



Exploring the Experiences of Zimbabwean Migrant educators teaching in the Western Cape, South Africa

by
Doreen Chiware

*Thesis presented in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in Public Sociology in the Faculty of "Arts and
Social Sciences at Stellenbosch University*

Supervisor: Dr Handri Walters

March 2024



Declaration

By submitting this thesis electronically, I declare that the entirety of the work contained therein is my own, original work, that I am the sole author thereof (save to the extent explicitly otherwise stated), that reproduction and publication thereof by Stellenbosch University will not infringe any third-party rights and that I have not previously in its entirety or in part submitted it for obtaining any qualification.

March 2024

Copyright © 2024 Stellenbosch University

All rights reserved

Dedication

This project is dedicated to my late mother Rose Nehumba Tinago who had big dreams for my success. I am sure if she had been alive today, she would have been very proud of me. I would also dedicate this research to my husband Jeremiah Chiware, my daughter Grace and my sons David and Tendai. Last but not least, the project is dedicated to all migrant educators in South Africa and elsewhere in the world who are suffering discrimination, exclusion and xenophobia. You may seem silent but the production of such narratives through your silent voices will bring change one day.

Abstract

This study sought to explore the experiences of Zimbabwean migrant educators teaching in Western Cape, South Africa. A qualitative approach was used to interview 10 Zimbabwean educators. Qualitative thematic analysis was applied to the data and revealed three main themes: dissatisfaction with bureaucratic processes, unnecessary red tape, and permits; the precariousness of contract work; and the manifestation of otherness anti-migrant sentiments. The themes also revealed the extent of how the lives of migrant educators have become very volatile living in South Africa and this has produced a lot of uncertainty about their future in this country. Their situation is made worse by government bureaucracy pertaining to permits required for Zimbabweans in order to live and work in South Africa. These strenuous and often slow bureaucratic procedures often leave Zimbabwean migrants hopeless. This study recounts the experiences of 10 Zimbabwean educators in South Africa. The author of this study is similarly a Zimbabwean migrant educator who teaches in the Western Cape. Her contributions to the data were made in the form of a personal journal that reflected on her own experiences. These experiences formed part of the analysis presented in this research.

Key Words: Zimbabwean Migrant Educators; Permits; Discrimination; Exclusion

Opsomming

Hierdie studie het gepoog om die ervarings van Zimbabwiese migrante onderwysers wat skool gee in die Wes-Kaap, Suid-Afrika te verken. 'n Kwalitatiewe benadering is gebruik om onderhoude met 10 Zimbabwiese onderwysers te voer. Kwalitatiewe tematiese analise is op die data toegepas en het drie hooftemas aan die lig gebring: ontevredenheid met burokratiese prosesse, onnodige rompslomp en permitte; die onsekerheid van kontrakwerk in Suid-Afrika; en die manifestasie van andersheid wat anti-migrant sentimente veroorsaak. Die temas het ook die omvang van hoe wisselvallig die lewens van migrerende onderwysers wat in Suid-Afrika woon onthul en hoe dit baie onsekerheid oor hul toekoms in hierdie land veroorsaak. Hul situasie word vererger deur regeringsburokrasie met betrekking tot permitte wat nodig is vir Zimbabwiërs om in Suid-Afrika te kan woon en werk. Hierdie strawwe en stadige burokratiese prosedures laat Zimbabwiese migrante dikwels hopeloos. Hierdie studie vertel die ervarings van 10 Zimbabwiese opvoeders in Suid-Afrika. Die skrywer van hierdie studie is insgelyks 'n Zimbabwiese migrante-onderwyser wat in die Wes-Kaap skool gee. Haar bydraes tot die data is gemaak in die vorm van 'n persoonlike joernaal wat oor haar ervarings reflekteer het. Hierdie ervarings het deel gevorm van die analise wat in die navorsing aangebied word.

Sleutelwoorde: Zimbabwiese migrante onderwysers; Permitte; Diskriminasie; Uitsluiting

Acknowledgements

The success of this thesis may not have been possible if the following people had not participated in this piece of work:

- My supervisor, Dr Handri Walters, who guided me from its inception to the end. Her feedback was always on time and encouraged me to contact her any time I felt I needed her assistance.
- Prof Steven Robins who guided me in formulating the topic before he handed me over to Dr Walters. His comments shaped my research and gave me the courage to soldier on.
- Many thanks go to Mellon Foundation for the Indexing Transformation Masters Scholarship which helped me to complete the degree. Thank you, Prof Bernard Dubbeld, for making it possible for me to get the scholarship.
- I also thank my participants who accepted to take part in my project by providing information that shaped and completed of this project. Their interesting stories are appreciated as they formed the backbone of this narrative.
- Special mention goes to the University Librarian Lucinda Raath for finding me all I needed in the library.
- The Sociology and Anthropology Department at Stellenbosch University for giving me the opportunity to study.
- My husband Jeremiah Tendayi Chiware for his unwavering support throughout this journey. He became my immediate help when I needed someone to listen and critiquing my ideas.
- My children David, Grace and Tendai who encouraged me to soldier on especially at times when I seemed overwhelmed. Grace has been my greatest cheer leader who constantly checked on how I was doing it and where I was with the project.
- Most importantly I thank God, for the wisdom and strength for this journey, Ebenezer.

List of Acronyms

DBE - Department of Basic Education

DHA - Department of Home Affairs

HOD - Head of Department

HRQ - Healthcare Research and Quality

ID – Identity Document

ILO - The International Labour Organisation

IOM – International Organisation on Migration

PTUZ - Progressive Teacher’s Union of Zimbabwe

SA – South Africa

SDGs – Sustainable Development Goals

ZDP – Zimbabwe Dispensation Permit

ZSDP – Zimbabwe Special Dispensation Permit

ZEP – Zimbabwe Exemption Permit

Table of Contents

Declaration	i
Dedication	ii
Abstract	iii
Opsomming	iv
Acknowledgements	v
List of Acronyms.....	vi
INTRODUCTION	1
Background to the Study: Migration in Sub-Saharan Africa	1
Problem statement and focus.....	5
Rationale.....	6
Theoretical Framework	6
Research Methodology.....	8
Ethical considerations	11
CHAPTER 1	13
Introduction	13
Red tape dissatisfaction.....	13
Frustrations of migrant workers in their attempts to renew or acquire permits	21
Chapter summary	23
CHAPTER 2	24
Introduction	24
The casualisation of labour	24
Socio-economic difficulties of the short and unreliable contracts	26
A lack of labour unions for migrant educators.....	28
Chapter summary	31
CHAPTER 3	32
Introduction	32
Xenophobia	33
Exploitation, discrimination and exclusion.....	37
Language Challenges	40
Lack of respect by learners.....	42
Familiarity and loneliness	43
Culture Shock.....	44

Chapter summary	44
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	45
Conclusion.....	45
Recommendations	47
References	49

INTRODUCTION

Background to the Study: Migration in Sub-Saharan Africa

The purpose of the study is to explore experiences of migrant educators working in Western Cape in South Africa. Migration is the movement of people from one place to another and this can be within a country or between countries. Migration occurs every day in Southern Africa and the region can be considered a region on the move (Rugunanan & Xulu-Gama, 2022). Hungwe (2020) suggests that migration has been on an upward trend for decades in South Africa especially Johannesburg. Johannesburg is the richest capital in South Africa and immigrants hope to get a better job there.

The International Labour Organisation (ILO, 2021) notes that half of the world's migrants are, in fact, migrant workers. According to the Moyo (2021), writing for the Migration Policy Institute, South Africa is the migration hub of Africa. South Africa has been attracting migrant workers since the late nineteenth century when it recruited unskilled mine and farm workers from neighbouring countries (Vosloo, 2020). Later, economic opportunities mostly in cities and surrounding areas attracted diversity of workers in the post-apartheid era.

Historically, it was mostly men who used to migrate to South Africa to work in the mines and restaurants. However, in contemporary times, women have joined the migrant labour force in search for greener pastures in a foreign country. Two factors have generally contributed to the global rise of migrant labour. Developed countries have been recruiting skills from the developing world to meet their labour needs and protect their economies (Desai & Rudra, 2019). It has also been aided by the movement of people due to famine and political instability in a country of origin (Rugunanan & Xulu-Gama, 2022). According to Grebeniyk, Aleshkovski and Maksimova (2022), migration affects skilled and unskilled workers and teachers make the bulk of people who migrate in search of greener pastures and better working conditions. Ochs 2009 and Degazon, 2010 report that an estimated 18 million qualified (primary and secondary qualified) teachers were in short supply globally if the universal basic education is to be achieved by 2030. This was confirmed by Amin and Greenwood (2019) who found the need for increasing skilled teachers and improving quality of teacher training in order to meet Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). This is especially the case in Sub-Saharan Africa where, in order to meet the goal of universal primary education in 2030, there is a need to

quadruple the output of primary school teachers to meet the demand (Teachers and Educational Quality, 2014). Thus, in the case of Zimbabwean migrant educators, their movement towards South Africa has been driven both by political and economic turmoil in their home country, as well as a need for skilled labour in their host country.

The economic and political unrest in Zimbabwe since 2000 caused a mass exodus of its citizens fleeing, especially to South Africa (Vanyoro, 2023). According to Raftopolous (2009), by 2006, 85% of Zimbabweans were living below the wealth inequality datum line. The number of Zimbabweans living in South Africa is inconclusive though research points out that there are by far the largest immigrant group in this country (Moyo, 2021; Rugunanan & Xulu-Gama, 2022). The lack of a centralized repository of migrants has hampered this discussion, as Zimbabwean migrants consist of documented and undocumented persons. In such instances, the total number of Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa has remained a vague estimation.

One notable group of migrant workers in South Africa has come in the form of Zimbabwean migrant teachers (Department of Higher Education and Training, 2013). It was estimated that 61% of migrants came from Zimbabwe not directly recruited by the government of South Africa (Manik, 2013). Vanyoro (2023) notes that Zimbabwean teachers escaped political and fiscal unrest, currency devaluation, a collapse in service delivery, meagre salaries and a shortage of money and goods. Zimbabwe's general economic situation was on the edge of collapse due to political unrest and isolation. The main complaints were about escalating inflation, the lack of hard currency, the scarcity of necessities, and the swiftly rising expense of living. According to the Progressive Teachers' Union of Zimbabwe (PTUZ), approximately 35,000 educators had left Zimbabwe by 2009.

Teachers were dissatisfied with the inadequacy their salaries which resulted in professional unhappiness. More so, shortage of currency and inflation meant waiting in queues to withdraw salaries from banks. In addition, the shops were empty of goods as Zimbabwe's supply of cash decreased. According to another participant of this study these were significant factors in the decision to migrate. In this regard, Sango, one of my participants, echoed similar sentiments as she stated:

My decision to move was motivated by the fact that [pause] my wage was so low that I was unable to cover my children's boarding school tuition. We could no longer afford it because we had a child in college and other regular household expenses.

Mhizha another participant just left without even resigning because of the frustration teachers were feeling. There was a time when teachers could not even buy a loaf of bread and they became a laughing stock to everyone. I stopped driving my car because there was no petrol, people would sleep in queues. As a lecturer in Education, I was financially miserable.

Therefore, low salaries were a contributing factor in a number of linked issues. Teachers typically sent their kids to good boarding schools, but were no longer able to do so. They value giving their own children a quality education because they were educators themselves. Additionally, teachers struggled to pay their expenses, which clashed with their ideal status as educators and damaged their reputations in the neighbourhood and in society at large. During one of the interviews Mai Varaidzo explained:

I wanted to lead a life where I would not be constantly worried about my family's next meal. I wanted to secure the future for my children in terms of education and sustenance.

The situation in the country made it harder for the teachers to maintain the quality of living they believed they should have as professionals. This did not bode well for their status, and occasionally they became the target of crude stereotypes that emphasized how little respect the profession received. Muroora, one of the participants, described how sometimes even the bus drivers could be heard stating, "*I am as broke as a teacher,*" or the foreign exchange traders bragging that they make enough money to pay multiple teachers each month. This clearly demonstrated how the teachers' dire financial circumstances caused them to lose their social respect. In order to address the issues, they became migrants as the Zimbabwean government could not improve its economy, nor offer teachers a viable income, and thus offered little incentive for teachers to continue working in their native country.

Hence Rugunanan and Xulu-Gama (2022) argue that post-apartheid South Africa has been attractive to migrants of all social classes. In a sub-region blighted by wars, political and economic instability, and government corruption, South Africa is considered a greener pasture. It would appear that many of these migrants perceive South Africa to offer a more stable political and economic climate when compared to other countries in this sub-region. While migrants have generally favoured Johannesburg as a destination for new economic opportunities, some teachers live and work in Western Cape as there are higher chances of getting a teaching job when compared to Gauteng.

It should be noted that migration may not necessarily make the migrants better off as individuals may find themselves faced with difficult circumstances in a strange area (Huber, Hueber & Kleinlercher, 2022; Pham, Tran, Le & Le, 2022). Migrants find themselves in lower-level jobs that do not match their qualifications and thus pay less (Dean, 2019; Risberg & Romani, 2022; Pham, Tran, Le & Le, 2022). For teachers specifically, it has not been a bed of roses as teaching vacancies are not easy to access. Forms of discrimination and anti-immigration policies aimed at chasing away foreigners, and acting as subtle persuasions to go back to their home countries, has also contributed to migrant teachers not being able to acquire teaching jobs. In turn they venture into other business sectors or forms of employment like farm work or housekeepers and gardeners so that they can earn a living and avoid going back to Zimbabwe.

Even when these migrant teachers are able to enter the teaching sector in the host country, they face numerous unexpected challenges related to their work.

The arrival of migrants into a country affects the labour market and the involvement of individuals in society and work. In Sweden, labour market integration has been speeded up to accommodate immigrants from Syria (Ennerberg and Economou, 2020). In South Africa integration is done through affiliating to professional bodies such the South African Council of Educators (SACE). Migrants who enter a new national labour market face challenges such as reclaiming and re-working one's new professional identity in a new country (Ennerberg and Economou, 2020). According to Makula (2023), migrant teachers face acculturation challenges where they have to adapt to different ways of speaking, teaching and behaving in front of learners and parents. The new migrant teacher has to be socialised into a different culture. Teachers who enter the Swedish school face similar challenges acculturation. In some cases, the teachers have to fully retrain for them to fit into the Swedish Education system. (Ennerberg and Economou, 2020).

Similar challenges of acculturation are faced not only by Swedish immigrants, but by immigrants who enter any new country. South African immigrants are no exception. Just like in Sweden where some immigrant teachers seek asylum in the host country because of political and economic meltdown in countries such as Syria, Zimbabwean migrant teachers have come to South Africa to escape political and economic meltdown in their home country. Whilst in Sweden the teachers re-train to adapt. In Sweden migrant Syrians are trained to fit in the Swedish system of education. In South Africa, migrants from Zimbabwe do not get re-trained

but may attend workshops related to their teaching and are not forced. The Zimbabwean teachers are subjected to numerous legal challenges such as demands for registration into professional bodies such as South African Council of Educators (SACE) and South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA). In South Africa their qualifications are evaluated to prove whether they are authentic or not and also to prove if they fit into their system. Apart from this they have to have proper documentation. Undocumented migrant educators will not be recruited in the South African Education System.

Furthermore, from my research, it is evident that Zimbabwean teachers in South Africa can be made to work for months without pay. A case in point is when the researcher had to go for six months without payment from the Department of Education although I was going to work, day in and day out. Similar painful experiences have been cited in this research of teachers who have been ill-treated financially and otherwise because of their migrant status. Most of the teachers end up stranded or doing other menial jobs such as those in the construction and hospitality industries so that they can survive.

Unfortunately, in this debate, due to the absence of an accurate database of migrants, facts are usually shrouded in emotion and political expedience.

Problem statement and focus

The study focuses on migration of Zimbabwean educators to South Africa and how they experienced life as migrant educators in the basic education system in South Africa specifically in the Western Cape schools. It seeks to establish the challenges Zimbabwean migrant teachers face in terms of employment, how they cope and, finally, how the South African education system can be adapted to accommodate migrant educators. The research found that migrant educators encounter several challenges varying from the lack of job security, short unreliable contracts that will never be permanent, difficulties in obtaining and renewing permits, going for months without being paid, facing exclusion in the work place on the basis of their inability to speak the local languages such as Xhosa, and many others, that relate to exploitation, xenophobic discrimination, lack of induction and lack of learner discipline as some learners do not respect them. With these many challenges in mind, this study thus seeks to relay the experiences of Zimbabwean migrant educators teaching in the South African education system with a specific focus on schools in the Western Cape.

Rationale

This project emanates from my own experiences as a Zimbabwean migrant educator working for the Department of Education in the Western Cape. I have encountered a wide range of forms of unequal and discriminatory behaviour against migrant educators including the following: When one Circuit Manager from the Department of Education in the Western Cape was asked why some educators were not paid by the department even if they had worked for several months in some schools, the manager remarked: “There is a lot of politics up there.” I was then left wondering what exactly the Circuit Manager meant and how it related to my own position as a Zimbabwean migrant educator. It would appear as if the statement by the manager gives a picture of how the people who hold office and implement policies in the Department of Education respond to migrant teachers differently from South African citizens. The interaction with the Circuit Manager became the catalyst for the research presented here.

While several scholars have done research on transformation in tertiary institutions, this research seeks to explore the experiences of Zimbabwean migrant educators in basic education in the Western Cape schooling system. Although migrant educators have experienced significant discrimination in the education system in South Africa, there is minimal literature on this issue. According to Manik (2014) limited studies have examined the experiences of skilled immigrants in South Africa with none specifically focussing on teachers despite fulfilling South Africa’s need for specialist educators in Maths and Science (Manik, 2014). The research reveals the vulnerability of migrant educators mostly from Zimbabwe and how the department policies are discriminatory to migrant educators most of whom are from Zimbabwe. It is my hope that this research will provide evidence that will be useful in understanding the life experiences of migrant educators. This research study can be of use to other stakeholders such as education policy researchers to address the social needs of Zimbabwean migrant educators and thereby foreground the silent voices of migrant educators through documenting and analysing their experiences. The findings of the study can also be used by policy makers to address the wider concerns of migrant educators in South Africa.

Theoretical Framework

The approach to this study was framed by a number of theoretical models that assisted in thinking through migrant workers and migrant work and, more specifically, thinking through migrant work as it relates to migrant educators.

In this regard, the Push and Pull Model developed by Lee (1966) was used as a lens through which to examine the migration experience of the sample of migrant Zimbabwean teachers in this study. In this model, the out-migration of skilled labour is seen as a function of the disparities that exist between sending and receiving countries (Guzi, Kahanec & Ulceluse, 2021). The push factors exist in the source country and pull factors in country of destination. Push factors may entail unfavourable conditions that compel skilled workers to leave their home country (Zanabazar, Kho & Jigjiddori, 2021). This may include low salaries, poor service conditions, strife, and an unclear path of career progression (Zanabazar, Kho & Jigjiddori, 2021; Guzi, Kahanec & Ulceluse, 2021).

Pull factors can be considered attractive socio-economic conditions that draw from various countries (Thet, 2022). Urbanski (2022) argues that pull factors act as motivators and may include better working conditions, family ties, higher compensation and benefits, professional development interests, better living conditions, more political, economic and social stability, more job opportunities and a desire to see the world. Zanabazar, Kho and Jigjiddori (2021) describes pull factors as those factors that draw people to move in a particular place. Ochs' (2017, p. 8) notes that pull factors are imagined possibilities in destination country such as following a partner/spouse; a better "future of their children"; in search of extra education; or being enticed to the host country in order to travel. Interestingly, she noted that one can be pulled to a destination for individual reasons, for a partner or for their family.

Thet (2022) on a similar note observes that pull factors fall into three categories namely political, social and economic factors. It has been observed in literature that Zimbabwean teachers came to South Africa due to socioeconomic, educational and political reasons (Vanyoro, 2023). If a destination country has positive incentives it makes migrants keener to relocate by pulling them to a new destination. In the case of Zimbabwean teachers, they are drawn because they are in search of political freedom, higher standards of living and better salaries (SACE 2011; Weda & de Villiers, 2019).

Caravatti et al. (2014) offer a model that focusses on the intentions of those that hire migrant teachers. The researcher found models useful in the analysis of the professional experiences of the sampled migrant teachers because the intentions of the employer heavily influence these experiences. Therefore, Caravatti et al.'s (2014) three models of teacher engagement were used to understand the professional experiences of the migrant Zimbabwean teachers. These models are briefly examined here.

The first is the Professional Exchange Model which argues that migration provide migrant teachers with opportunities for professional development in that their skills and knowledge is enhanced. This model also suggest that migration offers an opportunity for teachers to improve their standard and status of teaching. This does not only happen to the migrant teachers, but also reciprocal development in the source and destination countries thereby benefiting the two countries

The second is the Language and Curricular Programme Model which suggest that migrant teachers prepare students for citizenship in a globalised world. In this model, teachers are hired to deliver specialised coursework in the destination country by the employer. In other words, migrant teachers diversify the curriculum and shape the worldview of students differently.

The third is the Shortage Hiring Model presupposes those shortages of teachers in the labour market is a result of market failures in the demand and supply of teaching staff. In this regard, migrant teachers are hired to meet the staffing needs in the destination country in particular subjects capitalising on wage differentials. In this model, the foreignness of teachers is not valued as they do not seek to diversify the curriculum. As a result, their job security is usually uncertain, which makes them vulnerable to exploitation. Many countries such the United States, United Kingdom, Philippines, India, Maldives, Nigeria and Ghana follow the Shortage Hiring Model (Caravatti et al. 2014). In South Africa's case, the engagement of migrant teachers is in response to mismatches in the demand and supply of teachers. More so, the wage differentials between Zimbabwe and South Africa contribute to the movement of teachers between the two countries (SACE 2011; Weda & Villiers, 2019). The shortage hiring model is of particular interest to this study in that the experiences of Zimbabwean teachers can be understood using this model as they are characterised by exclusion, exploitation and hardship.

Research Methodology

A qualitative research methodology was used in this study because it provides a dynamic approach to research.

The qualitative approach answers questions like why and how, therefore enabling and allowing for a more in-depth understanding of experiences, phenomena, and context of the experiences of Zimbabwean migrant educators working in Cape Town. According to van Creswell (2019) qualitative research methods are usually associated with inductive approaches (based on empirical evidence). Consequently, the researcher decided to use this paradigm to study the

experiences of the migrant teachers in South Africa. A qualitative research methodology was used in this study because it provides a dynamic approach to research, allowing the researcher to follow up on responses given by respondents in real time, generating valuable conversation around a subject.

Because of the nature of this study, which intends to assess the experiences Zimbabwean migrant educators working in Cape Town, a descriptive research design was used. Non-experimental descriptive study seeks to characterize the characteristics of a phenomenon as it occurs (Schwarzkopf, 2008). Phenomenology involves understanding the experiences of particular people and how they experience it. As a result, a descriptive research design is a scientific method that involves observing and documenting a subject's behaviour without changing it in any manner. Furthermore, because the descriptive research design accurately and legitimately portrays the factors or variables that correlate to or are related to the research issue, it was used in this study. Cresswell (2013: 44) notes that

“[q]ualitative research begins with assumptions and the use of interpretive/theoretical frameworks that inform the study of research problems addressing the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem. To study this problem, qualitative researchers use an emerging qualitative approach to inquiry, the collection of data in a natural setting sensitive to the people and places under study, and data analysis that is both inductive and deductive and establishes patterns or themes. The final written report or presentation includes the voices of participants, the reflexivity of the researcher, a complex description and interpretation of the problem, and its contribution to the literature or a call for change.”

This study was a phenomenological study in that it focused on how migrant teachers experience exclusion in South African schools. Cresswell (2019) note that a phenomenological study is interested in understanding the common meaning of how people describe their lived experience of a phenomenon. In this case, the phenomenon is the education sector experience in South Africa. Not only that, it also seeks to understand how they experienced the political and economic factors which made them immigrate from Zimbabwe to South Africa. Thus, the focus of phenomenology is “what” they experienced and “how” they experienced it (Cresswell, 2019). When conducting a phenomenological study, Cresswell notes that it must put emphasis on the phenomenon being experienced, must focus on a group of people who have experienced the phenomenon, must focus on the lived experience of people and how their objective and

subjective experience have something in common with other people, where possible researcher must bracket out personal experiences from the study and the data collection must involve interviewing. In this case, the phenomena under investigation is experiences of exclusion in the education sector, teachers are the people who experienced the phenomenon, the interview approach was used in gathering data and the researcher did not exclude herself from the study as it was the motivation for conducting the study.

The selection of participants for this study relied on non-probability sampling and subsequently snowball sampling. Changbao and Thompson (2020) defines sampling as “selecting some part of the population to observe so that one may estimate something about the whole population”. This study used non-probability sampling techniques to select participants. Non-probability sampling is used when the total population is not known and it provides a range of alternatives techniques to select samples based on the researcher’s subjective judgment (Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill, 2019). Therefore, this study adopted purposive and snowballing sampling techniques. Purposive sampling involves the selection of participants based on prevailing similar circumstances. In this particular case, it looked at Zimbabwean educators in predicaments of employment uncertainty and discrimination in the education sector. Purposive sampling focuses mainly on particular characteristics of a population that are of interest to the researcher hence allowing the researcher to get answers to the research questions. Informal discussions with Zimbabwean educators on whatsapp groups and on the street about their situations at work enabled the researcher to identify relevant participants. Consequently, purposive sampling enabled the researcher to identify participants. As a result, this allowed the researcher to gain in-depth insight and understanding of the participants’ experiences about the subject matter under investigation.

In this study, the participants included both primary and secondary school teachers from different schools in Cape Town. The involvement of teachers from different schools was meant to get diverse views from key participants in the schools. Different participants provided different perceptions on the topic under study and hence a varied view on the experiences of Zimbabwean migrant educators working in South Africa.

Due to the Covid-19 related national lockdown, interviews were conducted over the phone using WhatsApp calls. Face to face semi-structured interviews were not as the data collection occurred during the Covid-19 pandemic and was thus hampered by lockdown measures. The researcher scheduled appointments with participants at the convenient times that the

participants were comfortable with. Most of them chose to be interviewed in the evenings after school when they would not disrupt the proper running of the school. A 45-minute interview was conducted for each participant. The interviewer had time to probe certain questions for clarity if it was necessary to do so. The interviews became very safe and convenient to both the interviewer and the interviewees.

Qualitative telephonic interviews are considered as appropriate as they are good in achieving anonymity, privacy for respondents and reduce distraction for (interviewees or self-consciousness (for interviewer) when interviewer take notes during interviews (Saunders et al., 2019). The researcher was also a participant in this research; thus, she kept day to day notes of all her experiences in her personal diary. The school's WhatsApp staff group was not of much use to the researcher save to highlight the discrimination imbedded in the school as most communication was in the local indigenous language the researcher could hardly comprehend.

After all interviews were concluded, they were transcribed and thematic analysis was applied, to analyze the data in a systematic way (Polit and Hungler, 1995). The research followed Braun and Clarke (2006) six phases namely familiarization, coding, theme searching, theme reviewing, theme definition and naming and finally writing up.

Ethical considerations

As a requirement in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology to seek approval to carry out fieldwork, I followed the regulations of the University from the Ethical Clearance Board and was approved by the Research Ethics Council. My fieldwork commenced with seeking for the participants informed consent using a written participant information sheet. This was given to the participants through WhatsApp which they read and understood

The reason for conducting the research was clearly explained to the participants which the researcher said was mainly for academic purposes for the completion of her thesis. The participants were allowed to voluntarily participate in the study. In the consent form the researcher assured the participants that they were not going to get any harm because of participating in the research. The researcher strongly emphasised that the information obtained was going to be used for academic purposes only. Confidentiality was going to be maintained throughout the study. The researcher had a non-disclosure of confidential information agreement with the participants. In addition, the study used pseudonyms to protect the identity of the participants.

CHAPTER 1

The challenges faced by migrant teachers in South Africa

Introduction

Weda and Villiers (2019) notes that there are issues that challenge migrants universally, such as separation from family and housing however for teacher's institutional hurdles exist such as bureaucracy and recognition of qualifications and experience. During the research my participants divulged varied experiences in the teaching profession. However, dissatisfaction with bureaucratic processes as it pertained to teaching was a recurring theme among the participants. Their experience with and interpretation of unnecessary 'red-tape' took centre stage. This chapter will thus delve into the experiences of migrant teachers as it relates to bureaucracy, 'red-tape' and required permits for residency and work.

Red tape dissatisfaction

Red-tape can generally be defined as bureaucratic processes related to the non-completion of paperwork with numerous bottlenecks. Globally, migrant teachers go through rigorous processes of acquiring the necessary permits and permissions in order to enter their profession in the host country. Migrant teachers are often left disheartened, powerless, exhausted and angry due to these processes (McDevitt, 2021). Such processes that are frustrating for teachers are not only akin to Canada, Australia and other European countries, but are also found in Africa, and more specifically in the case of this research, South Africa. Bureaucratic challenges have been a major issue for Zimbabwean teachers. In South Africa the immigrant educators have to go through the South African Qualification Authority (SAQA) who evaluate and equate their qualifications to the South African Education system, before they can register as teachers in the country. It is only after SAQA has completed all the necessary processes that migrant teachers can proceed to find employment under the Department of Basic Education. The major challenge in obtaining SAQA is the amount of money they charge to evaluate one's qualifications. Such an evaluation can take anything from one to six months to be completed. However, fast-tracking the evaluation will inherently cost the applicant more money. The cheapest option remains evaluation within six months. This of course greatly hampers the migrant teacher's ability to enter the South African workforce in their occupation of choice. Muroora, a participant of this study, recounted her arrival in South Africa in the following way:

When I arrived in South Africa I only had money that was enough to rent a shack for one month and to buy food with the hope that I would get employment quickly. Little did I know that finding teaching jobs was a daunting task as I was required to do the process of evaluating my qualifications with SAQA first. This was a blow to me as I did not have money left to pay for SAQA to be done. I had to look for any work to do in order to survive in the new life I was in hence I got a job as a domestic worker which did not pay me well because I was undocumented. The little amount I was getting at the end of the month meant that I would need to do another side hustle to cover my living expenses and transport to and from work. It took me eight months to raise money enough for SAQA and that was when I started the process of SAQA. Meanwhile the economic problems continued deteriorating and could not send anything back home to my parents who were taking care of my daughter I had left. My parents could not understand how possible it was for me not to send money back home to them when I was employed.

Muroora could not do her registration with the South African Council of Educators as it is only done by a person who is employed by the Department of Education, the process is only conducted when there is a letter written by the school confirming that she is teaching at that school.

Another participant, Sango, who got her Asylum seeker permit on arrival struggled to get her SAQA evaluation done because she had paid insufficient money unknowingly and there was no communication from SAQA about this irregularity. After ten months of waiting she decided to go to Pretoria to follow up on her evaluation. This meant travelling costs to and from Pretoria. It was only in Pretoria that she was told to top up the amount she had paid so that the qualifications could be evaluated. As she had paid the minimum amount for an evaluation, she had to wait again for another six months to get her SAQA certificate.

However, for Mhizha, the process of doing and acquiring the SAQA evaluation was not a major problem as he had a brother who had come to South Africa before him, found an engineering job, and became his financial provider for the process. His only problem was finding a teaching job in Johannesburg where he stayed for a whole year. He then moved to the Western Cape where he found a driving job at a cleaning company. This was a very big relief as he could pay for his rent, food and transport to and from work. However, what he was earning was only

enough for his stay here and he could not send anything back home to the family for two and a half years. His initial hope of finding a teaching job seemed impossible.

SAQA and SACE processes are slow and frustrating. That is not all, there is still the process of acquiring a legal document for staying in South Africa and when one gets employed in government with the Department of Education, there is still a vetting process for identity documents that is cumbersome.

According to Mai Vari another participant:

It has been difficult seeking employment in South Africa just because I am a foreigner. When I started, I worked as a maid because that's all that I could get and then when I got my Asylum permit, I started working at a private school. It was a private Christian school where we were taken advantage of very much. As it was a Christian school, they would seek donations from outside the country and claimed that they were paying teachers and yet they were not paying us well, and from then, the school closed down. When the school closed, they opened grade R classes, and I was fortunate to get a post to teach grade R but this time the salary was coming from the Department of Education. So, I managed to work there for five years.

According to Nakphong, Young, Morales, Guzman – Ruiz, Chen and Kietzman (2022) the key determinant of exclusion or inclusion in a society is the immigration status. Research thinking and sociological theory views immigration status as a major determinant as well. Immigration laws create statuses such as documented or undocumented. Such a status create room for inclusion or exclusion in a society. Although some migrants may attain legal status in South Africa, this does not translate to full social and economic rights (Nyakabawu, 2020). This is the case because South African laws themselves are discriminatory to legal or illegal migrants - a permanent residence permit does not mean inclusion of migrants and full enjoyment of South African rights. This was observed in Mhizha's situation that despite having acquired a permanent residence permit and a South African Identity Document, he has not benefitted fully from the existing situation. For instance, Mhizha's papers disappearing at the department when the school had applied to the Department to make him permanent. Related to that is the fact that he has acted as a Head of Department of the English Department for three years without any remuneration while everyone else in such positions were getting remunerated. Benefits such as pensions, medical cover, housing allowance and other fringe benefits including leave are reserved for the South African citizens. Mhizha stated:

I have never taken leave since I started teaching at the same school some twelve years ago simply because I am working in a contract. Citizens are always taking their leave days and they go on leave with benefits.

In the same vein, Mai Tau, another participant of this study, expressed that she could not get maternity leave as a contract worker. Going on maternity leave often meant losing the contract to someone who would replace her. Hence, she only had a week of the principal's goodwill to go and give birth and coming back to work. According to Mai Tau she got that one-week unofficial leave due to the kindness of her principal.

Being a diabetic and hypertensive person, I once fell very sick and I was given three days off sick. When I contacted the principal about my situation I was told that I was not entitled to leave days as a migrant educator in a contract. If I were to take those three days, I would remain unpaid for those three days. As I did not want to jeopardise my reputation at work, or come across as an unwilling or unreliable employee, I continued going to work as if there was nothing wrong. On the second day the principal told me I could stay home on the third day as it was a favour that she was doing for me.

The South African laws ensure that the foreign educators only get minimal benefits and no more. Foreign educators do not partake the South African cake, they have limited room to manoeuvre. Full economic and political inclusion is reserved for the South African citizens.

Having the required documents lead to the immigrant included in the numerous benefits associated with proper documentation. Access to banks, housing loans, car loans and schooling are all related to being properly documented. Kim, Molina and Saadi (2019) argues that such documentation removes any condition that makes migrants vulnerable, and enables them to make claims against the state while ensuring access to institutional benefits as provided by banks and insurance companies (that can provide compensation for losses). From this, it is clear that South Africa provides acceptable status for immigrants giving the immigrants different types of documents that regulate their stay in South Africa.

Mainini, a holder of a ZEP document that expired in December 2021 but was extended by the minister of Home Affairs to December 2022 and further extended to June 2023, nearly lost her contract when one department official had refused to process her contract papers from her school noting that the permit in her passport showed that it expired. The department official demanded to see the minister's decision written in the passport despite her explanation and

support from the school Governing Board and principal. Mainini took it upon herself to find a lawyer who had to write to the Department of Education to explain her case and to subsequently allow her to work again. She was given a year's contract up to December 2022. Such situations are very frustrating to the immigrant educators and very few of these educators can afford a lawyer to represent them like what Mainini did. The same situation befell Mkwasha, who ultimately lost his job because he could not afford legal representation nor did he have adequate knowledge of the procedures that was available to him in order to get his job back.

The large influx of Zimbabweans into South Africa since 2000 led the South African government in documenting some Zimbabweans through immigration amnesty. Such documents offered to Zimbabweans are different from the normal permits that some Zimbabweans also applied for. The immigration amnesty saw Zimbabweans being given firstly the Dispensation Zimbabwe Permit (DZP) in 2010, then in 2014 the Zimbabwe Special Permit (ZSP), then in 2017 the Zimbabwe Exemption Permit (ZEP) (Moyo, 2018). These permits were on "closure and replace" basis so that the immigrants would not claim permanent residency and citizenship. On the other hand, there was little to no knowledge pertaining to the conditions of the amnesty permits. When they were introduced by the Department of Home Affairs, many with asylum seeker permits or refugee statuses were given the option to exchange their existing permits for the amnesty permits without a clear understanding that they were in fact surrendering their valid permits, that are still in effect. This type of situation of document changes has meant that the Zimbabwean migrants live in constant anxiety, fear and uncertainty. Likewise, the way they get their wages is of fraught with uncertainty to such an extent that some migrants don't know when they will get wages or not.

Farmer (2004) points out that this form of structural violence caused by wage insecurity and uncertainty highlights exclusion. This structural violence caused misery in all my participants as they were subjected to this form of violence as shown in Mai Vari's case when her refugee permit took a lot of time to be renewed causing her to go for months without a salary. Because of this delay, she failed to pay fees for her daughter who was doing second year at the University, the child failed to write examinations and subsequently dropped out. What became the final nail in the coffin was that Mai Vari, being a single mother, failed to pay rent for her flat in Durbanville and was forced to look for alternative accommodation for her and her daughter. They had to go and stay with a friend in an informal settlement in Philippi which constituted a drop in their standard of living.

In the case of migrant teachers in South Africa, structural violence persists through pay delays and being awarded very short contracts. Employment issues therefore are serious hurdles for migrant teachers (Ennerberg & Economou, 2022).

My case is another example of structural violence when after teaching at the same school for nine years, I was denied a job because of citizenship as they wanted to employ a South African citizen. All the years I had taught there I had been given an annual contract which was renewed after each year. However, since January 2022 I was given a contract of three months. The new principal informed me that she had been advised to employ me for only three months, and yet all the other migrant educators in the same area were given one-year contracts. I was not paid for the three months and I just decided to continue going to school in the second term as I felt I should be at school so that I could get my salary. I continued teaching my classes as usual but even after completing the term, I still was not paid. After several efforts to find out why I was not getting paid while all my documents were in order, one department official found out that the principal did not write a motivation that is attached together with the forms for the contract.

Civic marginality which is an act of excluding a certain group from enjoying economic and political rights persists in areas where migrants reside or work. Mkwasha's case is a case in point, because despite having a ZEP permit, his employment was shrouded in uncertainties. Two or three months of work was followed by long periods of unemployment. Mkwasha was excluded from most of the benefits enjoyed by others because of the ZEP he holds which causes limitations to what others with different permits enjoy. For instance, holders of ZEP are legally violated through policies that determine renewal processes. The permit would be valid for four years and each time the amnesty permits were renewed, they would change their names so that a holder of such permit would not claim permanence residency which is done when one spends five years in a country with a permit. Another example of this violence is the case of Mainini who is another holder of the ZEP narrates how the policies about permits cost her hard-earned savings.

When my Zimbabwe Special Dispensation Permit was about to expire after four years, my bank, Capitec Bank had informed us that all bank accounts will be closed when the permits expire and that it would be difficult to get the monies if the permits were not renewed. With that fear in mind, I had to withdraw all my money from the bank account and asked my cousin to keep it for me in her bank account as she had a different permit from mine. When my permit was eventually renewed, I went back to ask for my money

only to find out that she had used my money. She never gave me my money and has since gone back to Zimbabwe.

These are the struggles we experience as far as documentation is concerned. Migrants who have no permits become legal ghosts who find difficulties in interacting with society through normal channels as they also end up losing their income opportunities. Uncertainty and anxiety experienced by Zimbabwean educators persist for as long as legal violence is given prominence. Daid and Nowlan (2021) refer to as violence embedded in legal practices. To immigrants it pertains to the decisions made to applications for different permits that can be awarded to immigrants such as migrant educators. Most of my participants expressed their frustration about how the processes of obtaining permits in South Africa.

Earlier research has established that by classifying migrants through giving them different statuses such as visa holder, permanent resident, citizen, asylum seeker, makes the migrants enjoy different sets of economic, political and civil rights which does not apply to the amnesty permits (Ong, 1999). This was confirmed by recent studies which highlighted that there are two types of categories that contain laws and policies - some which include, other which exclude immigrants from certain benefits through making requirements such as nationality or immigration status (Schweitzer, 2020; Finn & de Reguero, 2020). Aptekar and Hsin (2022) states that nation states use the legal status to stratify immigrants and that the national citizenship enjoys benefits that refugees, asylum seekers, and some permit holders do not enjoy.

According to Nyakabawu (2020) the Zimbabwe immigrants in particular do not fully enjoy the services provided in South Africa as their permits expire from time to time and they need renewal. The waiting for permit renewal is a nightmare for most Zimbabweans as this may mean restricted movements, anxiety and limited access to services offered in South Africa. Legal violence is when applications for permits have to go through the process of adjudication such as the Zimbabwe Exemption Permit (ZEP) (Nyakabawu, 2022). This type of violence is mostly exercised on foreign nationals who need to regularise their stay in South Africa than on South African citizens.

The South Africa exclusionary immigration policies ensures that the South Africans enjoy benefits of citizenship (White & Rispel, 2021). In South Africa, a documented immigrant enjoys marginal benefits, they have political citizenship however they do not enjoy fully citizenship status economically.

Ennerberg and Economou (2020) also observed that migrant teachers seeking employment encounter bureaucratic hurdles. Mai Vari who had a refugee permit which was renewed every year meaning that even the contract she had had to be renewed when there was a new permit. When the permit was renewed the new contract would take some time to be approved and getting paid as the Department would send the Asylum permit to the Department of Home Affairs for verification. The DHA would take long to verify, meanwhile she would go for a month or months without getting paid due to the delays at DHA. All this brought a lot of anguish to her as she had to go without a salary for some time and yet life had to go on as a single mother with a child. Mai Vari supported this view by stating that:

When the contract ended after 5 years, they decided they didn't want me anymore because being a foreigner, if you talk too much, they will not like you. We also had a problem with fundraising where I queried something, and my contract was cancelled. Then I started working in a School Governing Board (SGB) post of which, at times, I was not getting paid very well because of being a foreigner. Citizens in the same positions were getting far more than what I was getting despite the same qualifications. When I managed to get a departmental post, I stayed in that post until I was again victimised, and they ended my contract giving excuses about my refugee permit which was valid, and I have been using it for a long time.

A refugee permit is a legal document that is given to a person who goes to another country fearing repression from her country and in this case, Mai Vari left Zimbabwe as she was a political activist and was supporting the opposition party. This issue of documentation has made migrant educators feel financially, professionally and socially insecure. Although South African institutions value the quality of Zimbabwean teachers, and seek them to fill gaps in the supply of teachers in South Africa there continues to be very restrictive policies that are rigid and adds suffering to migrants. South African regulatory frameworks similarly present obstacles to the already suffering migrants and are not supportive to the to the Zimbabwean migrants in formal systems.

Mai Vari explained:

The most challenging aspect of being a migrant teacher in South Africa is, we are side lined. Our refugee papers state that we can work here but they don't give us the work its only contracts and when they find a South African then they put the South African there. Besides having... I mean despite having the refugee status of which my status is

almost because there are certain benefits that are given to people with a refugee permit as what is given to citizens but because of certain departmental policies I don't get them. I'm actually supposed to get some of the benefits that a South African gets because of my refugee permit, but we don't get that because I'm a foreigner even though I have a refugee permit.

Mai Vari also went on to state her experience as a foreigner in South Africa by stating that:

The previous contract that I was on, was for a year. It was supposed to have been until the end of the year. But I had an unfortunate incident where my principal borrowed some money from me when I got paid my lump sum after seven months. She stayed with my money for a year and when I started asking her for my money, she victimized me. She terminated my contract saying that my permit was expiring in September, so they couldn't renew my contract. My permit was expiring in June and was renewed online due to Covid-19 and the contract was ending in September. They simply terminated the contract and would not allow me to continue with the contract because of that. They could not accept what Home Affairs had put on their website that all expired permits were still valid and functional because of the strict lock down. Asking for my money from the principal costed me my contract That was how my contract ended and then from June of 2020 I stopped working until only now in August 2021 when I got a new contract.

Frustrations of migrant workers in their attempts to renew or acquire permits

Respondents also pointed out the frustrations that come with renewing or acquiring permits. A case in point related to the issue of delays in permit adjudication and the case of a Wits PhD student (Philip Chuma) gained widespread news coverage after he committed suicide. Vusi Sadonis (2022) noted that Philip was doing research on transition of newly qualified teachers in Zimbabwean schools. His attempts to renew his documentation made him fail to register for the 2022 academic year and resulted in him facing an uncertain future resulting in him committing suicide.

Chuma's story is illustrative of the frustration and predicament migrant people find themselves in. The issue of the Zimbabwe Exemption Permits that expired in December 2021 has caused a lot of job losses on the part of migrant educators who were using such permit. The extension of this permit by a year by the minister of Home Affairs brought some relief to some educators.

It was gazetted that although the permit expired it is still valid for the holders of the permit. However, there are some principals and department officials who are failing to acknowledge the steps taken by Home Affairs, and they have not renewed contracts for those educators insisting that they need to see the *new* permit in the passport of the educator. One such example was brought up by Mkwasha, a participant of this study. Mkwasha lost his job because of how some people chose to interpret the government regulations. Despite the efforts by Mkwasha to print the gazetted notice from the Department of Home Affairs website and bringing it to the principal, the principal still refused to take Mkwasha back. He wanted to see it in Mkwasha's passport as a renewed permit in the visa. Many educators in Mkwasha's situation have lost their livelihoods and are uncertain of a better future in South Africa.

The difficulties that migrant teachers encounter in trying and bureaucratic red tape are some of the major challenges that migrants encounter in an interaction with Home Affairs and Department of Education. More so, South Africa's immigration is restrictive that fewer options available for migrant educators to obtain immigration documents. As a result, many immigrant educators use the asylum process as a "back channel" to enter to the labour market. While acquiring an asylum seeker permit was easier than the other categories of permits, the challenge was the time taken to renew it when it expired. Sometimes they are issued only valid for three months which make it impossible to secure long term employment contracts.

We are not hired on a permanent basis and our employment is regularly reviewed along our legibility to work and stay in the country. Sometimes it takes long for us to get paid and that means we have to find other ways to survive. At the beginning of the year we have to wait for appointment and we do not have such luxuries as maternity leave", Mai Tau laments her situation.

Through the hiring of migrant teachers, South African schools unintentionally created new issues with education. Some migrant educators proved competent than locals which kept them having contracts continuously renewed every six months. School managements used the migrant educators' abilities to teach to overwork and exploit them knowing they would not complain. This was different from how the locals were treated even if they were in a contract while the citizens enjoyed.

Chapter summary

This chapter presented the challenges faced by migrant educators in South Africa such as “red tape” which was mainly about permits which my participants were referring to as papers. The findings from the interactions with my participants brought out the problems that immigrant teachers faced whilst in South Africa. They face a lot of problems with the Department of Home Affairs as they are given short periods of time on their permits, or they are refused the permits totally. The next chapter looked at the teacher’s job security and their precarity of labour.

CHAPTER 2

The precariousness of contract work in South Africa

Introduction

What emerged from the data was that most of the participants indicated that they are not considered for permanent positions despite working for many years in the Western Cape Education Department. They are always given short term contracts which at times are renewed quarterly or are terminated at any time. This brings a lot of uncertainty and anxiety to the migrant teachers interviewed for this study. In this regard, Mkwasha, one of the participants, stated: *“I am employed on a contract basis and at times the contract is not renewed depending on the situation.”* Mkwasha went on to explain that a new contract was awarded depending on whether the principal still needed you or not.

This section addresses the experiences of Zimbabwean migrant teachers in relation to job security and the precariousness of contract work. This theme unravelled other connected factors that includes socio-economic difficulties brought about by short term and unreliable contracts, and the lack of labour unions that can protect the interests of migrant educators in the workplace. This puts migrant educators in a very difficult situation.

The casualisation of labour

In the case of casualization of labour, there is an unequal power relationship. Contract teachers are basically marginalised, do not have a voice and bears the brunt associated with short term contract. They are unable to join unions that can represent them, and they are in a weaker bargaining position unless they can hire lawyers to represent them which they cannot afford. Numerous studies on labour casualization have been conducted. Contract employment is inexpensive as benefits such as pension are not given to contract employers. According to Vidal (2019), the labour process theory argues that contract employment entail power relations that result in the exploitation of contract workers. Fearing the possibility of not having a contract renewed they do everything that is asked by their superiors. Some of my participants experienced this. For instance, in the case of Mhizha when some of the school managers are exploiting him by giving work more than any other people.

Participants explained that the South African Departments of Education, which hired migrant teachers to work in public schools, typically offered three-month contracts and, in exceptional cases, one-year contracts to migrant teachers. *"Temporary (employment) here always refers to renewal; it's not even a year thing, but it's a term's thing,"* Sango explained. Her complaint highlights migrant teachers' dissatisfaction with having to constantly renew or seek new contracts. The other participants explained that renewing their contracts was always difficult. This was further complicated by a clause in their contracts that stated that if a suitably qualified South African could be found to replace the migrant teacher, the migrant teacher would be given one month to vacate the position exacerbated migrant teachers' job security in public schools.

Mainini spoke to the difficulties emerging from this approach for migrant teachers: *"How can they give a professional such a contract! A month and go where? To go back to your country? Family and everyone using a month's salary?"* Mainini, like the other participants, found this grossly unfair and insensitive to the migrant teachers since it invalidated the contract duration.

Mkwasha explained that being a contract educator does not give them rights to negotiate for anything and the educator is not allowed to join unions that can stand up for them. According to Weda and De Villiers (2019), teacher unions are useful in addressing challenges encountered by their members such as higher salaries and improvement in their conditions of service. It is very unfortunate for the migrant contract educators who do not have rights for bargaining because of the precarious nature of their employment. In other words, they are powerless, voiceless as they cannot belong to any union. The lack of job security coupled with lack of representation expose migrant teachers to even more exploitation in the classroom. Employers and school administrators in some schools take advantage of migrant teachers' insecurity to extract as much labour as possible from them. Mkwasha explained:

I would say that because these are temporary positions, you are forced to please a lot of people. You are unable to express yourself. Whatever they say, you have to follow because you fear losing your job if you disagree.

His complaint exposes the helplessness and the loss of voice that the migrant teachers experienced due to their fear of losing their jobs. They lack job security and this is very devastating. Mai Tau explained:

The lack of security has been most challenging. On Maslow's hierarchy of needs, security ranks high, meaning everyone desires it and that it is very important to humans. The fact that we do not know whether we will be bored or not, or that policies change will negatively affect keeps us in Limbo and a state of absolute uncertainty. As times go, we also grow older, we have families that are growing and we want the best for them, but something keeps on reminding us that we are quite vulnerable, any change could upset a lot of things in our lives, given that these jobs are the means to an end that made us come here in the first place. So, for me, lack of job security has been the most challenging.

The shortage of educators is a global challenge, and the challenges are not only specific to South Africa. However, there is a shortage of mathematics and science educators that causes South Africa to hire Zimbabwean migrant educators who are very competent in the areas. The shortage of educators is also caused and by a general lack of interest in teaching as a profession causing native educators to leave for other professions or greener pastures elsewhere in the globe soon after acquiring a teaching qualification. To help with its teacher shortages, South Africa employs a sizeable number of migrant teachers. Zimbabwean teachers were selected as study participants because they currently make up the greatest percentage of migrant instructors in South Africa's educational system.

Socio-economic difficulties of the short and unreliable contracts

The job insecurity caused by working on short and unreliable contracts have several negative socio-economic consequences for the migrant teachers, one of which was financial insecurity. In this regard Mkwasha stated:

Sometimes I will have to have a side hustle by buying and selling fruits and vegetables after school or during weekends in order to sustain myself and family especially during the times when the contract and salary are being processed which may take long to be completed."

Finding an alternative job in between contract employment and payment was quite common among my participants. Mai stated: *"Sometimes it takes long for us to get paid and that means we have to find other ways to survive."*

Participants of this research faced a lot of financial challenges because of short term contracts. Contracts would be terminated at any time without notice or posts can be advertised without the teacher in that position knowing which is very devastating. For instance, Mkwasha said that

in December 2019 there was a drop-in number of learners at the school that he taught as most parents for learners in upper grade transferred them to their rural schools. About 45 learners transferred making the loss of one full class. According to the Department of Education the school had to lose one teacher also. There were five contract educators including myself. Mkwasha was the most senior with seven years teaching at that school. Mkwasha explained that sometimes short-term contracts are terminated at a time when there are no other sources of income. This leaves the household vulnerable in a number of ways who require an income to pay for accommodation, electricity, water, food, fees for the children, transport and healthcare.

There is a year when I had to sell my car in order to pay for our three months' rent that had accrued and fees for my son at the University. I had no other option of getting money for all these and yet I had spent three months without getting paid", Mkwasha narrated in a very sad voice. He continued: *"even when the money came in the fourth month it was less than what he was supposed to get. Troubling him again to make an inquiry about the salary Having spent four months asking the principal to follow up on the salary and to start asking him to inquire about the anomaly in the salary was another hard time. But I eventually gained courage and the principal was told that they had not added 37% which they later on corrected and I got all my money. This is the extent to which migrant educators suffer in South Africa.*

Most teachers face a difficult time in January when schools hire migrant teachers, yet these hires are not processed and approved in the same month. There are a lot of delays that are caused by the process of verification of documents with the Department of Home Affairs who generally take their time. *"January, you may go without a salary, even February. This is a common practice,"* Mhizha explained. It is strange how the challenge of verifying documents affects Mhizha who has a green (South African) Identity Document.

Another participant, Mai Tau, expressed her sadness and pain in relation to the realities of migrant educators who sometimes go for many months without a salary, and yet life still has to go on. She explained:

Sometimes when one is just starting out, payments from the departments of education could take up to eight months while verification of legibility to work and stay goes on. That is a painfully long period to wait considering many of us have children and

families to take care of as well as other needs such as accommodation and clothing and food.

Migrant teachers face financial challenges because of lack of reliable income. This makes it difficult to pay for their accommodation, food and school fees for their children. At the same time, lack of secure employment makes it impossible to secure loans from financial institutions. Most migrant teachers were unable to access loans from reputable lending institutions. They are considered high risk due to their lack of permanent employment (as short-term contracts are favoured by schools). In addition, they are not considered long term residents and rely on temporary permits to remain in the country (legally). This leaves them ineligible to obtain accounts at retail stores. Their precarious employment situation makes it unfavourable for them to get any funding. In times of financial crisis, teachers resort to borrowing money from *mashonisa* (unregistered lenders) who charge exorbitant interest rates. If they fail to pay, the *mashonisas* often resort to violence tactics to get their money back. In addition, lack of access to stable employment make it difficult to secure accommodation in prime neighbourhoods. As a result, most migrant teachers are condemned to informal settlements which are cheap, but have high crime rates and poor reticulation of bulk services. More so, because of their precarious employment, it is difficult for migrant teachers to buy any property on a loan unless they buy it cash, which is impossible given their short-term contracts.

A lack of labour unions for migrant educators

Migrant educators are always made contract workers and will not get permanent positions in the schools. Due to their migrant status, they have less bargaining power as most of them do not belong to any unions. This often makes them vulnerable to exploitation by their employer without a recourse or support from trade unions compared to their fellow counterparts who are South African citizens. From a personal experience, as an educator for the past eleven years in South Africa, the researcher can recall the various strategies used to exclude migrant teachers. These tactics also reveal the differences between the demands of the school and the prescripts of the department. For instance, in 2020 the researcher taught for four months, only to be told that the school should not have given me a contract because of uncertainties related to the Covid 19 pandemic and the resulting national lockdown. Apparently, the department had frozen the hiring of new teachers until the pandemic was over.

Contract positions are painful to both migrant and citizens, it is much graver for migrants as they lack bargaining power. As for the citizens their hope is in trade unions. As for the migrant

workers, they lack the power and as marginalised people do not have the capacity to mobilise citizens to protest on their behalf. In fact, they are accused of taking jobs from South Africans. Migrants in South Africa are also blamed for all social ills in society including selling drugs, unemployment, overloading the health system and committing crime despite that they are a small minority compared to the population of South African citizens. Crush (2022) believe that migrants are made scapegoats or are demonised for various urban ills such as crime and unemployment. Most migrants who come into South Africa whether documented or undocumented engage themselves in entrepreneur activities which contribute to the economy of the country and as such locals benefit from their cheap goods especially in the townships. According to Crush (2022), the presence of the small shop traders has been, on one hand, beneficial to low income consumers facing increasing economic hardships and who have come to depend on the low prices.

While a lack of job stability has been cited as one of the greatest problems faced by migrant teachers, the effects of short-term contracts in this occupation supersede questions of job stability. Karpouza and Emvalotis (2019) stated, in such work arrangements, both the employer and employee invest less in this relationship especially in security and continuity. This is true for the Department of Education in South Africa. While they make short-term contracts to both citizens and migrants, it mostly affects migrant educators regardless of how many years spent in the contract. An educator can start teaching a subject for a term and before his/her relationship with the learners is properly established, the educator loses that contract in the next term. It is better for the citizens whose contracts are converted to permanency after working in those contracts for three months. As a result, there is lack of continuity. There are poor relationships with tutors and support of students is lacking.

Tracey, one of the participants of this study, specifically identified the difficulties of short-termism. She highlighted that this impacts the progress of learners and that there was no opportunity to build the relationship with students. There was no long-term growth of students. Kathleen, another participant, stated that students lose out because there is no certainty. Although the global neoliberal economy is now shifting its focus from permanent or core positions to contract positions in some areas. The experiences of my participants were that they work on in contract positions for many years without a possibility to be eligible for permanent positions. A school can keep employing same person for a number of years without regard to any indifference that the person has worked for one month or ten years. There is no recognition of service offered even in improving the pass rate of learners at different levels.

This is what Leathwood and Read (2020) refer to as “short term academic casualization of labour.” The short-term academic casualization of labour is real and happens today in most universities and other academic institutions like schools. Casualization of labour refers to giving contracts to academic individuals and is marked by temporal and unequal power relationships. Furthermore, a study conducted by Douglass (2015) in the UK revealed that 54% of the academic staff was on insecure contracts and these were mainly women and people of colour. Thus, Bennet and Burke (2017) stated that the casualization of labour is underlined or characterized by social and cultural inequalities. This form of labour often marginalises already marginalised populations.

Numerous studies have been done on casualization of labour. Zheng (2018) noted that contracts are cheap. An examination of the labour process theory reveals that they could also call it the temporality of labour (Bagnardi & Maccarone, 2023). Labour casualization entails power relations, contractual status, short-termism, sociology of time and time is context specifics (Vidal, 2019). Adams (2013), on the other hand, wrote about the ‘five Cs’ of time namely, the creation of time to ‘human design’ or ‘clock time’, the control, colonization commodification and compression of time. Marx propounded that time is everything, time is money, time is technology of government (Douglas, 2015). Studies have also shown that the speed with which things are done defines capitalism in institutions as such the management in recent years is output driven. In this context educational institutions are seemingly mainly interested in results and do not care about the cultural and social wellbeing of the teachers; and this is clock-time management.

Karpouza and Emvalotis (2019) saw casualization of labour as reconstructing teaching as a poorly paid housework in the marketplace because the authorities view teaching and services as care work. The contract worker is marginalized, least powerful, lack status and bears the brunt of this status. They cannot belong to unions which can represent them, and they are at a weaker position to negotiate unless if they can engage lawyers to represent them. Migrant educators who have permanent residence status are not immune to discrimination. Citizens who occupy the same contract positions are protected by law, after teaching in contract positions for three months they should be converted to permanency (South African Democratic Teachers Union, 2021).

Chapter summary

It is comprehensible that South Africa has become a destination of choice for Zimbabweans because it has numerous pull aspects in addition to the push factors mentioned - such as its close vicinity and comparative government stability. Additionally, it is acknowledged that South Africa's increasing need for skilled, good teachers is compromising the delivery of high-quality education in the country. Regardless, this chapter has highlighted important challenges faced by Zimbabwean migrant teachers. These relate to overall job security and the precarity of labour. The main challenge that was experienced by most participants was that migrants are given short contracts ranging from three months to a year. Additionally, these short-term contracts take time to be processed. The situation is made worse because if an educator is given a contract for three months, the department officials take time to process it as they need to send the required documents to Home Affairs for verification. As a result of this, the migrant educator may end up getting paid in the third or fourth month. Sometimes the three-month contract is not renewed before they could have their salaries due to processing and verification. Thus, short term contracts deprive migrant teachers many economic benefits. This includes a lack of access to bank loans and accounts at stores.

CHAPTER 3

The manifestation of otherness and negative immigrant sentiments

Introduction

Murenje (2020) alludes to the fact that discrimination against migrants in South Africa has caused a challenge for the well-known, and supposedly widely embraced, concept of Ubuntu. Murenje (2020) notes that Ubuntu means humanness. However, this humanness seemingly is not always extended to the migrant community since some South Africans display negative sentiments to the migrants in the form of exclusion, deprivation, name calling, discrimination, assault and even death. Perpetual attacks as well as discrimination of the African migrant in South Africa has shown that the concept and spirit of Ubuntu has been discarded by some people. The belief that African migrants in particular put a strain on the South African social services as well as on jobs in the country play a vital role in creating negative attitude towards migrants. The migrants are treated as ‘other’ human beings not supposed to live in South Africa. In total dismay and disagreement of how African migrants are treated in South Africa, the Secretary of United Nations Antonio Guterres (2019) argued that migrants played a vital role in transformational economics of the continent. Sustainable economic goals for the African continent can be achieved if migrant workers were positively received by countries. Nonetheless, the experiences and discrimination suffered by migrants at the hands of some xenophobic South Africans, though nauseating, are real.

The researcher's own experiences of coaching grade sevens for an English competition in the schools in the area which covers more than 20 schools and coming up first bringing a big trophy for the best English teacher and certificates for the learners. When announcing at assembly the principal failed to acknowledge my efforts and preferred to acknowledge the grade six teacher for the performance instead. The voucher and invitation given to me to go to the Department with all the other teachers whose teams won in other circuits was subsequently given to the grade six teacher. I assumed that they gave her the voucher because I am a migrant and was not entitled to benefit from it because another migrant teacher like me whose team won was given the invitation to go to the department and she certainly attended the celebrations for the winners. It was not the first time something like this had happened.

The first time was when I got a sponsorship from my German friends who sent school shoes, socks, pens, pencils and water bottles for 100 learners. After collecting the parcels from the Post Office which were addressed to me, I took them to the principal. It was never acknowledged and were distributed without my knowledge. When I requested pictures of learners receiving the goodies, as requested by the sponsors, I was informed that no pictures were taken when the goods were distributed.

The third incident was when the supervisor of PEP Store donated sanitary pads for the girls upon my request. When I brought them to school, they formed a committee of teachers who would see to the distribution of the pads. Apparently, they included all the grade 5, 6 and 7 lady teachers but neglected to include me. These events evoked feelings of exclusion and discrimination.

Xenophobia

South Africa has been a troubled terrain of xenophobic violence (Crush, 2022). Murenje (2020) define xenophobia as negative social representations and practices against foreign nationals. Crush (2022) argues that in South Africa, migrants have not yet been accepted. Dodson (2010) highlighted the 2008 brutal attacks of mainly Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa. Zimbabwean teachers were not spared in the attacks. Some died as a result of the injuries from these hostile attacks. Dodson (2010) notes that there is a seed of hostility planted among Africans to the extent that migrants experience different kinds of attacks on a daily basis in South Africa. Thus, in the context of South Africa, the issue of migrants is a very sensitive one. Hourani, Jarrallah and Block (2022) call such type of violence, that is repeatedly carried out on immigrant's, symbolic violence. Whilst most of my participants did not experience this symbolic violence in the Western Cape, other educators in KwaZulu Natal and Gauteng were not so fortunate.

Dodson (2010) further postulates that the xenophobic attacks that took place in May 2008 were based on the perceptions that migrants are outsiders or foreigners to a community, society, school or otherwise. The negative and prejudiced attitudes toward migrants has emerged in the form of physical attacks, verbal attacks as evidenced by the use of the degrading name "Makwerekwere", segregation, isolation, discrimination and deprivation. The sporadic attack of foreign national by South African indigenous communities for allegedly taking South African jobs and causing resource shortages is therefore a clear sign of hate and discrimination. Teachers have not been exempted from these negative perceptions. Like many other migrants,

they are often treated with disdain and sometimes experience embedded xenophobia, discrimination and racism in the workplace - as evidenced by the varied and painful experience narrated by the participants of this study.

Crush (2022) highlighted how corruption and fears of unemployment act as sites of resistance for immigration in South Africa. However, he stated that these are the main components of opposing immigration globally and they are therefore not unique to South Africa. However, this was not only unique to South Africans but a global issue (Crush, 2022). Vearey, Modisenyane, Hunter-Adamsiv (2017) (cited in Matenga 2020) also noted that the vulnerability of migrants is heightened by lack of documents. Hungwe (2020) highlighted how institutions of the state such as the police, education departments and home affairs officials show xenophobia and discrimination to migrants in South Africa. These are reflected in the narratives recounted by my participants.

Having migrated from Zimbabwe due to different circumstances, Zimbabwean teachers acquired different official documents ranging from one month stay awarded at the port of entry, asylum seeker/refugee permits, quota work permit and Zimbabwe Special Permit that subsequently changed its name to Zimbabwe Exemption Permit after four years. However, those who had one month stay and could not acquire proper permits stayed undocumented. Others struggled to have their documents renewed after they had expired due to South Africa's restrictive immigration laws which made it difficult in finding teaching jobs. Life has not been rosy too for those with permits as they found it difficult to find teaching jobs. They end up doing any menial jobs. All the participants have now been in South Africa for more than 10 years. Some of them have taught in both private and public schools and they have different experiences. Others only found work in public schools.

One participant, Mai Tau, explained how she was the only black teacher at her school which is located in a historically Coloured group area and, similar to many other areas, the local demographic remains defined by this category. In addition, she was also the only migrant teacher at her school. Her colleagues address her as auntie instead of teacher/ madam or Mrs. This method of addressing her has been adopted by learners and non-teaching staff. Respect by learners was demoralising as one day one of the learners called her auntie and she felt very traumatised. Mai Tau stated that no one has seen anything wrong with how she is addressed. She feels additionally suspicious of her status in relation to the other teachers based on the fact that cleaning staff at the school will clean the classrooms of her colleagues but will leave her

classroom in order for her to clean it herself. Mai Tau feels that the treatment she is getting from school is a form of Xenophobia. She feels that she is really an outsider and each morning when she thinks of going to school she hesitates.

The interesting observation from South Africa is that xenophobia is not just a grassroots problem (Masikane, Hewitt and Toendepi, 2020). State representatives propagate xenophobia in different institutions which spread to parents and learners. Mai Tai reflected on her vulnerability to sentiments emanating from government level and South African society that filtered down to her location of work:

I did not want to use the word xenophobia. Lately we have seen what I would want to call Zimbo-phobia. Some targeted hatred against Zimbabweans and it has been trending on Twitter for days, where a group of South Africans were protesting against Zimbabwe Special Permit (ZSP) renewals. ZSP permits were given to the Zimbabwean undocumented migrants who came to South Africa initially as cross border traders and later decided not to go back to Zimbabwe in an effort to regularise their stay in South Africa. The permits had a life span of 4 years and when they expired changed their name to Zimbabwe Exemption Permit. Such kind of information is easy to get as parents or fellow teachers get hold of it, some will be joking about it while others will make sure you know where they stand on the matter. That creates vulnerability and definitely emotional distress. These jobs are what keeps us here. The locals feel they should be doing those jobs so yes that's where all the commotion is emanating from, Xenophobia.

Discrimination and exclusion emerged from grassroots, learners, non-teaching staff, cleaners, cooks, teachers, school management to the departmental level. Mai Tau experienced discrimination when parents were coming to school to request that their children from grade one not be put in Mai Tau's class in grade two because she is not coloured. Instead of protecting Mai Tau and failing to explain to the parents the department policy of not choosing who they want to teach their children, the principal gave in to the parents request for the few who wanted a coloured teacher. The principal became a perpetrator of racism, discrimination and exclusion. She was an accomplice in the process of discrimination. These types of behaviours occur at the department level as well. Officials tend to deny access to services arguing that foreigners are taking resources reserved for citizens of South Africa. Derogatory statements are made towards non-nationals as echoed by Mai Tau who is addressed as auntie instead of teacher or Mrs at her school. She stated that these forms of othering in the workplace are not always explicit. It

comes in many forms, many which are demeaning and undermining to Zimbabwean migrant teachers.

The South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC 2010, p. 7) argued that xenophobia was intensely immersed in prejudgement and discrimination. The severe economic circumstances in South Africa, with concerning levels of unemployment and widespread poverty, additionally play a major role in the anti-immigrant attitude. Due to rising poverty and resource shortages, some claim that immigrants are stealing jobs from locals hence government officials may perpetrate anti-immigrant sentiment silently. The participants for this study all spoke to the varied ways in which they perceived anti-immigrant sentiments to affect them in the workplace. For Mau Tau it manifested in the way she was addressed by her colleagues and students and the way in which cleaning staff seemingly refused to clean her classroom, yet offered this service to other teachers. For another participant, Mhizha who has taught at the same high school for more than 10 years and has acquired a Permanent Residence Permit and a green Identity Document (ID), these anti-immigrant sentiments were experienced when his principal tried to convert his contract from contract to permanency. The paperwork got missing despite the principal's effort to complete it three times. The application continued to disappear without anyone at the Department of Education offices taking responsibility. The principal even accompanied Mhizha to the Department to find out what was happening with the forms and also why he was not being paid. The department promised to look into the matter but nothing materialised. In my own case the principal did not want to sign my contract forms because she claimed that the school was looking for someone suitable for the job so that unemployed South Africans could get employed. A day before we closed schools in second term in June 2022 some of the teachers who sympathised with me informed me that there were interviews for my position which were taking place in the staff room which I did not know about. Again, on the day we closed nothing was mentioned about me leaving the school after teaching at that school for nine years. The principal called me to the office to tell me not to come back in third term. It really shocked me to see how my case was handled. The other teachers only realised that I was no longer a teacher there when they did not see me in third term. I experienced it as discrimination.

Xenophobia has been escalating in South Africa as citizens fight all foreigners documented or undocumented. Zimbabweans have been particularly targeted by xenophobia. Tawodzera and Crush (2023) reports that many young people believe foreigners are a problem for the country. With the negative attacks perpetrated on foreign nationals by the vigilante group "Dudula",

many poor South African nationals feel that their issues of poverty and unemployment which the government has failed to address will now be solved by sending the Zimbabweans home. Since Dudula has become prominent, most South Africans seem to be supporting Dudula's agenda of chasing migrants out of South Africa and return to their countries of origin. Sango observed that at her school she hears other teachers discussing the issues claimed by Dudula that sending foreigners to their countries would pave the way for many South African citizens getting employed. They only start the types of discussions when they see her. This, according to Sango, is another form of xenophobia as these discussions in her presence are meant to frustrate her.

Exploitation, discrimination and exclusion

According to Lawrence (2013), "although immigration may be anticipated or may be a 'turning leaf' for a majority of people, economic success cannot be guaranteed for migrants." Migrants in general, and similarly migrant teachers, face exploitation, discrimination and exclusion. Zimbabwe migrant educators are given challenging tasks which the nationals run away from so that if they fail the tasks, the blame is shouldered by the Zimbabwean educator. The fact that they want to expose the migrant educator when a task fails shows it is a form of discrimination and xenophobia. Sango stated:

There are some grades for example grade 3, grade 6 that are tested by the department in a systemic exam, and nobody wants to teach those classes. When the results are out at the end of the year will have a strong bearing on the respective teachers for those classes. So, you will see that most South Africans don't want to go to those classes because when results come, it seems as if you are the one who wrote the test. Because of this, the examinable classes are given to migrant educators. Nationals take grades 1 and 2 but they don't put a lot of effort and when they come to grade 3 it will be the challenge for the migrant educator to teach what was supposed to have been taught in grades 1 and 2 plus the work for grade 3 which will be examined.

At my school I was given an overload of work taking History and Geography from another teacher to make my weekly periods seventy-six, and yet a teacher can only have fifty-five periods in a week according to the Department of Education. I would teach the extra periods when the school was out after three o'clock. This was very devastating and tiring.

Makula (2023) reveals how migrants experience difficulties of assimilating into a different culture. Maury (2019) notes how lack of knowledge on prevailing salary rates, work habits, legal conventions make foreigners vulnerable to exploitation and mistreatment. Many migrant educators express their sentiments in the Zimbabwean teachers whatsapp group.

Furthermore, for several migrant teachers, constructing a home is an investment, and sending their children to an exceptional good school is indeed an investment throughout their children's future lives. All these dreams become futile because there is little or no hope of getting employment as an educator in South African schools. Moyo (2021) notes that despite having their qualifications recognised by the South African Qualifications Authority migrant teachers are making a living through informal jobs. Zimbabwean teachers also experience exploitative circumstances in private schools through not being paid adequate salaries in comparison to South African teachers with little recourse for legal action making them destitute.

The same observations were made by Mhizha, a participant of this study. While he acted as Head of Department (HOD) for three years, he has never been paid for that position because he is a foreigner. Mhizha's forms for permanent employment also disappeared in the department yet the School Governing Board (SGB) had approved his permanency. This indicates that the job situation now and again shows qualities of intolerance, discrimination and exclusion particularly in the distribution of teaching posts at schools. The posts held by migrant teachers are frequently altered to protect the jobs of indigenous teachers. As the researcher, I also experienced this when I won a trophy for being the best English teacher in the circuit. Attached to the trophy was a voucher that was given to me, but I did not open the envelope where it was. I just presented everything to the principal who decided to give the voucher to the indigenous educator who teaches grade 6 English as it was an invitation to some place. This clearly showed me that even if I had known where the voucher was, if I had asked her, she probably would have told me that it was for a South African citizen.

The high qualifications and expertise of Zimbabwean immigrant teachers have not helped them in securing employment in South Africa and they have settled for menial jobs in order to survive.

Discrimination in the duration of contracts awarded to citizens and migrants is common. For example, a citizen with an identity document is given a contract of a year which is renewable annually, while a migrant is given a contract for three months which is renewed every three months. Mhizha explained:

I obtained my permanent residency permit and green identity document in 2015 but all that did not change my situation, I continued getting three months contracts different from the one-year contracts given to nationals with ID like mine.

The process is very frustrating to migrant educators as it may mean that they will not get a salary in the first month of the contract as the processing takes time (Bense, 2016; Maury, 2019). Xenophobia and discrimination posed challenges to the participants' stay. Most of the migrant educators lived in constant fear of xenophobic violence. *"You don't know if you will survive the next xenophobic attack,"* explained Mzukuru. This is so because Mzukuru witnessed a neighbour who was a Zimbabwean national being attacked during the 2008 xenophobic attacks on foreign nationals in a township she was staying and how her landlord protected her by hiding her inside her house. She was terrified at the time. It could be argued that skilled immigrant populations face discrimination on the job market. That prejudice is based on racial affinity, physical characteristics, social standing, and legal standing.

However, it appears that there has not been much research on how highly qualified immigrant workers' hiring patterns are affected. It is however noted that all migrant educators who seek employment as educators are qualified with either diplomas or degrees. Discrimination was experienced by most participants and also on other immigrant employees and that has shed some insight into the current situation wherein the immigrants are treated unfairly by their employers, because they are immigrants. The current issue is understudied, as evidenced by the fact that most studies have concentrated on low-skilled or undereducated immigrants (Behtoui, 2007). The information provided by the participants is absent in academic literature hence the migrant educators have continued to suffer in silence. It is these kinds of stories that reveal the struggle of migrant educators.

There is this sense of being labelled as a Kwerekwere, as Mhizha stated in his account of his experiences. He stated: *"Even our colleagues refer to us as such. In fact, I have just accepted the way they call me, and I have stopped worrying about it."* Additionally, four participants of this study claimed to have encountered *"a distinct sort of xenophobia"* in classrooms. Muzukuru said, *"It's a little subtler; it's not a physical attack; it's more of a professional xenophobia."* Sango described forms of discrimination that she has experienced in the workplace in the following manner:

You discover that the principal gives certain information to nationals not to migrant educators. The information may be something to do with the visits of Department officials so that they prepare for them, and migrants will be caught unaware. Secondly, migrants may not get resources from the school such as charts, white board markers and red pens ending up using their own money to buy and yet nationals will be given for free.

These reports point to the fact that the participants felt unappreciated by some of their South Africa colleagues, who often treated them with suspicion and contempt. Xenophobia colours the experiences of migrant teachers in South Africa and is a recurring theme in the study of migrant experience. Thirteen teachers from two significant urban areas and one rural district in KwaZulu-Natal were the subject of Manik's (2013) study on xenophobia among migrant Zimbabwean teachers in the province. According to the study, xenophobia caused social and professional isolation in migrant teachers, which leads to psychological suffering. It was determined as a result that migrant teachers long for socio-professional justice and consideration in how they are treated.

Language Challenges

All participants had the experience of working in schools where English was the medium of instruction although these schools were located in areas where communities spoke either Xhosa or Afrikaans which the educators were not competent in. In most of the schools where the schools were the community spoke Xhosa or Afrikaans, the teachers, management and non-teaching staff ended up using the local language spoken there instead of using the official language of instruction which the migrant educators were competent in. The researcher experienced this as Xhosa was used in all communication channels at school where she taught. She felt excluded and discriminated as she always missed out on very important issues she should attend to like the rest of the educators.

All meetings were conducted and deliberated in Xhosa. Very important issues were discussed in these meetings. Due to my lack of understanding and speaking the language, I would ask several times for clarification and interpretation, but it was very difficult to be assisted and on most occasions some staff members would just shout that I needed to learn the language as they did not want to speak English. I ended up stopping to ask them to interpret. The use of the Xhosa language disadvantaged me a

lot as sometimes I would miss deadlines given for certain activities. Sometimes in morning briefings they would come with circulars from the department informing us of very important issues and dates but instead of reading the circulars to us to hear for ourselves, the principal would just say what was in the circular in Xhosa having read it in the office. There was also a WhatsApp group for sending announcements and all the communication was done in Xhosa and sometimes security announcements were sent, and I would miss some of the things because of the language barrier.

Learning local languages was the first coping strategy proposed by participants. Sango reported that she had to learn Afrikaans quickly and this improved her interaction with colleagues and parents. In a statement Sango said:

Lack of language proficiency limits your ability to interact with other teachers as they do not want to speak in Eng. I have noticed that when one tries speaking their language in informal conversations, they try to embrace you and their attitudes change for better.

The participants also encountered language barriers in both the communities where the migrant educators lived and the schools where they taught. All the participants were teaching at schools where English was the official medium of communication while the schools were located in areas where the communities were using either Xhosa or Afrikaans. What was frustrating to most of the participants was the use of a language that was not the official medium of communication at schools they taught. At my school the language of communication was English, but Xhosa was mostly used for all the communication. Xhosa was used in all official meetings. I was never considered when deliberations were done in Xhosa even when very important issues were discussed. Sometimes I would request the person chairing the meeting to use English but blatantly they would tell me to learn the language as they themselves did not want to speak in English. I would wait for the meeting to end then I would ask a friend to tell me what would have been discussed

Eight out of ten participants admitted that they were not familiar with the local language(s) that their students and the local population frequently spoke. The learners did not speak fluent English, despite the fact that all the participants were teachers in English-medium schools. As a result, they claimed that they felt under pressure to adopt the code-switching technique used in the classroom by their South African counterparts. Masibanda explained:

I wish I knew their language so I could explain, but I don't. As a result, I would ask one learner to clarify in their own language, but I still couldn't verify that they understood what she was saying.

The bulk of the participants also used this method, employing the learners as interpreters. Some participants also mentioned how students would take advantage of the fact that the teachers did not speak their native tongues to make fun of them once they realized it. In this regard Mainini stated: *"In my first school, they could insult me in the local language, knowing that I don't understand what they are saying."*

A few participants remarked that because certain school meetings were held in a language they did not understand, they felt alienated from them. Masibanda said: *"You can have individuals at a meeting, and they use local languages."* Meanwhile Sango explained: *"I typically avoid townships due to the language barrier."* Townships are densely populated suburban areas where the lower middle class and working class predominate and a variety of native languages are spoken. The migrant teachers' inability to communicate in the most widely spoken languages also constrained where they could live and work. Instead, Mkwasha decided to reside and work in the medium density suburbs where English is more often spoken.

Language is essential to communicate amongst colleagues and also with students, especially when teaching. Both immigrant and local students are frustrated by their inability to converse with each other seeing as they would rather play with children to whom they can interact and are familiar with.

Lack of respect by learners

The participants of this study also spoke of how teachers were challenged in the classroom by the South African students. Muroora said in a frustrated tone: *"The South African child is 10 times more energetic and noisier than the Zimbabwean children, and they just do not want to learn."* The learners were described as usually lacking respect for migrant educators when they were aware of their migrant status. The learners were described by the participants as, among other things, "intimidating," "ill-disciplined," "disruptive," and "difficult to regulate." Participants noticed that the way the learners respond to the South African teachers was different from how they respond to migrant educators. They lack respect and sometimes can

shout words like Kwerekwere during the lessons and start laughing. Muroora said: *"At the end of the day, all you can do is shout and shout, begging them to keep quiet."*

There were no effective disciplinary procedures available, in the opinion of the migrant teachers, to influence the disruptive students' behaviour. For instance, Mai Vari expressed her displeasure that the students *"...shelter behind their rights to evade punishment."* Additionally, the majority of the migrant educators bemoaned the absence of induction in South African schools. Induction entails that the migrant educator would be given a familiarisation process on how the teacher would do things according to the requirements of the department and also according to the school's requirements. Issues of how to interpret the curriculum are not explained to the migrant teachers. They only understand it after asking every time when they ask for clarity or after attending subject workshops that are rarely organised by the department. Induction will also give direction to the migrant educator on how to handle issues related to learners such as disciplinary issues. According to Mainini, the main cause of migrant teachers' "struggling" in Western Cape schools is the absence of induction programs. Many schools only hire one or two migrant teachers each year and believe that implementing induction programs would be time-consuming and expensive.

Familiarity and loneliness

According Fokkema and Ciobanu (2021) loneliness is the feeling that a person has when their favoured socialization group and actual social network are different. Particularly, loneliness is still a purely debatable encounter, in contrast to social separation, which refers to the honest portrayal of a person's social connections. Even if one has a big social connectivity and a large number of social interactions, one may feel lonely; conversely, one may have few social connections but again not experience loneliness (Jang and Tang, 2021).

Mhizha's situation was a bit different because he had a very supportive principal who from time to time emphasised the need to accommodate him by using the official language acceptable especially during meeting so that he was not left out. On occasions like Heritage Day, she would take time to explain the need for people to embrace our diversities. Indeed, Mhizha gained a lot of friends.

While loneliness and social isolation are not limited to specific groups or ages, recent research suggests that migration may be a risk factor (Burholt et al. 2020; Fokkema and Ciobanu, 2021; Jang and Tang, 2021). As migrant workers, migration can be a risk factor, according to recent

studies, even though loneliness and social isolation are not limited to particular groups or ages (ibid). As migrants depart from their hometowns and friends, their community social networks may be relatively small and less fulfilling in the host nation (Jang and Tang, 2021). Migrant teachers may phone or attempt to travel home frequently to overcome their loneliness. This can present itself as a financial burden for the migrant teacher as a result of the trips made to the home country.

Culture Shock

According to Barney and Yoshimura (2020), losing one's social network and cultural identity can result in a grief reaction. Language (particularly informal language and vernacular), behaviours, principles, social systems, and community ties are all lost during migration. Cultural loneliness has been described by Eisenbruch (1991) as:

"the encounter of the internally displaced person or collective from loss of social systems, cultural norms and identity: the individual or community remains living in the past, is attended by higher powers from past while fully conscious or sleeping."

Participants of this study experienced this culture shock when they had to deal with their situations for instance during meetings there was when there was a switch from a language a migrant could comprehend to a language they could not understand. Sango being a teacher at an English school situated in an Afrikaans community used to get frustrated but she realised that the only way to solve this was to learn their language. When she started learning their language, it changed the whole situation as some of the educators' changed their attitudes towards her. The same sentiments were echoed by Mai Tau who also teaches at a similar school. For her was when learners could pass remarks in Afrikaans which she could not understand in her presence and then start laughing. She felt traumatised.

Chapter summary

In this chapter anti-immigration issues are the thorn in the flesh that has been paining Zimbabwean migrant educators in South Africa. Language barriers, non-renewal of permits and low salaries are some of the issues that bring out the fact that South Africa has anti-immigration issues that are greatly affecting migrant teachers in a negative way. The next chapter will present the recommendations and conclusion of this study.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusion

This study was conducted to explore the experiences of migrant teachers working in Cape Town schools. The fragility of the Zimbabwean migrant educators was clear from the accounts offered by participants during interviews. The participants expressed their displeasure at how their dignity and human rights were lost as their rights were violated by the people they worked with - including the learners they taught.

While the injustice of migrant teachers' contract terms was the main focus, other issues, including the Department of Home Affairs' inefficiency, social exclusion, discrimination, resentment of migrant teachers, social networks, and chain migration were also important findings that related to the experience of the participants. It is believed that the findings of this study will help to illuminate the experiences of migrant teachers in Cape Town schools. The Department of Basic Education circular provided proof that anti-foreigner sentiments are pervasive in South Africa and are visible among students, educators, and the general population in this country. It is government's responsibility to have a mechanism of monitoring how negativity towards migrants is eradicated in schools and government departments. The issue of permits which is in the public domain targeting mainly Zimbabweans has exacerbated the already heart-breaking situation

Permits and contracts should be processed with the necessary urgency as the delays cause a lot of suffering. Mai Vari did not get her salary for six months and when she finally got it as lump sum her principal borrowed R16 000 from her. When she asked for her money after a few months her contract was terminated. This shows the extent to which migrant educators are exploited by locals. The issue of contracts should be addressed by the Department of Education and government as a whole. One becomes permanent after acquiring a Permanent Resident Permit or ID. After Mhizha got his ID, he was given forms to change his employment status from contract to permanent. He took his forms to the department. However, after following up after three months the department told his principal that his forms could not be found. The process was repeated three times and the same story was told. It is the government's responsibility to have a record of those that should be converted to permanency after acquiring the needed documents. Such information should be in their data base and when a person is due for conversion, it should just be done from their system.

This study is intended to increase migrant teachers' acceptance among co-workers and students while reducing opposition to their presence in South Africa. Additionally, the Department of Basic Education requires exerting more effort in educating native South African teachers and students about the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol and how to integrate and recognise migrant teachers for the value they add to education in South Africa. In order to satisfy the rights of everyone who works there, schools must modify their ethos in response to the influx of migrant instructors into the local educational system. Although this is clearly stated in the South African Constitution, local government organisations must be aware of how to incorporate human rights considerations into their practises and policies.

Although it is also important for the migrants to learn the local language, their failure to learn it at a faster pace does not mean the local teachers, cleaners and cooks should discriminate against them by using a language they cannot comprehend. The researcher experienced exclusion through the use of Xhosa, which is not the school medium of communication, in all meetings and notices. The lack of understanding subsequently resulted in missing out on important issues raised and missing internal deadlines. The Department of Education should be strict about the school's language policy. Schools should adhere to the requirements of the department by using the language for required as official so that no one should be excluded on the basis of their understanding of the language. Therefore, meetings and official communication should be done in the official language prescribed.

The study confirmed the views of push pull factor theory which suggests that political and socio-economic stability of the host country may 'pull' migrants to the host country. However, the envisaged benefits of such stability are seldom realised by Zimbabwean migrant educators. Instead of realising a significant improvement in standards of living, violence encountered by the migrants results in a deterioration of living standards through treatment which does not benefit a professional of such a standing.

Though discrimination is affecting all migrants, institutionalised discrimination is prevalent for Zimbabwean migrants, evident from frequent changes in permit statuses which targets Zimbabweans and affects their potential to secure permanent employment. Due to the shortage hiring model in use for Zimbabwean migrant teachers in South Africa, employers have greater flexibility and do not exercise restraint in their unfavourable treatment of migrant teachers. This applies to both the public schools and private sector employers as there is no distinction in the provision of short-term contracts and hiring and firing of teachers. The Zimbabwean

migrant teachers are in a dilemma whereby they are ‘pushed’ by unfavourable conditions in their country of origin, and ‘pulled’ by seemingly better opportunities in South Africa, which are proving difficult for them to realise.

What makes the Zimbabwean migrant educators’ case significant is the predominance of legal violence and bureaucratic violence which is not so common in other cases. The level of discrimination is institutionalised, commencing at high levels of authority and propagated to the workplace and community level. While in other countries where discrimination is rife in the community and workplace, migrants find protection from those in authority, yet the Zimbabwean migrants’ scenario in South Africa is unfortunate. This implies that without a transformation in institutions meant to curb violence targeted on migrants and clarity of policy communication, security of job tenure for Zimbabwean migrant teachers may continue to be unwarranted, and the envisaged benefits of migration unrealised.

Recommendations

A variety of institutional structures in South Africa, many of which are government structures should consider the following:

- Government institutions must be considerate to the amount of contribution made by migrant educators and their input they have put to the Education system of South Africa. This is so because while the migrant educators are offering South Africa a good education, they also have a life to live and so consideration should be taken to make sure that their lives also matter.
- Education department must consider offering permanent positions to migrant educators with the skills that are needed by the education system so that they fill up the gaps created by the South African who leave their positions for something else when migrant educators obtain the needed documents. This will reduce the struggle faced by migrant educators while they are in a foreign land. It will also make them have a decent life when they are able to purchase their own homes and they will be able to educate their own children.
- The Department of Education must offer longer-term contracts, a minimum of one-year contracts, in order for migrant educators to be able to have decent life. Short term contracts give migrants a sense of hesitation hence when they know that they are secure they will be able to plan their lives too.

- Teacher Unions should allow migrant teachers to join unions even in a contract in order to protect the rights of migrant teachers and to give them a platform to voice their opinions.
- DHA: must fast track adjudication of visa applications. This will make life easy for the teachers to get their contracts and salaries processed fast so that they maintain a decent life with dignity.
- DBE: the department must offer opportunities for migrant teachers teaching scarce skills. Acknowledging the good work done by migrant educators will motivate them to do more.
- DBE: must offer opportunities to convert recurrent contracts into permanent employment. South Africa has become their new home hence they need to live with confidence without fear of losing their jobs any time.

References

- Amin, MA. & Greenwood, J. 2019. The Un Sustainable development Goals and teacher development for effective English teaching in Bangladesh: A gap that needs bridging. *Journal of teacher education for sustainability*, 20(2) 118 – 138.
- Amnesty International. 2018. *South Africa: Ten years after xenophobic killings, refugees and migrants still living in fear* [Online]. Available at:
<https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2022/07/south-africa-ten-years-after-xenophobic-killings-refugees-and-migrants-still-living-in-fear/>
- Aptekar, S. & Hsin, A. 2022. Stratified entry into illegality: how Immigration policy shapes being documented. *Social forces*, soac125.
- Bagnardi & Maccarone, 2023. New directions in labour process theory. *Sociologia Del Lavono* N. 167(3), 2023.
- Barney, KA. and Yoshimura, SM. 2020. Death related grief and disenfranchised identity: A communication approach. *Review of communication research*, 8, 78 – 95.
- Behtoui, A. 2007. The distribution and return of social capital: Evidence from Sweden. *European Societies*, 9(3): 383-407.
- Bense, K.G.M. 2016. International teacher mobility and migration: The exploration of a global phenomenon. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Western Australia.
- Changbao, K. and Thompson, S. 2020. *Sampling theory and practice*. 10.1007/978-3-030-44246-0.
- Comprendio, LJ. & Savski, K. 2020. ‘Asians’ and ‘Westerners’: examining the perception of ‘(non-)native’ migrant teachers of English in Thailand. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 41(8), 673-685.
- Creswell, J. 2019. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods*. London: Sage publication.
- Crush, J. 2022. Xenophobia denialism and the global compact for migration in South Africa. *International Development Policy*, <https://doi.org/10.4000/poldev.4824>.

- Daid, RM. & Nowlan, E. 2021. Barriers to recognition for migrant teachers in Ireland. *European Educational Research Journal*, 21(2).
- Dean, J. 2019. Does it matter if immigrants work in jobs related to their education? *Journal of development and migration*, 8(7).
- Desai, RM. & Rudra, N. 2019. Trade, poverty and social protection in developing countries. *European journal of political economy*, 60, doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2018.08.008
- Dodson, B. 2010. Locating Xenophobia: Debate, discourse, and everyday experience in Cape Town, South Africa. *South Africa Today*, 56(3), 2-22.
- Eisenbruch, M. 1991. From post-traumatic stress disorder to cultural bereavement: diagnosis of Southeast Asian refugees. *Social Science & Medicine*, 33(1):673–680.
- Ennerberg, E. & Economou, C. 2020. Migrant teachers and the negotiation of a (new) teaching identity. *European Journal of teacher education*, 44(4), 587 – 600.
- Ennerberg, E. & Economou, C. 2021. Migrant teachers and the negotiation of a (new) teaching identity. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 44(4): 587-600.
- Ennerberg, E. & Economou, C. 2022. Career adaptability among migrant teachers re-entering the labour market: a life course perspective. *Vocat learn.*: 15(2), 341 – 357.
- Farmer, P. 2004. An anthropology of structural violence. *Current anthropology*, 45(3): 305–325.
- Finn, V. & de Reguero, SU. 2020. Inclusive language for exclusive policies: restrictive migration governance in Chile. *Latin American policy*, 11(1), 42 – 61
- Fokkema, T. & Ciobanu, RO. 2021. Older migrants and loneliness” scanning the field and looking forward. *Eur J Ageing*, 18, 291 – 297.
- Grebeniyk, A. Aleshkovski, I. & Maksimova, A. 2022. The impact of labour migration on human capital development. *Tijuana ene inter* vol. 12. Doi.org/10.33679/rmi.v1i1.2190.
- Green, W. 2014. Employment of migrant teachers in public schools in South Africa. In Keevy, J., Green, W. & Manik, S. (eds.). *The status of migrant teachers in South Africa: Implications for policy, research, practice*. Waterkloof, South Africa: South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA).

- Gutman, M., Jayusi, W., Beck, M. & Bekerman, Z. 2023. *To Be a Minority Teacher in a Foreign Culture Empirical Evidence from an International Perspective*: Switzerland: Springer.
- Guzi, M., Kahanec, M. & Ulceluse, M. 2021. *Europe's migration experience and its effects on economic inequality*. Institute of labour economics, IZA DP No. 14041.
- Hourani, J., Jarrallah, Y., Block, K. 2022. How structural and symbolic violence during resettlement impacts the cosila and mental wellbeing of forced migrant women: the lived experiences of Arabic speaking survivors of IPV resettled in Mebourne, Australlia. *Confl Health* 16, 59.
- Huber, J., Hueber, L., & Kleinlercher, D. 2022. Acceptance or rejection of welfare migration – an experimental investigation. *SN Bus Econ* 2,179.
- Hungwe, C. 2020. Hanging in there: Zimbabwean migrant workers in Johannesburg. *Journal of community positive practices*, 20, 54 – 76.
- International Labour Organisation (ILO). 2021. Africa – Arab Tripartite Interregional Meeting on Labour Migration.
- Jang, H. and Tang, R. 2021. Loneliness, age at immigration, family relationships and depression among older immigrants: A moderated relationship. *Journal of social and personal relationships*, 39(6).
- Kim, G., Molina, US. & Saadi, MD. 2019. Should immigration status information be included in patient's helath record? *AMA J ethics*, 21(1), E8 – 16.
- Krause, S., Proyer, M. & Kremsner, G. (ed.) 2023. *The Making of Teachers in the Age of Migration Critical Perspectives on the Politics of Education for Refugees, Immigrants and Minorities*. Bloomsbury Publishing Plc: London.
- Makula, T. 2023. *Independent schools in South Africa: Acculturation of Zimbabwean immigrant teachers*. In: Gutman, M., Jayusi, W., Beck, M., Bekerman, Z. (eds) *To be a minority teacher in a foreign culture*. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-25584-7_12.

- Manik, S. 2013. Zimbabwean immigrant teachers in KwaZulu-Natal count the cost of going under the hammer. *Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of the Arts and Humanities in Southern Africa: Alternation*, 7: 67-77.
- Manik, S. 2014(a). “We are working hand to mouth”: Zimbabwean teachers’ experiences of vulnerability in South Africa. *Migracijske i Etničke Teme*, 30(2): 171-191.
- Manik, S. 2014(b). Professional experiences of migrant teachers in South Africa. In Keevy, K. Green, W. & Manik, S. (eds.). *The status of migrant teachers in South Africa: implications for policy, research, practice*. Pretoria: The South African Qualifications Association (SAQA). 105-120.
- Mapepa, P. & Adekoye, RA. 2019. Teacher Unemployment in Mugabe’s Zimbabwe: A Lesson for the Future? *JGIDA, Special Issue*, (2019), 169 – 181.
- Masikane, CM., Hewitt, ML. and Toendepi, J. 2020. Dynamics informing xenophobia and leadership response in South Africa. *Commer*, 20(1).
- Maury, O. 2019. Between a promise and a salary: student – migrant – workers’ experiences of precarious labour markets. *Work, Employment and Society*, 34(5), 809 – 825.
- McDevitt, SE. 2021. *Border lives: exploring the experiences of immigrant teachers teaching and caring for young immigrant children and families*. Doctorate thesis: Columbia University.
- Moyo, K. 2021. *South Africa reckons with its status as a top immigration destination, apartheid history, and economic challenges*. Migration Policy Institute (MPI).
- Moyo, Z. 2021. Narratives of Zimbabwean female teachers’ experience in South Africa. *African sociological review*, 25(2), 183 – 204.
- Murenje, M. 2020. Ubuntu and xenophobia in South Africa’s international migration. *African Journal of Social Work*, 10(1), 95 – 98.
- Nakphong, MK., Young, T., Morales, B., Guzman – Ruiz, IY., Chen, L. & Kietzman, K.G. 2022. Social exclusion at the intersections of immigration, employment and healthcare policy: A qualitative study of Mexican and Chinese immigrants in Carlifonia. *Social Science & Medicine*, 298.

- North, A. & Chase, E. 2023. *Education, Migration and Development Critical Perspectives in a Moving World*. Bloomsbury Publishing Plc: London.
- Nyakabawu, S. 2022. Legal Violence: Waiting for Zimbabwe Exemption Permit in South Africa. *Journal of Law, Society and Development*, 1-21.
- OECD 2019. *The Road to Integration: Education and Migration, OECD Reviews of Migrant Education*. OECD Publishing, Paris, <https://doi.org/10.1787/d8ceec5d-en>.
- Ong, A. 1999. *Flexible Citizenship: The Cultural Logics of Transnationality*. London: Duke University Press.
- Pham, NH., Tran, MD., Le, AD. & Le, TL. 2022. The impact of migration on Vietnam household living standards. *L. Risk Financial Manag.*, 15(5), 201.
- Risberg, A. & Romani, L. 2022. Underemploying highly skilled migrants: an organizational logic protecting corporate ‘normality’. *Human relations*, 75(4), 655 – 680.
- Rugunanan, P. & Xulu-Gama, N. 2022. *Migration in Southern Africa. IMISCOE Regional Reader*. Springer: Switzerland.
- Saunders, MNK., Lewis, P. & Thornhill, A. 2019. *Research Methods for business students*. 8th edition. Pearson: New York.
- Schweitzer, R. 2020. *How inclusive institutions enforce exclusive immigration rules: mainstream public service provision and the implementation of a hostile environment for irregular migrants living in Britain*. In: Hinger, S., Schweitzer, R. (eds) *Politics of (Dis)Integration*. IMISCOE Research Series. Springer, Cham.
- Tarisayi, KS. & Manik, S. 2020. From Periphery to Epicentre: The Resilience of Zimbabwean Immigrant Children Despite ‘Walking a tightrope’. *Alternation Special Edition*, 34 (2020) 286 – 308.
- Tawodzera, G. & Crush, J. 2023. ‘A foreigner is not a person in this country’: xenophobia and the informal sector in South Africa’s secondary cities. *Urban transform*, 5(2).
- Thet, KK. 2022. Pull and push factors of migration: a case study in the urban area of Monywa township, Myanmar.

- Urbanski, M. 2022. Comparing push and pull factors affecting migration. *Economies*, 10(1), 21.
- Vanyoro, K. 2023. The political work of migration governance binaries: Responses to Zimbabwean ‘Survival Migration’ at the Zimbabwe – South Africa border. *Refugee survey quarterly*, hdad006, <https://doi.org/10.1093/rsq/hdad006>.
- Vearey, J., Modisenyane, M. & Hunter-Adamsiv, J. 2017. Towards migration aware of health system in South Africa strategic opportunity to address health inequity. *South African Health Review*, 89-98.
- Vidal, M. 2019. Contradictions of the labour process, worker empowerment and capitalist inefficiency. *Historical materialism*, 28(2), 170 – 204.
- Vosloo, C. 2020. *Extreme apartheid: the South African system of migrant labour and its hostels*. University of Johannesburg: South Africa.
- Weda, Z. & de Villiers, R. 2019. *Migrant Zimbabwean teachers in South Africa: Challenging and rewarding issues*. Sotuh Africa.
- White, JA. & Rispel, LC. 2021. Policy exclusion or confusion? Perspectives on universal health coverage for migrants and refugees in South Africa. *Health policy and planning*, 36(8), 1292 – 1306.
- Zanabazar, A., Kho, NS. & Jigjiddori, S. 2021. The push and pull factors affecting the migration of Mongolians to the Republic of South Korea. *SHS Web of Conferences*, 90, 01023.