EVALUATION OF GENDER EQUITY PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION IN LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE

By

Nthabiseng Martha Nkoana

Thesis Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

Master of Public Administration

at

Stellenbosch University

Department: School of Public Management and Planning

Faculty: Economic and Management Science

Supervisor: Professor A.P.J. Burger

Date: December 2010
DECLARATION

By submitting this thesis electronically, I declare that the entirety of the work contained therein is my own, original work, that I am the owner of the copyright thereof (unless to the extent explicitly otherwise stated) and that I have not previously in its entirety or in part submitted it for obtaining any qualification.

Date: 17 June 2010
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It has been quite a journey to complete this study. I would not have made it if it was not for the support I received throughout my study. I appreciate the various contributions to this work and I dedicate special thanks to:

God, the Creator, for the sanity, and above all the gift of life;
My late grandmother, to whom I owe my success. I will always respect your courage;
My parents, your love and belief in my abilities kept me going even when it was tough;
My family and friends for believing in me even when I was losing hope;
My husband and kids, for always keeping track of my progress. I am passing the baton and I sincerely hope that you will strive to raise the bar to greater heights.
My nephew, Onthatile, for constantly reminding me of my spot on the study table;
My little angel, Bokang, even though you only witnessed the final lap of my marathon, you gave me the reason to continue;
Management and staff at Limpopo Department of Sport, Arts and Culture and Department of Labour for granting me access to information and their co-operation during data collection;
My mentors thank you for keeping your door forever open. May the Good Lord richly bless you;
To Rianna Moore and Lydia Meyer at the University of Stellenbosch, your administration and effective communication facilitated efficient progression of our studies. Thank you;
My initial supervisor, Dr Belinda Ketel, even though you left before I concluded the study, you have been great, and finally;
To my supervisor, Professor Johan Burger, thank you for taking me through the last mile of the marathon.
Together, we have won this race. God Bless you ALL!
ABSTRACT

Since the democratic dispensation in South Africa, attempts were made in earlier studies to make recommendations for the implementation of gender equity in the labour markets. Until now companies and public service departments have done little to ensure gender equity. Most efforts made were merely window-dressing given that previous studies provide evidence of fewer female employments in Senior Management Service (SMS) positions across the public service. South Africa has introduced a legal framework to support the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998). The study sets out to evaluate the extent of gender equity implementation in Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998) aims to redress employment inequalities previously experienced by racially, culturally and sexually marginalized South Africans. Departmental human resource processes are evaluated to establish equity measures necessary to achieve the purpose of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998).

This study reviews employment equity practices from various countries to establish best practice. Issues and proposed strategies for improvements surrounding employment equity legislation in South Africa are also highlighted. The study is extended to other departments to establish accountability standards as well as actions and penalties available for non-compliance. The findings from the study indicate that women are mostly employed in middle management while male employees continue to dominate the top management in spite of the Department of Public Service and Administration’s (DPSA) strategic goal to reach a 50% equal employment at SMS by 31 March 2009. Suggestions are provided to accelerate implementation of gender equity in Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. Given that the study was based on a representative sample of a single public service department, the findings may as a result not be generalized to the entire South African public service.
OPSOMMING

Sedert die demokratiese bedeling in Suid-Afrika was pogings in vroeë studies aangewend om aanbevelings te maak vir die implementering van geslagsgelykheid in die arbeidsmark. Tot dus- ver het maatskappye en staatsdiens departemente min gedoen om geslagsgelykheid te bevorder. Talle pogings wat aangewend was, is niks meer nie as uiterlike vertoon, gegee die feit dat vorige studies bewysstukke lewer van minder vroulike indiensneming in Senior Bestuursdiens (SBD) posisies deur die staatsdiens. Suid-Afrika het `n wetgewende raamwerk ingestel om die Gelyke Indiensnemingswet, 1998 (RSA, Wet 55 van1998) te ondersteun.

Die studie het ten doel om die implementering van geslagsgelykheid in die Limpopo Provinsiale Departement van Sport, Kuns en Kultuur te evalueer. Die GIW, 1998 (RSA, Wet 55 van 1998) beoog om die indiensnemings ongelykhede te herstel, wat voorheen ondervind was deur rasse, kulturele en geslagtelik gemarginaliseerde Suid-Afrikaners. Departementele menslike hulpbron prosesse word beoordeel ten einde die billikheidsmaatreëls te bepaal wat nodig is om die doelwitte van die GIW, 1998 (RSA, Wet 55 van 1998) te bereik.

Hierdie studie raadpleeg gelyke indiensnemings praktyke van verskillende lande ten einde die beste praktyk te stig. Aangeleenthede en voorgestelde strategieë vir die bevordering van wetgewing oor gelyke indiensneming in Suid-Afrika word ook beklemtoon. Die studie word uitgebrei na ander departemente om standaarde oor aanspreeklikheid te bepaal, asook optrede en strafmaatreëls vir nie-voldoening daaraan. Die bevinding van die studie dui daarop dat vrouens meestal op middel bestuursvlak in diens geneem word, terwyl manlike werknemers aanhou om die top bestuursvlak te domineer, ten spyte van die Departement van Staatsdiens en Administrasie (DSDA) se strategiese doelwit om 50% gelyke indiensneming op SBD- vlak teen 31 Maart 2009 te bereik. Aanbevelings word gemaak om die implementering van geslagsgelykheid te versnel in die Limpopo Provinsiale Departement van Sport, Kuns en Kultuur. Gegee die feit dat die studie gebaseer was op `n verteenwoordigende monster van `n enkele staatsdiens departement, mag die bevindinge gevolglik nie veralgemeen word met die totale Suid-Afrikaanse staatsdiens nie.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title page i

Declaration ii

Acknowledgements iii

Abstract (English) iv

Opsomming (Afrikaans) v

Table of Contents vi

List of tables x

List of figures xi

Chapter 1: Research background

1.1. Introduction 1
1.2. Rationale for the study 4
1.3. Problem Statement 5
1.4. Research Question 5
1.5. Study Objectives 6
1.6. Research Methodology 6
1.6.1. Population and Sampling 6
1.6.2. Data Collection Instruments 7
1.6.3. Data Analysis 8
1.7. Chapter Outline 9
1.8. Conclusion 10
Chapter 2: Gender Equity Conceptualized

2. Employment equity legislation in other countries 12
   2.1. Introduction 12
   2.2. Definition of key concepts 12
   2.2.1. Employment equity opportunities 13
   2.2.2. Affirmative action 14
   2.2.3. Gender equity 16
   2.3. Background to workplace discrimination 17
   2.4. The rationale for employment equity legislation 18
   2.5. Employment equity in selected countries 19
   2.6. Affirmative action 24
   2.7. Affirmative action strategies in selected countries 26
   2.8. Gender inequality in the labour market 29
   2.9. Conclusion 30

Chapter 3: Gender equity legislation in South Africa

3.1. Introduction 32
3.2. The rationale for employment equity legislation in South Africa 33
3.3. The legislative framework for employment equity in South Africa 34
3.4. Background to affirmative action in South Africa 37
3.5. Affirmative action in South Africa 38
3.5.1. Problems encountered in employment equity implementation in South Africa 40
3.6. The case for employment equity within the South African Public Service 41
3.6. Conclusion 48

Chapter 4: Case Study Chapter

4.1. Introduction 49
4.2. The Historical Background of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Art and Culture 49
4.3. Legislation Mandating the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Art and Culture 51
4.4. The vision of LDSAC 52
4.5. The mission of LDSAC 52
4.6. Background to the employment equity plan of LDSAC 52
4.7. The employment equity plan of LDSAC 54
4.7.1. The need for a gender-based EE strategy 57
4.7.2. Reporting 58
4.7.3. The organisational structure of LDSAC 58
4.8. Conclusion 61

Chapter 5: Data Collection, Presentation, analysis and Interpretation

5.1. Introduction 62
5.2. Research Design 62
5.3. Data Collection Procedures 63
5.4. Population 63
5.5. Sampling 64
5.6. Data Collection Instruments
5.6.1. Document Analysis 65
5.6.2. Individual Interviews 65
5.6.3. Questionnaires 66
5.6.3.1. Measurement and Scoring Technique 67
5.7. Validity and Reliability 67
5.8. Data Analysis 68
5.8.1. Analysis and Interpretation of qualitative data 68
5.8.1.1. Institutional Systems 69
5.8.1.2. Communications 69
5.8.1.3. Promotion opportunities 70
5.8.1.4. Female affirmation 70
5.8.1.5. Training and development 70
5.8.2. Analysis of quantitative data 71
5.8.2.1. Quantitative analysis of Biographic data 72
5.8.2.1.1. Age and Gender 72
5.8.2.1.2. Marital Status 73
5.8.2.1.3. Race and Disability Status of Respondents 73
5.8.2.1.4. Positions and Educational Qualifications 74
5.8.2.1.5. Educational Qualifications by Work Experience, Positions and Gender 75
5.8.2.2. Quantitative Analysis of Questionnaire Data 76
5.9. Conclusion 80

Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations

6.1. Introduction 81
6.2. Conclusions 81
6.3. Recommendations 82
6.3.1. Monitoring and Evaluation 82
6.3.2. Performance measurements 82
6.3.3. Support and development opportunities 83
6.3.4. Integration of plans 83
6.4. Limitations of the study 84
6.5. Problems encountered during data collection 84
6.6. Summary 85

Reference List 88
Appendices 98
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Occupation levels (in the South African labour market) by race percentage

Table 1.2: Statistics from Breakwater Monitor Report, July 1999

Table 3.1: A strategic approach for women’s empowerment and gender equality in the South African Public Service

Table 4.1: Current employment status of Limpopo provincial DSAC

Table 4.2: Current employment status of Limpopo provincial DSAC at management level

Table 5.1: Sampling Guide

Table 5.2: Total number of male and female respondents per age group

Table 5.3: Marital status of respondents

Table 5.4: Respondents educational qualifications, work experience, position held and gender

Table 5.5: Responses to employment equity questions

Table 5.6: Responses to promotion questions

Table 5.7: Responses to interviews and advertisements questions

Table 5.8: Responses to development questions
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Percentages of board members that are women

Figure 5.1: Age distribution of male and female respondents

Figure 5.2: Analysis of respondents’ positions and qualifications
CHAPTER 1

RESEARCH BACKGROUND

1.1. INTRODUCTION

The legacy of apartheid and the high level of poverty in South Africa have contributed much to inequalities in the South African community. The history of South Africa reflects the repression of black workers and the constant struggle against the almost exclusively white government and employer. During the apartheid era, the government had attempted to protect the interest of the white populace while exploiting black workers as a source of cheap labour.

Historically job-discrimination was institutionalized by law. The job reservation clause was included in the Industrial Conciliation Act, 1956 (RSA, Act 28 of 1956 as quoted in Horwitz, 1994:135). The Act excluded blacks in its definition of what constituted – “an employee” and as a result blacks did not have any formal protection offered by the Act. The emergence of collective black labour as a social, economic and political force in response is one of the significant aspects of these oppressive legislations.

Horwitz, Bowmaker-Falconer & Searll (1996:135) maintains that the amendments to the Industrial Conciliation Act further exacerbated the problem by prohibiting the formation of mixed unions and also imposed job reservations reserving certain positions to whites only. Horwitz et al (1996: 135) further asserted that the monopolization of skilled labour by white trade unions effectively denied access to apprenticeship training for black employees. Access to upward mobility to skilled and managerial positions was prevented by deliberately created institutionalized practices.
The effect of these practices is thus reflected in the Table 1.1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation Levels</th>
<th>Whites</th>
<th>Blacks</th>
<th>Coloureds</th>
<th>Asian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Managerial and Professional</td>
<td>92,7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled and Supervisory</td>
<td>77,64</td>
<td>10,74</td>
<td>6,94</td>
<td>4,68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apprentices and trainee technicians</td>
<td>60,94</td>
<td>30,91</td>
<td>5,82</td>
<td>2,33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.1: Occupation levels (in the South African Labour market) by race percentages

Source: Adapted from Horwitz et al. (1996)

Horwitz (1994, 187-191), states that the Wiehahn Commission of Inquiry was instituted in 1979 following the 1976 Soweto uprising, the growing international disapproval (sanctions) of the apartheid system and the growing shortage of increasing demand for skilled workers. The Commission investigated and supported radical changes to the government’s labour policies. The results of the Commission contributed to the revamping of the Industrial Conciliation Act 28 wherein all workers irrespective of race were included and all unions were granted full rights. However, the amendments to the Industrial Conciliation Act disregarded socio – political legitimacy because black South Africans were still not enfranchised.
Tinarelli (2000:4) further indicated the following illustration of the impact of inequality:

**Table 1. 2:** Statistics from Breakwater Monitor Report, July 1999

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• White men and women holds 84% of management positions in South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Males of all races holds 83% of management positions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>With regard to promotions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• White employees still constitute about 74% of management promotions and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54% of skilled promotions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In terms of recruitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• General recruitment figures show that black men are most targeted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Managerial and skilled recruitment figures show that white males are</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>still favored. e.g. recruitment rate for white male managers is 46%,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>followed by white women at 19% and black males at 18%.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Adapted from Employment Equity User Guide (1999)

The status quo remained until after the first democratic elections in 1994 where the Constitution, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) was instituted and included most importantly the Bill of Rights as well as the comprehensive legislative framework for labour which was to regulate and facilitate harmony and equality in the workplace. Tripartite structures have been established to address the challenges of reconstruction, development and economic competitiveness.

South Africa, like many other countries across the globe has taken conscious measures to redress past inequalities in the labour market through the institution of Affirmative Action and Employment Equity legislation. Jain (2002:2) points out that in the 1990s South Africa passed some of the most progressive labour market legislations.

Makgoba (2005:21) argues that the purpose of the established Affirmative Action and Employment Equity legislation in South Africa is to bring about equity, redress past
inequalities and lay foundations for a future non-racial, non-sexist and equitable South African society.

Albeit the establishment and progressive implementation of anti-discrimination labour-market legislation in South Africa, women still experience different forms of male-domination and oppression according to their class, status, religion, race, ethnic and cultural backgrounds (Ajani, 2005:76). The early 1990s saw very few women in economically active jobs in South Africa (Ile, 2002:1). Women were also discriminated in the job market in terms of race. Women in South Africa were thus generally discriminated against in the workplace. Very few women, regardless of their professional qualifications, find themselves in very senior positions. McLennan (1994:138) believes that public administration in South Africa, both in theory and practice has been a male-dominated field. Women are found to be minimally represented in top management positions in the civil service.

Limpopo Province has inherited the former Gazankulu, Lebowa and Venda homelands. Limpopo thus has a diverse cultural background. The community of Limpopo Province has been deeply divided along racial, gender and ethnic lines. There are six official languages in Limpopo. The democratic provincial government has inherited the ethnic ills which reflect similar imbalances as the entire country. The Limpopo Department of Sport, Arts and Culture have inherited a culturally diverse workforce from the former homelands. The Department offers a variety of services ranging from sports, languages, performing and visual arts, library, to archives and heritage. The purpose of this study is to analyze the implementation of employment equity programme, with specific reference to gender equity in the Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture in Limpopo Province. This study seeks to establish whether women are advancing into top management positions within the Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The findings from the study may thus assist in suggesting relevant strategies required in supporting the Department in implementing employment equity to address the issue of gender equity and other equity related issues.
1.2. RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY

The purpose of this study is to evaluate implementation of employment equity in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The reasons behind the necessity of evaluating implementation in this department are mainly based on the challenges of transition presented in the form of reconfiguration of the South African government into provinces and the public service into departments, integration of fragmented administrative entities from former homelands to build a representative civil service. In identifying consistent features in equity implementation processes within the department, insight into the overall approaches being used will be established and thus used to examine the impact on the employment status of the designated groups, particularly women, as well as the entire workforce within the department. Various policies have been put in place to redress the inequalities in the labour market.

1.3. PROBLEM STATEMENT

The Department of Sport, Arts and Culture offers a variety of services, ranging from language affairs to cultural affairs to the entire province. These services are offered to all citizens including the disabled and youth. The Province has inherited a culturally diverse workforce from the former Venda and Gazankulu homelands. The nature of services offered within each sub-directorate requires an equity framework that will have effective affirmative action and diversity management procedures, including reasonable accommodations for equity opportunities. Despite the fact that an equity framework may be available in the department, there may be instances that affect the implementation. The study will focus on implementation of gender equity, with special reference to promotion of women into senior management positions in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. In identifying consistent features in equity management, insight into the overall approaches being used will be established. These will be done by generating a research question which will guide the study. The research question and the objectives for the study follow:
1.4. RESEARCH QUESTION

- To what extent has gender equity been implemented in Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Art and Culture?

1.5. STUDY OBJECTIVES

The implementation of gender equity programme in Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is aimed at eliminating employment barriers and making reasonable accommodations for people from the designated groups. The objectives:

- Analyze theory on diversity management and gender equity.

- Describe the case of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture with regard to implementation of gender equity.

- Collect employment statistics and other relevant data on implementation of gender equity in Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture.

- Draw conclusions and make recommendations regarding implementation of gender equity within Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture.

1.6. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Mouton (1996:107) defines a research design as a set of guidelines and instructions to be followed in addressing the research problem. He further asserts that the main function of a research design is to anticipate what the appropriate research decisions should be so as to maximize the validity of the eventual results. Babbie (1995:83) says research design is all about designing a strategy for finding out something. This study will focus on evaluating the implementation of the employment equity programme in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. Mouton (2001:158) states that implementation evaluation research aims to answer the question of whether an intervention programme or policy has been properly implemented. According to Babbie (1995:339) evaluation research is a process of determining whether the intended results were produced.
1.6.1. POPULATION AND SAMPLING

The population for this study includes:

- Personnel from the Human Resource section of the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture,
- Managers within the Department: (middle, senior and top management) and
- Labour inspectors from the Provincial Department of Labour.

Implementation evaluation design calls for non-probability sampling techniques. The sample will be selected based on the staffing information that will be provided. The respondents are selected on the basis of their role in and knowledge of human resource matters and processes in the Department.

1.6.2. DATA COLLECTION

The study will use a combination of data collection methods relevant to the study. Individual interviews, analysis of quantitative secondary data from available Departmental and other relevant employment equity reports as well as questionnaires will thus be employed as data collection instruments.

Mouton (2001:159) indicates suitable data collection methods for the implementation design as both structured (questionnaires, tests and scales) and less structured (focus groups, interviews, participation observations) as well as analyzing existing documents. Creswell (2003:217) maintains that triangulation is usually selected in an attempt to confirm, cross-validate or corroborate findings within a single study. Woods (2006:4) adds that the use of different methods at different moments of time, in different places, among different people strengthens an account. Neuman (2006:149) further asserts that triangulation is the idea of looking at something from multiple points of view which thus improves accuracy. Ritchie &
Lewis (2003:43) further say that triangulation involves the use of different methods and sources to check the integrity of, or extend inferences drawn from the data.

A. DOCUMENT ANALYSIS

The data will primarily be collected through analysis of reports, including; equity reports, other relevant departmental records, records from the Department of Labour as well as the Citizen’s Report from the Premier Office to establish whether there is evidence of compliance to the current departmental gender equity plan.

B. INTERVIEWS

Individual interviews will be conducted with a purposefully selected sample to elicit information regarding implementation of gender equity in the Department.

Two (2) individual interviews will be conducted to fortify data obtained from report analyses. The unstructured individual interviews will be conducted with the Human Resource/Equity manager in the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture to grasp the overall status of the Department in terms of implementation of the programme. Another individual interview will also be conducted with one (1) labour inspector from the Limpopo Provincial Department of Labour. The labour inspector, as an outsider, is regarded as an intervener and not a perpetrator, and it is therefore hoped that his/her responses will be more objective than subjective. Rubin & Rubin (2005:3) noted that through qualitative interviews a person can understand experiences in which one did not participate. Ritchie & Lewis (2003:36) affirm that individual interviews provide an undiluted focus on the individual and thus provide an opportunity for detailed investigation of people’s personal perspective.

C. QUESTIONNAIRES

Descriptive statistics according to Smith & Glass (1987: 145) refer to numbers representing some characteristics of a set of scores. Questionnaires will be administered to selected sectional managers and Human Resources personnel to elicit information regarding
implementation of gender equity in the department. Questionnaires can be effective in measuring feelings and attitudes. The questionnaire allows the researcher to obtain more information about the respondents’ perceptions, feelings beliefs and attitudes (Ile, 2002:31).

1.6.3. **DATA ANALYSIS**

Analysis will be a combination of textual data collected from interviews regarding reasons, causes and solutions to barriers to implementation and numerical data obtained from facts and statistics on employment equity which will indicate the achievement of equity targets as set out in the Departmental equity plans. Terreblanche & Durrheim (1999:140-143) provide a model for analyzing qualitative data. The model allows the researcher to familiarize himself/herself with the preliminary meaning of data from experiences gathered from interviews.

Basic statistics will be employed to analyze data collected from questionnaires. Graphs, frequencies, percentages and tables will be used to reflect the position of the Department with regard to implementation of gender equity.

1.7. **CHAPTER OUTLINE**

Chapter One includes the background and rationale for the study. The problem statement exposes the reason for studying the implementation of gender equity in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The research problem statement explained the problem and the need for the study. The research question and objectives focused the investigations and set the path for the anticipated progression. The methodology for the study outlined the design and instruments that will be used to collect data.

Chapter Two presents the theoretical framework and literature review relevant to the study. The theoretical framework covers main themes relevant to the topic including affirmative action, employment equity and other gender related issues.
Chapter Three outlines the implementation of gender equity in the South African public sector. The chapter will also outline the legislative framework, setting out relevant legislation and regulations necessitating implementation of gender equity in South Africa.

Chapter Four is the case study on the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The chapter outlines the overall employment background of the Department.

Chapter Five outlines the procedures that were used to collect, present, analyze and interpret data. The chapter will clearly present procedures used for scoring, coding and presenting various data collected.

Chapter Six outlines the conclusions, recommendations, limitations and summary. The chapter will also present a suggested normative approach to gender equity in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The approach will thus outline how gender equity should be implemented in order to be effective. The problems encountered during data collection, barriers to implementation of gender equity as long as the successes and failures achieved will be outlined.

1.8. CONCLUSION

In the past fourteen years of democracy, a number of research efforts have been undertaken to suggest solutions to the issue of workplace discrimination in democratic South Africa. Most of the research efforts were mainly to assess the impact of the employment equity legislation established in the country.

This study endeavors to pursue investigations on the implementation of gender equity. The research will investigate the progress made within the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture in relation to gender equity, especially the promotion of women to top management positions.

Based on the background and the problems stated, the next chapter will review literature regarding international workplace equity. Establishing the position of other countries in this
regard will guide the investigations thereby giving the researcher insight into the problem and also provide the best practice for South Africa.
CHAPTER 2

GENDER EQUITY CONCEPTUALIZED

2.1. INTRODUCTION

Allen (2001:19) maintains that many organisations rarely appreciate the talents and abilities of the historically disadvantaged which in turn leads to them being marginalized in employment as well as being overlooked for top management positions. Labour market legislation should therefore be seen as a key instrument to redress the past labour inequalities, disadvantage and discrimination of particular groups in the labour market.

Kamoche (2004:15) argues that South Africa is facing a double transitional challenge to redress the historical inequalities by building a democracy based on human rights and tolerance as well as speedily developing its human capital capacity to compete in the harsh global economy. South Africans have been largely disadvantaged by the inferior education system which prevailed during apartheid. The larger percentage of the South African population is semi-literate. The low level of literacy has negatively affected the skills level and competency of the country.

This chapter will begin by developing the theoretical framework outlining key concepts and thereafter continue to discuss the background to the development and implementation of employment equity legislation of women in employment in South Africa, continentally and globally. Literature regarding key issues that the study attempts to address will be reviewed.

2.2. DEFINITION OF KEY CONCEPTS

Zajda (2005:352) states that affirmative action, employment equity, diversity, equity and equal employment opportunities are often used interchangeably in most countries while they mean different things in others. This study will define affirmative action as a strategy geared towards the attainment of employment equity where employment equity is regarded as the desired goal which employers should strive to achieve through minimization of workplace discrimination.
The study will thus consider various meanings drawn by different scholars in their attempts to develop theory necessary to generate relevant understanding.

2.2.1. EMPLOYMENT EQUITY OPPORTUNITIES

The basis of employment equity is mainly the provision of equal opportunities for all individuals. Adam (2001:8) states that employment equity (EE) is a positive measure which aims to empower people who have been historically discriminated against in the workplace. Ziehl (2000:3) states that the purpose of employment equity is to identify and eliminate discrimination. Starling (1992:511) maintains that equal employment opportunity (EEO) means that an organisation seeks the best qualified applicant as judged by existing personnel standards regardless of race or sex. Biraimah (1999:33) states that equity refers to policies and procedures for enabling and encouraging groups in society which are presently under-represented as well as extending opportunities to suitably qualified individuals regardless of sex, ethnicity, disability or any other consideration which have no bearing on their abilities, thus allowing such individuals to achieve staff positions in workplaces and to advance professionally according to merit and achievement without discrimination based on unrelated considerations.

Equal employment opportunity is the provision of an environment which enables all individuals to realize their full potential (Human et al 1999:30 and Ramphele, 1995:34). Equal employment opportunity will be achieved when all gaps between diverse groups have been eliminated and the disadvantaged individuals brought to a level where they can compete equally and be given equal opportunity to do so without any form of discrimination. Coetzee (1995:22) points out that employment equity are based on the belief that all people were created equally. Coetzee further maintains that the belief in the equality of man is universal and it should thus be the fundamental value in any civilized society. An equity framework is crucial provided it is geared towards creating an equal opportunity environment to release the creativity in every citizen.
2.2.2. **AFFIRMATIVE ACTION**

Affirmative Action (AA) is a conscious effort by government to move towards a more racially and gender balanced workforce. In the South African context, Affirmative Action will include both black (African, Indians and Coloureds) empowerment and women empowerment including all South African women. Portnoi (2003:79) sees Affirmative Action as a positive, corrective tool to assist people who have been previously discriminated against to obtain employment and training.

Eide (1992:9) defines affirmative action as “preference by way of special measures for certain groups or members of such groups (typically defined by race, gender or ethnic identity) for the purpose of securing adequate advancement of such groups or their individual members in order to ensure equal enjoyment of human rights and fundamental freedoms”. Maphai (1993:7 as cited in Nzimande & Sikhosana1996:45) also argues that affirmative action must be viewed as temporary preferential treatment for women and blacks.

Human (1995:52) states that affirmative action should be viewed as a measure to overcome barriers to equal employment opportunities rather than a means of preferentially advantaging the historically disadvantaged groups at the expense of the previously advantaged groups.

In agreement with the above reference by Human, Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994: xix) remark that affirmative action is seen as a temporary measure designed to achieve equal employment opportunities without lowering standards or unfairly hindering the career aspirations of current employees who are competent in their jobs.

Barker (1999:264) says affirmative action refers to policies and practices aimed at redressing social, economic or educational imbalances or inequalities arising out of unfair discrimination. Smit & Morgan (1996:340) affirm that organisations that have gone the route of affirmative action see it as an interim measure to ensure that the statistical imbalances in terms of race, culture and gender in the workplace are redressed.
Affirmative Action in the Australian context is about achieving equal employment opportunities for women, and to achieve this goal, the barriers in the workplace which restrict employment and promotion opportunities for women have to be systematically eliminated (Strachan et al, 2004:196).

Carrel et al (2006: 6) point out that affirmative action is a business strategy and process aimed at transforming socio-economic environments which have excluded historically disadvantaged individuals from gaining access based on their potential. Smit & Morgan (1996:324) agree that affirmative action can be viewed as a proactive development tool to overcome constraints and effectively mobilize latent resources, such as latent potential in the designated groups in order to stimulate overall development as well as encourage different cultural and gender groups to work together to ensure synergy.

Herholdt & Marx (1999:9) says affirmative action is a multi-dimensional concept which is not easy to define. Definitions of affirmative action can be categorized into five groups, including:

1. Focus on equal treatment emphasizing interventions aimed at creating opportunities;

2. Preferential treatment, redistributing resources and opportunities as well as offering financial assistance to disadvantaged communities;

3. Empowering the disadvantaged while emphasizing the deliberate attempt to uplift previously disadvantaged groups to enable them to operate at the same level as their advantaged counterparts;

4. Developing members of the disadvantaged groups so that affirmative action is seen as a process of developing disadvantaged individuals to enable them to compete on an equal level with the advantaged groups. Emphasis should be more on training of affirmative action appointees to enable them to acquire certain managerial skills and function more effectively; and

5. Affirmative action as the creation of management of diversity in the workplace.
2.2.3. GENDER EQUITY

Synder et al (1996:1484) notes that the meaning of the term gender reflects inequality between males and females with males usually described as superior and females as inferior. According to Burnstein (1994:230) discrimination against women is manifested in a variety of ways. Burnstein further maintains that in its most typical form no prescribed barriers exist.

Despite the political changes and developments in South Africa, the position of women in society is still the same as before democracy. Gender equity remains one of the main priorities in the government’s attempts to eradicate workplace discrimination. The majority of women in South Africa currently occupy positions subordinate to men in the workplace and in other societal spheres. Whites and males still hold most top management positions in South Africa and across the world.

Schwellnus & Bendix (2002:23-24) states that data collected by Statistics South Africa in 1998 also showed great gender discrepancy in top management given that 45,69% of professionals were male while 55,31% were female. Women constituted only 27, 45% while men constituted 72, 55% and this was a clear indication that women were not deterred by a lack of ability at lower levels but rather it was an institutional matter.

According to Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:62) the International Labour Organisation (ILO) rejected the myth that gender equality is changing and maintains that it will take another five centuries before women and men reach equal status in the workplace, regardless of women being more qualified than their male management colleagues in developing countries.

According to Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:62) a quote by Professor June St. Clair, Deputy Vice-Chancellor at Wits University refers to the stark reality of the position of women in the workforce: “Women make up more than 50% of the world’s population, perform roughly two-thirds of its work, earn roughly one-tenth of its income and own one-hundredth of its property.”
2.3. BACKGROUND TO WORKPLACE DISCRIMINATION

Mohr & Fourie (2000:387) explain that labour market discrimination means that people are given different economic opportunities based on race, age, sex and religion. Workplace discrimination restricts women from attaining influential positions and at the same time protects men from competition in male jobs. According to Burnstein (1994:41) the role of women in employment is severely circumscribed by custom, social pressure and practice. Women had a role in the workplace during World War II. Women worked successfully and performed jobs previously restricted to men. Their worth could only last until after the war after which they were compelled to return home to care for their families and leave industry work to men.

Labour market discrimination on the basis of race and ethnicity occurs in almost all countries which are culturally and ethnically diverse (Wrench, 2002:12 and Burnstein, 1994:309). Many countries deal differently with racial, ethnic, religious and gender differences. In some countries women are yet to attain the most basic rights of citizenship. Most Western countries, as a result of international pressure, are prohibiting labour market discrimination based on ethnicity, race, religion or sex. Sellick (2001:41) notes that job discrimination remains a major source of labour market rigidity and economic inefficiency. Excluding women from the so-called male jobs reduces an economy’s ability to adjust to change.

In South Africa, workplace discrimination dates back to the early nineteen century. Various pieces of legislations have been enacted to institutionalize labour market discrimination. Historically, job-discrimination was institutionalized by law. Job reservation for Whites was institutionalized under the Mines and Works Act 12 (RSA, 1911) which deemed it illegal for Africans, Coloureds and Indians to work and receive remuneration as skilled workers. The Factories, Machinery and Building Work Act, 1941 (RSA, Act 22 of 1941) further exacerbated the situation by instituting segregation of workspaces and separate facilities were established for different racial groups.
the Industrial Conciliation Act, 1956 (RSA, Act 28 of 1956 as quoted in Horwitz et al, 1996:135), excluded blacks in its definition of what constituted – “an employee”, and therefore blacks did not have any formal protection offered by the Act. The Job reservation clauses were also included in the Industrial Conciliation Act, 1956 (RSA, Act 28 of 1956). Racial job reservation was maintained by workplace convention, by the power of white workers in the workplace and by the industrial council collective bargaining agreements (Webster & Von Holdt, 2005:48).

2.4. THE RATIONALE FOR EMPLOYMENT EQUITY LEGISLATION

The global community is faced with a challenge to find creative solutions to the perpetual labour market discrimination. Labour market discrimination is pervasive throughout the world. Organisations are increasingly confronted by the pressure to eradicate the legacy of inequality and discrimination in the workplaces. Bowmaker et al (1998:31) point out that the rationale for any Employment equity initiative must be to offset the legacy of the workplace discrimination, including the systematic discrimination that often occurs as an unintended by-product of other policies and practices. Compensatory policies are thus necessary to ensure a fair and competitive race given the already unequal starting points.

The struggle against workplace discrimination has been one of the defining features of American life for decades. The fight against workplace discrimination was at the heart of the civil rights movement. Equal Employment Opportunity was also at the heart of the contemporary women’s movement which was founded in 1966 out of the frustration that the federal government refused to consider the prohibition of sex discrimination included in Title VII of the Civil Rights Act (USA, 1964 as cited in Burnstein, 1994: ix).

The 1980s saw the emergence of ever-increasing need to change the workplace regime. In South Africa, the struggle to establish a new workplace order ensued in the 1980s. Workers engaged in struggles to create new workplace institutions and practices through a process of innovation from below (Webster & Von Holdt, 2005:69).
The debate around workplace discrimination became more complex across the globe that compensatory labour legislation had to be developed to regulate the job market thereby eradicating workplace discrimination.

2.5. EMPLOYMENT EQUITY IN SELECTED COUNTRIES

USA

Employment equity in the US is referred to as affirmative action or equal employment opportunity. Employment equity legislation in the US rests on a number of Acts and Executive orders. The US Constitution (USA, 1788) does not provide for affirmative measures for certain groups but instead provides the principle of equality before the law which covers equal capacity to acquire and enjoy legal rights for all individuals (Zajda, 2005:352). The Fourteenth Amendment of the constitution further stresses that no person shall be denied equal protection from the law which meant that affirmative action and equal employment opportunity measures constituted some form of discrimination and is therefore unconstitutional.

Title VII of the Civil Rights Act (USA, 1964 as cited in Burnstein, 1994:121) was the first anti-discrimination Act in the US. The Act prohibits discrimination in employment procedures and practices on the basis of race, colour, sex, religion, age and other factors (Kearney & Carnevale, 2001: 187). Achieving EEO is difficult because of systematic discriminatory practices. Employers may, as such, take special affirmative action measures to eliminate barriers and alleviate imbalances in the workforce attributable to past discrimination such as special efforts to recruit, hire and promote members of disadvantaged groups. The primary legal bases for affirmative action policies are Title VII of the Civil Rights Act which prohibits private sector employment discrimination as a violation of the fourteenth Amendment, and the EEO Act (USA, 1972 as cited in Burnstein, 1994: 121)) which extends Title VII coverage to public employers. Section 703 of Title VII prohibits distinction in treatment because of an individual’s race, color, national origin, religion or gender.
The Equal Employment opportunity Committee (EEOC) and the Office of Federal Contract Compliance (OFCC) was established to monitor compliance with Title VII of the Civil Rights Act (USA, 1964). The law prohibited discrimination in pay, promotion, hiring and termination and training. Until 1972 the EEOC was limited to merely a passive role of processing complaints, conciliation and entering cases after initiation by other parties. The EEOC was given authority to initiate litigation on its own after the Civil Rights Act was strengthened in 1972. The OFCC was established in 1965 by executive Order 11246 which prohibited discrimination by race among federal contractors above a certain size. The order was amended to include sex in 1967 by Executive Order 11375. In 1968 the OFCC required federal government contractors to prepare AA plans that would eliminate any under-utilization of black workers (Burnstein, 1994:196).

United Kingdom

Sloane & Mackay (1997:93) state that Employment equity legislation was first introduced in the United Kingdom during the 1970s. Separate legislation covering sex; race, religion and disability were developed. Separate enforcement bodies and separate geographical arrangements in Britain and Northern Ireland were also established. Expanding employment opportunities for women were a distinct feature of the 1970s. Most of the growth in labour opportunities was in part-time employment which saw a sharp decline in male participation rate. Burke & Nyandwi (2001:7) point out that the UK has strong employment equity legislation which protects women from workplace discrimination on the basis of sex, race, religion and disability.

The British Race Relation Act (Britain, 1976 as cited in Burnstein, 1994: 309) set out the basic legal obligation of employers to deal fairly with applicants from different racial backgrounds. The Act outlaws racial discrimination in employment. The Race Relation Act distinguishes two concepts of discrimination. Direct discrimination occurs where a job applicant is selected or rejected on the basis of his/ her racial origin. Indirect discrimination occurs where practices and policies bias the recruitment process regardless of the way they are formulated or of the employer’s motive (Burnstein, 1994:316). Research in Great Britain argues that EEO laws
have substantially improved economic outcomes for women but not for minority groups (Burnstein, 1994:310).

*Japan*

According to Burnstein (1994:357) the Japanese Constitution (the Kenpô) specifically prohibits government from discrimination on the basis of sex. This provision introduced the concept of sexual equality into the Japanese legal system. The Constitution further requires equal pay for equal work. The judicial construction of the clause has significantly weakened its potential impact. The Japanese Constitution has been judicially construed to permit reasonable discrimination instead of prohibiting discrimination.

The Japanese Equal Employment Opportunity Act consists of amendments to previous labour laws dealing with sex discrimination including the Labour Standards Act (LSA), the Working Women’s Welfare Law (WWWL) and Article 90 of the Civil Code (Burnstein, 1994:358).

Chapter VI of the LSA regulates women’s working conditions. The Japanese government promulgated Article 4 of the LSA in response to International Treaty. The article provides a mandate for equal pay for equal work. However, Japan is still rated the lowest among the industrialized countries in the ratio of women to men’s wages. Japanese women are prevented from reaching an equal position that merits equal pay. The LSA also contains restrictions limiting women’s work which, opponents believe, are measures to legally discriminate against women (Burnstein, 1994:359).

The WWWL was promulgated in 1972 to further the welfare and improve the status of working women. The focus of the WWWL is primarily focused on eliminating discriminatory employment practices and improving women’s vocational abilities.

Article 90 of the Civil Code (called the Minpô) has been the primary legal weapon in the battle for equal employment opportunity. However, the article does not prohibit sex discrimination in explicit terms. The article makes provision for nullifying any juristic act that is contrary to
public policy. The article also focuses on the reasonableness of discriminatory conduct which state that any discriminatory conduct found to be contrary to public policy will be nullified (Burnstein, 1994:360).

The Japanese government was pressurized to establish EEO laws by a UN resolution calling all member states to undertake reasonable measures to modify or eradicate all legislation discriminating against women. In 1985 Japan ratified an EEO law prohibiting discrimination based on gender but the law is unlikely to be effective because it is vague with regard to what it prohibits. The law only urges voluntary change in employment practice and imposes no penalty upon employers who continue to discriminate (Burnstein, 1994:311-312).

Amendments to EEOA (Japan, 1985) led to the promulgation of new EE legislation designed to promote equal treatment between men and women in employment in Japan. The equal employment opportunity for Women and Men (EEOWM) was promulgated in 2002. Chapter II of the Act sets out important provisions which prohibit discrimination against women in employment with regard to recruitment, hiring, assignment, promotion, fringe benefits, mandatory retirement age, retirement and dismissal. The chapter also states that women should not be dismissed for taking maternity leave under the Labour Standards Law (ILO, 2002:16).

**Australia**

Strachan et al (2004:196) maintain that EEO issues were tackled in many ways in Australia. The 1960s saw visible progress into issues relating to equal pay among employees. Equity legislation is both federal and state-based in Australia. Employment equity policies in Australia were guided by the Racial Discrimination Act (Australia, 1975) which made provisions for anti-discrimination legislation (Zajda, 2005: 353). The aim of the anti-discrimination legislation was to redress cases of discrimination after they have occurred as well as cover complaints on grounds of gender, race, ethnicity, religion, family status, sexuality and disability. However, the Act failed to provide mechanisms for monitoring discrimination or for instituting equity measures. Discussions about women’s wages widened to encompass wider understanding of equal pay in the 1980s. The Public Service Act
(Australia, 1984) provided for equity measures thereby outlining measures to eliminate barriers to employment for women, Aboriginals and other members of minority groups.

The 1980s also saw the introduction of unique legislation, thereafter called Affirmative Action Act (Australia, 1986), which was designed to promote EEO. The Act was later replaced by Equal Opportunity for Women in the Workplace Act (Australia, 1999). The Disability Discrimination Act (Australia, 1992) makes provision for protection from unfair discrimination for people with disabilities and further requires employers to provide special facilities (Zajda, 2005:353). Significant changes took place in the Australian industrial relations system between the 1980s and the 1990s. The changes interacted with EEO policies. The once centralized system of conciliation and arbitration that operated through a semi-judicial authority changed to a heterogeneous and fragmented system that emphasizes workplace bargaining. The focus of the Affirmative Action Act (Australia, 1986) was individual enterprise as opposed to legislative and economy-wide standards. The evolution to a decentralized industrial relations system corresponds to a period of declining trade union membership in which many women employees had limited voice.

The focus of government policies in the 1990s was mainly on giving parents the opportunity to choose between going to work and caring for children. General childcare support was offered to low income earners.

**Zimbabwe**

Castle (1995:8) points out that discriminatory labour policy were the order of the colonial rule in Zimbabwe. The country endured large disparities between white and black workers with regard to wages, employment levels, education, vocational training and wealth with consequent high unemployment among black workers and full employment for white workers. Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:43) state that for fear of capital and skills flight, no explicit policy of affirmative action was introduced, especially in the private sector, to redress the past employment inequalities. However, affirmative action measures were introduced in the public sector to remedy the situation. The public service commission received a presidential directive
to institute a programme to replace white workers with black workers in 1980. The replacement programme was facilitated by limited career prospects, attractive retirement schemes and pensions paid in foreign currencies.

According to Swanepoel et al (2003:139) the new labour legislation, the Zimbabwean Labour Relations Act, 1985 (Zimbabwe, Act 16 of 1985) neither addresses the effects of past discriminatory labour practices nor directly confronts gender inequalities. The focus of the Act was on individual discrimination. By 1989, 95 percent of the top 300 positions in the public service were filled by blacks. The country also saw a rapid increase of black employment in the public service from a total employ of 40,000 in 1980 to 90,000 in 1989. Black Zimbabweans with qualifications but limited experience were given preference (Castle, 1995:9 and Charlton & van Niekerk, 1994:43).

2.6. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION

Carell et al (2006:75) maintain that while affirmative action is viewed by other authors as an interim measure designed to achieve equal employment opportunities without lowering standards or unfairly hindering the career aspirations of current employees who are competent in their jobs, diversity management is regarded as a long-term strategy to redress the workplace imbalances. According to Agocs & Burr (1996:30) managing diversity can be viewed as a strategy for dealing with issues which affirmative action left unaddressed, such as the retention and career development of women and minorities employed under affirmative action plans and making the necessary accommodations for such groups in the workplace.

Hubbard (2003:8) says affirmative action should be viewed as a sub-strategy of equity which, coupled with diversity management, can both assist the country towards the achievement of the desired employment equity goals. Jewson & Mason as quoted in Kirton & Greene (2005:115) identified both the liberal and radical approaches to equality. The liberal approach is based on a view of the rights of the individual to universally applicable standards of justice and citizenship. This approach holds that equality opportunities exist when all individuals are enabled freely and equally to compete for social rewards. Strategies such as affirmative action...
and diversity management can thus be employed as intervention in an attempt to bring about

Diversity management becomes a prerequisite for the success of any affirmative action
programme in organisations. It aims to create an organisational environment that will allow all
human potential to be effectively managed to bring about greater productivity. Kirton &
Greene (2005:125), in their outline of the capabilities approach, hold that policies for diversity
management revolve around identifying choices people have, facilitating them, as well as,
providing the organisational environment wherein individuals can use their potential
capabilities to the fullest. Human (1995:8) argues that diversity management is the prerequisite
required for effective implementation of employment equity programmes.

Carell et al, (2006:85) maintain that the promulgation of the Employment Equity Act, 1998
(RSA, Act 55 of 1998) was aimed at achieving equality in workplaces by advancing equal
opportunities for all citizens by eradicating all unfavorable working conditions and effecting
affirmative action measures to rectify the apartheid ills.

Criticisms against affirmative action

Critics of Affirmative Action argue that the EEOC and OFPC will reduce total productivity of
the economy (Burnstein, 1994:87). They maintain that government pressure to increase the
hiring and promoting of female and minority workers may lead organisations to mis-allocate
labour and thus cause production losses. The implementation of affirmative action has been
reduced to window dressing in some organisations which fail to consider the suitability of
candidates resulting in appointees being dissatisfied. Window dressing usually leads to a
lowering of standards in terms of service delivery and offers poor quality of output. Barker
(1999:266) adds that the tendency of not considering qualifications or making necessary
training and development arrangements when appointing on the basis of affirmative action,
may lead to severe tension.
A second criticism is that affirmative action pressures firms into engaging in reverse discrimination or preferential treatment of women and minorities, which they view as a direct violation of employment equity laws. Critics maintain that affirmative action policies in most cases fail to reach the most deserving groups whereas the application of quotas promulgates reverse discrimination in which certain members of the elite dominate at the expense of the most deserving members.

2.7. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION STRATEGIES IN SELECTED COUNTRIES

Countries such as Malaysia, India, Canada, USA, Britain and Zimbabwe have been implementing Affirmative Action strategies over the years (Thomas, 2002:242). The strategies are directed at affirming minority groups. This study will only focus on the affirmative action implementation in Malaysia, India and Canada mainly because implementation in USA, Britain and Zimbabwe is highlighted in the section covering Employment Equity legislation in other countries.

Malaysia

The affirmative action model in Malaysia may be comparable to the South African case given the parallels existing between the two countries (Charlton & Van Niekerk, 1994:41). Various studies show that Affirmative Action strategies in both countries are designed to benefit a large majority of the population and religious differences in Malaysia coincide with ethnic differences in South Africa (Thomas, 2002:243). Malaysia has made significant strides in implementing affirmative action. The Chinese minority and the Malay majority set up a comprehensive plan to implement affirmative action while still maintaining economic standards. Citizenship was granted to Chinese and Indians in return for constitutional preferential treatment for the Malays. The indigenous Malay community remained economically disadvantaged even after implementation. The aim of The New Economic Policy (NEP) (Malaysia, 1971) was to reduce and eventually eradicate poverty and to restructure society to eliminate the association of race with economic standing, thereby ultimately promoting national unity and social integration. The success of affirmative action in Malaysia
must largely be credited to the political and economic bargain struck and the flexible approach adopted by the Malay government. The affirmative action success in Malaysia was largely due to high economic growth rate which consequently made resources distribution possible. Affirmative Action implementation in Malaysia was not without problems. The introduction of quotas resulted in non-Malay students leaving the country to study abroad. Chinese continued to operate businesses run by Malay people as fronts. The result was that an elite Malay group benefited from affirmative action with the poorest sectors of the disadvantaged remaining poor. Rigid Affirmative Action strategies apparently eventually serve only the interests of a minority.

India

According to Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:40) India conceived two large programmes, Affirmative Action and land reform programmes, during independence. In terms of the Indian Constitution (India, 1950), positive measures in the form of quotas in education and employment in the public sector must be adopted to advance members of scheduled castes (the untouchables) and scheduled tribes (Thomas, 2002:244). In his study, Thompson points out that it was an advantage to be socially or educationally disadvantaged in India since this qualified one for relief from the legislator (Charlton & Van Niekerk, 1994:40). The Indian government introduced a programme of forced affirmative action across the board including mechanical and numeric quotas. The 1994 report by Jain & Ratman state that in 1990 the government introduced additional reservations for other disadvantaged classes and adopted a quota of 27 per cent for this group in addition to the 22.5 per cent quota for the untouchables and the tribals. The Supreme Court decided that reservations for all three groups should not exceed 50 per cent and that candidates for appointment should meet eligibility requirements to ensure administrative efficiency (Jain, 2000 as cited by Thomas, 2002:244). Certain categories of employment were also exempt from the reservation of appointment. Critics maintained that affirmative action policies failed to reach the most deserving groups whereas the application of quotas raised reverse discrimination where members of a particular caste dominated public service departments. Economic growth was as well relatively slow between 1950 and 1990.
which resulted in lack of resources for expanding social services. Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:41) argue that positive discrimination is self-defeating if it is used as an instrument of creating balance of power. Affirmative Action can only be effective when there are clear inequalities between groups which the programmes seek to address. When there are minor disparities the use of affirmative action leads to a power struggle.

**Canada**

The federal Employment Equity Act (Canada, 1986), later amended in 1995, required the government to improve the status of the designated groups. The designated groups in Canada were defined as women, ethnic minorities, aboriginals and people with disabilities. The Act required prohibition of all forms of discrimination in all government agencies. The legislation was directed at federal government agencies, as well as the banking, transportation and communications sectors (Jain, 2000, as cited by Thomas, 2002:245). A further requirement was the introduction of administrative policy that required companies with 100 or more employees, who bid on federal government contracts of $200,000 or more, to implement employment equity programmes. The programmes include the removal of barriers encountered by the designated groups in areas of selection, hiring, promotion and training as well as the setting of specific goals and timetables for the introduction and progression of people from the designated groups within these companies. Progress with regard to implementation of the employment equity policies was visibly slow in all sectors. The representation of members of the designated groups was sporadic in all sectors. The 1992 study by Leck & Saunders revealed that the Canadian employment equity policy increased the hiring of white able-bodied women at the expense of addressing discriminatory practices relating to racial minority and women (Thomas, 2002:245). Studies by Agocs & Burr (1996), Lem (1995) as well as Poole & Rebick (1993) report that the slow progress may be attributed to government’s lack of attention to identification and change of discriminatory organisational policies and practices embedded in the organisational culture (Thomas, 2002:245-246). The slow progress may also be a function of the government’s reluctance to play an effective role in monitoring and compliance.
2.8. GENDER INEQUALITY IN THE LABOUR MARKET

According to Burnstein (1994:277) women have been seen as different from men in a variety of ways. Proponents of women’s rights believe that women required protection from the harshness of the labour market. The promulgation of EE laws must take into account the differences between men and women. Some scholars believe that the labour market has been structured in a way that favours men. Scoville (1991:158) states that since the 1960s economists and labour market analysts showed interest in developing theories to explain differential participation of men and women in the labour market.

According to Burnstein (1994:216) equal pay and equal employment opportunity legislation have been the main policy initiatives to deal with gender discrimination. Other initiatives have followed to facilitate the adaptation of women into the labour market in a manner that would improve their pay and employment opportunities. Women across the world have been actively engaged in the fight against gender discrimination in the workplaces. These engagements were carried out through representations in various international organisations and national commissions dealing with gender equity, as well as through professional organisations (Fagenson, 1993:90).

In the US, the Civil Rights Act (USA, 1964) increased the proportion of women in male-dominated occupations, thus raising the overall number of women managers even though women’s progress in top management has been quite slow (Nelson & Michie, 2004 as quoted by Mathur-Helm, 2005:58). Women in China are also faced with similar challenges in terms of climbing the managerial ladder (Fang, 2004 as cited by Mathur-Helm, 2005: 58). Women across the world are faced with problems in workplace and management positions. Women enter the workplace with both social and structural disadvantages. Sexism and gender stereotypes usually result in discrimination against women in the workplace. For example, the AA policy in the US was challenged in the Supreme Court on the basis that it discriminated on the basis of gender and contravened equality of treatment since women are accorded special treatment. Even though the Court ruled that affirmative action is not discriminatory since it seeks to redress inequalities in access to opportunities, it is evident that gender stereotypes
perpetuate workplace discrimination (Chivaura, 2002:95). Governments across the world are reluctant to ratify declarations and policies designed to address gender inequality. The United Nations Convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women (CEDAW) (UN, 1979) was still not signed by some countries even after ten years. The United Nations’ concern to draw public attention to women’s social issues led to the organisation of various conferences globally. International conferences on the plight of women were held at a five year interval, but the implementation of the proposed declarations has not always followed (Zajda, 2005:340).

In the late 1970s, women managers began organizing support groups in a number of countries. The first international association of women in management was founded in 1984, with the creation of European Women’s Management Development Network (EWMDN). The EWMDN helped in the establishment of networks for women in management all over the world (Fagenson, 1993:90).

Women in management are largely affected by class issues. Research shows that while white women also suffered economically, their economic situation was not as dire as that of women of color (Fagenson, 1993:108). Studies on women in management show white women are in better employment positions than black women. Black women enter the workplace with historical disadvantages such as inadequate educational backgrounds and lower socio-economic status. Employment rights of women should be protected. Governments should focus their affirmative action strategies on ensuring equitable access to jobs, promotions, developmental and decision-making opportunities (Allen, 2001:28).

2.9. CONCLUSION

While governments can provide a legal base to eliminate workplace discrimination through legislation, organisations need to commit themselves to making such efforts possible by ensuring positive implementation and ratifications of the proposed practices and procedures. Lack of commitment to implementation of the proposed legislation causes major setbacks with regard to realizing the outcomes.
The promulgation of equal employment opportunity legislation globally is an indication that the global community is intending to deal with issues of discriminatory practices in the labour market. Implementation of EEO legislation has met with reluctance in many countries. The prevalence of gender stereotypes, in relation to affirmative action policies, hampers progress with regard to eliminating labour market discrimination.

In some countries, the implementation of affirmative action in some organisations has been reduced to the mere addressing of the facade. Women are still not accepted as an integral part in crucial decision-making processes. Further efforts are thus required to ensure the transformation of workplace practices to successfully integrate women into influential decision-making structures.

The success and failures experienced in the implementation of employment equity legislation in both the public and private sectors in other countries provided lessons for South Africa in the establishment of its own employment equity legislation. South Africa has established its own employment equity legislation since the democratic government came into power. Implementation failures in other countries and international best practice in EE legislation provides positive insight for the successful establishment of such legislation in South Africa. In the coming chapter, the study will concentrate on the progress made with regard to implementation of employment equity legislation in the South African public service. The focus will specifically be on the progress made with regard to gender equity in the South African public service.
CHAPTER 3

EMPLOYMENT EQUITY (GENDER EQUITY) IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SECTOR

3.1. INTRODUCTION

The 1990s saw the implementation of employment equity reforms within the public service. Employment equity reforms were mainly introduced to target labour stereotypes which resulted in labour market discrimination based on race, sex, ethnicity and religion. Equal Employment opportunities have thus been viewed as a labour market intervention strategy to improve employment opportunities for women and historically disadvantaged groups.

South Africa, like many other countries, experienced the harsh realities of labour market discrimination, exacerbated by the apartheid government. The institutionalization of job discrimination policies and practices affected the majority of the South African population. South African women, irrespective of their race, were largely discriminated against. Past policies favored men, both white and black. Women were defined as inferior to men and as such assigned positions of minors in both public and private sectors. In the face of glaring socio-economic inequalities, it was inevitable that remedial actions to redress prevailing inequalities were taken (Nzimande & Sikhosana, 1996:11).

The Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) was the cornerstone for the development and implementation of employment equity legislation to redress the past imbalances created by the apartheid government. Section 9(2) of the Constitution, 1998 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) seeks to promote the achievement of equality and thus recommends that legislative and other measures necessary to protect and advance categories of people disadvantaged by apartheid be taken. Relevant legislation should then be enacted to realize this objective.

This chapter will discuss the efforts taken by the South African government in the development and implementation of employment equity legislation within the national context.
The role of government in dealing with gender issues and the position of women in the public service will also be highlighted.

3.2. THE RATIONALE FOR EMPLOYMENT EQUITY LEGISLATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

The rationale for employment equity legislation in South Africa is succinctly stated in Tinarelli (2000:3-8). It is stated that the reasons behind the necessity of employment equity legislation are many and thus include, amongst others, the following:

- **Discrimination and the resultant inequalities**

  Legislation aims to eradicate the inequalities still inherent in the labour market to ensure a place for every South African across all divides in the workplace. It also aims at eradicating inequalities in income and job distribution against designated groups. Differences in income and status in South Africa is linked to race and gender.

- **The need for economic growth**

  The income and occupation inequalities by race have had severe economic consequences. A reduction of such inequalities will therefore promote economic growth. The Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) and the Skills Development Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 97 of 1998b) aim to eradicate discrimination and stimulate active participation by all categories of workers in the labour market. The EEA Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) and SDA Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 97 of 1998b) aim to consequently improve access to jobs; training and promotion opportunities as well as upgrading of skills.

- **Requirements of the Constitution and the ILO**

  A further rationale for employment equity legislation is based on the need to comply with the requirements of the Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) as well as the need to meet the standards of the Conventions of the ILO, as have been ratified by South Africa.
• Employment equity makes business sense

According to the Employment Equity User Guide (RSA, 1999), investing in and developing all people of South Africa will contribute to sustainability of the business and future returns. A workforce that reflects the demographics of the country can improve the market share, the understanding of markets and the ability to service all current or prospective clients.

The implementation of employment equity legislation will, as well provide a diverse workforce in terms of race, culture and gender and a diverse workforce, have potential for competitive advantages for employers.

3.3. THE LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK FOR EMPLOYMENT EQUITY IN SOUTH AFRICA


The period after 1994 led to the development of legislation to regulate the South African labour market. The Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) has laid a solid foundation for the establishment of labour laws through the equality clause. The legislative framework for the Republic of South African (RSA) labour practice was therefore established and employers were presented with an opportunity to transform the RSA workplace through the relevant labour regulating Acts.


• The International Labour Organisation Convention 111

The fundamental objectives of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) were to supervise international labour standards (Tinarelli, 2000:6-7). The ILO Convention 111 (ILO, 1998), in terms of employment and occupation, was aimed at achieving equal opportunity and treatment in employment through the eradication of workplace discrimination. South Africa has ratified this Convention and therefore it has to be followed.
• **Labour Relations Act, 1995 (RSA, Act 66 of 1995)**

Labour Relations Act, 1995 (RSA, Act 66 of 1995) has, amongst other things, codified South Africa’s law of unfair dismissal (Venter, 2003:106). The act promotes the right to fair labour practice. Employers have to establish substantive and procedural fairness in the dismissal of employees.

• **The Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997 (RSA, Act 75 of 1997)**

The Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997 (RSA, Act 75 of 1997) promotes social justice and development through the establishment and enforcement of the basic conditions of employment. The Act clearly states the maximum working hours, overtime, leave entitlements including maternity leave for mothers and other benefits available to employees.


Tinarelli (2000:8) states measures legislated in the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) for effecting employment equity. These measures include:

- The prohibition of harassment
- Ways in which to reorganize work to reduce barriers to entry
- Methods for advancing the hiring, training and promotion of people from previously disadvantaged groups
- Procedures to prevent pay and benefit discrimination and
- Annual reporting on the progress of employment equity.

The EEA recognizes that the inequalities caused by apartheid cannot be overcome solely by eliminating discrimination. The Act thus states the aims of its provisions in an effort to take positive measures. Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) amongst other things, aims to achieve workplace equity by implementing affirmative action measures to redress the disadvantages to employment experienced by designated groups. The Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) addresses the socio-economic and political
imbalances of the past by promoting equal employment opportunities and eliminating unfair dismissal at the workplace.


The Skills Development Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 97 of 1998b) provides for the development of skills for the South African workforce to: improve the quality of life of workers; increase productivity and competitiveness of employers in the workplace; promote self-employment and improve the delivery of social services; provide employees with the opportunities to acquire new skills; opportunities for new entrants to the labour market to gain work experience and employ persons who find it difficult to be employed.

The legislation of employment equity in South Africa has met with criticisms from business leaders (Thomas, 2002:238). The concerns include, amongst others, the following:

- It is believed that the over-regulation of the labour market as well as the government’s role as a watchdog will affect the desire for overseas companies to invest in the country;
- Monitoring and enforcement of the employment equity legislation will eventually result in increased administrative costs for the government and thus be a burden on the taxpayers;
- Reverse discrimination and race classification will result in a decrease in employee loyalty and loss of skills in white males thereby reinforcing racial tensions and negative stereotypes;
- Employees from designated groups may adopt a culture of entitlement undermining initiative, self-confidence and self-reliance.

Preventive measures are required to counter such problems. Studies indicate incidents in other countries where such problems have been encountered.
3.4. BACKGROUND TO AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN SOUTH AFRICA

South African workplaces are burdened with legacies of inequality and social divisions that were the order of the day during the apartheid government.

The South African labour market has, over time, struggled for equity in the workplace. Black workers constituted the majority of the workforce and suffered greatly under the apartheid work order. Attempts to change the work order were based on a long history of seeking equity in the workplace. United States multinational companies took intensive measures in attempting to bring about social change to the South African workplace (Thompson, 1995:11).

The discussions on employment equity and affirmative action intensified as the apartheid government began to release its hold. In South Africa, affirmative action efforts can be traced back to the imposition of the Sullivan Code in 1978 on American companies operating in South Africa (Herholdt & Marx, 1999:3).

According to Herman & Gelderbloem (1996:23) the Sullivan Code constituted the first Affirmative Action initiatives to be introduced in South Africa. The Sullivan Code played a major role in helping to speed up the process of eradicating discrimination by highlighting the injustices that were common in South Africa during the apartheid era. Herholdt & Marx (1999:3 and Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:52-53) report that the Code included the following:

- Non-segregation of races in all work facilities;
- Equal and fair employment practices for all employees;
- Equal pay for all employees for comparable work for the same period of time;
- Initiation of training and development programmes to prepare black workers for supervisory, administrative, clerical and technical jobs;
- Increasing blacks in management and supervisory positions; and
- Improving employees’ quality of life outside the work environment in areas like housing, transport, schooling, recreation and wealth.
The main aim of the Code was to eliminate racial inequalities that characterized the apartheid government. Many role-players contributed to ending workplace discrimination and unfair labour practices in South Africa. Initially, more emphasis was directed at de-segregating the workplace, recognizing workers’ rights to form unions and promoting equality for employees of all races. The Sullivan Code encouraged companies in South Africa, particularly multinationals, to take the initiative to accelerate social reorganisation and provide opportunities for black advancement. By 1985, 184 American companies were signatories to the statement of the Code to help unify the South African workplace.

Many companies later adopted a neutral position to avoid confrontations, which then amounted to introduction of tokenism and window dressing. Attempts to end workplace discrimination in South Africa had little effect and Reverend Sullivan called for sanctions to be imposed against racist South Africa in 1987. The call for sanctions was subsequently followed by the closing of operations within South Africa, by American companies.

According to Thomas & Robertshaw (1999:12), companies who were signatories were required to report annually on their performance in the areas specified in the Code, namely:

- Social justice;
- Education for non-employees;
- Training and development as well as;
- Community service.

Further actions to legalize trade unionism for blacks ensued in 1979 after the recommendations of the Wiehahn Commission of Inquiry which investigated and supported radical changes to the government’s labour policies (Horwitz, 1994:187-191).

3.5. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN SOUTH AFRICA

South Africa is a multi-racial country and therefore requires a diverse workforce. Chapter 3 of the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) deals with affirmative action
Section 15(2) of the Act defines measures for implementation, by designated employers, to ensure that suitably qualified people from designated groups have equal employment opportunities and are equitably represented in all occupational levels.

Affirmative Action in South Africa is part of a comprehensive strategy to bring about a fundamental transformation in the material inequalities and power relations which we have inherited from apartheid (Ohmar, 1991:20 as cited in Nzimande & Sikhosana, 1996:76)

According to Horwitz et al (1996:139) the implementation of affirmative action in South Africa requires a robust strategy with a planned and holistic set of objectives to enhance skills capacity and provide real job responsibility. Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:93) suggests that organisations must exercise caution when selecting an approach to implementation of affirmative action. The approach selected should consider the critical ingredients for human resource development. Charlton & van Niekerk (1994:93) also suggest the following critical ingredients and key strategies for successful implementation of Affirmative Action:

- replacing negative expectations of blacks of themselves and white managers with positive ones;
- overcoming the lack of people management skills and accountability of white managers;
- Creating an environment that rewards initiative, creativity and competence.

According to Charlton & Van Niekerk (1994:93) the four key strategies suggested are:

- obtaining top management commitment to affirmative action and leadership competence to provide an environment where people can develop;
- developing coaching and mentoring skills as well as empowering attitudes necessary to facilitate the transfer of skills on the job;
- training for growth through the accelerated development of critical success competencies;
Complementary strategic systems reinforcing human competence throughout the organisation.

Grossett & Venter (1999:164) believe that affirmative action sometimes create negative stereotyping. Training and performance objectives may best manage such stereotyping. Narrowing the gap between the privileged and the disadvantaged may lead to a situation where people with less experience or education are put in positions where they are overrated in terms of abilities. Necessary measures are therefore required to monitor any situation where inexperienced and less qualified people are placed in such positions within organisations.

3.5.1. PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN SOUTH AFRICA

The aim of implementing employment equity legislation in South Africa was mainly to ensure that the legacies of apartheid in the workplace are redressed. This broad view will be achieved by promoting equal opportunity and fair treatment through the elimination of unfair discrimination and the implementation of affirmative action measures to advance people from the designated groups (Thomas, 2002:237). The implementation of affirmative action measures in the South African workplaces has created racial tensions and social conflicts within companies. Those employees who had a previous advantage regard the process as reverse discrimination. This will obviously have an adverse effect on company productivity.

Studies by Black Management Forum (1993) and Thomas (1996) as cited in Thomas (2002:240) found the following problems, as a result of the introduction of Affirmative Action strategies, prevalent in the South African workplaces:

- The act of tokenism or window dressing being applied in an effort to reach racial and gender targets required by the Act;
- Negative expectations about candidates from designated groups prevail. They become highly scrutinized, feared and resented by those who stand to lose promotional
opportunities. Eventually members from designated groups become excluded from all networks and systems necessary in job progress;

- Lack of top management commitment to affirmative action efforts affects successful implementation thereof;
- Lack of management commitment to performance management as a means of training and developing people from designated groups into fully productive employees also defeats affirmative action efforts;
- Information sharing processes functional in promotions and advancement are sabotaged thereby creating informal networks to exclude appointees from designated groups from progress.

The Constitution Act , 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996), as the supreme law of the country, made provision for the enactment of labour market legislation to redress workplace discrimination created by apartheid laws. All companies operating within the borders of South Africa are therefore obliged to operate within such legal frameworks. Any effort, in contradiction of such frameworks constitutes constitutional contravention and will thus have to be condemned. The government should take necessary steps to put mechanisms in place to ensure successful implementation of affirmative action initiatives by companies. Adopting best practice from other countries may assist South Africa in making positive progress with regard to implementation.

3.6. THE CASE FOR GENDER EQUITY WITHIN THE SOUTH AFRICAN PUBLIC SERVICE

According to the article, “Employment Equity Act creates representative public service” (SA Media, 18 February 2004) great strides had been made in creating a representative public service in South Africa with 547 045 of a total workforce of 1037655 being women as at December 2003. African women made up 398 736 while 80 684 were white women and the remainder were Asian and Colored women. The report also indicates that there is still a need for greater representation of women in management positions. South Africa is working towards meeting the global challenge through promoting the rights of all citizens, irrespective of race, gender, class, age or disability. Section 23 of the Constitution, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of
clearly states that “everyone is entitled to fair labour practice” while section 9(2) states that equality includes the full and equal enjoyment of all rights and freedoms. To promote the achievement of equality, legislative and other measures designed to protect or advance persons or categories of persons, disadvantaged by discrimination, may be taken. Policies and strategies were designed to ensure the implementation of equal and unalienable rights of all women and men and of improving the status of women in the workplace.

Women across the world are faced with problems in the workplace and management positions. The implementation of equal opportunity and affirmative action legislation along with, the demise of apartheid definitely brought in formal equality in South Africa, even though there are major barriers to full implementation of the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998), (Mathur-Helm, 2005:61). The South African labour environment is still not women-friendly. Past discriminatory labour laws also institutionalized gender discrimination (Munetsi, 1999 as cited by Mathur-Helm, 2005:61). Top management positions in South African organisations are still male-dominated and if there is no commitment they will continue to maintain their privileged position by closing off opportunities to women and other disadvantaged groups (Mathur-Helm, 2005:61). The South African government has adopted the National Framework for women’s empowerment and gender equality within the Public Service, DPSA (2006:2). The basic objective of the framework is to spearhead the creation of an enabling environment that would facilitate the development of strategies, mechanisms and interventions by government departments and provincial administration to achieve the strategic objective of women’s empowerment and gender equality. The Framework (DPSA, 2006:10) should therefore be measured against the government’s eight priority areas for the second decade of democracy (2005-2015), namely:

- Transforming the country into a genuinely non-sexist society
- Eradicating poverty and under-development, within the context of a thriving and growing first economy and the successful transformation of the second economy
- Securing the safety and security of the people
- The further entrenchment of democracy in South Africa
• Building a strong and efficient democratic state that truly serves the interests of all citizens
• Transforming the country into a genuinely non-racial society
• Opening the vistas towards the spiritual and material fulfillment of all South Africans
• Contributing to the victory of African Renaissance and the achievement of the goal of a
  better life for the people of Africa and the rest of the world.

The principles and guidelines underpinning the Framework were drawn directly from the
integration of gender considerations in the transformation of the South African Public Service.
South Africa has signed a number of conventions on women, as well as made contributions to
quite a number of sub-regional, regional and international gender instruments, including:
(DPSA, 2006:12-13)

• The Commission on Gender Equality.
• The RDP (RSA, 1994).
• The National Report of the status of Women in SA, prepared for the World conference
  on Women held in Beijing (1995).
• The SA Women on the Road to Development, Equality and Peace (Beijing Conference
  Plan of Action, 1995).
• Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination against Women
  (CEDAW)
• AU Heads of States Solemn Declaration on gender equality in Africa
• Optimal protocol for the African Charter on the Human and People’s Rights on the
  Rights of Women in Africa
• SADC Heads of States and government’s Declaration on Gender and Development and
  its addendum on the Prevention and Eradication of Violence against Women and Children
• The UN Millennium Declaration and its Developmental Goals

According to Mathur-Helm (2005: 58) women were still under-represented, as compared to
other countries, in top management positions despite the government’s tremendous strides in
promoting and advancing women in the workplace, Schwellnus & Bendix (2002:23-24) states that data collected by Statistics South Africa in 1998 also showed great gender discrepancy in top management given that 45, 69\% of professionals were male while 55, 31\% were female. Women constituted only 27, 45\% while men constituted 72, 55\% and this was a clear indication that women were not kept by a lack of ability at lower levels but that it was an institutional deterrent. Jain et al. (2003:15) further affirmed the report by the Commission on Gender Equity (RSA, 1999) where it was stated that gender equality within the workplace was underpinned by job-segregation and perceived roles associated with gender groups. Although women constituted the major segment of the South African population, they accounted for only 22\% of senior public sector positions while men accounted for 78\% (according to the 1995 Household Survey). Broadnax (2000:261-262) maintains that despite great strides in trying to establish credibility in the workplace, women still continue to face significant obstacles to achieving credibility as leaders. In spite of their advanced educational credentials, women often face significant gender-related hurdles to advancement.
Figure 3.1 below highlights women’s significant under-representation in the South African corporate sector as compared to the other countries (USA, Canada and Australia):

![Graph showing percentages of board members that are women](image)

**Figure 3.1: Percentages of board members that are women**

**Source**: Adapted from Mathur-Helm (2005:59)

The Department of Public Service and Administration (DPSA) assumed a leading role in improving the representation of women in the Public Service (DPSA, 2006). A target of 30% women in senior management services (SMS) by 31 March 2005 was set and by 31 March 2005, 29% of the SMS were women with just 1% missing the target; which was reached within a year on 31 March 2006. Government has set a further target of 50% of women in SMS by 31 March 2009, as well as a long-term strategy for women empowerment and gender equality within the Public Service. Ramphele (2007: 25) stated that the disproportionate progress white women have made in terms of representation in SMS poses a risk to the vision of a transformed society in which all citizens participate in growing the prosperity of South Africa.

The South African public service has adopted the strategic approach illustrated in Table 3.1 below, which is based on the short, medium and long term objectives for women’s empowerment and equality within the public service:
Table 3.1: A Strategic approach for women’s empowerment and gender equality in the South African public service, (DPSA, 2006:14-15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy approach</th>
<th>Short-term objectives</th>
<th>Medium-term objectives</th>
<th>Long-term objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increased representation of and participation by women in key decision-making levels</td>
<td>Policy Development and implementation Phase Training and development phase Impact Evaluation of interventions</td>
<td>Gender mainstreaming Strategy for women’s empowerment and gender equality Transformation for non-sexism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Date</td>
<td>31 March 2009</td>
<td>March 2010</td>
<td>March 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Macro indicators | 50% of women appointed in all levels of SMS  
Increased access by women to basic services, health care, education land, housing, economic opportunities, finance and micro credit | Recruitment and other HR Policies reviewed, and where necessary, new policies formulated. 
Guidelines for implementation of policies developed. 
Full roll-out of Training manual for gender mainstreaming in the public service. 
Achieve targeted number of women trained in leadership and management 
Achieve targeted number of Public servants trained in mainstreaming in the public service | Sectoral gender mainstreaming strategy in place 
Gender considerations integrated into all programmes, policies and projects 
Impact Evaluation report 
Equitable access by men and women, including persons with disabilities, elderly women and young women to resources and opportunities

Source: Adapted from Job-ACCESS (DPSA, 2006)

*The Strategy for Gender mainstreaming*

Gender mainstreaming entails bringing the perceptions, experience, knowledge and interests of women, as well as men, to bear on policy-making, planning and decision-making, DPSA (2006:15). Gender mainstreaming was established as a major global strategy for the promotion of gender equality in the Beijing Platform for Action from the UN’4th World Conference for
Women in Beijing in 1995. Mainstreaming should situate gender equality issues at the centre of analyses and policy decisions, mid-term plans, programmes, budgets and institutional structures and processes. The strategy increasingly recognizes that incorporating gender perspectives in different areas of development ensures the effective achievement of other social and economic goals. Mainstreaming can reveal a need for changes in goals, strategies and actions to ensure that both women and men can influence, participate in and benefit from development processes; which may then lead to changes in organisational structures, procedures and cultures to create organisational environments which are conducive to the promotion of gender equity (DPSA, 2006:15).

3.7. CONCLUSION

South Africa has, since the inception of the democratic government made concerted efforts to redress workplace discrimination. A number of studies have been conducted to investigate the issue of gender and racial discrimination in the workplace. International examples have been examined to establish best practice. It is evident from the results of the studies conducted that South African women are still facing the challenge of being fully integrated into decision-making and other influential job processes.

The implementation of affirmative action legislation in the public and private sectors notwithstanding, South African women are still sidelined. Reaching top level positions is still difficult for most South African women. Equal employment policies are becoming a barrier to the growth and advancement of South African women. The equal employment policies are failing to transform work practices and procedures. Gender biases are still prevalent in employment procedures.

In light of the issues highlighted above, the following chapter will present the context of the study. The chapter will give the background of the organisation which is the focus of the study; the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture, as well as its current position with regard to implementation of gender equity.
CHAPTER 4

THE CASE STUDY OF LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND
CULTURE

4.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter highlights the background and employment history of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The chapter endeavours to describe the case of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture with regard to the implementation of gender equity.

The Department has a legal mandate, as a public service organisation, to develop internal programmes and establish procedures to redress past employment inequalities in line with recent legislation. The legislative framework governing the executive functioning of the Department and the development of the employment equity plan is clearly outlined. The chapter also analyzes the departmental organisational structure and the human resource plan to establish the position of the Department with regard to gender equity.

4.2. THE HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF
SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE

The history of the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture can be traced back to the period before the democratic government came into power. The democratic government was faced with challenges of transition, presented in the form of reconfiguration of the South African government into Provinces and the public service into Departments and the integration of fragmented administrative entities from former homelands to build a representative civil service. Prior to 1994, sport and culture was operating under the then Department of Education. Cultural matters fell under the jurisdiction of the Regional Office for Cultural Affairs. Sports and cultural matters fell under the control of the new Department of Education, Sport, Arts and Culture which was established in 1994 under the political leadership of the
MEC Dr Motsoaledi (Limpopo Department of Education, Sport, Arts and Culture (LDESAC Annual Report, 1996: 7).  

The new Department of Education, Sport, Arts and Culture, established in 1996, catered for education, sport and cultural matters in the Province. The Department of Education, Sport, Arts and Culture were later split into two departments, namely: the Department of Education under the political leadership of MEC Dr Aaron Motsoaledi and the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture, under the political leadership of MEC Mrs. Joyce Mashamba (LDESAC Annual Report, 1996:7).  

Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is committed to redress the inequalities caused by the past apartheid government. The department inherited most of its staff from the former Department of Education, Sport and Culture. The staff at the former Department of Education, Sport and Culture was seconded from the government offices in the former homelands of Lebowa, Gazankulu and Venda (LDESAC, 1996:7). Support staff for the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC) was seconded from the Department of Education. Core functions and personnel were transferred from the Department of Education to the new Department of Sport, Arts and Culture.  

In attempting to restructure the department, an initiative was taken to study good practice from other provincial offices and the national office. The departmental organisational structure was consequently revised in 2005 whereupon the new establishment was set at 650 posts. Of the total 650 posts, 381 posts are vacant and only 269 filled (Limpopo provincial DSAC: Employment Equity Report, 2007/2008). The staffing shortage presents a challenge to departmental operations and has an adverse effect on service delivery. Funds are annually allocated by the Treasury for additional employment of only 10% of the posts due to budget constraints. A review will thus be conducted after the final implementation of the 2006-2010 employment equity programmes to establish the total number of personnel employed as well as gender considerations done. The results thereof will determine a necessary accommodation that should be made where a total establishment of 650 personnel may be earmarked for the
2011-2015 EE plans given the 10% annual budget allocation by the Treasury. There is a prevalence of policy loopholes; which needs to be addressed for successful integration of gender equity within Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The number of vacancies will have an effect on the Department’s effort to implement gender equity and other policies.

4.3. LEGISLATION MANDATING THE LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE

The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture obtains its legal mandate from the following legislation (Limpopo provincial DSAC Human Resource Plan 2007-2008:3):

- The White Paper on Arts, Culture and Heritage services (RSA, 1996)
- Northern Province Arts and Culture Council Act, 2000 (RSA, Act 6 of 2000)
- Northern Province Language Act (RSA, 2000)
- National Heritage Resources Act (RSA, 1999)
- National Archives Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 43 of 1996)
- Provincial Archive Services Act 5 (RSA, 2001)
- National Sports and Recreation Act (RSA, 1998)
- White Paper on Sports and Recreation (RSA, 1999)
- National Film and Video Foundation Act, 1997 (RSA, Act 3 of 1997)
- Provincial Library and Information Services Act, 2001 (RSA, Act 7 of 2001)
- Public Finance management Act (RSA, 1999)
- Treasury Regulations (RSA, 1999)
4.4. THE VISION OF LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE

The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is committed to redressing the imbalances of the past through a representative workforce and via the implementation of numerical goals that are set out in this plan and within a defined period. To achieve their strategic goal, the Department has set as their vision statement the goal to be a champion of equitable and integrated sport, art, and culture and heritage services which are geared towards the socio-economic development of the province (Limpopo provincial DSAC Human Resource Plan 2007-2008:2).

4.5. THE MISSION OF LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE

The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is set on a mission to enhance unity and diversity through the provision of services for sustainable development of sport, art, culture and heritage in Limpopo (Limpopo provincial DSAC Human Resource Plan 2007-2007:2).

4.6. BACKGROUND TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY PLAN OF LIMPOPO DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE

The South African labour market has been exposed to a number of international and national labour laws after 1994. Both private and public sectors were under pressure to undergo radical changes in employment procedures and working conditions. All public sector departments were mandated by the national government to implement the new labour laws to redress past imbalances.

According to Tinarelli (2006:6) the 1998 Convention 111 of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) was aimed at achieving equal opportunity and treatment in employment by eradicating workplace discrimination. South Africa ratified the above stated convention in its
Section 9 of the Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996). Furthermore, the South African Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) also encourages organisations to roll-out strategies to ensure that the workforce is representative of the entire South African population. The EEA aims to redress past socio-economic and political imbalances through the elimination of unfair dismissals and the promotion of equal employment opportunities for all. Section 23 of the Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996), as well as the 1995 South African Labour Relations Act, 1995 (RSA, Act 66 of 1995), promotes the right to fair labour practice and thus declares any discriminatory practice based on gender, race, age or culture illegal. The Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) outlaws all discriminatory practices and thus makes provision for legal sanctions to ensure compliance. All departments were required to establish Employment Equity committees in line with EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a). The Employment Equity Committee is representative of all sections within each department and the Human Resource section serves as the secretariat of the committee.

The development of the Employment Equity plan of the Limpopo Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is informed by the South African employment equity legislation and other relevant legislations. These include, amongst others:

- The International Labour Organisation Convention 111 (ILO, 1998)
- The Basic Conditions of Employment, 1997 (RSA, Act 75 of 1997)
- The Skills Development Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 97 of 1998b)

The equality clause in the Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) makes provision for the promotion of the rights of all citizens irrespective of race, gender, class, age or disability. Section 9(2) states that equality includes the full and equal enjoyment of all rights and freedoms. To promote the achievement of equality, legislative and other measures designed to protect or advance persons or categories of historically disadvantaged persons may be taken.
Chapter III of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires designated employers to implement affirmative action measures for designated groups to achieve employment equity. Section 19 of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires employers to conduct an analysis of employment policies, practices, procedures and the work environment so as to identify employment barriers that adversely affect members of designated groups. The development of a work profile determining the extent of under-representation of designated groups should also be included in the analysis.

Section 25(3.2) (b) (5) of EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires affirmative action measures to include preferential treatment and numerical goals, excluding quotas, to ensure equitable representation. Section 20 requires employers to prepare employment equity plans. The Act requires that the employment equity plan must contain a description of the measures taken by the designated employer to eliminate unfair discrimination in the workplace, thereby achieving employment equity. The employment equity plan must, amongst others:

- Have objectives for each year of the plan,
- Include affirmative action measures,
- Have numerical goals for achieving equitable representation,
- Have a timetable for each year,
- Have internal monitoring and evaluation procedures, including internal dispute resolution mechanisms, and
- Identify persons, including senior managers to monitor and implement the plan.


The Limpopo Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is committed to redress the imbalances of the past through a representative workforce and implement numerical goals, that are laid out
in the employment equity plan, within the set period. The plan illustrates, amongst others the following:

- Total number of employees per occupation level
- Total number employees with disabilities per occupational level
- Race and gender representation: numerical targets per population group
- Current and planned numerical targets
- Current departmental employment progress
- Activities for effective and efficient development, implementation and monitoring of the employment equity plan.

The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture has, in line with the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) designed activities for effective and efficient development, implementation and monitoring of the employment equity plan. The activities include identifying challenges and developing objectives necessary to ensure effective implementation of the employment equity plan (Limpopo provincial DSAC, 2006-2010, 10-15). These are as follows:

- Lack of proper monitoring of employment equity plan:
  - To ensure implementation of the departmental employment equity plan.
- Lack of facilities, accessibility and reasonable accommodation for people with disabilities:
  - To ensure accessibility of buildings for people with disabilities,
  - Accessibility and availability of equipments for people with disabilities,
  - To ensure that external and internal training providers accommodate people with disabilities and
  - To ensure representativity of designated groups.
- Staff turnover:
  - To reduce the turnover of competent employees,
• To ensure that all managers are champions of change and transformation within the department and
• To ensure staff retention.
  ➢ Lack of numerical goals to redress the imbalances of the past:
    • To ensure that set numerical targets are realized.
  ➢ Lack of management of cultural diversity:
    • To ensure effective management of cultural diversity.

To ensure achievement of the above objectives, the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture has developed the following action plan (Limpopo provincial DSAC, 2006-2010: 10-15):

• Identify and appoint members of the Employment Equity Consultative forum,
• Regular meetings with internal stakeholders to ensure effective monitoring of implementation of employment equity plan,
• Development of employment equity targets at branches and regular monitoring to ensure implementation,
• Timeous replacement of members in terms of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a),
• Making participation in the employment equity plan by members of the Employment Equity Consultative Forum an integral part of the performance agreement thereby assessing such members on this regard,
• Installation of lifts, ablution facilities and parking facilities accessible for the disabled,
• Ensure easy access to sign language interpreters,
• Making all departmental conference facilities user-friendly,
• Communicating recruitment and selection policies to accommodate designated groups,
• Conducting exit interviews to determine employees, perceptions, needs and attitudes towards the Department,
• Promote internal promotions and skills retention,
• Provide diversity management training to managers, and
• Base appointments on the departmental Employment Equity plan.

4.7.1. THE NEED FOR A GENDER EQUITY STRATEGY

Section 25(3) of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) enforces equal workforce representation through affirmative action measures. AA legislation was thus enacted to highlight, amongst other things, issues of gender discrimination thereby making provision for processes and laws that will create an environment conducive to the rights of women in workplaces. The EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) encourages organisations to engage in strategies to ensure a workforce representative of all population groups, including women. Policies and strategies were designed to ensure the implementation of equal and unalienable rights of all women and men and of improving the status of women in the workplace. The South African labour market is still characterized by workforce imbalances. Cloete & Makgoro (1995: 84-86) maintain that there exists a need for equal employment opportunities to guard against unfair labour practices based on gender or race.

The South African government has adopted the National Framework for women’s empowerment and gender equality within the Public Service (DPSA, 2006:2). The basic objective of the framework is to spearhead the creation of an enabling environment that would facilitate the development of intervention strategies and mechanisms by all government departments and provincial administration to achieve the strategic objective of women’s empowerment and gender equality. The principles and guidelines underpinning the Framework were drawn directly from the integration of gender considerations in the transformation of the South African Public Service (DPSA, 2006:12).

Ramphele (2008:19) argues that a fundamental misunderstanding of employment equity and affirmative action has resulted in practices that do a profound disservice to all South Africans. Ramphele further maintains that many people equate employment equity and affirmative
action, which results in confusion of the means and the ends which, in turn, have serious implications.

4.7.2. REPORTING

Section 21 of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires designated employers to submit the organisation’s employment equity report on the first working day of October each year. Departments must indicate performances which attempt to meet targeted percentages per occupational category as set out in their specific employment equity plans.

Section 24 of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires designated employers to assign one or more senior managers to ensure implementation and monitoring of their specific employment equity plans. In the draft policy, Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture has assigned senior managers to ensure implementation and monitoring of the employment equity plan in line with the Act (DSAC, 2006-2010: 10-15). Target dates are specified for reporting on each activity. Section 24 of the EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires designated employers to provide resources for the effective implementation of the employment equity plan.

4.7.3. THE ORGANISATIONAL STRUCTURE OF THE LIMPOPO PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENT OF SPORT, ARTS AND CULTURE.

The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture have six-hundred and fifty (650) posts. Two-hundred and sixty-nine (269) of the total staff allotment is occupied and three-hundred and eighty-six are vacant. One-hundred and forty-one (141) of the total employed is male while one-hundred and twenty-eight (128) are female.
Table 4.1 below illustrates the current employment status of the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (Limpopo provincial DSAC) Employment Equity Plan [a draft] 2006-2010:9):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HOD</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Managers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(level 14-16)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Managers</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(level 13)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers (level 11-12)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputy Managers</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(level 9-10)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Management</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(level 6-8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Supervision</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(level 1-5)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>141</strong></td>
<td><strong>128(1)</strong></td>
<td><strong>269</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is divided into five directorates. Each directorate is controlled by the relevant senior manager and the HOD is the political head of the Department.
Table 4.2 below illustrates the current employment status at management level in the Limpopo Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (Limpopo provincial DSAC Human Resource Plan 2007 and 2008: 13):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Top Management (level 14-16)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Management (level 13)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Management (level 9-12)</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture operate at the head office and in five districts across the province. A percentage of the total number of staff employed is deployed to districts. Each district is temporarily allotted a district senior manager. Given that a larger number of posts on the establishment are vacant, the Department largely operates with fewer personnel in all districts and head offices. Most of the vacant senior managerial positions are temporarily occupied by other staff members. The Department suffers a serious challenge of understaffing which consequently poses a threat to efficient service delivery. The departmental employment status in Table 4.1 indicates more female employments in junior management. Table 4.2 indicates that 60% of managers employed are male. Given that the Department is committed to redressing the imbalances of the past through a representative workforce, there is a need for the Department to streamline employment processes and align such with the prescripts of EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a). There is a need to shift the employment focus at senior management to include more female employees.
4.8. **CONCLUSION**

The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture aims to achieve a representative workforce and implement numerical goals as set out in the departmental human resource plan. Through this study, the researcher aims to analyze the implementation of gender equity in the Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture in Limpopo Province. This study seeks to establish whether women are advancing into top management positions within the Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture.

The next chapter will embark on collecting data necessary to assist the researcher in evaluating the implementation of gender equity in the Department. The procedure followed in collecting the required data will be thoroughly outlined.
CHAPTER 5

DATA COLLECTION, PRESENTATION, ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

5.1. INTRODUCTION

Once the research problem has been identified, the researcher has a responsibility to embark on a study in an attempt to provide possible solutions to the problem. Mouton (1996: 107) defines research design as a set of guidelines and directives that should be followed in attempting to address the identified research problem. He further asserts that the main function of a research design is to anticipate what the appropriate research decisions should be so as to maximize the validity of the eventual results. In attempting to establish the extent of gender equity implementation in DSAC, the study will employ relevant methodologies.

This chapter highlights the methodology that guided the researcher in the processes of collecting, analyzing, presenting and interpreting data. The focus of the study is on evaluation of the implementation of gender equity in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The methodology of this research is described in terms of the following sections: Research design; Data collection procedures; Population; Sampling; Data collection instruments and Data analysis. Both qualitative and quantitative data collection methods were used in generating the data. Analysis and interpretation will thus consider the nature of the data in relation to the literature and study objectives.

5.2. RESEARCH DESIGN

The research design employed in this study is descriptive. Qualitative research is fundamentally a descriptive form of research. Welman et al (2005: 188) comments on this matter stating that qualitative approach is an umbrella phrase covering a number of interpretive techniques seeking to decode, describe, translate and understand features occurring in the social world.
5.3. DATA COLLECTION PROCEDURES

A request for permission to conduct research was submitted to the provincial DSAC Head of Department (HOD). Approval was initially verbally granted but later presented a problem. Formal permission was later granted, where after the researcher requested for access to documents and appointments for interviews. On presentation of the formal approval from the HOD, the Human Resource Management and Development (HRMD) senior manager assigned the Human Resource manager to assist the researcher with the requested documents and schedule appointments for interviews. Available documents were provided and interview appointments were scheduled.

The researcher administered a uniform questionnaire to fifty (50) respondents including managers and HR support staff. Questionnaires were piloted prior to administration. The questionnaire was tested on a group of ten (10) employees from different employment categories in the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture were adjustment were made in line with their comments and suggestions. The questionnaires were individually delivered to all respondents. A letter of appreciation was advanced as a cover page of the questionnaire to the respondents. Anonymity and confidentiality were mainly ensured in the cover letter to allay fears. Only 40 of the 50 issued questionnaires were returned. 8 of the 40 questionnaires returned were spoilt and only 32 questionnaires were used for analysis. Spoilt questionnaires were studied to establish commonalities and differences in opinions. Information gained was therefore incorporated in the discussion of results.

5.4. POPULATION

Bless & Higson-Smith (2001: 85) defines population as the entire set of objects and events or group of people as the object of research about which a researcher wants to achieve characteristics. The population for this study was limited to the staff in the Human Resource section and available managers (junior, middle and senior management) of the Limpopo
Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture as well as available labour inspector(s) from the Provincial Department of Labour.

5.5. SAMPLING

De Vos (1998: 191) views a sample as a subset of measurement drawn from a population in which the researcher is interested in studying. Non-probability purposive sampling was used. The actual sample size was purposively determined using information on population given to the researcher by the Human Resource manager in the Limpopo DSAC provincial office as well as insight gained from report analysed. De Vos (1998: 192) provides a guide for sampling. The guide assisted much in the selection of the sample size.

Table 5.1: Sampling guide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Percentages suggested</th>
<th>Number of respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1000</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 000</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from: De Vos (1998: 192)

The Department has 650 posts on its establishment. 269 posts were filled at the start of the 2008/2009 financial year while 381 posts were vacant. 98 of the 269 permanent employees were managers; representing all levels of management. The Department has five district offices and one provincial office. This study was based in the provincial office. The staff component in the provincial office is approximately 200. The sample was made of two groups
of respondents consisting of both management and Human Resource support staff on the basis of their involvement in and knowledge of Human Resource matters in the Department.

Subjects were proportionally selected using various categories including age, gender, nationality, educational qualifications, designation and tenure. 54 respondents participated in this study. 33 of the respondents were female and 21 were male. The respondents’ age ranged from 20 to 45 years. 53 of the respondents are permanent employees of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture (DSAC) and only one respondent is an employee of Limpopo Provincial Department of Labour (DoL). 50 respondents responded to questionnaires. Only four (4) respondents were interviewed.

5.6. DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS

5.6.1. Document Analysis

Prior request for access to departmental documents was submitted to the Senior Manager for Communication services in Limpopo provincial DSAC. The researcher collected and analyzed DSAC Equity Reports for the financial year 2008/2009, Limpopo provincial DSAC as well as the 2007/2008 Limpopo provincial DSAC human resources plan. Staff Audit summary were also provided for analysis. The researcher collected and analyzed the 2006/2007 Citizen’s Report from the Premier’s Office.

5.6.2. Individual Interviews

Reports analyzed provided the primary textual data regarding gender equity implementation required for the study. The researcher secured appointments for interviews with respondents in advance. Overall four individual semi-structured interviews were conducted to fortify the data obtained from analyzed documents.
As Rubin & Rubin (2005: 3) have noted, a person can understand experiences in which he/ she has not participated through qualitative interviews. Ritchie & Lewis (2003: 36) affirm that individual interviews provide an undiluted focus on the individual and thus provide an opportunity for detailed investigation of people’s personal perspective. The initial plan was to conduct two individual semi-structured interviews with Limpopo DSAC Human Resource manager and Limpopo provincial Labour Inspector (DoL). The analysis of documents culminated with two additional individual interviews with managers for the Gender Focal Point and Gender, Youth, Disabled and Elderly integration programmes. Gender Focal Point is a special departmental programme dealing especially with issues around sexism and feminism.

An interview guide was prepared beforehand to assist the researcher to obtain relevant data from the respondents. The researcher was however free to further ask probing questions to obtain clarity on certain responses. Questions were also adapted during the course of the interview to suit individual respondents.

5.6.3. Questionnaires

The questionnaire used is divided into two sections. Section A covers respondents’ biographical information. Section B contains closed and open-ended statements addressing attitudes and opinions around recruitment or interviews and advertisements, development, EE/ Affirmative action as well as development. The compilation of the questionnaire was informed by information obtained from the literature study including derivations from journals studied. The compilation of the questionnaire for this study was amongst others informed by the following seven employment matters, listed in Strachan et al (2004:197), that organisations are required to address within their organisational analysis, namely;

- Recruitment procedures and selection criteria;
- Promotion, transfer and termination of employment of employees;
- Training and development for employees;
• Work organisation;
• Conditions of service of employees;
• Arrangements for dealing with sex-based harassment of women in the workplace; and
• Arrangements for dealing with pregnant employees and employees who are breastfeeding their children (Equal Opportunity for Women in the Workplace Agency, 2000;13 as cited in Strachan et al, 2004:197)

Questionnaires are believed to be effective in measuring feelings and attitudes. Ille (2002:31) comments that questionnaires allow the researcher to obtain more information about the respondents’ perceptions, feelings, beliefs, opinions and attitudes.

5.6.3.1. Measurement and Scoring Technique

A five-point summated or Likert scale was used as a unit of measurement for respondents’ reactions. A summated attitude scale consists of a collection of statements about the attitudinal object whereby respondents have to indicate the degree of agreement or disagreement in respect to each statement (Welman et al, 2005: 157). Different reactions are indicated by different scale rating from the highest positive response of 5 to the highest negative response of 1. Neutral responses are indicated by a rating of 3.

5.7. VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY

The use of triangulation in data collection is necessary to improve accuracy of collected data. A valid and reliable measuring instrument will yield accurate scores.

The appropriateness and reasonableness of the inferences made on the basis of the scores explains the validity of the data. Reliability is more concerned with the consistency with which a particular measuring instrument yields results, that is, the credibility of the findings
5.8. DATA ANALYSIS

This section is divided into two:

- Firstly qualitative data from documents and interviews will be analyzed in terms of identified themes.
- Secondly, quantitative data will be analyzed through descriptive statistics. Section A of the questionnaire describes the research sample in terms of biographic data. Section B describes the knowledge aspect.

5.8.1. ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF QUALITATIVE DATA

Qualitative data was collected through documents and interviews. Themes identified during document analysis provide the basis for analysis and interpretation of interview data. Documents analyzed include the Equity Report for 2008/2009; Citizens Report for 2007/2008 Departmental Annual Report for 2008/2009.

Welman (2005: 211) regards thematic coding as the most fundamental task in qualitative research. Themes are identified to assist the researcher in analyzing qualitative data from interviews and documents.

The model by Terreblanche & Durrheim (1999: 140-143) guided the researcher in analyzing data from interviews and documents. The model provides the following suggestions:

- That the researcher familiarizes himself/herself with preliminary meaning of data from experiences gathered through interviews,
- That the researcher identifies themes from the interviewees’ language, thinking processes, tensions and contradictions.
• That the researcher selects and categorizes themes from interviews, and
• That the researcher interprets data from themes to provide explanations, findings, summary and conclusion.

Welman et al (2005: 145) believe that new information gathered from documents clarifies interview focus. Documents were, as a result, given precedence in data analysis. Interview data was interrogated and reviewed on the basis of the information gathered from documents.

5.8.1.1. Institutional Systems

Although the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) requires organisations to develop institutional AA/ EE policies and plans as well as conduct periodic reviews, data gathered from documents indicate that the DSAC does not have an effective institutional AA policy. This data is corroborated by evidence gathered from interviews. Interviews with three managers at DSAC confirmed that what has been provided as the DSAC employment equity plan for the period 2006-2010 was merely a draft wherein consultation was not done. The absence of evidence of reports on assigned activities served as a confirmation that the plan has not been effective. Even though there is an indication of submission of equity reports, the Department has so far made no consultative effort with regard to the development of institutional EE policy and plan. In terms of the Employment Equity Act, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) the development of an institutional EE plan is a consultative process. The development thereof must include various stakeholders. It is the responsibility of individual organisations to ratify such regulations into sector-specific policies to ensure institutional flexibility.

5.8.1.2. Communication

Data from interviews acknowledges that even though the Department of Sport, Arts and Culture clearly communicates its AA goals in advertisements and through various internal and external communication channels, most respondents felt that these goals were not first
communicated and agreed on within the department. Their argument was that absence of institutional plans meant the absence of goals. It is therefore impossible to clearly communicate goals and consequently employees remain uninformed. Given that the available EE plan/policy is not effective, the situation painted in advertisements may be regarded as cosmetic.

5.8.1.3. Promotion Opportunities

Reports indicate a significant improvement with regard to female employment in middle management. This was confirmed by the views of interview respondents. Respondents agree that promotion opportunities at middle management are made available to women in Limpopo DSAC. Respondents are of the opinion that the department needs to accelerate employment of women into top management. This may be the consequence of the absence of clarity regarding institutional policies particularly gender equity.

5.8.1.4. Female Affirmation

Documents and interview data revealed the absence of clearly communicated EE institutional policies and plans. The Human Resource manager indicated that the Department occasionally conducts staff audits to establish its position with regard to employment of women in senior management positions. Despite that, other respondents are of the opinion that the Department should commit to effective and efficient development and implementation of EE policies to ensure female affirmation to SMS positions. Without internal policies, the Department will struggle to efficiently deal with issues of feminism and sexism.

5.8.1.5. Training and Development

All respondents acknowledged the unavailability of effective support programmes in the Department. It is in the best interest of EEA, 1998 (RSA, Act 55 of 1998a) that every organisation design programmes to empower designated groups as well as affirming members.
holding management positions from designated groups. It is imperative for the Department to commit to development, implementation and evaluation of institutional policies in order to clear uncertainty with regard to its position with regard to a gender equity implementation. Establishing best practice may guide the Department towards the achievement of successful implementation of gender equity.

5.8.2. ANALYSIS OF QUANTITATIVE DATA

Basic descriptive statistics were used to describe quantitative data collected through questionnaires. The questionnaire consisted of 23 statements which were measured differently. 21 statements were measured on a Likert-type scale. 1 of the remaining two statements was measured on a different attitude scale while the last statement was open-ended. Graphs, tables, frequencies and percentages were used to present biographic data. Frequencies and percentages were used for scoring questionnaire data. The scores were rated on a five point scale with the highest score of five (5) which is the highest positive score and the lowest score of one (1), which is the highest negative score. A scale rating of (5) represented Strongly Agree (SA), a high score of 4 represented Agree (A), an average score of 3 represented Neutral (N), a low score of 2 represented Disagree (DA) and the lowest score of 1 represented Strongly Disagree (SD). Positive responses are indicated by the scores of 4 and 5 while negative responses are indicated by the scores of 2 and 1. Neutral responses are indicated by a score of 3. For the purpose of analysis neutral responses will only be considered if they constitute 30% or more of the total responses.

The questionnaire contained positive and negative statements relating to particular themes to help the researcher to grasp respondents’ feelings, attitudes and perceptions in relation to gender equity implementation in Limpopo provincial DSAC.

Statements were clustered thematically to establish correspondence to qualitative data, study objectives and the literature studied. Frequencies were established per individual questionnaire statement and percentages were calculated. The magnitude of the percentages was used to
establish the direction of respondents’ attitudes, feelings and opinions towards a particular theme.

5.8.2.1. QUANTITIVE ANALYSIS OF BIOGRAPHIC DATA

5.8.2.1.1. Age by Gender

Figure 5.1 above indicates the age distribution of respondents according to gender. The summary in Table 5.1 indicates an almost equal number of male and female respondents which is a positive reflection of gender balance in employment. The above presentations indicate that there are fewer males in the first two age groups, that is, 20-30 years and 31-40 years and fewer female employees in the last two age groups, that is, 41-50 years and 51-60 years. Observations based on the analysis in Table 5.1 indicate that female employees exit the Department employment as they get older while male employments increase. The data suggest that promotion opportunities of the more experienced and mature female employees in the provincial DSAC diminish as they grow older. Although the three top positions in the
Department are occupied by women, the departmental organisational structure indicates more male employments in senior management as compared to female employments.

5.8.2.1.2. Marital Status

Table 5.3: Marital Status of Respondents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data provided in Table 5.2 indicate that only 44% of the female respondents are married as compared to 75% of the male respondents. 56% of the female respondents are single. The data in Table 5.1 indicate the decrease in the number of female employees in the older age groups. Given the analysis of the marital status above, it may thus be concluded that female employees are more likely to change jobs than males. This conclusion is based on the evidence provided in Table 5.2 which suggests that 75% of male employees in LPDSAC are married as compared to 44% of female employees. This may help to clarify the decrease in female employees from the 41-60 years age group.

5.8.2.1.3. Race and Disability Status of Respondents

The importance of including information on the race and disability status of the respondents was to allow the researcher to compare opinions and attitudes of various racial groups and physical status in relation to a gender equity implementation in the provincial DSAC. 100% of the respondents were Black and Not Disabled. Although Race and Disability Status are the
components of Affirmative Action, the focus of the study is on gender. This implies that the racial composition and numeric representation of the Disability Status may not directly impact the result thereof.

5.8.2.1.4. Positions and Educational Qualifications

Figure 5.2 below presents the analysis of respondents’ positions and educational qualifications.

The inclusion of respondents’ positions and qualifications sought to establish the professional level of the respondents. The graph indicates that the highest qualifications of the majority of respondents in management are at the degree and Honours/ Masters Level. The Department should provide development programmes to empower the historically disadvantaged groups and enhance professional advancement.
5.8.2.1.5. Educational Qualifications by Work Experience, Positions and Gender

Table 5.4: Respondents’ educational qualifications, work experience, positions held and gender.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Qualification</th>
<th>Work Experience</th>
<th>Position Held</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Certificate Total</td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Support staff</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma Total</td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Support staff</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6-10 years</td>
<td>Support staff</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree Total</td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Support staff</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6-10 years</td>
<td>Support staff</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11 years and</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>above</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honours/ Masters Total</td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Support staff</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-5 years</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6-10 years</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11 years and</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>above</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A larger percentage of the respondents have advanced academically. 81% of the respondents have Degrees and Honours/ Masters. The analysis reveals that both female and male respondents are academically advanced. 75% of the male respondents are in management while only 38% of the female respondents are in management. Evidence from the departmental organisational structure indicates a higher number of female employment as
compared to male employments. Despite the evidence highlighted above, the data in Table 5.3 above indicates more male employees in management as compared to female employments.

5.8.2.2. QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS OF QUESTIONNAIRE DATA

Statements were clustered thematically to establish correspondence to study objectives and the literature studied. Frequencies were established per individual questionnaire statement and percentages were calculated. The magnitude of the percentages was used to establish the direction of respondents’ attitudes, feelings and opinions towards a particular theme. Neutral responses are only considered if they constitute 30% or more of the total responses.

Table 5.5: Responses to Employment Equity Questions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire Statement</th>
<th>% Positive Response</th>
<th>% Negative Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>63*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>41*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>61*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>50*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>34*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* indicates a higher % of negative responses

The researcher sought to determine the relations and attitudes within the provincial DSAC with regard to employment of women in SMS positions. With regard to staff and male employees’ relations to female managers; 42% of the respondents indicated a negative response and 39% indicated a positive response. The analysis suggests prevalence of negative attitudes towards gender equity. 61% of the respondents reject the statement that gender equity is simply reverse discrimination against men and 63% deny the existence of gender
discrimination in the provincial DSAC. 41% of the respondents do not support the statement that women managers have a negative effect to service delivery.

Table 5.6: Responses to Promotion Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire Statement</th>
<th>% Positive Response</th>
<th>% Negative Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11*</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* indicates a Neutral score above 30%

With regard to questions on promotion, the researcher sought to determine respondents’ perceptions with regard to the provision of promotion opportunities for females in SMS positions. 66% of the respondents responded positively. 57% of the respondents hold the belief that promotion of women into SMS positions is more about the quota system than equity. 71% of the respondents agreed that Black women are mostly preferred for promotion than other races. Given that 100% of the respondents were Black the perception of high preference for black women in management is probable.

The equal percentage response with regard to the preference of older women for promotion to management positions is an indication of uncertainty among the respondents. 44% of the respondents responded positively and an equal 44% responded negatively. The data in Table 5.2 reflected a decline in female employees in the older age groups. The comparative analysis in Table 5.3 indicates evidence of more male employments in management. Based on the above analysis, it may be concluded that effective support systems to motivate women to management positions are necessary. The findings are therefore not surprising given that gender equity is a long-term process.
Table 5.7: Responses to Interviews and Advertisement Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire Statement</th>
<th>% Positive Response</th>
<th>% Negative response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20*</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21*</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* indicate the prevalence of a Neutral score above 30%

The researcher sought to determine whether good practice regarding advertisement and interview procedures is made in the provincial DSAC. 66% agreed and 16% disagreed that promotion opportunities are well communicated in the provincial DSAC. Asked whether advertisements for managerial positions are non-discriminatory, 57% of the respondents were positive while 22% responded negatively.

There is a feeling that interviews are not properly conducted in the provincial DSAC. A higher percentage of uncertainty is evidence that employees are dissatisfied or unclear about interviews in general. Asked whether interview questions are non-discriminatory 40% agreed, 34% were neutral and 26% disagreed. 9% of the respondents responded positively to the question of exit interviews, 59% were neutral while 31% disagreed.

Although 44% of the respondents agreed that the Departmental employment equity plan is considered during advertisements, an equal 44% disagreed. Evidence of equal negative and positive response indicates a lack of clarity with regard to gender equity.
The data in Table 5.7 highlights responses with regard to availability or non-availability of development or support programmes for women in the Limpopo provincial DSAC. The table summarizes responses to both negative and positive statements addressing the development and support questions. 61% responded positively to the statement that there are no programmes to empower women. Asked whether skills development programmes are well-communicated, 62% disagreed. 75% of the respondents confirmed the unavailability of effective support systems for women in the Limpopo provincial DSAC.

**Table 5.8: Responses to Development Questions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire Statement</th>
<th>% Positive Response</th>
<th>Negative Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ratings on employment and Suggestions on improvement of gender equity strategy

Respondents were asked to rate the Department in terms of the employment of women in management as well as give opinions on the improvement of the gender equity strategy. 37% of the respondents rated the provincial DSAC fair to poor in terms of employment of females in SMS positions. Their recommendations regarding the necessary improvement on the DSAC’s gender equity strategy mainly indicate the need for revision and adjustment of EE/AA policies. They further recommend the need for the development and implementation of development programmes and proper monitoring procedures. The majority of the sample, that is, 63% rated the department highly in terms of employment of females in SMS positions. From the responses, it is clear that their ratings were not based purely on the actual employment positions but rather on the argument against affirmative action. Their recommendations indicate the need for a shift away from a gender-focused EE strategy. They emphasize a need for skills-based employment and development strategy.
5.9. CONCLUSION

The focus of the study was mainly on establishing the Limpopo provincial DSAC’s strides in integrating women into senior management positions. The study received a positive response from the management and support staff in the provincial department.

Analysis of documents revealed special programmes on gender-related issues available in Limpopo Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The researcher was, as such, prompted to conduct additional individual interviews with managers for the Gender Focal Point and Gender, Youth, Disabled and Elderly integration programmes respectively.

As mentioned earlier on in the study, most writers maintain that triangulation improves data accuracy. It is therefore an attempt to corroborate findings within a single study. Woods (2006:4) adds that the use of different methods at different moments of time, in different places, among different people strengthens an account. The use of a variety of instruments provided more insight with regard to the departmental stance on gender-related issues.

The views and opinions of the respondents are considered as representative of the Limpopo provincial DSAC staff. The study mainly intended to establish the extent of implementation of gender equity in Limpopo provincial DSAC. Although the majority of the staff acknowledged the Departmental improvement with regard to employment of women in management, it is also agreed that there is still much uncertainty with regard to issues affecting women in management. It has been observed that although women have infiltrated management, most women are employed in middle management.
CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents conclusions and recommendations based on the findings made throughout the study. Reference to relevant literature is made to alert one to the challenges highlighted by the study and to set the stage for recommendations.

A suggested normative approach to employment equity (gender) programme in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is recommended. Limitations of the study and problems encountered are highlighted. The last part will present a summary of the entire study.

6.2. CONCLUSIONS

The results of the study have shown that women are mostly employed in middle management. Although the top three highest departmental positions are held by females, the employment statistics indicate a higher percentage of male employments in senior management. The study reveals that the implementation of affirmative action in DSAC is rudimentary and unplanned due to the absence of a departmental AA/EE plan.

Although structures have been established, there is no evidence of developed departmental AA/EE policies. Structures need to move from intention to action. The study has proven that the department has taken no action to integrate gender considerations in its transformation. Gender consideration is one of the priority areas of public service transformation.

Given the absence of support programmes and development opportunities for women, it may be concluded that the monitoring and evaluation structures within respective departmental accountability bodies, namely the Quality Assurance, Public Service Commission and the
Premier’s office are questionable. Successful AA/ EE implementation requires effective performance monitoring.

6.3. RECOMMENDATIONS

Previous studies on gender equity implementation indicate that women are faced with many challenges with regard to employment in senior management. There is a prevalence of policy loopholes that need to be addressed for the successful integration of gender equity within Limpopo provincial DSAC.

The findings highlighted above defeat the intentions of the integration of gender considerations in the transformation of the South African Public Service, as outlined in the National Framework (DPSA, 2006:12). Following is a recommended approach for effective development and implementation of a gender-focused AA/ EE policies and programmes within DSAC:

6.3.1. Monitoring and Evaluation

The absence of monitoring and evaluation processes is a major causal factor leading to poor policy development and implementation. There is a need for the development and establishment of monitoring and evaluation body to ensure effective development and implementation of AA/ EE programme.

6.3.2. Performance Measurement

Earlier in the literature, previous studies showed that lack of top management commitment to affirmative action efforts act as a hindrance to the successful implementation thereof. Commitment to AA/ EE should be used to measure performance of top management to ensure efficient and effective implementation.
6.3.3. Support and Development opportunities

Findings of studies by the Black Management Forum (1993) indicate that lack of management commitment to performance management as a means of training and developing people from designated groups into fully productive employees’ defeats affirmative action efforts. The study reveals that there is evidence of poor support for women in management in DSAC. The Department has no special development and support programmes for women. It is evident from data analysis that women are equally academically competent to men. A significant number of female respondents have academic qualifications beyond degrees. As mentioned in the literature, women still continue to face significant obstacles to achieving credibility as leaders, despite their advanced educational credentials (Broadnax, 2000:261-262). It is widely known that the employment history in South Africa had discriminated against women. A majority of women in South Africa are believed to lack managerial and leadership competencies. Mentorship programmes should be established for skills enrichment purposes. All top management should participate in mentoring which should also constitute part of their performance measurement.

6.3.4. Integration of Plans

The findings of the study indicate the availability of special programmes that deal with gender issues. All government departments are required to facilitate the development of intervention strategies and mechanisms to achieve the strategic objective of women’s empowerment and gender equality (DPSA, 2006:2). Having appointed the manager for Gender Focal Point the Department should work towards integrating the Human Resource plan, with specific plans for special gender-focused programmes, namely; Gender Focal Point and Youth, Disabled and Elderly integration programmes to establish an active strategy that will yield positive results. A built-in reporting system should be concurrently established to effect continuous reporting and curb deviations from planned programmes. Such programmes should be the primary responsibility of the Gender Focal Point manager to ensure progress and efficiency as well as
to reduce overload on the Human Resource manager. Senior management should also form part of the serving committee as an indication of their support to the programme.

6.4. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

To limit the tendency to generalize, the following limitations observed are highlighted:

- The focus of the study was on women in senior management within the provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture in Limpopo. The findings made might apply in other departments across the country but such an assumption does not guarantee any generalization.
- Only Blacks participated in the study. The findings therefore represent a particular group of women (Black) within Limpopo provincial DSAC. It may thus be difficult to draw a clear female perspective with regard to the study in question.
- Inability to secure senior management participation in the study may create a barrier with regard to actual departmental position on gender-focused AA/ EE programmes.
- Departmental understaffing may also affect the outcome. The size of the sample as such might have affected the conclusions reached. The results due to sample size might present difficulty in comparing the experiences of different groups of women.

The research findings provided enough material to analyze issues around gender and promotions in the Limpopo provincial DSAC.

6.5. PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED DURING DATA COLLECTION

Having succeeded in collecting and analyzing data, the following are some of the problems encountered during data collection:

- Delays in obtaining departmental permission to conduct research
- Absence of respondents from work due to work-related workshops and meetings
- Misplaced questionnaires in respondents’ possession
In spite of the problems encountered, the study developed into a complete cycle as envisaged. The conclusions drawn and recommendations made were in line with observations made in the course of the study.

6.6. SUMMARY

The legacy of apartheid and the repression of women caused great employment disparities and the high level of poverty in the South African community. Women in management are largely affected by class issues.

South Africa, like many other countries across the globe, has taken conscious measures to redress past inequalities in the labour market through the institution of progressive labour market legislations. Notwithstanding the development and implementation of anti-discriminatory labour laws, women in South Africa still experience different forms of male domination. Very few women, regardless of their professional qualifications, find themselves in very senior positions. McLennan (1994:138) believes that public administration in South Africa, both in theory and practice, has been a male-dominated field. Women are found to be minimally represented in top management positions in the civil service.

Labour market legislation should be seen as a key instrument in redressing past labour inequalities, disadvantage and discrimination of particular groups in the labour market. Equal Employment opportunity will be achieved when all gaps between diverse groups have been eliminated and the disadvantaged individuals brought to a level where they can compete equally and be given equal opportunity to do so without any form of discrimination.

Data collected by Statistics South Africa in 1998 also showed great gender discrepancy in top management given that 45, 69% of professionals were male while 55, 31% were female. In spite of the professional differences women constituted only 27, 45% while men constituted 72, 55% and this was a clear indication that women were not restricted by a lack of ability at lower levels but rather by institutional issues.
The International Labour Organisation (ILO) maintains that it will take another five centuries before women and men reach equal status in the workplace, regardless of women being more qualified than their male management colleagues in developing countries.

The Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) has laid a solid foundation for the establishment of labour laws through the equality clause. The legislative framework for the Republic of South African (RSA) labour practice was therefore established and employers were presented with an opportunity to transform the RSA workplace through the relevant labour regulating Acts.

The Constitution Act, 1996 (RSA, Act 108 of 1996) sets the foundation for the legislative framework of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture as set out in the departmental HR plan (Limpopo provincial DSAC Human Resource Plan 2007-2008:3). The Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture is committed to redressing the imbalances of the past through a representative workforce and the implementation of numerical goals that are set out this plan within a defined period (Limpopo provincial DSAC Human Resource Plan 2007-2008:2). Through this study, the researcher aimed to analyze the implementation of employment equity programme with specific reference to gender equity in the Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture in Limpopo Province. The study intended to establish whether women are advancing into top management positions within the Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture.

The study was descriptive. The focus of the study was on the evaluation of the implementation of the employment equity programme in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. The methodology of this research is described in terms of the following sections: Research design; Data collection procedures; Population; Sampling; Data collection instruments and Data analysis.

Both qualitative and quantitative data collection methods were used in generating the data. Analysis and interpretation considered the nature of the data in relation to the literature and
study objectives. Qualitative data was collected through documents and interviews. Themes identified during document analysis provided the basis for analysis and interpretation of interview data.

Basic statistics were used in analysis of quantitative data. Graphs and tables were used to present biographic data. Statements were clustered thematically to establish correspondence to study objectives and the literature studied. Frequencies were established per individual questionnaire statement and percentages were calculated. The magnitude of the percentages was used to establish the direction of respondents’ attitudes, feelings and opinions towards a particular theme. Neutral responses will only be considered if they constitute 30% or more of the total responses. The views and opinions of the respondents are considered as representative of the DSAC staff. Based on the conclusions drawn, it is agreed that there is still much uncertainty with regard to issues affecting women in management. It has been observed that although women have infiltrated management, most women are in middle management. The number of women in top management is therefore insufficient.
REFERENCE LIST


Human, L. 1995. _Multiculturalism and Managing Diversity: Are they the same?_ Volume 11. Number 4


Synder, M. Berry, F. & Mavima, P. 1996. Gender policy on Development assistance: Improving implementation results. World Development 24


Ziehl, S. 2000. *Affirmative action and equal opportunity policies, the relevance of a dead German*. Society in transition. Volume 31. Issue 1
APPENDIX A
To the Management of Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture

Request for completion of research questionnaire

Research Topic: Evaluating Implementation of Employment Equity Programme (with reference to gender) in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture

Sir/ Madam

This questionnaire forms part of the research for the Masters programme in Public Planning and Development Administration. The researcher is a registered post-graduate student at Stellenbosch University. As stated in the topic, the purpose of this study is to evaluate the extent of the implementation of employment equity programme with reference to gender in the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture.

I humbly request you to volunteer your co-operation in completing the attached questionnaire. The information supplied will assist the researcher in evaluating implementation of the programme in question. The information is solely needed for study purposes. Anonymity and confidentiality are strictly guaranteed. There is neither right nor wrong responses. All responses will be treated with respect. Guidance with regard to selecting suitable responses is provided.

I truly appreciate the urgency and effort dedicated towards the completion of this questionnaire given your tight schedules.

Thank you, in advance

--------------------------------------
Nkoana NM (Ms)
nthabisengnkoano@yahoo.com (072 355 2697)
APPENDIX B

RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE

SECTION A

BIOGRAPHIC DATA

Mark with an X where appropriate:

1. Age (in years)

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20-30</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>41-45</td>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>60 and above</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Gender

| Female | Male |

3. Population Group

| Black | Chinese | Coloured | Indian | White |

4. Marital Status

| Divorced | Married | Single | Widowed |

5. Disability Status

| Disabled | Not disabled |

6. Highest Educational Qualification

| Matric | Higher Certificate | Diploma | Degree | Honours/Masters | Doctorate |

7. Position held

| Management | Support staff |

8. Work Experience (in years) at Limpopo Provincial DSAC
The following statements are attempts to evaluate the extent of employment equity implementation in relation to gender at the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. Please circle **O** or make a **cross X** on the option that best represent your response.

The responses are categorized as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. There are patterns of gender discrimination ….. within the department.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. There are no programs in place to empower …. women.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Promotion opportunities in management are…. made available for women.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Sexual harassment in relation to promotion….. does not exist in the Department.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Promotion of women is more about …………. numbers than equity.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Women managers have a negative effect……. on overall service delivery</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Gender equity is merely reverse……………. discrimination against men.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Employing women in management…………. is a positive means to achieving affirmative action.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Older women are mostly preferred for……. promotion in management than young women.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Black women are more likely to be……… considered for promotion than other racial groups……..</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11. Disabled women are seldom preferred for promotion. 5 4 3 2 1
12. Male employees relate well to women managers 5 4 3 2 1
13. Promotion opportunities are well communicated in the Department. 5 4 3 2 1
14. Skills development opportunities are provided for female employees. 5 4 3 2 1
15. Strong support systems are available for women in management. 5 4 3 2 1
16. The level of institutional flexibility in relation to family responsibility is acceptable. 5 4 3 2 1
17. Staff response is positive towards women in management. 5 4 3 2 1
18. Advertisement for managerial posts are non-discriminatory. 5 4 3 2 1
19. The departmental employment equity plan is considered when advertising posts. 5 4 3 2 1
20. Interview questions are non-discriminatory. 5 4 3 2 1
21. Exit interviews are conducted. 5 4 3 2 1

NB. The question below will assist the researcher in the assessment of the development level of gender equity at the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture. Five different responses are given. Select the response that best indicate your rating: Tick in the box next to the appropriate response.

22. How do you rate the employment of women into senior management positions in Department of Sport, Arts and Culture?

|--------------|--------|--------|--------|-------------|

101
23. Do you think the Limpopo Provincial Department of Sport, Arts and Culture still need to improve on their gender equity strategy? If yes, what are your recommendations?

THANK YOU FOR YOUR CO-OPERATION.
APPENDIX C
INTERVIEW GUIDE

Does the DSAC have its own institutional policy (gender strategy) to facilitate the employment of women into senior management positions?

Does the department clearly communicate its goals regarding AA in post advertisements?

What is the Limpopo Provincial DSAC’s current employment status in senior management services (SMS) in terms of gender?

In the absence of departmental AA policy, how does the Department assess its progress/ EE status with regard to the employment of women in SMS positions?

In your opinion, do you think the Department has strategies in place to ensure institutional flexibility for women in particular?
Given the current state of affairs, do you think the Limpopo Provincial DSAC have any systems in place to support women in SMS positions?

What informed best practice has the Department established to guide its AA implementation regarding the promotion of women into SMS positions so far?

THANK YOU