SONGWRITING IN ADOLESCENCE:
An ethnographic study in the Western Cape

Adriana Janse van Rensburg

Dissertation presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the University of Stellenbosch.

Promotor: Dr. Maria Smit
December 2004
I, the undersigned, hereby declare that the work contained in this dissertation is my own original work and that I have not previously in its entirety or in part submitted it at any university for a degree.

Signature:………………………………………

Date:…………………………………………
Dedicated to my father,
in recognition of his vision and enterprise.

Opgedra aan my pa,
as erkenning aan sy visie en ondernemingsgees.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

1. Dr. Maria Smit, my promotor, for valuable assistance, advice and guidance.
2. Dr. DeWet Schutte, for assistance with data-gathering techniques and qualitative research methodology.
4. Derick White for assistance with transcription and revision of music from recordings.
5. All the adolescent respondents in this research, in particular L.S., who unstintingly shared their songwriting experience with me.
6. My husband and sons for their continued support and encouragement.
SYNOPSIS

The main objective of this study is to describe the nature and function of adolescent songwriting phenomenologically to ascertain the implications for music education. Secondary aims and research questions include ascertaining if and to what extent songwriting in adolescence serves as medium for emotional expression, self-therapy, socio-cultural cohesion and informal learning. Other secondary research aims are establishing the quality of the creative product and determining the implications for music education curricula in keeping with current curriculum development strategies.

Adolescents’ engagement in music is considered as a socio-cultural phenomenon. Individuals’ interaction with music is thus considered on Doise’s (1986:10-16) four levels of social explanation: the intra-personal, the inter-personal, the positional level and the ideological level. On the intra-personal level music is viewed as a technology of the self (DeNora, 2000), a medium for self-therapy and mood control and technology of the body. On the inter-personal level music is discussed as a form of self-expression serving as communicative form. On the positional level music’s role in bonding between individuals, namely social cohesion, is expounded. Lastly, on the ideological level, music is considered as part of youth, youth culture and cultural identity.

The compositional (songwriting) process is analyzed. Compositional modes, individual and collaborative, are identified and described and the creative process namely composing, is delineated according to creativity, creativity as social formation, creativity as process and the role and nature of informal learning. Adolescents use the process of songwriting to establish and enhance social cohesion, to further communication and expression with peers and to exert creative and intellectual activity in an informal learning environment.
The **creative product**, adolescents’ songs, is analyzed and described. General perspectives and theories about musical analysis are addressed to include a broader, socio-cultural view of analysis to analyze adolescent music. The musical and lyrical features are analyzed within the context of their socio-cultural setting. The SOLO Taxonomy (DeTurk, 1988) is adapted and applied to propose an evaluation procedure for the lyrics. Dunbar-Hall’s (1999) five methods of popular music analysis are applied in combination with Goodwin’s (1992) sound-image model, *synaesthesia*, to expand on the socio-cultural context of popular music analysis. The implications of musicology namely “formal music education” versus popular music styles and the effects of formal and informal learning strategies on songwriting are considered. A new understanding of musical analysis namely “musical poetics” (Krims, 2000) is adopted and the role that locality plays in this analysis is expounded. The role of notation and playing by ear is set out to validate the adolescents’ creative product.

The **research methodology** employed in this research include group discussion, observation, experience sampling method (adapted from Larson & Csikszentmihalyi, 1983) and individual interviews and are described according to methodology, results and analysis of the results.

General perspectives on **music education curricula** are considered in light of the possible contribution songwriting, as an informal learning activity, could bring to music education as composition is currently a high priority in international music education discourse and features prominently in current curricula. Recommendations and conclusions are made.
SINOPSIS

Die hoofdoelstelling van hierdie studie is om die aard en funksie van liedjieskryf in adolessensie fenomenologies te beskryf om sodoende die implikasies vir musiekopvoedkunde te bepaal. Sekondêre doelstellings en navorsingsvrae sluit in die vasstelling van of en hoe liedjieskryf in adolessensie dien as medium vir emosionele ekspressie, self-terapie, sosio-kulturele binding en informele leer. Ander sekondêre navorsingsvrae sluit in die bepaling van die kwaliteit van die kreatiewe produk en die implikasies vir musiekopvoedkunde kurrikula met inagneming van huidige kurrikulumontwikkeling strategieë.

Adolessente se interaksie met musiek word beskryf as ‘n sosio-kulturele fenomeen. Individue se interaksie met musiek word dus ontleed volgens Doise (1986:10-16) se vier vlakke van sosiale verduideliking: die intra-persoonlike, die inter-persoonlike, die posisionele en die ideologiese vlak. Op die intra-persoonlike vlak word musiek beskou as ‘n tegnologie van die self (DeNora, 2000), d.w.s as ‘n medium vir self-terapie en stemmingsbeheer asook as ‘n tegnologie van die liggaam. Op die inter-persoonlike vlak word musiek bespreek as ‘n vorm van self-ekspressie wat dien as kommunikatiewe vorm. Op die posisionele vlak word musiek se rol in die binding tussen individue, d.w.s. sosiale binding, beskryf. Laastens, op die ideologiese vlak, word musiek oorweeg as deel van jeug, jeugkultuur en kulturele identiteit.

Die komposisionele (liedjieskryf) proses word geanalisser. Komposisionele metodes, individueel en gemeenskaplik, word geïdentifiseer en beskryf en die kreatiewe proses, naamlik komposisie, word gedelineeer volgens kreatiwiteit, kreatiwiteit as sosiale formasie, kreatiwiteit as proses en die rol en aard van informele leer. Adolessente gebruik die proses van liedjieskryf om sosiale binding te vestig en te bevorder, om kommunikasie en ekspressie met die
portuurgroep te bevorder en om kreatiewe en intellektuele aktiwitiet in ‘n informele leeromgewing uit te oefen.


Die navorsingsmetodologie toegepas in hierdie navorsing sluit in groepsbespreking, observasie, ondervinding-steekproef metode (aangepas van Larson & Csikszentmihalyi, 1983) en individuele onderhoude en word beskryf volgens metodologie, resultate en die analise van die resultate.

Aangesien komposisie tans hoë prioriteit in internasionale debat geniet en prominent geplaas is in huidige musiekopvoedkunde kurrikula word algemene perspektiewe op musiekopvoedkunde kurrikula oorweeg in die lig van die moontlike bydrae wat liedjieskryf as informele leeraktiwiteit aan musiekopvoedkunde kan bring.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1.1 ORIGIN AND DESCRIPTION OF THE PROBLEM

1.2 AIM OF THE STUDY
   1.2.1 Main Objective
   1.2.2 Secondary Objectives and Research Questions

1.3 THE STUDY DOMAIN

1.4 DEFINITIONS
   1.4.1 Songwriting
   1.4.2 Composition
   1.4.3 Improvisation
   1.4.4 Popular Music
   1.4.5 Adolescence
   1.4.6 Teenager
   1.4.7 Youth, Youth Music and Youth Culture

1.5 CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 2
GENERAL PERSPECTIVES ON MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULA

2.1 CURRENT SOCIO-CONSTRUCTIVIST VIEWS AND PHILOSOPHIES ON MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULA
   2.1.1 Music sociology’s role in music education
   2.1.2 Constructivism
   2.1.3 The purpose of music education
   2.1.4 The role of music
   2.1.5 How people learn

2.2 COMPOSITION AS COMPONENT OF CURRENT CURRICULA

2.3 THE POTENTIAL OF INFORMAL COMPOSITION, I.E. SONGWRITING, IN CURRENT CURRICULA
   2.3.1 Notation
   2.3.2 Analysis

2.4 CONCLUSION
### CHAPTER 3
SOCIO-CULTURAL UNDERSTANDING OF MUSIC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>THE ADOLESCENT’S INTERACTION AND ENGAGEMENT WITH MUSIC</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>THE INTRA-PERSONAL LEVEL: THE ADOLESCENT</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.1</td>
<td>Music as technology of self</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.2</td>
<td>Self-therapy and mood control</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.3</td>
<td>Music as technology of the body</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.4</td>
<td>Music in the forming of identity and gender identity</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>THE INTER-PERSONAL LEVEL</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2.1</td>
<td>Self-expression and communicative form</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>THE POSITIONAL LEVEL: SOCIAL COHESION</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>THE IDEOLOGICAL LEVEL: YOUTH, YOUTH CULTURE AND CULTURAL IDENTITY</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 4
SONGWRITING: THE COMPOSITIONAL PROCESS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>COMPOSITIONAL MODES</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>THE CREATIVE PROCESS: COMPOSING</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2</td>
<td>Creativity as social formation</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3</td>
<td>The creative process: composition</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>INFORMAL LEARNING</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1</td>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>SUMMARY</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 5
SONGWRITING: THE CREATIVE PRODUCT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>MUSICOLOGY VERSUS POP</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>MUSICAL POETICS</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>LOCALITY IN ANALYSES AND UNDERSTANDING OF POPULAR MUSIC</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>NOTATION</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>ANALYSIS OF THE CREATIVE PRODUCT: MUSIC, FORM, GENRE AND SOCIO-CULTURAL BACKGROUND</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1</td>
<td>Analysis of the song Déjà vu [CD track 1]</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.6.2 Analysis of the song Verlore Liefde [CD track 2] 119
5.6.3 Analysis of the song Help die Man [CD track 3] 121
5.6.4 Analysis of the song Main Man [CD track 4] 123
5.6.5 Analysis of the song Essence of Life [CD track 5] 123
5.6.6 Analysis of the song Disillusioned [CD track 6] 124
5.6.7 Analysis of the song Toleration [CD track 7] 129
5.7 TEXT ANALYSIS 130
5.7.1 Do lyrics matter? 130
5.7.2 The SOLO Taxonomy: an analytical tool 134
5.7.3 An overview of subject matter of lyrics 143
5.8 SUMMARY 145

CHAPTER 6
THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

6.1 INTRODUCTION 147
6.2 GROUP DISCUSSION AS DATA-GATHERING TECHNIQUE 150
  6.2.1 Methodology of the group discussion 151
  6.2.2 The male group discussion 151
  6.2.3 The female group discussion 158
  6.2.4 Analysis and interpretation of both the groups’ interview data 164
  6.2.5 Summary and conclusion 168
6.3 OBSERVATION 170
  6.3.1 Introduction 170
  6.3.2 Methodology of the formal observation log 172
  6.3.3 Results of the observation procedure 174
  6.3.4 Analysis and interpretation of the data 177
  6.3.5 Summary and conclusion 179
6.4 EXPERIENCE SAMPLING METHOD 180
  6.4.1 Introduction 180
  6.4.2 Methodology 180
  6.4.3 Results 181
  6.4.4 Analysis and interpretation of the data 183
6.5 INTERVIEWS 185
  6.5.1 Introduction 185
  6.5.2 Methodology 185
  6.5.3 Analysis and interpretation of the data 186
  6.5.4 Summary and conclusion 205
6.6 CONCLUSION 205
CHAPTER 7
RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

7.1 INTRODUCTION 209
7.2 RECOMMENDATIONS 210
7.3 IMPACT 214
   7.3.1 Teacher training 215
   7.3.2 Instrumental tuition methods 216
   7.3.3 Assessment 217
   7.3.4 The application of informal learning practices 218
7.4 CONCLUSION 223

APPENDIX A: SONG TEXTS 228
APPENDIX B: EXPERIENCE SAMPLING METHOD 264
SELF-REFLECTION FORM
APPENDIX C: INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE 265
APPENDIX D: RESULTS OF THE INTERVIEWS 268

BIBLIOGRAPHY 271
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 ORIGIN AND DESCRIPTION OF THE PROBLEM

Research and methods of studying adolescents and their engagement in music are numerous, yet results are often superficial and do not deal with the informal expression of youths in their natural environment. Little relevance to the salient issues of adolescence, as encountered in authentic situations, are revealed in research employing traditional spheres of observation and the case study procedure.

Research techniques are often overly simplistic and must expand in an interdisciplinary manner by means of collaboration among researchers to include broader concepts (Rogers, 1981:25). Current proliferating research about adolescents includes historical, anthropological, longitudinal and cross-cultural approaches (Rogers, 1981:22-23). Case study approaches depend on researchers' "intuitive skills" (Csikszentmihalyi, Larson & Prescott, 1977:282) and do not deal with adolescents in their everyday life. Hargreaves & North (1999:82) have noted that one of the central research questions in music psychology and music education today is whether research data truly reflects real-life musical behavior. They suggest that music psychology and music education have a great deal to gain by utilizing a greater range of methodologies in researching music and the meaning of music in everyday life. Adolescents' natural emotional and creative informal expression through music, for example predominantly through songwriting (as is evident in the numerous teenage rock bands) and their experience thereof, have yet to be investigated.
Studies on creativity and adolescent psychology abound, but the natural, unforced tendency and phenomenon of adolescent songwriting, as a medium of emotional expression, self-therapy and socio-cultural communication and cohesion is to date relatively unexplored. The area of informal learning is “especially appropriate for qualitative studies in music education” (Mark, 1996:119). He (ibid.) identifies informal learning as one of the areas that has largely been overlooked by music education researchers despite the obvious success with which cultural musics have been taught for a very long time in the informal milieu outside school. The notable exception is a recent study by Green (2001) entitled How popular musicians learn which does touch on the adolescent informal learning experience.

Despite the current "popular vs. academic music" dichotomy in music education, much research has paved the way for an inclusion and acceptance of popular music and performance practices in music education curricula. It is contended that this research on the nature and function of the adolescent songwriting phenomenon could contribute to a deeper understanding of the role informal learning styles and popular music production could play in music education philosophy and curricula.

Although popular music has become a generally accepted part of school music curricula, its inclusion has remained tenuous: ambiguity about the inclusion of informal learning methods remains. Mark (1996:120-121) raises a number of salient issues regarding research into informal learning using qualitative techniques. These include: How do children learn the styles of popular music so well? Who teaches them: older peers, other sources? Do popular music pursuits eventually lead to an appreciation of other, including classical, genres? And significantly: What role does music education in schools have in this process? Literature on adolescent songwriting as an informal learning activity is sparse and generally does not address the complex issues of the function, emotional complexity and the social indicators that determine the quantity, quality and range of this creative phenomenon.
General, phenomenological research questions about songwriting that arise are:

- Does songwriting contribute to adolescents' psychological health; thus does it have therapeutic value?
- Does it have communicative properties?
- How does songwriting contribute to social cohesion?
- What is the quality and quantity of the creative product?
- To what extent does the adolescent use technology i.e. electronic instruments and techniques employed in the compositional process?
- What is the extent of the emotional range in the song texts and does it show development over the adolescent time span when different age groups are compared?
- What is the nature of the informal learning process that takes place?
- Does songwriting predominate in certain cultures and/or socio-economic strata?
- Does it occur during a particular phase in adolescence?

Answers to the above questions are not salient or not available at the moment. The need for exploratory research (Bless & Higson-Smith, 1995:42) as a cross sectional study (Babbie, 1992:99) and interdisciplinary research involving musicology, sociology, music therapy and music education, thus arises.

1.2 **AIM OF THE STUDY**

1.2.1 **Main Objective**

The main objective of this study is to describe the nature and function of adolescent songwriting phenomenologically in order to ascertain the implications for music education.
1.2.2 Secondary Objectives and Research Questions

Secondary aims and research questions include ascertaining whether, and to what extent, songwriting in adolescence serves as medium for emotional expression, self-therapy, socio-cultural cohesion and informal learning. Other secondary research aims are establishing the quality of the creative product and determining the implications for music education curricula in keeping with current curriculum development strategies as delineated by Conelly & Clandinin (1988).

1.3 THE STUDY DOMAIN

This research is aimed at:

- The adolescent of ages 12 through 18 years of age;
- The informal activity of songwriting as opposed to more formal concepts of songwriting namely composition assignments as part of music studies in school;
- Songwriting in its broadest definition.

1.4 DEFINITIONS

Certain terms have to be defined according to the meanings in which they are used in this dissertation. They are: songwriting, composition, improvisation, popular music, adolescence, teenager, youth, youth music and youth culture.
1.4.1 **Songwriting**

Songwriting is a generic term used in this study to designate any and every activity of individual or collective “song making”. Although the term *song* implies vocal music, this term is applied to all instrumental and vocal compositions and combinations thereof in adolescent composition in this study. The term *songwriting* also implies *writing*. However, in this study, the term is applied to all forms, oral and/or literate, of informal instrumental and/or vocal composition by adolescents. The term “songwriting” is used interchangeably with the term “composition” and/or “making up a song”\(^1\), as it is inherently the same concept. The term “songwriting” is preferred as it implies two important issues relevant to this study:

- It implies music written in a popular style as opposed to the more formal, academic concept of composition,
- It is the term used by adolescents to refer to their music-creating activity.

1.4.2 **Composition**

The classical concept of composition is generally accepted as *prior notated music* created by an individual and associated with Western art music. This process implies processes of modification and revision of musical ideas synthesized into notated composition. Burnard (2000:241), in a study of children’s experiential differences between composition and improvisation, describes the definitive processes of composition whereby students construct temporal markers, for example a riff or catchy phrase, to enable them to duplicate what they had made up. Furthermore, a composition is objectified as a *product* by the owner/s thereof.

Composition, as used in this dissertation, will include *prior notated music* as well as broader definitions including those outlined under the term *Songwriting*.

---

\(^1\) The expression “making up music” is Paynter’s (2002:224) preferred expression as opposed to composition.
1.4.3 Improvisation

Kratus (1989:17), in writing on children’s compositions, considers “improvisation” as the process of “trying one new musical idea after another (exploration)”. In Burnard’s study (2000:241), on examining the experiential differences between improvisation and composition in children’s music making, she proposes that from a child’s perspective improvisation is an “intentional activity of a time-based event actualized through interaction and orientated toward continuity”. Burnard (2000:241) states that for children, improvisation is multi-sensory and immediate: the interaction between physicality and sound. As the songwriting process includes improvisatory strategies and narrowly parallels, if not superimposes with compositional strategies, the term improvisation in this dissertation is used to describe exploratory techniques that might or might not result in a song.

1.4.4 Popular Music

Popular music, as applied in this research, is a generalized term implying many diverse styles of music. Gates (in Ponick, 2000:24) prefers the term “commercial” music. Cassara (ibid.) adds: “Popular music is any music that students perceive as separating them from adults, especially their parents”. Schmid (ibid.) states that “popular music is any style of music that is currently well known by large groups of people”. The reason for the inclusion of definitions of popular music in this research is that the adolescent songwriters use popular styles for their songwriting and as such, the term “popular music” is used throughout this dissertation as an umbrella term indicating all and every instance of music in a popular, commercial and/or youth related style.

---

2 J. Terry Gates is associate professor of music education at the State University of New York at Buffalo.
3 Charles Cassara is associate professor at the Berklee College of Music in Boston.
4 Will Schmid is chair of the music department at the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee.
1.4.5 Adolescence

Adolescence as a life stage in this research will be considered from early and middle adolescence: early adolescence, 12 to 15 years of age and middle adolescence, 15 to 18 years of age (Konopka, 1973:291).

1.4.6 Teenager

“Teenager” is a term that was coined in the 1950s and then denoted mostly working-class young (Frith, 1981:181). Abrams’ 1959 study, as quoted by Frith (1981:182) defines teenagers as young people from school leaving age until they are married or reach twenty-five. The teenagers of the 1950s were associated with leisure, pleasure, coffee bars, motor scooters and other similar banalities of teenage life. Sex and violence and juvenile delinquency became synonymous with the term “teenagers” (Frith, 1981:184; Hamm, 1995:21). More recently the term has broadened into a word used to describe young people in their teens (12 through 20 years old) without the delinquent connotations.

1.4.7 Youth, Youth Music and Youth Culture

“Youth” and “youth culture” are terms associated with the 1960s and inferred the insignificance of class distinctions. However, “youth” refers more, though not exclusively, to middle-class young (Frith, 1981:181). “Youth” is an ideological concept identified by American sociologists as the phenomenon of youths deliberately adopting lower-class values namely roughness, rebelliousness, toughness, etcetera and diametrically opposed to the values and norms of their elders. “Youth culture” of the 1960s was also campus-based and linked with the student movement. Popular music gained a previously unsurpassed eminence as badge (Frith, 1981:217) of the social autonomy and distinction of the youth and youth culture of the 1960s. “Youth music” is a designation coined by the Music

5 Badge: a term used by Frith to indicate the symbolization and appropriation of music by adolescents.
Educators National Conference as used in the November 1969 issue (Mark, 1978:149). As such, it includes all types of music that appeal to youths. As Mark notes (1978:149), by implication this excludes other types of music, for example classical.

1.5 CONCLUSION

This study henceforth aims to address the following course of research and documentation of adolescent songwriting as observed and studied in this ethnographic research⁶:

Chapter 2 views general perspectives on music education curricula in light of the possible contribution songwriting, as an informal learning activity, could make to music education as songwriting/composition is currently a high priority in international music education discourse and features prominently in current curricula.

Chapter 3 sets out to consider music as a socio-cultural phenomenon. As such individuals’ interaction with music is considered on Doise’s (1986:10-16) four levels of social explanation: the intra-personal, the inter-personal, the positional level and the ideological level. On the intra-personal level music can be viewed as a technology of the self (DeNora, 2000), a medium for self-therapy and mood control as well as a technology of the body. On the inter-personal level music is discussed as a form of self-expression serving as communicative form. On the positional level music’s role in bonding between individuals namely “social cohesion”, is expounded. Lastly, on the ideological level, music is considered as part of youth, youth culture and cultural identity.

⁶ Ethnographic: as explicated in Chapter 5.
Chapter 4 explores the **compositional (songwriting) process**. Compositional modes are identified and described and the creative process namely composing, is delineated according to creativity, creativity as social formation, creativity as process and the role and nature of informal learning.

Chapter 5 examines the **creative product** resulting from songwriting. The implications of musicology namely “formal music education” versus popular music styles and the effects of formal and informal learning strategies on songwriting are considered. A new understanding of musical analysis namely “musical poetics” (Krims, 2000) is adopted and the role that locality and the concomitant understanding of aesthetics play in this analysis is expounded. The role of notation and playing by ear is set out to validate the adolescent’s creative product. Analysis of the creative product is undertaken by viewing the product in its socio-cultural context, musical context, the form, genre and text.

Chapter 6 describes the **research methodology** employed in this research. Group discussion, observation, experience sampling method (adapted from Larson & Csikszentmihalyi, 1983) and interviews are described according to methodology, results and analysis of the results.

Chapter 7 states recommendations and conclusions.
CHAPTER 2

GENERAL PERSPECTIVES ON MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULA

This chapter investigates general perspectives on music education curricula with specific reference to the role of songwriting, or composition, as it is currently employed. Current international trends in music education are marked by three main issues (Hargreaves, Marshall & North, 2003:155) namely firstly, aims and objectives, secondly, contents and methods and thirdly, student issues. Firstly, curriculum issues according to above-mentioned research, identified concerns on specialist versus generalist approaches to music education. Secondly, the aims and objectives of music education are continuously assessed and reviewed to include philosophical trends. Lastly, the third issue to emerge from the Hargreaves, Marshall & North research (ibid.) is the balance between musical learning in and out of school, that is, informal versus formal learning.

More generally, the trends in education and hence music education are currently a socio-constructivist view of learning and learning theories. As such, socio-constructivist views and philosophies are examined to shed light on the sociological aspect in music to determine how research in this field contributes to underwriting the significance of songwriting as a socio-musical phenomenon. Constructivism, the purpose of music education, and the role of music in the lives of students are addressed. Furthermore, current views on composition in music education curricula are examined for the justification of the inclusion of songwriting as informal activity. Composition is in a sense the formal counterpart to the informal activity of songwriting. This distinction is made to compare and identify tangents. Several areas where this research can shed light, and/or support current theories, and/or identify areas for further research are discussed below.
2.1 CURRENT SOCIO-CONSTRUCTIVIST VIEWS AND PHILOSOPHIES ON MUSIC EDUCATION CURRICULA

2.1.1 Music sociology’s role in music education

Music sociology has recently begun to develop perspectives on the more “active” aspects of music with regards to social action, emotion and cognition (DeNora, 2003:165). Sociology, and specifically sociology of education, has in the past been primarily concerned with the institution of education. Informal socialization for example, has been less of a concern (ibid.). DeNora (ibid.) highlights music as a medium of social practice, a perspective which dispenses with previously held “music and society” paradigms⁠¹. Sociology has moved forward to acknowledge that to be engaged in music is to be engaged in social life. Research and discourse during the 1980s focused on music’s social shaping and the influence of music upon individuals. Current views in music sociology view music as an active ingredient in social life. To understand the importance of recent research in music sociology and how it bears relevance to this dissertation, we examine five major themes within music sociology (DeNora, 2003:165) relevant to music education, namely: music and status consumption, the focus on the construction of value and talent in music, music as a way of being, music and emotion, and music as consciousness. Each of these areas has much to offer discourse in music education and will be briefly addressed to identify tangents for this dissertation.

Firstly, music as consumption dates from discourse starting in the late 1970s when sociologists of art became increasingly concerned about musical taste, taste publics, etcetera, and its role in the construction of social differences. The view is that musical tastes reinforce socio-economic status. This theme will be addressed in this

---

¹ The archetypal paradigm of music distanced from and reflecting social structure.
dissertation as the group identity of adolescents and how music is appropriated by adolescents as “badge” and as “social cement”. This clearly contrasts with previous sociological views now acknowledging the active role of music in adolescent socialization.

Secondly, the focus on the construction of value and talent in music highlighted how socially and politically fraught the idea of musical greatness is. The research deals with the value of artworks and how musical value is articulated. Social recognition of talent is not necessarily in line with “good practice”, a viewpoint expanded on by Green (2001). This dissertation will examine the role and nature of the informal learning process and identify abilities and talents “outside-the-classroom”. Informal practices of musical learning open up new vistas for the identification and differentiation of talent and value in music, and thus ties in with *hidden curricula* outside the classroom.

Thirdly, music as a way of being has been another central theme in music sociology. This theme in sociology focuses on how music helps to shape identity, social action and subjectivity. Of particular relevance in this theme is the DeNora research (2000) *Music in Everyday Life*. A key idea, relevant to this dissertation, is the notion of *affordance*—how music structures or influences the shape of action, thought or embodied matters for example comportment or emotion. This does not mean that certain actions *will* happen, merely that affordances exist for certain situations. The sociology of music thus focuses on how affordances are created. It explores the links between music and social life or experience.

---

2 *Affordance* is a term borrowed from psychology: Gibson, J.J. 1966. *The Senses Considered as Perceptual Systems*. Boston, MA: Houghton and Mifflin. This term, “affordance”, was further appropriated and adapted by sociology: Anderson, R. & Sharrock, W. 1993. “Can organizations afford knowledge?”, *Computer Supported Cooperative Work*, Volume 1, pp. 143-61, which explains how some forms of material lend themselves more easily to the doing of some things over others. For example, certain examples of music lend themselves more to marching than others, a ball lends itself more to bouncing than a cube, etcetera.
By extension this means that it can be argued that songwriting *affords* the adolescent the opportunity for self-expression, mood control, self-therapy, communication and an outlet for creativity, amongst others. It also *affords* him/her the opportunity to engage in socially distinctive action gaining social authorship and autonomy.

Fourthly, music and emotion has been a theme in music sociology that has had research focus on music listening practices. This theme also links up with research (DeNora, 2000) establishing how music regulates, enhances and changes qualities and levels of emotion. Chapter 3 of this dissertation will examine this line of discourse and the devices and strategies of adolescents employing songwriting as emotional regulatory device will be documented in Chapter 6.

Lastly, the theme of music as consciousness has been raised in sociological research which focuses on how individuals perceive music as an exemplar or analogue of other things. Formation of self-identity, also gender identity, bears relevance. Individuals perceive their identity, and thus their actions, as aligned within a certain group or vision where music may provide exemplars of and for action. Arguments of “social-cement” and the appropriation of songwriting for purposes of social authorship will be made. This line of discourse is also borne out by Hargreaves, Marshall & North’s (2003:161) research which concludes that self-identity forms the centre of a new model of the outcomes of music education in the twenty-first century and suggests that music psychology and music education now have more tangents than ever before, likewise concluded by DeNora (2003:175) who notes how the boundaries between sociology of music, musicology, ethnomusicology, anthropology of music and social psychology have blurred. The merging of these disciplines provides much scope for further research and discourse. Hargreaves, Marshall & North (2003:161) conclude that the inclusion of a socio-cultural context in music education and in developmental social psychology of music provides firm conceptual foundations.
2.1.2 Constructivism

The development of music education curricula, asks the questions why and what (curriculum) and when, where, and how (instruction). In keeping with current views on learning theories, particularly constructivism, how learners construct understandings, that is, how they guide their own learning, including metacognition, form the basis of considerations when researching and designing new methodologies, teaching practices for the inclusion in curriculum. Boardman (2001:45) proposes that the outcome of any curriculum should be a cohesive whole as the nature of human experience and learning is holistic.

Although curriculum development is not within the scope of this dissertation, basic premises on curriculum development need to be addressed to identify tenets for a broader understanding of how this research can impact and contribute to music education in general. Boardman (2001:46) expostulates that to develop effective music education curricula, three premises form the point of departure, namely:

- The purpose of music education;
- The role of music in our lives (aligned in this dissertation with the sociology of music as discussed above);
- And how people learn (aligned in this dissertation with thus far arguments on informal learning practices and socio-constructivist views on learning).
2.1.3 The purpose of music education

The value of music education in schools has long been a contentious issue. Several arguments for the retention of music education have been made in the past, including that the value of music education extols both the extrinsic and intrinsic qualities of music. Extrinsinc qualities would include the ambassadorial role of music in schools, the marketability of a school with an arts program, etcetera. Elliott (1995:272) identifies intrinsic qualities namely self-growth, self-knowledge and musical enjoyment to provide growing musicianship, as the primary values of music education. Likewise, Paynter (2002:223) argues for a place for music in the school curriculum based on the intrinsic qualities which music affords, namely sensitivity, imagination, inventiveness all in artistic endeavour. The important human quality to be exercised and developed is the potential all individuals have to “make art by making up music” (ibid.) Boardman (2001:47) proposes that the extrinsic and intrinsic qualities of music are not necessarily dichotomous, but rather complementary. They serve to focus music education on assisting learners to gain insights and intellectual skills necessary to understand music as a “unique, nonverbal mode of representation”. It is with these arguments in mind, that songwriting – the informal creative expression in a popular style, finds its place aligning with notions of self-growth, self-knowledge, enjoyment (Elliott, 1995:272), sensitivity, imagination, inventiveness, making art (Paynter, 2002:223) and acquiring intellectual skills, informally, to understand music. Hargreaves, Marshall & North (2003:158) developed a model to demarcate the potential scope and aims of music education in and out of school. They identified potential outcomes of music and arts education for individual students and the interrelationships between them (Figure 2.1):
Figure 2.1: The potential outcomes of music education

Above diagram shows the overlapping nature of the many social-cultural outcomes of music education. Three main divisions are demarcated, namely musical-artistic, personal, and social-cultural. The musical artistic domain has thus far been the prominent component of Western type music education containing performance, aural, literacy, sight reading, composition, and improvisation. This however, overlaps with personal components of music-making such as creativity, aesthetic appreciation and emotional expressiveness. Personal outcomes include cognition, learning and
scholastic accomplishments, and also a second type namely mood regulatory functions, an aspect that will be covered in this dissertation in Chapter 3. The third main group, social-cultural outcomes, refers to values and cultural ideals of particular social and cultural groups.

It is within this broad framework for music-educational outcomes in the twenty-first century that we place the role of songwriting in the lives of adolescents, and consider the significance and place of this phenomenon in the current music educational model.

2.1.4 The role of music

The ubiquitous nature of music in all walks of life and through all phases of life, have led many philosophers to extol the virtues of, and the reasons for the existence and propagation of this phenomenon called music. As far back as Plato, music’s ability to rouse the emotions was acknowledged. Since then, philosophers such as Langer and others, have proposed theories proclaiming music’s ability to represent feeling and emotion. Boardman (2001:48) maintains that emotion alone does not provide an adequate explanation of the pervasive nature of music. It appears imperative that there is another reason for the pervasive nature of music and humans’ reasons for arranging sounds in particular ways, that reaches beyond the theory of emotion and feeling.

Boardman (2001:48) thus proposes that the reason for music’s all pervasiveness and human beings’ continuous engagement therein, lies in the need of humans to symbolize. Human beings’ ability to create symbolic systems is unique and empowering. It is the ability to symbolize that enables us to make meaning of the world, represent it in a diversity of ways to recall and represent ideas, events, and emotions. Thus, symbolization empowers an individual to convey meaning that is
sensorially experienced. In addition, symbolization facilitates the human ability to conceive possibilities, new ideas, new concepts, that is, to create (Gardner, 1982). It thus follows, that symbol systems emerge and among them is music. Therefore, the notion of the appropriation of songwriting as a device for obtaining social authorship, and intensifying sensorial experience aligns with the theory of the human need to symbolize. As such, symbolization gives form to the adolescent’s emotional experience, gives it shape, makes it tangible, in a sense provides a simulacrum to real life and lived experience. This likewise, provides the adolescent with the ability to project future identity through symbolization. Boardman (2001:48) succinctly summarizes that: “This cluster of sounds known as music has been organized in such a way as to present the kinds of meaning that no other symbol system can convey” and “[music] is essential to our well-being as individuals and as a society, because it enables us to present, to re-present, feelings so deep and powerful that they are indeed ‘unspeakable’ ”. This expostulation will be examined as the value and need of songwriting, where adolescents express their appropriation of songwriting for the purposes of emotional, non-verbal expression of feelings, observations, emotions, often so profound and inexpressible that language does not provide a sufficient vehicle for the expression of the profundity felt.

It thus follows, that the purpose of music education becomes one of assisting learners in accessing symbolic systems to share, expand and absorb knowledge equipping them not only for creative and independent thought, but also as a vehicle for self-therapy, communication and self-expression.

2.1.5 How people learn

Learning takes place formally and informally and the existence and nature of informal learning cannot be negated. Research on learning styles and the nature of learning the past fifty years, have moved away from a mainly “deconstructivist” view, meaning
for example, the teacher as lecturer, to more constructivist views on learning theories. Hargreaves & North (1997:11) note that one of the foremost concerns of music psychology has been the relevance and application of psychological research for music teachers. The research on constructivist learning theory, of which a complete exposition is not within the scope of this dissertation, has provided music educators with basic premises on the nature of learning and cognition which should form the backbone of any music educational curricula. The four tenets of relevance for music educators formulating a curriculum, as proposed by Boardman (2001:50), are:

- **Learning is constructing meaning**
  In the constructivist classroom, learners are challenged with new knowledge that has to be linked to prior knowledge. Connections are made between old and new, forging associations, comparisons, disparities, etcetera, thereby forming new knowledge. The essence of constructivism lies in learners forming and constructing their own knowledge. The constructivist classroom affords the learners opportunities for exploration linking the known to the unknown, presenting new information to be compared to the old, posing research questions, forcing learners to “think” for themselves. Informal learning strategies, such as learning an instrument in a rock band from peers, making-up own songs by listening, copying and imitating, is the quintessence of “constructing meaning” and aligns itself with the notion of tapping into “what the students already know”.

- **Learning is holistic**
  Earlier learning theories decentralized the dimensions of learning into action, cognition and emotion, as for example Bloom’s cognitive, psychomotor, and affective domains. Since then, researchers (Caine & Caine, 1991:52) have proposed that the interaction between these domains is inseparable. Thus, a holistic view is imperative in generating a curriculum. Separating emotion from the learning experience is then, according to above mentioned research,
The emotional aspect involved in songwriting forms in many cases the backbone and motivation for the activity. Emotional aspects include self-expression, self-therapy, self-identity, gender identity and social identity.

- **Learning occurs in context**
  Boardman (2001:51) continues that all learning, formal and informal, takes place within a socio-cultural context. Researchers (Bruner, 1996:ix; Vygotsky, 1962) have long established the essence of the interaction within a socio-cultural setting as inextricable from the learning process. Postmodernist learning theories have investigated ideas, as postulated by Vygotsky (1978) that explains the individual construction of schemas that leads to understanding. Vygotsky’s (ibid.) views expand on the development of understanding through real life experiences that involve interaction with others. Therefore, all knowledge is socially constructed. It follows that all learning is a social process on the inter- or intrapersonal\(^3\) level. Thus, the more life experiences we acquire, the more we are able to operate on the intrapsychological level – that is, independently of others.

  The social nature, for example, collaborative songwriting, rock bands, and the social authorship gained by adolescents involved in songwriting, will be explored. It follows that the learning processes the adolescents engage in, informally and socially, could have benefits which could extend to the formal music education curriculum.

- **Learning involves multiple modes of representation**
  Bruner (1973) identified three modes of representation, namely *enactive* (representation through action), *iconic* (representation through imagery, and *symbolic* (representation through symbolization). Other theorists likewise

\(^3\) See also Doise, W. 1986.
have identified modes of representation labeling them cognitive, haptic, kinesthetic, etcetera. However, the basic premise remains that the ability to represent our knowledge is paramount. Learners use a variety of representational modes to show understanding and involvement with learning matter through actions, iconicity, and/or symbolization. The theorist Fosnot (1996) contends that the exact mode of representation is inconsequential as the act of representation builds dialectic tension beneficial to thought. He (ibid.) continues that different media have their own advantages and disadvantages and affords the learner the opportunity to extol new meanings from the contextually implied meaning. The implication for music education is clear: although adolescents engage in songwriting on an informal level, mainly through the medium of popular music, this mode of representation is inconsequential. The activity still affords them the processes to thought, critical thinking, problem solving, collaborative working techniques and appropriating new meanings from existing material.

In review of all of the above on current learning theory and the role of music education, it is noteworthy to view Hargreaves, Marshall & North’s (2003:158) model of opportunities in music education (Figure 2.2):
From the above diagram, the opportunities students have to pursue music are clearly demarcated into two formal and informal semi-spheres. The model attempts to indicate the interpolation of the vertical semi-spheres (formal and informal opportunities) with the horizontal hemispheres (in and out of school). The significance of this model for this dissertation is the equally weighted importance of all spheres of musical opportunity afforded the student. As such, the arena songwriting commands, gains validity and is circumscribed by this model.
2.2 COMPOSITION AS COMPONENT OF CURRENT CURRICULA


Although academic writings have shown an upsurge of research on composition and songwriting, a recent survey (2003) by MENC⁴ (the national Association for Music Education in the USA), reported that a large percentage of teachers did not include songwriting in their curricula. Elementary (65%) and middle school (53.3%) teachers were more likely to include songwriting as part of the music curriculum, while high school teachers showed that 33% did not include any songwriting activity. 37% of high school teachers included songwriting as part of the overall music curriculum.

---
⁴ Results of the survey were reported in Teaching Music, 2003, Volume 10 no. 5, p. 83.
2.3 THE POTENTIAL OF INFORMAL COMPOSITION, I.E. SONGWRITING, IN CURRENT CURRICULA

Legette (2000:16) notes that informal knowledge underpins what is taught in schools and warns against the occurrence of teaching exactly the way you have been taught. Considering the multicultural, multi-ethnic society in today’s schools, students must participate in the learning process to be able to relate school knowledge with everyday life (Legette, 2000:16). Ross (1995) refers to this discrepancy between school and informal knowledge as “cultural dissonance”. An approach of Teaching Structures (TS) developed by De Oliveira (2000:33) in the 1980s for street kids in Brazil, found that curricula employing no discrepancies between formal and informal music and education structures and processes, benefited and started to change and improve the music educational scenario in Brazil. Empirical results of aforementioned study demonstrated the integration of formal and informal ways individuals learn music, placed in social and contextual situations, and found that this curricular model would be applicable to other curricular designs for community schools, street kids projects, etcetera, particularly where reaching diverse cultural groups. The significance of this research within the South African context is salient.

Adolescents are clear and unambiguous in their support of various popular musics and their engagement therein extends naturally into the creation thereof. As such, songwriting, as will be argued, provides the adolescent with a number of tools with which to mediate the self and the world around him/her. Adolescent's propensity for songwriting include personal, solitary experiences, informal gatherings for example rock bands, and ever wider social reaches, for example Internet alliances (the web site Sharing wisdom: Songwriters on Songwriting at www.lyricist.com/songwisdom.html) providing other adolescents with information on how and why to write songs. It can be concluded that formal education does not provide these answers readily to the adolescent and they thus search out other
channels of communication to share the experience of songwriting as they would any other leisure activity.

2.3.1 Notation

Notation has long been the crux of the music curriculum and studying music has become synonymous with studying notation. Dunbar-Hall & Wemyss (2000a:25) suggest that using popular music in skeletal notation produces different ways of studying and thinking about music. They identify the benefits as:

- Increasing the scope of music skills students have to master;
- It presupposes a shift from passive, score reading activities to active music-making;
- It indicates a shift from teacher as resource of knowledge to students as the creators of knowledge gained from experience.

Dunbar-Hall & Wemyss (2000a:25) use the example of students interpreting a lead sheet and the benefits thereof. Likewise, if adolescent songwriters composed utilizing only a lead sheet, the benefits would be twofold. An understanding of the roles, limitations and performance possibilities of various instruments are required; converting chord symbols into sound, artistic decision making, voice leading, bass lines and melody parts, etcetera, are but a few of the artistic and musical skills inherent in this form of notation.

Technology allows students of all levels of musical experience to compose, as the processes of creating music through technology are no longer necessarily dependent on notational literacy. Sounds may be sequenced so they can be played, recorded and further edited. If notation is required, software packages can be utilized. Levels of musical complexity, which a student may be able to perform but notate due to the lack of high enough levels of notational capability, are thus allowed (Dunbar-Hall & Wemyss, 2000a:28).
The value of symbolic representation modes have been argued above and it thus follows that learners will appropriate various systems of notational and symbolic systems to convey meaning. Western notation may, or may not, be one of them. "The result of an overload on notation and theory divorced from listening and practical application is the likelihood that learners will end up knowing how to name notes on the stave or on an instrument, or knowing the names of musical procedures and elements, but not knowing what to do with them independently of any written or verbal instructions" (Green, 2001:206). The caveat lies in the "notation in isolation" approach which alienates students from music education. Informal music education procedures show notation as being used as a means to an end, purposefully, as a mnemonic or communication device. The conclusion that can be made, also in keeping with learning theories on sound-before-notation, is that notation and theory should be introduced in formal education after meaningful, interactive engagement in sound.

2.3.2 Analysis

Dunbar-Hall (1999:40) concedes that popular music has recently become accepted as part of music education curricula, but that ways to study and teach popular music are currently still developing. He (ibid.) identifies analysis as one of the main problem areas and claims that examples of popular music analysis are rare and/or not always appropriate to popular music.

Analytical methodologies suited and applicable to popular music are a necessity for a number of reasons:

- Analytical methodology provides the music educator with accountable and assessable tools to be used in a music education setting;
• Analytical tools provide the music educator with access to the adolescent's informal world of music creation;
• Analytical tools provide the music educator with resources beyond the scope that his/her tertiary education may have provided;
• The implication is that the analysis is linked to an extension of choice of musics to be studied in music education which includes non-art music (Dunbar-Hall, 1999:52);
• Analysis supports the continued focus of teaching processes rather than finite content (Dunbar-Hall, 1999:52);
• More diverse ways of analysis should become the basis of further music study in an ever widening paradigm.

Several analytical tools will be explored in this dissertation and demonstrated using adolescent songs. It can be concluded that even the most basic of songs does provide the music educator with a point of departure for further work and research.

2.4 CONCLUSION

Composition has made its mark on music education curricula over the past two decades. Much has been documented with regards to formal aspects of composition including processes and product. However, to date little has been acknowledged and researched regarding the informal activity of songwriting, not necessarily in “rock band” context only, but as an extension of the daily lives of adolescents. As such, composition in school can be viewed as the formal counterpart of the informal activity of songwriting. The informal practices have been analyzed and addressed above to find its place and potential in current teaching and learning contexts. Above all, the personal investment the adolescent makes in the act of songwriting should not be negated by the music educator. The self-expressive, communicative, social bonding and therapeutic functions
of songwriting are paramount to the adolescent and should remain intact, particularly within the formal education setting.
CHAPTER 3

SOCIO-CULTURAL UNDERSTANDING OF MUSIC

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Recent research (DeNora, 2000; Legette, 2000; Toynbee, 2000; Hargreaves & North, 1999; Shepherd, 1991; Middleton, 1990) has begun to re-evaluate the importance of the social context of the music experience. “Music in everyday life” (DeNora, 2000) redefines the context wherein people’s engagement with music is examined. Hargreaves & North (1997:2) list several prominent writings (Durkin, 1995\(^1\); Butterworth, 1992\(^2\); Fiske & Taylor, 1991:14\(^3\); Eiser, 1980\(^4\)) on recent developments in psychology, social science, social cognition and contemporary social psychology, noting the increasing awareness of the social context in the human developmental process and the integral, inextricable role of cognition, human development and sociology.

Recent research in the field of music (Hargreaves & North, 1999) also places the social dimension of music at the core of music psychology. Hoffer (1992:713) explains that a tenet of the sociological view of music is that almost everything humans do is learned, whether formally or informally, and therefore manifests itself in a great variety of ways and for a wide variety of purposes. This includes, but is not limited to, emotional expression, aesthetic enjoyment, entertainment, communication, symbolic representation, physical response, social cohesion, validation of social and religious institutions, cultural cohesion, knowledge, collective possession, personal experience, an incidental

---


commodity, a symbolic indicator of change, a link with past and future, therapy, moral and symbolic engagement and gratification\(^5\).

Hargreaves & North (1997:5) postulate that psychologists have neglected the social context in the study of music, and that a social psychology of music should include cultural and social contexts. They describe the social psychologist’s role as investigating the effects of specific listening and performing/composing situations inclusive of cultural norms that historians and musicologists might articulate.

3.2 THE ADOLESCENT’S INTERACTION AND ENGAGEMENT WITH MUSIC

Middleton (1990:98) demarcates three modes in the matrix within which popular music functions that are salient in the discussion on adolescent’s engagement in music, as adolescents’ appropriation of popular music forms are axiomatic. These modes are:

- **The everyday**: distraction, participation, conviviality;
- **The auratic**: image, fantasy, narrative identification;
- **The critical**: shock, protest.

Observations on the reasons and nature of adolescents’ engagement and interaction with music are multitudinous, yet can be superimposed within the above matrix. Observations are wide-ranging and include:

- **“Authentic self-expression”** as the key for children to find personal meaning in their musical transactions (Finney, 1999:240), including numerous theses on

---

music as communication and as a form of presentational symbolism (Winner, 1982:213).

- Music listening as preferred leisure activity among adolescents (Shuker, 1994:230), because “listening means for youth an encounter with a life attitude translated into sound gestures” (Diehl, 2000:115).

- Rock music has “reward power” as it provides information to adolescents on life, love, emotion and the adult life (La Voie & Collins, 1975:64), or as Zillmann & Gan (1997:177) state: “Romance, or sex in updated language” (See also the role of pop texts and identity politics, Hawkins: 2002).

- Adolescents engage in music for the sheer pleasure of body and emotional pleasure through text (Middleton, 1990: 258, 267; Frith, 1981:164).

- Diehl (2000:112) elucidates: “the basic experience of youth with music is that of intensity.” He (ibid.) continues:

  The basic experiences that make up the musical behavior of youth include: to lose oneself in music, to exhaust oneself with it, to express oneself in it and to feel oneself withdrawn from reality with it, to turn inward, to concentrate, simply to listen and find something of oneself within it, but also to drown oneself in sound, to put oneself in a state of delirium or to use music as a personal outward sign for the outside world, yes, as a protective shield or a detail of performance.

Frith (1987:139) likewise remarks on music’s individualizing ability through its ability for direct emotional intensity.

- Music provides “socio-cultural and emotional depots of experience” to adolescents (Ståhlhammar, 2000:38) in keeping with arguments presented in this dissertation on present and future identity.

- To express defiance of authority through music and lyrically rebellious music (Zillmann & Gan, 1997:175).

- Rock is a “deterritorializing machine” (Grossberg, 1994:51) that provides “lines of flight” from the boredom and repetition of daily routine to the energizing possibilities of fun. He (ibid.) continues, “It creates temporary and local places and spaces of mobility…”

- Music as a technology of the self and of the body, namely ways of providing social and emotional agency for the construction and maintenance of the self
(DeNora, 2000) and to construct the spaces within which they live (Bennett, 2000:195).

- Richards (1998:172) suggests that adolescents appropriate and align themselves with musical taste groups through social and sub-cultural cohesion, using music as a tactical device to social self-positioning. As Frith (1981:215) expands: music provides distinguishing features for the various peer group affiliations, and “all adolescents use music as a badge...a means of identifying and articulating emotion”.

- Frith (1981:265) notes that paradoxically adolescents engage in music as “self-indulgence and individual escape and as a source of solidarity and active dissatisfaction”.6

- Studies (Tarrant, North & Hargreaves, 2000:66) on adolescents’ reasons for listening provide evidence that adolescents listen to music for self-actualization and to satisfy social and emotional needs. Thus, the social function of music, and by implication the creation of music, that is, songwriting for the individual, musicians and non-musicians, is manifested in the management of self-identity, interpersonal relationships and mood in everyday life (Hargreaves & North, 1999:79) where self-identity, in the broader social constructivist view, includes embodiment (giving shape to intangible feelings), materiality and power (O’Neill, 2002:92).

Negus (1996:32) however, cautions that the meaning of music and reasons for engagement and interactions with certain genres can not be tied down, as individuals respond differently to the same piece of music in different contexts and among different people.

A central question that arises is: How is songwriting different to other forms of musical engagement, that is, what does songwriting provide to the adolescent that other forms of musical engagement (listening, dancing, singing) do not?

---

6 Own bold type.
Firstly, we turn to Diehl (2000:113) who refers to the functions of experiencing rock/pop music in terms of the **intensity** and various levels thereof (*Figure 3.1*).

![Figure 3.1: Music-related intensity experience (circle showing facets of equal importance)](image)

In elucidating the above diagram: Corporeal feeling deals with the **bodily experience** of music, the kinaesthetic response to sound meaning how adolescents would physically respond to music for example through dance, playing an instrument, singing, etcetera. Affection deals with the direct **emotional effect** of music for example being stirred-up, happy, or sad. Resonance refers to the musical experiences’ contribution toward **formation of identity** among adolescents, that includes the ability of music to draw together taste cultures and to provide adolescents with a medium for developing the self. Arousal refers to structures in **situative arrangements**, for example symbolism understood by all and the creation of relationships leading to the reality of a situation that makes realities possible. For example, adolescents would understand symbols such as
clothing, stance, facial expression to be associated by a certain type of music and as such creates a certain reality for them. Multi-sensory experience refers to the synaesthetic perception of acoustic, optical and space-related situative qualities observed and absorbed by adolescents’ engagement with music for example through the all-encompassing sound of band music, the possibility of submerging oneself completely in sound, thereby escaping, and so forth.

The intensity of the above experiences and combinations thereof catalyzes and determines the adolescents’ engagement and interaction with music. It is thus argued in this dissertation that songwriting provides stronger intensification on all levels: corporeal, affective, resonant, arousal and synaesthetic perception with the concomitant spin-off of social authorship, than other forms of musical engagement. Social authorship is a feature of songwriting that provides the adolescent with the possibility of a role as producer/creator/author of something new and innovative, thereby providing individuality and autonomy to the adolescent.

Secondly, we turn to the body of research on the personality and/or temperament of the musician. Kemp’s (1981a; 1981b; 1982a; 1982b; 1996) contribution on the personality structure of the musician is notable in this regard. Research by Storr (1972) concludes that individuals who are anxious tend to find escape and release by engaging in creativity. Similarly, Kemp’s (1982) research on the personality traits that both students and professional musicians have in common, identify anxiety, introversion, tender-mindedness and intelligence. Gillespie & Myors’ (2000) research on the personality of rock musicians concludes that rock musicians tended to be higher than the norm on neuroticism. They (ibid:161) theorize that higher levels of neuroticism could be necessary for musical performance and that creative activity provides an outlet for negative emotions and acts as a defense against anxiety. Their research (ibid:61) also indicates that rock musicians are particularly high on self-consciousness, i.e. not displaying excessive extraversion.
The strongest trait their research identified was **openness**. The latter refers to **openness to experience** and is associated with creativity, imagination, unconventionality and being susceptible to embracing new ideas. Over two thirds of their (ibid:63) sample actively played originally composed material and 68% claimed creativity as their greatest musical asset. It can thus be surmised that certain adolescents fitting the same personality and temperament profile, namely anxious, neurotic, self-conscious, intelligent and/or creative, could, through the creative act of songwriting, find a release for negative emotions and/or a defense mechanism against anxiety. This hypothesis will be further explored in this document in Chapter 5 in the analysis of the creative products by adolescents and in Chapter 6 in the interview and observation findings.

To further understand the social function of music for the individual, we turn to Doise (1986:10-16), who distinguishes “four levels of analyses” in social psychology namely:

- The *intra-personal*;
- the *inter-personal*;
- the *positional*; and the
- *ideological* level.

These levels are herewith applied to understand the realm of the adolescent’s engagement with, and experience of, music within a socio-cultural milieu and to further understand adolescent songwriting within that socio-cultural milieu.

The *intra-personal* level describes how individuals organize and perceive themselves in their environment and accordingly organize their behavior. The *interpersonal* level describes how the individual responds to other individuals in their social setting. The *positional level* describes individuals in their social position e.g. their friendship group.

---

and social cohesion. The fourth level, the **ideological level**, describes the individual at the broader cultural level of youth and cultural identity.

### 3.2.1 THE INTRA-PERSONAL LEVEL: THE ADOLESCENT

The intra-personal level describes the adolescent’s reflection on the self within the socio-cultural milieu.

#### 3.2.1.1 Music as technology of self

Music is appropriated by individuals as a resource for the ongoing constitution of themselves and their social psychological, physiological and emotional states. As such it points the way to a more overtly sociological focus on individuals’ self-regulatory strategies and socio-cultural practices for the construction and maintenance of mood, memory and identity (DeNora, 2000:47).

DeNora (2000) explores how music is used to constitute, construct and regulate *the self*. In addition, DeNora examines the private, aesthetically reflexive musical practices of individuals in the regulation of self using music to self-program through knowing what you need emotionally and exploring what music *does* instead of what it *means* (2000:49) to identify it as a dynamic material of social existence. Respondents in DeNora’s research showed considerable awareness of what they “needed” to hear, which she terms, “self-programming”. This research proved that the use of music in private life transpired to be the most significant fact in the constitution and regulation of self. This dissertation aims to contribute towards an understanding of how songwriting, by its very nature a reflexive practice, ties in with aforementioned research as a self-programming device.

---

utilized by adolescents to create and re-create the self through active involvement, namely the creative process. Herein they find the tools to project and introject\(^9\) their self-identity.

### 3.2.1.2 Self-therapy and mood control

Music helps to “shift mood or energy” (DeNora, 2000:53) as a component of self-care. DeNora’s respondents indicate that music facilitates the attainment, enhancement and maintenance of desired states of feeling and physical energy. It also serves as a medium to structure the parameters of aesthetic agency for example emotions, energy, drive, demeanour, etcetera. DeNora (ibid.) indicates that respondents make appropriations between musical works and their specific characteristics on the one hand, and modes of agency on the other hand to the extent that music is used to provide desired or imagined states. This care of the self, or self-conscious articulation work, is based on how people assume music works for them.

Whenever anyone gets angry we all tend to go to our rooms and turn on the music really loud. She describes the process as ‘venting’ (that is, letting off steam) with music….. As Beatrice describes this process, ‘the act is parallel to – perhaps – punching a pillow or something. Because it really makes me feel that I’m taking the anger away. I don’t know how that happens but it really works.’ The music provides a simulacrum for a behavioral impulse...(DeNora, 2000:56).

It is evident that, particularly for adolescents, music plays a significant role in the simulation of behavioral modes as described above when considering the emergence of the self as young adult and the relative powerlessness and lack of self-autonomy often experienced by adolescents. Music affords a vehicle for “working through moods” and provides a virtual reality. DeNora (2000:62)

\(^9\) Introjection as described by DeNora (2000:62) is “a presentation of self to self, the ability to mobilize and hold on to a coherent image of ‘who one knows one is’ ”.
concludes that, to use music as a simulacrum to felt emotion also defines the
temporal and qualitative structure of that emotion, and thus provides a release
from that emotion and the opportunity to move on. Likewise, Frith (1987:144)
notes on one of the social functions of music as the management of feelings.

In summation, music proves to be an active catalyst in the constitution, regulation
and maintenance of self. However, music does not merely “act upon” individuals.
People orient to it, interpret it and appropriate it for their own specific uses within
the web of music and extra-musical associations.

3.2.1.3 Music as technology of the body

McClary (1994:33) argues the ability of music to affect the body and relates
historic findings and presents manifestations and implications thereof. She
(ibid.) argues that a productive approach to music analysis would be to
concentrate on its “correspondences with the body” and proposes that music is
foremost among “cultural technologies of the body”- the locus of learning socially
mediated patterns of physical experience, temporal existence, and the like. This
means that adolescents learn physical social patterns through music, for example,
the facial expressions and bodily stances of displaying attraction for and to the
opposite sex. Here, the view (Lipsitz, 1994:21) that dance, i.e. movement, acts as
a metaphor bears significance, as it is through metaphoric engagement, physical
and psychological, that adolescents create and recreate reality and, as will be
argued, create present and future identity. The physical realm, although
significant at all stages of life, is particularly prominent in the adolescent
development and as such forms one of the prime dimensions in which adolescents
construct themselves, in keeping with DeNora’s (2000:77) notion of music as a
notes that another dimension of “self-location and self-encapsulation” establishes
itself in the physical and emotional immersion in music through dance.
Movement to music allows the adolescent an element of autonomy and self-assertion through corporeal placement. Both Richards (1998:82) on movement, and Diehl (2000:114) on aesthetic experience, refer to the significance of intensity of the musical experience for the adolescent. It can be surmised that by being physically involved, the intensity of the musical experience is strengthened.

Finnigan (1989:174), in discussing movement and the visual-bodily aspect in rock music, explains that rock musicians described their music as a performed, rather than a written piece and, as such, rock music includes a certain element of composition-in-performance resulting in a concomitant visual aspect including physical movement and gesture. Spontaneous experience, that is, the natural inclination to move or tap the foot to the beat, of music often catalyzes motoric and kinaesthetic components (Olsson, 1997:292) and is extended through perceived sub-cultural ideology. These visual aspects should be viewed as integral aspects of the popular music composition-performance practice. Linking up with gender identity, visual aspects of body presence and physicality are integral components of the male gender identity development. Whitson (1992:23) argues that learning to utilize the body in “forceful and space-occupying ways” communicates power. The locus of male gender identity development resides in physicality and construction of power and as such rock music, particularly performance (composer-performers) through body posture and stances and the mere acoustical amplified power of sound, extends the male space domination.

Music therapy has also tapped into the healing power of songwriting to restore emotional and physical well being in adolescents who have been traumatically injured through burning, spinal cord injury and brain injuries. Therapeutic songwriting has proved (Robb, 1996) to be an intervention that effectively addresses the unique needs of the adolescent patient. As such, school psychologists and counselors are using songwriting as therapeutic intervention to better understand children’s feelings, concerns, and anxieties (see for example the case study by Miles, 1993; also Newcomb & Thompson, 1994).
Finally, **security**, an important component of the adolescent development as it establishes itself in the experience and extension of the self, and the link between bodily and emotional security is expanded on by DeNora (2000:86):

> If music affords a kind of auditory device on to which one can latch in some way or other, in relation to some or other bodily activity or process, then it is a resource for the constitution of embodied security and its properties may afford such security.

Therefore, music provides an auditory sphere onto which the individual can latch upon which he/she is dependent to structure an environment of safety and/or to achieve transformation to a state of order through the physical parameters of music, that is, rhythm, texture, melody, acting as a metaphor for the ordered state required by the individual.

It is thus argued that the adolescent appropriates music for a multitude of reasons including, but not exclusive to, the **intensification** of the links between bodily and emotional experience and the extension and/or construction of struts or supportive links between the mind and body. As such, songwriting, as one of the ways in which adolescents engage in music, likewise provides mind-body struts. In the realm of songwriting imagined constructions provide the same function generally for girls, however, these are imaginal constructions providing the same function as actual lived-out performance in the rock band provides to boys.

### 3.2.1.4 Music in the forming of identity and gender identity

Recent social theory (MacDonald, Hargreaves & Miell, 2002; Giddens, 1991; DeNora, 1995a; DeNora, 1995b; Richards, 1998:47) views the self as reinventing, ever-changing, adapting to ever changing social situations in contrast to earlier fixed, more stagnant identity models. Giddens (1991) views the self as a reflexive project that involves the active construction of self-identity over time. DeNora
(2000:62) states that identity has been reconceptualized as a product of social “work”, as does Hoffer (1992:721) when describing the self as inherently a “social product”. Individuals consistently engage in an array of identity-building activities to “construct, reinforce and repair the thread of self-identity”. A large portion of this identity work is done to present oneself to others. “Music can be used as a device for the reflexive process of remembering/constructing who one is, a technology for spinning the apparently continuous tale of who one is” (DeNora, 2000:63). Hoffer (1992:721) notes that many individuals appropriate music as an “accoutrement or trapping” to a specific self-concept or socio-economic stratum. However, what is significant about identity in adolescence, is that for the first time “physical development, cognitive skills, and social expectations coincide to enable young persons to sort through and synthesize their childhood identifications in order to construct a viable pathway toward their adulthood” (Marcia, 1980:160). With specific reference to the role of composition in the forming of identity, Kemp (1996:206) describes composition as a quest for self-actualization (see also Tarrant, North & Hargreaves, 2000:166) and relates (ibid.) Copland’s answer to the question: Why compose?

...why is it so important to my own psyche that I compose music? What makes it seem so absolutely necessary, so that every other daily activity, by comparison, is of lesser significance? And why is the creative impulse never satisfied; why must one always begin anew? To the first question – the need to create – the answer is always the same – self-expression; the basic need to make evident one’s deepest feelings about life. But why is the job never done? Why must one always begin again? The reason for the compulsion to renewed creativity, it seems to me, is that each added work brings with it an element of self-discovery. I must create to know myself, and since self-knowledge is a never-ending search, each new work is only a part-answer to the question ‘Who am I?"

Kemp (1996:207) further describes the act of composition as a struggle between the individual and society, a quest for identity to work out tensions between the restrictions of society and the internal creative forces. These processes bring strength and growth to the self. “It is a process in which the individual may experience a degree of omnipotence and sense of authority and superiority; bringing order out of internal chaos” (Kemp, 1996:207). Although songwriting
may provide a multitude of emotional and social supports to the adolescent, it
does transpire that, particularly in adolescence, when the self is in a particularly
vulnerable and developing phase, creative activity does provide self-knowledge,

In view of this research on adolescents’ appropriation of music, not only as
listeners and recipients, but also as creators thereof, DeNora’s summation that
“music is a device for the generation of future identity\textsuperscript{10}, and action structures, a
mediator of future existence”, likewise Gracyk’s (2001:43) argument that listeners
create meaning in music by incorporating it into identity because of their
“engagement with future-oriented intentions” is of particular significance. It can
be inferred that adolescents find particular value in the temporal nature of music
to serve as an enabler in constructing future identity. In constructing future
identity, adolescents come to know and create present identity, a reflexive,
semiotic process of association and appropriation using, amongst others, music
with which the individual identifies.

Music and musical personae’s role in the construction of identity, specifically
gender identity, has received extensive coverage in academic discourse. The idea
of role models is well-known in social psychology. However, current discourse
refutes unilateral representation of cultural products, including music and musical
personae. Clawson (1999:102) notes that analysis is often limited to the level of
media representation and its concomitant consequences, and neglects to theorize
and specify the socio-cultural milieu, as well as the resources and constraints of
that milieu, but this is equally pivotal in the process of becoming a musician.
This means that analysis of identity formation has to be founded on a broader base
than mere single dimensional icons and symbols of representation. An
understanding of the socio-cultural context in which adolescents create music is
crucial to a fuller understanding of how gender identity is formed.

\textsuperscript{10} Own italics.
Music is one of the leisure activities in which both males and females actively engage, albeit on different levels and modes of engagement. Adolescent engagement in music includes listening, dancing, humming along to music, playing music and creating music. It can be assumed that both males and females, for various reasons due to cultural and traditional patterns, appropriate these activities possibly also to reflect and propagate gender identity. Larson’s (1995) study and Shepherd’s study (1991:178) concur in findings on gender differences in musical preferences. Olsson (1997:292) and Shepherd (1991) also report research findings relating that boys mainly played rock, specifically heavy metal and punk correlating with their listening preferences. Girls on the other hand were choristers and played traditional instruments like piano and showed preferences for ballads and easy listening music. These findings also note that 71% of girls took formal music lessons whereas only 32% of boys did so. Shepherd (1991:178) notes girls’ preference for singing along and concludes that physical considerations regarding the individual vocal instrument determine this phenomenon. He (1991:179) notes that boys seem to be attracted to specific instruments because they represent technology. A study by Koizumi (2002) also relates the distinct gender differences in the “personal”, “common” and “standard” appropriations of music between adolescent males and females. Boys’ strategies for negotiation and differentiation, and girls’ strategies for utilizing common music in order to conceal their own personal music were found.

The band is traditionally the site where masculine adolescence is formed (Clawson, 1999:103) as this research will explore. Females show lower tendencies to be involved in bands. It is particularly the rock band as locus of early self-taught and peer-taught training (Olsson, 1997:292) that forms a site of male dominance and gender formation. Clawson suggests that the reason for this is the composition of peer groups (gender homogenous) and the cultural dynamic of adolescent gender identity formation. Bennett (1980), Finnigan (1989) and Clawson (1999) note how bands start as groups of friends. Friendship groups in early adolescence are typically single sex. As a result, females are excluded from
learning in a beginner band at young ages. Research indicates that the all-male rock band is not only the result of sex-segregated society, but also indeed a masculine institution. Clawson (ibid: 108) quotes Whitson (1992)\(^{11}\) who notes the parallel with all-male activities such as sports teams. Sport promotes sex-segregated activity and is the locus of male solidarity due to a need to articulate strength and skill and a bonding with other males through team activity that shapes masculine social practices. Bands follow the same pattern. Secondly, inherent in male development is the physical identity of strength and power. Bands offer the opportunity to present the body in such a way as to suggest latent power. Thirdly, the electronic amplified sound also offers the opportunity to “dominate aural space”, and to this can be added that the prominent instrument of the band is the guitar and its concomitant phallic suggestion. Negus (1996:126) corroborates when stating that “rock has been actively *made* as male”. Walser (1993:134) likewise relates findings that hard rock supporters do not simply *express* their sexuality, but are involved in “identity work”. In these ways females distance themselves from bands and do not identify with the band as a site of developing gender identity.

### 3.2.2 THE INTER-PERSONAL LEVEL

Hargreaves & North (1999:79) identify a second social function of music namely the *establishment and maintenance of interpersonal relationships*. This ties in with the intra-personal level as an extension of self-therapy, as therapy is considered “communicative, social, and interactive” (Bunt, 1997:251).

Interaction within collaborative groups and the resultant constructive and enhanced cognitive and motor co-ordination development has been extensively

\(^{11}\) Whitson, D. 1992. “Sport in the social construction of masculinity”, in M.A. Messner & D. Szabot (eds.): *Sport, Men, and the Gender Order*. 
researched and is well documented as explicated below. Social co-ordination of actions proved more advanced than an individual’s coordination of the same actions in research on motor co-ordination in a study by Mugny & Doise (1978). Studies, for example, Doise, Mugny & Perret-Clermont (1975) on cognitive co-ordination through interaction with others yielded the same results of improvement between pre- and post-tests with children who had engaged in social interaction in the intervening period. Doise (1986) reports several studies’ results corroborating findings on the significance of social interaction for cognitive development: Silverman & Geiringer (1973) reported that social interaction during one task transferred to improved performance in other tests and Maitland & Goldman (1974) found that social interaction improved problem solving on moral judgments.

Additionally and more specifically, in the domain of social collaboration in music related tasks, the research of Burland & Davidson (2001) concluded that social grouping, friendship groups, did not specifically influence the quality of compositions, but did have a positive effect on the quality of interaction between group members. They concluded that children have a more positive emotional and social experience collaborating with friends in music group work activities. MacDonald & Miell (2000) on the other hand, have indicated that social and communicative factors are central issues in examining the quality and nature of group compositions and performances. Their research on the communication during collaborative learning, verbal and musical, taking place during compositions created by friends and non-friends has indicated that socialization and the resultant music produced by friends were of significantly higher quality than individuals who had been teamed up in non-friendship pairs. Their (ibid.) study showed that musical interaction between individuals provides mediation routes other than purely talking. Communication also takes place on the level of thoughts, emotions and ideas on a non-verbal level. As Mick Jagger (Flanagan, 1990:179) describes about the Rolling Stones’ way of collaborative working:
You don’t have to have total verbal communication. The musical communication is enough, that you know what this guy can do, what his limitations are…You don’t have to talk but gestures are very important.

MacDonald and Miell (2000:61) distinguish between “transactive” (communication that constructs and enhances ideas already expressed) and “non-transactive” communication\(^\text{12}\), similar to Jenne’s (1977:81) “affirmative” and “innovative” communication. Transactive/innovative communication was shown to be a central component of quality collaboration. Discourse on collaborative learning has explored social context of learning extensively through research and it has now transpired that children learn in many different ways (Legette, 2000), formally and informally. Children learn a great deal through interaction and engagement with others as has been reported in numerous composition studies (Burnard, 2000; MacDonald and Miell, 2000).

Thomas (1992:432) refers to Maehr’s (1984)\(^\text{13}\) **personal investment model** which offers clarification on adolescents’ choices within the larger social and educational context. Accordingly, students choose to invest effort in a task to which they have attached meaning and these meanings are determined by contextual antecedents:

- **Meaning** consists of three interrelated cognitive constructs:
  1. beliefs about self;
  2. goals related to ego, social solidarity, and extrinsic rewards;
  3. action possibilities, i.e. the perceived available behavioural alternatives.
- **Contextual antecedents** influence the meanings students attach to various activities:


1. personal experience;  
2. teaching-learning situation;  
3. information;  
4. socio-cultural context.

As can be noted from this model, adolescents’ inter-personal interaction i.e. the socio-cultural context in which their engagement with music takes place, forms a matrix within which meaning is allocated to musical tasks and transcends into beliefs about the self, goals and future actions and forms the crux of intrinsic motivation.

3.2.2.1 Self-expression as communicative form

Music’s position as a communicative system, and by inference, its self-expressive nature, has long been acknowledged. In 1988 Leonhard wrote about the power of music to the life of feeling, imagination and self-expression. He pleaded for re-evaluating music’s role in schools for the “expressive import it affords, for the effect on imagination, for the sentient life, and as an avenue for self-expression” (1988:188). He (1988:189) noted that the most devastating aspect of music education at the time was the persistent negation of “self-expression through the creation of music by composing and improvisation” thus acknowledging these activities’ fundamental role in self-expression.

Jenne (1977:23) describes music as “a system for the expression of thoughts (or associative feelings) and for the transmission of signals, sense-elements, and complex sense-relationships between subjects.”

The question arises whether adolescents’ songs, which often have the sole purpose of self-expression, i.e. private and not meant for public performance, is a
**communicative form** of self-expression? Is it communication to express your self without the intention of having a recipient or audience? Is this phenomenon on the inter-personal or intra-personal level?

Jenne (1977:26) systematizes communication behaviour by identifying various forms: direct and indirect, (re)productive and receptive communication. This he plots on a scale of intensity *(Fig. 3.2)*:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INTENSITY</th>
<th>METACOMMUNICATION</th>
<th>RECEPTION</th>
<th>(RE)PRODUCTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MAXIMUM</td>
<td>integrating communication</td>
<td>Conscious and critical reception of messages</td>
<td>(direct) messages (statement, performance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Discussion group, musical ensemble, sport team)</td>
<td>that can also be worked over meta-communicatively</td>
<td>with (direct) reaction by the recipients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(radio, TV, records)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MINIMUM</td>
<td>Unreflective awareness of messages</td>
<td>Unreflective action (singing along,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Background communication)</td>
<td>whistling to oneself, communal speaking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>of ritual formulas)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Fig. 3.2: Communication Intensity*

Jenne’s diagram of communication intensity shows that it begins with simple sense perception (penetration of the unconscious). Such messages are not recorded as a communicative act that conveys meaning and thus do not facilitate the commencement of meta-communication. In the middle area, communication is conscious but unreflected. On this level (re)productive and receptive
communication begin. The higher levels of communication are receptive and (re)productive forms of reflective communication e.g. watching television and listening to selected music. In other words, they are communication acts aimed at recipients for approval or rejection. The maximum level of communication is reached when all participants actively and consciously participate in the structuring of the communication process, for example a musical ensemble, discussion group, etcetera.

Interaction always involves communication. However, it is not a necessary and integral component of communication. Much communication takes place without any interaction for example the reader of a book, the person looking at a picture, etcetera. They all take part in a communicative process namely reacting to communicative stimuli. But do reflections, mental associations, thoughts devoid of external stimuli, have anything to do with communication? One therefore asks, does the adolescent songwriter writing only for him/herself, expressing his/her thoughts in his own private world, take part in the act of communication? Jenne (1977:32) states that thoughts reflect previously assimilated data concomitantly producing transmittable sense relationships. The answer to the question is thus yes, “thought processes, and individual reflection without a direct communicate manifestation, can be characterized as the element that gives force to every type of communication, and thus to the development of a more complex communication system” (ibid.). Similarly, Toynbee (2000:58), in discussing popular music and performance, contends that creation always has a performative dimension. Creators always have the notion of an audience, a consciousness of someone out there that the act of self-expression is ultimately intended. He (2000:57) describes this social authorship as having an element of performance to the self, where the self acts as another.

The conclusion can be made that adolescent songwriters, whether composing for themselves or for recipients of their creative product, are all engaged in a highly
complex act of communicating and are thus expressing themselves. In this way, self-expression is both intra- and interpersonal.

Expanding on this, Finney (1999:239) defines *authentic self-expression* as “awareness of ourselves as part of the process that relates to the world beyond us”, hence its inter-personal nature. Authentic self-expression implies being true to one’s own feelings and therefore adolescents’ thoughts, ideas and feelings are crucial in their conception and acceptance of themselves. The search for personal meaning is also inherent in the authentic self-expressive act. Finney (ibid.) pleads the case for acceptance of children’s “private worlds”, a creative-imaginal space. He (ibid.) quotes research supporting the very nature of this authors’ dissertation that “Studies of young people’s cultural and artistic activities out of school\textsuperscript{14} show them to be expert at finding personal meaning, developing skills and creating knowledge (Finney, 1987\textsuperscript{15}; Willis, 1990\textsuperscript{16}).” Adolescent songwriting as an informal activity studied in this research, aligns itself with Finney’s statement of “cultural and artistic activities out of school”.

Gammon (1996:120), in discussing creativity at school-age level, concludes that the expressive act is not merely from internal to external, because the internal results from building from the outside; “the self is a construct of others”. He maintains that individuals’ need for self-expression is partly to assimilate and synthesize an own identity from a number of conflicting and contradictory elements from which we are made, and concludes that artistic creation is a significant role-player in this process. It is through creation, songwriting in this case, that adolescents find a forum for self-construction by sorting through contradictory elements from outside. The process of creation provides *authorship* and concomitant *ownership*, and thereby an implied autonomy which adolescents so fervently seek. This is supported by Toynbee’s (2000:52) explanation of the

\textsuperscript{14} Own italics.
complexity of social authorship. He explains that social authorship is more complex than mere self-expression. It includes selecting, integrating and synthesizing “what is out there”, which corresponds with Negus’ (1996:70) view that creation of music is never merely reflective, but a complex web of social relations and power struggles.

It can thus be concluded that self-expression is a bi-lateral, intra- and inter-personal, ever-expanding, spiraling process of communication and creation.

### 3.2.3 THE POSITIONAL LEVEL: SOCIAL COHESION

Many theorists, and in particular Adorno (1941:39), have acknowledged popular music’s social adhesive ability, that is “social cement”\textsuperscript{17}. As early as 1975, La Voie & Collins (1975:58) described rock music’s role for the adolescent as enhancing identification with peers and providing a bond. It also provides adolescents with information on such varied topics as love, parent relations, aspirations, values, etcetera.

In examining social cohesion i.e. the tendency of individuals to affiliate and conform to a homogeneous group, we turn to Crozier (1997:68) who refers to Levine & Russo’s (1987) study explaining social conformity. This study by Levine & Russo (1987) distinguishes between two types of social dependence processes namely “compliance” and “informational influence”. Compliance relates to how individuals depend on a group for approval and acceptance according to a reward or punishment expectation. Informational influence is the process whereby individuals compare their view on everyday life to that of the group as a device to create and evaluate reality.

\textsuperscript{17} The term “social cement” as used by Mohan, A.B. & Malone, J. 1994:284.
Studies have shown that adolescents succumb to majority and minority group influences depending on their perception of, and affiliation to, particular reference groups. To understand the adolescent and the role of the influence of the social group upon the adolescent’s behavior and perceptions, it is important to distinguish between private and public attitudes. Private opinions are often suppressed to conform to majority opinions or to fit in. Crozier (ibid.) relates Finnäs’ (1989)\textsuperscript{18} findings of the discrepancy between the publicly confessed and privately preferred music preferences of young people. The reason for adolescents’ private and public selves, or personal and social identity (Crozier, 1997:71) are manifold including self-preservation motives, protecting the self from embarrassment (Maass et al, 1987), and conceptualizing and establishing the self. It is axiomatic that music relates to social identity as adolescent appropriation of certain types of music, for example heavy metal or rock, symbolizes the identity of their particular group and affiliation. Consequently, music offers the adolescent a tool to further explore, develop and align the self within a social structure. Also, Mohan & Malone (1994:284) observe that popular music functions as “social cement” when it communicates a value system. Self-expression as communicative form, as described in paragraph 3.2.1, takes place in a variety of forms to corroborate or repeat previous messages, strengthen attitudes and strengthen togetherness (Jenne, 1977:80). DeNora (2000:109) articulates music’s role as a device for collective ordering i.e. how music is utilized to align and co-ordinate seemingly disparate individuals. DeNora (ibid.) proposes that music, or aesthetic materials, provide a template or paradigms for the construction of non-aesthetic matters in everyday life. As such adolescents engaged in songwriting appropriate the activity of songwriting to create a paradigm to align themselves within a collective social ordering that they project and introject through music.

3.2.4 THE IDEOLOGICAL LEVEL: YOUTH, YOUTH CULTURE AND CULTURAL IDENTITY

Current discourse on the meaning of popular music and how it is mediated by cultural and sub-cultural theory, view cultural identity and ideas about cultural identity as dynamic, shifting systems and viewpoints as opposed to former fixed or rigid conceptions that simply reflect or portray a lifestyle or certain group of people through direct links between lyrics/lifestyles, texts/identities, etcetera (Claus-Bachmann, 2000:14; Negus, 1996:133). Cultural identities are “morphic” and are created through processes of social and musical cohesion employing the structural elements from the supply of elements within music to demarcate identity, Claus-Bachmann’s (2000:14) Grenzmarkenvorrat. These are elements within music such as performance style, clothing, expressions, etcetera, that form markers of particular groups drawing them together through their own set of symbols.

It is not within the scope of this research to define discourse on sub-cultural theory or provide a history of youth sub-culture, but rather to illuminate current discourse on sub-cultural theory to provide a backdrop to the phenomenon of adolescent songwriting. Hence, current constructivist views on sub-cultural formation are delineated to provide the framework for analyses of the creative product namely adolescent songs in this study. Therefore, Claus-Bachmann’s (2000:15) argument for a “systematic conception of cultures”, meaning that youth subcultures are dynamic systems originating from marginal situations (cultural minority groups, underprivileged groups) as opposed to dominant systems for

---

19 Grenzmarkenvorrat as applied by Claus-Bachmann (2000:14) signifies a supply of elements that demarcate identity and includes all signs, symbols, activities, ways of thinking, etcetera, that individuals engage in to distinguish themselves and/or to align themselves with certain groups they wish to be associated with. In cultural identity terms, particularly relevant in adolescence, this includes, but is not limited to clothing, hairstyles, jewelry, body painting and piercing, linguistic expression, music, eating habits, leisure activities, etcetera.
example parents, bourgeois or middle-class social formations, and the like, a notion supported by Lipsitz (1994:20), forms the tenet of the argument in this dissertation. As McRobbie (1980) observes: “It is necessary to adjust our old preconceptions about youth culture as male adolescence played out on the street”, and accept that male youths do indeed have a domestic situation. In observation of youth sub-culture products it transpires that these demarcated, marginalized groups produce of the most dynamic and creative art forms of youth culture e.g. rap. Individuals dominated and demarcated by mainstream society often find their only outlet and locus of resistance in the sub-cultural art forms. These marginal cultural groups i.e. sub-cultures, are demarcated through the appropriation of sensorial markers such as clothing, music, jewelry, make-up, art forms, etcetera, i.e. sub-cultural affiliations that are “coded in signs” (Gaines, 1991:92; Diehl, 2000:111). Assmann20 (1992:154), as mentioned by Claus-Bachmann (2000), observes that anti-identities are thus formed and maintained as reaction against a dominating culture and not as cultureless chaos. However, it should be noted that the majority of youths do not necessarily affiliate to spectacular, necessarily deviant and/or rebellious sub-cultures. Most adolescents simply share, often in a limited way, those activities and “badges” of the sub-cultural affiliation (see also Ross, 1994:7). It can be noted, according to the Assmann research, how youth subcultures cyclically repeat, establish themselves through circularly repeating rituals and practices, formations and presentations as a constructivist system. The constructivist viewpoint of culture and by implication music culture is, according to Claus-Bachmann (2000:17), essentially an ethnomusicological and anthropological perception as self-determination towards own identity systems and forms an integral part of this concept. The constructivist viewpoint is supported in this dissertation, as adolescent songwriting is a creative and identity forming activity essentially establishing and repeating rituals and formations of the self and the affiliated sub-cultural group.

A corroborating viewpoint is found in Toynbee’s (2000:37) explanation of the “self-interested nature of culture-making”. He (ibid.) refutes the ideological belief of the monolithic nature of the artwork and argues for a dual view of cultural production, specifically popular music production namely firstly, the self-serv ing, strongly individualistic nature of creation and the personal benefit it brings and secondly, that popular music, more than any other cultural form, perpetuates and communicates on behalf of the community (social struggle, minority issues, etcetera) and for collective benefit.

Diehl’s thesis (2000) supports the notion of individuals’ participation in lifestyles and expressive forms within sub-cultural scenes as a construction of reality and that this construction is determined aesthetically. Diehl (2000:111) views intensity as a category of cultural philosophy that bears direct evidence on youth and their daily encounters with music through their basic need for intense living. Demonstration of affiliation to a sub-cultural group creates intensification of the “self”. Diehl (2000:112) describes this “as-is-ness” as a form of heightened significance to adolescents. It is through the intensity of the musical experience of adolescents that they manage to submerge and immerse themselves to create a simulacrum to an acceptable reality. Of particular significance for this research is Diehl’s (ibid:112) thesis that adolescents are tied to their respective sub-cultural milieus and the relevant inner reflections and concomitant external lifestyles through:

- Individual active participation, (for example songwriting) and
- An aesthetic determination of this action.

Firstly, adolescents are not “consumed” by a certain sub-culture, rather they act and contribute to creating the sub-culture. Secondly, Diehl (ibid:113) proposes that everything occurs as aesthetic behaviour, that is, all external elements contribute to constituting a holistic impression in a highly differentiated way. He notes that “self-productive music-making (corporeal, active, haptic components)”
creates an intensification of the affiliation to the sub-cultural group. As such, self-productive music-making, e.g. songwriting, produces “model-like aspects of the own inner self” which the adolescent attempts to bring to the surface and is crucial in the understanding of the difference between active and receptive engagement in music. This author contends that it is in the heightened intensity of music creation that adolescents find maximal extension and realization of the self in and through culture.

Similarly, Negus (1996:134) argues for the concept of “articulation” as a way of understanding the myriad interconnections between creation and consumption of popular music. As such, popular music as cultural formation should be viewed as a web of mediations between involved parties, not as linear communication between creator and consumer. The meaning of music and its role in cultural identity arises from the way in which performers and consumers “articulate” with each other in certain socio-cultural ways. Likewise, Willis’s (1978) study explains how music does not reflect social values, but acts as dynamic system utilized by people. The content of this research on adolescent songwriting thus aligns itself with the contributions of Willis (1978), Frith (1978; 1981) and Hall (1980) as not explicating on cultural works, but rather the utilization and establishment of culture by individuals within the context of their daily lives, what DeNora (2000:7) describes as a “cultural vehicle”, a kind of aesthetic technology or an instrument of social ordering.

For the purposes of this research, culture is thus understood from a constructivist viewpoint as an active, morphic ingredient of social formation in broadening our understanding of adolescent songwriting.
3.3 SUMMARY

This chapter expanded on the socio-cultural aspects of music and how individuals interact and engage with music. As such, Doise’s (1986:10-16) four levels of social explanation, the intra-personal, the inter-personal, the positional and the ideological levels provide a paradigm in which to view adolescents’ engagement in music. Music as a technology of the self, as a medium for self-therapy, mood control and its role in the development of gender identity was explored. The communicative role of music as form of self-expression was expounded on including its role in broader inter-personal and social formations.

This chapter proposed a socio-cultural framework within which to view, understand and analyze the adolescent phenomenon of songwriting.

The next chapter will explore the compositional (songwriting) process to identify techniques and strategies of the creative process. The corroboration with compositional techniques in keeping with current theories on creativity, creativity as social formation and informal learning theory will be addressed.
CHAPTER 4

SONGWRITING: THE COMPOSITIONAL PROCESS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

Although the foci of this research are the nature and function of adolescent songwriting with the locus of the research on the description of the creative product, the creative process does deserve consideration as an integral and inseparable component in the understanding of the fruition and establishment of this phenomenon. As such, modes of composing, i.e. individually or collaboratively, and the general nature of creativity are examined. Particularly relevant is the discourse on creativity within the social context of the adolescent linking it to the aim of this study namely the nature and function of the compositional act. The compositional process bears relevance in as much as it will be established that adolescents use the process of songwriting to establish and enhance social cohesion, to further communication and expression with peers and to exert creative and intellectual activity in an informal learning environment.

4.2 COMPOSITIONAL MODES

Due to the many social and technological changes over past years, the average individual today is exposed to more music, in a greater variety of modes, than the average person of even a few years ago. Television, radio, computers, video games, and the mass media have revolutionized how and when people utilize music. Frith¹, as quoted by Hargreaves & North (1999:72) has noted that “music has become

entirely mobile” and thus music has become entirely “individualized: it has become a soundtrack to everyday life, and thus a central part of personal development and identity for many people.” The adolescent today has access to a vast amount of musical styles and musically expressive forms on a number of different levels.

Hargreaves & North (1999:73) furthermore note that boundaries between styles and genres have diffused and accessibility to various styles and genres are optimized through their ubiquity. The ubiquitous and pervasive nature of music in the modern world and the concomitant shared ownership in the conception, creation and production thereof reshapes our definition of creation in music (see Hargreaves & North, 1999:73; Dalgarno2, 1997). No longer is the creation of music reserved for “the composer”, but songwriting has become a domain for anyone to explore. More and more adolescents also acquire instruments, albeit not rock band standard, at a very young age with which they experiment and imagine themselves in the commercial world of music. As interest in music peaks in adolescence and instrumental skill improves, it is but a short step to creating own compositions for the self or the band. Why and when this step is taken is henceforth explored.

The ways in which music is conceived, created and produced need to be explored and to this end Finnigan’s (1989:160-67) study of music making at the local level in a small English town, provides findings on different modes of composition. She identifies three different modes of composition:

- The classical mode of **prior written composition** by an individual.

- **Composition-in-performance.** Here the composer relies on a reference framework of musical formulae suited to the style and tradition of the particular music which enables him/her to compose in performance, similar

---

to improvising, but unique to every situation.\(^3\) This is typically an oral-formulaic process; although in cases when something is written down it is rather an aide-memoire than a complete score.

- **Collective prior composition:** much used by, for example, rock groups, though typically not written. Finnigan also labels this “prior-composition-through-practice” mode. Songs are worked out beforehand, not written down, but rehearsed enough to become totally familiar to the band members to replicate in performance. Typically, all band members contribute to the composition process by one member “coming up with an idea” that sparks other members to add to systematically until a whole song evolves.

To the above, the author of this dissertation adds a fourth mode of composition, namely:

- **Individual prior oral composition:** This is similar to collective prior composition, except it is composed by an individual who worked out a song starting with a catchy idea/riff/motif, then expanding it into a complete song. This is then repeated many times over, that is, rehearsed so thoroughly that it becomes a complete composition, often known only to the composer. Typically, this composition is not notated, but lyrics are often written down. There may also be aide-memoire in the form of chord symbols and or graphics to aid in remembering the basic pitch and/or rhythmic motif.

From the above it is clear that we may distinguish between two main modes of composition: *individual* forms and *collaborative* forms, which also form a basic difference between different styles of music, for example classical and popular music and pop and rock music. Rock music has as its center the ‘band’, a social

---

organization and integral to the cultural identity of rock. Pop music focuses on the vocalist with anonymous accompaniment or backing. This forms a salient link to the different modes of composition. Music provides mediation routes between individuals, but also acts as a form of mediation between the self and the outside world. In this sense, individual and collaborative composition serve the same purpose, meaning it has the same communicative and expressive meaning for the adolescent.

A table of comparison (Figure 4.1) between these two modes, as applicable to the styles of music, namely popular music, shows the following physiognomy:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INDIVIDUAL MODE OF COMPOSITION</th>
<th>COLLABORATIVE MODE OF COMPOSITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Similar to composition-in-performance: an individual is free to change number of verses or repetitions of chorus during any rendition thereof.</td>
<td>Typically the music is rehearsed to form a finished, performance-based composition, i.e., not changed overly during performance. However, may be changed from one performance to another.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stylistically, the composition tends to be of the ballad type, single voice with accompaniment, with melodic and rhythmic features suited to the accompaniment instrument that is typically piano (keyboard) or guitar.</td>
<td>Stylistically the music is conceived for a group. Clawson (1999:101) notes, “rock music identifies the entire band as its ideal creative and performing unit”. It is multi-layered, has harmony parts, is multi-textured, etc. due to the nature of having multiple instruments and voices involved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The composition is not necessarily audience directed, but conceived for self-performance, without any (or very little)</td>
<td>The composition is conceived for audience, for “attention and adulation” (Clawson, 1999:101) and is inherently</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
thought to clothing, performance style, movement, etc.

audience directed, with the concomitant badges and icons of band music, on stage, for an audience for example clothing, hair styles, movement, instrument handling, commentary over the mike to the audience, etcetera, all of which forms part of “the composition”.

The composition is typically not notated. The most common form is a page of lyrics with chords written to the words.

Lyrics may or may not be written down.

Typically a pop style with a focus on the vocalist.

Typically a rock style, focus on the group. “Rock music highlights instrument playing in a characteristic way…is strongly linked to notions of rock creativity…” (Clawson, 1999:101).

Figure 4.1 Table of comparison of the physiognomy of individual and collaborative forms of songwriting.

Lilliestam (1996:209) observes that collective composition has to date been studied very little by musicologists, although recently articles, notably in Billboard Magazine (Cobo, 2001; Cronin, 1995) on songwriting teams have appeared stressing mainly the history and nature of the collaborative process, rather than the educational impact thereof. Paradoxically, collaborative composition is more prevalent than individual composition as it exists in most folk music and popular music.
4.3 THE CREATIVE PROCESS: COMPOSING

4.3.1 Creativity

The making of music in a popular style is not as simple as analyzing the product or dissecting the process of creativity. As outlined above in the discussion on the different modes of composition, it is apparent that performance plays an integral role in the creativity process in popular music styles. The production of popular music is also inherently a process of musical agency, rather than what is traditionally conceived as creativity. Creativity in popular music styles is thus complicated by ownership and/or social authorship. Issues of cultural production are also at stake in this process. Shepherd (1991:134) notes that “participation in the ownership and control of material or intellectual property creates a different relationship to the world and a different interest from the non-participation of people who can only sell their labour power.” He (ibid.) adds that those who have ownership thereby control material. As such, the creative act is experienced by the adolescent as more than a mere temporal process of making a song, but also affords the adolescent the opportunity to wield and exert power through production: having a say, being “out there”, making their voices heard. It can therefore be concluded that the creative act to the adolescent is often more overt than covert, an intentional act of raising the voice in which two decision-making poles form a crux: on the one hand, musically related decisions and on the other hand decisions regarding the outcome of the product in its entirety. Toynbee (2000:35) theorizes that the concept of creating popular music is not “an intuitive act of expression, but rather something which depends on planning, research and the constant monitoring of the outcome of decisions” and refers to this as knowledge production. He (ibid.) continues:
I want to suggest that people who make popular music are creators, that is, agents who make musical differences in the form of texts, performances and sounds. Crucially, though, the musical creator is restricted in how much difference s/he can make at any given moment. In other words the unit of creativity is a small one.

In sum, the creative act in popular music creation is limited and restricted to “small creative acts” and is, according to Toynbee (ibid.), a common denominator in pop. He (2000:66) argues that in popular music creativity occurs on a small scale: it consists of many small creative acts rather than one grand effort. The nature of any act that is considered “creative” is inherently novel or new within certain parameters as conceived by a certain cultural group. Toynbee (ibid.) asserts that in popular music the room for creative maneuvering is particularly limited due to the lack of compatibility between “habitus” and “field”:

Bourdieu’s theory of habitus and field, and his observations of cultural production provide a helpful way of understanding creativity in popular music. The key concept here is the space of possibles. Possibles are, first, in the relationship between habitus (artists’ dispositions) and field of musical production (the power relations among, and pattern of positions taken by, all artists); and, second, in that historical fund of practices, textual forms and codes called the field of works. Constraint and possibility are produced together in that while habitus and field are relatively stable the fit between them is never a tight one. We can augment Bourdieu’s thinking here by adding a third consideration – the likelihood of the selection of possibles. With this set of terms and conditions in mind I want now to take a further step and assemble a general model – the radius of creativity – which can be applied to all sorts of popular music-making and perhaps the production of culture more generally.

Bourdieu’s notion of habitus and field in creativity correlates with Csikszentmihalyi & Rich’s (1997) view of a systems approach of creativity encompassing the environment in which the individual creates. Csikszentmihalyi & Rich identify domain, a cultural or symbolic environment (correlating to Bourdieu’s habitus) and field, the social aspect (correlating to Bourdieu’s field). The systems model of Csikszentmihalyi & Rich (1997) illuminates the creative process at both the macro and micro level. At the macro level, creativity in historical examples can be viewed

---

within the domain and field (cultural, symbolic and social environment). At the micro level, the systems model reminds us of innovation within the limitations of a domain, i.e. the judgments and practices of the field (Csikszentmihalyi & Rich, 1997:48). Of importance in this research, is the notion of the phenomenology of the creative experience at the micro level. They (1997:48) conclude: “Perhaps the most salient experiential aspect of creativity is the enjoyment it provides (see also Custodero, 1998). Artists and scientists remember moments of creativity as instances of ‘peak experience’ or ‘flow’”. This notion of enjoyment, or flow, is further explored under Informal Learning below as motivation in the phenomenon of adolescent songwriting.

Toynbee’s (2000:40) model of creativity, “the radius of creativity”, views creativity as a circular space. Central is the music maker (individual or collective) extending to a vague circumference along which radius lie all the creative possibilities. In the center a high density of possibles exists and so also customary, familiar patterns from which to choose. Towards the extremities of the creative radius, possibilities are fewer. The propensity to select from the center forms one constraint or limitation on creativity (Figure 4.2):

---

5 Own italics.
He (2000:67) explains the relationship of creativity and performance as mutually dependent i.e. performance realizes the act of creation, in itself another restriction in the radius of creativity. From Toynbee’s theory we conclude that, in popular music styles, the creative act is limited, but also mediated, by the restrictions of conventions, styles and idioms within the popular field. As Csikszentmihalyi & Rich (1997:46) note: “Creativity is not the product of single individuals, but of social systems making judgments about individuals’ products”. It is within these parameters that adolescent songwriting must be viewed. We can surmise that, when considering the spectrum of the creativity of the adolescent songs, they will reflect
and mediate, if indeed not imitate, the immediacy of their involvement with particular popular music styles. Paradoxically, it will indeed be the familiar, imitated patterns used in novel ways, Toynbee’s “small creative act”, that will render a composition innovative and creative, rather than an overall, grand creative effort. Van der Merwe (1989:97) succinctly notes: “When the conservative critic denounces an innovative work, it is usually not the novelties he objects to so much as the absence of the old familiar patterns.”

4.3.2 Creativity as social formation

Central to the argument of creativity in popular music, is music’s ability to represent social formation in struggle. Creativity in popular music often emerges from social relations of dominance and class antagonism as an expression against the exigencies of the social system and is “the key aspect of the popular in popular music” (Toynbee, 2000:36). The notion of social formation is relevant in this argument as adolescents find themselves in a phase of life where autonomy needs to be established and they thus extend themselves into a social system struggling for, mostly, acceptance and social space. **Social production** thus forms a tool to mediate the transition.

We thus examine Toynbee’s view on Bourdieu’s study on the field of cultural production, which he elucidates extensively. Bourdieu argues that since the mid-nineteenth century a struggle existed between an economically and socially dominant group, representing the establishment, and those against, or outside, it. This conflict displays hierarchical positioning, which has as result cultural production. Cultural products are thus used as self-serving purpose to further, adjust, object and/or display social positioning. Toynbee (2000:37) asserts that this counters the naïve ideological belief in the purity of art. Sociologically, popular

---

music acts as common denominator and musicians assert themselves as spokesmen of the community. “In my view we should therefore see the field of popular music as the site both of a struggle for individual position and a utopian drive to make the world better through music” (Toynbee, 2000:37).

The creation of popular music further serves the purpose of social cohesion and gender formation (see cultural identity and gender issues in Chapter 3). To this can be added that the inherent social nature of collaborative composition lends itself to the development and establishment of the self as part of the world, community and peer group through multi-dimensional modes of expression, verbal and non-verbal.

### 4.3.3 The creative process: composition

In developing a forum for placing adolescent songwriting in an educational context, the thinking processes involved therein need closer inspection. Five aspects of creative thinking in music (DeTurk, 1989:27) relevant to songwriting can be outlined as follows and are linked to similar theories of researchers mentioned thus far:

- Creativity is catalyzed by intense desire and preparation (motivation);
- Creativity demands working at one’s full potential (Csikszentmihalyi’s flow\(^9\));
- Creativity demands “an internal rather than external locus of evaluation. Working to personal standards in pursuit of a personal product serves to isolate the creative thinker from peer pressure and possibly even teacher evaluation” (DeTurk, 1989:27). This correlates with the attribution theory as discussed under Informal Learning (paragraph 4.4 below);

---

- Creativity requires reframing and reworking of ideas to arrive at an aesthetic arrangement of the elements of music within a given paradigm, Eisner’s\textsuperscript{10} “aesthetic organization”; similar to Toynbee’s (2000) notion of restricted maneuvering room in the “creativity radius”.
- Creativity can be improved by opportunities for free-flowing thought.

In keeping with Eisner’s notion of “reframing and reworking of ideas” it is worthwhile to examine Bennett’s model of the composition process (1976:7), which he developed after interviewing professional composers (Figure 4.3).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{music_composition_process.png}
\caption{Model of the process of music composition}
\end{figure}

In assessing this model, keeping the adolescent and his/her songwriting in mind, the question regarding *compositional process* that comes to mind is: How exactly does that germinal idea take shape and how does it evolve into a sketch and then a draft, etcetera?

We turn to Serafine (1988:74) and examine the notion of “temporal processes” in composition. Serafine maintains that music is organized along two coexisting dimensions, the “simultaneous” (harmony) and the “successive” (counterpoint):

In the **successive dimension**, the cognitive processes of chaining, grouping and patterning takes place within certain idiomatic parameters. Four sub-processes include:

1. **Idiomatic construction**: a coherent cell, unit, motif or riff.
2. **Motivic chaining**: cumulative, additive process where two or more units are combined to form a larger one.
3. **Patterning**: repetitive chaining of units.
4. **Phrasing**: larger-scale efforts to lump together phrases, not necessarily equal in length.

In the **simultaneous dimension**, one musical event is superimposed upon another. In cognizing simultaneous events, Serafine (ibid.) identifies the following:

1. **Timbre synthesis**: the combination of two or more timbres (instruments) ranging from inseparable blends to juxtaposed sounds.
2. **Motivic synthesis**: simultaneous melodic or rhythmic motives.
3. **Textual abstraction**: In simultaneous streams of activity, it is necessary to identify a definable texture i.e. important material (for example, melody above accompaniment) needs to emerge from the rest of the musical activity.
Finnigan (1989), Bennett (1976), Toynbee (2000), Serafine (1988) and Eisner (1964) all refer to the basic small creative unit (motif or riff), which is then expanded and evolves into the composition. Serafine’s model of temporal processes explains the compositional evolution process as it spins into a larger work. This theoretical analysis conforms to Burnard’s (2000:238) findings in a study with children’s music-making that mental models, or ideas/units/riffs, were added together to form a larger structure: the piece. The above models and Toynbee’s (2000:53) notion of “creation-in-progress” (the uncompleted nature of pop) will be used to analyze and compare the composition process of adolescents in Chapter 6.

Although research in compositional process mostly relies on studies in literate styles, typically in a scholarly or academic setting as in aforementioned Bennett, Eisner and Serafine, certain basic principles of composition and songwriting, Lilliestam’s notion of formulae (1996:203), apply to all music styles, including popular music. Although the area of compositional process in popular music is largely unexplored (Covach, 1999:468; Lilliestam, 1996:213) basic premises do exist. Writings (Lilliestam, 1996; Clawson, 1999; Finnigan, 1989; Bennett, 1980) on compositional process in rock bands and with numbers of popular singers do reveal the following common denominators in the compositional process:

- Most songwriters and players/performers of popular music (pop and rock) are primarily self-taught (Bennett, 1980; Clawson, 1999:104);
- The development of the learning, songwriting and playing experience is often peer-based, that is, a collective experience (Clawson, 1999, Bennett, 1980; Cohen, 1991), correlating with Saar’s (1992:19) horizontal learning;
- The compositional process often involves “getting a song from a record” (Bennett, 1980:132) and/or “lifting” a musical idea/riff/line from someone else and adapting it to your own song (Lilliestam,

---

Burnard (2000:234) also reported this occurrence in her study with children’s composition and improvisation. She notes that it was common for children to develop pieces from known melodies and rhythms “by ear”.

“Eddie van Halen claims that to this day he can play every solo by Eric Clapton as he has copied them all, but he also stresses that you have to move on from the simple copying and make something of your own” (Obrecht, 1993:67).

- “All creative acts have formulas as points of departure” (Lilliestam, 1996:203). This correlates with “germinal idea” (Bennett, 1976) and “motif/unit” (Serafine, 1988), which is a basic small unit of sound (commonly referred to as a riff) that forms the basis of exploration into larger compositions. Shuker (1994:104) relates supportive observation of a band noting that a band member comes up with a new song by playing a “short sequence of notes (a riff) which he plays over and over to enable the others to get the feel of it”. The others try a few chords, try the beat, repeat the riff and experiment with more chords and beats. This then spins into a larger composition as all try out the basic unit, adding and changing.

- To reiterate: a piece thus develops unit-by-unit, phrase-by-phrase, and mental models, or aural images, are formed of the piece as a structure through extensive repetition. Songs are mentally mapped as formal structures for example, songs have definite sections, e.g. chorus, refrain, verse, bridge, introduction. This correlates with Burnard’s (2000:241) findings of compositional maps containing “structural signposts” or “temporal markers” to facilitate memory.

Lilliestam (1996:208) relates the story of a 13-year-old aspiring rock player explaining how he composes songs: “You just sit down and play and sooner or later something comes out!” Although many interviews (see Lilliestam, 1996:208-213; Sloboda, 1985:115) with songwriters and aspiring songwriters relate attacks of
inspiration, songs coming from out of nowhere, sudden creative storms, etcetera, just as many relate stories of extreme effort and long periods of work. Sloboda’s (1985:116) study notes the general consensus of the existence of two phases in composition namely inspiration and execution. In this account, Sloboda’s “inspiration”, a skeletal idea or theme, conforms to the above-argued notion of initial idea/unit/riff. The “execution” phase, where “the idea is subject to a series of more conscious and deliberate processes of extension and transformation” conforms to the above-argued notion of motivic chaining, patternning, phrasing (Serafine, 1988) and sketch, first draft, etcetera (Bennett, 1976).

Songwriting is on the whole a process that relies greatly on memory, an unnotated, unwritten activity. The process of creating a song, unit by unit, phrase by phrase, relies on remembering “new discoveries” or previously discarded ideas that could “fit” with a new idea. Memory, as discussed under Notation in Chapter 5, involves auditive, visual, tactile-motoric and verbal memory (Lilliestam, 1996:201). However, memory also forms a crucial component in the creative process of composition. The different types of memory all at work in greater or lesser degrees during songwriting are:

- **Auditive memory**: the very essence of remembering and recalling music and thereby creating new ideas within certain parameters.
- **Visual memory**: e.g. notation, tablatures, the physiognomy of the instrument, etc.
- **Tactile-motoric memory**: remembering the feel of playing e.g. hand positions and finger patterns in playing an instrument.
- **Verbal memory**: naming musical phenomena. Verbal identification i.e. labeling, assists memory.

All aspects of memory as listed above influence, if not determine, the compositional process and thereby the final creative product. Auditive memory has been discussed above noting the formation of unit-by-unit, phrase-by-phrase build-up in creating a
composition, which inherently relies on auditive memory. Visual memory, particularly notation, is discussed in Chapter 5. In essence, verbal memory forms part of visual memory in the sense of labeled, identified phenomena in music and is discussed below (paragraph 4.4 Informal Learning). It is thus tactile-motoric memory that remains to be discussed and has particular significance in the creative process.

Several writings (Lilliestam 1996, Bennett 1980), including this study on Adolescent Songwriting, observe that songwriters use their instrument to create a new song. The use of an instrument combines visual, tactile-motoric and auditive memory. It has been argued that the creative process in songwriting involves playing around i.e. exploring sound, on the instrument, trying out ideas, copying known ideas, changing them, expanding them, all in the attempt to create something new and original sounding through exploration. It can be deducted that the presence of an instrument has the following implications in the creative process:

- The instrument, by its physical nature, sets limitations for example range, melodic/harmonic, volume, etcetera.
- The instrument demands instrumental idiomacy, that is, playing in a style suited to the instrument.
- Instrumental playing demands certain technical facility and skill by the player to produce the basic unit/riff or idea to create a new song.

4.4 INFORMAL LEARNING

Odam (2000:122), reflecting on research undertaken in the United Kingdom in 1998 and 1999, noticed that as early as Key Stage 3 (ages 11-14) and 4 (ages 15-18), students were composing out of school:
We can now show that a surprising number of pupils voluntarily compose music outside school. The evidence from our sample of pupils is that 35 per cent at Key Stage 3 compose on their own outside school for their own enjoyment and at Key Stage 4 this figure rises to 53 per cent. This suggests that the ‘Sunday composer’ may soon become as much a feature in our society as the ‘Sunday painter’. Pupils spoke of composing as a relaxation, a relief from depression and from boredom. One pupil described the experience as ‘playing with sounds’.

Lilliestam (1996:207), quoting Davis (1985:16)\textsuperscript{12}, also reflects on this informal, outside of school, musical phenomenon:

> The good thing about the guitar was that they didn’t teach it in school. Teaching myself was the first and most important part of my education. I know that Jeff Beck and I enjoyed pure music because we didn’t have to. I hope they keep it out of the schools.

Stock (2003:139) relates his research of learning in traditional opera in Shanghai where opera singers learned on the job after an initial period of apprenticeship and notes how extremely successful learning occurred within an environment that completely de-emphasised teaching. He (ibid.) concludes that from this type of learning we can research \textit{life-long learning}, an idea that is also currently internationally important in music education curricula.

As Clawson (1999), Shuker (1994), Finnigan (1989) and Bennett (1980) concur: a central characteristic of adolescent involvement in rock bands is the autonomy from formal instruction. The informal musicians are self or peer taught. Bennett (1980:18) observes informal learning as “learning without pedagogy” about rock musicians. He (1980:3) notes that rock music is \textit{learned} rather than \textit{taught}. This tendency has been noticed by many an educator, however, to date little research (with the exception of for example Green, 2001 whose research covers, among others, the adolescent) has been undertaken to investigate the nature and meaning of the \textbf{adolescent} “informal composer” phenomenon. Some research projects have investigated bands and band playing in adolescence. However, the compositional/songwriting efforts of adolescents, in bands and as individuals, are to date virtually unexplored, although recently some writings and research have

appeared, for example Green’s (2001) study of various learning and teaching styles based on interviews with 14 musicians on how popular musicians learn, formally and informally. Mark (1996:120) pleads the case for in-depth phenomenological studies to research how people learn popular musics. He (ibid:120) suggests that music educators become proficient enough in ethnography to learn how informal learning and teaching takes place in ethnic communities thereby providing schools with a resource for emulating informal methods of the greater community. He (ibid.) concludes that such research will be achieved through qualitative research techniques.

*Informal learning*, as termed in this research, correlates with the term “*acculturation*” used by some scholars (Hargreaves, 1986b; Sloboda, 1985), meaning spontaneous learning that is not consciously directed or assigned, as opposed to formal learning, or “training”. The term “*tacit knowledge*” (Lilliestam, 1996:199) is thus also applicable. Tacit knowledge is unverbalized skills, actions, activities that are not explained or formally taught. Tacit knowledge is a set of skills and knowledge people acquire through informal observation, imitation and repetition and is an acknowledged form of knowledge.

Similar terminology (Lilliestam 1996:207) used that comply with the formal/informal learning concept are:

- **Strong and weak traditions of learning:** Rolf (1991:148ff)\(^\text{13}\) proposes this terminology to distinguish between a strong learning tradition e.g. formal teacher-student process and weaker traditions e.g. oral traditions.

- **Vertical and horizontal learning:** Saar (1992:16)\(^\text{14}\) discerns that in vertical teaching a more experienced, expert person teaches the music and the instrument. In horizontal teaching individuals develop and learn together, for example, peer learning in rock bands.


The nature of the informal music learning adolescents experience as they create music, particularly collaboratively, can thus be termed as an example of Rolf’s “weak tradition” and an example of Saar’s “horizontal learning”.

In considering the nature of the informal learning process we turn to recent trends in research on human development. Hargreaves (1986a:86) identifies three main streams of discourse in the current field of developmental psychology:

- It is now believed that children take an **active role** in structuring their own development.
- **Cognitive approaches**: development is a joint enterprise, that is, socialization plays a role and is seen as a two-way activity.
- **The ecological approach**: a holistic view of human development, that is, concentration on interpersonal networks, also embracing *life-span* approaches.

Discourse on all the above bears relevance in this study. Firstly, when linking children’s **active role** in structuring their own development to a **socio-cultural** perspective, it can be seen that the very social nature of music and adolescents’ overt engagement therein produce active structuring of their own development. MacDonald & Miell (2000:58) concur that interaction between peer groups, family, teachers and pupils affect individuals’ “interest and knowledge about music” and their personal identity development.

Secondly, research (MacDonald & Miell, 2000) has shown that social learning strategies, that is, collaborative learning, result in increased creativity and quality of the creative product. Much tacit knowledge is acquired through interaction and socialization with others. Doise (1986:42) hypothesizes that “at certain levels of development, social interaction produces cognitive structures which the individual could not master before the interaction but can master after.” He (ibid.) states that
social interaction functions as “inducers of embryogenesis” by facilitating new cognitive structuring. An example of such cognitive structuring is the tendency of collaborative workers to develop own verbal and non-verbal coding, as Lilliestam (1996:200) relates that within a group who plays music by ear, for example, a rock band, there is often little conversation. There is however a group **vocabulary**, a musical terminology understood by the group, sometimes limited to the group. As such this forms part of the collective devices for remembering music. Some terms are well known: riff, lick, groove, but groups develop an own communication through which learning and knowledge takes place. This is also not restricted to verbalization. Bennett (1980:6) refers to this as the most critical characteristic of rock musicians, i.e. the “definitions and interpretations which comprise its collective knowledge are impelled by and shaped through inter-actional events”.

Thirdly, the last point is of particular importance in this research as it is contended that informal learning activity could lead the way to **life-long learning**. As noted in Chapter 1, this is a concept that is currently of particular interest among cognitive scholars, as well as a critical outcome in the Arts and Culture Learning area for Curriculum 2005. Bowles (1999:15), reflecting on solutions to provide lifelong involvement in music, i.e. transcending the school phase, suggests the following steps music educators might consider to promote lifelong involvement in music:

- Students must continue performing and must know how to do that independently;
- Students must know how to continue their progress in music education;
- Students should know how to begin something new in music;
- They should know how to seek out opportunities for music making;
- They should know how to make music on their own and with others;
- They could know how to teach another person how to make music;
- Educators should consider what one needs to know to achieve the above.
To correlate: following the above steps suggested by Bowles, it could be noted that the informal activity of composition inherently corresponds to the notion of “lifelong learning”. Adolescents are active independently, continue to progress in playing and songwriting, seek out opportunities to perform with their bands or to sing their compositions, they seek out opportunities to perform with others and they teach each other working collaboratively. Adolescents view themselves as involved for the long term with their music making once involved in songwriting. It can be argued, however, that adolescents forsake this activity sooner or later and active involvement in rock music/bands/popular songwriting remains the domain of the adolescent – where then is the lifelong involvement? As illustrated above, songwriting or informal music making is potentially fertile ground for producing lifelong participation in music. The reason for cessation of this activity after adolescence or even late adolescence, however, is manifold. Currently, as identified in this research, informal songwriting is basically limited to:

- Popular genres;
- Considered depreciatory in the curriculum thus deprived of validity;
- Appropriated by adolescents to structure and regulate the self, and to provide a medium towards future identity;
- Providing a form of communication and expression for adolescents.

In finding a solution to combat the cessation of songwriting activity after adolescence, it becomes clear that music education could have a potential role to play. As argued below supporting Paynter (2000) and Jenne’s (1977) writings, if educators could provide a broader base and provide a broader understanding of the songwriting activity, as Nazareth (1999:18) advises by integrating learning into life experiences thereby forging links with the community, adolescents could be equipped to utilize songwriting and music making much later on in life.

The music educator’s role will expand into a study of music that necessitates “individual awareness” and “personal thinking” in other words, **meta-cognition:**
“Students begin to see themselves as designers of their own learning rather than viewing musical information as something to be gleaned strictly from a teacher or a textbook” (Pogonowski, 1989:9). The current phenomenon of learners to informally learn and create music certainly conforms to the dimension of musical thinking known as metacognition.

4.4.1 Motivation

What motivates adolescents to compose without being assigned composition homework? Odam’s (2000:122) research gives the reasons: relaxation, relief from boredom, relief from depression and playing with sounds.

Csikszentmihalyi & Rich (1997:48) identify flow, or a peak, optimal experience, i.e. enjoyment, as the most salient aspect of creativity. The theory of flow (ibid.) postulates that individuals feel enjoyment in an activity when the following set of conditions is present: “clear, specific goals; immediate feedback; a balance between the opportunities for actions (challenges) and the person’s ability to act (skills).” Under these conditions, individuals “will begin to focus concentration and forget personal problems, will begin to feel in control, will lose critical self-consciousness, will lose track of time, and eventually will begin to feel that whatever the activity is, it is worth doing for its own sake.” Viewing the writings/the text, as lyrics with the intention of making it into a song, provides the adolescent with the additional benefits of producing a tool for the technology of the self to repeatedly use when and where the need arises, also to obtain social authorship and cultural production. As such, it is most natural for adolescents to intuitively know music creation as a tool to provide in all these requirements.

As Paynter (2000:6) notes, “It is the most natural thing for human beings to make up music”. As such individuals, mostly musically untrained, invent music intuitively.
Paynter (ibid.) poses the question: “if inventing music is intuitive, who are we to interfere?” He proposes that expressing feelings and emotions are not divorced from thought – songwriting is an activity of the mind, a direction of thought similar to Jenne’s\textsuperscript{15} (1977) communication theory of music. Therefore, tapping into the informal learning context, music educators’ role in composition activity is to facilitate learners’ ability to process their thoughts into meaningful, communicative structure.

Adolescents engaged in the informal activity of songwriting are internally motivated. Writings on motivation link feelings of 	extit{competence} to motivation. Feelings of competence could therefore be one of the reasons that motivate individuals (DeTurk, 1989:27). If composition is not assigned, therefore not turned in for grading or assessment, being 	extit{judged} is also avoided. Therefore, songwriting provides an activity in which perceived personal success could be experienced. Studies on attributional explanations of success and failure investigate motivation in learning music. Abeles et al. (1984) list self-image, conformity, expectations and roles, feelings of competence, cooperation and creativity as fundamental aspects of social psychological foundations in music education. Weiner’s (1974) 	extit{attribution theory} involves four main causal categories: ability, task difficulty, effort and luck. Ability and effort are considered 	extit{internal} and luck and difficulty are considered 	extit{external} as the latter are beyond the individual’s control. In Asmus’ (1986:81) study respondents attributed their own success and failure to the external category of task difficulty. Thus, in the informal activity of songwriting, the adolescent eliminates the unstable external factors, luck and task difficulty, thereby gaining complete control over the success rate of this enterprise and thereby gaining the feeling of competence.

The challenge facing music educators are encapsulated in tapping into the two learning contexts “formal” and “informal” and bridging the gap between the two by accommodating and promoting both contexts. Legette (2000) quotes Rogoff & Lave

\textsuperscript{15} See Chapter 3.2.2.1.
who confirm that individuals are able to transfer prior knowledge learned outside school in informal settings to formal school settings. To illustrate: much research, as long ago as Lee (1976) and as recent as (Hebert & Campbell, 2000), has lamented and fiercely argued the case for inclusion and/or tolerance and/or exclusion of popular (rock) music from school curricula. Lee (1976:163) expands on the long and exacting informal apprenticeship young musicians endure in order to achieve close and accurate imitation of accepted popular music models and identifies many advantages thereof. Recent research (Visser, 2000) pleads the case for including and revering both formal and informal learning contexts since learning, as illustrated in Visser’s (2000) research, is fundamentally situated in the learning context from which it arises. Stålhammar (2000:43) concludes in his article about music teaching and young people’s own music experience that the student’s role should change from recipient-participant to that of co-creator. As such, the creativity adolescents display as informal creators of song could be extended to the classroom where teachers could accommodate the student as creator. As argued, an informal, collaborative and socio-culturally aware learning context does provide rich and meaningful learning opportunity and positive results. As Legette (2000:16) succinctly notes: “Cognitive psychologists have shown that children spontaneously develop particular informal concepts outside of school that can often be related to academic knowledge obtained in school. This informal knowledge can serve as a scaffold or underpinning for what is taught in school”.

4.5 SUMMARY

Examining the compositional process has shed light on the establishment and enhancement of social cohesion, communication and expression of the self and among peers and the ways in which adolescents exert creative and intellectual

---

17 Own italics.
activity in an informal learning situation. The creative process as one of musical agency and cultural production and the resultant knowledge production has been linked to adolescent songwriting. The creative field and domain boundaries within which adolescents compose have been explored according to the systems approach of creativity and it has been hypothesized that the creative act will be “the small creative act”, that is, the familiar and imitated patterns within the cultural matrix and as such sets the parameters for the analysis of the creative product in Chapter 5. Issues of creative production such as memory, instrument use, the parameters of the informal learning situation and the motivation of adolescent to engage in this activity contributes to our understanding of the nature and function of the creative product.

The next chapter, an exploration of the creative product, will apply recent theories on analysis, including a socio-cultural perspective, to view the adolescent compositions. As such, the product will shed light on arguments thus far made on informal learning, communicative power of songwriting, the expressive and therapeutic nature of the product and the compositions’ conformity to general styles, forms and genres in popular music.
CHAPTER 5

SONGWRITING: THE CREATIVE PRODUCT

In this chapter general perspectives and theories about musical analysis are addressed to include recent research encompassing a broader view of analysis in general to include socio-cultural contexts and issues such as notation in the analysis of adolescent music. Adolescents’ songs are investigated regarding musical features and lyrical features within the context of their socio-cultural setting. The SOLO Taxonomy (DeTurk, 1988) is adapted and applied to propose an evaluation procedure for the lyrics. Dunbar-Hall’s (1999) five methods of popular music analysis are applied in combination with Goodwin’s (1992) sound-image model, synaestesia, to expand on the socio-cultural context of popular music analysis.

5.1 INTRODUCTION

In keeping with the aim of this research, namely examining the function and nature of adolescent songwriting, the creative product is investigated to learn from this product all we can through examination of its physiognomy. Two concomitant layers coalesce in song namely, music and lyrics, all within a third encompassing layer: the socio-cultural context (Figure 5.1). Covach (1999:466) warns against viewing popular music in a single way as inherently and only social, but proposes that popular music should be considered as “inherently musical, and only secondarily social”. Covach (ibid.) claims that the challenge becomes one of researching popular music along traditional lines but maintaining a careful sensitivity to the differences between popular music and art music in their specific musical magnitude, a proposal that this research supports, without the notion of being “secondarily social”, but rather inherently social. This research thus
attempts to study adolescent’s songs along musicological lines, but inclusive of socio-cultural context.

![Figure 5.1: Physiognomy of song.](image)

### 5.2 Musicology versus Pop

Traditional musicology neglects the social context, emphasizes the transcription of music (the score), and elevates harmonic and rhythmic structure to pride of place as an evaluative criterion. Rock, on the other hand, emphasizes interpretation through performance, and is received primarily in terms of the body and emotions rather than as pure text (Shuker, 1994:136).

Since Adorno published his first critique of popular music “On Popular Music” in 1941, many likeminded articles, accentuating the discourse on high versus low art, continued to relegate popular music to the bottom of the musical rung. Since then many writings, notably Moore, 2003; Covach, 1999; Shuker, 1994; Shepherd, 1991; Middleton, 1990 and numerous others, have expostulated the dichotomy of the inherently musicological perspective of musical studies over the past number of years and the concomitant negation of the social and/or popular nature of music. Lilliestam (1996:196) as well notes that folk or popular music has been disregarded by musicology, that is, it has been disregarded within the academic spheres of musicological research and music education. Middleton (1990:101) notes how popular music has at times been admitted to the musicological academia but moved sideways to the sociologists rather than
musicologists. More important, particularly in this research on *Adolescent Songwriting*, is Middleton’s (1990) explanation of why mainstream musicology is less than useful in the study of popular music. The reason for this is threefold:

- **Terminology** developed as a result of the needs of “classical” music, thus leaving an abundance of vocabulary in certain areas, for example harmony, melody, and so forth, and left a remainder of impoverished areas, for example, nuance, tonal gradation, technology. More significantly though, terminology implies a bias highlighting ideologically important facets about music by having them termed. The implication is thus that a musical facet not labeled is not important.

- **Notation**¹ is perhaps the most obvious parameter of musicological study, which has directly affected the place of popular music in musicology. Notation has provided musicologists with a literary system, that is, a tool, to artefactualize music through the analysis thereof.

- The **origins of musicology** are closely associated with the aesthetic and historical theories of German idealism and as such are removed from the context in which popular music arose.

The reasons for the lack of involvement of musicologists in the popular music arena are clear and the above-mentioned reasons are likewise applicable to the music education situation, where music teachers are trained in the classical idiom. Shepherd (1991:189) argues for a bridge between conceptual and contextual matters in musicology through appropriate fusion of popular music studies into tertiary curricula that will lead the way to the “re-conceptualization of musicology as a discipline”. Furthermore he (ibid.) postulates that if musicology continues to negate the inherently social nature of music, musicology will “condemn itself to an even more peripheral position in the academic world than it presently occupies”. A similar viewpoint was held as early as 1981 by
Greckel (1981:30) and others. These views relate by implication to music education in grade school, as school music education is an extension of that which is taught to music education students, the music teachers of the future, at university level. Richards (1998:12) notes in his research on media studies the same disparity between academic discourse and the everyday experience of popular culture.

The dichotomy can be extended to music education where the discrepancy between music-out-of-school and music-taught-in-school is most remarkable, and the discourse for the inclusion or exclusion of popular music from educational curricula has been rife, as noted as long ago as 1976 by Spencer and later by Ponick (2000); Stålhammar (2000:41); Hebert & Campbell (2000); Dunbar-Hall & Wemyss (2000a); Tagg (1998) and Ross (1995), the latter subsequently followed by a number of writings in response to his article: “What’s wrong with School Music?” The plight of the music educator who wishes to meld the traditional approaches with popular styles and methodologies remains multifold. Most recently, Hargreaves, Marshall & North (2003:156) again delineate the dichotomy of pop music outside of school and the central role it plays in the lifestyles of most teenagers and the “badge of identity” it provides them, so significantly that in fact the distinction between “music at school” and “music at home” is quite marked. Research relates a variety of obstacles in the path of the progressive music educator. In South Africa the problem has been exacerbated by the legacy of fragmentation and segregation between various cultural groups. Remedies and research, specifically in South Africa, see for example Hauptfleisch (1998), to rectify the nature of music education in South Africa are currently underway. Above-mentioned serves to illustrate the peripheral position of popular music in mainstream education and even more apparently, the inclusion of songwriting which is invariably in the popular idiom for example, alternative music, rock bands, pop ballads, in music education curricula, as are found in this research. Lacunae in educational approaches have been noted above, yet remedies are sparse. To pave the way towards a feasible music educational philosophy towards the accountable inclusion of the study of popular musics and the production/creation thereof, we turn to an analytical model namely “Musical Poetics” as set out by Krims (2000).

1 Notation, and its relevance to adolescent songwriting, is discussed more in depth in this chapter at 5.6
5.3 MUSICAL POETICS

In light of the preceding account of popular music’s relative exclusion from the field of musicology in the past, and the need of a broader paradigm within which to mediate the analyses of popular music and also to pave the way towards a music educational tool, Krims’ (2000) proposed model of a broadened music theory, namely musical poetics, is examined.

The current understanding of music theory is expanded to include cultural and social theory about music. Krims (2000:27) proposes to “rename what is now called ‘music theory’ – specifically, the designing of models of intramusical relations and analysis of particular pieces – as ‘musical poetics’.” This redefinition permits music analysis to include the whole field of cultural theory itself. Bennett’s (1980:8) notion of analysis, including the idea of a “socially negotiated musical reality system”, basically supports Krims’ proposed model. Musical poetics may thus be defined as simultaneously indispensable as a broadened base for music theory and inclusive of more generalized theories of societies, ethnicities and histories that have traditionally been overlooked in music analysis. Krims (ibid.) also argues that the current relevance of all music theory should not be denied or disposed of as it may relate to and shed light on culturally significant phenomena and processes. It becomes clear that musical analysis, as applied and supported in this research as well, is mediated by socio-cultural context. Therefore, analyses of examples of songwriting by adolescents in this research will be analyzed utilizing traditional theory/harmony and formal methods, as well as the extra-sonorial dimension, namely the socio-cultural context. This proposed analytical perspective views adolescent songwriting as a cultural, rather than exclusively musical formation. As Grossberg (1994:41) notes: “Speaking of rock as a formation demands that we always locate musical practices in the context of a complex (and always specific) set of relations with other cultural and social practices; hence I will describe it as a cultural rather than as a musical formation”.
5.4 Locality in Analyses and Understanding of Popular Music

Defining “global” and “local” music has been a source of considerable discourse among scholars. According to Negus (1996:189) global theories fail to provide specific information on how cultures and international networks shape popular music. Guilbault (1993) notes that defining the local has become a matter of distinctiveness and difference in dominant cultures, while smaller cultural groups discuss the local mainly for preservation of the cultural heritage and in fear of being subsumed by global homogenization.

In defining local many ambiguities and contradictions occur (Negus, 1996:182). He (ibid.) argues, “no sound, cultural form or corporation can be ‘global’ in anything but a partial way, so the characteristics of ‘local music’….are so varied and lead to a rather confusing array of potential ‘global-local’ musical relationships”. Instead of defining the local, Negus (1996:183) argues it would be more functional to raise the question: “How the local is given meaning in specific circumstances. In short, how is a sense of physical place… represented, conveyed and experienced?” Gay’s (1993) view of an “imagined local” should be noted. He (ibid.) proposes that local musical groups and performers, rather than being dulled by mass media and postmodern life, create an authentic group identity and their own local map defined by the interactions within their group, a “changing lattice work of localities created by the actions of its inhabitants”. This viewpoint is directly reflected by Bennett (2000:195) who describes the relationship between music, the “local” and the structuring of “local identities” as dynamic, meaning this relationship is forever changing, mutating and developing due to the interaction between the two. Furthermore he (ibid.) states “music informs ways of being in particular social spaces; …music functions as a resource whereby individuals are able to actively construct those spaces in which they live”, which is reminiscent of DeNora’s (2000) views on the structuring of the self and music as technology of the self. Adolescents tend to adhere to more personal styles and tastes in music as perceived within their immediate localities, but also drawing upon, as Bennett (2000:197) describes it “locally embedded
images, discourses and social sensibilities centered around the familiar, the accessible, the easily recognizable”.

In the analysis of the adolescent songs (later in this Chapter) it will be investigated whether the adolescent songwriter does indeed turn to the familiar, that is, emotions, behaviors, and the known for example people, places, things, and the accessible for example instruments, tape recorder, and the easily recognizable for example styles, genres, playing techniques, which could imitate and/or initiate with a relative measure of successful duplication for it to sound authentic, given the lack of studios, producers, mixing desks, superior instruments, superior playing techniques, and so forth, a fact which is also of particular importance within the South African context. Rural and urban marginalized schools and societies in South Africa confront the same challenges of relative lack of equipment, technology, etcetera.

In this ethnographic study which investigates the informal songwriting in a specific town, Paarl, in the Western Cape, it is useful to employ Negus’ (1996:189) suggestion of a constructive way of analyzing “place-specific music” by considering three distinct features:

- How the physical circumstances (nature of the population, activity and communication) of a place facilitate and contribute to the production of specific sounds.
- How the specific instruments, rhythms, voices and language particular to a place is utilized to symbolize the identity of that place.
- How listening involves the synthesis and interpretation of symbolic data that is conveyed musically and how this creates a sense of “spatial rivalry”.

Besides making a distinction between the “home”, and “school” arena as a musical environment for adolescents, a third environment is identified (Hargreaves, Marshall & North, 2003:157) which relates to social context where music learning takes place informally, meaning without the supervision of parents or adults. Such a third
environment is the playgrounds, garages, clubs, Internet alliances, where adolescents meet to engage in music making and conversing.

Answers to these questions are addressed through examination and analysis of the creative product.

5.5 NOTATION

The vast majority of all music ever made is played by ear. To make music by ear means to create, perform, remember and teach music without the use of written notation. This is a type of music-making that has been little observed by musicology, which has mainly been devoted to notated music (Lilliestam, 1996:195).

Discourse on music not written down, as is predominantly the case in adolescent songwriting, has faced a dilemma in terminology. “Folk Music”, “improvised music”, “un-notated music”, etcetera, are inept in describing the various styles and genres of music and how they come about aurally, without the aid of written mnemonic devices. Lilliestam (1996:195) notes that a term such as “un-notated music” implies Western thinking regarding music. Considering that music played by ear is by far the most abundant type of music making, terminology emanating from Western notated traditions will not suffice. Because oral music is associated with popular and/or folk styles, it has not been of interest to Western musicology. Western thinking has for a long time focused on written skills and in music studies it has been no different. Notational skill is even today considered equivalent to musical knowledge. Current music education still primarily concentrates on notational reading and writing skills (Plummeridge, 1997:26).

The centricity of notation in musical skill and teaching remains the norm in Western thinking about music, hence Musicology. This research on Adolescent Songwriting will explore the correlation between musical background and the efficacy of music educational emphasis on Western Notation systems on the writing/notation style of the songwriters. It is assumed that the preferred mode of composition for the adolescent songwriter, in keeping with popular and rock traditions, is predominantly an oral one.
In considering orality\(^2\) and literacy, the concomitant nature of both, meaning that they exist together and are seldom exclusive of each other can be noticed, particularly in highly developed societies. Contemporary popular music can also be considered a form of “secondary orality\(^3\)” (Negus, 1996:74). Lilliestam (1996:197) refers to information transfer in terms of literate strategies.

As songwriting, as evidenced in this dissertation, is mainly in an oral style, the characteristics of oral music styles can thus be identified as:

- There is no original work: music exists only in performance. Finnigan (1989:173) emphasizes the significance of performance and points to the paradox of musical notation in all styles, both popular and classical: all music in essence exists in performance and is created in performance correlating with Middleton (1990:81) who notes that all music has an oral dimension.
- Only through memory or technology can the music be preserved.
- It does not have physical tangible shape to be owned or copyrighted.
- It is not limited to the limitations of notation.
- Music is created differently than in notated composition, as the perception of what could feasibly be written down is inherent in the notated compositional process.
- Oral forms (excluding purely electronic forms) differ from literate forms in “architectural” complexity (Sloboda, 1985:246), as literate forms can embed complicated multi-level structures (contrapuntal writing), whereas “chain structures” predominate in oral music.

Many writings refer to the inadequacies of notation (Jenne, 1977:51; Finnigan, 1989:175; Serafine, 1988:34; Bennett, 1980:107) and in particular to the limitations of five-line,

mensural notation. Sloboda (1985:248) also observes that music notation selects aspects of sound for preservation and discards others. It can be assumed that songwriters of popular music are tacitly aware of these limitations and are thus not inclined towards learning notation, an important implication for music education. Shuker (1994:136) reports that many rock musicians are happy to acknowledge that classical music functions along different criteria, which has little validity for them. Popular songwriters thus identify with oral and non-literate forms of music making as a form of knowledge. We turn to Lilliestam (1996:199) who explains that playing by ear, and by implication inclusive of other forms of oral music making, is a form of tacit knowledge. He (ibid.) describes tacit knowledge as verbally inexplicable, an obvious knowledge that has been acknowledged as a special kind of knowledge or skill.

However, the purpose of notation is to preserve music, thus a mnemonic aid. But musicians who play and create by ear remember music in several ways. One field of research on children’s musical schemes investigated graphic representations of music (Goodnow, 1971; Bamberger, 1982; Winner, 1982) and identifies various modes of representation. In exploring a broader paradigm within which to view literate and non-literate styles of music-making we turn to Bennett (1980:143) who argues for a move away from written notation, meaning linear notation, as the “concreteness of music itself” to a broader understanding of notation as a communicative system. Herein could be included an understanding of music as a notation symbol system existing in many forms including memory aids, “marks in the mind” and “acoustic phenomena”, sounds existing on recordings, but also within the complimentary spheres of content and context (Sloboda, 1985:247). This is in keeping with Middleton’s (1990:81) statement that the important questions when analyzing different musics should be: what form the oral production, notation and recording took in the exact context and secondly, the social context within which it operates. Bennett (1980:145) claims that rock musicians conceptualize sound in a historically individual and unique way and they use commercial recordings as a formal notation system. As such then, these modes of production should be considered part of the paradigm that forms “notation”.

---

Continuing the train of thought on memory aids, Lilliestam (1996:201) identifies five different kinds of memory that work interactively: auditive, visual, tactile-motoric, verbal and mental-mapping. The latter, mental mapping (mental model) is a mnemonic technique predominantly used by the respondents in this research, and was also identified by Burnard (2000:238) as utilized by children when composing.

In keeping with Bennett’s notion of a broader paradigm of viewing notation and Lilliestam’s elucidation of memory aids, it becomes clear that a notation system “sets the possibilities of composing music by allowing musical events to be memorable” (Bennett, 1980:209). He (ibid.) continues by explaining that partitioning sound becomes the musician’s tool for “externalizing” and “artifactualizing” musical ideas for absorption into compositions. He (ibid.) notes that skilled musicians often employ more than one kind of musical notation: demonstration, verbalization, written marks (including five-line system) and copying from recordings.

Bennett (1980:210) delineates the developmental analysis of notation systems in Figure 5.2. The most fundamental level is the phenomenal level, relying on a teacher and student and the sound of their music making. At the spoken nominal level language is added to the situation. The written nominal level employs a system of notation or “marks on paper”. The symbolic notation system, including the Western European system, uses “visual markings other than names” to indicate sound. Moving through various levels of greater development to the synthetic phenomenal level where a return to purely acoustic sound representation takes place and the only example here is electronically produced music where a student can interrupt the temporal nature thereof for study purposes:
The extent to which adolescents employ all the levels in the different developmental types of music notation systems will be investigated in Chapter 6. This has many implications for the music educator.

Toynbee (2000:55) asserts that in popular music’s brief history the accent has moved from “scored song-work to song-performance realized on record and broadcast”. In fact, Gracyk (1996) states that rock music now consists mainly through and in recording. This is supported in Bennett’s (1980) views which open up the spectrum to our understanding of notation to include verbal, non-verbal, graphic and recorded modes, and a plethora of combinations thereof, in understanding the temporal marking of music as to facilitate composition and performance. In conclusion, Sloboda’s (1985:267) explanation of the function of notation remains: “Music, perhaps, provides a unique mnemonic framework within which humans can express, by the temporal organization of sound and gesture, the structure of their knowledge and of social relations.”
5.6 ANALYSIS OF THE CREATIVE PRODUCT: MUSIC, FORM, GENRE AND SOCIO-CULTURAL BACKGROUND

The analysis of popular music can take one of three basic forms:

- The analysis of the music solely according to its musical characteristics, for example melody, rhythm, meter, motives, tonal structure, and so forth. Examples of such analyses are: Spencer (1976); Middleton (1990); Dunbar-Hall (1999), Walser (1992), in fact most Western music is analyzed in this way.

- The analysis of the music mainly according to its sociological basis, for example biographical, historical and sociological data included in the analysis of how and why the piece came to be. Examples of such analyses are: McClary (1987), Shuker (1994:153).

- A combination of the above or the application of above-mentioned Musical Poetics (Krims, 2000). For example Meller’s (1987) analysis of popular styles that mainly deals with the details of melody, harmony and rhythm, but views the goal of musical analysis to be the message or the meaning of the music and why the composition “works”. Also Walser (2003:27-37) combines music and sociology in his analyses of four contrasting popular songs. As Shuker (1994:135) observes, simple musical analysis, presupposing melody, rhythm harmony, etcetera, is a workable approach to analysis, but inadequate and needs “extension” into the affective domains of relationship between text and listeners, generic and historical locations of text and performers, etcetera, thus, with the inclusion of sociological factors into the musicological approach, a combination approach. This combination approach is also supported by Sundin (2000:10) more broadly to avert the pop/classical dichotomy by noting that the two, pop and classical music, are not exclusive or dichotomous, but depend on each other. It thus follows that analytical tools and processes could be interchangeably applied.
Moore (2003:10) in *Analyzing Popular Music*, notes the growth in collective popular music scholarship with much recent study done on the analysis of popular music (for example Covach & Boone, 1997; Everett, 2000; Middleton, 2000; Stephenson, 2002). In keeping with the proposal of this dissertation that music exists musically and textually within an encompassing socio-cultural layer (*Figure 5.1*), above methods will be combined in the analysis below. Many writers (Walser, 2003:17; Dunbar-Hall, 1999:40; Tamm, 1985:236) have remarked on the application of traditional tonal analysis methods to popular music which has been erroneous and unsuccessful. Instead, analysis of popular music should include aspects of repetition, verse/chorus format, stylistically appropriate practices and processual characteristics, improvisation, collectively or solo instrumental sections and so forth. Importantly, Dunbar-Hall (ibid.) notes that the essentials and basics to music education are the **stylistic characteristics, music history and musical construction** that hence form the basis for the structuring musical analysis. He (ibid.) proposes five analytical tools for the analysis of popular music to present a range of ways that popular music text can be examined. These are:

- **Semiotic analysis**: this approach is based on the work of Nattiez (1982). In semiotic analysis (the study of signs), examining the song’s construction identifies musical meaning, or how the parts work together to form a whole. This type of analysis does not look beyond the structure to, for example, socio-cultural context. In analyzing solely musical structure, firstly, the smallest possible motives are identified, they are then labeled to show their relationship to each other (inversion, segmentation, and so forth), thirdly, the motives are tabulated and lastly the patterns are interpreted. Dunbar-Hall (1999:47) states that this sectionalization and motivic tabulation can provide a way of teaching improvisatory techniques, motivic development and strategies for constructing a song in a music education setting.

- **Performance strategies and the design of the composition**: this approach examines the design of the song in light of the mechanics of its creations in
sound, i.e. which playing techniques, instrumental skills, nature of the instrument, etcetera, led to the creation of the specific motives.

- **Pitch graph:** this approach typically draws up synoptic charts of lowest and highest pitches of each section showing several factors about pitch organization, for example the contrasts in pitches and pitch directions (ascending and descending).

- **Proportional analysis:** this approach uses proportional analysis, that is, the ratios of bars, beats or time duration showing the mathematical relationships between sections of music and their role in the overall composition, see Paynter’s (2002:221) analysis of a child’s piece and Howat (1983). The significant proportional matrix under discussion is the ratio 18:26, or 0.692, and can be expressed as two thirds. The argument is that about two thirds into a section or whole piece of music, a shifting of mood, or a climax, or a shift in key, or such, takes place marking the place as a significant nodal place or temporal marker. This proportional matrix was also used by Lendvai (1971) to analyze the music of Bartók, and Howat (1983) to analyze music of Debussy. This derived relationship of 0.6, also known as the Fibonacci series and ratios, is a naturally occurring relationship in art, music and nature.

- **Recontextualisation:** this approach analyzes the way in which the mechanics of performance on a specific instrument is realized into the composition of the song.

In combination with Dunbar-Hall’s (1999:41-54) five proposed analytical tools, Goodwin’s (1992) sound-image model, **synaestesia**, will be drawn on to identify the relationship between the signifier (our sensorial reception) and what is signified (our ideas, perceptions) in musical analysis and is herewith applied to facilitate song analysis. The semiotic terms **icons, indexes** and **symbols** are utilized:
• **Icons**: represent the physiognomy of sound, for example, facial expression and vocal expression such as breathiness on the voice to signify love, pent-up emotion, or harshness or anger in the voice, etcetera.

• **Indexes**: signs that tacitly connect to the object, for example applause on a track would be an index of it being a live performance, or the singer would use interjections such as “sing along”, “yes”, etcetera, which would be an index for crowd involvement.

• **Symbols**: signify direct relation through convention to a specific cultural context, for example, the instrument a singer chooses to accompany has symbolic reference, such as, the electric guitar has a visual phallic connotation, drums symbolize power and dominance, giving the pace, etcetera.

Brent & Drabkin (1987:5) concur that a single method of analysis cannot be used, but several analytical methods would need to be employed.

The following songs have been chosen for analysis in the order of their appearance on the accompanying CD. They are all songs composed by L.S. (16 year-old male) and performed by his rock band. He is the main singer and also the keyboard player in the band. The choice for the analysis of this material from one songwriter was made for the following reasons:

• It allows an overview of the oeuvre of a single composer to establish trends, tendencies, scope and overall ability within the output of a single songwriter. By implication this could infer similar trends within the output of other adolescent songwriters.

• The comparison of very dissimilar songs with regard to length, instrumentation, performance and creative level, as would have been the case if a variety of songwriter’s materials had been compared, does not provide comparable and scientifically valid conclusions other than noting discrepancies. The important
role the instrument of choice plays, for example piano or guitar, will be noted below.

- Many respondents in this research had too few, or incomplete songs, or songs of very limited scope, or trouble presenting an error-free performance for recording and transcription purposes in their repertoire and as such made analysis, trends and general conclusions thereof invalid. This songwriter, L.S., could however provide seven songs that he considered complete and could thus be recorded for transcription and analytical purposes.

5.6.1 Analysis of the song Déjà vu by L.S. (16 year-old, male) [CD Track 1]

- Semiotic Analysis

Semiotic analysis is unequivocally a structuralist approach to analysis, and does not use socio-cultural context as an indicator. However, the argument thus far is that both musicological and socio-cultural approaches are used in combination and complementary processes. Semiotic analysis has been used in the analysis of popular music, for example Middleton (1990) as a musical form of analysis rather than traditional tonal analysis that is not always applicable or usable. Nattiez (1982), in his analysis of Varese's flute solo, Density 21.5, (similar to Middleton's application) uses semiotic analysis by segmenting the music into the smallest possible motives, analyzing their relationship to each other, tabling and interpreting the patterns to produce a structural analysis.

This song, Déjà vu, is in essence 96 measures long with one additional measure containing a final note. As is common in this type of rock song, several main sections can be identified as set out in figure 5.3. This sectional analysis is not similar to traditional musicological analysis, i.e. A, A1, A2, B, C, A3, etcetera, as sections here indicate more than mere melodic and/or rhythmic resemblance. The sections consider performance indicators and allow for a broader sectionalisation of the song:
Analysis of the pitch patterns within the various sections reveals the song’s dependence on the following motif of the fourth (=m4), ascending fourth (m4a) and descending fourth (m4d):

Which appears as either a descending fourth, for example in measure 9, =m4(d),
Or an ascending fourth, as for example in measures 5 to 6, =m4(a):

As well as the motif of the interval of a second, used ascending and descending extensively and alternating, for example measure 73 (=m2):
Deja Vu

L.S. (16 year-old, male)

Section A

Section A1

\[ \text{ Guitar Riff } \]

Section A2

Voice

Section Band D

1. Sometimes it's all the same, you and me, are going through the pain.
2. Failing and call my name, now it's me, I'm waiting, waiting for the bend.
3. Sometimes it's a shame, you are gone, and I am left in end.
4. cry-
   and call your name, but it's still me, I'm waiting waiting for the pain.

Section C

1.3. 2.4. Section C

bend.  end.  pain.  end.

2. You So, stay away from me I'm falling away from you, there's nothing you can do, nothing you can do.
4. I do do, de-jah vu, de-jah vu
Deja Vu

Section F1

Section F2

Section F3

Tabulation of every beat per measure to identify the utilization and the occurrence of the two main motives and derivatives thereof, results in the following delineation (Figure 5.4):
# TABULATION OF MOTIVIC USE IN DÉJÀ VU

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4/4 Measure</th>
<th>Beat</th>
<th>Motif m4</th>
<th>Motif m2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>m4(a)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>m4(a)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m4(a)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m4(a)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integer</td>
<td>Column 1</td>
<td>Column 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>m4(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>m2(d) and m2(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(d) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(d) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(d) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(d) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a) and m2(d)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>m2(a)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The above tabulation show appearances of the motif and its derivatives bunched at the end, where every beat shows use of the two main motives. Measure 73 onwards shows extensive repetitive use of the m2 (a) and (d) motives, excluding the motif of the fourth, m4 (a) and m4 (d). The only section of the song displaying complete absence of the two motives is the coda (measures 89-96) of the song, further demarcating that as a separate section and marking it as a final section, departing from motives used and heard thus far, in itself significant as a device to obtain distance and removal signifying an ending.
• Analysis according to performance strategies and the design of the song

The above analysis provides information on structural markers and signposts in the composition and offers the music educator points of departure to teach improvisatory techniques or strategies for constructing a song. However, further analysis of a song is required to shed light on how a song comes about. Using above structural analysis, it becomes clear that the two main intervals, namely fourths and seconds are used. The playing mechanics of the guitar as well as the tuning of the guitar provides information on the nature of the melody that consists of fourths and seconds. It must be noted that the tuning of guitar strings is mainly in fourths, namely e, a, d, g, b and e. It follows that when a player plays open strings, this will provide fourth-rich melodic material. When examining the score, the preponderance of the notes ‘e’ and ‘a’ must be noted, for example in the opening 8 measures of solo guitar introduction. These two strings are also the lowest on the guitar and provide a bass quality, hence the regular occurrence of these notes in both riff and melodic material. The abundance of seconds is produced easily enough for the amateur player by placing single fingers on the fret board, particularly in the first position on the guitar, that is index finger on the first fret, alternating with the open strings. Thus the ‘e’ bass string and first fret ‘f’, produce the minor second, etcetera, which is often featured in riffs and likewise produce the Phrygian modality (the scale with the lowered second). It should also be noted that the adolescent player using guitar as the instrument of choice in songwriting, will display a greater preponderance of the usage of the interval of a fourth due to the ease of playing on open strings, and also because of the ear being accustomed to the sound of fourths rather than thirds as in traditional tonal harmony. The fourth quality is thus associated with guitar music and has particular connotation to the rock songs composed by the adolescent songwriters as opposed to the more third rich melodic and harmonic material encountered in the piano analysis.
Pitch graph analysis

Pitch graph analysis provides another set of data contributing to the understanding of the structure and by inference, musicological basis of the composition. The following table (figure 5.5), a synoptic graph of pitch factors, displays highest and lowest pitches, and by inference the scale/mode, of each section:

![Synoptic graph of pitch factors](image)

Figure 5.5 Synoptic graph of pitch factors

The table indicates several factors regarding the organization of pitch in the song. The pitch shows a steady increase throughout the song starting with the lowest pitch of the song in the first section, ending with the highest pitch of the song in the last section. Each section shows successive raises in pitch, particularly so in the
instrumental sections. From this it can be concluded that the instrumental sections (A1, A2 and F1, F2, F3) in particular serve the purposes of building towards climaxes through raised pitches. The ever narrowing of pitch range, 5\textsuperscript{th}, then 4\textsuperscript{th}, finally ending on unison, in the solo instrumental section F contributes to this tendency. The opening instrumental section, section A, shows the same decline in pitch range, namely a 7\textsuperscript{th} followed by the interval of a 6\textsuperscript{th}. The bridge section which is one of the climactic sections of the song is characterized by the range of the 4\textsuperscript{th}, one of the main motives as identified in the structural semiotic analysis above. Linking the highest pitches of the instrumental section A shows the outline of a 4\textsuperscript{th}. Linking the highest pitches of the vocal sections shows a minor 3\textsuperscript{rd} and the final instrumental section F shows a 5\textsuperscript{th}. Closer examination of the lower pitches reveal that section A shows a 5\textsuperscript{th}, the vocal sections B, C, D, and E outlines a 7\textsuperscript{th}, whereas the final instrumental section F, outlines a 9\textsuperscript{th}. This examination of the linking of higher and lower pitches show firstly, the importance of the interval of the 4\textsuperscript{th} as an established motif, also the tendency of the higher pitches to stay closer in range and the lower ranges to expand.

This table also reveals modal use. The instrumental section A starts on the Aeolian scale, on a, moving into the main mode of the song namely the Phrygian scale on e. At the return to the instrumental final section F, the Aeolian scale is once again present, this time as the b Aeolian scale. Here it is also worth noting how the initial section A and the final section F, both in the Aeolian mode, move up by the interval of a second conforming firstly to the general tendency of the song to raised pitch level and secondly, supporting the tendency of the 2\textsuperscript{nd} as one of the main motives in the song. This table also supports the thus far argued notion of the influence of guitar playing technique, as the e Phrygian scale is derived easily from the guitar fret board, by 'e' being the lowest note of the scale. The avoidance of the major 3\textsuperscript{rd} in this song is notable, further focusing attention to the predominant interval of the 4\textsuperscript{th}. The presence of modal sections is characteristic of Metal guitar technique (Walser, 1993; Harrell, 1994).
• **Proportional Analysis**

Howat (1983) explains that proportional analysis uses the mathematical relationships between measure numbers or elapsed time to determine the relationships between various sections of music in a song. The significant mathematical relationship in the analysis of visual art, design and music is the decimal relationship of 0.692, placing significance at a point roughly two thirds into an artwork. This relationship, the Fibonacci series and its ratios, are naturally occurring proportions and form the cornerstone of much art. Proportional analysis, when applied to this particular song, reveals that measure number 64 is the exact point two-thirds into the song. At this point the bridge occurs marking the first climactic section of the song. Supporting the significance of this proportional point, the title of the song is heard the first time, namely Déjà vu, where it is repeated four times. Also, the verses are performed in pairs of two, that is, verse 1 and 2, then chorus, followed by verse 3 and 4 grouped together. This makes the verse sections 16 measures in every case. This produces the ratio of 16:24 when measured against the final (instrumental) section of 24 measures, of the song, clearly a two-thirds relationship.

• **Recontextualisation of the solo**

The analytical methods thus far have relied mainly on structural and decontextualised methods. A more comprehensive analysis demands that a closer examination of the compositional techniques and processes within the socio-cultural setting is made. Dunbar-Hall (1999:51) proposes that variants such as the musical source of basic motives, the reliance/non-reliance on formulaic methods, the derivation and deviation from other stylistic connections and the position of the song in popular music practice need to be considered in a recontextualised analysis.

It has been established that the basic motives, namely the intervals of the 4th and the 2nd, are derived from the nature of the guitar tuning. The interval e to a (4th) is produced between the lowest two strings as well as the interval b to e between the
highest two strings. Also, the modality of the song relies on the Phrygian scale on e also produced by the nature of the guitar tuning of the open strings, that is, e is the lowest and highest strings on the guitar. This motivic and modal phenomenon, on the whole, complies with the tendencies in rock guitar music where modal and blues scales form the basis of the tonality and motives are determined by mainly guitar tuning and standard box positions on the fret board. A comparison between this song and, for example, the piano piece *Die Nuwe Suid-Afrika* [excerpt of the opening accompaniment measures below, *figure 5.6*], further illuminates the distinct differences between the different instrumental genres. The latter piece, composed on the piano, retains much of traditional Western harmony due to the white notes on the piano forming the C major scale, thus causing songwriting activity and exploration on the piano keyboard to be based in Western major and natural minor tonality. As such, piano chords played in the left hand are based mainly on thirds, thus resulting in melodic material using motives based on thirds, rather than fourths, as is the case in guitar/rock music. A cursory tonal analysis of this excerpt clearly indicates basic tonality of a minor with tonal harmonies: a minor chord (i), d minor chord (iv), G major chord (VII), G7 chord (VII7), C major chord (III) and the return to a minor chord. Structurally the opening displays regular 4 bar phrases with basically one harmony per four measures. The interesting fact here in recontextualising a solo, is the nature of the pianism. The chordal patterns are derived from the nature of the piano: the range of the left hand notes, the relative inactivity of bass and bass line as opposed to guitar music, the triadic nature of the right hand accompaniment and the octave shift (at measure 17) a simple variation device for a pianist.
Die nuwe Suid-Afrika

Figure 5.6 Die Nuwe Suid-Afrika (The New South Africa) excerpt.
5.6.2 Analysis of the song Verlore Liefde⁴ by L.S. [CD track 2]

The analysis of this song will rely mainly on semiotic analysis to provide data on the musical aspects of the song and Goodwin’s icons, indexes and symbols to provide data on the socio-cultural, emotional and communicative aspects of the song.

Of significance is the songwriter’s utilization of the vocal icon of chant-like speech or rap. Two sections which could structurally represent verses one and two (Section D) in the song rely on rhythmic speech rather than melodic singing. This could be interpreted as a cultural symbol because speech/rap represents the adolescent as a voice crying out from a typically marginalized position into mainstream society. Rap and its derivatives have become synonymous with the adolescent, with black youths and the message of societal and emotional critique. As such, the songwriter, by employing this icon, tries to symbolize lost love as part of the bigger picture within his life and within the life of adolescents by trying to make sense of the event thereby placing it within the context of the inevitable, the unconcerned, thus diminishing the impact of this event in his mind. The blase attitude furthermore acts as a device for making sense of the event by trying to place it in its proper perspective. The voice therefore becomes the icon that, more than any other device, reflects the impending realization of futility and inevitability and thus relates the occurrence of the lost love in an excessively laconic voice at first which then develops into a vocal tone reflecting increasing amounts of aggression, madness, harshness and severity amplified by the addition of distortion guitar (Section E). The intermittent use of Section C in the song repeatedly provides a sense of calm and/or reflection which reverts and redirects the singer and listener to the line in the song “Send me a help line”. This line is significantly enough, sung by another singer (the only occurrence of a second singer on the entire CD). The second singer thus becomes an index referring the listener repeatedly to the “voice of reason” as the Section C music becomes and index for reason and reflectivity.

⁴ Translation: Lost Love
Section G becomes the section in the song where the singer changes pace in a variety of ways. Proportional analysis methods could also be applied here as Section G is two thirds into the way at this point of the song (Measure 55 where the vocals, *dalk was ek ‘n bietjie verkeerd*, start lies at 64.7% into the song calculated within the total of 85 measures) and as such conforms to the Fibonacci series of proportion. The music indicates a change of pace (see the metre change) and the accompaniment changes as well. The bass guitar now takes up a more expanded riff a, f, d, b which outlines a diminished seventh chord and plays this throughout the Section G. The melody also changes in this section as the pitch becomes higher. This section contains the highest pitches of the song, further marking it as the climactic portion of the song. Pitch graph analysis would be applicable in this case as well to demonstrate the increase of pitch and range, particularly in this section. The motivic use of the interval of a second which thus far dominated the song is now expanded on by the inclusion of the repeated use of the interval of a fourth as a motive. The lead guitar abandons the repeated interval of a second by strumming chords in this section thus harmonically supporting the bass guitar riff. The lyrics furthermore indicate the need for the change of pace. The singer now admits to maybe having been wrong supported by the indexes “yes”, and the index of repetition: *Maybe I was somewhat wrong, yes, maybe I was somewhat wrong*. However, the singer immediately places the blame on the other party: *It’s because of you, yes, because of you*. This section of the song thus becomes the moment of truth for the singer. The story of the lost and abandoned love is initially related in an off-handed laconic chant. This then gains momentum as the chorus (section E), with the aid of distortion guitar recklessly and aggressively blares out: *This is my story of lost love carried with much, much depth*. Then continues the chant of head and stomach aches, send a helpline, the singer despises what the “lost love” has become and again the distorted, angered cry (chorus): *This is my story of lost love*. The moment of truth arrives: *Maybe I was wrong*. The songwriter now chooses to relate this melodically in an expanded pitch range. The need for greater expression is signified by the greater pitch inflection and range and thus utilized as communicative device. Pitch, range and expansion, can therefore now be identified as a device for deeper emotional communication as utilized by this songwriter.
Further semiotic analysis of melodic and pitch structures reveal the use of the Phrygian scale on b (b, c, d, e, f#) and the three main motives as repeated notes, the interval of the second and the interval of the fourth, the second and fourth used both as ascending and descending melodic intervals. The pitch structure reveals that the pitch range is initially limited to outlining a minor third, as for example in Section B which ranges from b to d, also Section C and E which ranges from f# to a, likewise Section D where the lead guitar uses the Section C riff (minor third outlined) while the voice intones chant-like lyrics. The climactic section, Section G, is then characterized by the inclusion of the interval of a fourth (g to c) and also the higher pitch level. The lowest note is raised by a semitone in section G and the highest note is raised by a minor third.

As in the previous song, when the song is recontextualised very similar conclusions and observations as in the first piece, Déjà vu, can be made. Once again, the role of the guitar predicts the predominance of seconds and fourths in melodic and harmonic material. Repetition plays an important role both in the lyrics and in the initial sections of music leading up to Section G. This song shows less influence of traditional, ethnic and/or local influences than for example Essence of Life, Main Man or Toleration (all analysed below). As such this song serves as an example of what the songwriter conceives of as Afrikaans rock, also considered alternative rock particularly when it is in the vernacular. The presence of bass drum, lead guitar, keyboard effects, distortion guitar and full drum kit indicates the typical rock sound. The lyrical content and performance mode designates it into the category of alternative rock.

5.6.3 Analysis of the song Help die Man5 by L.S. [CD track 3]

The song Help die Man, in marked contrast to most of the other material on this CD, shows more constraint with regards to novelty in performance mode, for example speech-like singing, unusual instrumental qualities (African instruments), and also with regards to musical qualities such as tonality, this song uses d minor rather than the Aelion and

5 Translation: Help the Man
Phrygian modes which have dominated much of the other material. However, a number of interesting features are noticeable within a socio-cultural and musical analysis, in which Goodwin’s model will mainly be used to analyse this particular song. The topic of the lyrics refers to extending help and support to a man. Initially the man is questioned as to who he is and what he is doing here. This is presented by voice and band in a deceptively peaceful, gentle approach. Notable icons (representations of the physiognomy of sound) for example, facial expression and vocal expression such as breathiness on the voice to signify love, pent-up emotion, or harshness or anger in the voice, etcetera, are concentrated in the chorus of this song. For example, the chorus shows a marked shift in vocal and instrumental presentation and demeanour. In the chorus the voice takes on a harsh, angry quality supported by the use of distortion guitar and fuller chords on bass guitar. The tone is accusatory, possibly fearful. Vocal qualities include breaking of the voice, strained vocal tone and raised pitch levels. Notable indexes (signs that tacitly connect to the object, for example applause on a track would be an index of it being a live performance, or the singer would use interjections such as “sing along”, “yes”, etcetera, which would be an index for crowd involvement) include melismatic use on the word help as if it is a cry, also extended melisma on the word bang (scared) once again as if pleading and crying, and also extensive repetition of the phrases koud en bang (cold and scared), help die man (help the man), moeg en tam (tired and weary). Repetition in this case serves the purpose of drawing attention to the cry, in fact crying out to society for help. Examples of the use of symbols (which signify direct relation through convention to a specific cultural context, for example, the instrument a singer chooses to accompany has symbolic reference, such as, the electric guitar has a visual phallic connotation, drums symbolize power and dominance, giving the pace, etcetera) include the role of the distortion guitar which is particularly significant as this is applied in the chorus section providing harshness and symbolizing distorted emotion. The distortion guitar also absorbs and overpowers aural space symbolizing dominance and power. The drum kit is also used with fuller application of drumming including high-hat, side drum, cymbals and bass drum providing a symbol of empowerment and dominance in the chorus.
5.6.4 Analysis of the song Main Man [CD Track 4] is completed under Chapter 5.7
Text Analysis

5.6.5 Analysis of the song Essence of Life by L.S. (16 year-old male) [CD track 5]

This song is characterized by a virtually uneventful, insignificant progression of
repetitive harmonies and melodic material initiated and supported by instrumental
qualities such as the use of continuous opening ostinato by the accordion tone quality.
The use of accordion as a tone quality is notable as the tone quality of this instrument is a
sustained sound without tonal inflection or gradation which in this case provides a
sameness and blandness as is reflected throughout the performance of the song, including
the voice. This sonoric atmosphere is expanded upon and supported by the harmonic
material provided to the accordion ostinato namely the open fourths with suspension in
the third to fourth measures (the interval of a fourth becomes a third, see Figure 5.7)
which provides dissonance resolving to consonance in Western tonal harmonic analysis.
It could be suggested that the ostinato reflects the underlying message of the lyrics
namely the questioning, bland, desolate seeking of the essence of life (I am nothing)
represented by the open fourth, resolving onto the third (You are everything, the musical
essence of life) providing an answer, a resolution as such.
This song used texturally layered entries as first a reedy whistle, possibly indicating the popular African penny whistle, tone quality is added, then followed by a shaker, also a typical rhythm instrument in traditional ethnic music. Lead guitar adds some plucked notes and lighter chords in the chorus parts. Noticeable is the avoidance of drum kit and typical rock qualities such as bass guitar, distortion guitar and other rock effects, once again reminiscent of the “African” qualities and influences in this songwriter’s music (See also the analysis below of Disillusioned regarding Locality in Analysis). Thus far argued notions of locality and the influence of local and global forces are once again apparent in this song. The more typical rock qualities are abandoned in favor of a more “local” sound reminiscent of the songwriter’s culture in Africa, when he addresses the meaning and the essence of life (his life?). The song has a very placid, virtually unclimactic character, yet ironically, addresses the question of the essence (the meaning?) of his life. The laconic nature of presentation belies the importance of the text thus the device of using irony to understate or underplay significant or profound emotion occurs: “I am nothing and you are everything, the essence, the essence, the musical essence of life.” The device of repetition is also used to draw attention to essence substantiating its role in the profundity of the questioning emotions.

5.6.6 Analysis of the song Disillusioned by L.S. [CD track 6]

Although numerous analytical methods could be applied to every song, for example text analysis, recontextualization, proportional analysis, semiotics, and so forth, certain songs’
characteristic features determine specific analytical methods. As such, *Disillusioned* will be analyzed utilizing the recontextualization method which includes a focus on locality in the analysis. Here Gay’s (1993) view of an “imagined local” is revisited (see Chapter 5.4). As previously stated, this means that local musical groups and performers, rather than being dulled by mass media and postmodern life, create an authentic group identity and their own local map defined by the interactions within their group. Bennett’s (2000:195) viewpoint on the relationship between music, the “local” and the structuring of “local identities” as dynamic is also notable in this analysis.

Bennett (ibid.) states that “music informs ways of *being* in particular social spaces; …music functions as a resource whereby individuals are able to actively *construct* those spaces in which they live”, which is reminiscent of DeNora’s (2000) views on the structuring of the self and music as technology of the self. This songwriter of *Disillusioned* used the modalities, sonorities and tonalities of this composition to further develop the personal space he creates within the broader social and global space. He draws upon, as Bennett (2000:197) describes it “locally embedded images, discourses and social sensibilities centered around the *familiar*, the *accessible*, the *easily recognizable*”. Familiar to this songwriter are the sounds of pop and rock that he has been encultured to over the radio and mass media, but also sounds within his broader social milieu within an African context. As such the influence of traditional musics, instruments and sonorities will become apparent in this analysis. The song shows other *familiar* traits, for example emotions and behaviors including typical adolescent disillusionment with society and the restraints the adult world places on them; *the known* for example people, places, things which includes the specific use of instrumentation and the reflection of Africa and its music in his song; and *the accessible* for example instruments, such as the African drum, and lastly *the easily recognizable* for example the style of the song, the genres, the playing techniques are all imitated and/or initiated with a relative measure of successful duplication for it to sound authentic, given the lack of studios, producers, mixing desks, superior instruments, superior playing techniques, and so forth.
In analyzing the song, this socio-cultural background information is significant in that the composition is not a culturally “pure” form. On the whole, the music analyzed displayed characteristics of cultural imperialism and homogenization, in fact, hybridization of popular and ethnic forms. In this sense, the music produced in this small South African town is both local and global, that is, it has characteristics of local influences. For example, African elements such as drumming patterns and sound imitation of African instruments occur, but it also has global influences, for example the types of music, the formal structure, the content of the texts, and so forth.

In Chapter 5.4 in this ethnographic study it was noted that it would be useful to employ Negus’ (1996:189) suggestion of a constructive way of analyzing “place-specific music” by considering three distinct features, which are henceforth addressed:

- **How the physical circumstances (nature of the population, activity and communication) of a place facilitate and contribute to the production of specific sounds.**

  In the case of the composition of this song, *Disillusioned*, the nature of the physical circumstances include the geographic location of Paarl, i.e. Western Cape situated in South Africa with all the concomitant socio-geographic influences including rock/pop music, Afrikaans folk music, classical music background from school and formal tuition, African traditional music and local town musicians’ influences. The local adolescent songwriting and band activity influence production of the lyrical and musical content due to the limitations of the creative sphere within which the songwriter functions and also the global influence. The nature of the geographic location facilitates and contributes to the production of a very specific sound idiom which is characterized by hybridization of typically African features combined with the more traditional styles and instruments of the rock band. Limitations of the songwriter’s locality include limited access to superior quality instruments, authentic African instruments (these sounds are replicated
on the keyboard) and limitations on the players. As a peer group in the band, these adolescents are limited in their technical ability, also in their time for practice due to the rigorous school schedule and lastly, the playing tendencies of bands in school and in the town presuppose and predict a certain type of sound which they inadvertently adhere to.

- **How the specific instruments, rhythms, voices and language particular to a place is utilized to symbolize the identity of that place.**

  Distinguishing features of this song include firstly the instrumentation: the use of running water sound effect as the opening sounds which gives the song a reflective/naturalistic tone reminiscent of purity, innocence, a return to nature, etcetera. The lead guitar enhanced with wha-wha pedal creates a sound reminiscent of the uhadi bow\(^6\) instrument, also the lack of the typical rock drum kit but replaced by the drumming provided on African drum and the chant-like speech patterns are again reminiscent of traditional African music. Secondly, supporting the instrumental tendency to combine rock and ethnic sounds, the musical material likewise reflect techniques associated with traditional African music such as the **ostinato** (see *figure 5.8*) which is repeated throughout the song, **improvisation** as applied on this ostinato where the song reaches more climactic moments and **cyclical elements** in the text as the text spins the story of disillusionment.

---

\(^6\) The uhadi bow is an African instrument of the Xhosa group which is a bow with calabash resonator attached, held to the shoulder and struck repeatedly with a short stick on the outward facing snare. The other hand pulls and releases the snare to produce pitch fluctuations and the calabash is pressed and released from the shoulder which produces tonal and volume inflections.
• How listening involves the synthesis and interpretation of symbolic data that is conveyed musically and how this creates a sense of “spatial rivalry”.

The hybridization of musical form and genre has been referred to and as such forms a synthesis in the creation of this song. It is symbolic that within the South African context, with the marginalization of racial groups, cultural and social symbols become the products wherein unity, hybridization and a synthesis forms, as well this song reflects. As such, it becomes symbolic of the resolution of racial tension that has characterized the South African political scene. It is notable that it is within the cultural and social domain that individuals find their voice, albeit not overtly, but the covert and symbolic message becomes established as the cultural products provide the individuals with social authorship and provides the songwriter with a unique corner in cultural and social space.

In the analysis of the adolescent songs it became apparent that the adolescent songwriter did indeed turn to the familiar, that is, emotions, behaviors, and the known for example people, places, things, and the accessible for example instruments, tape recorder, and the easily recognizable for example styles, genres, playing techniques, that they felt they could imitate and/or initiate with a relative measure of successful duplication for it to
sound authentic, given the lack of studios, producers, mixing desks, superior instruments, superior playing techniques, and so forth, a fact which is also of particular importance within the South African context. Rural and urban marginalized schools and societies in South Africa confront the same challenges of relative lack of equipment, technology, etcetera. However, as it transpires, adolescents turn to familiar and accessible resources, however limited those might be.

In analyzing the materials in this study, this viewpoint was confirmed in that the subjects’ music is not a culturally “pure” form, that is, free from global influence and uniquely small town Western Cape music of white, middle class, Afrikaans speaking adolescents. In fact, on the whole all the music analyzed in this research displayed characteristics of cultural imperialism and homogenization. In this sense, the music produced in this small South African town, Paarl, is both local and global, that is, it has characteristics of local influences. For example, African elements such as drumming patterns and sound imitation of African instruments (listen to “Disillusioned”, track 6 on the CD) occur, but it also has global influences, for example the types of music, the formal structure, the content of the texts, and so forth. The song “’n Stukkie Kaap” (see Appendix A for lyrics) also displays elements reminiscent of the style of Anton Goosen, a popular Afrikaans singer whose ballad singing style with simple guitar accompaniment, is characterized by local, Afrikaans images conjuring up everyday life of the Cape area in particular. Expanding on this, Richards (1998:73) notes that “pop music is a medium through which individual subjects often…reposition themselves in geographically wide-ranging cultural networks.”

5.6.7 Analysis of the song Toleration by L.S. [CD track 7] under Text Analysis below
5.7 TEXT ANALYSIS

Lyrics forms one component of the phenomenon “songwriting” and is henceforth analyzed as a constituent member of this genre. Mulvey (2001) in an article, “Words, Music are an inseparable Mix”, relates the conundrum found by professional songwriters that it is impossible to distinguish between lyrics or music when asked: Which comes first, the words or the music? The songwriter describes the process of lyrics writing as lyrics arising from the need to give shape to a melody or rhythm – not an intellectual, rational idea. He relates how narrative was induced by a catchy riff and specific rhythm. This led to some words that took a few moments to write, as it was sounds leading to sounds, images leading to images. Here it must be noted though that this could be the typical procedure for the professional songwriter who has a completely different set of circumstances and long term goals with songs, namely mass appeal, marketability of the song, etcetera, issues which do not concern the adolescent. Therefore, the adolescent engaged in songwriting has a more personal stake in the matter and emotional, social and intellectual needs are addressed.

5.7.1 Do lyrics matter?

A history of the importance of song words (Frith, 1988:119) reveals Riesman’s (1950) skepticism in the 1950s on the importance of lyrics and Denzin’s (1969) view in the 1960s that pop audiences did not listen to the words, but mainly responded to the beat. This discourse was the norm in the 1970s. Frith (1988:119) relates research of Robinson & Hirsch that concluded that teenagers are unaware of lyrics. Another survey (ibid.) reports that “effectiveness” of song lyrics is limited. Tamm (1985:237) remarks on numbers of studies that have shown that listener comprehension of texts is often minimal even when the song is in the native language. However, expanding on the above,

---

Richards’ (1998:102) research with adolescents, also borne out in this research (see Chapter 6 group discussions) reveals that adolescents differentiate between two modes of listening, namely:

- Attentive to sonic qualities, or
- Engaged with and entered into the meaning of the text.

Frith (1988:120) thus asks: Why and how do song words work?

“Words are the sign of a voice”, explains Frith (1988:120). It is through words bearing meaning, semantically and emotively, through verbal and non-verbal devices, that the singer conveys meaning.

General conclusions that can be drawn about the analysis of lyrics are:

- Lyrical meaning is communicated \textit{verbally} and \textit{non-verbally}; verbally through the semantic meaning of the words and non-verbally through for example sighs, sneers, laughter in the voice, stressing, stretching or repeating certain syllables of the word, rougher voice quality, or tremor in the voice (similar to Goodwin’s icons).
- Lyrical meaning is imbedded in \textit{performing conventions}, that is, listeners are used to hearing certain words expressed in certain ways. If a singer therefore performs the gentle love words of a song in a harsh manner, it conveys a different meaning than the conventional linguistic definitions of the words.
- Voicing influences lyrical meaning; for example, male-female duets evoke a sense of conversation between lovers. Also, the same song sung by a male or female could communicate different emotions to the listener.
- Lyrics mostly exist in ordinary language. \textbf{Realism and authenticity}, imitating and/or reflecting on everyday life, is created through the use of
ordinary speech. The use of slang likewise, draws particular attention to the language itself and the down to earth poetry it evokes.

Horton (1957:577) concludes that popular song “provides a conventional language for use in dating”. He (ibid.) continues that people often lack the verbal skill to express “profound feelings” and that song words become a messenger, a verbal carrier of difficult -to-express emotions for individuals.

Pop love songs do not ‘reflect’ emotions, then, but give people the romantic terms in which to articulate and so experience their emotions. (Frith, 1988:124)

This research proposes to expand on the definition of song words as expressive of conventional language for dating, to include a definition as song words functioning as expressive language for a greater spectrum of emotion, about the self and the perceived outside world. The analysis of song texts by adolescents in this research are thus viewed in the context of serving the function to provide the adolescent with a means of communication, expressing through song words what would otherwise have been too profound, too significant or emotionally and verbally cumbersome. The value of song texts to examine expression and intra- and inter-social behaviour is recognized by educators, for example Cooper (1981:8), who uses contemporary song texts in education, mainly in social studies, as he considers them invaluable aids for pursuing the educational goals of “self-knowledge and social analysis”; Miles (1993) who uses the power of songwriting as therapeutic intervention and Newcomb & Thompson (1994) likewise utilize songwriting activities as an aid in elementary education counseling.

Most recent discourse (Griffiths, 2003:42) on lyrics in pop songs indicate that the words in pop songs are not poetry, but are like poetry, and that by extension they tend towards being like prose. Griffiths (ibid.) refers to this as lyric and anti-lyric. This forms the basis for a systematic discourse on words, and historically how songs have worked in popular music, thus a “word consciousness”.

132
Griffiths (2003:43) refers to the function of musical phrasing in pop songs as **verbal space**\(^8\). This bears relevance in this dissertation in the analysis of adolescent’s songs, as the significance of word positioning within phrases bears relevance to the meaning and interpretation of the text. Verbal and musical space are realized in aspects of rhythm. The crux of this view rests on not how space is defined but how the words occupy it, that is, the relative density within and between each line. As such, some songs will build up through increased verbal or syllabic density.

Rhyme is central in pop music and the use of rhyme serves several functions. Rhyme can:

- Focus attention on certain words;
- Create a banality which forms a backdrop or antithesis to a deeper message (see also the group discussions in this dissertation, Chapter 6, where adolescents indicate how profundity and significance of emotion are masked in lyrics);
- Provide an emphasis on the sonorous quality of words arising from the lyrics themselves;
- Center concentration within the verbal space.

Griffiths (2003:50) identifies three types of rhyme in pop songs: **full rhyme**, **near rhyme** and deliberate **non-rhyme** in a rhymed setting. Combinations of the first two generally occur. Rhyme and alliteration, as well as numbers of grammatical and syntactical devices, are used in abundance by songwriters as techniques of poetry and prose.

---

5.7.2 The SOLO Taxonomy: an analytical tool

This author applied and adapted the SOLO Taxonomy\(^9\) (DeTurk, 1988:25) to the evaluation of the thinking processes involved in the creation of the lyrics in songwriting. The SOLO Taxonomy was originally developed to assess student essays about music, for example to describe a composition heard. This procedure rates the thinking process with a certain measure of proven success. A similar procedure had been followed by Bennett (1976) who developed a model of the process of musical composition that parallels models from creative writing.

In the SOLO Taxonomy an essay is assigned to a certain level depending on the sophistication of critical thinking, structure and concepts. To this end, this model is applied only to the song lyrics that will serve as the “essay”, or text, and will evaluate criteria such as structure of the lyrics and more importantly, the interpretation/performance of such lyrics in conjunction with the communicative and expressive power of the lyrics, as analysis of lyrics can not stand in a vacuum, but is inextricably linked to the music and socio-cultural context as thus far argued. As Spencer (1976:120) noted as long ago as 1976:

One must not look at the words of children’s songs as though they were conceived of as poetry, intended to stand by themselves. They are lyrics, and must be considered in conjunction with the music, which completes the sense and deepens the feelings expressed by the words.

More recently, Finnigan (1989:170) relates a rock composer remarking that if your lyrics have an important message, “you don’t need a great tune or accompaniment”, while an instrumental piece of greater complexity could have lyrics that are “just nonsense really”. Thus, lyrics have to be viewed in context of the musical setting.
Regarding the levels on the taxonomy (*Figure 5.9*): Lower-level concepts include for example functionality of form supportive of lyrics, that is, basic verse/chorus form, functionality of repetition (for example communicative and/or expressive power), application of progression or retrogression, clichéd exclamations, for example Baby, Baby I love you so. Higher level concepts include expanded, proportional, or novel formal structure supporting the lyrics, that is, inclusion of a bridge, varied verse length, through-composed elements in the text, purposeful repetition supportive of the lyrics, building of tension/relaxation or progression in the lyrics or lack thereof corresponding with the lyrics. The five levels in the adapted nomenclature for song lyric analyses thus represent:

- Increasingly advanced levels of critical thinking;
- A conceptual framework for analyzing lyrics within the musical and socio-cultural paradigm;
- A proposed assessment tool for music educators involved with adolescent composition.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><strong>Prestructural</strong></th>
<th>displays no structure; deny or simply fail to convey or support musical concepts; conveys no or very little communicative or expressive qualities.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>Unistructural</strong></td>
<td>relies upon a single lower-level musical concept or fact to convey communicative or expressive qualities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>Multistructural</strong></td>
<td>employs many unified lower-level musical and textual concepts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>Relational</strong></td>
<td>displays an understanding of higher-level concepts (such as style, form, progression) and presents evidence of several varied concepts in a related and unified whole relating it to communicative and expressive qualities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extended abstract: Includes meaningful combinations of lower-level and higher-level concepts and exceeds the bounds of basic skills. Displays advanced powers of communication and expression through higher-level verbal and non-verbal skills.

Figure 5.9: Levels of the SOLO Taxonomy adapted for song text analysis

Analysis of the text of the song “Main Man” by L.S. employing the SOLO-Taxonomy [CD Track 4]

Original in Afrikaans                  Translation

Main Man

Verse 1
Main man is die beste
Hy’s die koning van die skool
Hy kry al die chicks
Ja, hy’s die Main Man

Hy’s die rugbykaptein
En hy drink baie wyn
Niemand kan hom keer nie
Hy’s die Main Man

(tussenspel)

Hy’s baie populêr
Maar hy’s lelik teen die nerds
Arme nerds
Hy’s die Main Man

Verse 2
Hy vat nie baie twak nie
En hy neuk jou sommer op
O help my ek is bang
Vir die Main Man
Hy’s die Main Man
Sing saam met my
Main Man
Ja, Main Man

Verse 1
Main Man is the best
He’s the king of the school
He gets all the chicks
Yes, he’s the Main Man

He’s the rugby captain
and he drinks lots of wine
No-one can stop him
He’s the Main Man

(interlude)

He’s very popular
but ugly to the nerds
poor nerds
He’s the Main Man

Verse 2
He doesn’t take any nonsense
He beats you up
O help me, I’m scared
of the Main Man
He’s the Main Man
Sing with me
Main Man
Yes, the Main Man

136
Herhaal vers 1.

Herhaal vers 2.

Almal saam, kan julle nie hoor nie,
Yes, die Main Man.

L.S. (16 year-old, male)

Repeat Verse 1

Repeat Verse 2

All together now, I can’t hear you,
Yes, the Main Man.
Figure 5.10 : Notation to Main Man
As related above, the profundity and significance of an event or emotion often prohibit direct expression. For example L.S. is in the position, where in a boys’ high school, he is perhaps one of the “nerds”, intelligent, not a sportsman, criticized by the jocks and the "Main Men" in the school. As release, and/or mere social commentary on the anger, frustration and fear of being singled out in a group of “inferiors/nerds/geeks” and the like, he finds expression in songwriting. The lyrics of song allow him to express the profundity and significance of an event and emotion which he is unlikely to express to friends or classmates in the same way due to either a lack of social and/or verbal skill for his age level and/or because of it being socially unacceptable to talk “emotion” or “feelings” to friends in the male adolescent situation. The writing of this song has permitted the adolescent to vent frustration and also fear about the rugby captain of the school whom he describes as the Main Man of the school, King of the school, he drinks lots of wine, he is ugly to the nerds, etcetera. Most significantly, in the 15th line of the song he states: O help me I am scared of the Main Man, and then follows the indexes (Goodwin, 1992) “Sing along now”, “All together now”, “I can’t hear you”, used as a directive to the musical audience, a simulacrum to society, with the function of seeking support, as a cry and a plea for help and support. Continuing the train of thought on the use of symbols, icons and indexes (Goodwin, 1992) in this analysis, the vocal quality used by the singer on the indexal lines where he cries for help, are indicative of strain and stress with an upward vocal inflection, and in markedly different vocal style to the rest of the song which is delivered in a laconic, laid back, lethargic, monotone type relation. This style of singing is ironic and draws attention to the severity of the fear through the very laconic and uncaring, nearly callous and accepting singing tone employed in relating the content.

In viewing the notational example above (Figure 5.10), the simple, steady rhythmic pattern heightens the laconic character of the words. The limited range with much pitch repetition draws further attention to the plaintiveness of the message. The use of this vocal style is a symbol (Goodwin, 1992) as irony is a culturally understood symbol, here used to belie the fear and anger by masking it through overly uncaring vocal delivery.
The musical elements such as the melody, the rhythm and the harmonies, are delivered in the same continuous, unaltering way supporting the laconic and uncaring vocal delivery of the text. The melody uses mainly two interval motives repetitively throughout the song adding to the understatement the text wants to make. Throughout, the text is delivered as if relating a story without much feeling in the voice and the rhythm supports the steady, relentless forward motion. The melody supports the “uneventfulness” of the song content through the continued repetition of the two motives, driving the irony further home. The use of the slang “Main Man” in the Afrikaans context further supports the down to earth, everyday quality of the song, placing it in the adolescent milieu. Another symbol the songwriter employs is the plaintive tones of the piano accordion which are reminiscent of the concertina, a traditional Afrikaans instrument used in traditional “boeremusiek” bands. As such, the occurrence of the imitation of this instrument reflects a socio-cultural influence placing the song within a specific milieu (see Chapter 5.4 on locality in music) reflective of this student’s cultural milieu, possibly indicative of his cultural background.

With the above descriptive analysis, the content is examined within the framework of the SOLO-Taxonomy. Above descriptive analysis has identified:

- The use of icons, indexes and symbols;
- The use of irony;
- The use of slang, platonic and everyday expression creating milieu;
- The use of melodic motives to support irony;
- The use of motoric rhythm to drive the irony and fear relentlessly forward;
- The build up to a powerful climactic statement of fear and implied call for help.
- The lyrics provide the dual function of personal expression and observation, as well as a social commentary.

Applying the levels of the Taxonomy: Level 1 is clearly not applicable as the song has structure and builds up, layer by layer, a picture of the Main Man and his character
leading to the climactic “O, help me I am scared of the Main Man”. Level 2 is likewise not applicable, as the song does not rely on only one lower level musical concept to relay expressive or communicative qualities. Similarly, level 3 does not apply as more than one unified textual and musical concept has been applied. This analysis places the song text and its musical representation at the minimum at level 4 and ideally on level 5 as multi-level concepts are present and higher order thinking is presented here in a unified whole supported through many dimensions and on several levels of expression.

Analysis of the lyrics of the song Toleration by L.S. [CD Track 7]

Griffiths’ (2003:42) research on lyrics in pop songs indicate that the words in pop songs are not poetry, but are like poetry, and like prose, namely lyric and anti-lyric. This forms the basis for a systematic discourse on words, and historically how songs have worked in popular music, thus a “word consciousness”. Griffiths’ (2003:43) notion of the function of musical phrasing in pop songs, i.e. verbal space, is used in the analysis Toleration, as the significance of word positioning within phrases bears relevance to the meaning and interpretation of the text. Significant is also how verbal and musical space is realized in aspects of rhythm. How words occupy space, the relative density within and between each line will be analyzed.

The opening phrase “sick and tired” is rhythmically denser as this phrase uses shorter note values. Likewise intensification and condensing of verbal space is employed in the opening words of most lines, yet notable is the verbal space given at the end of every line, for example after mad and sad, likewise the greater verbal space on the end words helplessness and wilderness. Through accentuation and repetition the word “me” at the end of lines 4 and 13 are made significant within the context of the toleration theme. The indexes “Yeah” (line 5) and “Go” (line 13) again draws the audience in, a device which lyrics offer the adolescent in a way that poetry does not. Griffith’s (2003:42) statement that song lyrics are like poetry and prose requires closer scrutiny within the context of this song. The basic lay-out of the song is organized in stanzas consisting of four lines, each containing one rhyming couplet. This format is abandoned in the final verse (or
stanza) which the song leads up to where a six-line stanza is encountered. This stanza is, as a further distinguishing feature, not sung, but spoken like a rap and as such, the verse takes on greater verbal density as well as rhythmic density. The words are spoken in rapid succession, virtually glossing over very significant statements including: *tolerate every person, every culture, every race, age, color, every gender*. This greater verbal and rhythmic density leads the build up of the song on to the climactic *toleration* end verse which consists of one word only which is repeated 16 times. Repetition is a feature song lyrics offer the songwriter, which is not generally encountered in prose or poetry, whether it be repetition of the chorus, or of specific words within verse or chorus. This songwriter chooses to repeat the word *me* four times at the end of lines 4 and 13. Likewise the word *toleration* is repeated six times at the end of line 9 and 16 times at the end of line 20. The words of the chorus are heard twice in its totality. This device, repetition, is a significant feature for the songwriter to draw attention to a main topic or to strongly express and communicate the essence of his thoughts.

As has been noted, rhyme is central in pop music and the use of rhyme serves several functions. In *Toleration*:

- Rhyme **focuses attention** on the words done and sun in line 1 and 2, but consequently also draws attention to the following two lines of the stanza for the very fact that they do **not** rhyme;
- Rhyme creates a **banality** which forms a backdrop or antithesis to a deeper message. For example, the relative banality of the opening two lines: *sick and tired of all the things you’ve done, cooling off to freeze in the sun*. This however, sets the stage for the importance of the meaning contained in the following two lines where the songwriter focuses attention on himself waiting on change, peace and happiness.
- Rhyme also provides an emphasis on the **sonorous quality** of words such as helplessness and wilderness (lines 10 and 11), mad and sad (lines 5 and 7), bad and sad (line 17) arising from the lyrics themselves;
- Rhyme also focuses concentration within the verbal space, for example the single rhyming couplet per stanza focuses attention on the remainder of the stanza.
Also, when words are repeated, naturally they “rhyme” as they repeat, hence the verbal concentration.

TOLERATION

1 Sick and tired of all the things you’ve done
2 Cooling off to freeze in the sun
3 Waiting just before the winds of change
4 And what they bring peace and happiness for me, me, me, me.

CHORUS
5 Yeah, do something else to make me mad
6 I’ll tolerate it
7 There are better things in life to be sad
8 It’s a matter of
9 toleration 6x
10 to the end devoid of helplessness
11 My voice unheard in a wilderness
12 You wearing and caring won’t last long
13 I don’t care you mean nothing more to me, me, me, me, Go

CHORUS
14 Toleration for everything, everyone
15 Toleration for the nation, anyone
16 Tolerate this, tolerate that,
17 Don’t feel bad, don’t feel sad
18 Hey, tolerate every person, every culture,
19 Every race, age, colour, every gender
20 Toleration 16x

5.7.3 An overview of the subject matter of lyrics

A number of studies (Horton, 1957; Bridges & Denisoff, 1986) have investigated subject matter of lyrics and the changes that took place over a certain length of time. Additionally, Hayakawa noted in 1955 that popular music predominantly idealizes romantic love, a statement later verified by Hamm (1995:45) in an analysis of the top songs per Billboard magazine, May 8, 1954, who also remarks on the homogenous nature of the lyrics extending to the music. Research on the listener’s perception of the meaning of song texts (see 5.7.1: Do Lyrics matter?) corroborates these findings in the sense that
the banality and clichéd nature of the words tend to bypass the listener in merely creating a general feeling.

In a later analysis of popular music song lyrics in 1970 (Hamm, 1995:48), Hamm notes that of the top ten songs only two deal with romantic love, the rest deal with aspects of American life, religion, sex, life as a difficult and troubled journey, and so forth, in fact, a wide variety of views on life and love. The music reflects the same heterogeneous tendency. Hamm (1995:50) remarks that since 1950 new elements, from minority cultures, have poured into popular music and brought with it new themes. When rock came on the scene, one of the very first new issues it addressed was loneliness and alienation (Reich, 1971:32). Other themes rock initiated was the physical side of love, an expression of anti-war sentiments, drugs as part of American life, ecology, politics, old age, historical characters, humor, religion, patriotism, family relationships, etcetera.

An overview of subject matter in popular music necessarily needs to note the anti-education theme that has been a controversial issue for both politicians and educators, as songs of that nature were also found in this research, for example, Hating School (see Appendix A). Songs by the Beatles (Sergeant Pepper), Pink Floyd (The Wall), Sting (Don’t Stand so Close to Me) testify to this tendency. In essence, defiance of authority is marked out in these songs and in forms such as hard rock, heavy metal, rap and numerous studies (Bleich et al, 1991; Robinson et al, 1996; Hansen & Hansen, 1991; Arnett, 1991; Zuckerman, 1979; Dollinger, 1993; Little & Zuckerman, 1986) have established a direct link between rebelliousness, defiance, and reckless behavior regarding drugs, sex, and etcetera.

Finnigan’s (1989:171) study of music making in a small English town unveils an immense quantity of compositions by local amateurs on a wide variety of subject matter as far ranging as the sentimentality of: Secrets of your heart, I want you, Moody side of me, to the other extreme on violence, social and political commentary: They built the bomb, Political violence, So much hate, Peace for a new age, and Natural born hooker, to name but a few. Finnigan (1989:170) concludes that the variety of the subject matter
negates a dismissal of “passive copying of ready-made matter”. The range of the subject matter bears testimony to the range of personal experiences to be expressed in words and music.

5.8 SUMMARY

It is contended in this chapter that, adolescent songwriting (which typically is in the popular music style) provides material to support a new paradigm for the discourse and philosophy on the inclusion of popular music making and listening in music education. This paradigm should extend to include ever widening spheres of musicological and socio-cultural analytical tools. A number of musical analytical tools have been proposed in this chapter including semiotics, performing strategy analysis, pitch graph analysis, proportional analysis, recontextualisation, and Goodwin’s signs, symbols and indexes and the SOLO-Taxonomy and Griffith’s verbal space for analysis of song lyrics.

It has been established that the discourse on popular music has historically examined mainly lyrics. It has also been established that musicological analysis has provided mainly tonal analysis and analytical approaches best suited to Western classical music. It is proposed in this chapter that a single analytical method does not suffice, as varied analytical tools provide different sets of data. It has thus been proposed, in light of Krims’ (2000) notion of Musical Poetics, to include various methods of analysis extending from the music through the socio-cultural data to gain the necessary data for meaningful and accountable inclusion of this genre in music education. Equally importantly though, the phenomenon of adolescent's informal songwriting products can be viewed as a rich resource for educators and researchers alike to tap into gleaning much about socio-psychological and musical development.
The next chapter describes research methods utilized to research and document all data on adolescent songwriting. Group interviews, observation, individual interviews and the Experience Sampling Method were used, and described, data were analyzed and conclusions are made.
CHAPTER 6
THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This chapter describes research methods applied to document the product and process of adolescent songwriting. Research methods include qualitative and phenomenological methods based in ethnography. Results are documented and analyzed and conclusions are made.

6.1 INTRODUCTION

In 1979 Harré proposed that traditional experimental approaches in social psychology would reach a crisis in the eighties due to firstly, the often decontextualized laboratory settings which removed the locus of the study from everyday life and secondly, the discrepancy between the North American approach that focuses on the individual and the European approach which focuses more macroscopically on social contexts. To combat above distinctions, social research in the past decade has tended to rely more on qualitative research methods and also to combine various research methodologies.

Such qualitative research methodologies include phenomenology and ethnography. In research where the research question pertains to the meaning or function of a phenomenon, phenomenology can be applied. Where the nature of the phenomenon is described, ethnographic research methodology applies (Morse, 1994:224). As stated in Chapter 1, the aim of this research is the study of the nature and function of adolescent songwriting. Therefore, a combination of phenomenological and ethnographic methods is applied. Various qualitative research methods may be used simultaneously to obtain a more holistic view (Morse, 1994:224). In this
research, two qualitative research methodologies are combined: **phenomenology**, that is, those questions eliciting the *meaning or function of an experience* and **ethnography**, meaning those questions exploring the *nature* of the values, practices and beliefs of a cultural group. As such, ethnographic methods rely greatly on “participant observation” (Atkinson & Hammersley, 1994:248) and mostly smaller, purposive samples, as in this dissertation where the number of participants totaled 29.

Atkinson & Hammersley (1994:248) describe ethnography as a social research consisting of many of the following features:

- A strong emphasis on exploring the nature of particular social phenomena, rather than setting out to test hypotheses about them;
- A tendency to work primarily with “unstructured” data, that is, data that has not been coded at the point of data collections in terms of a closed set of analytic categories;
- Investigation of a small number of cases, perhaps just one case, in detail;
- Analysis of data that involves explicit interpretation of the meanings and functions of human actions, the product which mainly takes the form of verbal descriptions and explanations, with quantification and statistical analysis playing a subordinate role at most.

Persson & Robson (1995:41) acknowledge that there exists significant ambivalence as to the value and utilization of qualitative data. Qualitative data is often considered only purposeful if used in conjunction with substantiating quantitative data. Qualitative data has often been condescendingly viewed as “arbitrary assumptions”\(^1\) or “anecdotal”\(^2\). However, Persson & Robson (ibid: 41) note the equality of qualitative and quantitative data. They (ibid.) propose that every effort

---


should be made to study the “real world” of music by researching music and musicians in their actual contexts. As such, musicians should be able to make their unique contributions by individual responses. “Openness” towards participants in any research enquiry is vitally important particularly in an effort to obtain “real” results in the actual context of the phenomenon. Musicians should thus be considered “co-researchers” (ibid:43) rather than objects of study.

The musicians may well have valuable suggestions about the research procedure, particularly concerning the validity of heuristic assumptions and the nature of the research questions – provided these are open to discussion with the participants. Also, provided that research results are presented in an appropriate type of language, the validity of findings may also be tried against the opinion and understanding of the participating musicians themselves, who in our experience of ten will provide valuable comments and insights (Persson & Robson, 1995:43).

Persson & Robson (ibid.) conclude by highlighting the importance of involving musicians rather than isolating them. Likewise, Stock (2003:142), in relating ethnomusicological practices, states that ethnomusicological writing presents both the views of the community studied and the scholar’s interpretation. Much of this is termed “ethnographic – that is, an account of a society” (ibid.). The links between ethnomusicological methods such as ethnographic methods are clear and the benefits for the music education researcher are apparent. Stock (ibid.) identifies several strengths of ethnographic methods for music education research. These are:

- The extensive participant-observation provides the researcher with a wide variety of experiences to draw on and such participants provide reflection of their own and others’ music making in the contexts of day-to-day life. As a result, ethnography is a particularly suitable way to capture the complexities of the live experience of individuals.
- Ethnography also avoids false comparison such as generalizations based on categories that lack grounding in the realities of the subject.
- Ethnography also avoids superficiality inherent in research based on only interviews without extensive observation and/or self-participation.
- Ethnography, being based in the day-to-day context of people, is also rich in detail.
- The written conventions of ethnography also allow the researcher’s own reflections on the impact of his/her presence in the research period.

As such, the aim of the research procedures outlined below has strived to involve adolescents in different ways to achieve validity of research findings. Adolescents have been considered co-researchers in this study by allowing them considerable freedom in the way they chose to make their contribution, for example, freedom to write the ESM (Experience Sampling Method) report in their own way rather than using the form, freedom to engage in conversation with the observer rather than being in isolation from the observer, etcetera, as set out below. Observation, discussion, formal and informal interviews and conversation have all been conducted on the principles of the interaction between researcher and respondent. A socio-cultural and contextual perspective has thus been maintained throughout the research procedure. Furthermore, the extent and variety of research methodologies employed served to cross-validate data.

6.2 GROUP DISCUSSION AS DATA-GATHERING TECHNIQUE

Two group discussions were conducted, with males and females respectively. Group discussion provides the researcher with general observations towards making initial conclusions for more detailed observations during individual interviews and other data gathering techniques.
6.2.1 Methodology of the group discussion

The group discussions were held in two sessions of approximately one hour 30 minutes each with the males and females respectively. Each discussion centered on a number of questions posed by the interviewer to which participants freely responded. The nature of this research technique combined phenomenological and traditional interview techniques in the sense that although a semi-structured approach was employed in questioning, respondents were free to reply and continue the conversation which often meandered and digressed onto related matters. Both group discussions were tape recorded and were transcribed verbatim from tape. The transcriptions then formed the source for the following analysis and interpretation.

The male group consisted of 6 adolescents namely two 15 year-olds, two 17 year-olds and two 18 year-olds. The female group consisted of 7 adolescents namely one 15 year-old, two 16 year-olds and four 17 year-olds.

6.2.2 The male group discussion

The discussion was initiated with a question on the mode of songwriting, that is, do they find songwriting to be an individual or collaborative effort. Responses indicated that all the respondents wrote mainly individually, but have on occasion worked collaboratively in a band or as a songwriting team for example:

*S.J.: I would say my music is mostly an individual effort. Few of my songs have actual words. Every now and again I write poetry, and then I feel like setting it to music. I am currently busy writing a musical. My friend wrote a play and asked me to write a few songs for it.*

*P.L.: M. and I have tried writing songs together, but yes, I don’t know, I can’t. I struggle to work with his words. So, yes, I mainly write on my own.*
The discussion steered towards how lyrics and music came about. Mostly, respondents have a preferred method of going about songwriting with regards to whether lyrics or music are done first. C.B., S.J., E.K. indicated that they definitely have to work with lyrics first and fit music to it. C.B., however, continued by stating that:

*If you write lyrics first and not the music, is it virtually impossible to meld or develop various styles. If you have lyrics you have to fit the music to the different themes of the songs, it has to fit, but if you write the music first it stays on your own style, but then you have to try and fit words to the music.*

The discussion then veered onto style and whether it was the focus of songwriters to write in a specific style.

*Interviewer: must you write in different styles? Like maintaining a style as your badge? (Many interjections)*
*No...* 
*Actually different ones...* 
*Yes, it’s just...what people do...and if you listen to a CD then there are certain songs whereby you can identify the group...* 
*Like a special voice...* 
*P.L: And you can, because people want to hear an arsenal of different styles...* 
*It takes a long time to develop your own style.* 
*C.B: before you try to develop your own style you must first have a goal, you must say I want, I like this band, and I want to sound like them. And I like this band, two different ones, with totally different music.* 
*Interviewer: and you meld the two styles?* 
*C.B: Yes, but yet it does not concern me that one likes one type of music and another and you don’t try and make it a badge. It comes automatically.*

The discussion was then directed towards listening to music and to what extent they feel their listening preferences influenced their songwriting style. The result of this line of discussion can be summarized as focusing on instrumental playing technique and studio production and how a certain style of music might be favored for listening, but cannot be reproduced due to practical limitations.
C.B.: I love Metallica, but the point is it’s metal and you have to be very, very good to make metal sound good. Your playing, your technique (several responses).
P.L.: I mean for example they have the best lead guitar player in the world, that guy is incredible.
P.L.: I listen to Red Herring. They are busy totally transforming rock. They have brought about a whole new sound, because they have a synthesizer and a lot of stuff. It’s not electronic, it’s not pop, but their guitar will like play a riff and a lot of sounds come together, nearly like an industrial band. You must listen to it to experience it. And they influence me a lot in the sense that a lot of their lyrics are very intellectual. So you have to think hard what the song is about.
Interviewer: in which way does it influence you?
P.L.: I think the influence is more subconscious, it’s subtle. I just play my guitar and it just comes out.
M.P.: I listen to folk rock, it’s deep music.
F.L.: I like Nirvana, but it doesn’t influence my music. I write more in an old style because I like playing the older type styles more and I listen to more contemporary styles.
Interviewer: so you make a clear distinction between what you listen to and what you play?
F.L.: Yes.
C.B.: if you have a school band that’s not professional, they play music like Soutklip³, it’s just like a metal band but not good, because it’s like jazz, you have to be an excellent player to make jazz sound good. It’s like classical music too.

The discussion on playing technique naturally steered toward the compositional process as the use of an instrument is closely connected with the songwriting process.

C.B.: I want to say, I’m not a pianist, I did take lessons for two years (much laughter all round), but I feel that in piano style there is just so little prospect of songwriting than if you compare it to bands.
S.J.: no, I can’t play guitar (much simultaneous talking). I have to go strictly on tunes because on a guitar you do chords and the tune is built on that. I must first take the tunes and then make a chord out of that because on a piano you must have a tune.
E.K.: as he says, it starts like the drummer will begin, just with a beat, then the bass joins in, and then the guitarists comes in with a little something that maybe he messes around with at home, and then he starts with that and then the tunes comes on the guitar…which goes with the song.

³ Soutklip: a rock band comprised of four high school students in these respondents’ school.
The discussion then took a turn to the physical aspects of playing an instrument and how that affects style and songwriting.

_E.K_: *I went to a jazz festival in Cape Town the other day, and a lot of people played and the woman on the piano was going mad and I thought to myself: How can they enjoy that? But every person has something as it feels to me. Every person, it's like playing bass, or xylophone and it's everything to that person (much laughter)._  
_C.B_: it's like I hate listening to blues, but I love to play it.

From the discussion on listening to music and the playing of instruments it became clear that on the whole the adolescents discern between listening, playing and songwriting styles. If the one influences the other, they are aware of it and allow the influence. They are also saliently aware of the limitations of the styles they like and the limitations of their production potential.

The interviewer continued with a direct question on why adolescents engage in the activity of songwriting.

_S.J_: we just do it.  
_P.L_: I think every little boy in his life dreams of becoming a music star or whatever. (Interruptions). Everyone seeks the glamour, and yes...  
Interviewer: but, does everybody seek that glamour?  
(Much simultaneous talking).  
_P.L_: Yes, yes, for me it’s about a music star  
_S.J_: yes, we are crazy about it.  
_P.L_: yes, it starts out as fun and it just gets more. But, I think everybody has that ambition to revolutionize the music industry.  
_C.B_: I don’t know.  
_P.L_: am I talking too much?  
Interviewer: no, no, continue.  
_P.L_: Like it will be a hell of an honour for me to be able to do something that totally shocks everyone out of their skulls, that is, to give everyone something new.  
_C.B_: but one has to be careful of such things, because something totally new might not fit, it’s like something new can be extremely novel or just an extreme stagger.  
Interviewer: to return to the purpose of songwriting, is it thus the glamour at the end of the line?  
_S.J_: that’s very broad...
C.B: there is nothing nicer in the world, let’s say, you dream about a girl that you have just spoken to on the phone and then you write a song. That’s much nicer to think “Oh, this can get interesting”...
P.L.: it’s not necessarily on a grand scale. It was very nice for me when we got a prize at the variety concert for our own composition and it’s not only that.
E.K: I don’t agree. I can’t stand that whole image and media thing.
(Much interjections from everyone informing us that E.K.’s reluctance is due to the fact that he’s band plays punk rock. On the whole the group seemed negative about punk music and thus also about E.K.’s opinions).
E.K: (after much commentary on the lack of authenticity by rock and pop stars). I mean, it doesn’t do it for me. I have nothing to do with those people (rock and pop musicians), it’s their jobs and they enjoy it, but I am not going to agree with everyone here because everyone has their own thing and a right to enjoy that, but it doesn’t do it for me, because what do they change? They only make themselves wealthy and do publicity stunts. Where is the authenticity in their music? It all just comes back to the meaning of it.
Interviewer: so what does it (songwriting) mean to you?
E.K: it is a way to convey a message.
Interviewer: what message?
E.K: Any message.
S.J: to vent suppressed emotion.
E.K: no, not only that.
Interviewer: what is the purpose of your songwriting, F?
F.L: just for myself.

The discussion then progressed to the more practical and logistical matters of songwriting for example, the nature of what is written down and how, or if, music is stored.

P.L: just record it.
C.B: words are written.
E.K: I tape it.
S.J: I can’t remember mine at all because I play with two hands on the piano. But I use Cakewalk and my computer and keyboard and store it thus.
Interviewer: does anybody write notes?
Several respondents: Notes?
Interviewer: Yes, notes on five line staffs.
S.J: no one has that much time.
Interviewer: chords?
P.L: yes.
C.B: I use tabs for guitar as well, particularly when someone else has to play it.

Responses to a question on each adolescent’s oeuvre to date can be summarized as:
E.B: 10 songs.
M.P: 4 or 5. Lately I haven’t written much.
S.J: 12 completed songs.
F.L: 7 or so, but if you leave them you lose them after a time.
P.L: I have 3 complete songs and about 5 or 6 not completely done yet.
C.B.: I have one completely done and then about 2 years worth of riffs and short pieces that I’m about to put together.

The above statement led on to a discussion about form, how a song comes together from riffs and is expanded into a full composition.

Interviewer: so, if I understand this correctly, often you have a catchy idea (many concurring nods), and you realize you have something here, but you have difficulty to flesh it out into a complete song?
S.J: yes, I have a lot of problems doing the C part. You know that part that is the bridge...every piece has a verse, chorus, verse, chorus and suddenly a completely different key and different music...I have struggled for months, but I just can’t do it. It’s the hardest part.
P.L: yes, it builds up to a chorus
Some-one: yes, but all you do is... (Interrupted by S.J.)
S.J: You put the transpose just after it
C.B: all you do is just take the verse and contrast the chords and it will come.
S.J: normally I do that but it is still the hardest part of songwriting
Interviewer: when you write a song do you think in terms of a formal structure for example, I have this part, now it must be followed by another part, etcetera?
Someone: that’s how it always turns out.
(Much simultaneous talking)
P.L: I simply try to let my song flow. I don’t like structured things, otherwise the song gets monotonous. My songs won’t have verse-chorus-verse-chorus the whole time. It will be like verse-chorus-something totally different-link-etc. A song gets hell of a monotonous and boring if it’s the same stuff over and over.
F.L: I think choruses must vary the whole time; it mustn’t be the same chords over and over.
C.B: yes, but that’s what choruses do. It’s the same piece... (Interrupted)
S.J.: yes, but a golden technique that always works is you just change the last sentence of the chorus, or the first, then already it changes the color of the chorus, but when you write, particularly pop, it must repeat.
E.K.: very often one only has to take one sentence and repeat it.
S.J.: everyone knows Britney Spears. Every song of hers is the classical format of verse, and that exact same chorus, it all sounds the same. It irritates me unbelievably.
C.B: that’s pop for you, it all sounds the same.
E.K: yes, if you’ve heard one pop song...
The interviewer continued with questions on vocal versus instrumental genres.

M.P.: if you're going to do instrumentals you have to be excellent.
Interviewer: so is writing vocal music a form of camouflaging lacking technique?
P.L.: no
E.K.: many songs have instrumental parts
S.J.: no-one wants to listen to instrumentals; if there is an instrumental piece on your CD you skip it.
E.K.: they are very repetitive, it's like metal and their bass is also very good and the music is so good, their instruments it's like they have the knowledge and the skill and they use acoustic guitar for an introduction going into full chords, and they have a piece where they play like that for 2 or 3 minutes...(trails off)

The discussion digressed onto various playing skills and techniques employed by bands during instrumentals interludes of vocal songs. Lastly, the matter of lyric topics was addressed. The participants were asked what the main topic of their lyrics is. Summarized:

C.B.: Definitely what happens to you.
P.L.: my lyrics are mainly opposite to the music. If the music is happy then the words are opposite like cross or depressed. My lyrics are mostly emotion, depression.
M.P.: there are lots of bands like that. Their words don't make any sense.
P.L.: REM did that. They wrote songs and cut up every line through it together in a hat and pasted it together in any way.
C.B.: lots of songs are very deep; you don't always know straight away what it's about.
S.J.: disappointments. But you can't write it straight out, you are subtle about it. You're not going to sing “I got 50% for my Math test, oh, I'm so disappointed”. You write about the emotion, the disappointment, not that it is Math. Most of my songs are about lost opportunities, lost loves, big disappointments; the most beautiful ballads come from sad words.
F.L.: I like to write a song so that when the song starts people don't have a clue what it's about, only at the very end you realize what the song is about.
M.P.: it's very passionate, abstract music.
C.B. my songs are all depressed, about someone in trouble. What you experience comes out in your songs.
Simultaneous responses: it gives you strength, it helps you through problems, and it gives perspective.
Interviewer: while you write, or thereafter?
C.B: while. Every, every song I write is about how things are going with me, basically my life and what I see in it.

END OF SESSION.

6.2.3 The female group discussion

The interviewer started the discussion off by inviting each of the participants in the group to briefly describe what they have written and how many songs they have composed.

E.G: Not much completed, but I have some, but I have a big folder full of words and..... (Trails off)
Interviewer: so do you make your own music and words?
E.G.: yes, I sometimes write the guitar chords to the words, because I can’t play piano.
Interviewer: so, what comes first, the lyrics or the music?
E.G.: first the words, sometimes I have words for long and then I hear music somewhere, and then I take it from there.
Interviewer: L.C.?
L.C.: I have written many songs and sometimes I just sit and write and later I sit at the piano and try out things, sometimes I lose it and as I play things come back.
Interviewer: so you basically work alone?
L.C.: yes.
Interviewer: you thus make words first and then music?
L.C.: yes, but I can’t play piano from notes, I play by ear and I have the words and sit and try out things on the piano.
H.L: I write on days like when I’m depressed, and I’ll write like how unfair life is, but I always write the words. I have written two songs. I write when and because I feel I just want to escape and for the relaxation it brings. I love music and to me writing a song, I sit for hours in my room writing songs, and I sometimes write with M.G. I can’t play piano, but I can play by ear.
Interviewer: M.G.?
M.G.: yes, I write on my own. I’ll sit at the piano and like I’ll just play a chord, and expand it a little and then just add words just as I play, not even important words.
E.S: I have written a little bit, but I don’t like writing words. I have asked others to write, but I am good at piano and I play a chord and expand it like her. I have done about 5 songs.
E.S: basically like I only started this year and write to express myself. I think what is very much in fashion today is songs with great emotion, and that’s the kind of song I write.

The discussion veered into several comments passed on how they write songs and next thing they might hear something on the radio that sounds a lot like the song they composed. Sometimes the feeling of “this song is too good to be mine” emerges as they think “this song is so good, it can’t be mine, I must have heard it somewhere before”.

E.S.: I have just written a song that sounds a lot like something I have heard on the radio. I’m just not sure.

E.S. continued to speak about songs she has written sounding somewhat like other familiar songs, all the while paging in a collection of songs in a book.

Interviewer: so do any of the rest of you collect your songs in a book like this? You? Yes. You? Yes. You H.L? Well it depends, sometimes at school I get an idea and just like write it down in my homework book, so really I have song words all over.

Several other responses were given on how the songs are written just anywhere and collected into little books or folders. Mainly it seemed as if ideas, namely words/thoughts came to the girls in various situations and they would jot these down on the backs of magazines, homework books and the like and later work them through.

The discussion proceeded on what exactly was written down on paper: words only, words with chords, five line notation and the like.

Two responded they remembered everything and did not write anything down.

E.S: I write words down and above it the guitar chords, but sometimes the words are enough, I remember the chords. I sometimes write notes on the staff, with chords above and words below.
Interviewer: are the notes basically for pitch only? How accurate are you with the rhythm?
(Laughter) I basically don’t write rhythm. I just make notes to indicate pitch.
Interviewer: just whole notes?
Yes. (Laughs)

The discussion continued indicating that words are mostly written down with chords and when they sit down to play the melody is remembered from this “lead sheet”. They also indicated that it was mainly the basic chords, not necessarily all the chords.

The interviewer then led the discussion further on the developmental path of a song: How the words take form and settle into a “song”. Questions on the path of inspiration versus effort were posed.

Sometimes I just have one verse and a chorus, and then maybe I don’t quite get the chorus right....
Yes
I find it easier to write a melody when I don’t think about the notes too much but just let it flow.
I basically get inspired by a core idea to a song, the rest is sometimes not as good, but my main core is the essence of the song. I return to a song often and rework.

The discussion was then led onto the function of the songs, meaning how the songs were utilized by the adolescents.

E.G: I don’t think I’ll become a singer or anything, I doubt it, I mean you have to be very, very good, but I like to keep my options open. To me it’s a very personal thing, its fun and basically part of living; it’s like why you get up in the morning. It’s one of the things to make life more interesting. If one day, if I get really good with it, then I want to go into some kind of writing, expressive creative writing but I think it helps my thinking.
L.C: it’s nice to write, because no one has your thoughts. It’s how you feel, no one can tell you it’s wrong and you can’t feel like that, it’s completely something your own.
H.V.: I also write basically to get away, but I don’t think there’s something I’m really writing for. It’s not as if something’s going to happen that I’m writing for. But it will be a dream come true, if say, someone sees me and I become this great star, not that this will happen, oh, I once wrote a song for my parents and then I
sang it in church and it’s how you start just with small things and it gets bigger and bigger.
M.G.: yes, I write songs so I can sing them.
L.S.: sometimes when I have to practice piano, I find that I make up my own stuff rather than practice my scales. I don’t like to say to people, like I have this song, and this song, I will still play the music, but the words I keep to myself. It stays private.

The interviewer posed questions on the style of songs the girls compose for example ballads, slow songs, rock songs? There seemed to be consensus among the girls that it was mainly slow songs, “songs that tell a story”. One girl related that she was involved with a band and the style of music they do is called alternative. They play a lot of Afrikaans rock. She composes some songs (not all) for the band and enjoys hearing how the songs flesh out when in rehearsal with the guitarists and drummers. The girls mentioned that the instrument they composed on was piano.

Interviewer: how many times, when you’re just sitting by yourself playing, trying out new ideas, do you try to play songs you know, that you might have heard on the radio, like pop songs, rock and so on.
(Lot of laughing, immediate concurring reaction).
Many simultaneous responses of:
Yes, I do it often...
I love it when I’m just copying something else...
I also think when you try and copy songs then you understand how other styles feel if you read the CD booklet along with the songs then you can get meaning from that because you have tried it yourself. You understand for the first time how that guy [who wrote the song] must have felt when doing so. What he’s trying to say.

This led to a discussion on writing about emotion, what you feel, and how you understand others’ feelings through music. The interviewer continued with questions on the extent the songs are mainly emotional expression or just improvisatory playing with words.

Someone: Songs are mainly emotions, and sometimes you don’t even think, you just play. It’s like another world which you enter. You don’t think, you just feel good, you just play.
Interviewer: when you think in terms of the emotions you pour out in your songs, of the lyrics of your songs, what are the main topics of your song lyrics? Can you name a few?
M.G.: Life and love are the main topics of the song lyrics.
L.G.: It’s mostly when something happens to you and then how you feel about it, and then you write about it, sometimes about a time in your life. Sometimes something happens to some one close to me, and then I write about that. But you never write about something in detail, it’s always something you understand, but that is oblique to someone else. You don’t want others to know the details.
E.G: Some words just create some kind of emotion and just go so well with your song.
Interviewer: you have said how songwriting lifts you up, makes you feel good, etcetera. Now when something has happened that is sad, why relive the experience in the songwriting process?
Several responses simultaneously.
Someone: if later when you return to the song, you remember it, the importance of it. When you go back to it later it helps you to remember what happened.
L.G. If you write a song about something terrible that happened to you it’s as if you’re rid of it, it stays there.
H.V: It helps you create a world that’s more perfect, where you can dream.

The conversation turned towards musical background and it transpired that all the girls had at some time or another taken music lessons. Not all were currently music students; however, all had had exposure to formal musical education including theory and music notation experience. Three were currently taking formal music lessons, and one took after school piano tuition.

The compositional process was discussed next, particularly the germinal idea for a song, namely a riff that expands into a song. The girls concurred that the best songs had a very simple, catchy riff.

L.S: it’s something that’s just in your head the whole day, over and over.
Someone: yes...
L.S.: yes, and then you know it’s going to be a good song.
Interviewer: but when you write a song about an emotion, will it need a riff?
H.L.: I think you can distinguish between girl and guy songs, but not quite, because guys are more likely to use guitars and bands, and all the songs are just riffs (laughs). Girls’ songs are more emotion.
The discussion continued onto the types of music they listen to and how and if their listening choice influences their songwriting.

L.S.: I listen to anything, my parents’ classical music, sixties music, everything contributes to developing your own style.
H.V.: I also listen to anything. I like the modern stuff.
H.L.: I like to sing, and to relax while listening.
E.G.: I don’t like to listen to weird stuff, but it depends on one’s mood.
M.G.: Many people listen to music they don’t even like, it’s just peer pressure. There’s a type of popular music, and if you don’t listen to it, or admit to liking something else, you’re a nerd, and so on.

The discussion continued on the act of songwriting and how it set them apart from others. They perceive themselves as more individualist, independent, not concerned with what others think of them.

E.G.: writing a song is really exposing yourself to the outside world, making you very vulnerable. Some people don’t like expressing themselves because they are so afraid of what others might think.
M.G.: I get this creative urge, that I just want to “make”.

The conversation digressed onto the topic of how keen they all were to “make” things, to be creative, for example, to make a dress, or make a paper-machè object, or art, etcetera.

H.V.: Sometimes I just want to make something, I just don’t know what, I don’t have an idea.
E.G.: the product you create is the way you feel about yourself.

Interviewer: how do you see your futures as songwriters?
L.S.: Just the thought that a song could be famous, or make you famous, is just so exciting.

On the whole, the girls felt, that there was no future in music. They related how their parents urged them to study in a field where there is money. They did not perceive songwriting, singing, the stage, etcetera as possible avenues of “safe”, reliable careers.
END OF SESSION

6.2.4 Analysis and interpretation of both the groups’ interview data

In qualitative research such as this dissertation, there are three identifiable analytic strategies (Gay & Airasian, 2003:232) namely:
- negative case analysis
- analytic induction (development of a theory)
- constant comparison

In this case, constant comparison is used for data analysis as this approach involves the constant comparison of identified data and concepts to determine their distinctive characteristics so that they can be placed in different and appropriate categories.

Therefore, in the group discussion the participants were tape recorded, these recordings were then transcribed verbatim. This transcription was analyzed through the constant comparison method for themes – recurring thoughts or patterns that emerged. In the male and female group discussion 12 themes were identified. These themes were coded as for example style, listening, compositional process, etcetera and are reported in a summarized, narrative form below.

The transcriptions were then analyzed for all opinions on said themes. Not all participants had an opinion or statement on every theme. In reporting the different themes and selecting representative quotations there were three options:
1. Where there was general consensus and agreement, that is, the opinions echoed each other or were just a repetition of an already expressed idea on a theme, the most succinct and clear utterance was quoted.
2. Likewise with general consensus in disagreement.
3. Where there was ambivalence or divergent opinions on a theme, all such opinions were quoted.
The interpretation of the data followed from the identified themes again according to the constant comparison method. The 12 themes of the male group were compared to the 12 themes of the female group. The findings in each theme were compared to the other group to establish concurrences or variances. For example: songwriting style was an identified theme in both discussions. The male and female narrative was then compared and statements made on how the females and males showed similarities or differences in that particular category. This is reported below in narrative form rather than quantitative forms such as graphs or tables, as is the practice in qualitative reporting to include reflection and interpretation of the researcher.

Thematic analysis
The interview with the group of girls reflected many of the beliefs and tendencies the group of boys held, but there were some differences. Concurrences and differences include:

- The competitiveness of a career in popular or commercial music. The girls in particular indicated parent's reluctance to let them be involved in a music career.
- The “secret” dream of possibly being a “star” was found in both the girls and boys group. Expressions regarding “stardom” from the boys were heard such as:

  *I think every little boy in his life dreams of becoming a music star or whatever. Everyone seeks the glamour ...One of the girls likewise said: I also write basically to get away, but I don’t think there’s something I’m really writing for. It’s not as if something’s going to happen that I’m writing for. But it will be a dream come true, if say, someone sees me and I become this great star, not that this will happen, oh, I once wrote a song for my parents and then I sang it in church and it’s how you start just with small things and it gets bigger and bigger.*

- The enjoyment of songwriting: losing yourself in it, being in another world, forgetting about yourself, etcetera, was a common theme in both the boys and girls groups. It transpired, along with the information on
individual or collaborative songwriting, that songwriting has particular meaning for the adolescent as a solitary, individual action of self-expression, reflection, and being “deep” as the boys termed it.

- The lyrical content of their songs likewise focused on life and love as the primary emotion. The boys were very outspoken and clear about the purpose of their songs as venting emotion, what happens to you, what you feel, disappointments, deep emotions, and the like. As such, even though the locus of their performance of these songs was the band, it seemed acceptable that emotional songs, about life, love and deep emotion (subtle, not overt) formed the main lyrical thrust of their oeuvre. The girls likewise responded that life and love, what happens to you, how you feel, when you want to remember something, etcetera formed the main lyrical content of their songs. The conclusion can be made that songwriting, despite the difference in style, instrumentation, performance technique and presentation, provides both male and female adolescents with a tool for expressing emotion. It thus answers one of the secondary research questions of this dissertation, namely how songwriting provides a medium for self-expression and communication for the adolescent.

- Songwriting afforded them the opportunity to get rid of negative emotion, to write about inexplicable or troublesome matters thereby distancing themselves from it. As results on the lyrical analysis (see Chapter 5.6) of songs show, adolescent songs deal mainly with negative (unhappy, troubled, inexplicable, questioning, angry, frustrated, etcetera) emotions.

- The songwriting procedure was very similar in both the girls’ and boys’ groups: starting with a basic idea or emotion and expanding from a germinal idea, fleshing it out into a song. It was notable in both groups that adolescents have a very clear understanding of form. The boys in particular engaged in a long conversation about the nature of structure in their songs. They were well aware of structural concepts such as verse, chorus, bridge sections and techniques such as repetition, modulation, imitation (although not the terminology) in their songs. Both groups had
clear notions as to how to put together a song so that it conforms to a perceived structural sense. Adolescents’ clear perception of structure, gained mainly from listening, opens up aspects for further research and enquiry.

- The boys, with one exception, used guitar as instrument of choice for songwriting, whereas the girls, except one, all used the piano. The implication of this is far reaching (as has been discussed in Chapter 5) as the type of instrument inherently determines the type of music, the presentation style, the nature of the activity, the individual or collaborative effort, and etcetera. This also corroborates findings on gender identity and the guitar as instrument of the band as locus of male gender identity development. The style of music is likewise determined by the choice of instrument, namely slow ballads and/or pop style songs as suited to a pianistic style, which further perpetuates the piano as the instrument associated with females.

- Both groups indicated a preference for engaging in songwriting alone and not collaboratively. Although most of them seemed to have attempted writing with someone else, perhaps only obtaining lyrics from another individual, even then the effort seemed unsatisfying as P.L. states: *M and I have tried writing songs together, but yes, I don’t know, I can’t. I struggle to work with his words. So, yes, I mainly write on my own.*

- It transpired that some of the females collected the songs they wrote in a type of journal, a folder of their songs. This was not encountered with the group of boys. This possibly suggests that the songwriting for the females, in a certain sense, forms a record, much as a journal or diary would, of their inner life, one that they wish to preserve and reflect on. As one girl stated: *If later when you return to the song, you remember it, the importance of it. When you go back to it later it helps you to remember what happened.* Another said: *If you write a song about something terrible that happened to you it’s as if you’re rid of it, it stays there. And*
another: *It helps you create a world that's more perfect, where you can dream.*

- Both groups admitted to the importance of listening to music, developing an own style and trying to copy songs from CD or radio. The adolescents in general seemed in agreement that listening formed part of the music experience and formed the basis of expanding your style, incorporating new techniques, trying out new styles and they were aware that music influenced them. As P.L. stated: *I think the influence is more subconscious, it’s subtle. I just play my guitar and it just comes out.* Particularly the boys were aware how the styles they preferred were somewhat inaccessible to them due to their limitations of technique, technology, expertise and facilities.

### 6.2.5 Summary and conclusion

“A result is the outcome of a test of significance or a qualitative analysis. The corresponding conclusion is that the original hypothesis or topic was or was not supported by the data. In qualitative reports, the conclusion may simply be a summarizing description of what was observed” (Gay & Airaisian, 2003:513).

The conclusions herewith take the findings per theme and link them to the original research questions which are a description of the nature and function of songwriting and its implications for music education, emotional expression and communication, self therapy, socio-cultural cohesion and informal learning, i.e. six research questions or themes to which conclusions are made that either support and/or verify literature or further explained the research question.

It is concluded that the songwriting experience for both males and females are in essence very similar. The expressive mode, that is, **representational form**, varies for males and females. The quintessential features thus far identified as associated with males and females were borne out in the interviews, for example,
guitars for boys, piano for girls, ballad type songs as the preferred style for the girls, band material as the preferred style for the boys, etcetera. However, the core motivation for engaging in songwriting in the first place, was paralleled in both groups: namely the expressive and communicative powers songwriting holds. Also, the power of songwriting for identity formation through embodiment, materiality and empowerment was borne out. Both males and females found in songwriting the agency for developing projected identity and agency for the creation of a simulacrum for a perceived or envisioned reality. The results of this research indicate the female adolescents’ appropriation of songwriting activity as different to males in the following ways: Firstly, females use songwriting as an individual and highly personal activity, mainly for self-expression. Secondly, females traditionally have less social pressure regarding the projection of a gender type than males, as males bear the burden of having to prove strength, dominance, power and masculinity. Consequently, in female adolescents’ songwriting activity the structuring of the self-identity and female-identity coalesce and is a highly personal pursuit. It can be argued that for males songwriting becomes a by-product born out of necessity for the principal purpose of providing musical material to play in the band and that songwriting per se is not utilized for constructing gender identity. For female adolescents on the other hand, songwriting is neither a by-product nor incidental occurrence, but the main medium of self-construction and self-reflection. In this sense, this research correlates with Richards’ findings (1998:172) that there is indeed “significant gender differences” in adolescents’ relation to music. The question for further research thus arises whether above appropriations of songwriting by males and females reflect a difference in emotional developmental well-being and health.

Songwriting also seems to provide males and females alike with social authorship in the sense of providing a tool for creation. The females expressed the need to create, but this was a central issue in the boys’ discussion as well, although in different terminology. As one of the girls succinctly said: Sometimes I just want to make something, I just don’t know what, and I don’t have an idea.
E.G.: the product you create is the way you feel about yourself.

6.3 OBSERVATION

6.3.1 Introduction

Gold’s (1958) classic model of researchers’ roles in observation delineates four ways in which observers may acquire data:

- The observer as complete participant;
- The participant-as-observer;
- The observer-as-participant, and
- The complete observer.

Earlier conceptions of qualitative research saw the observer’s role as somewhere at the midpoint of above roles. However, newer tendencies are shifting towards greater observer participation, concurring with Persson & Robson’s (1995:43) notion of “co-researchers”.

The strengths of observation lie in the availability and ease of entrée to research settings (Adler & Adler, 1986:382) as in the case of this study where this researcher, as music teacher, had access to formally and informally observe adolescent songwriting in context.

As early as 1976 Spencer relates a case study tracing songwriting in a popular idiom of a fifteen-year-old boy. Through observational techniques including interaction between student and teacher the growth process and development is recorded albeit with an emphasis on the educational aspects. A similar study, also observing the development of an adolescent songwriter, is documented by

Observation, whether longitudinal or synchronic, is a particularly suitable tool for the researcher in the initial phases of research to gain a holistic view and general impression of the nature of the phenomenon to be studied which leads into group discussions and individual and/or group interviews. Observation also takes place **formally**, for example arranged time and place, and **informally** for example, in casual, inconspicuous observations (Webb et al., 1966) over extended and/or intermittent periods of time, with or without the participants’ knowledge, for example Carpenter, Glassner, Johnson & Loughlin’s (1988) study observing adolescents during their lunch break to ascertain structuring of leisure time.

In observation, in an attempt to gain psychological insight into the creative musical process leading to a musical composition, certain methods of enquiry can be discerned. Sloboda (1985:103) identifies among others:

- An examination of what composers say about their own compositional processes\(^4\), and
- “Live” observation of composers during a session of composition.

Sloboda (1985:104) notes that the latter requires co-operation from the composer and notes that to his knowledge there is one published example (to date of publication), albeit with a professional composer in the more classic sense of the word, of such observation, namely Reitman’s (1965)\(^5\) study. Observations of children’s’ individual and collaborative compositional and songwriting efforts,

\(^4\) This aspect is covered extensively throughout this study.
notably Loane (1987); DeLorenzo (1989), Kratus (1989, 1991, 1994); Upitis (1992); Wiggins (1993); Emmons (1998) and Burnard (2000), are more readily available as interest in children’s compositions continue to grow. Observation as a tool to explore songwriting and composition is thus not unknown in academic settings and has in recent years expanded greatly.

6.3.2 Methodology of the Formal Observation log

Two male adolescents, a 15 year old and a 17 year old respectively, were observed for about 30 minutes each. Both are white, middle class, Afrikaans speaking adolescents attending the same high school. They were both asked to allow this observer to sit in during a songwriting session. They were put at ease by being told that a final product is not necessary, as 30 minutes would most probably not suffice for making up a complete song. Both tended to want to make conversation during the songwriting process as to explain certain aspects of the process. Intermittent conversation has been included in the observation log in accordance with Sloboda’s (1985:123) verbal protocol during observation. This data collection technique is reported as a synchronic observation and not as for example a think-aloud protocol (see for example a think-aloud protocol such as Martin’s (2002) study on the compositional thinking of tertiary-level students, which is used as primary sources of data, although triangulated with other sources such as observation notes), because in a time analysis, participant #1 spoke (total speaking time) for a total of approximately one minute and participant #2 approximately 30 seconds. As such it does not qualify as a think aloud protocol whereby dialogue could have been coded and analyzed. Due to the minimal time value of the talking in the total 30 minute observation period this data collection method is reported as an observation also because in the data collection methodology the Gay & Airaisan (2003:201) observation protocol was applied whereby the observer makes descriptive notes (emic data) and alongside it
reflective notes (etic data) is reported in narrative form. This then was useful to code according to Merleau-Ponty’s “lived experience” which categorizes according to theme how an experience is “lived” in time, body, relations, space.

In this observation, two research questions were addressed:

- Which compositional procedures do adolescents use to ‘make-up’ a new song?
- How do adolescents experience the act of songwriting?

In attempting to form an image of the compositional processes at work during songwriting activity, extensive notes were taken during the observation. After the observations, these notes were immediately reworked and supplemented to comprise as complete an account as possible. In the attempt to form an image of how adolescents experience the act of songwriting ‘lived experience’ needs to be examined. Here Merleau-Ponty’s (1962) postulation of a ‘set of life-world themes’ to map experiential qualities is applied. These themes are: ‘lived time’, ‘lived body, ‘lived relations’ and ‘lived space’. Lived experience can thus be delineated as experience based on self-reporting; constructed representations and personal construction of individuals (see Figure 6.1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>BODY</th>
<th>RELATIONS</th>
<th>SPACE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>as discernible boundaries</td>
<td>as oriented activity</td>
<td>between self and others</td>
<td>between self and surroundings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 6.1: Life-world themes as lived experience*

---

6 As reported and utilized by Burnard (2000:231) in her study on experiential differences
7 As illustrated in Burnard (2000:231).
6.3.3 Results of the Observation procedure

Case study #1: E.B. 15 year-old male.

Instrumental medium chosen for songwriting: piano. Seated at piano.

- Right hand (RH) strikes d minor third. Repeats this many times with some rhythmic variation. Left hand (LH) tries out d minor chord arpeggiated. Rolls the chord ascending and descending several times in different arpeggiated combinations. Back and forth between RH minor third pattern and LH broken chord patterns. At times, trying out various d minor chordal patterns with both hands at the same time.

- LH tries other chords: F major, C major and A major in various broken chord patterns. Some are repeated, several successive patterns are tried out along the same lines and rhythmic and melodic patterns as the d minor chord initially. The action thus far is one of intense concentration on listening and identifying portions of chords and chord successions that seem to “fit” a mental schema. Several chordal, triadic motives are played, varied, discarded, and later returned to, as a structure is starting to take shape.

- RH returns to the d minor third pattern, now includes repeated note patterns. “This reminds me of the Titanic theme.”
  “In what way?”
  “Just this little bit of melody. So I’m going to change it.”
  “Why?”
  “Else it’s not my own song, and in any case, the rest of the song’s going to want to sound like the Titanic song.”

- RH moves away from repeated figures and plays expanded triads, including some passing notes.
• Adds LH as block chords. Plays around with the block chords transferring LH ideas to RH for several minutes.
  “This is going to be a ballad.”
  “How can you tell?”
  “It sounds like it.”
  “Explain.”
  “Well, the chords in my LH are mellow and like this bit (plays RH minor third) sounds like a ballad. Also it’s slow.”

• Continues to play RH pattern in new dotted rhythms. LH takes up a d/A/d/A harmonic pattern.
  “This will be the chorus eventually, not the verse.”
  “Why?”
  “Well, it repeats like this (plays some of the repetitive third pattern in RH and d/A/d/A in LH) and that’s like a chorus. The verse will need more stuff.”
  “So the chorus is repetitive?”
  “Well …..no, just catchy. So you must use easier stuff that can repeat.”

• This is played four times. He then starts humming a melody. Plays again and hums.
  “Have you got words in mind?”
  “I have some words that could work.”
  “O, where?”
  “I’ve written some lyrics that could fit this.”

End of session as the rest of the session did not yield much that was new.
Case study #2: 17 year-old male.

Medium for songwriting: piano.

- Immediately starts playing on the piano with hands together, C major. Combinations of thirds, chords and some scales/consecutive note patterns.
- Plays this several times. Mostly thirds and fifths with rhythmic variations.
- Plays it again, now LH plays more in the bass. Moves the LH an octave lower.
- Repeats this several times.
- Plays only LH chords in arpeggiated form. Seems to “practice” a certain pattern.
- Adds RH again to the “practiced” bass.
- Reverts to RH melody. Plays the figure several times.
- Adds C major chord. Repeats this pattern in the RH now with A major chord in the bass. Then tries G, F and E major chords in the bass. (Just touches on them.) Then goes back to A major chord.
- Plays this pattern with C major chord, then a minor chord.
- Seems satisfied with this. Up to now seems to have established.
- Adds percussive effects.
  “I mostly write pop songs.”
  “Why?”
  “It’s upbeat. I can hear it.”
- Thus far two bars seem to have been established. Now he tries another figure higher in the RH. Uses the percussive effect he seems to like. Repeats this many times.

As the songwriting effort did not yield anything much more productive beyond this point, it was the end of the session.
6.3.4 Analysis and interpretation of the data

Lived time: the temporal nature of songwriting

Both players’ temporal experience of songwriting tended to be anchored in prior formal knowledge and tacit knowledge (know what) combined with instrumental skill (know how) in a continuous matching to a certain sound ideal, auditive image or mind map, resulting in moment-by-moment construction through the interplay between these sets of knowledge. Songwriting seemed to be repetitive actions of reliving certain sounds, reliving emotional experiences through association by constructing and reconstructing sound. Inherent and explicit in this process was the accepted time it would take to explore sound, relive and reconstruct sound and the concomitant discovery time with its implicit “findings” that would result in ideas, beacons or temporal markers for the song. Playing around with minor thirds led E.B. to announce, “This sounds like the Titanic theme”. This was a ‘finding’ that matched prior knowledge. A conscious effort was required to move away from known melodies to create a new pattern, yet still within the matrix\(^8\).

Lived body: physical mediation between lived experience and physical expression

As both songwriters were pianists, it became immediately apparent that physical and technical skill at the instrument played a significant role in the creation process (see also Chapter 4.3.3.1. Tactile-motoric memory). The production of

sound on an instrument has an implied kinesthetic involvement through multisensory activities namely the physical act of moving fingers over the keys, the body in front of the instrument responding to the beat, the visual and aural senses alert and absorbing. The complete absorption, reminiscent of Csikszentmihalyi’s ‘flow’, in the prolonged exploration and discovery process at the keyboard was reflected in visible corporeal enjoyment. Both songwriters’ bodies reflected involvement, enjoyment and ‘lived experience’ as they bodily responded to the beat, rhythm and evoked emotion of the sound. Prolonged exploration at the keyboard was continually monitored and negotiated through constant audio-visual reflection and problem solving. Revising and revisiting tried ideas while negotiating with the self seemed to be the strategy for creation. The 17 year-old’s greater technical skill at the piano also led to more advanced and varied motivic units, for example he started exploring with hands together immediately whereas the younger, technically inferior songwriter, limited himself to single hand explorations for the first couple of minutes.

Lived relations: experiencing the interaction between self and others

As has been argued (see Chapter 3.2.1), the act of songwriting, although also individually produced, is an act of communication: the communication of the self to the outside world through an accepted and understood medium, in this case music. As such a proximal state is formed whereby adolescents can approximate or form a simulacrum to real world lived experience and real world communication. Songwriting provides firstly an opportunity for communication through opening up or exploring the self and secondly for constructing communicative ports to others. The act of songwriting also provides the opportunity for imagined states of being and achieving, the argued idea of future identity, including an escape from present identity. The argument (Chapter 3.1.4) on the formation of identity is of particular significance in this notion of lived
relations as it has been established that identity is in a constant state of flux, forever constructing itself from outside stimuli (Hoffer, 1992:721).

**Lived space: experiencing sharing of self within a multi-dimensional continuum**

The act of songwriting in this observation empowered adolescents’ with the ability to make sense of their world and themselves through a controllable medium. They appropriate music as a tool for creating the necessary links to reach out to others, to the real ‘adult world’, to imagined states of being in an attempt to create their own space or to construct and regulate their own being. As discussed, popular music has been appropriated by adolescents in such a ubiquitous way that songwriting i.e. owning a piece of that world of popular music, provides a unique forum for the reflection of their thoughts and moods and provides a singularly unique multi-dimensional continuum for the establishment of an own space and identity.

**6.3.5 Summary and conclusion**

In analyzing the data, Serafine’s (1988) model of temporal processes can be discerned in the observations. The initial *idiomatic construction* (a basic beginning unit/idea) expanded through *motivic chaining*, that is, linking successive ideas through *patterning* in an attempt to group these musical events together in a cluster, or *phrase*, was discernable in both cases. These steps form the first dimension in the temporal process viz. *succession*. However, *simultaneity* was immediately present: both songwriters combined and synthesized musical events from the onset, vertically superimposing *timbre,*
motivic and textual abstraction. The processes also confirm Lilliestam’s notion of auditive imaging and Burnard’s notion of temporal markers. The songwriting process in both cases were marked by a consistent attempt to construct, through ever expanding cycles, a sound image (a song) that conforms to a certain sound ideal in the elusive meeting ground between prior knowledge (the matrix) and novelty (creativity).

6.4 EXPERIENCE SAMPLING METHOD

6.4.1 Introduction

The Experience Sampling Method (ESM), a method devised by Larson and Csiksentmihalyi (1983) to study subjective experience, was adapted and used to determine adolescents' emotional experience during songwriting activity. The participant in this ESM study was asked to keep, or supply, a diary and/or logbook of songwriting activity and to complete a self-report form (supplied by the researcher, see Appendix B) before, during or after songwriting activity. This method investigates subjective experience regarding mood, "flow", emotion and motivation during songwriting.

6.4.2 Methodology

A 13 year-old male was asked to write a log reflecting on his feelings and emotions before, during and after writing a song. He was asked to limit this activity to one instance of songwriting and to provide a written report on his emotions and reflections at those times. He was supplied with a self-report form
(Appendix B), but subsequently chose not to complete the form, but instead wrote his reflections in paragraph form. He was also requested to tape himself singing and playing his song and to hand the tape in along with the self-reflection. He was given three months in which to return this to the researcher, as being pressurized into ‘having to write a song’ and making it feel like an assignment was to be avoided. The log was to be completed when and if he felt like engaging in songwriting.

6.4.3 Results

The following log\(^9\) was written by JH, a 13 year-old male, reflecting on his emotional and intellectual experiences before, during and after songwriting:

\(10:21\ p.m.\ 8/09/02\)

*At the moment, I feel a little bit awkward about myself and how I’ve changed over the last 7 years. As I thought about myself as a fifth grader, I realized that I use to always be the unique, quiet, creative person. Now, all I see myself as is another average person how just wants to be cool with everyone. The reason I’m writing this song is to express everything that’s been puzzling me ever since my 12\(^{th}\) birthday. The song is basically going to ask “who do I see myself as” and it really expresses what an uncertain kid or teen might think about sometimes. As to seeing how slow I wrote and how much I want to put into the song, I’d have to say writing this song will take four hours at the least. After writing this song, I’m not really certain how I want to feel after writing this song, but I know I’ll feel better.*

\(8:33\ p.m.\ 8/10/02\)

\(^9\) The exact language i.e. vocabulary has been retained, however, typing errors and spelling has been corrected.
Although I only wrote a verse and the refrain, I feel that the creativity in me is starting to flow again. I’m actually beginning to feel the song’s lyrics as in relation to what I felt before I began to write. Not counting all the breaks, I’ve been writing for about six hours now.

10:07 8/10/02

Now, I feel a lot better about myself. I feel that this song has encouraged me to be who I want to be and not try to act just because of what other people might say. This song serves a purpose to anyone who sometimes wonders about how they see themselves. I’ll always use it as a reminder that someday I will find out who I should see myself as. After almost eight hours, I finally wrote a song that expresses my thoughts.

The song that was composed *Who Could I Be*:

**Who Could I Be**

By J.M.H.

[In A flat major]
(V1) Looking back in time
I wonder why or what I’ve done.
This can’t be me.
I wasn’t ever like that.
Was never that carefree
So it just couldn’t be,
But you’d never see
Now if you look at me.

(Refrain) Who am I?
Who could I be?
Will I ever see?
Who I’m supposed to be
Who am I?
Will I ever know?
Am I really me
Will it show?
Who could I be?

---

10 An exact duplicate of the song, including key references.
(V2) What could I’ve done?
to myself to make contrast
between the past and present me?
Could I be acting like
Someone else cause suddenly
I feel fake and unknown.

(Refrain 2) Who am I?
Who could I be?
Will I ever see?
Who I’m supposed to be
Who am I?
Will I ever know?
Am I really me
Will it show?
(Who am I-?
Who could I be?)

[Mp in B flat major]
Who am I?
Who could I be?
Will I ever see?
Who I’m supposed to be
[3 count rest]

[Forte in C major]
Who am I?
Will I ever know?
Am I really me
Will it show?

(Refrain 3) Who am I?
Something I’m destined to know
Who could I be?
Will I ever see?
Who am I?
Will I ever know?
Am I really me
Will it show?

Who could I be (I be, I, I, be- 4x)

6.4.4 Analysis and interpretation of the data

Considering the log written by this adolescent, it appears that questioning the self acts as social agent to the formulation and structuring of the self. Music is thus appropriated in certain ways to evoke and project future identity through
structural expressiveness, which acts as a clarification process for the adolescent. The psychological experience of identity construction evoked and projected through the songwriting activity forms a simulacrum to reality and is experienced as homologous to real life in the future. This, the songwriting, propels the adolescent toward manageable, productive moments in regulating and constructing the self by being engaged in a constructive activity. It can be argued that the constructive activity of creation, i.e. songwriting in this case, forms a simulacrum to the intangible, psychological process of self-construction and this becomes a tangible, purposeful activity tacit within the adolescents’ control. This fact seems to be well within the adolescents’ subconscious expectation of the songwriting experience. In the pre-composition log he writes: “After writing this song, I’m not really certain how I want to feel after writing this song, but I know I’ll feel better”. He follows this up during the songwriting by writing: “I’m actually beginning to feel the song’s lyrics as in relation to what I felt before I began to write”. The efficacy of the expectation is experienced. The post-composition log notes: “Now, I feel a lot better about myself. I feel that this song has encouraged me to be who I want to be and not try to act just because of what other people might say.” This last statement strengthens the argument that through constructing lyrics and making a song, thereby producing a tangible object representing a nebulous, intangible feeling, the adolescent feels empowered and strengthened. The activity has provided a constructive way of releasing his fear and anxiety about the self by allowing him to produce a more acceptable image of the self. In summary, this activity has provided self-confidence that is built over time, as Giddens (1991) also notes the self is a reflexive, active project of constructing the self over time.
6.5 INTERVIEWS

6.5.1 Introduction

Interview research methods are well-documented and have become standard practice in much qualitative research. The interviews, although conceived and structured beforehand by the researcher, were conducted along phenomenological research methodology guidelines. A thumbnail interview sheet was kept where the research was copied on verbatim. Respondents were encouraged to relate in their own words information on various aspects of their songwriting.

6.5.2 Methodology

Thirteen adolescents, 8 males and 5 females, ranging in age from 13 to 18 years old were interviewed individually. The interview sessions lasted between 30 to 45 minutes each at their respective schools. The respondents are from three different high schools all in the Paarl area and were identified in school by making a general school-wide announcement that this researcher would like to interview adolescents who wrote their own songs. Seven respondents came forward at the local boys’ high school, five girls came forward at the local girls’ high school and one male came forward at the local co-ed high school. Appointments for interviews were made with willing participants after briefly explaining the nature of the interview. They were encouraged to bring along song(s) they had written and might want to perform the song(s), although it was made clear to them that performance was not mandatory.
A basic outline of questions for required data was used (Appendix C), however, the interviews were not conducted as question-answer sessions, rather discussions as is the procedure in phenomenological research, with the researcher prodding, encouraging them to talk about their songwriting, how it feels, why they compose, etcetera. As they spoke and information randomly came forth, data was written down on a prepared question outline sheet, namely a thumbnail worksheet. Responses were inserted as adolescents freely talked about their songwriting. The information sheet served the purpose of verifying that all areas of interest to the research had been touched on during the interview. Respondents were asked to identify one song, to be used as an example, to possibly perform and to discuss specifics. The interviews were also taped for correlation and comparison to information sheets.

6.5.3 Analysis and interpretation of the data

This type of individual interview situation is a partially structured interview meaning there are closed and open-ended questions. Quotations were selected only on the open-ended questions because this is where the participants had to provide opinion and reflection. Then, quotes that were used were based on the following principle: If there was the same general response from all the participants, a representative quote that expressed the general nature of the finding was used. Where there were divergent opinions all of those diverging from the mainstream were given. All divergent or contradictory opinions were quoted in full.

The younger ages make up smaller percentages of the total, that is, 15% in each of the age groups 14 through 17 years of age. The 18 year-old group is the largest contingent comprising 5 respondents (38%). This could be due to the 18 year olds feeling more self-confident about sharing their songwriting experiences with
a researcher and/or 18 year olds simply having more experience at songwriting i.e. having more songs to discuss and therefore readier to refer to themselves as songwriters. The younger age groups might have felt that having written one or two songs does not make them a “songwriter” and therefore might not have responded to the invitation to take part in the research project.

62% males responded as opposed to 38% females from the three different high schools. This male predominance typifies the music scene in general and correlates with Clawson’s (1999) and du Plooy’s (2000) findings on male predominance in popular music making, particularly involving bands. Clawson (1999:99) notes that women’s involvement in rock music is defined by their “numerical minority and symbolic anomaly” and identifies the band as a site where adolescent gender formation takes place through activities that can be termed masculine. Notable in the results of this author’s research are the findings that of the 5 female respondents, all five identified songwriting as intended ‘to sing/play to myself for my own pleasure’. In the male group only 2 respondents noted this as the reason for their songwriting. Six out of the 8 (75%) males claimed songwriting as intended for band and/or performing to school/public. This supports findings in aforementioned studies that music activity i.e. rock bands in particular, shape male gender development. Graphic representation shows (Figure 6.2) an inverse of results for female and male intention of songwriting. The male intention graphs low on self, close friends with an upswing towards public performance and the rock band. The female songwriting intention shows direct inversion of that tendency, namely a peak at writing for the self with a decline towards public performances.
92% of the respondents were white, although it must be noted that the boys’ high school and the girls’ high school are predominantly white. The co-ed school, however, has a predominantly coloured cultural profile. This tallies with “rock’s character as a predominantly white pop genre” (Clawson, 1999:100) and also with findings that rock and pop genres are synonymous with whites of middle-class background.

The language group represented is 92% Afrikaans due to the fact that Paarl is a small, predominantly Afrikaans town and the schools in this study, although dual-medium\textsuperscript{11}, are predominantly Afrikaans.

The high percentage urbanized youth, 62%, is due to the fact that two of the schools are boarding schools and the respondents mainly live in an urban setting, Cape Town, but attend school during the week in the small town Paarl.

Respondents were asked to describe their disposition i.e. how they perceive their personalities to be. As currently concurring with social constructivist theories and phenomenological research techniques, interpretative repertoires of individuals

\textsuperscript{11} Dual-medium: A term that refers to schools in South Africa where instruction takes place in Afrikaans and English. Both languages are weighted equally important in the school: culturally, academically and socially. However, dual-medium schools tend to have a dominant language group mostly due to their geographic location.
are used to analyze accounts by individuals based on their linguistic resources (grammatical, metaphors, linguistic devices) on a broad, semantic level (similar also to the research technique of O’Neill, 2002:86-7). As such this linguistic repertoire is analyzed to obtain information particularly on variability (contradictions) and repetition (naming or relating the same things). The following is a list of the total number of adjectives the adolescents used to describe themselves:

- Quiet
- Not fearful of standing up for my rights
- Go-getter
- Different to other people
- Mixed-up
- Unpredictable, one day up the other day down
- Happy
- Temperamental
- Moody
- Creative
- Independent
- Social
- Identify with artists, cultured people
- Loner
- Introspective
- Serious
- Extrovert
- Frustrated
- Lonely
- Misunderstood
- Eccentric
- Talented
- Different to mainstream
- Lyrical
- Expressive
- Socially aware
- Sophisticated
- Don’t like too many people
- Private
- Intelligent
- Thinker
- Philosophical
- Ambitious
- Shy
- Self-conscious

The pattern that emerges is one that acknowledges the adolescent maelstrom of feelings, emotions and confusion so typical of budding adulthood. Here adjectives such as mixed-up, one-day-up-one-day-down, shy, self-conscious, lonely, frustrated, etcetera described the mood fluctuations of adolescents, but also the yearning for emotional stability and acceptance as autonomous, independent adults. Adjectives such as independent, thinker, sophisticated, social, ambitious and go-getter illustrate the adolescent on the threshold of adulthood. In a percentage analysis of grouped adjectives employed by the adolescents as listed above, it shows 46% of the respondents claiming feelings of loneliness, being a loner, private, introverted, shy and/or self-conscious. 31% describe themselves as different to other people, eccentric, creative, thinkers and/or sophisticated. 15% (N=2) of the respondents use adjectives to describe being mixed-up, frustrated, emotional, Moody and/or temperamental. One respondent (8%) describe herself as happy and a go-getter, but also different to other people. With that adjective, the grouping could also overlap with the group of 31% who feel different, unique, and creative. Graphic representation (Figure 6.3) shows the majority, 72%, as
being isolated whether by being private and shy or by being eccentric and
different to other people.

54% of the respondents proved to have an advanced musical background i.e. 8+ years of music studies. One (8%) has a good musical background i.e. 4 years of music lessons. One (8%) has an average musical background i.e. 2 years’ musical studies. Three (24%) have a below average musical background i.e. 2 years’ musical studies. One (8%) has had no formal music tuition and thus has no significant musical literacy. This scale: advanced, good, average, below average and poor, is an estimate and not solely based on exact number of years formal tuition, as number of years tuition does not necessarily guarantee musical literacy. However, the number of years formal tuition was used as a guide. Graphic representation (*Figure 6.4*) shows the highest point as 54% of students with advanced musical background with a steep drop towards a poor background. One small incline can be noticed at below average level (3 months to 1+ years).
It was observed in this research that the use of an instrument was present in 100% of all the respondents interviewed, and was limited to two instruments only namely piano/keyboard and guitar and the instruments were used in 100% of the cases as harmonic accompaniment. The pattern that emerged was:

- **Melody:** Sung, at no point did respondents in this research duplicate the melody in voice as a whole on the chosen instrument.
- **Accompaniment:** block and arpeggiated chords on the piano played with two hands extending chords from the bass through the middle range of the piano, basic strumming chords with some finger picking on the guitar. Chords were on the whole limited to major and minor chords and inversions thereof.
- **Bass line:** only on the guitar were snatches of bass line, and/or short riffs, executed. The pianists refrained from producing any form of melody or motives in the bass.

*Figure 6.4 Musical background distribution*
Of the 13 respondents in the Informal Interviews 85% (N=11) used the piano as their chosen instrument and 15% (N=2) used the guitar. In both cases the guitar players were male, although only one of them was involved in a band.

In answer to questions on the operations of the compositional process, 62% of respondents answered that they had lyrics first and then “played around” on their instrument till they came up with something, melody/harmonies/riff that could match the words. One respondent noted:

*I get the lyrics first and then work out the melody and harmonies together on the piano. [Male, 14 years old].*

31% noted that they came up with the harmonies first; these were notably guitarists and band players. One respondent, a 15-year-old male guitarist and band player noted:

*I might have lyrics first or I find a riff on my guitar or sometimes both.*

Only one respondent (8%) claimed he made up melodies first; however this was a respondent who did not write vocal music at all, but only solo instrumental music in a “neo-classical” style. He stated:

*I hear only melodies in my inner ear. [Male, 14 years old].*

Results show 46% (N=6) of the respondents involved in collaborative forms of songwriting, while the remainder in the sample work exclusively alone. Of the 46% involved in collaborative songwriting, two males are involved in rock bands, one writes mainly lyrics for a rock band, while the other one mainly writes music with a partner who then does the lyrics and one female writes music that is sometimes used by a rock band (*Figure 6.5*).\(^{12}\)

---

\(^{12}\) Totals in the graph exceed N=13 as overlap in the categories occur.
Figure 6.5: Comparison of female and male individual and collaborative modes of songwriting.

The above graph shows that the greatest number of songwriting modes are firstly individual (equally weighted between males and females) at 75% of the respondents (N=10), followed by the second most commonly used mode of songwriting, namely males writing for rock bands at 13% (N=2). Lyric writing for bands was utilized by one male (N=1), 6% and writing music for bands (not rock bands) features equal male and female involvement at 6% respectively. When two broad polarizations are made between completely individual forms of songwriting and any form of collaborative songwriting (pairs, bands, and so forth), it transpires that 75% (N=10) of adolescents engage in songwriting individually and 33% (N=5) engage in some form of collaborative work.

Findings on how compositions are preserved (stored for future reference) note that 46% (N=6) of the respondents mostly write something (lyrics and/or chords) down, 23% (N=3) relied on memory alone and 8% (N=1) used computer software to store their songs. 15% (N=2) indicated that at times they used recording to store their compositions. In specific questioning of writing during the
compositional process, 80% (N=10) of the respondents indicated they mostly write something down, i.e. 31% (N=4) mostly write only lyrics and 46% mostly (N=6) write lyrics with chords although the addition of chords was not consistent. 15% (N=2) indicated they never wrote anything down, neither lyrics nor chords. One of them noted:

*I don’t write anything down, because then it would feel like “work” [Male, 15 years old].*

Mnemonic strategies, for example, a graphic representation of music, was found in this research to serve as mnemonic aid in assisting a guitar player/songwriter to remember his song (see Figure 6.6). This songwriter wrote the words to a song, Doubt, and included one example of staff notation with a single motif on it. Also a drawing of a keyboard consisting of three notes with the letters C D E D E D below and in parenthesis (first line sings the tune). On the text of the first two lines dashes indicating the pitches were added. In the interview he stated that this graphic representation reminded him of a certain popular song and thus assisted him to remember the melody of the song.

```
C D E D E D  (first line sings tune)

Death is creeping nearer

With its tongue and its skull

Etc.
```

*Figure 6.6: Use of graphic representation in “Doubt” by 17 year-old songwriter.*
This however, overlaps in the cross-correlating questions on the preservation of compositions where the same two respondents noted that they recorded compositions, which explains the lack of paper and pen techniques. Only 8% (N=1) wrote any musical notation i.e. the melody down. It must be noted however that this respondent wrote only instrumental pieces and as such did not use lyrics/chords formations. Questioning on what exactly they might put down on paper resulted in 31% indicating that if they wrote anything down it was just the text (lyrics). One respondent noted:

*I write the lyrics down then look at the form. Then I wait, 'cause I don’t know what melody – that follows later* [Male, 16 years old]. A female respondent, 17 years old, mentioned that she also sets poetry to music. Another respondent noted:

*Notation takes too long; in any case I have the melodies memorized in two days* [Male, 16 years old]. Another noted: *I can’t work out the rhythms, so I only put down text and chords* [Male, 18 years old].

In an analysis of song titles as provided by the respondents, this research on analysis of adolescent song lyrics also includes an overview of song titles collected during the ethnographic research and draws on Mohan & Malone’s (1994:290) research model in which **only song titles** are analyzed, not the entire song text. This approach presents an effective coding of both manifest and latent textual content (ibid.) as analysis of entire lyrical content of a song has presented problems in past research regarding reliability of coding, as coding of content necessitates subjective interpretation. Examination of entire song lyrics contains too many different issues and images to form exact data for scientific analysis. A focus on the titles is warranted since the title is the main method of communication to the prospective audience. “A songwriter’s decision as to title is a social communication in itself, summarizing images from the song that hold the most impact for him/her…” (Mohan & Malone, 1994:290). The title in this sense thus serves as a “poetic signpost” (ibid.).
The following songs (*Figure 6.7*) were collected from adolescents in the sample and arranged the titles according to categories as per Mohan & Malone’s (1994:293) study combined with categories from the research questionnaire:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>SONG TITLE</th>
<th>ADOLESCENT(^{13})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Negative Event</td>
<td><em>Rasor</em></td>
<td>E.G. (17 year-old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Skemerkind(^{14})</em></td>
<td>WvT (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Life’s Ended</em></td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Fear of loneliness</em></td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Hating school</em></td>
<td>C.B (15 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Doubt</em></td>
<td>C.B (15 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social commentary</td>
<td><em>Help die man(^{15}) [CD track 3]</em></td>
<td>L.S. (15 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Disillusioned [CD track 6]</em></td>
<td>L.S. (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Toleration [CD track 7]</em></td>
<td>L.S. (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Main Man [CD track 4]</em></td>
<td>L.S. (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Die nuwe Suid-Afrika(^{16})</em></td>
<td>E.B. (14 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Stukkie Kaap(^{17})</em></td>
<td>WvT (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive event</td>
<td><strong>Topple over</strong></td>
<td>E.G. (17 year-old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td><em>Roulettes</em></td>
<td>C.B (15 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Demon revolution</em></td>
<td>C.B (15 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td><strong>Sexy Cinderella</strong></td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music/dancing</td>
<td><strong>Essence [CD track 5]</strong></td>
<td>L.S. (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{13}\) Initials are used throughout this document to protect the identity of the adolescent respondents in this research.

\(^{14}\) Translated: Sunset Child

\(^{15}\) Translated: Help the Man

\(^{16}\) Translated: The New South Africa

\(^{17}\) Translated: Piece of Cape
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Love/romance</th>
<th>Verlore liefde\textsuperscript{18} [CD track 2]</th>
<th>L.S. (16-year old, male)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Déjà vu [CD track 1]</td>
<td>L.S. (16-year old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>You!</td>
<td>H.L. (18-year old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clouds</td>
<td>E.G. (17 year-old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Only love can break your heart</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>You were my everything</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Will she love me tomorrow?</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>When will I see her again, clover, clover?</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Together</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Queen of my heart</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Oh God, it hurts</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Let me know</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inside of me</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Had enough</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Especially for you</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Don’t turn me down</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memories/</td>
<td>Watershed</td>
<td>L. S. (17 year-old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nostalgia</td>
<td>Remember</td>
<td>H.V. (17 year-old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desires</td>
<td>My prayer to God</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The inexplicable/</td>
<td>Who could I be?</td>
<td>J.H. (13 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>What happened?</td>
<td>H.V. (17 year-old, female)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What should I do?</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Am I to blame?</td>
<td>E.P. (17 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waar is jy?\textsuperscript{19}</td>
<td>WvT (16 year-old, male)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>41 songs</td>
<td>9 songwriters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{18} Translated: Lost Love  
\textsuperscript{19} Translated: Where are you?

Figure 6.7: Table of song title categorization.
The subject categorization shows the following distribution: the largest category, 39% (N=16) are songs on love/romance. On the whole, all of these lamented the woes, sorrows, insecurities and/or hurts of love. None of these songs sang of the wonders, security or future of love. The category Negative Event ranks second with 14.6% (N=6) of all songs about death, life’s end, loneliness, hating school, and the like. Social commentary and the inexplicable/questions rank next at 12.2% (N=5) respectively. Memories/nostalgia covers 4.8% (N=2) of all songs and the categories Positive Event, Sex, Music/dancing and Desires rate at 2.4% (N=1) respectively. When the pessimism of love is added to the negative column, 53.6 % (N=22) of all the songs are decidedly negative/pessimistic. When all categories are scrutinized to fit two main positive and negative polarizations, it is noted that 90.2% (N=37) of all the song titles essentially contain an element of negativity, pessimism, insecurity, pain, questioning, fear, alienation, doubt and/or painful reflection.

Figure 6.8: Song title categories distribution
Mohan & Malone’s study (1994:296) concludes that song titles of alternative music express “social criticism, pessimism and alienation from society to a greater extent than mainstream song titles. Alternative music can thus be said to serve as “social cement” for an audience dissatisfied with conventional mainstream values”. This dissertation has thus far argued for the analysis of music and lyrics in the context of socio-cultural settings (see Figure 5.1) and when above results on song titles (Figure 6.8) are viewed in combination with the genre style of the music within the performance parameters thereof, it transpires that adolescent songwriting conforms to alternative styles of music making (and was expanded upon under musical analysis), rather than mainstream pop styles. Also, it can be concluded that this phenomenon provides “social cement” to adolescents and is decidedly a mechanism for managing the self, the environment, the social context and communication as the song titles reflect the troubled nature of inner experiences and emerging resolutions of trying to make sense of self and the world through creative expression. As argued (under 5.7.1 Do lyrics matter?), lyrics provide adolescents with a form of articulation to experience these emotions.

The majority, 69% (N=9) of the respondents claimed that an emotion gave them the onset of a song and initiated songwriting activity (Figure 6.9). One respondent remarked:

*Definitely an emotion, particularly when you're depressed; bullied, or like when you feel sorry for yourself you want to relate the experience in a song [Male, 16 years old].*

Another respondent claimed that it was particularly negative emotions that inspired him to songwriting:

*When I’m depressed, sad or upset, not a positive mood, like when my grandfather died. Also like the situation in our country [Male, 14 years old]. A 17-year-old female respondent claimed human relationships and the emotions they evoke as*
well as religious emotions move her to songwriting. 15% identified an event as a catalyst for songwriting and 15% identified an incident as the catalyst that

![Figure 6.9: Reason for composing a song](image)

compelled them to write songs. Two respondents (15%) claimed a reason “other” than the above: one identified the situation in the country as setting him off to compose and one claimed the “beauty of words” moved him to write songs.

One 18-year-old female claimed that events, incidents, emotion and numbers of other things inspire her to write songs.

The compositional process can also be summarized as 62% claiming that songwriting is inspired i.e. they get an idea and make up a more or less complete song. However, it should be noted that 69% claimed they rework their songs, which corroborates the hypothesis made in Chapter 4 on “inspiration versus execution”: Songwriters often claim “inspiration” when in fact one or more riffs were stumbled on quite early in the songwriting process and/or they did have a riff or two in mind, and the rest of the song took more effort. This is then perceived as the “entire” song having been inspired. 15% stated that songwriting was on the whole an effort involving exploring, playing around on the instrument,
etcetera to get a song. Three respondents (23%) either said songwriting is somewhat inspired in the sense they might have an idea for a song, but that it still requires some effort to make a whole song or that a part of songwriting is inspired, for example the lyrics, but that setting it to music might require a lot of effort. It is thus postulated that a combination of the two creative extremes can exist in the sense that one or more basic riffs or units may arise spontaneously and effortlessly giving the songwriter the feeling of being inspired, yet, a certain amount of spinning-out the initial inspiration may be involved. Per definition, this forms the execution phase. The songwriter may thus on the whole feel that the song was created effortlessly or he/she was inspired, depending on the extent of the initial ease with which the song started. This was proven in the Informal Interviews with a cross-correlating question to validate data: The question on reworking of compositions (returning to it to change, improve or alter it) yielded a 69% (N=9) response clearly overlapping with a previous question that 62% (N=8) claimed the compositional process is inspired.

31% indicated that they do not write songs with a specific audience in mind which tallies with the 54% who stated they compose mainly for themselves, as self-expression.

In reviewing the intention of the songwriting activity, i.e. the motivation behind the action, 54% noted for myself/own pleasure/self-expression; 23% noted to sing/perform to close friends or family; 31% noted to perform in school/public (these were notably all the bands) that overlaps with 31% noting that they write songs for using in their bands. One respondent in the group who identifies self-expression as the motivation for songwriting, succinctly states: 

*Because it’s in my mind, I have to get it out. [Male, 14 years old]*

Topics of lyrics i.e. the topical content of the song, (not song titles as analyzed above) yielded an overwhelming 92% focusing on love and/or emotions for song texts (see Figure 6.10). Wade (1992) notes that certain topics are universally
interesting to adolescents viz. death, danger, chaos, power, money, sex and romance. 54% claimed the inexplicable/questions as topics of choice as can also be noted under the Experience Sampling Method: the adolescent’s repeated questions “Who am I” and “Who could I be”. Five respondents (38%) claimed social or political issues of interest for text topics, for example, *The New South Africa* (see Appendix A) and another 38% noted death e.g. *Skemerkind*; *Doubt* (see Appendix A) and its concomitant emotions as a topic of their songs. 23% identify memories/ nostalgia or events in the past as topics of their lyrics and 15% (2 respondents) claim desires as song topics. These desires mainly include the desire to be accepted. One respondent (8%) stated that philosophizing about life is a favorite song topic.

![Figure 6.10: Topics for song lyrics](image)

Cross-correlation between “reasons for songwriting” (Figure 6.9) and “topics for song” (Figure 6.10) validates data as emotion correlates with love/romance as the strongest indicator, followed by incidents cross correlating with social/death/questions.

When asked to evaluate the quality of their songs, 38% of the respondents noted that they thought their lyrics were good, 23% remarked that they think the music

---

20 Translated: Sunset Child
is quite good and 31% remarked that their music is overall good. Commentary about the self-evaluation of their songwriting included:

*Overall my songs have potential, but needs work. I don’t have enough experience, I am ignorant.* [Male, 15-year-old].

*Lyrics are very important to me. My guitar compositions are not good yet, because I only use very basic chords. My songs are very simple.* [Female, 18-year-old].

*My lyrics are mixed-up, but the music is nice, particularly the harmonies. I work quite long on Intro’s.* [Female, 18-year-old].

*My songs are great; top of the range.* [Male, 16-year-old].

*My lyrics are good, but my piano technique limits the music.* [Male, 14-year-old].

62% of respondents write songs that include lyrics, 31% compose only instrumental music and 8% do compositions in both modes.

Two respondents (15%) indicated that their songwriting was mainly in a pop style and one respondent (8%) indicated that he wrote in a rock style. One wrote mainly in Afrikaans slow songs/ballads and one wrote mainly Afrikaans rock. The majority (85%) indicated that they wrote English slow songs/ballads. Herein a correlation to the above findings of 69% who wrote songs “for themselves/to express emotion” can be found, as it can be assumed and was also proved by the recordings, that depression, mixed-up feelings, sadness, heartache, love, lost love, etcetera find an outlet in slow songs. One respondent claimed he wrote only in a Neo-classical style.
6.5.4 Summary and conclusion

The adolescents in the individual interviews ranged from 14 to 18 years old, 5 females and 8 males, mainly Afrikaans, middle class, whites. The group as a whole rated high in the creative/different/loner/private classification groups, corresponding with previously cited research on personality types. Most adolescents in this research sample seemed to have some musical background. Much correspondence and overlapping in compositional process and product was reflected in the results, for example: the lyrics are mostly written first (62%), text and chords are written on paper (46%), an emotion (69%) sets of an idea for a song and the compositional process is inspired (62%), the composition is reworked (69%). Also in the intention of the composition the majority indicated for own pleasure (54%). Likewise, topics of lyrics rated high in the love/emotions category at 92% with a third of the adolescents feel their lyrics, music and overall are satisfying/good. Vocal music (62%) in an English, slow ballad type rated high at 85%.

The results show the preponderance of a general style of writing and mutual reasons for doing so. Writing slow, expressive songs about love and life for the self, as a form of self-expression, communication and self-therapy, clearly dominates.

6.6 CONCLUSION

In this research the Gay & Airasian (2003:513) outline of how conclusions are derived are utilized. That is, conclusions follow on the results where the research questions are again addressed to ascertain whether and how the findings corroborate the initial hypothesis and or contribute to a deeper understanding of the research questions. This is provided as backdrop to explain how the process of making
conclusions was approached. This also means that not every result will be reported with a conclusion – only those results that bear relevance to the initial research question(s). In keeping with the explorative nature of ethnographic research, such conclusions serve to provide a deeper and richer understanding of the nature of a particular social phenomenon.

The qualitative research methods were selected in keeping with social research methodologies of the past decade which also tends to combine various research methodologies. As such, the research methodologies above conform to ethnographic methods (Atkinson & Hammersley, 1994:248) which have a strong emphasis on exploring the nature of particular social phenomena, rather than setting out to test hypotheses about them; also has a tendency to work primarily with “unstructured” data. Also in keeping with ethnographic methods a small number of cases were examined in detail. Furthermore, analysis of the data that involves interpretation of the meanings and functions of the adolescent’s actions, and the product takes the form of verbal descriptions and explanations, with limited quantification and statistical analysis.

As such, the aim of the research procedures outlined above has strived to involve adolescents in different ways to achieve validity of research findings. Adolescents were co-researchers in this study. Observation, discussion, formal and informal interviews and conversation were conducted on the principles of the interaction between researcher and respondent. A socio-cultural and contextual perspective was maintained throughout the research procedure. Furthermore, the extent and variety of research methodologies employed served to cross-validate data.

Findings in the male and female group interviews revealed many similarities. The songwriting experience for both males and females is in essence very similar, but varies in expressive mode, that is, representational form. The core motivation for songwriting engagement was paralleled in both groups: namely the expressive and communicative powers songwriting holds. The power of songwriting for identity
formation through embodiment, materiality and empowerment was identified. Social authorship, agency for the development of projected identity and envisioned reality was reflected in both groups. The need to create is a central issue in both groups.

In the observations corresponding processes were identified namely Serafine’s (1988) model of temporal processes starting with the initial idiomatic construction (a basic beginning unit/idea) expanded through motivic chaining, successive ideas linked through patterning in an attempt to group these musical events together in a cluster, or phrase. The first dimension in the temporal process namely, Succession was discernable in both observed cases. Simultaneity was likewise immediately present where both songwriters combined and synthesized musical events from the onset, vertically superimposing timbre, motivic and textual abstraction. These findings cross validate data obtained in the interviews and group discussions. The songwriting process in both cases conformed to the process of structuring a sound image (a song) that conforms to a certain sound ideal in the elusive meeting ground between prior knowledge (the matrix) and novelty (creativity).

The Experience Sample Method revealed that the self acts as social agent to the formulation and structuring of the self. Songwriting is appropriated to evoke and project future identity through structural expressiveness, which acts as a clarification process for the adolescent. Central is identity construction projected through the songwriting activity which forms a simulacrum to reality. The songwriting activity provides the adolescent toward manageable, productive moments in regulating and constructing the self by being engaged in a constructive activity. It was argued that the constructive activity of creation and the need for creation, as identified in the female group interview, songwriting, forms a simulacrum to the intangible, psychological process of self-construction. This activity thus becomes a tangible, purposeful activity which the adolescent can control.
The individual interviews yielded results corresponding and corroborating findings of the other research methods. Again, findings confirm those in the observation logs, namely that in the compositional process and product the lyrics are mostly written first, text and chords are written on paper, an emotion sets of an idea for a song and the compositional process is inspired, the composition is reworked. Also in the intention of the composition the majority indicated for own pleasure. Likewise, topics of lyrics rated high in the love/emotions category.

The various research methods employed verified arguments thus far made on adolescent’s appropriation of songwriting for the purposes of self-expression, communication, and self-therapy. It is also in keeping with argued notions on identity formation and social constructivism. As such, the nature and function of songwriting within the parameters and limitations of this particular research group, have been established.
CHAPTER 7
RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

7.1 INTRODUCTION

In formulating the recommendations in the final chapter of this dissertation, the Gay & Airasian (2003:534) guidelines are followed:

- final theoretical and practical implications are discussed;
- future research areas are recommended;
- suggestions for future action are based on practical significance. In quantitative studies such recommendations would be made on statistical significance.

As the main research question was the description of the nature and function of songwriting in adolescence to determine the implications for music education, such implications are initially addressed. In the study of songwriting, the overall, holistic view of this phenomenon that emerged clearly contrasted in its nature to school music. School music is assigned, guided, formal, etcetera, whereas songwriting is the exact opposite. As such, potential caveats in current music educational practices are identified. The idea is to suggest (recommend) areas for further investigation for the enhancement of school music curricula as extracted from this informal music activity. From this flow thoughts on music teacher education and how music teachers could tap into informal learning activities to supplement curricula and teaching strategies. These are written in an understandable and practical way so as to provide real life solutions for the music teacher, not abstract theories that might remain illusive and vague. The first section of the recommendations covers these thoughts.

The second part of the recommendations flow from the secondary research questions:

- informal learning: compositional processes and how such informal practices could be imitated. Also the recommendation on the area of ethnomusicology arises from
the fact that songwriting is an informal learning activity and this, along with apprenticeships, vernacular and traditional musics, oral learning traditions, certainly leaps out as an area for further research and how these methods could aid the music educator.

- Self-therapy and expression/communication: mood-control, self-expression and communication and recommendations based on songwriting as a therapeutic tool which opens up areas for counselors and other instructional areas.
- Social-cohesion and the formation of gender identity identify areas of potential difference in the development of psychological well-being between males and females.

The following recommendations thus strive to address each of the research questions point by point to indicate tangents, connections to other fields of study and areas for further research based on findings.

### 7.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

The aim of this study was to research the *nature* and *function* of adolescent songwriting with one of the secondary aims to determine the implications of this phenomenon for music education.

As such, the following recommendations, in light of data from the preceding chapters, can be made:

The very existence of songwriting, rock bands, and the like, outside of school in an informal, peer-based learning setting, is indicative of a **caveat in the formal, in-school, music education** currently provided. The caveat lies mainly in the inability of current music education curricula to provide:
• A greater variety of musical styles, particularly popular;
• Listening, copying and imitation of popular music;
• Musical activities, such as songwriting, for personal expression and communication;
• Alternative teaching strategies based on informal practices;
• Alternative music instruments, and
• Alternative assessment strategies.

It is recommended that **music teacher education** should include strategies to provide meaningful assistance to learners involved in popular music. A variety of techniques and strategies should be explored to assist the music teacher in utilizing:

• Knowledge about a variety of music styles including popular music.
• Teachers should place themselves in the position of the young musician trying out techniques such as listening to music, trying to copy it or approximate it on an instrument of choice, and/or copying music on a variety of instruments through explorative techniques. Green’s (2001) research on how popular musicians learn and Kennedy’s (2002) research of the compositional processes of adolescents suggest that listening takes a central position in the composition process. The four case studies in Kennedy’s research indicated that listening was central to their songwriting experience (Kennedy, 2002:8). The implications for music teachers are that teachers should provide a variety of diverse listening experiences to expand the sound framework and palettes of learners.
• Prospective music teachers should harness the creative possibilities of music through training, at least personal experience, in for example improvisation, instrumental composition, songwriting for personal expression, collaborative composition, and etcetera.
• A variety of electric and technological instruments and instrumental devices, for example drum kit, electric guitar, and synthesizer, should be explored.
• A wider scope of teaching, or facilitating, strategies based on what we have learned from informal methods should be harnessed, for example: purposive
listening, copying recordings on an instrument, making-up own rhythms and riffs, singing or playing along with recordings, playing by ear, collaborative composition, making up lyrics and setting it to music, learning a new instrument through observation and imitation first and not notation first, etcetera.

- Alternative assessment strategies should be designed and employed with which the teacher feels comfortable. For example: the teacher should learn to design rubrics for self and peer assessment, be able to analyze popular music pieces with students showing tonal, interval, rhythmic relationships thereby working out 'why the song works', explore the socio-cultural context within which adolescents make music, explore the local music scene to ascertain qualities which might be important in the sound-quality the learners strive for, etcetera. Kennedy (2002:8) notes that teacher feedback, coupled with student self-assessment and peer assessment is an effective method to assist learners toward task revision and also task completion.

The chapter on **compositional processes** (Chapter 4), both formal and informal, has several implications for the music educator. For example, teachers should remember the integral role of listening when facilitating composition class. Also, guidance on the principles of form can provide students with tools for shaping, molding, and developing their ideas (Kennedy, 2002:8). Furthermore, teachers can provide reflection while the learner crafts and revises a composition. Teachers can provide valuable assistance on using listening skills to reflect on the compositional process. The compositional process (Chapter 4) and the interviews with the students (Chapter 6) found that students engaged in much solitary work, exploring sound at the piano, “getting a song”, listening to a CD and trying to copy it, etcetera. This implies a need for individual work, not only group work as is often the case in class composition activities. Teachers should provide the opportunity for learners to have quiet time for composing by, for example, allowing work home, or allowing after school time in the music room, etcetera, imitating informal songwriting procedures and thereby affording the adolescent the opportunity to benefit from the rich emotional, creative, communicative and therapeutic resources the activity offers.
The importance of songwriting as a **therapeutic tool** has recently begun to be explored and utilized by for example school counselors (Miles, 1993) and elementary school counselors (Newcomb & Thompson, 1994) as support of early literacy instruction (Smith, 2000). It follows that the recommendation can be made that the exact benefits of songwriting be researched and the therapeutic potential of songwriting be researched to obtain longitudinal data on psychological benefits for the adolescent. It was surmised in Chapter 3 that certain adolescents fitting the personality and temperament profile, it is anxious, neurotic, self-conscious, intelligent and/or creative, could, through the creative act of songwriting, find a release for negative emotions and/or a defense mechanism against anxiety. This hypothesis was further explored in this document in Chapter 5 in the analysis of the creative products by adolescents and in Chapter 6 in the interview and observation findings. The results clearly show the adolescent’s need for communication, self-expression and application of various techniques of mood-control in songwriting. It is concluded that songwriting provides the adolescent, not only the anxious, negative, depressed individual, but also the highly creative, expressive and intelligent individual with a wide range of self-regulatory mechanisms.

It was furthermore argued in Chapter 3 that for males songwriting is mainly a by-product born out of necessity for the principal purpose of providing musical material to play in the band and that songwriting per se is not utilized for constructing gender identity. It was found that this differed for female adolescents. Songwriting for females is neither a by-product nor incidental occurrence, but one of their main tools of self-construction and self-reflection. This correlates with Richards’ findings (1998:172) that there is indeed “significant gender differences” in adolescents’ relation to music. The question for further research which was raised in Chapter 3 is whether above-mentioned appropriations of songwriting by males and females reflect a difference in emotional developmental well-being and health. Thus, are females advantaged, and to what extent, by their more personal investment in songwriting, appropriating it for own emotional use?
It is recommended that the potential of **ethnomusicology** to open up the subject of music itself be incorporated in our thinking on music education. Informal learning methods, apprenticeships, vernacular and traditional music, etcetera, clearly has strong links with ethnomusicology and what that field of research can offer the music educator. A similar study documenting tangents between songwriting and indigenous South African music could be undertaken. Stock (2003:138) suggests that instead of making assumptions about what music is, ethnomusicologists try to discover what musicians actually do when engaged in musical activity, and *listen* to how these individuals make music and how they explain what they do.

This research on adolescent songwriting echoes Richards’ (1998:197) plea for continued dialogue between research and teaching. Academic disciplines, for example, ethnomusicology, sociology, media and cultural studies, have much to offer music education and vice versa. A shared research practice can ensure sustained dialectic between various disciplines. This research has explored often neglected tangents to music education and attempted to identify areas of common interest that can be mutually beneficial. Particularly ethnomusicological research methods and music therapy has links for the music educator and researcher.

This research explored the nature and function of songwriting as an explorative, qualitative and descriptive research. It follows that another avenue, namely a quantitative study, opens up for further research to ascertain the exact quantity (how many songs do adolescents compose) of the creative product and the demographics (the who, when and where) of this phenomenon.

### 7.3 IMPACT

The impact of this research (on adolescent songwriting and informal learning methods) is multifold. Several areas where this research can shed light, and/or
support current theories, and/or contribute to areas for further research are discussed below.

7.3.1 Teacher training

One of the major areas for further research is in music teacher education - the relationship between course content and course design and aligning it with current music education philosophy. Traditionally, the music teacher education programmes have negated popular music and instructional methodologies regarding popular music. As such, a caveat in the training of teachers has developed which has left most music teachers overwhelmed, ill-equipped and unprepared for dealing with teaching popular musics. Dunbar-Hall & Wemyss (2000b:50), reporting on teacher training in the Australian context, reveal that research of popular music practices and aesthetics from a music education perspective show how the characteristics of music being studied can lead the way to deriving teaching and learning strategies. As such, the music itself forms the basis and backbone of knowledge necessary for music teachers to utilize. It follows that adolescent songwriters provide much of the material needed in their informal songwriting activity for music educators to tap into and explore with the students. De Oliveira’s empirical research (2000:33) in Brazil notes that teachers, in combining formal and informal structures and processes are using processes of “empathy and osmosis, repetition of musical motives and gestures, observation, imitation, variation, improvisation, musical challenges, musical games and plays, group interactions with strong identity relations, group singing, rehearsals of public shows and festivities, Brazilian traditional music and games, and spontaneous individual and group singing and instrumental performances”. The contribution of the informal songwriter becomes evident in the informal practices and contributions particularly in the areas of imitation, group interactions, producing material for public shows and productions, and the like.
7.3.2 Instrumental tuition methods

Green (2001:178) hypothesizes that the "formal popular music instrumental tuition methods have much in common with formal classical instrumental tuition, and relatively little in common with informal music learning practices." It can be deducted that a discrepancy between how someone learns popular music, and how he or she eventually teaches popular music, arises. Green (2001:179) observes that instrumental teachers of popular music basically use the same approach as their counterparts in classical music. For example, the lesson focuses on basic technique, assumptions that students will practice regularly, emphasis on theory, notation, scales, technical exercises, and a teacher-directed learning situation. Most importantly, Green's (ibid.) research found that formal music tuition was merely supplemental to informal learning practices, such as enculturation, listening, copying and working with peers and that lessons were undertaken when students were already self-motivated enough after extensive informal learning to supplement this with formal tuition. As has been identified in this research on adolescent songwriting, and confirmed by Green's research (2001:180), there is a vast range of informal learning practices which has been overlooked. Popular musicians, who have learned their skills informally, are often under the impression that they have not learnt anything because it was not conveyed in a formal teaching situation. "Thus many of the central informal learning practices by which these musicians mainly acquired their own skills and knowledge, including purposive, attentive and distracted listening and copying, unconscious learning, peer-directed and group learning may be overlooked by much popular music instrumental tuition" (Green, 2001:180).

Green's (ibid.) research found that teachers' approaches to teaching of popular music are closer to conventional pedagogy associated with Western classical music than
self-teaching and group informal learning practices associated with popular and other vernacular musics. It can be surmised that formal and informal learning practices co-exist independently and cross-fertilization does not generally take place. Music education has acknowledged and accepted popular music into educational curricula, however, learning practices and methods associated with informal learning have not been adopted into pedagogy.

7.3.3 Assessment

The diversity of musics, styles, playing techniques and so forth, complicates assessment of the musical creative product i.e. songs written by adolescents. The task of assessment thus becomes daunting, if not impossible for the music educator, hence the reluctance often times to allow learners the opportunity to learn, engage in, discuss, compose, or present popular music in any form for assessment. The formal music educator's comfort zone still resides in formal music educational practices, i.e. assessing mainly classical music according to long established criteria. Assessing student's work in popular music, including their original songs written, must be viewed in a broader paradigm of multiple forms of assessment. In keeping with the expectations of South Africa's Curriculum 2005, continuous assessment, portfolios, assessment rubrics, practical tasks, peer assessment, self assessment, teacher assessment, and so forth, are all within the scope of the assessment process. In particular, self- and peer-assessment become powerful tools in the overall assessment procedure when popular music comes into play. Methods of analysis of popular music (as set out in Chapter 5) have also contributed to a more accountable approach which music educators could employ to facilitate and enhance the assessment process. Brinner (1995: 40-42) delineates various domains within which musical competence can occur and as such these could form the basis of assessment categories: sound
quality; sound patterns; symbolic representation (notation and/or mnemonic
schemes); transformative processes (for example transposition); interaction;
orientation (whether towards a tonal center or temporal marker); ensembles;
repertoire; performance context; and meaning or symbolism.

7.3.4 The application of informal learning practices

Informal learning practices that are readily available, and have to date been
relatively unexplored by formal music education pedagogy, are:

- The use of a community of practice: learning from peers;
- The solitary, focused attention to music recordings and imitation thereof;
- Instrumental skill acquisition through observation and imitation of more
  proficient players, particularly peers;
- A less rigid, rigorous instrumental practice regime focusing on instrumental skill
  acquisition rather than on instrumental expertise (Cope, 1999:72);
- Attitudes and values associated with music: making music for the sake of personal
  expression, self-therapy, communication, and social and cultural ownership.

The impact that the informal learning practices identified above could have on
the attitudes and values in the formal music education situation, are outlined by

- Such approaches would presuppose the teacher to be "inactive rather than
  proactive" (ibid: 186). This involves teachers learning alongside their students
resulting in a near-replication of the peer learning situation employed in informal
learning situations.
• Musical enculturation in informal learning practices are embedded in the acquisition of skills and knowledge, particularly of listening and copying, gained during music making. All vernacular music has traditionally relied on close observation, listening and copying of expert, or more proficient, music makers. In current Western contexts, such "traditional" learning methodologies have become obsolete and have been replaced by the formal educational setting. The role of the teacher thus involves embracing learning practices that involves listening and copying from technological resources as one of the main tools for self-education.

• Music educators overlook the importance of musical enculturation. Popular musicians are surrounded by popular music through the ubiquitous nature of popular music in everyday life, whereas classical musicians have no such soundscape that becomes their musical frame of reference. Teachers of classical music often demonstrate a bar or two, or a phrase, of music which forms the total listening activity for the student. As such, for classical musicians "enculturation" into music doesn't take place at the same level as it does for popular musicians. The act of listening and copying their music teachers are thus also negated. The impact of studying informal learning methods thus becomes one of acknowledging the benefits informal learning methods can extend to formal learning methods. In this case, formal music education could benefit from the use of recordings for the purposes of enculturation through listening and copying by imitation.

• Popular instrumental tuition could likewise benefit from teaching methodologies employed by classical teachers. More time could be devoted to listening activities, particularly to music the students brings in, approximating the music whilst the teacher provides guidance by providing skills and knowledge from both informal and formal teaching methodologies.

• Classroom music has over the course of history at various times emphasized listening for "music appreciation", but has been relegated to the bottom of the
rung in many cases to be upstaged by playing, composing and improvisational activities in the general music classroom. Attentive and purposive listening intended for copying, imitation, adaptation, approximation by ear (see also Lilliestam, 1996) have not been explored much in the general music classroom. Copying recordings, and/or playing along with recordings if used judicially, would provide a feasible musical activity in most schools. Most schools have basic sound equipment, for example a CD-player or "boom box", and some basic music instruments, particularly keyboards and/or one or two electric instruments, possibly a drum kit. Even the most rural, marginalized schools in the South African context, could conceivably have local and/or ethnic instruments, own manufactured percussion instruments and/or access to radio where recorded music could be heard. The procedure would involve the teacher laying ground work by providing basic skills in imitation such as copying simple riffs, imitating simple rhythmic patterns, etcetera. Students could then, in pairs or small groups, bring a CD to school (approved by the teacher), have the whole group listen, discuss, identify characteristics that would make it suitable for copying in the school situation, etcetera. The pairs or groups could then proceed to copy whichever part(s) they had decided on. Besides exact copying through purposive listening, students could also extend this activity to listen with the purpose of making a piece of music that would sound similar, in instrumentation, style, mood, or melody.

- One of the most profound impacts informal learning methods has, is the development of aural skills, that is, developing the ear for listening and "playing by ear" (see also Lilliestam, 1996). Green (2001:195) asserts that in general, the aural activity of musicians working in the oral tradition is meaningful because it is embedded in the real life practices of both reproducing existing music and creating original music, individually or collaboratively. Once again, numerous possibilities for schools in the marginalized societies where resources are limited, now become available. Choral singing, body percussion and instrumental percussive playing have long been practiced by people in rural societies. Such
music making has already laid the foundation for strong aural skills which music educators can build on. Formal "aural tests", although considerably changed, rely on out of context, isolated exercises which tests skills associated with classical music. In the broader context of education, benefits of advanced critical and discriminatory listening skills are axiomatic.

- Informal learners acquire technical skills in a less rigorous practice routine than do conventional classic musicians. Cope (1999:72) suggests that other approaches and motivations for practicing an instrument must be considered, which would attract and sustain larger numbers of people. He (ibid:72) notes that instrumental practice is concerned with the development of instrumental expertise, an unrealistic goal for adolescents, because mostly they do not wish to spend such a significant amount of time practicing an instrument. However, the development of instrumental competence is easily achieved with significantly less practice time. The impact for music education is thus recognizing that adolescents can take instrumental instruction to develop to a competency level where they can function maximally to achieve their purpose of songwriting, namely to be able to approximate a sound, mood or emotion they wish to convey for the purposes of self-expression, communication and social authorship.

- Valuing "own" music is fundamental to informal music learners. Students have to identify with the music they engage as intrinsically worthwhile learning material, as from this follows motivation. "Cultural dissonance" (the dichotomy between in- and out-of-school music) has been identified as demotivating and counterproductive in the music education setting. The benefits of adolescents being free to choose their music and/or engage in music that is culturally harmonious to them adding to their sense of well-being (self-therapy), have been established and is well documented (Sloboda, 1999:451). Arguments against the inclusion of popular music into the school curriculum have been made and it is often argued by music educators: Why teach students music they already know? However, Green's (2001:201) research in the study of popular musicians' learning
practices, attitudes and values, found that "knowledge and skill of a committed sort in one type of music into which musicians are encultured, and with which they identify, go hand in hand with an enhanced appreciation of musical sensitivity or feel and a capacity to appreciate a wide variety of musical styles". Using popular music in the classroom also has the implication of shifting the focus from teacher-centered to student-centered education with music itself at the center of the curriculum.

- Peer-directed learning.
The importance of friendship in the peer-directed learning situation has been established, and the enhanced learning that takes place when students work in friendship pairs, rather than strangers, has been established (see Chapter 3; MacDonald and Miell, 2000a). Group work, particularly in compositional activities in the classroom setting, has become more common. The benefits of informal learning methods that teachers could apply to these group work situations are: form friendship groups, provide time without being formally observed and assessed, provide the opportunity for uninterrupted self-education, provide time for working independently at the student's own pace, allow the group work situation to provide time for being engaged in the student's "own" music.

- Linear versus explorative learning progression
Formal music education has primarily employed linear music learning programmes in the past moving from simpler to more advanced material, as opposed to informal music learning that mostly takes place in an explorative, often haphazard, fashion. The benefits of the explorative, haphazard learning progression as found in informal learning situations are, most saliently, that learners engage in musical procedures that might have been denied them for many years to come. If, for example, chromatic chords are only taught after several years in formal music education, it might already be chords necessary, if not essential, in providing the rich sound students are used to hearing in popular music. Informal learning procedures afford learners the opportunity to progress
with sound as they are ready for them while maintaining the enjoyment and novelty of the experience.

- **Motivation**
  As has been established in this research, assessment, "being judged", has often been counter-productive in the sense that it has been demotivating and has resulted in adolescents being less than enthusiastic to get involved in formal music education. Hence, in part, the very existence of the informal music learning scene, the informal songwriter, the adolescent rock band, and so forth. Formal music education has often resulted in learners perceiving themselves as not successful in the extreme rigors and demands placed on them by, for example, instrumental teachers. The competitiveness in the classical music arena has also contributed to deter adolescents from pursuing this avenue. It is thus in informal music-making situations where learners find scope for alternative methods of learning and playing music, where the styles are more vernacular and encultured, where the sound and tone production is more attainable, where less emphasis is placed on assessment and competition and where there is a more collaborative engagement in music propelled by the music itself.

### 7.4 CONCLUSION

The final conclusion attempts not to provide a regurgitation of conclusions already made at the end of the data collection studies which were more specific, as were conclusions at the end of said chapters, but rather now, at the end of the dissertation provide a general conclusion reflecting the trains of thought and arguments carried forward in the dissertation to address the research questions.
Firstly, it is stressed why phenomenological research can affect or impact policy, i.e. why this study is important and what the practical implications are.

In reviewing the usefulness of phenomenological research, this author herewith adapts Polkinghorne’s (1989:58) delineation why the results of phenomenological research can affect or impact policy. In this the impact can be viewed in terms of benefits for the 

**educator**, impact on **curriculum** and impact on **music philosophy**:

- Descriptions, for example, lyrics, emotional experience, compositional procedures, informal learning, etcetera, can assist both the adolescent and the music teacher to understand the advantage of these experiences.
- The results help counselors and teachers who work with adolescents to become more sensitive and responsive to the socio-cultural and emotional world of the adolescent.
- The purpose of narratives as provided by the adolescents in this research is to provide insight into the personal meaning and descriptions of personal experience that songwriting provides the adolescent.

It is concluded that self-expression is a bi-lateral, intra- and inter-personal, ever-expanding, spiraling process of communication and creation within the parameters of the adolescent’s cultural milieu, and likely further in life. For the purposes of this research, culture has been viewed from a constructivist perspective as an **active, morphic** ingredient of **social formation** in broadening our understanding of adolescent songwriting.

The findings of Bowles (1999:15) were reflected on in Chapter 3 identifying solutions to provide **lifelong involvement** in music to transcend the school phase, and the steps suggested to music educators to promote lifelong involvement in music included:

- Continued performance and the knowledge of how to do that independently;
- Students must know how to continue their progress in music education;
• Students should know how to begin something new in music;
• Students should know how to seek out opportunities for music making;
• Students should know how to make music on their own and with others;
• Students could know how to teach another person how to make music.
• Educators should consider what one needs to know to achieve the above.

The correlation between the informal activity of composition and its correspondence to lifelong learning has been reflected on. It was identified that adolescents are active independently, continue to progress in playing and songwriting, seek out opportunities to perform with their bands or to sing their compositions, they seek out opportunities to perform with others and they teach each other by working collaboratively. It was established that adolescents view themselves as involved for the long term with their music making when involved in songwriting. It was argued in Chapter 3 that many adolescents forsake this activity sooner or later and active involvement in rock music/bands/popular songwriting cease. As argued, songwriting or informal music making, is potentially fertile ground for producing lifelong participation in music. The reason for cessation of this activity after adolescence or even late adolescence is manifold and leaves fertile ground for further research.

However, in finding a solution to combat the cessation of songwriting activity after adolescence, it becomes clear that music education could have a potential role to play. It was argued that music educators could provide a broader base and provide a broader understanding of the songwriting activity, as Nazareth (1999:18) advises by integrating learning into life experiences thereby forging links with the community, adolescents could be equipped to utilize songwriting and music making much later on in life.

The music educator’s role will expand into a study of music that necessitates “individual awareness” and “personal thinking” in other words, meta-cognition: “Students begin to see themselves as designers of their own learning rather than viewing musical information as something to be gleaned strictly from a teacher or a textbook” (Pogonowski, 1989:9). In analyzing student motivation (Chapter 4) it was determined
that adolescents engaged in the informal activity of songwriting are internally motivated. Writings on motivation linking feelings of competence to motivation was examined and it was determined that adolescents experience feelings of competence during songwriting. It could therefore be one of the reasons that motivate individuals (Boardman, 1989:27). It was stated that if composition is not assigned, therefore not turned in for grading or assessment, being ‘judged’ is also avoided. Therefore, songwriting provides an activity in which perceived personal success could be experienced by the adolescent. Likewise, this provides rich ground for further research to determine the extent of personal attribution theory and motivation theory as applicable in informal songwriting activity.

Chapter 4 identified one of the challenges facing music educators as tapping into the two learning contexts “formal” and “informal” and bridging the gap between the two by accommodating and promoting both contexts. Likewise, Legette (2000) confirms that individuals are able to transfer prior knowledge learned outside school in informal settings to formal school settings. It follows that student’s prior knowledge forms a central tenet on which to build a richer and more meaningful music educational experience, in keeping with current social constructivist learning theories.

The chapters on the creative product and process have confirmed theories on how individuals learn, how they compose, why they compose and significant issues in the nature and function of this informal activity. It is, lastly, recommended that above all, the music educator should acknowledge the personal investment and the autonomy within the personal and cultural sphere which the adolescent bestows upon songwriting.

Within the growing international interest of children’s and adolescent’s compositions, it is surmised that this study herewith contributes to a deeper understanding of the role of songwriting in the adolescent life phase. New vistas open up to the music educator inspired by the many challenges and opportunities within the realm of self-expression that songwriting offers. Likewise, new areas for further research are identified within the growing body of research materials on informal learning and composition in music education. Particularly within the South African context with Curriculum 2005 in mind,
this research makes a contribution to the ever broader understanding of how people learn, how to enhance lifelong learning and accommodate different learning styles. Although this research addresses one research question within the music education framework, it is hoped that it will find its place within the broader scope of music education today.
Bibliography


Kratus, J. 1985a. "Rhythm, melody, motive, and phrase characteristics of original songs by children aged five to thirteen", *Dissertation Abstracts International*, Volume 46 no. 11, 3281A. University Microfilms no. 8600883.


Robb, S.L. 1996. “Techniques in song writing: Restoring emotional and physical well being in adolescents who have been traumatically injured”, *Music Therapy Perspectives* [United States], Volume 14, no. 1, pp. 30-37.


Western Cape Education Department. Curriculum 2005: Arts and Culture document.


### APPENDIX A: SONG TEXTS

**Original in Afrikaans**

**DIE NUWE SUID-AFRIKA**

**Verse 1**
Met angs loop ek by die straat af
Met vrees klim ek in my kar
Bang loop ek in die donker
En seerkry speel ‘n groot rol in my hart

**Verse 2**
Met probleme stoei ek die dag deur
Met verwardheid verloor ek die pad
Met huil plak ek ‘n pleister
En met droom vlug ek uit hierdie land uit.

**Koorjie**
Die son sal weer skyn
en die blomme sal weer bot 2x
As jy net bid
en jy net glo in ons God 2x

**Verse 3**
Met moedeloosheid klim ek af van my fiets
Met frustrasie sluit ek die deure snags
Met kwaadheid staar ek na die koerantberig
En met minagting kyk ek na ons demokrasie.

**Koorjie**
Maar ongelukkig moes hy gaan
En ‘n beter plekkie vind.
En ons vra dat Liewe Jesus
en ons trane terg?

---

**Original in Afrikaans**

**SKEMERKIND**

**Verse 1**
Ken jy die Skemerkind
aan die voet van Paarlberg?
Weet jy dat hy huil
en ons trane terg?
Ken jy sy gesig
en hoor jy sy stem?
Weet jy dat hy harteer van binnekant kan tem?

**Koor**
Maar ongelukkig moes hy gaan
En ‘n beter plekkie vind.
En ons vra dat Liewe Jesus

---

**Translation**

**THE NEW SOUTH AFRICA**

**Verse 1**
in fear I walk down the street
in fear I get into my car
Fearfully I walk in the dark
and hurting is present in my heart

**Verse 2**
I battle with problems during the day
in confusion I lose my way
with tears I put a plaster on
And through dreams I flee this land.

**Chorus**
The sun will shine again
and the flowers will bloom 2x
If you only pray
and believe in our God 2x

**Verse 3**
Frustrated I dismount my bike
in frustration I lock the doors at night
in anger I stare at the newspaper
and with disdain I look at our democracy.

**Chorus**
But unfortunately he had to leave
To find a better place
and we ask Dear Jesus
Mooi sal kyk na ons Skemerkind.

Verse 2
Sy glimlag wat harte raak
Onthou ons al te goed.
Vriende wat weet, hulle’s lief vir hom.
Waardeer sy menswees oralsom.

Koor

Verse 3
Nou moet ons groet,
sonder om baai te se
Ons weet dat niemand dit altyd so wil hé
Daar bly ‘n plekkie in ons gedagtes
En ons hoop jy weet jy bly ons Skemerkind.

Koor

W. v. T.  (16 year-old, male)

Original in Afrikaans

WAAR IS JY

Verse 1
Wys vir my ‘n vriend wat waardes het
Van eerlikheid en geluk
Noem vir my ‘n naam van iemand
Wat vreugde in hartseer kan vind
Hoeveel mense is daar,
Wat deel in hul geluk.
En saam met jou huil as jy misluk.
Waar soek mens so persoon
in ‘n wereld soos die
Wat stewig agter jou staan.

Koor

As almal iemand anders soek,
Wat dit vir jul kan gee.
Wat is daar oor vir my om te vat
Baie mense wat soos ek soek
Na ‘n vriend wat om kan gee.
Wat saam met my die lang pad kan stap.

Verse 2
Wys vir my ‘n pel wat met sekerheid
Die toekoms vir ons kan bepaal.

Chorus

Translation

WHERE ARE YOU

Verse 1
Show me a friend with the qualities
of honesty and happiness
Name me someone
who can find happiness in heartache
How many people are there
Who can share in their joy;
Who can cry with you when you fail
Where do you find such a person
in a world like this
That will stand staunchly behind you

Chorus

Verse 1
Show me a friend with the qualities
of honesty and happiness
Name me someone
who can find happiness in heartache
How many people are there
Who can share in their joy;
Who can cry with you when you fail
Where do you find such a person
in a world like this
That will stand staunchly behind you

Chorus
Wat eiewys, saam met my kan meedeel
Wat getrouheid aan ons kan betaal.
Kom tye van swaarkry,
En tye van nood.
Sal ons mekaar nie vermy.
Deur woeste waters, haelstorms
En duisternis.
Voel ek jou altyd langs my.

Verse 3
Wat verwag jy terug van my
Waarmee moet ek deel
En gaan ons keer dat niemand
ons geluk van ons steel
en sê my vriend wanneer is dit klaar
sodat ek myself van die lewe kan skaar.

Koor

W.v.T. (16 year-old, male)

Original in Afrikaans

‘n STUKKIE KAAP

Vers 3

Wat verwag jy terug van my
Waarmee moet ek deel
En gaan ons keer dat niemand
ons geluk van ons steel
en sê my vriend wanneer is dit klaar
sodat ek myself van die lewe kan skaar.

Koor

O hou vir my ‘n stukkie Kaap
En moet dit nie verloor
Want more gaan ek huis toe
En al die pret is ook
So los vir my ‘n stukkie Kaap
‘n stukkie wat ek kan hou

CHORUS

O keep me a piece of the Cape
do not lose it
because tomorrow I return home
and all the fun is over
so leave me a piece of the Cape
a piece I can keep

230
want ek bewaar my stukkie Kaap
en gee ’n stukkie vir jou.

because I treasure my piece of Cape
and give a piece to you

Die rykmanseuns op Clifton Beach
Wat met pappie se BM ry
Vissermanne aan die Kaai
Wat die diepsee wil verby
Robbeneiland met sy tronk
En die ligte teen Tafelberg
Gesogte Kaapse winterreën
Wat die surfers ook vererger.

The wealthy guys at Clifton Beach
who drive dad’s BMW
fishermen at the quay
who ride the deep seas
Robben Island with its jail
and the lights on Table Mountain
treasured Cape winter rains
which angers the surfers

Hoekom moet ons huis toe gaan
Hoekom moet ons ry?
Want ek’s verlief op die Kaap
En die Kaap is lief vir my
So vat my goedjies uit die Kaap
En los my dat ek slaap
Want vandag raak ek ook definitief
Eie aan die Kaap

Why must we go home?
Why must we leave?
because I am in love with the Cape
and the Cape is in love with me
so take my things from the Cape
and leave me to sleep
because today I definitely become
true to the Cape

O son en see
En mense wat lag
En tyd wat self voorspel
Geniet altyd die hele dag
Dis eie aan die Kaap

O sun and sea
and people who laugh
and time that dictates
enjoy the whole day
this is true to the Cape

W.V.T. (16 year-old, male)

DOUBT

Verse 1
Death is creeping nearer
With its tongue and its skull
I can feel his presence
Cause my days are getting dull

Verse 2
The tension is building I feel it
The darkness is formed by his black cape
My master he is, he controls me
Like remote control cars like a zoo ape

Chorus
Oh will I die
Or am I succeeding
I work so hard
That my fingers are bleeding

Oh I don’t know
If I will survive
He’s tempting me so
It’s hard to stay alive

Verse 3
I don’t have to work anymore
I’ll just do it all for nothing
I won’t succeed anymore
In the end he’ll turn out as the king

Chorus

C.B.  (15 year-old, male)

HATING SCHOOL

Verse 1
Once again like before
Sitting here in the classroom
Listing to the teachers talking
Sounds like the language of doom

Verse 2
Let’s take the teachers hostage
I have explosives and a big shotgun
Oh please do reconsider
It’ll be a lot of fun

Chorus
Hey it’s me, I’m not at home
I went out to burn down the school
Leave a message after the beep
And please don’t take me for a fool.

Verse 3
Once again not like before
Sitting here in the jail cell
At least I don’t have to go to school
I burned it down to hell

Chorus

Hating school, yes I do  2x
With a passion

C.B.  (15 year-old, male)
DEMON REVOLUTION

Verse 1
Evil is controlling me
Please leave me alone
I had enough on the evil road
…..don’t want to chew that bone

Verse 2
I’m killing people like animals
Can’t seem to pass the gatekeeper
Violence is controlling my head and my hands
Maybe I’m grim Reaper

Chorus
Oh God please help me
I’m trapped in this spell
Fire breathing down my neck
Don’t want to go to hell

Demon Revolution x2

Verse 1
Chorus

C.B. (15 year-old, male)

ROULETTES

Verse 1
Been lonely in this dark world
In this corner alone and curled
Fooled by so-called friends and peers
Sleeping with eyes filled with tears
Been convinced to buy a weapon
To destroy my depression

Verse 2
Been all wasted in this black room
Choking on smoke from the autumn bloom
Drowning my hatred in a dark drug
It’s transforming me into a thug
There’s demons stuck in my head
I’ll kill myself instead

Pre-chorus
Like a volt, running through my spine
Like a drunk, walking a white line
Like a guide, showing me where to walk
Like a champagne bottle, ready to cork

Chorus
I’m like a gambler, playing with my life
I’m like a blind man, catching a damn knife
When Mr Gambler, placing his bets
Placing it all on the Russian Roulettes
Nothing ’s gonna stop me now x2
Never will I give a damn
Accept the way I am
Roulettes

Verse 3
Through it all I’ve learned a lesson
Do it like they said, aim at your head
Toll the chamber, round it goes
Pull the trigger as the excitement grows
It’s becoming an obsession
To destroy my aching depression

Pre-chorus
Chorus

C.B. (15 year-old, male)

AM I TO BLAME

Speak:
I can’t seem to realize
why I feel this way (about you)
it may be your beauty
cause your beauty comes from within
it may be your smile
the smile which for I long to see everyday
it may be your voice
that bring’s out in a soft sound or melody
your deepest feelings
I always thought that it was a crush
But in my dream God has told me
That I’m in love with you
I can’t believe it but it’s true
And nobody know’s it but me and now you
I don’t know why you don’t wanna hear
What I have to say, so I wrote this song
To tell you that my love cant go away
Everytime you turn me down
I cry inside, cause I don’t know why
I don’t know what to do
Cause I just cant stop loving you
Please understand that I can’t help it
I guess this is the way life is
To me its unfair
Cause I didn’t ask for this love to be there so am I to blame

Verse 1
As I look into my diary
Seeing pages with your name
Cause I just can’t see
How thing’s will be the same
Remembering all the good times
And every bad one we forgot
Then I never know
I would have a broken heart

Chorus
Am I the one to blame
After all my struggle’s and my pain
Is this in vain, I’m going insane,
Should I be the one to cry
You should please tell me
Am I to blame

Verse 3
Is there another way
To get through this pain
Cause it hurts so bad
To let you go away
After all that we’ve been through
I know I found my way
Cause I’ve been here before
And I won’t take the pain no-more.

Repeat chorus.

Bridge
My love isn’t gone
But my life goes on, after all this time
You played around, you hurt my feelings
I had to go through, all this pain alone
You need to be my cure
I never should have fallen in love

Repeat chorus.

Speak: Am I to blame

E.P. (17 year-old, male)
BABY BEAR

Every single night
You cry yourself asleep
Even if you know
That I’m here next to you
I guess you don’t know
How much it hurts me
To see you so unhappy
Maybe that’s the way life is
Still I just want you to be happy
And be as sweet as you are
Cause you’re the point of my heart
And the love of my life
There’s nothing I’d rather do
Than show how much I love you
I wanna hold you in my arms
And never let you go
Cause I want you to stay
My baby bear.

E.P.  (17 year-old, male)

DON’T TURN ME DOWN

Speak
I wanna tell you
That no girl has ever made me feel
The way you make me feel
That’s why I need to hold you in my arms
And never let you go
You may be young, but you’re ready to love
So don’t turn me down.

Verse1
It just made my heart go insane
Cause then I already knew
That I needed to make you mine
I wanna whisper sweet things to your ear
And tell you my deepest feelings
Cause I wanna make you cry
Only tears of joy
Can’t seem to stop wondering
If you’re an angel, cause you’re so perfect
Just remember that person who broke your heart
Isn’t me, so don’t let the past
Mess up our future

Chorus
I wanna be your Romeo
And I wanna make you my Juliet
Cause we can be happy if you give me a chance
I know what I feel for you is true
So what can I do, to prove my love for you
Please don’t turn me down.

Verse 2
I said I wanted a relationship with you
And I hope you feel the same
I promise I won’t play with your feelings
And that’s true
Cause it seems that I’m falling in love with you
God knows how much it hurts me
To be away from you
I don’t want you to just be my girlfriend
I want you to become my wife
Cause I can’t think of my life without you
There’s nothing I’d rather do
That’s how much you really mean to me.
Repeat chorus.

Bridge
To me it’s destiny, that we should be together
Cause I’ll rather die
Than see you with another guy
Hmm. Every night I miss that beautiful smile
You threw into my love account
I need to feel your hand in mine
I promise I won’t say goodbye
Cause without you my life will be a lie
So please say my name
And say you feel the same

Repeat Chorus

Speak
Leigh-Jeanne, don’t turn me down!

E.P.  (17 year-old, male)

ESPECIALLY FOR YOU

Verse 1
On a special day like this
I recall all those loving memories
That sweet and thoughtful things
You’ve done for me
That’s why I wanna tell you
That you’ll always have a special
Place in my heart
Guess I can’t love, (yes I can)
But not the way you want me to
Even though I try, I just can’t let go
Cause something in your eyes touched my soul

Chorus
Especially for you
I’d give anything you need
Cause you are my world
And my every heart beat
Nobody sees what you really mean to me
Cause you truly are my destiny
Especially for you

Verse 2
When I wake up in the morning
And the sun hurts my eyes
While something bears on my mind
I just look at you
And I know it will be a beautiful day
You gave me the one chance
I never thought I would get
I don’t know if my mind’s overruling my heart
Maybe I’m not right every time, but I was right when I decided to put my heart on you.

Repeat chorus

Bridge
Baby count our days together
By smiles and not tears
Count your days without me
By stars and not fears
You know what you mean to me
But still you fight the fact that you love me too
I know you can’t forget
That day we met

Repeat chorus

Speaker
For those in love, why seek for advice
Just remember, when you fall in love
You pay a price
So know the rules before you roll the dice
So if you wanna contact me
I got the same address
Nothing new, except me loving you

Repeat chorus

E.P. (17 year-old, male)
FEAR OF LONELINESS  (Boy and girl)

Boy: Verse 1
Sometimes when you’re in love
You’re even shy to speak to her
But when you finally find the words
Thing’s don’t really go your way
You don’t feel to talk no more
Cause the pain you can’t describe
It seems you can’t see
The love inside me
That makes me feel this way

Girl: Verse 2
You may think that I’m rude
And I don’t care, but you’re wrong
Cause I’ve been there before
And I can’t take the pain no-more
I believe that your love me
And I really feel the same
But you should understand
This is true love and not a game
I don’t wanna be unhappy
And I don’t wanna look back
When I say yes to you
What will I do
If you break my world in two.

Chorus
This is my fear of loneliness
A feeling I need to resist
And I wanna spend my life with you
And let all our dreams come true
You’re the one I really love
And can’t stop to think of
When I know we feel the same

Vocal: Boy to girl:
I know we can be happy
I’ve you become mine
We can try to make it work
But promise you won’t let me down
And you will never leave my side
So you can be my wife
And you can stay in my life
Forever and stop my
Fear of loneliness.

E.P.  (17 year-old, male)
**HAD ENOUGH**

Verse 1
I put my heart on you
Did what you asked to do
I thought your love was true
Cause I believe in you
Never thought you could be
Someone who will play on me
But I guess I was wrong
I looked in your eyes
 Noticed all those words were lies
When you said
You don’t wanna lose me
You were my first love
Now I think I had enough
Cause me and players
Don’t get along

Chorus
Get get get gone
Cause here you don’t belong
Player take your bags and leave
Cause you’re a love tease
Get get get gone
Cause I had enough
Pain through the love of a player

Verse 2
Everytime you kissed me
You just wanted to leave me
Can’t remember what’s his name
Cause it only was a game
No matter what you say
You already lost me
Baby you played on me
I’ll hate you for eternally
Said you’re my greatest fan
Slept with another man
How can I forgive you
I always loved you
You always said you loved me too
I gave you all I had
But players only makes me mad.

Chorus
Get get get gone
Cause hear you don’t belong player take your bags and leave
cause you’re a love tease
get get get gone
cause I had enough
pain through the love of a player
no no no more
please walk out that door
oh how could it be
you never really loved me
got get gone
cause I had enough
heartbreak by a player

Rap
your crying, cause you’re lying
guess you didn’t know
what you really mean to me
so let’s come back to reality
okay you played me for a fool
but I’ll get you back
cause I won’t just sit there
crying about falling in love
so as my witness hear above
you’ll cry many more tears
cause I’m gonna make sure
your life’s like mine
you’re making me go crazy
by just thinking of what you’ve done
I guess I wasn’t the only one
On your mind
I’ll bet you’re not one of a kind
But somewhere there’s true love to find
So here we go and you should know
That we’re through
And I want nothing to do with you
So player get gone
Cause here you don’t belong
You think you outplayed me
Think again, cause you just lost
To your own game, and that’s a shame
Cause only you are to blame

Repeat chorus
E.P. (17 year-old, male)
INSIDE OF ME

Verse 1
Your pictures I see
Brings a thousand words to mind
The words I never knew how to say
Cause everytime you cry, oh baby
I know it’s because of me
I guess I didn’t see
What you really mean to me
But every promise I made to you
I intended to keep
Now I know, that I don’t want you to go
So please say it can be
What I feel inside of me

Chorus
I wanna be with you
Cause no-one else will do
You’re the owner of my heart
And with out you I’ll fall apart
You can make my life complete
Cause you’re what I need
You’ve got the key
To free the person inside of me

Verse 2
I heard people say
Relationships never last forever
But I can’t believe it’s true
Cause when I’m with you, baby
It makes me wonder
Why I never found you before
We both know there will be days
That things won’t go our way
But as long as you’re by my side
I can accomplish anything
Cause you’re me destiny
That’s why I wanna ask, if you’ll marry me

Repeat chorus.

Bridge
I wanna sit with you by candlelight
And just hold you, so very tight
Playing our song
Hoping nothing can go wrong
Cause baby with you I belong
And I wanna walk with you
Hand in hand, across the years to come
Cause there’s nothing I’ll rather do
Than spend everyday loving you
How incomplete my life will be
If I didn’t feel this love for you

Oh, inside of me.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

LET ME KNOW

Verse 1
Every time we’re apart
I’m afraid of losing you
Cause it feels like
I’m in love with a stranger
You always knew where to go
Whenever you’re down
You know that one guarantee
That you always had me
For good or bad whenever you’re sad
I was your shoulder to cry on
But things have changed
Chorus
Let me know, if it’s over
Let me know,
If someone else took my place
You send the message on my phone
That we need to talk
Cause you knew
That I could only give you love
That lasts forever
Let me know
If your feelings for me changed
let me know, if we’re through
There’s nothing I can do
To stop loving you
Let me know, if we’re through

Verse 2
If it’s over
Stop touching me the way you do
I always wanted to wake up
And reach out knowing you’re there
I wanted to make you see
What you really meant to me
That’s why I tried to be so romantic
I bought you roses and expensive gifts
I also gave you a thing
That money can’t buy, I gave you love
And you also had the key to my heart

Repeat chorus.

Bridge
I also felt so lucky
Waking up with you for breakfast
You never said a word
Your body always did the talking
But now, just like a bird
You wanna fly free
Even if you know what you mean to me
But let me know
How you feel about me, about us
And the way it’s gonna be

Repeat chorus.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)
LIFE’S ENDED

Verse 1
When I’m alone
And feel bad
Cause nothing’s going my way
I just know
That I should close my eyes
And think about you
And everything will be okay
No matter what people said
You were always there for me, all you wanted
Was for me to be happy.

Chorus
But how could life be this cruel
When God knows what you meant to me
You just opened my eyes
And I saw what a friend I had in you
No one can take your place
I just wanna go back in time
And tell you my true feelings
Our time together ended
And there’s no coming back

Verse 2
Did you get my letter
Saying how much I miss you
You meant the world to me
Cause you were my best friend
Nobody understood me the way you did
So your memories won’t go away
You’ll always live in my heart
One day we’ll see each other again
Until then goodbye

Repeat chorus

Bridge
You always knew
When something was wrong
And you were the one
Who helped me keep strong
Please let your friendship rain on me
Cause I know how empty my life will be
If you’re not in it with me, but I understand
That God called your name
And I will soon join you my friend
When the angels come
Which God have sent

Repeat Chorus.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)
MY PRAYER TO GOD

Verse 1
I come to you
With guilt in my heart
Cause I know that it seems
That whenever I pray
I need your help
But this time I really do
Not that I don’t need you everyday
Today is different
I wanna pray for all the children
Going through times in life
And all the criminals doing crimes
With their various reasons

Verse 2
Lord I wanna thank you
For giving me this chance on earth
Thank you for trusting me
With every life decision I should make
Thanks for being there
When I need a shoulder to cry on
Oh God thank you
For listening to my prayers

Verse 3
There are days in life
That people feel lonely and unloved
Never knowing that you’re there with them
In all their pain and sorrow
Cause you know our problems and fears
And you dry our eyes
Whenever we cry a tear
Thank you for this talent
To sing your name

Verse 4
Lord nobody’s perfect, except you
So ask you to please forgive my sins
Thank you for being there for me
By giving me a loving family
That stands by me in life
Only you know how hard life really is
I know I can depend on you

Verse 5
You hear my everyday plead
Thanks for making my dreams
And destiny become a reality
I’m just a young man
So thank you Lord
For doing what you can
And making me who I am
OH GOD IT HURTS

Verse 1 (Girl)
I never knew
That I would feel this empty inside
Guess I wasn’t really ready
To let you go, but now I know
That shouldn’t have thought of you
As just another boyfriend
Cause I can’t describe
The pain I felt when you walked away
I wonder if I’ll ever heal completely
Cause people say there aint no cure

Chorus (girl)
Oh God it hurts
Cause I can’t put you of my mind
I seem to cry every night
Cause I can’t get use to the fact
That you not here with me anymore
And that I can’t get you back
Oh God help me cause it hurts
Save me from this disease
Baby my heart’s in pain
And I’m going insane
Cause baby it hurts so bad

Verse 2 (boy)
I thought of myself
As the magician of love
Cause I never thought
Someone could take my heart
Guess I never knew
That players also fall in love
Never imagined the pain I caused you
I’m so sorry I let you down
I can’t live without you anymore
Can’t deny the fact
That I’m still in love with you

Chorus (boy)
Oh God it hurts so bad
When I dream about you every night
And see someone else holding you tight
Baby please forgive me for what I’ve done
Thank you God for letting me know
That she’s the one
It doesn’t matter what I have to do
To get back with you
Can’t forget the way
You just turned me down, oh God it hurts.

Bridge (Boy and Girl)
Baby I aint over you
But is there something I can do
Cause I can’t live without you anymore
Please understand that I’m mad and feel bad
About the pain I’ve caused you
I’ll go down on my knees to beg you please
For just one more chance
Cause my life is empty
And the pain won’t go way

I’m still in love with you
And I know you feel the same
Please forgive me for what I’ve done
And thanks for letting me be
The only one in your heart
Will you be my wife (yes I will)
Baby make my pain go away
And say you’re here to stay
Cause no-one else will do
Cause I’m still in love with you
And God knows how much it hurts

Oh God it hurts (Repeat till fade)

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

ONLY LOVE CAN BREAK YOUR HEART

Verse 1
I made a move, and you turned me down
I walked back facing the ground
Cause my lonely words was all in vain
And now I have to go through all this pain
Why can’t you see, what you mean to me
Cause now I’m sitting alone
Listening to your message on my cell phone
Saying you’re sorry
Baby I never loved someone so much
That I should cry myself asleep
But I’ll rather die
Than see you with another guy
I now know

Chorus
Only love can break your heart
When I thought we’ll never part
You meant the world to me
But maybe it just wasn’t meant to be
Cause as friends we were so close
Lord why did she say no
When I thought she loved me
And she wanted me to be happy
But it came this and I realized
Only love can break your heart

Verse 2
No, I never knew this pain before
But I knew that love was knocking at my door
Cause when your heart spoke to mine
It made me strong
But how could I be this wrong
I know there’s nothing you can do
To stop me from loving you
I write this song
Cause baby with “[name]” you belong
When I looked in your eyes
It made me wonder why
I never saw it before
That you don’t want me anymore

Repeat Chorus.

Bridge
I bought the sun to warm your hand
Cause thought together we’ll stand
Baby in love, that God said from above
When I saw you at night
Your eyes shined so bright
You sparkled like a star
Even when you’re so far
I know where you are

Repeat chorus till fade.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

SEXY CINDERELLA

Verse 1
From the first day I saw you
I had you on my mind
Then I realized
You need to be mine
And I went to see
If you had a man
He can’t stop me
Even if he can
I have a plan

Chorus
Sexy Cinderella
I will make you mine
Sexy Cinderella
I need you in my life
Sexy Cinderella
My life is incomplete
Sexy Cinderella
Cause you’re what I need
Sexy Cinderella
You look so fine
Sexy Cinderella
Please be mine
Sexy Cinderella
Ooh hmm

Verse 2
I would give you everything
That your heart needs
You’re my desire
And I’ll beg you please
Would you be mine
And everything will be fine
If you become my Cinderella

Repeat Chorus 2x

Verse 3
Baby your body looks so fine
That’s why you gotta be mine
You’re what I need
And I’ll beg you please
Would you be mine
And our life can be designed
Sexy Cinderella

Scream my name
Say you feel the same
No, baby it aint a game
I’ll try to never let you cry
To keep you satisfied
My Cinderella

Repeat chorus till fade.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

TOGETHER

Verse 1
I always had a crush on you
But I never had the words
To tell you how I feel
Cause I’m a shy guy
And I never was in love before
You don’t know
The gift you’re giving me
By letting me tour
Through you mind
So that I can free the person inside

Chorus
I wanna stop the time
From passing by
Cause I just wanna be with you
I wanna close my eyes
And hear your heart speak to mine
I wish you’d tell me
That you feel the same
She knows where the road goes
But I wish it brings us together

Verse 2
We both know we can’t be friends
Even if we tried
I wanna be with you
Cause no-one else will do
Every time we’re together
My life feels complete
When you’re with me
You’ll only cry happy tears
And that I promise you
That I’ll never let you down

Repeat Chorus.

Bridge
Close your eyes
And think of how it will be
If you’re here with me
Baby you’re my destiny
And I will not stop
Until you’re next to me

Repeat chorus.

Speak
Please don’t break my heart
Cause we can’t be apart
I need to be with you
To show you my feelings are true
And that I’m truly in love with you

Repeat chorus.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

WHAT SHOULD I DO

Verse 1
I still love you
It’s after midnight
And we’re still on the phone
I don’t know how to tell you
That I don’t want you to go
I had nothing till you came along
So what went wrong
Cause I was suppose to be your Romeo
And you my Juliet
Now I need to cope
With a broken heart.

Chorus
What should I do
To get you back in my life
What should I say
To tell you it’s destiny
That we should be together
How can I make you see
What you really meant to me
And that we’re meant to be

Verse 2
Baby don’t cry 2x
How could life be this cruel
when God knows how much I love you
I need to feel you hand in mine
Cause without you my life’s a lie
I don’t know, if I should laugh or cry
Cause we know we can’t be apart
Baby I need to be with you
And I know you still love me too

Repeat chorus

Bridge
Baby I know I was wrong
Can’t help it but I’m crying inside
And when you left
A part of me died inside
Cause I need to be with you
I’m searching for the words
To tell you how I feel
But baby all the words doesn’t matter
Just listen when my heart speaks to yours
Saying that I won’t give up on us.

Repeat chorus.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)
QUEEN OF MY HEART

Verse 1
From our first day together
You always gave me all you had
Even when things didn’t go our way
You always told me that God watches over us
By that words I just knew
That you were told
How hard life’s gonna be
Cause you seem to know
When things are wrong
And when happy days
Doesn’t really come along

Chorus
So I write this song
To tell you that I love you
And I really know
How hard life’s gonna be
When you’re gone
Thank you for who I am
And telling me the right from the wrong
You’re a friend, but I’m proud to say
You’re my mother

Verse 2
Sometimes people don’t
Realize what a mother means
But when there’s bad times
They always go and look
For that shoulder to cry on
But I now know
There will never be someone
As special as you are
So I thank heaven for giving me you
Cause there’s nothing I’d rather do
Than spending my whole life
Trying to please you
You deserve to be treated like a queen
There for you should know
That you’re the queen of my heart
And there will never be anything keeping us apart

Repeat chorus.

Bridge
You are the reason
I can be proud to say my name
You are the person
I need to tank for my fame
And I promise I wont be ashamed
To speak your name
Cause my life wont be the same
If you’re not there helping me
WHEN WILL I SEE HER AGAIN “CLOVER, CLOVER”

Chorus
She loves me, she loves me not
Clover, clover
Does she still love me
Clover, clover
Does she know we’re meant to be
It seems she can’t see
What she really means to me
So she went away
I wonder if I’ll live another day
When will I see her again
Clover, clover

Verse 1
I hope you hear every word I sing
I’m not mad at myself
For buying you diamond rings
But I gave you my heart
Even if I never wanted to
Cause I was afraid things would go wrong
And you’d leave me, standing all alone
Thinking of those nights
When you hurt my feelings, how hard I tried
To keep my tears inside
Hoping you’d see, and try to comfort me

Repeat chorus

Verse 2
Is there any possibility
That you maybe will come back to me
Even while you’re so far away
I know where you are
Cause no star shines as bright as you
And nobody fills my heart the way you do
With a little bit of faith
I know in my heart that you still love me
And I also know, I love you
It’s a word people like you say
But never obey, and think that it’s okay.

Repeat chorus

Bridge
It seems like yesterday
When you said you’d be mine
Can it be possible that in this short time
I have fallen head over heels
In love with you
But God as my witness
I never knew it was true
So please scream my name
And say you still feel the same

Repeat chorus

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

WILL SHE LOVE ME TOMORROW

Verse 1
I may stand on my own
But inside I’m not alone
One of these days
I will tell you how I feel
That you were my friend
And now we’re in love
Can’t seem to stop wondering
What happened to my friendship from above
Thinking of those obstacles we fought
To be as close as we are
When I look into your eyes
You glow like a star

Chorus
You’re the point of my heart
And we can’t be apart
But I got this feeling
You’re not gonna let
Our friendship step aside
But baby, still you gotta decide
If we’ll be together
Cause I wanna make you smile again
I wanna hold you in my arms
And never let you go
Cause when I go to bed I wonder
Will she love me tomorrow

Verse 2
I got this crazy message on my cell phone
Saying that you’ll only break my heart of stone
But I know in my heart
That nobody’s perfect no-no
Cause there are things I’ve done wrong
And I always wondered if we’ll still get along
But I know you’ll accept me
For who I am, even if
I’m not the man in your dreams called Sam
I need to feel your hand in mine
Cause to me you’re one of a kind
And I know in you, there is
True love I need to find

Repeat chorus

Bridge
When I wrote this song, hmm
With no fancy words
I looked at your picture
And it brought a smile to my sad eyes
I just feel in my heart
That I shouldn’t give up
That one day it will be
You and me
Cause no-one else can be
As special as you are to me

Repeat chorus

Speak
Will you love me,
Will you love me tomorrow.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)

YOU WERE MY EVERYTHING

Verse 1
When the moon stopped glowing
I should have known
That something would go wrong
Even when I thought our love was strong enough
To overcome anything
But things didn’t go my way
Still I can’t stop looking
At your picture every night
And still keep on writing letters
To tell you how I feel

Chorus
I miss you, and I need you
Darling I cant stop thinking about you
You were my everything
Sweetheart I love you so much
I miss you and baby I need you
And don’t wanna be without you
Cause you are my everything

Verse 2
I gave you everything
Just to see that smile
Now I’m playing a song
Imagining you’re happy without me
So I wrote this words
To sing a melody about my feelings
May be I haven’t said
The things you needed to hear
Every night I scream out your name
Hoping you’d hear me
Saying how much I miss you
Repeat chorus

Bridge
Since you went away
My nights are lonely
And my days are bad
Every time you walked by
I just get so sad
Please come back to me
Baby for eternity
And I’ll show you that
We’re meant to be
And that our love’s a reality
Repeat chorus

Speak
I miss you so much
Words can’t express
How empty my life’s without you
By my side.
Cause you were my joy and my pride
And you were so dignified
How do I tell you
That I want you back
Repeat chorus.

E.P. (17 year-old, male)
**Main Man**

**Vers 1**
- Main man is die beste
- Hy’s die koning van die skool
- Hy kry al die chicks
- Ja, hy’s die Main Man
- Hy’s die rugbykaptein
- En hy drink baie wyn
- Niemand kan hom keer nie
- Hy’s die Main Man

(tussenspel)
- Hy’s baie popular
- Maar hy’s lelik teen die nerds
- Arme nerds
- Hy’s die Main Man

**Vers 2**
- Hy vat nie baie twak nie
- En hy neuk jou sommer op
- O help my ek is bang
- Vir die Main Man
- Hy’s die Main Man
- Sing saam met my
- Ja, Main Man

Almal saam, kan julle nie hoor nie,
Ja, die Main Man.

**L.S.** (16 year-old, male)

**HELP DIE MAN**

**Dm G F**
- Wat is jou naam?
- Waar kom jy vandaan?
- Hoekom is jy hier?
- Is die lewe vir jou ’n plesier?

**CHORUS**

**Translation**

**Main Man**

- Verse 1
- Main Man is the best
- He’s the king of the school
- He gets all the chicks
- Yes, he’s the Main Man
- He’s the rugby captain
- and he drinks lots of wine
- No-one can stop him
- He’s the Main Man

(interlude)
- He’s very popular
- but ugly to the nerds
- poor nerds
- He’s the Main Man

**Verse 2**
- He doesn’t take any nonsense
- He beats you up
- O help me, I’m scared
- of the Main Man
- He’s the Main Man
- Sing with me
- Yes, the Main Man

**Repeat Verse 1**

**Repeat Verse 2**

**Every one together, can’t hear you,**
Yes, the Main Man.

**HELP THE MAN**

**CHORUS**
Am
Wat soek jy hier?
G
Wat maak jy daar?
Hier is niks vir jou nie x2
Dm F G   Dm
Help vir die man
Dm F G (lank)   Dm
Sy lyf is moeg…en tam

Dm   G   F
Waar het jy verdwaal?
Het branders jou gemaal?
Dit was of ek of dit was jy
Nou is jy die een wat ly

CHORUS X2
Dm F G   Dm
Help vir die man
Dm   F G (lank)   Am   F G
Want hy is koud…en baaaaaaaaang
G   Am   F G
Koud en baaaaaaaangaang
G   Am
Koud en bang
F
Moeg en tam
G
Help die man
Hy is bang
G   Am
Moeg en tam
F
Koud en bang
G
Help die man
Help die man
G   Am
Help die…man

L.S.   (16 year-old, male)
DEJA VU

Sometimes it’s all the same
You and me
Are going through the pain
You fall
And call my name
Now it’s me I’m waiting, waiting for the end

So stay away from me
I’m falling away from you
There’s nothing you can do
Nothing you can do

Sometimes it’s a shame
You are gone
And I am left in pain
I cry and call your name
But it’s still me
I’m waiting, waiting for the end

So stay away from me
I’m falling away from you
There’s nothing you can do
Nothing you can do
Déjà vu 4x

(Instrumental)

L.S. (16 year-old, male)
VERLORE LIEFDE
*Original in Afrikaans*

Ek weet jy het vir my gelieg
Ek weet jy het vir my bedrieg
Ek sien jy het ‘n ander ou
Blond en opgerolde mou
Jy weet ek het vir jou gelos
Jy weet my kaartjie is gepos
Na jou adres
Ek lees daarin van liefde haat en waansin

Hier is my storie van verlore liefde
Gedra met baie, baie diepte
Hier is my storie van verlore liefde
Gedra met baie, baie diepte

My kop is seer
My maag dit pyn
Stuur vir my ‘n hulpyn
Ek kan nie anders nie
As ek sien wat jy geword het
‘n ander soort mens 2x

Hier is my storie van verlore liefde
gedra met baie, baie liefde
Hier is my storie van verlore liefde
gedra met baie, baie liefde

Dalk was ek ‘n bietjie verkeerd
ja dalk was ek ‘n bietjie verkeerd
maar dis as gevolg van jou
ja, as gevolg van jou

Stuur vir my ‘n hulpyn 8x
‘n ander soort mens 4x (fades)

*LS.* (16 year-old, male)

Translation

I know you lied to me
I know you deceived me
I see you have another guy
Blond with rolled up sleeves
You know I left you
You know I mailed my card
To your address
I read of love, hate, madness.

Here is my story of lost love
Carried with much, much love
Here is my story of lost love
Carried with much, much love

My head aches
My stomach aches
Send me a help line
I can’t otherwise
If I see what you have become
Another type of person 2x

Here is my story of lost love
Carried with much, much love
Here is my story of lost love
Carried with much, much love

Maybe I was somewhat wrong
Yes, maybe I was somewhat wrong, but
it’s because of you
Yes, because of you

Send me a help line 8x
Another type of person 4x (fades)

ESSENCE

What do you want from me
Do you need me to keep you
Is it something like true love

Nothing in this world
Could prepare me
For what you just said to me
I am nothing
And you are everything

(Instrumental)

Through the darkness
I see you coming back to me
Is this reality or am I dreaming
My mind is winding, blinding
Madly seeking you
I am nothing and you are everything

Essence 3x
The musical essence of life
Essence 3x
The musical essence of life
Essence 2x
The musical essence of life
Essence 2x
The musical essence of life

L.S. (16 year-old, male)

DISILLUSIONED

Looking to the sky
I don’t know why
Something falls down
Brings a tear to my eye
Depression everywhere I cannot bear
My thoughts or anyone
I’m afraid to be scared

What’s wrong with this life
For my rights I must strive
Like free speech
Do I fight or do I teach?
No one is trying to find solutions
Everybody out of tune
Disillusioned

I wake up to a dark, dark future
It’s a nightmare
That’s for sure
I don’t know how it turned out this way
But I know there must be a cure

(Instrumental: 8 measures)

Waiting for a better day
It never comes
My hope gets weaker and my feelings are numb
I have never felt this way before
Am I wrong
or are the demons out there too strong
whatever happened to peace and love for each other
Are we too self centered to care for our brothers
our time is almost up
so don’t waste it
if you do
be prepared to face it
I don’t know what’s been said
Or what’s been done
About our problems
It seems like no one has an answer
I closed my eyes I see a world of misery
But we hold a key to fix it
(Instrumental)
There must be a cure
There must be
There must be a cure
For all this pain and suffering
There must be a cure
There must be
There must be a cure
For all this pain and suffering

L.S. (16 year-old, male)

TOLERATION

Sick and tired of all the things you’ve done
Cooling off to freeze in the sun
Waiting just before the winds of change
And what they bring peace and happiness for me, me, me.

CHORUS
Yeah, do something else to make me mad
I’ll tolerate it
There are better things in life to be sad
It’s a matter of
toleration 6x

(Instrumental)

to the end devoid of helplessness
My voice unheard in a wilderness
You wearing and caring won’t last long
I don’t care
You mean nothing more to me, me, me, me, Go

CHORUS

(Instrumental)

Toleration for everything, everyone
Toleration for the nation, anyone
Tolerate this, tolerate that,
Don’t feel bad, don’t feel sad
Hey, tolerate every person, every culture,
Every race, age, colour, every gender

Toleration 16x

L.S. (16 year-old, male)
APPENDIX B: Experience Sampling Method self-reflection form

SONGWRITING

PRIOR TO SONGWRITING
Date..................................Time..................................
1. How do you feel right now?..........................................................
2. Why are you going to write a song now?..................................................
3. What will the song be about?........................................................
4. How long do you think you will be busy with it?.........................
5. How do you expect to feel after you have written the song?..............

DURING YOUR SONGWRITING
Time..................................
1. How do you feel right now?
2. How do you feel about the song you are writing?
3. What is the song about?
4. How long have you been busy now?

AFTER COMPLETING YOUR SONG
Time:..................................
1. How do you feel right now?
2. How do you feel about the song you have written?
3. What purpose does the song you have written serve? How will you use it?
4. How long did it take you to write the song?

COMMENTS

..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................
APPENDIX C: The Interview Questionnaire

QUESTIONNAIRE FOR INTERVIEWS:

ADOLESCENT SONGWRITING

1. BIOGRAPHICAL DATA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Cultural group</th>
<th>Social profile</th>
<th>Rural/urban</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Psychological/emotional profile

Intellectual profile

2. MUSICAL BACKGROUND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musical literacy</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Below average</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

General musical background:

…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
…………………………………………………………………………………………………………………
3. THE CREATIVE PROCESS

In what order do you compose?
   First the lyrics
   first the melody
   first the harmonies

What is written down?
   Only the text
   only the melodic line
   only the chords
   Text and melody
   text and chords
   Melody and chords

How long does it take to finish a song? ...........................................

What sets off the idea for a song?
   An event e.g.
   An incident e.g.
   An emotion e.g.
   Other

Is the composition an inspired or mostly diligent effort (trial and error) type of process?

Do you find that once a composition is complete that you return to it again and again to improve/alter it?

Do you compose with a specific audience or event in mind for its performance?

Comments

4. THE CREATIVE PRODUCT (GENERAL)

What are your compositions intended for?
   To sing to myself for my own pleasure etc....................................
   To sing/perform to close friends/folks.......................................... 
   Perform in school/public............................................................
   To use in my own band..............................................................

What topics do you generally choose for your lyrics?
   Love/emotions.................................................................
   Memories/nostalgia.............................................................
   Desires.................................................................................
   Social/political/cultural commentary........................................
   The inexplicable/questions....................................................
   Conflicts.............................................................................
   Death..................................................................................
   Other................................................................................
How do you rate the quality of your compositions in general?
   Lyrics……………………………………………………………………………………..
   Music……………………………………………………………………………………..
   Overall…………………………………………………………………………………..

What style do you mostly compose in?
   Vocal / instrumental
   Ballads, slow songs, folk songs, country, pop, etc………………………………

How do you go about storing your compositions?
   Notated
   Recorded

5. THE CREATIVE PRODUCT (EXAMPLE)

Tell me about this song, what is it about?
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
........................................................................

How did this song come about? What gave you the idea for this song?
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
........................................................................

Why is this one of your favorite songs?
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
........................................................................

Tell me about the process of composing this song, the how, where, when.
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................
........................................................................

How old were you when you composed this song?……………………………………..
## APPENDIX D: Results of the individual interview questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BIOGRAPHIC DATA</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural group:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social profile:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle class</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower socio-economic class</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Urban</strong></td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Psychological/Emotional profile:**
- Loner/private/introvert: 46% (6)
- Creative/different to others/eccentric: 31% (4)
- Emotional/frustrated/moody: 15% (2)
- Happy/social/many friends: 8% (1)

### MUSICAL BACKGROUND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musical literacy:</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advanced</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Below average</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Totals in each category do not necessarily add up to 100% due to rounding off of the decimal.
CREATIVE PROCESS

Order of composition:
- First the lyrics 62% 8
- First the melody 8% 1
- First the harmonies 31% 4

Written down:
- Only the text (lyrics) 31% 4
- Text and chords 46% 6
- Melody and chords 8% 1
- Nothing 15% 2

What sets off the idea for a song? An event
- An event 15% 2
- An incident 15% 2
- An emotion 69% 9
- Other 15% 2

The composition process is:
- Inspired (gets an idea and writes it down effortlessly) 62% 8
- Requires diligent effort to ‘get a song’ 15% 2
- Neither, varies, or both 23% 3
- Reworking of composition (returning to it to change, alter it) 69% 9
- Compose with a specific audience in mind 31% 4

THE CREATIVE PRODUCT

Intention of the composition:
- To sing/play to myself for my own pleasure 54% 7
- To sing/perform to close friends/family 23% 3
- Perform in school/public 31% 4
- To use in my own band 54% 7

Topics of the lyrics:
- Love/emotions 92% 12
- Memories/nostalgia 23% 3
- Desires 15% 2
- Social/political/cultural commentary 38% 5
- The inexplicable/questions 54% 7
- Conflicts 23% 3
- Death 38% 5
- Other 15% 2

---

2 This category totals over 100% due to the fact that some respondents have more than one.
3 The results in this category do not add up to 100% as overlapping of selection takes place.
Subjective evaluation of compositions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Satisfied/Good</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lyrics</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mode:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vocal</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Style:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pop</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans slow songs, ballads</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans rock</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English slow songs, ballads</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neo-classical</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Storing compositions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written (lyrics and/or chords)</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recorded</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memory</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer stored</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>