SERVICE DELIVERY IMPROVEMENT IN THE WESTERN CAPE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (WCED): A TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT (TQM) APPROACH.

DARIUS D. CORNELISSEN

Thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Masters in Public Administration presented to the University of Stellenbosch.

Supervisor: Prof. Erwin Schwella

December 2005
# TABLE OF CONTENT

| Declaration | i |
| Acknowledgement | ii |
| Abstract | iii |
| Opsomming | iv |
| List of tables | vi |
| List of figures | vii |

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Importance of research</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Problem statement</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Aim of the study</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Research design and methodology</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 2: SERVICE DELIVERY IMPROVEMENT (SDI): SELECTED THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Definition for service delivery improvement</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Characteristics of the service delivery process</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>A framework for service delivery improvement</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>General approaches to service delivery improvement in an organisation</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Techniques for service delivery improvement</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1</td>
<td>The Gap Zapper</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2</td>
<td>TQM</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3</td>
<td>Benchmarking</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.4</td>
<td>Business Excellence Model</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.5</td>
<td>Service Level Agreements</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.6</td>
<td>The Balanced Scorecard</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.7</td>
<td>The Star Model</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Service delivery improvement in the public service</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.1</td>
<td>ISO 9000</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.2</td>
<td>The Charter Mark</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3</td>
<td>Investors in People</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.4</td>
<td>The Balanced Scorecard</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.5</td>
<td>The Public Service Excellence Model</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Service delivery improvement in education</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 3:** TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT (TQM) IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR: CONCEPTS AND CHALLENGES

| 3.1     | Introduction                                | 44 |
| 3.2     | Definition of Total Quality Management      | 44 |
| 3.3     | Essential elements of Total Quality Management | 47 |
| 3.4     | Benefits of Total Quality Management        | 48 |
| 3.5     | Total Quality Management in the public sector | 50 |
| 3.5.1   | The systems approach                        | 54 |
| 3.5.2   | The input-output model                      | 54 |
| 3.5.3   | Teamwork                                    | 55 |
| 3.6     | A normative model of Total Quality Management for service delivery improvement in the public sector | 56 |
CHAPTER 4: WESTERN CAPE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (WCED) AND SERVICE DELIVERY IMPROVEMENT

4.1 Introduction 68
4.2 WCED: Relevant contextual matters 68
4.2.1 General context of WCED 68
4.2.2 Corporate context 70
4.3 Service delivery improvement in the WCED: current reality 73
4.3.1 Legislation and policies applicable to service delivery improvement 73
4.3.2 Programmes of the WCED to improve service delivery 77
4.3.3 Implementation of SDIP/Programme in WCED 80
4.4 Summary 82

CHAPTER 5: RESEARCH FINDINGS AND EVALUATION

5.1 Introduction 84
5.2 An evaluation of WCED SDIP against the PSEM 85
5.3 Research findings 91
5.3.1 Enablers 93
CHAPTER 6: **SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION**

6.1 Introduction 102
6.2 Recommendations 102
6.3 Conclusion 107
6.4 Further research recommendations 109

Appendix: Service Delivery Improvement Plan / Programme of WCED for the 2002 / 2003 year 110

References 113
Declaration

I, the undersigned hereby declare that the work contained in this study project is my own original work and that I have not previously in its entirety or in part submitted it to any university for the purpose of a degree qualification.

Signature : ......................................................

Date : December 2005
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the following persons:

- First and foremost, I would like to thank God for the wisdom, strength and courage bestowed upon me in this research project;

- My wife, Belinda, for the unselfish love and endless support, understanding and tolerance throughout the research;

- Professor Erwin Schwella, my study leader who believed in me and who guided me through the research, gave me invaluable information that I lacked and offered me endless assistance throughout the research;

- The staff of the library of the Stellenbosch University, Bellville Park Campus, for their co-operation and assistance;

- The staff and colleagues of the Western Cape Education Department for their invaluable support during the interviews;

- Mr Karel van der Molen for the proof-reading and editing of my research project.

I would like to dedicate this research project to my late mother, wife and two children, Megan and Herschelle.
Total Quality Management (TQM) sets out a framework for managers on how to improve business performance in all types of organisations. Organisational excellence must be integrated into the strategy of business through an understanding of the key business processes and the development of people. Once the processes are identified they must be prioritised into those that require continuous improvement, those which require re-engineering or re-design, and those which lead to a complete re-think or visioning of the business.

Performance-based measurement of all processes and people development activities is necessary to determine progress so that the vision, goals, mission and critical success factors may be examined and if necessary, reconstituted to meet the requirements for the organisation and its customers, internal and external.

The principles of TQM are becoming increasingly important in the public sector due to the demands for increased levels of stakeholder satisfaction. Increasingly, public sector organisations have to commit their services to the delivery of customer-oriented quality. In doing so, they are encountering a series of barriers.

This research project investigated the issues involved in introducing TQM into public sector organisations. A number of TQM models are reviewed and an eclectic implementation model is developed. The model emphasises change steps, which an organisation needs to undertake, as well as a detailed implementation strategy that may be followed by educational institutions.
OPSOMMING

Totale Kwaliteitbestuur bied ’n raamwerk vir bestuurders oor hoe om besigheidsprestasie in alle tipe van instansies te verbeter. Organisatoriese briljantheid moet geïntegreer word in die besigheidstrategie deur die sleutel besigheidsprosesse en die ontwikkeling van menslike hulpbronne te verstaan. As die prosesse geïdentifiseer is, moet dit gepriotiseer word in dit wat deurlopende verbetering benodig, dit wat herskepping verg en dit wat lei tot ’n totale herredenering of visionering van die besigheid.

Prestasie-gebaseerde meting van alle prosesse en menslike ontwikkeling aktiwiteite is nodig om vordering te bepaal. Dit sal daartoe lei dat die visie, doelwitte, missie en kritieke sukses faktore ontleed kan word en herbevestig indien nodig om die verwagtinge van die organisasie en sy kliente (intern en ekstern) na te kom.

Die beginsels van Totale Kwaliteitbestuur is toenemend besig om belangrik te word in die openbare sektor as gevolg van die aanvraag na verhoogde vlakke van bevrediging deur aandeelhouers asook die koste vermindering en prestasie programme van die regering. Toenemend moet openbare instansies hul hulpbronne bestee aan die lewering van kwaliteit. Sodoende trotseer hulle ’n reeks van struikelblokke.

Die navorsing is gebaseer op bo genoemde aspekte betrokke by die bekendstelling van Totale Kwaliteitbestuur in publieke sektor instansies. ’n Hele paar Totale Kwaliteitbestuur modelle word oorweeg en ’n eklektiese Totale Kwaliteitbestuurmodel word ontwikkel. Die model beklemtone “verandering” stappe wat ’n instansie moet doen sowel as ’n implementeringsstrategie wat deur instansies gevolg kan word.
Implementeringstruikelblokke en sukses faktore vir Totale Kwaliteitbestuur in onderwys word aangebied.
## List of tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Quality standards</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Comparison between WCED Service Delivery Improvement Plan/ Programme and Public Service Excellence Model</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Differences between traditional and quality management</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Sharing the vision</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>Characteristics of a continuous improvement process</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>The stages of continuous improvement</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>Phases of a service delivery improvement programme</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>The Gap Zapper</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>McKinsey 7S Model</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>The Balanced Scorecard</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>The Star Model</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Simple input-output model</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>The Public Service Excellence Model</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>Self-assessment steps</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

1.1 Introduction

Service delivery improvement is one of the national government’s flagship initiatives to improve service delivery in the public service and the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) is not excluded from this as a provincial education department.

The study intends to analyze service delivery improvement in the WCED. Recommendations will then be made about individual performance systems, organisational goals, the enhancement of the performance and productivity of employees, facilitation of improved performance and review and the measurement of the performance of the organisation from a Total Quality Management (TQM) perspective.

1.2 Background


In terms of Part III C of the Public Service Regulations of 2001, executive authorities are responsible for the establishment and implementation of a service delivery programme for their departments.
The Member of the Executive Committee (MEC) and the Head of Department are responsible for:

(a) specifying the main services to be provided to the different types of actual and potential customers, as identified by the department;

(b) consultation agreements with the department’s actual and potential customers;

(c) specifying the mechanisms or strategies to be utilized to remove the barriers that access to services is increased;

d) indicating standards for the main services to be provided;

e) arrangements as to how information about the department’s services are to be provided; and

(f) stipulating a system or mechanism for complaints.

It is further expected of an executive authority to publish annual statements of public service commitment. These documents set out the department’s service standards that citizens can expect, and which will serve to explain how the department will meet each of the standards.

The issues of sustainability, response to the needs of public, accessibility of services are key in the delivery of effective services. Public officials, therefore, should have the right skills, knowledge and attitude to do justice to this request.

In the context of the prescribed service delivery improvement programme of the government, quality management as an approach will be analyzed and investigated and this forms the basis for the research.
1.3 Importance of the research

Rendering services of a high standard of professional ethics that is efficient and economic, as well as the effective use of resources, is an issue that continues to raise interest. It further demands attention and deliberations in the context of the transformation of the South African Public Service.

The practical and fundamental importance of this study is therefore, to establish how the Total Quality Management (TQM) approach to the improvement of service delivery can contribute to the enhancement of the quality of service at every level and in every activity of the WCED. This approach will be based on teamwork, trust and respect, examining the process through which work gets done in a systematic, consistent, organisation wide manner. Qualitative methods and analytical techniques will be used for expanding knowledge and expertise in process improvement.

1.4 Problem statement

The lack or absence of TQM impedes on the effective and efficient delivery of services in the WCED. The research problem which arises from the above-mentioned statement and which this study seeks to provide answers to is:

- Are quality frameworks leading to improved longitudinal organisational performance in the WCED?
- How does top management in terms of usefulness perceive these frameworks when compared with others?
- Is there a distinctive preferred approach by top management at the WCED?
1.5 **Aim of the study**

The aim of the study is to conduct in-depth research into the elements and benefits of TQM, the link with service delivery improvement as well as to compare the Service Delivery Improvement Plan (SDIP) of the WCED with a normative model.

1.6 **Research design and methodology**

A qualitative research design approach has been selected in conjunction with a case study method. The term case study refers to the fact that a limited number of units of analysis such as an individual, a group or an institution, are studied intensively (Welman, et al., 2001:182). It directs towards the understanding of the uniqueness and idiosyncrasy of a particular case in all its complexity.

As far as the research procedure is concerned, participant observation, unstructured interviews, documents and content analysis were used to collect the data about service delivery in the Western Cape Education Department (WCED). A comparison was drawn between the Public Service Excellence Model (PSEM) and the Service Delivery Improvement Plan (SDIP) of the WCED against the background of the accepted normative TQM approach.

The research methodology involved two aspects. Firstly, focus groups were used with representative focus groups, composed of senior public sector managers representing a cross-section of the WCED. The data from these groups enabled tentative conclusions to be drawn in regard to the research questions and also helped in developing the comparative table.
Secondly, semi-structured interviews were used to explore, in more depth, the findings from the focus groups and to achieve triangulation. At least one representative from each level in top management of the WCED was interviewed.

The type of sampling that was used to identify individuals with whom to conduct the interviews is the non-probability type and specifically purposive sampling. Preference was given to the MEC, Head of Education, Deputy Director Generals, Chief Directors and Directors on account of their positions and experience. The availability of the Head of Education was a cause of concern during the data collection process, but due to the application of structured telephonic interviews as an alternative, these constraints were overcome.

In view of the fact that the researcher himself is the research instrument, an attempt was made to corroborate the findings against at least two different approaches, namely participant observation and systematic observation. Participant observation required the researcher, for an extensive period of time to take part in, and report on the daily experiences of the members of the group, community or organisation, or the people involved in the process of service delivery.

In participant observation, one does not observe the experiences of the individuals involved or detached outsiders, but experiences them first-hand as insiders (Welman, et.al., 2001: 184). The researcher thus became part of the group or event that was studied. The research situation was approached with a minimum of preconceived ideas, which allowed for room to follow up a host of clues that the researcher noticed.
A special application of systematic observation occurred in the content of human and personal documents. This was done with open-ended questions and the contents of the unstructured interviews in order to report in a qualitative way of the essence of the contents of such interviews. The contents of the annual reports, journals, circulars, policy documents and national directives were being examined systematically to record the performance of the WCED against the PSEM during the period from 2001 to 2003.

For the purpose of review, the researcher has received a large number of publications, reports and papers relating to the performance of the WCED over the last three years. Reports of government publications including legislation, consultation papers, annual reports and official guidance were also reviewed. Information gathered from the various interviews formed part of the various quality management schemes currently in existence and the development of quality management and performance improvement in the public sector over recent years. The research report summarises the main findings of the review and should be read in conjunction with the case study report and the findings during the unstructured interviews.

1.6 Summary

It requires a quantum leap in terms of operational performance to reach world class performance. The real challenge for organisations today is to create a culture of sustained continuous improvement. In this sense continuous improvement means growing the organisation through a focused strategy, development of private partnerships, adding value to services rendered as well as to reduce the total cost base of the organisation.
Chapter two will cover the theoretical aspects of service delivery improvement illustrating the characteristics of continuous improvement and highlighting the requirement for service delivery improvement.

Chapter three will cover the concepts and challenges relating to Total Quality Management (TQM) as an approach to improved service delivery.

Chapter four will describe the current realities in the WCED and compare its service delivery improvement plan with a normative model. It will further analyze the service delivery gaps in the Department.

Chapter five will highlight the main research findings and evaluate it against the PSEM, whilst chapter six will cover the conclusions and give recommendations for the successful implementation of TQM in the WCED.
CHAPTER 2
SERVICE DELIVERY IMPROVEMENT (SDI): SELECTED
THEORECTICAL PERSPECTIVES

2.1        Introduction

In the previous chapter an overview was given of the importance of the study project, the problem statement and the aim of the study. It further referred to the research design and methodology that was followed by the researcher.

In this chapter the focus will be on service delivery improvement (SDI). SDI leads to the improvement of the overall performance of the organisation. In order to focus on SDI the following objectives will be pursued here:
- a definition of SDI and the reasons for it;
- the main characteristics of SDI will be discussed;
- a framework for SDI will be provided;
- the general models applicable to SDI will be discussed; and
- public sector models of SDI as well as techniques for SDI will be discussed.

2.2        Definition for service delivery improvement

Service delivery involves the actual production or provision of goods and services to the community. This needs to be conducted in accordance with plans and within the allocated budgetary funds (Public Service Commission, 2002). The emphasis of a service delivery improvement plan is to improve and increase service delivery within the available budget of a Government Department. The overall goal of the programme is for service delivery to be as efficient and effective as possible, which may involve the delivery of service by either the private or public sector. One can thus say that service
delivery improvement is the provision of the same or better goods and services to the community with the same or less resources available.

What are the main reasons for service delivery improvement? According to Kaul, 1998: 70 public service reforms of which a key component has been the rethinking of public service delivery, have been driven by economic pressures and by increasing expectations from consumers and have been enabled by the renewed sense of managerial possibility, which has emerged internationally. This possibility consists as far as service delivery is concerned of a wider range of alternative mechanisms and potential service providers that had previously been envisaged. Quality management and the involvement of public servants in the renewal process are the origins of improved service delivery (Kaul 1998:70).

2.3 Characteristics of service delivery improvement process

Service delivery improvement prosper in organisations that exhibit special characteristics along interrelated dimensions, viz. vision, culture, organisation, leadership, strategic management, performance focus or results focus and skills building (Dichter, 1991 and Kiernan, 1993). What now follows is a discussion of these characteristics. It needs to be mentioned that many organisations may exhibit some of these characteristics, but the continuously improving organisation inculcates them systematically by building them into their systems and day-to-day activities.

The continuous improvement journey starts with a vision of what the
An organisation should become. It represents top management’s expectations in terms of values, strategies and outcomes to be pursued. Any attempt at culture change could be given with a clear vision of the new strategy and what it will take to make it work. Organisations are driven by a vision, not by directives from the chain of command (Harvey & Brown, 2001: 432).

Latham in Harvey & Brown (2001: 432) goes further to define a vision as a mental image of a possible and desirable future state of the organisation, which articulates a view of realistic, credible, attractive future for the organisation, a condition that is better in some important ways than what now exists. An effective vision should be challenging, inspiring and aimed at empowering people at all levels. It is important that the vision is shared, meaning that all levels of the organisation are involved and communicated with.

**Figure 1: Sharing the vision**

![Diagram showing the process of sharing the vision, rewarding performance, empowering the individual, and developing trust.]

Source: Harvey, 2001
A shared vision provides a starting point for cultural and organisational transition. A shared vision should be simple, easily understood, clear and energizing. Figure 1 illustrates the steps that should be followed to develop a shared vision.

For an organisation to be successful a particular cultural should be prevalent throughout it. Organisational culture is a complex, multidimensional and multilevel concept with roots in the disciplines of social anthropology and sociology. Harvey, 2001: 433 defines culture as a set of values for setting priorities on what is important, and the way “things are done around here”.

Due to this, culture is a critical factor in the implementation of a new strategy. An organisation’s culture can be a major strength where there is a fit with the strategy and can be a driving force in implementing a successful change.

The definition, allows for the existence of different subcultures within the same organisation, thus there can all units and others that are unit specific share certain beliefs and values. Culture both reflects and encourages member action and has performance consequences for the organisation. In view of the above-mentioned it is important that one look at the four key characteristics of a continuous improvement culture as identified by McKinsey in Minnie (1195: 51). The areas of focus for each key characteristic are shown in figure 2.

The way an institution is organized has an impact on how tasks are performed. A continuously improving organisation needs a structure that encourages teamwork, empowerment and learning to guide ideas into decisions and actions. According to Sallis (1993), organisations following a continuous improvement philosophy tend to have flatter, flexible structures,
less administrative intensity and greater distribution of power and authority at lower levels in the hierarchy. Work typically gets done in self-management teams where individual members are empowered to look for opportunities to improve performance and take actions without relying on procedures or orders from above to act.

All organisations must become and remain as learning organisations. A learning organisation is one that puts a high premium on the acquisition, creation, transfer and retention of knowledge. A learning organisation is very adept at changing its behaviour in the light of new knowledge or circumstances, and the learning organisation abhors making the same mistake or reinventing the wheel (Minervini, 2003:48). Leadership plays a pre-eminent role in continuous improvement by creating a vision for the organisation as well as its social architecture (culture) to support that vision. A continuously improving organisation will typically have vision and value-driven leadership. The key tasks of the leader of such an organisation are to install a clear, shared sense of purpose and to encourage teamwork, empowerment, exploration, and risk taking within the organisation. The leader has to encourage these values not only by what he/she says, but also by what he/she does.

Heifetz (1994) distinguishes leadership from the positions of authority, which usually are thought to be its starting point. The author goes further to say that the term leadership involves our self-images and moral codes. Leadership is the interpersonal influence that gets and individual or group to do what needs to be done. Thus, effective leadership is crucial in any organisation. Visionary and dynamic leaders have a lot to do with the success of their organisation.
It is true to say that managers must be able to lead and leaders must be able to manage. In fundamental terms, this means that the leader sets the basic direction for the organisation through formulating and communicating the
vision and helping to create an organisational culture, and the managers are to implement it. Besides that, managers can be leaders within their own domains.

The implementation of a continuous improvement vision entails development and implementing policies, strategies, and structures needed for continuous learning. It is important however to note that leadership and management are not quite the same thing. Management essentially encompasses tasks such as planning, organizing, motivating and controlling. One can be relatively effective at doing this - following the organisation’s rule and procedures, maintaining systems and by large, getting the job done – without being a leader. But the manager that is also a leader goes beyond this, not only creating a favorable environment, but also in inspiring employees and keeping their focus on organisational objectives (Minervini, 2003:24).

Service delivery improvement does not just happen. It must be planned for. Service delivery improvement needs to be approached systematically using a rigorous strategic planning process. Strategic planning is one of the major planks of TQM. Without clear long-term direction the institution cannot plan for quality improvement. This can only be achieved within the context of a corporate strategy. Underlying the strategy must be the concept of strengthening the customer focus. A strong strategic vision is one of the most important critical success factors for any institution.

The main benefit of strategic planning is that it enables the formulation of long-term priorities, and it enables institutional change to be tackled in a rational manner. Without strategy an institution cannot be certain that it is best placed to exploit opportunities as they develop. The real significance is
that it directs senior managers’ attention away from day-to-day issues and forces a re-examination of the main purposes of the institution and its key relationships with its customers. Strategy must be based around the various customer groups and their expectations, and from these policies and plans which can deliver the mission and progress the vision.

Results give momentum to a change process by motivating and energizing people. A second important concept is the fact that changing behaviour leads to changing attitudes. Changes needs to occur on so many fronts simultaneously that everyone would find it impossible to continue behaving in the old way. The new culture must encourage new performances. A typical performance management system starts when management decides on performance goals. Performance targets are set, and clear performance criteria are determined for the employee to meet. The employee’s progress and problems encountered form the subject of regular discussions between the manager and employee. Once targets are achieved, managers should celebrate their achievement with employees to increase their level of motivation and commitment, and reinforce positive behavior (Minervini, 2003: 45 - 46).

For any organisation to continuous improve the delivery of service the skills of employees should also be constantly developed to keep abreast with the demands of the job. Everyone has his or her own job-specific skills, but care should be taken to maximize their transferability. This can be achieved by continuous training in new aspects of these skills to ensure that the employee is comfort- able with the latest developments, and by ensuring that the employee is exposed to related skills through job rotation (Minervini, 2003: 122).
The process of skills building is gradual and takes place in all four of the stages of continuous improvement (see figure 3). The fourth stage is the ultimate target. In the first stage of skills building, the focus is only on basic qualification requirements, so that no skills development takes place. In the second stage of jump-starting continuous improvement, skills development is limited and is not focused on organisational requirements. In this stage poor career management is exhibited.

The situation improves during the third stage, when skills development is focused on organisational requirements. In this stage poor career management is exhibited. The situation improves during the third stage, when skills development is focused on institutional requirements and career development for “high fliers”. The fourth and target stage in which continuous improvement is maintained completes the process. Highly developed career management and the nurturing of world-class skills in required areas characterize this stage (Minnie, 1999: 74).

The stages must be well documented so that they can be used as comparative instruments. Thus, the documentation of each pre-defined stage of change serves not to entrench a process but to measure it and improve on it. The culture of improvement is one of ongoing re-examination and renewal of the format of work (Graham, 1994). In continuous improvement, the perceived best practices, job descriptions, employment categories and promotion positions change to meet client demands (Graham, 1994). Furthermore, a continuous improving organisation enhances the culture of constant learning, which includes skills building, knowledge transfer and a learning culture where employees want to learn and teach by example (Senge, 1992).
2.4 A framework for service delivery improvement

The South African government committed itself to addressing the disparities of service provision and the backlogs of public infrastructure in previously disadvantage areas resulting from apartheid, whilst simultaneously reducing the budget deficit as a percentage of the Gross Domestic Product (Republic of South Africa 1994, Department of Finance, 1996). This results in a need to increase the efficiency of the public service, so that service delivery can be expanded within financial constraints (Phillips, 2001: 318).
This involves changing from bureaucratic, inefficient and inward-looking state departments, into service-oriented, responsive, efficient and effective departments. This transformation is required by the policies and the new regulatory framework for the public service which the South African government has put in place over the past five years e.g. Batho Pele (People First), the revised Public Service Act of 1999, the revised Public Service Regulations of 2001, the Public Finance Management Act of 1999, and the Revised Treasury Regulations of 2001. The emphasis of the previous framework was on detailed regulation, which resulted in managers tending to focus more on compliance with the regulations than on outputs (Phillips, 2001: 318).

In contradiction with the previous framework prior to the new democracy, the new one is more flexible and places emphasis on service delivery and on making managers responsible and accountable for their actions. We can thus say that the emphasis of the state programmes is on improving and increasing service delivery within the available budget. The overall goal of the programme is for service delivery to be efficient and effective as possible, which may involve delivery of services by either the private sector or the public service.

The following section will focus on the different approaches to service delivery improvement where after the education sector will be discussed.

2.5 **General approaches to service delivery improvement in an organisation**

In the last two decades, organisations have experienced a period of great change in their markets and operations. International competition has
meant that many organisations have faced an increasingly turbulent and hostile environment. Customers have become demanding, competition has become intense and sophisticated, and the pace of technological change has quickened (Porter & Tanner, 1996: 1-6). Regulators and consumer groups have also added to these pressures. As a result, many organisations have adopted a range of improvement approaches in response to these forces.

Given the above-mentioned the approach to establish service delivery in an organisation calls for one of holistic approach. This approach provides for a complete integration of the improvement activity into an organisation. Various important factors need to be taken into account, in establishing service delivery improvement in an organisation.

First of all the organisation needs to be redesigned to coincide with this process, which is based on a strategic intent of continuous improvement of service delivery. This process is driven by the strategic management process, and is further linked to the balance between top-down and bottom-up approaches towards target setting and budgeting.

The major thrust in the early development of quality assurance systems came from two manufacturing industries, and it is in this market sector that most of the theoretical writing or quality is to be found. The demand of standardized interchangeable manufactured parts of predictable performance led to the introduction of quality standards and specific manufacturing criteria, either focus of quality assurance schemes was therefore on inspection and monitoring of performance against predetermined standards. According to Dickens, 1996: 12 the key to improved quality was to focus on developing the manufacturing process itself, so that the quality was built in at
the earliest possible stage. This found expression in the “right first time”
approach.

The logical step was to apply the same specifications process that regulated
the manufacturing process to the quality assurance system itself, producing
the type of system where the emphasis is on developing and inspection and
control system that in it meets specified standards. This implication is that
such a system would have a direct bearing on the quality of the manufactured
products, as it ensures quality throughout the process, and emphasizes
prevention rather than cure.

The final logical shift is from quality assurance schemes to an approach that
stresses quality as the responsibility of all staff, and as pervading all aspects of
the organisation’s work. This includes not just the manufacturing process, but
also the management, support, marketing and personnel functions. Dickens
(1996: 13) regards this as the level where the concern for quality merges with
wider issues such as management style and strategy, leadership and the
organisational culture. Peters and Waterman (1982) considers these variables
to be of greater predictive value of quality performance and product than mere
product sampling.

Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry (1998:43) developed an assessment
tool – SERVQUAL – that could be used to measure both customer
expectations and satisfaction in specific service industries and businesses.
Gronroos (1988: 52) went further to outlined three dimensions of service
quality:

- The technical quality of the outcome of the service encounter that
  represents the tangible product of the service;
The functional quality of the process itself, which is the manner in which the service is provided through the medium of the service encounter; and

- The corporate image dimension, which is a global view of the organisation as perceived by the customer, built from the first two dimensions and established over time.

No matter how service quality is defined and measured, it is apparent that there are a number of consistent findings from research. The attributes of service quality derive from customers expectancies and experiences and the satisfaction, or dissatisfaction, that those experiences provide. Hence, it is obvious that a realistic assessment of service quality, and any practical, effective way of improving that quality will have to consider the above-mentioned factors. Besides product-orientated measures, there will need to be consideration of process-orientated variables, as well. Lastly, the dimensions of customer expectancies and satisfaction need to be considered, given their vital importance in determining service quality. The approach proposed for analyzing organisations that provide standardized public services is the comprehensive or holistic approach. This approach consists of different steps:

- The **first** step is the identification of main processes and main activities that characterize the service provided;
- The **second** step is the identification of the stakeholders and the definition of the information flows among them;
- The **third** step is the analysis of present normative statements and service standards. All of these steps should be considered before the evaluation process itself; and
- The **fourth** step is the definition of the performance measurement method (Mwita, 2000: 5).

Conceptually, the service quality process can be examined in terms of gaps between expectations and perceptions on the part of management, employees and customers. The most important gap, the service gap, is between customers’ expectations of service and their perception of the service actually delivered. Ultimately, the goal of the service institution is to close the service gap or at least narrow it as far as possible. Before the institution can close the service gap, it must close or attempt to narrow four other gaps:

- **The knowledge gap,** or the difference between what consumers expect of a service and what management perceives the consumers to expect;
- **The standard gap,** or the difference between what management perceives customers to expect and the quality specifications set for service delivery;
- **The delivery gap,** or the difference between the quality specifications set for service delivery and the actual quality of service delivery;
- **The communication gap,** or the difference between the actual quality of service and the quality if service describe in the organisation’s external communications such as brochures and mass media. Hence, the service gap is a function of the knowledge gap, the specifications gap, the delivery gap, and the communications gap. As each of these gaps increases or decreases, the service gap responds in a similar manner (Parasuraman, Zetaml and Barry, 1998: 45).
Consequently, the researcher will look at techniques for service delivery in service organisations.

2.6 Techniques for service delivery improvement

The success of intervention strategies in organisations intent on transforming organisational processes and strategy is dependent on carrying vision through to action. The discussion that follows now will focus on the various techniques used to improve service delivery in organisations. All of the techniques can be seen to be insufficient in themselves to form the basis of an adequate approach to quality in an organisation, one that covers all the aspects of such services which make them unique and different from other service industries. Hence, the following techniques will be discussed, namely:

- The Gap Zapper;
- TQM;
- Benchmarking;
- Business Excellence Model;
- Service Level Agreements;
- Balanced Scorecard; and
- The Star Model.

2.6.1 The Gap zapper

In attempting to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the internal units of an organisation, the management should strive to make them more businesslike. This does not mean sacrificing service delivery for profit, nor
does it mean reducing the accessibility of services to the poor. Rather, it means making the public service focus on issues that the private sector focuses on, such as measuring outputs, measuring the cost of production of outputs, and putting in place management systems and incentives which result in the optimization of outputs per unit expenditure.

What informs the delivery improvement programme in any service organisation? Figure 4 illustrates the four phases of performance management common to all organisations. To start with it is recommended that a practical gap analysis be done to identify performance problems and agree on how to achieve your performance standards. The four steps to follow are:

- Describe what performance standards; results or outcomes should be achieved in an organisation;
- Then describe what is actually happening in terms of the results or problems that you can identify;
- Have a careful look at what could possibly be causing the poor performance or service delivery problem; and
- Select the best solutions.

**Figure 4:** Phases of a service delivery improvement programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identify performance</td>
<td>Measuring performance</td>
<td>Managing performance</td>
<td>Monitoring &amp; improving performance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Sewell, 2003.
The key question that need to be asked once the performance gap is identified is: “What can we do more, better or differently, to deliver quality services. To achieve successful on-the-job performance, it is essential that managers always think about the real causes of the performance problem.

**Figure 5: The Gap Zapper**

Successful On-the-job Performance

EXTERNAL FACTORS TO ORGANISATIONS
Factors outside the control of anyone in your organisation. Examples economic conditions, international politics or competition, and governmental regulations.

EXTERNAL FACTORS TO ORGANISATIONS
Factors within the control of management and the people in your organisation.

EXTERNAL FACTORS TO ORGANISATIONS
Factors within individual that ensure they are capable of performing as needed on-the-job.

Categories:

1. **Clarity of Roles and Expectations**
2. **Coaching and Leadership**
3. **Incentives and Consequences**
4. **Work Systems and Processes**

Categories:

1. **Knowledge, Skills and Attitudes of People**
2. **Inherent Capability of People**

Figure 5 illustrates how performance improvement could depend on changing the factors external to the organisation, or they could be internal to the people in a department with regard to their competencies, capability and motivation to succeed. Usually, performance can be improved through a combination of these external and internal factors. The following section will focus on service delivery improvement in the public service.

The next section will focus on TQM as a technique to improve service delivery in an organisation.

6.2.2 TQM

TQM also goes by other names, including continuous quality improvement and leadership through quality. TQM is an organisation strategy of commitment to improving customer satisfaction by developing procedures to carefully manage output quality. TQM involves moving toward organisational excellence by integrating the desires of individuals for growth and development with organisational goals. Teamwork and empowerment of individuals are an integral part of TQM (Harvey & Brown, 2001: 366).

According to Dickens (1994: 160) are a number reasons why TQM as an approach should have usefulness for human services, and should be beneficial. Firstly, most human services are based on a set of values or principles that need to be communicated to all staff if they are to be the basis upon which work is conducted. TQM is very much to do with values, and the culture of the service that results from the implementation of these values in practice. These organisational requirements according to the McKinsey 7 S Model in Minnie (1999: 44) are aptly presented in Figure 6.

26
Secondly, human services are more concerned with the “soft” aspects of quality, and as such are eminently suitable for the interpersonal approach that TQM espouses, rather than the “hard” techniques of many industrial quality assurance systems (see Fig 6). Peters and Waterman in their book *In Search of Excellence* (1982) made the distinction between hard Ss (structure and strategy) and soft Ss (systems, staff, skills and shared values).

They argue that corporate strategists had devoted insufficient attention to soft Ss. Peters and Waterman in Lawton & Rose (1991: 181) the following characteristics can be found in organisation of excellence:

- **A bias for action.** The effective organisation gets on with the job;
- **Get close to the customer.** The successful organisation hear what the customer is saying and responds to the customer requirements;
- **Authority and entrepreneurship.** Individuals should be encouraged to take responsibility for their own actions and show initiative than merely follow routine and allow themselves to be governed by the rulebook.
- **Productivity through people.** Everybody within the organisation is encourage to innovate in order to improve the product.
- **Hands on, value driven.** Individuals within the organisation share a set of values and are motivated by organisational goals.
- **Stick to the knitting.** Organisations must identify what they are good at and stick to it. It is important that you stick to your core business.
- **Simple form and lean staff.** The successful organisation has a lean structure with few hierarchical tiers.

**Simultaneous tight loose properties.** Core values are controlled at the center but autonomy is located lower down the organisation to enable
Figure 5: McKinsey 7s Model for organisational requirements

- Process knowledge
- Project management
- Problem solving
- Benchmarking

A coherent set of actions aimed at gaining a sustainable advantage

Capabilities possessed by the organisation as a whole as distinct from those of an individual

- ‘Can do’ attitude
- CI way of life

Those ideas of what is right and desirable (in corporate and/or individual behaviour) which are typical of the organisation and common to most of its members

Strategy

- Shared vision & values

The organisation chart and accompanying baggage that show who reports to whom and how tasks are both divided up and integrated

Structure

The people in the organisation, considered in terms of corporate demographics, not individual personalities

Staff

The way managers collectively behave with respect to use of time, attention and symbolic

Style

- Clear career tracks

Skills

- Process knowledge
- ‘Can do’ attitude
- CI way of life

The processes and procedures through which things get done from day to day

Systems

- KPI and inspiration-driven information
- Budget process aligned with target setting
- HR performance measurement and incentives aligned

- Highly skilled workforce

action based upon care values. A balance is there to be struck between central direction and local direction.

Thirdly, because consumers are a vital part of the service delivery process, and are at the heart of human services, a TQM approach that stresses the involvement and participation of consumers should be beneficial.

Fourthly, most human services rely greatly on the competence and professional skills of people delivering them, with less reliance on formal working procedures. TQM stresses the need for the individuals to be committed to a quality approach, and to be the main element in its implementation. What now follows is a discussion of the basic elements a TQM model.

The model begins with understanding customer needs. TQM organisations have processes that continuously collect, analyse, and act on customer information. Activities are often extended to understanding competitor's customers. Developing an intimate understanding of customer needs allows TQM organisations to predict future customer behaviour. These organisations integrate customer knowledge with other information and use the planning process to orchestrate action throughout the organisation to manage day to day activities and achieve future goals. Plans are reviewed at periodic intervals and adjusted as necessary. The planning process is the glue that holds together all TQM activity. TQM organisations understand that customers will only be satisfied if they consistently receive products and services that meet their needs, are delivered when expected, and are priced for value. TQM organisations use the techniques of process management to develop cost-controlled processes that are stable and capable of meeting
customer expectations. TQM organisations also understand that exceptional performance today may be unacceptable performance in the future so they use the concepts of process improvement to achieve both breakthrough gains and incremental continuous improvement. Process improvement is even applied to the TQM system itself (Deming, 1986: 25 – 29). The final element of the TQM model is total participation. TQM organisations understand that all work is performed through people. This begins with leadership. In TQM organisations, top management takes personal responsibility for implementing, nurturing, and refining all TQM activities. They make sure people are properly trained, capable, and actively participate in achieving organisational success. Management and employees work together to create an empowered environment where people are valued. All of the TQM model’s elements work together to achieve results.

2.6.3 Benchmarking

Benchmarking is the systematic and continuous process of determining what the best performances and underlying skills of leading organisations are in the strive for excellence, and based on this, stimulate the organisation’s own strive for excellence performance at all organisational levels (Camp, 1995:45). It is a strategy to stimulate changes and optimize performances. Benchmarking procedures are one of the techniques used to establish the customer perspective by comparing your performance against best of breed, that is against your competitor’s best practice (Kaul, 1998: 17 - 18).
2.6.4 Business Excellence Model

The South African Business Excellence Model was established in 1997. It is the South African version of international business excellence frameworks, which include the Malcolm Bridge National Quality Award of the United States of America and the European Foundation for Quality Management Model (Minervine, 2003: 19 - 20). All the quality models provide a framework against which self-assessment and external assessment allow companies to incorporate world-class standards of excellences into the operations. The Business Excellence Model in particular consists of eleven criteria, namely:

- Leadership;
- Policy and strategy;
- Customer and market focus;
- People management;
- Resources and information management;
- Processes;
- Impact on society;
- Customer satisfaction;
- People satisfaction;
- Supplier and partnership performance; and
- Business results.

The first six criteria, concerned with approach, are categorized as enablers, and the remaining five, focused on measurable achievements, are categorized as results (Minervine, 2003: 20). The advantage of the model is that many of the quality awards would show that their high-level categories are often relevant to public organisations (issues such as leadership, strategy, resources, and management (Talbot, 2001: 276). It is perhaps
more crucially that are aspects of public sector organisations that are largely absent from the model. Firstly, all public organisations operate within a framework of governance and policy that is largely externally imposed. These place severe restraints on public organisations. The second major issue is about outcomes, or social results. Most public services do not have financial results in the same way as private corporations. In the public sector the financial results are simply reporting on inputs - that is how the money budgeted for their activities was actually spent. With regard to quality of output issues, however, the public and private sectors are much closer. In both cases, qualitative measures of customer satisfaction can be made through a wide variety of methods (Talbot, 2001: 275).

2.6.4 Service level agreements

The service level agreement is another technique to improve service delivery. It is both a process and a document. The service level agreement process involves the customer and the service provider agreeing on sustainable targets for particular services. This process is also treated as a commercial transaction, and the services are paid for by the customer. The achievement of these targets is measured and any discrepancies are discussed and resolved openly. The advantages of this process is that:

- It gives the service provider an opportunity to improve performances;
- It gives the customer the opportunity to review priorities.

A service level agreement hold further benefits in for the organisation in so far as that it:

- Set clear performance expectations of customer and service provider;
- Clarifies roles and responsibilities of both parties;
- Focuses attention on customer priority needs;
- Encourages service quality culture, and continuing improvement;
- Provides a mechanism for both parties to plan for the future; and
- Service providers are in a better position to plan their delivery function (Kaul, 1998: 43).

2.6.6 **Balanced Scorecard**

The Balanced Scorecard developed by management theorists, Robert Kaplan and David Norton, acknowledges the vital role of correctly measuring performance to ensure transformation (Dale, 1998). The Balanced Scorecard is a setting consisting of financial, customer, internal processes and learning perspectives describing the current strategy of an organisation and how to achieve in the future. A set of measurements will show how an organisation is doing (Wood, 1999).

The Balanced Scorecard is a multi-dimensional approach, which measures operational performance that incorporates both financial and non-financial factors. According to Katz (1999: 50) the Balanced Scorecard is:
- A device for balancing concern about financial performance with concern for other aspects of performance;
- A balanced model that focuses on internal and external indicators as well as the performance drivers and outcome measures, which describe the cause and effect relationship behind the strategy;
- A strategic management system for achieving long-term goals;
- An integrated approach for translating strategy into action;
- A state-of-the-art system to assess performance from four perspectives;
- A proven technique already tried and adopted by manufacturing, service, government and non-profit organisations; and
- Together with the performance review structure, considered a true tool that tells management much more about what to expect of the future and in addition, virtually assures stretch goals (Katz, 1999).

**Figure 7: The Balanced Scorecard**

Source: Kaplan and Norton, 1996.

Total quality management applies human resources and analytical tools to focus on meeting or exceeding customers’ current and future needs. It
integrates these resources and tools into management efforts by providing planned, systematic approaches to improving organisational performance. This involves everyone in programs aimed at improving the total organisation, so that it is more customer oriented, quality conscious, flexible, and responsive (Harvey & Brown, 2001:366). According to Figure 6 two main areas for organisational development exist: first the conceptional side, which includes strategy, shared values and skills; secondly the more physical side of organisational development, that is the structure, staff, systems or processes and the style. For each of these elements the intention is given in figure 6.

### 2.6.7 The Star Model

According to Lawler (1996: 46) the most critical elements for organisational design are:

- **Strategy**;
- **Structure**;
- **Rewards**;
- **Processes**; and
- **People**.

Not only are the different elements of importance, but also the links between the elements. The links in the model also indicate that organisational effectiveness requires a good alignment or fit among all five elements (Lawler, 1996). The similarities between the Star and McKinsey 7S model show that it is critical to address some or all of the aspects mentioned in order to enhance business performance, in other words to create a high-performance organisation.
The above-mentioned approaches or techniques to establish service delivery in an organisation calls for one of holistic approach. This approach provides for a complete integration of the improvement activity into an organisation. Various important factors need to be taken into account, in establishing service delivery improvement in an organisation. In the next section the researcher will look at various quality schemes that can be used to improve service delivery in the public service.

### 2.7 Service delivery improvement in the Public Service

Although many quality schemes or models exist in the public sector, the researcher has limited his investigation to five models of quality management systems for service delivery improvement, namely ISO 9000, The Charter
Mark, the Investors in People, the balanced scorecard and the Public Service Excellence Model.

2.7.1 ISO 9000

With reference to the ISO 9000 series standards it demand to systematise and document all the activities of the organisation, to execute regular and purposeful training of the employees of the organisation as well as to execute the regularly internal audits of the organisation. The ISO 9000 standards structurally consist of:

- Introduction;
- Management responsibility;
- Quality system;
- Contract review;
- Design control;
- Document control;
- Purchasing;
- Control of customer-supplied product;
- Product identification and tractability;
- Process control;
- Inspection and testing;
- Control of inspection, measuring and test equipment;
- Inspection and test status;
- Control of non-conforming product;
- Preventative and corrective actions;
- Handling, storage, packaging, preservation and delivery;
- Control of quality records;
- Internal quality audit;
- Training;
- Servicing; and
- Statistical techniques.

In addition to introducing the ISO 9000 standards, there can be certain advantages for an organisation as there are strictly determined and documented procedures for all the activities of it. On the one hand there are precisely defined criteria which should be observed and introduced, whilst one of the shortcomings is that the ISO 9000 standard in the present wording is more applicable for the industrial enterprises and is less oriented to the public administration organisations (PriceWaterhouseCoopers, 2000). Hence, the opinion prevails that the system is too bureaucratic – there are many documents that regulate the system activity.

2.7.2 The Charter Mark

The Charter Mark is another Management Quality Award System that is provided to promote and award improvements in the state institutions (PriceWaterhouseCoopers, 2001). This award with the help of evaluation provides the standard for services to be rendered by the state institutions. Each applicant receives a mark of an independent expert and detailed offers of assistance for individual improvement.

The Charter mark mainly pays attention to the services provided for the
customers and their quality. It is elastic, easily understandable and applicable in the public administration institutions of different sizes, which directly render services for the public. It evaluates institutions on the basis of ten criteria, proceeding from such aspects as the level of services, availability and choice, appropriate remuneration, effective utilization of resources and accessible complaint and compensatory system. The Charter Mark whilst focusing on access to customer information did not initially have the same rigorous assessment e.g. proving customer satisfaction and results information. Its application was largely the submission of a document that was externally assessed. Awards could only be granted to specific/discrete services not the organisation as a whole (PriceWaterhouseCoopers, 2000).

2.7.3 Investors in People

Investors in People is a national quality standard, developed in 1990 in the United States of America, which sets a level of good practice for organisational improvement, through the training and development of people. The key principles of this model are:

- Commitment;
- Planning
- Action; and
- Evaluation.

Hence, the model has the following distinctiveness and particular appeal:

- Promotes and supports people;
- Recognizes the need for management and people development of competencies; and
- Is reasonably inexpensive and accessible schemes for organisational units (PriceWaterhouseCoopers, 2000).
2.7.4 The Balance Scorecard

The Balanced Scorecard is another model that is ably applied in the public sector. The balanced scorecard is essentially a strategic measuring framework or model including customer, internal process, innovation and learning and financial perspectives. Although applied successfully in the private sector, the potential for benefit in the public sector is considered to be even greater (Kaplan and Norton, 1996: 76). A further benefit of the scorecard includes that it focuses on high impact measures, is easy to use, it is balanced and puts the emphasis on prevention rather than detection (McAdam, 2003).

2.7.5 The Public Service Excellence Model

In addition to the other models stated above, the Public Service Excellence Model (PSEM) is another model which can be applied with great success in the public sector to improve service delivery. The model consists of three parts: enablers, results of organisation and results of programme. The enablers are divided into five parts:

- Statement of main policy;
- Strategy and plans, management;
- Resource management;
- Processes; and
- Personnel management;

The results of the organisation are divided as follows:

- Resources and economy;
- Efficiency;
- Motivation of the staff;
- Dismissal and responsibility;
- Results of service;
- satisfaction of customers.

The results of the programme characterize the final results. Accordingly the PSEM is applicable for the public administration institutions and central administrative institutions for which it is difficult to define a circle of their customers or the customers are diverse and the their interests are various. In the model the dismissal and responsibility as well as information availability and openness are underlined, which are the major indicators of the state management quality. The results of the public administration organisation’s activity are emphasized.

Although the main shortcoming of the PSEM is that there are no strict criteria regulating what actions should be undertaken by institutions to introduce it, the model is still seen by most people surveyed as the most comprehensive model with a broad range of application from diagnostic self-assessment tool to developing submissions for award schemes. (PriceWaterhouseCoopers, 2000). The model will be discussed in detail in chapter 3 as a quality framework for service delivery improvement in the education sector.

2.8 Service delivery improvement in Education

In its search for examples of service delivery improvement in the education sector, it was discovered that no specific model is applied. The researcher, however, assumes that generic or public models exist. Therefore, the researcher will apply the PSEM in a later chapter to the WCED to analyse the
relevancy of the model (refer to chapter 4).

2.9 Summary

In this chapter we have considered the issue of service delivery improvement from the point of view of industry in general and finally from that of service organisations. He has reviewed the definitions of service delivery improvement that have guided both the evaluation of service quality and the development of service delivery.

The theory and practice of service delivery improvement was also discussed. The next section will focus on Total Quality Management as an approach to service delivery in the public sector with specific reference to the particular concepts and challenges associated with this approach.
CHAPTER 3
TQM IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR: CONCEPTS AND CHALLENGES

3.1 Introduction

In the previous chapter selected theoretical perspectives have been considered. In this chapter the following aspects will receive attention:
- a definition for TQM will be provided;
- the elements of TQM;
- the application of TQM in the public sector;
- a normative model will be discussed and recommendations will be made as to how best to improve the model.

This will create an understanding of TQM as an approach to service delivery improvement in the public sector.

3.2 Definition of TQM

Total quality management is an organisational strategy of commitment to improving customer satisfaction by developing procedures to carefully manage output quality. TQM involves moving towards organisational excellence by integrating the desires of individuals for growth and development with organisational goals (Harvey & Brown, 2001: 366). Although quality management was a private sector initiative, it has begun to impinge on management thinking in the public sector – the quality approach. As with corporate management, systems analysis and their approaches, quality has hit the public sector management agenda (Sallis, 2001: 23). TQM is sometimes also referred to as quality management. For the sake of this discussion one will use the definition of Rampersad (2001): “TQM is both a
philosophy and a set of guiding principles that represent the foundation of a continuously improving organisation. It encompasses mobilizing the entire organisation to satisfy the demands of the customers”.

TQM is focused on routine involvement and participation of everyone in the organisation in the systematic improvement of quality. It involves each individual and group within all parts of the organisation. TQM provides a way of life to constantly improve the performance at every level and in every activity, by creating a positive continuous improvement environment based on teamwork, trust and respect, examining the process through which works gets done in a systematic, consistent, organisational manner, applying quantitative methods and analytical techniques, and expanding your knowledge and expertise in process improvement “ (Rampersad, 2001:3).

Continuous improvement forms the cornerstone of this new management system. This means far-reaching change, effected by acquiring and applying new knowledge, skills and values. It never stops. It is a cyclic, iterative and never-ending activity (Crosby, 1984).

Sallis (1993:16) further distinguishes between three important quality ideas, namely quality control, quality assurance and TQM. *Quality control* is the oldest concept. It refers to the detection and elimination of components or final products that are not up to standard. It is an after-the-event process concerned with detecting and rejecting defective items.
Table 1: Quality Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRODUCTS AND SERVICE STANDARDS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conformation to specification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fitness for purpose or use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zero defects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right first time, every time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CUSTOMER STANDARDS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exceeding customer expectations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delighting the customer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Sallis, 1993

Quality assurance is different from quality control. It is before and during the event process concerned to prevent faults occurring in the first place. Quality is further about designing quality into the process to attempt to ensure that the product is produced to a predetermined specification. Quality assurance, therefore, is about consistently meeting product specifications or getting things right first time, every time. The quality of goods or service is assured by there being a system in place, known as quality assurance system, that lays down exactly how production should take place and as to what standards.

TQM incorporates quality assurance, and extends and develops it. Hence, it can be argued that TQM is about creating a quality culture where the aim of every member of staff is to delight their customers, and where the structure of their organisation allows them to do so. In TQM the customer is sovereign.
Therefore, it can be said that TQM is about providing the customer with what they want, when they want it and how they want it. It further involves moving with changing customer expectations and fashions to design products and services that meet and exceed their expectations (Sallis, 1993: 18 –19).

In short it can be said that TQM is concerned with the management of organisational change towards continuous improvement of the processes, which govern the way work gets accomplished. While the definitions and applications of TQM can vary widely there seems to be a general consensus about the essential elements of TQM. It is thus important to look at the essential elements of it.

### 3.3 Essential elements of TQM

Claus (1991: 2 - 12) identifies the following eight essential elements of TQM, namely:

- It is geared to the continuous improvement of quality in the organisation;
- It is based on customer expectations, and on meeting and anticipating customer requirements;
- It requires an organisation’s long-term commitment;
- It is management driven;
- The process ultimately has to involve all employees to be successfully integrated;
- It is focused on collaborative work;
- In its application it aims at changing the attitudes as well as the behaviours of its work force; and
- It is aimed at achieving a harmony between technology and people.
By virtue of the magnitude of change, the road to quality and continuous improvement is a long and arduous one. The cultural change required is not possible without drastically different processes of operations. The gurus stress it that it can take several years to obtain results. Notwithstanding the latter it does not have to be that way if employees are permitted to share a common fate, are empowered to make incremental improvements, and are properly reinforced and rewarded for process and result improvements. It is therefore important that we look at the benefits of TQM for the public sector.

3.4 Benefits of TQM

TQM is a comprehensive and structured approach to organisational management that seeks to improve the quality of products, systems and services through ongoing refinements in response to continuous feedback. It can be applied to any type of organisation. Although it originated in the manufacturing sector it has since been adapted for use in the public sector.

TQM as a management model, with its emphasis on leadership, strategy, teamwork, rigorous analysis and self-assessment, has a universal message. Hence, it is now required more than ever in our world of continuous change.

The motivation for introducing TQM systems is connected with benefits received from the system. The most common benefits mentioned by public institutions who implement TQM systems are:

- Professional development of employees;
- Improvement of day-to-day operations;
- Improvement of the information flow;
- Continuous improvement of the organisation;
- Quality service delivery;
- The reduction of operating or internal costs;
- Increase customer satisfaction;
- Improvement of the morale of employees;
- The establishment of a process of continuous improvement and business reengineering; and
- The gain of a competitive edge (McAdam, 2003).

Sallis (1993: 3-4) identifies four main reasons or benefits for the implementation of TQM in the public education sector, namely a moral imperative, a professional imperative, a competitive and an accountability imperative. In respect of the moral imperative the customers and clients of the education services (learners, parents and the community) deserve the best possible quality of education. Sallis regard this as the moral high ground in education and one of the few areas of educational discussions where there is little dissent. The professional imperative closely links to the moral imperative. Professionalism implies a commitment to the needs of the customer. This implies a commitment to the needs of the customer. This implies operating on the highest possible standards. In addition, the competitive imperative requires competitiveness in respect of all aspects of the system. The accountability imperative utilizes TQM to support the accountability imperative by promoting objective and measurable outcomes of the internal processes and provides mechanisms for quality improvement. Institutions have to demonstrate that they are able to deliver what is required of them.

Given the benefits of TQM, the researcher will now look at the application of this approach in the public sector organisations as well as the challenges that go with this approach.
3.5 TQM in Public Sector

Traditionally democratic governments focus on inputs rather than outcomes. For example, they fund schools based on how many learners enroll; welfare based on how many poor people are eligible; police departments based on police estimates of human resources needed to fight crime. They pay little attention to outcomes – to results. In fact, schools, welfare departments, and police departments typically get more money when they fail: when children do poorly, welfare rolls swell or the crime rate rises. Entrepreneurial governments seek to change these by issuing rewards and incentives (Osborne & Gaebler, 1993).

Public entrepreneurs know that when institutions are funded according to inputs, they have little reason to strive for better performance. But when they are funded according to outcomes, they become obsessive about performance. Because they do not measure results, bureaucratic governments rarely achieve them. They spend more on public education, yet test scores and dropouts rarely budge. They spend even more on job training for welfare recipients, yet welfare rolls continue to grow. They spend more on police and prisons, yet crime continues to rise (Graebler, 1993: 26). With so little information about results, bureaucratic governments reward their employees based on other things: their longevity, the size of the budget and staff they manage at their level of authority. So their employees diligently protect their jobs and build their empires, pursuing larger budgets, larger staffs, and more authority.

Private organisations focus on results, because they will go out of business if the key numbers go negative. Words like accountability, performance and
results, however have begun to ring through the halls of government. According to W. Edwards Deming only 15% of the problems in most organisations are caused by employees and managers involved. The other 85% stem from the broader systems within which these employees work – the education system, the budget system, the personnel system, and so on. Incentive pay gives people an incentive to improve performance, but it does not give them the authority or the tools to change the system that lie behind their problems.

TQM has been embraced by public organisations in the United States and the United Kingdom at all levels. In practice, however, most of these organisations implement only a part of the Deming approach. What is meant by the Deming approach? According to Deming, organisations can solve their problems most effectively if the employees get involved in crafting the solutions. The employees know the system best, and they know where the problem lurks. TQM uses teams of employees – often known as quality circles – to tackle most problems in the workplace (Sallis, 2001: 58).

It is further worth noting that many public organisations fail to track the results of their work for instance, or to define exactly what results constitutes quality performance. Very few focus on the basic system that drive their organisations, so they remain in the realm of 15% solutions, rather than transforming their organisations. TQM is an effective means to force organisations to act on the performance information they receive. The budget, however, is the most important lever in government that drives behaviour (Gaebler, 1992: 309).

In relation to the private sector, markets exist not only in the private sector;
they also exist within the public sector. When they do, we normally call them systems: the education system, the job training system, the mental health system. But they are markets, just as surely as the financial system, the banking system, and the health care system are markets. If we applied market oriented thinking to our public system, we would accomplish a great deal. It is therefore important that leaders in government also embrace the principles of entrepreneurial organisations.

Osborne and Gaebler (1993: 306 - 307) isolate and describe ten principles around which entrepreneurial public organisations are built:

- Steer more than they row;
- Empower communities rather than simply deliver services;
- Encourage competition rather than monopoly;
- Are driven by their missions, not their rules;
- Fund outcomes rather than inputs;
- Meet the needs of the customer, not the bureaucracy;
- Concentrate on earning, not just spending;
- Invest in prevention rather than cure;
- Decentralize authority; and
- Solve problems by leveraging the market place rather than simply creating public programmes.

The universe of established techniques for improving performance and thus service delivery is large and varied: quality circles, job redesign, contracting out, alternative work schedules, demand analysis – the list is almost endless. They all fall into three categories:

- Changes in the work process;
- Changes in the employee;
- Changes in management options.

According to James Swiss in Rosen (1993; 251), TQM can have a useful role to play in government only if it is substantially modified to fit the public sector’s unique characteristics. However, one element: the customer is not always easily defined in the public context.

Service delivery improvement is possible in every field and at every level of government. There is no systematic, existential barrier. Quality service delivery is understood in many ways. However, in the public service, quality service delivery is commonly defined as: “A systematic arrangement to satisfactorily fulfilling various demands for services by undertaking purposeful service, with optimum use of resources to deliver effective, efficient and economic service resulting in measurable and acceptable benefits to customers” (Sewell, 2003).

Transforming service delivery to enforce quality as a key principle calls for a commitment towards customer satisfaction where service providers know the needs, expectations and wishes of customers. A number of approaches have been cited in chapter two to achieve improve service delivery in the work place. Many people feel that these approaches have failed and should be discarded. It is not clear where these approaches were properly implemented and managed, whether they were given sufficient time and whether people did not expect quick results and miracles. With reference to the statement made of the various approaches that could be followed to improve the quality of service delivery and a discussion will follow about the main approaches to TQM, namely: the system approach, input-output approach; and teamwork.
3.5.1 The systems approach

The system approach has been in existence for quite some time but whether it was understood by all those who were suppose to implement it still remains unclear. For example, if we take an example of a school where most of the time the quality of output is measured by what happens in the classroom.

3.5.2 The input…output model

The input-output approach is guided by the principle of what you put into the system will determine what to expect out of the system. Figure 9 illustrates a simple model of service delivery improvement.

Figure 9: Simple input ... output model

Source: Adapted from Talbot, 2001.
It focuses respectively, on:

- The efficiency relationship between inputs and outputs;
- Reducing inputs or the cost of inputs;
- Due process and equity;
- The relationship between inputs and outputs and outcomes (Talbot, 2001: 268).

This simple model is particularly useful for analyzing where the emphases in particular service delivery initiatives have placed emphasis. People often place too much emphasis on output at the expense of the whole system, including input and internal supplies.

3.5.3 Teamwork

Teamwork is the element that links professionalism to the quality development process. It is the frameworks in which innovation and change become an accepted fact of life. Without teamwork, quality development cannot be instituted. The key aspect of teamwork is the recognition of the internal customer chain. Therefore, teams can be seen as the engine of quality improvement. They make quality management work. Working in teams can provide every person in the organisation with a means of expressing their views and making a contribution to the quality improvement process. A normative model of TQM for service delivery improvement in the public sector will now be discussed in detail and recommendations will be made as to how to improve the relevancy of the model for the entire public sector.
3.6 A normative model of TQM for service delivery improvement in Public Sector.

Various models of TQM exist in the public sector. In chapter two we have discussed the various models. It is also clear that standardized models have an advantage or benefit for an organisation as they have certain credibility as models. They further provide an opportunity for the whole organisation to benchmark itself against other organisations (Talbot, 2001: 275). Many of the quality models show that their high-level categories are often relevant to public organisations. This include issues such as leadership, strategy, resources and management.

Given the existence of various models of quality management, the Public Sector Excellence Model as a holistic model of quality and performance has been selected as a normative model for service delivery improvement. The Public Service Excellence Model (PSEM) was designed in 1998 and fully implemented in the public service in 1999 in response towards increasing performance measurement in public services. It draws on the best of existing approaches whilst adapting them fully to a public sector environment.

In figure 10 an outlay of the various components of the Public Service Excellence Model is illustrated. What now follows is a brief description of the model and the reason for its various components. The Public Service Excellence Model has three sections, viz:

- Enablers;
- Organisational results; and
- Programme (or outcome) results.
The enablers and the organisational results are further broken down into two-subsections each:
- Strategic enablers
- Operational enablers

**Figure 10: The Public Service Excellence Model**

![Image of the Public Service Excellence Model]

Source: Talbot, 2001

What follows is a brief description of the various sections of the model and the categories that make each up, namely:
- Enablers;
- Organisational results; and
- The programme results.

### 3.6.1 Enablers

The enablers are divided into strategic (policy and governance, strategy and
plans, leadership) and operational enablers (resources, processes and people). Strategic enablers refer to the issues of policy and governance, strategy and plans and leadership. Policy objectives set for any individual organisation are likely to facilitate better performance. Organisations with a poor policy framework are likely to perform less well than one with a clear policy framework. It is further noted that an organisation’s ability to act – especially in the public sector – is clearly constrained or enhanced by how well its governance framework is geared to its policy objectives. The clearer management and supervision structures, audit and assessment regimes, the more likely it is that the organisation can carry out its designated mission and mandates (Talbot, 2001:281).

Strategic management and planning is another issue of the strategic enablers. Many of the principles of strategic management and planning as applied in the private sector have been implemented with little adjustments. It places greater emphasis on these differences. Talbot (2001: 281) further argues that leadership in a public service context is slightly more controversial as a factor in promoting good performance. Prescriptively, it has been argued that public servants should not be assuming leadership roles that, in democracies, ought to be reserved for elected leaders. On the other hand descriptively, it has been argued that leadership is simply impossible anyway, certainly on anything like the scales exhibit in the private sector, because of the constraints of multiple stakeholders and the policy and mandate governance frameworks. However, some empirical studies have clearly shown that public servants can and have assumed leadership roles which have been important contributory factors in organisational successes.
The management of resources has become increasingly sophisticated in the public sector. Under resources we are referring to human resources (people), physical resources, financial resources and time. At managerial level, there have been trends towards activity-based or priority-based budgeting and accounting. – that is aligning resource allocation processes much more closely with organisation objectives and core processes.

As with resources, organisational processes also need to be aligned with organisational goals and the core outputs and outcomes that the organisation is seeking to achieve. People are the greatest asset of any organisation. Talbot (2001:282) is of the view that properly aligned and deployed people management policies can enhance performance and help to focus individual and team efforts on organisational goals. Management initiatives in the public sector will probably continue their tendency to imitate the private sector with a lag of several years. Popular innovations in the public management currently include reinventing government, re-engineering government, entrepreneurial government, strategic management, TQM and performance budgeting (Halachmi & Baukaert 1996, 34 – 35). Several common themes run through these initiatives:

- Firstly, an emphasis on customers – adapting government services to what clients and taxpayers want;
- Secondly, decentralization of authority; and
- Thirdly, an increase need for and use of information.

### 3.6.2 Organisational results

Organisational results in the model are limited to the immediate achievements
of the organisation which are clearly separated from internal enablers on the one side and eventual impacts or social results, on the other. Internal results refer to those categories of results that are not experienced or see immediately by persons external to the organisation, unlike the following three categories of results (reporting, outputs and satisfaction), which are far more visible and external:

- **Resource Results**: are simply reporting against the objectives set for resources deployment (usually but not exclusively budgets): What has the organisation achieved in deploying its resources as it intended?
- **Efficiency Results**: What has the organisation achieved in terms of its own efficiency target or previous performance? For example, reduction in unit costs, administrative overheads etc.
- **People results**: This results refer to factors such as staff turnover, morale and grievances.

External results refer to the reporting, outputs and the level of satisfaction of the organisation. In the public sector, there has been a corresponding trend towards increasing reporting. Public service organisations are accountable to their customers and taxpayers. Reporting organisational activities and successes assist the client to evaluate the performance of the organisation. Service reporting is about the appropriateness and quality of organisational reporting: How well does the organisation report to all its key stakeholders? Departments in South Africa produce detailed annual reports with their accounts. These reports assist the customer and the taxpayer to understand the outputs of departments.

Service outputs and service satisfaction cover the quantitative and qualitative
aspects of actual organisational outputs, and in the case of satisfaction, processes. It is fairly straightforward – this category covers the quantity and quality of outputs and their relationship to organisational objectives.

3.6.3 Programme results

The ultimate reason for the existence of public organisations is achieving outcomes. These outcomes remote from direct organisational activities. All public organisations do or should contribute directly or indirectly to social outcome objectives democratically decided by legitimate governments. These outcomes may be more or less remote from direct organisational activities. They may be more or less easily attributable to organisational actions. They may even be more or less dependent on other organisational actors (public, private or voluntary) or susceptible to environmental factors (Talbot 2001: 284 – 285). Despite all these problematic issues, PSEM makes the stipulate assumption that all public organisations should make an assessment, and probably report, on what trends are occurring in their domain of activity and what, if any, contribution they are making to positive or negative developments in social outcomes.

A critical question however is does this model work for all public service organisations? One is of the view that all the key elements of the PSEM are useful for application in the public sector. The major benefits include driving continuous improvement, and these activities are supported in most cases by integrating the improvement activities with the business plan. Leadership is a key enabler for success, and the interference from national government a potential barrier. It can also be said that there are certain shortcomings in the model. One is of the opinion that the following aspects will improve the usefulness of the PSEM for application in the public service:
(a) **Enablers:**
   - Public Partnerships
   - Information and Knowledge
(b) **Self-assessment:**
   - Monitoring and Evaluation
   - Surveying of customer needs
   - Verification of standards
(c) **Innovation and learning**

In the next few paragraphs a brief description will be given of what is meant by each of the following aspects, namely enablers (public partnerships, information and knowledge), self-assessment (monitoring and evaluation, surveying of customer needs, verification of standards) and innovation and learning.

### 3.6.4 Public Partnerships

Organisations need to develop long-term strategic mutually beneficial partnerships with a range of external partners, including customers, suppliers and non-governmental organisations. Successful long-term partnerships focus on delivering sustained value for the partners. Excellent organisations plan and manage external partnerships, suppliers and the effective operation of processes. Hence, during planning and whilst managing partnerships and resources they balance the current and future needs of the organisation, the community and the environment.

### 3.6.5 Information and knowledge

Information and knowledge is essential ingredients for any organisation to
make informed decision. A lack or absence of information can hamper the successful decision-making process in any organisation. The way an organisation manages its information and knowledge, is of paramount importance. The information strategy must support the top-level policy and strategy, and the way in which this is formulate needs to be considered. The validity, integrity, security and scope of the information need to be assured and improved, and appropriate and relevant information needs to be accessible.

However, organisations need to be clear that knowledge is more than information. More and better information does not mean that we are any more knowledgeable. In fact often the opposite can be the case. Information by itself can often lead to confusion and overload. Information overload is one of today’s most serious problems both for individuals and for organisations. Hence, the productive use of information is important. Knowledge is information that has been consciously processed and which has established meaning and value to those who use it. A key to successful knowledge management is to exploit all of forms of knowledge, both formal and informal. This can be achieved by developing an open knowledge–sharing culture and developing processes linked to appropriate technologies that facilitate the sharing and exploitation of all available information.

3.6.6 Self-assessment

Institutional self-assessment is a major element of quality improvement. In this way an organisation is taking responsibility for its own quality that is a key mark of organisational maturity. It is a process by which an organisation or institution make considered judgments on their own performance and use
that as the data for use of enhancement of their services. Figure 11 illustrates the steps that should be followed when you do self-assessment.

**Figure 11: Self-assessment steps**

- Choosing the framework
- Forming the assessment team
- Collecting the information
- **Assessment**
- Consensus
- Site –visit process-clarification and verification
- Feedback
- **Action Planning**

**Source: Porter & Tanner, 1996**
Self-assessment is a comprehensive, systematic and regular review of an organisation’s activities and results. Hence, the process allows the organisation to discern clearly its strengths and areas in which improvements can be made and culminates in planned improvement which are then monitored for progress. A valuable aspect of self-assessment is the ability to make year-on-year objective comparisons. Quality systems always need a feedback loop. Mechanisms must be in place to ensure that outcomes can be analysed against the plan. Monitoring and evaluation are, thus key elements in strategic planning. If an institution is to be a learning, rather than a static organisation, a process of evaluation and feedback must take place at three levels: immediate, short term and long-term.

For any organisation to be successful a learning culture should be at all times present. In the previous paragraph reference was already made to learning organisations. It includes continuous improvement of existing approaches, and adaptation to change, leading to new goals and or approaches.

With the minor adjustments of the following enablers - public partnerships and information and knowledge as well self-assessment (monitoring and evaluation, surveying of customer needs, verification of standards) and innovation and learning to the Talbot model, it can be regarded as useful for the public sector. It further delivers a set of benefits for public sector organisations. The following aspects can be regarded as the main benefits of the PSEM:

- Leadership can gain an impartial, external perspective of its organisation;
- Leadership can learn from feedback reports, through comment
outlining detailed strengths and areas of improvement;
- It accelerate improvement activities of the organisation;
- It help to motivate employees via the achievement of external recognition;
- Leadership develops a mission, vision and values and are role model of a culture of excellence;
- It can lead to increase public satisfaction with Public Services;
- It measure up to external benchmarks in public and private sectors;
- It serves as a instrument for establishing , examining and improving the management and operational practices throughout the Public Service;
- It serves as a basis for an organisational measurement tool to track progress over time; and
- It builds logistical structures around organisational activities and management and practices that should be in place in given organisations.

At any point in time the Public Service or an unit may identify the need for major improvement in a particular aspect of its business. It is often necessary to launch focused initiatives to deal with these issues in a timely manner.

Very few shortcomings can be found in this model for education. The following, however, can be regarded as shortcomings:
- No strict criteria regulating what actions should be undertaken by institutions to introduce the PSEM;
- It is still too strongly focused on intra-organisational and management issues and does not sufficiently take account of the specific working environment of public sector organisations.
In view of the above-mentioned it is strongly recommended that the PSEM be applied to the education sector departments.

3.7 Summary

From the discussion above, it is clear that success in quality in the private sector does not surprise many prospective followers of TQM, but successes in the public sector are often not well known. In contrast to the race to improve profits and remain in business in the private sector, the need for TQM in the public sector is different, but no less compelling. In the public sector the challenge is to offer the customer, the taxpayer, an improved quality of services at reduced costs.

Quality measures of customer satisfaction can be made through a wide variety of methods, although most public sector services are monopolies. It has however also been argued that a specific approach is required in public services that can be drawn upon, but not slavishly copied private sector models. The PSEM as per discussion above can be applied with great success to improve the quality of service delivery in the public sector.

In the next chapter service delivery improvement in the WCED will come under spotlight and its normative model of service delivery will be evaluated against the PSEM.
4.1 Introduction

Chapter 3 was dedicated to exploring TQM as an approach to service delivery improvement in the public sector and then concluded with briefly exploring the Public Sector Excellence Model (PSEM) and its realities in the public sector. It was found the PSEM is useful for all sectors of government.

The purpose of this chapter is to provide data and information about the general context, the corporate context, the current realities in terms of service delivery improvement of the WCED as well as to evaluate its Service Delivery Improvement Plan (SDIP) against the PSEM. This will be done by means of a description of the applicable legislation, the analysing of findings during the interviews, the decoding of documents as well as participative observational findings.

4.2 Western Cape Education Department: Relevant Contextual Matters

4.2.1 General context of the WCED

The Western Cape Education Department (WCED) was established on 1 September 1995 as a result of the amalgamation of four Education Departments: Ex-Cape Education Department, Ex-Department of Education and Training and the departments of Education of the Ex-House of Delegates
and the Ex-House of Representatives. The strategic objectives of the WCED as listed in the department’s Strategic Plan for 2003/2004 are as follows:

- To ensure access to quality education for all children living in the province;
- To equip educators in their efforts to provide effective education;
- To ensure effective management and governance in all learning sites and support structures;
- To ensure safe school environments required for teaching and learning; and
- To promote accountability on all levels, in line with the legislative mandate.

To meet the objectives, the WCED identified the following key objectives for the year:

- Preparing the ground for the introduction of the revised national curriculum for General Education and Training (GET), starting with the Foundation Phase in 2004;
- Continuing to develop Further Education and Training (FET) in schools and FET colleges;
- Supporting Early Childhood (ECD), Adult Basic Education and Training (ABET) and Education for Learners with Special Education Need (ELSEN);
- Developing appropriate and effective learner assessment practices for GET and FET; and
- Applying scarce resources as effectively and as equitably as possible.
During the 2003 financial year, the WCED paid particular attention to its role in achieving the objectives of iKapa Elihlumayo (to grow the Cape Province). According to the strategy, education must play the leading role in developing the human resources needed to fight poverty, create employment and ensure economic growth.

### 4.2.2 Corporate Context of the Western Cape Education Department

The WCED consists of a provincial head office, seven Education Management and Development Centres (EMDCs) and approximately 1 500 schools, six Further Education and Training Colleges and other educational institutions.

The Provincial Education Ministry is headed by a Member of the Executive Council (MEC) of the ruling party in the province. He/She is responsible for the policy management of education in the province, and works closely with the Minister of Education at a national level (NEPA, 1996). This provincial education ministry is responsible primarily for the development of provincial education policy and the management of the political aspects of education.

The provincial head office is responsible for policy co-ordination and mediation and strategic management, whereas the EMDCs are responsible mainly for policy implementation. The WCED, organisationally further is headed by a Superintendent-General or Head of Education and consists of three branches below it, namely:

- Corporate Services;
- Operational Education Management; and
- Education Planning and Development.

The Corporate Services branch is chiefly responsible for human resource
management and development and financial management. It is thus responsible for ensuring organisational effectiveness and efficiency. Much of the responsibility for the delivery of quality administration to the education community, and schools particularly, rests with this branch.

The Operational Education Management branch’s key responsibility is to introduce a continuing programme of school effectiveness and improvement. The Education Planning and Development branch is mainly responsible for:

- The development and support of dynamic, quality curricula;
- The creation of an enabling environment for the delivery of high quality vocal education and training;
- Effective prevention, removal of an/or compensation for barriers to learning to ensure optimal learning;
- Ensuring that planning, provision and continuing support of various forms and educational technology in support of teaching and learning in classrooms and the effective management and administration in the educational institutions;
- Ensuring the necessary infrastructure for teaching and learning;
- Ensuring the delivery of an effective and reliable assessment and examination system; and
- The collection, analysis, development and dissemination of valuable management information, research and policy.

For the branches to operate effectively it need human resources. The WCED has a total of 9361 public servant posts, of which 8343 are filled. It also carries 831 employees additional to its establishment. In addition to the public servants, the WCED also employs over 29 000 educators in its various institutions( WCED, 2003).
The policy process is devolved to the various Chief Directors. The main purpose of policies, regulations and circulars is to promote good management practice by providing clear guidelines for the implementation of national policies and guidelines.

The aim of the EMDCs is to bring management and development support closer to public schools throughout the province, and to assist schools in their efforts to be site-based institutions, meaning the ability to manage themselves effectively, efficiently and economically. The EMDCs further offer a wide range of services. These services include:

- Curriculum development and support;
- Specialized learner and educator support;
- Institutional management and governance support; and
- Administrative services.

In focusing on its core objectives, the WCED has implemented a number of interventions, programmes and systems to ensure that the services that they render are of a very high standard (WCED, 2003).

In the context described in the introduction and the background above, the Department embarked on a business process re-engineering or SDI programme in 2002 (see Annexure A), with the aim of improving service delivery. The SDI programme consists of the following elements:

- Restructuring of the schooling system;
- The establishment of seven EMDCs;
- Introduction of school-based management;
- Introduction of the Khanya Project;
- Implementation of a Employee Assistance Programme;
- The development of Work Skills Plan;
- The launch of a Batho Pele Campaign;
- The implementation of a Client Service Centre; and
- The implementation of an Issue Management System.

The next section will look at the current realities in the WCED with specific reference to the constitutional and legislative mandates as well as the applicable policies.

4.3 SDIP in the WCED: Current Reality

Public services are not a privilege in a civilized and democratic society: they are legitimate expectations. Meeting the basic needs of all citizens should be a key programme of any government. This means that all citizens, within the context of the fiscal constraints, must orient government institutions to optimize access to their services and the fulfillment of competing needs (Batho Pele Handbook, 2002).

4.3.1 Legislation and policies applicable to SDI

Chapter 10 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act No 108 of 1996 stipulates that public administration should adhere to a number of principles, including that:

- A high standard of professional ethics be promoted and maintained;
- Services be provided impartially, fairly, equitable and without bias;
- Resources be utilised efficiently, economically and effectively;
- Peoples’ needs be responded to; the public be encouraged to
participate in policy-making and
- it be accountable, transparent and development-oriented.

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act No 108 of 1996, through the Bill of Rights, also give citizens certain rights to take action against the state if they believe their constitutional rights have been infringed. It further grants them the right in terms of section 32 to have access to information held by the state, which they need in order to be able to do so. In line with these Constitutional principles, the White Paper on the Transformation of the Public Service (WPTPS) of 1997 calls on all national and provincial departments to make service delivery a priority. The purpose of the WPTPS is to provide a policy framework and a practical implementation strategy to enable national and provincial departments to effect the required transformation of public service delivery. This White Paper is primarily about how public services are provided, and specifically about improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the way in which services are delivered. It is not about what services are to be provided – their volume, level and quality – which is a matter for Ministers, Members of the Executive Councils (MECs), other executing authorities and the duly appointed heads of government institutions. However, their decisions about what should be delivered will be improved as a result of the Batho Pele approach, strategies. Thus, these strategies will need to promote continuous improvements in the quantity, quality and equity of service provision. Chapter 11 of the WPTPS, 1997 requires national and provincial departments to identify, among others things:

- A mission statement for service delivery, together with service guarantees;
- The services to be provided, to which groups, and at which service charges;
- In line with Reconstruction and Development (RDP) priorities, the principle of affordability, and the principle of redirecting resources to areas and groups previously under-resourced;
- Service standards, defined outputs and targets, and performance indicators, benchmarked against comparable international standards;
- Plans for staffing, human resource development and organisational capacity building, tailored to service delivery needs;
- The redirection of human and other resources from administrative tasks to service provision, particularly for disadvantaged groups and areas, financial plans that link budgets directly to service needs and personnel plans;
- Potential partnerships with the private sector, non-governmental organisations (CBOs) which will provide more effective forms of service delivery; and
- The development, particularly through training, of a culture of customer care and of approaches to service delivery that are sensitive to issues of race, gender and disability.

The Batho Pele policy framework as set out in the WPTPS, 1997 consists of eight service delivery principles, namely:

- Consultation: citizens should be consulted about the level and quality of the public services they receive and, wherever possible, should be given a choice about the service that are offered;
- Service standards: citizens should be told what level and quality services they will receive so that they are aware of what to expect;
- Access: all citizens should have equal access to the services to which they are entitled;
- **Courtesy**: citizens should be treated with courtesy and consideration;
- **Information**: citizens should be given full, accurate information about the public services they are entitled to receive;
- **Openness and transparency**: citizens should be told how national and provincial departments are run, how much they cost, and who is in charge;
- **Redress**: if the promise standard of service is not delivered, citizens should be offered an apology, a full explanation and a speedy and effective remedy; and when complaints are made, citizens should receive a sympathetic, positive response;
- **Value for money**: public services should be provided economically and efficiently in order to give citizens the value for money.

**Other legislative and functional mandates include, inter alia:**
- The South African Schools Act, 1996;
- The National Education Policy Act, 1996;
- The Education Laws Amendment Act, 1999;
- The Further Education and Training Act, 1998;
- The South African Certification Council Act, 1998;
- The Western Cape Provincial School Education Act, 1997;
- The Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (as amended);
- The South African Qualification Authority Act, 1995;
- The Western Cape Technical Colleges Act, 1994;
- The Adult Basic Education and Training Act, 2000;
- The Skills Development Act, 1998;
- The Skills Development Levies Act, 1999 and
In view of the legislative mandates and functions, it is expected of the WCED to adopt a SDIP. The next section will focus on the programmes of the Department to effect service delivery improvement.

4.3.2 Programmes of the WCED

In its quest to deliver excellent service to all clients – both internal and external – the WCED, like all other departments within the public service, is required to have a SDIP in terms of Part III C of the Public Service Regulations of 2001. The primary aim is to inculcate the Batho Pele principles and the implementation thereof in the organisation (WCED, 2004).

During a telephonic interview with the Head of Education of the WCED held on 1 December 2004, it was confirmed that the department did not have a SDIP for the year 2003/2004 and subsequent years. However, in terms of the annual report to the Executive Committee, it was confirmed that the groundwork for a SDIP was already completed in the year 2002 with the Strategic Objectives as a starting point. The process of developing the plan, which include the setting of targets, began in February 2003.

Despite, the lack of a SDIP, the WCED adopted the following programmes with objectives as part of its service delivery improvement strategy:

- Programme1 which covers the administration with the aim to provide overall management of and support to the education system. The administration programme consists of the following sub-programmes:
- To provide for the functioning of the office of the MEC;
- To provide corporate management services that are not education specific;
- To provide education management services;
- To provide human resource development for head office staff; and
- To provide key programme developments.

Programme 2, which is directed towards Public Ordinary School Education with the aim to provide public ordinary education from Grades 1 – 12 in accordance with the South African Schools Act, 1996. The Public Ordinary School Education programme comprises of the following sub-programmes:

- To provide education for the Grades 1 – 7 phase at public primary ordinary schools;
- To provide education for the Grades 8 – 12 levels at public secondary ordinary schools;
- To provide professional services to support public ordinary schools;
- To provide human resource development of educators and non-educators in public ordinary schools.

Programme 3, which is directed towards the provision of Independent school subsidies to support them in accordance with the South African Schools Act. The following sub-programmes form part of it:

- Support to independent schools in the Grades 1 – 7 phase;
- Support to independent schools in Grades 8 – 12;

Programme 4 deals with public special school education and aims to provide public education in special schools in accordance with the South African Schools Act, 1996 and White Paper 6 on inclusive education. The following sub-programmes form part of it:
- Provision of education at public schools;
- Professional services to support special schools; and
- The professional development of educators and non-educators in public special schools.

Programme 5 has do with further education and training and is intended to provide FET at public FET colleges in accordance with the Further Education and Training Act, 1998. Sub-programmes part of it includes:

- Provision of specific public FET colleges with resources;
- Provision of professional services to support public FET colleges; and
- Professional development of educators and non-educators in public FET colleges.

Programme 6 strives to provide adult basic education and training in accordance with the Adult Basic Education and Training Act, 2000. Sub-programmes include:

- Subsidies to private ABET centers to support them;
- Professional services to support ABET sites; and
- Provision for the professional development of educators and non-educators at ABET sites.

Programme 7 deals with early childhood development with the aim to provide for ECD at Grade R and earlier levels in accordance with White Paper 5. Sub-programmes include the following:

- Provision of resources to public ordinary schools with Grade R classes;
- Support to particular community centers at Grade R level;
- Professional services to ECD sites; and
- Provision of professional development to educators and non-educators at sites.

Lastly, there is programme 8 that deals with the auxiliary and associated services. The purpose of it is to provide education institutions as a whole with support. Sub-programmes include the following:

- Payments to Education and Training Development Practices Sector Education Training Authority (ETDPSETA) to provide employee human resource development in accordance with the Skills Development Act of 1999;
- Provision for projects specified by the national Department of Education that are applicable to more than one programme and funded from conditional grants;
- External examinations — provision of departmentally managed examination services; and
- Assistance with the supply of qualified and competent educators for the teaching profession.

With this background information, the researcher will look at the implementation of a SDIP in the WCED and draw a comparison between the WCED SDIP against the PSEM.

### 4.3.3 Implementation of SDIP / programme in the WCED

A comparative analysis has been made of the WCED programmes and objectives against the actual achievements. The annual report of 2003/2004 was used as gauge to establish this.
In terms of programme 1 – Administration – the WCED undertook to provide overall management of and support to the education system. According to the WCED annual report of 2003/2004, the department was relatively successful as almost all the objectives were achieved. For example a target of 48% was set for schools to receive section 21 status (to be able to manage their own financial and administrative functions with limited supported from the Head Office), whilst an actual output of 51% was achieved.

With regard to programme 2 - Public Ordinary School Education - the primary objectives was the provision of primary ordinary education from Grades 1 – 12. As far the primary phase is concerned the department was relatively successful, except for the secondary phase where they fail in ensuring that the flow of learners through the secondary phase is optimal. The repetition rate, dropout rate and percentage of over-aged learners in the secondary phase are below the targets.

In terms of Programme 3 – Independent schools subsidies- the department was relatively successful. All independent schools that are registered with the WCED and eligible, depending on the Norms and Standards Funding for Independent Schools, received a subsidy.

Programme 6 – Public special school education – was successfully implemented. A pass rate for learners at special schools of 100% was achieved. Despite the successes, there is still a need for placement of learners in youth centers and schools of skills.

Programme 7 – Early childhood development – was relatively successful, except for the provision of Grade R spaces in public ordinary schools in accordance with policy, specifically White Paper 5.
As far as programme 8 – Auxiliary and associated services are concerned, the WCED was relatively successful as almost all their targets were met.

The results need to be qualified in several respects:

- There are deficiencies with regard to the setting of quality standards for the strategic objectives in the Department, and the monitoring of compliance to these standards. There is limited value in monitoring the efficiency of production if the required quality of output is not specified and strictly monitored. If this is not done, reported improvements in output may be misleading; and
- There might be problems with the accuracy of the measurement and recording of output data.

4.4 Summary

From what we have discussed above, it is evident that a philosophy of public service delivery is required by the WCED. This is in line with the spirit of the White Paper on Transforming Public Service Delivery of 1997 and the PSEM. This philosophy reflects on the following three facets:

- The WCED’s obligation to deliver service efficiently, effectively and economically;
- The public’s legitimate right to receive efficient, effective and economic services; and
- The public’s legitimate right to demand quality services if standards drop.

The increasing demand for more effectiveness and efficiency in the provincial
education system requires a strong accountability system and excellent administrative processes in the Department.

Chapter 5 will explore the research findings in detail, analyse it and make recommendations for the improvement of service delivery in the WCED.
CHAPTER 5
RESEARCH FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Introduction

In chapter one an overview was given of the research project and covered issues like the aims of the study, the problem statements as well the research methodology.

In chapter two the process as well as the importance of effective and efficient service delivery were discussed. The organisational requirements for a process of continuous improvements were covered as well as the functions of a typical continuous improvement organisation.

Chapter three focused on the various approaches to TQM for service delivery improvement, as well as the description of the PSEM. It further looked at the benefit and usefulness of the model for application in the public sector.

Chapter four explored the task environment of the WCED as well as the corporate context within which it operates. In this chapter we will explore the research findings in detail, interpret them and make recommendations for improving service delivery in the WCED through the implementation of TQM. Barriers for implementation as well as strategies to ensure that continuous improvement takes place will also be discussed.

In this chapter the researcher will evaluate the WCED SDIP against the PSEM and provide a summary of the main findings during the research project.
5.2 An evaluation of the WCED SDIP against the PSEM

Evaluation is a growing concern in the public service. From federal and state governments down to local taxpayer groups, one finds an increasing demand for evaluation (Talbot, 2001: 198). Much of this stress on evaluation arises from a desire to find out what is wrong with a system and why departments are not delivering effective and efficient services. Some stress evaluation is necessary as a way of holding departments accountable to taxpayers and funding agencies for the money they spend. Others, such as universities, are seeking to increase information about the effective programmes or intervention strategies.

The outcome of the evaluation for quality control is the protection of the public from incompetent services. Unquestionably this is an important outcome and a highly significant responsibility for administrators and politicians.

The following performance level indicators were used to assess the various criteria of the PSEM against the SDIP of the WCED:

X – Does not comply: This level of performance does not meet the minimum expectations and requires urgent intervention and support.

√ - Satisfactory: Satisfies minimum expectations. This level of performance is acceptable and is in line with minimum expectations, but development and support are still required.

√ x - Good: Performance is good and meets expectation, but some areas are still in need of development and support.

√ √ - Outstanding: Performance is outstanding and exceeds expectations. Although performance is excellent, continuous improvement is advised.

During the research project the researcher measured the WCED SDIP against
the PSEM with reference to the following aspects:

(a) **Strategic enablers:** Policy and Governance, Strategy and Plans, Leadership

(i) In terms of **policy and governance** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Legislation and guidance;
- Policy objectives;
- delegation of powers;
- Management and supervision structures;
- Audit and inspection regimes;
- Policy statements; and
- Measurement framework.

(ii) In terms of **strategy and plans** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Strategic planning;
- Operation planning;
- Communications mechanisms;
- Strategic purpose;
- Benchmarking; and
- Information analysis.

(iii) In terms of **leadership** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Performance management;
- Learning and development;
- Internal communication;
- Efficiency, quality and value;
- Leadership style;
- Ethics and Governance;
- Consultation; and
- Recognition and Celebration.

(b) **Operational enablers:** Resources, Process and People

(i) In terms of **resources** the following aspects were evaluated:
   - Financial management;
   - Information computer technology (ICT);
   - Facilities management; and
   - Knowledge management.

(ii) In terms of **processes** the following aspects were evaluated:
   - Management standards;
   - Evaluation and review;
   - Service standards;
   - Customer care;
   - Process compliance;
   - Process coordination; and
   - Marketing and information.

(iv) In terms of **people** the following aspects were evaluated:
   - People management;
   - Human resource planning;
   - Employment terms;
   - Induction;
   - Performance appraisal;
   - Training;
- Health and safety;
- Delegation and responsibility;
- Remuneration and retention; and
- Redundancy and retirement.

(c) **Organisation results:** Internal and external results

**Internal results:** Resources, efficiency results and people results

(i) In terms of **resources** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Budgets;
- Financial control;
- Equipment and materials; and
- States and buildings.

(ii) In terms of **efficiency results** the following results were evaluated:
- Value for money;
- Waiting times;
- Liability claims; and
- Contractor performance.

(iii) In terms of **people results** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Staff involvement;
- Performance review;
- Accident management;
- Sickness management;
- Staff retention;
- Grievances and disputes; and
- Equality of opportunity.
External results: Reporting, outputs and satisfaction

(i) In terms of **reporting** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Annual reports;
- Quarterly reports; and
- Publications.

(ii) In terms of **outputs and service satisfaction** the following aspects were evaluated:
- User demand;
- Media profile;
- Complaint management; and
- Community involvement.

(iii) In terms of **programme outcomes and programme satisfaction** the following aspects were evaluated:
- Strategic outcomes;
- Service quality; and
- Waiting times.

As indicated above, the WCED had no SDIP for the 2003/2004 financial year. Notwithstanding this, each directorate in the WCED has focus on its own service standards and its responsibility towards its clients. The WCED is still busy consulting stakeholders with regard to the adoption of a shared vision document up to the year 2020 (WCED, 2004). An evaluation will now be done of the current programmes of the WCED against the PSEM model, which was discussed in chapter 3. Table 2 shows a comparison of the PSEM against the WCED SDIP.
Table 2: Comparison of the WCED SDIP and PSEM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>PSEM</th>
<th>WCED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Enablers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Strategic enablers;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 Policy and governance</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 Strategy and plans</td>
<td>✓✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3 Leadership</td>
<td>✓✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Operational enablers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 Resources</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Processes</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 People</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Organisational results:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Internal results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Resources</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 Efficiency</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3 People</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 External results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Reporting</td>
<td>✓✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Outputs</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Satisfaction</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Programme results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Programme outcomes</td>
<td>✓✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Programme satisfaction</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The purpose of the section was not to discuss the assessments as indicated in the comparative table, but should to give an overview of the findings of the evaluation of the WCED SDIP against the PSEM. The motivations for these assessments will be provided in chapter 5.3. Strong recommendations will be made as to how the shortcomings can be address in an attempt to change the WCED to an organisation that strives towards continuous service delivery improvement.

5.3 RESEARCH FINDINGS

From the findings of the research study, i.e. focus groups, participative observation, documents analysis and unstructured interviews, a number of conclusions can be drawn in regard to the aims and research questions posed in this thesis. Firstly, are quality frameworks, as applied in the Western Cape Education Department, leading an improved longitudinal performance? Within the limitations of the survey scope the conclusion is that the WCED demonstrated improved levels of performance when quality frameworks were applied within the organisation. In general, this effect was more noticeable beyond the implementation period. Thus the principles of TQM as embodied in the quality frameworks can be sustained in the WCED by leading to improved performance.

Secondly, how are the frameworks perceived in terms of usefulness when compared with each other? The analysis of results, in particular the cross-analysis, shows no clear preference from the WCED top management for any framework during the interview held with the Director for Human Resource Management, Ms Linda Rose on April 12, 2003 in Cape Town.
Thirdly, is there a distinctive preferred approach to using the quality frameworks to achieve performance improvement? The results indicate no preferred approach. However, an overall pattern was found to be emerging where a combined use of the various quality frameworks was identified as the main vehicles for sustaining and carrying forward quality improvement efforts, like the introduction of Senior Performance Management System for senior management, the Integrated Quality Management System (IQMS) for educators, Public Service Management Development System (PSMDS) for office-based educators and the Public Service Management Development System for non-Curricular System Educators.

It was found that there is a continuing emphasis on cost reduction and improved customer service within the WCED, as top management seeks to control public expenditure and improve value for money. However, no formally recognised quality model has been introduced by the WCED. The question that needs to be answered, is how does the WCED’s SDIP compare against the PSEM? The following issues will be looked at and recommendations will be made in this regard:

Enablers:
- Policy and governance;
- Strategy and plans;
- Leadership;
- Resources; and
- Processes.

Organisational results:
- Resources;
- Efficiency;
- People;
- Outputs; and
- Satisfaction.

Programme results:
- Programme outcomes; and
- Programme satisfaction.

In the following section, the assessment as concluded upon in Table 2 will now be substantiated by means of an overall evaluation and supporting evidence.

5.3.1 Enablers
5.3.1.1 Policy and governance

In respect of policy and governance the researcher indicated that the WCED SDIP does not comply satisfactorily against the PSEM. To substantiate this, the following evidence can be provided. As far as policy and strategy are concerned, the Provincial Education Minister is responsible for the policy management of education in the province, and work closely with the Minister of Education at a national level (WCED, 2004). The provincial ministry is responsible primarily for the development of provincial education policy and the management of the political aspects of education. The key goal of the WCED in relation to this office of the Minister is to ensure that the MEC is continuously informed and kept abreast on developments in the education sector. No policy unit, however exist in the WCED to draft concept policies for recommendation to the MEC. The provincial head office is responsible for policy coordination and mediation and strategic management, whereas the EMDCs are responsible mainly for policy implementation. This is not a rigid
dividing line since EMDCs are also involved in the design and development of policies at various levels, including the national level as far curriculum policy and other policies are concerned like the conditions of service of public servants and educators.

According to A. Lewis (8 September, 2004) there is no synergy in terms of policy implementation. The majority of the policies that are agreed to are not workable on the ground, because of the absence of a realistic feel of top management for what is happening at grassroots level. Mr Eugene Daniels E. (5 October, 2004) shared this view.

The research conducted clearly indicated that policy process in Department is disparate and uncoordinated. Although the process is devolved to the various Chief Directors, but the process verifying the legislative basis of policies is lacking. There is little consideration for the impact for line directorates within the Department. It is further confirmed that no register is kept of policies, regulations and circulars, resulting in a duplication of various policy documents (WCED, 2003: 20). This led to resistance and frustration with the implementation of the policies at various levels. This can be ascribed to a lack of ownership of various processes. Although national policies are in the interest of the country, all employees are not brought on board. This calls for an effective communication strategy, to align departmental policies taken the uniqueness of the problems and challenges of the province into consideration. Indeed, the main purpose of policies, regulations and circulars is to promote good management practice by providing clear guidelines for the implementation of national policies and legislation. Clarity in the policy process promotes confidence and stability in the system, and enable schools to focus on its key role, namely the delivering of the curriculum.
Governance refers to the control of assets of the Department, which includes planning, organising, leading/directing, devising work procedures and methods and staffing. This will be elaborated upon in the section to follow. The current focus will be narrowly on the financial issues. The WCED has a Fraud Prevention Policy in place, which includes a clear description of acts, which constitutes corruption, fraud, theft and mal-administration. The policy further clearly indicates the reporting procedures that must be followed when such acts occur. A copy of the code conduct has been supplied to each official. The Department emphasizes the need for segregation of duties in order to limit the effect of conflict of interests (WCED, 2004).

In compliance with Section 38 (1)(a)(ii) of the Public Finance Management Act No 1 of 1999, the WCED has appointed an audit committee during July 2003. In collaboration with the Provincial Treasury, the Department has ensured that the necessary induction sessions were held and interactions between management and the audit committee were also arranged. This was in an attempt to ensure that the audit committee operates effectively and sound financial governance is achieved. Despite all these efforts, top management has failed in this regard as no internal audits were performed at the Department during the 2003/2004 financial year under review (WCED, 2004).

In terms of the annual report of the Auditor-General for the financial year 2003/2004, various internal control weaknesses were also identified and reported to top management of the WCED. Most of the weaknesses relate to insufficient control over payment vouchers (including support documentation), as well as the omission of references to where the supporting documentation can be obtained. For example the inspection of budgets per individual schools
could not be determined and thus it could not be determined whether the actual payments made to schools had exceed the budget per school.

5.3.1.2 **Strategy and plans**

In terms of Table 2 in chapter 4 the WCED SDIP complies with the PSEM. The researcher is of the opinion that the WCED has been successful in the category as a strategic plan was adopted for the Department. The resources were also deployed as prescribed by the Public Service Regulations, 2001. Key performance indicators are being set, monitored and achieved within the environmental and budget constraints faced. Good governance and effective control, however, should be the priority for attention and improvement.

Strategic and operational plans guide the processes at head office. The responsibilities of people and time-frames are agreed to. No quality assurance mechanism however is in place. Currently the functionaries are basically managing transition. They are putting building blocks in place, wrestle with change and are challenged to change the landscape. This is an evolutionary process and leadership is therefore depressed with the tempo of change in the WCED (Mr E. Daniels, 5 October, 2004).

5.3.1.3 **Leadership**

In so far leadership is concern as indicated in Table 2 of chapter 4, some elements of satisfactorily compliance is detected, but there also elements of concern. As far as a vision and mission are concerned, no shared vision exists
in the WCED. Previous visions adopted were done so without the buy-in of subordinates. It was a unilateral process as top management alone was involved in the formulation as the vision and mission. A process is currently underway to formulate a vision for the next 15 years. This is a more democratic process as all role-players are extensively consulted. The purpose of the exercise is to give all role-players a sense of ownership of the WCED. Although credit must be given for the top management of WCED for their attempts to adopt a shared vision for the ensuing years (2004 – 2020), the process is too slow (Mr Cameron Dugmore, 8 November, 2004).

5.3.1.4 Resources

In terms of resources as indicated in Table 2 in chapter 4, the WCED SDIP does not comply satisfactorily against the PSEM. The audit of assets revealed that there is no policy in place that incorporated all the aspects of asset management. Although an asset register has been maintained, the asset register is incomplete and does not meet the requirements and as a result is in non-compliance with existing laws and regulations. The criterion requires the immediate attention of top management to remedy the situation that will ultimately lead to the improvement of service delivery.

5.3.1.5 Processes

According to Table 2 in chapter 4 the WCED’s SDIP does not comply satisfactorily against the PSEM. It is opinion of the researcher that a deliberate attempt was made to identify the process key to the success of the service delivery improvement programme. It is systemically managed and review through the quarterly reports of the various directorates and targets are set for improvement (Mr Eugene Daniels, October 5, 2004).
5.3.1.6 People

In terms of table 2 of chapter 4 the WCED SDIP also does not comply satisfactorily against the PSEM. It is opinion of the researcher that enough is not being done in this area. This particular aspect relates to the way people agree to targets, the performance review, empowerment, recognition, involvement, dialogue, caring. Not all employees have performance contracts. This issue is restricted to middle and top management (director level and higher). Despite poor performance, like the lack of internal control, seniors still receive performance bonuses.

At school and district level no performance assessment tool were in place for school-based and district official (directors excluded). The training in the IQMS and PMDS for educators and public servants were concluded as recently as October 2004. Not even all public servants and educators received training in the performance measuring instruments. It can further be argued that the quality of standard provided by service providers was not always according to standard.

5.3.2 Organisational results

The following section will focus on the organisational results of the WCED.

5.3.2.1 Resources and results

In terms of Table 2 in chapter 4 the WCED SDIP does not comply satisfactorily against the PSEM. With regard to the management of resources, the focus is on the hard stuff, instead of the soft stuff as well (see McKinsey 7 S Model as referred to in chapter 3). There is a substantive focus on targets.
The WCED is heavily criticised that it only want outputs to improve the organisational results. Top management does not always take the national, provincial and contextual factors into consideration. A key feature of the WCED’s strategic plans is that they are input orientated and seldom reflect on outputs and outcomes. The emphasis should be on the analysis of outputs and outcomes. In terms of people management little is done in measuring empowerment, recognition, involvement, dialogue and caring. It was only most recently that the Employee Wellness Programme was adopted to assist employees with counselling of work and family-related problems. The moral of members of staff is extremely low (WCED, 2004).

In an attempt to address the complaints and concerns of internal and external customers, a client centre was instituted where members can report issues of concerns. The enquiries are then directed to the relevant directorates and report back is given. Two key areas of perceived poor service from the provincial and district offices relate to inadequate and ineffective communication, and tardy response times to individual educator school queries. In particular, schools cite instances of documents being lost, unanswered telephones, unclear contact and responsibility points in relation to various queries regarding school finances or conditions of service. A serious allegation also, is that the WCED’s communication system is both ineffective and inefficient.

5.3.2.2 Efficiency results

It is difficult to express an opinion with regard to the internal results, relating to the resources, efficiency and people as no information was available during
the research in this regard. However, it is important to note that the increasing demand for efficiency in the education system, requires a strong accountability system and process in the WCED. Systemic evaluation, School Self-Evaluation, Whole School Evaluation and Organisational Efficiency Measures are all instruments to be used to advance the objective.

5.3.2.3 Reporting

According to Ms Linda Rose (April 12, 2003) the WCED is subject to a wide range of accountability processes. This include, amongst other;

- auditing of financial management processes on an annual basis, by the provincial Auditor-General’s office;
- appearances at regular sessions with the Education Portfolio Committee and the Standing Committee on Public Accounts in the provincial legislature; and
- meetings (or road shows) with various education stakeholders at regular intervals by the MEC and the Head of Education to share information about the latest developments in education or simply to hear about problems experienced by educators and school managers.

The WCED is already under obligation to submit an annual report on its activities to the legislature. This document is accessible by the broader public and allows for the education community to monitor the achievements or failures of the Department, in relation to legislative and policy mandates and its strategic plans (WCED, 2003). The reports are interrogated by the relevant structures and recommendations are made in this regard to improve the delivery of services.
5.3.3 Programme outcomes

In terms of Table 2 in chapter 4 some of the elements of the WCED SDIP comply satisfactorily against the PSEM, but there were also elements of concern detected. As far as the impact on the society is concerned, there is still different views on the effectiveness of the WCED. According to the Public Service Commission Survey, April 2003 (WCED, 2004) the general view about service satisfaction is positive. A cautionary note is however sounded as teachers neither rate the value of the information they receive nor the actual service very highly. Moreover, they do not recommend the delivery of the service highly. This is extremely worrying, given the status of teachers in many communities. Consequently, we can say that the morale of teachers is extremely low, high turnover rates and absenteeism are prevalent in the Department.

Members of the SGBs were slightly more enthusiastic about the value of the service that they received. Like teachers, however, they do not rate the value of the information pertaining to the service very highly. On the other side, whilst ABET learners would strongly recommend the service, they were not quite as satisfied with either the value or the information they received or the actual value of the service.

It can be said that the WCED has achieved the desired programme outcomes as planned. May be the levels of expectation regarding the services might be too ambitious. The landscape has not change yet as two set of economies are experienced in schools. Not enough has been done to eradicate the discrepancies of the past. Schools are still racially divided although certain historical privileged schools are almost fully integrated. Discrimination is now
taking place along economical lines.

5.4 Summary

The process of periodic public sector reform followed by a significant period of consolidation is based on the premise that organisational homeostasis is the norm and that reform is the exception (Graham, 1994). This assumption needs to be replaced by one of continuous improvement, where the on-going re-examination and renewal of the work context is the norm. This, in turn, requires the construction of an atmosphere in which participating managers and other stakeholders alike feel sufficiently free from threats to their self-esteem to be “open to learn”.

Given the background information with regard to the findings of the researcher, the following section will deal with recommendations as to how to effect continuous improvement of service delivery in the WCED.
6.1 Introduction

The total quality concept in the public sector should be comprehensive – not only in consistency of service and meeting customers’ expectations (useful, effective, appropriate), but also in the efficiency of technical and organisational processes. The increased complexity in the relationships between users and providers of public services make the finding of a compromise between efficiency and effectiveness all the more critical.

Chapter 5 was dedicated to the main findings of the researcher during the research project as he measured the WCED SDIP against the PSEM. This chapter will deal with the recommendations on how to effect continuous improvement of service delivery in the WCED.

6.2 Recommendations

In order to improve both organisational and individual performances, the above-mentioned management functions are all important. The following recommendations can be considered to address the inadequacies of the SDIP in the WCED.

6.2.1 Policy and Governance

To assist the WCED with coordination of the policies, it is recommended that
a policy unit be established in the office of the Minister. This will enable the Minister to have a direct control over the policy formulation processes and a to keep a register of all policies. In this way the implementation process can be easily monitored in term of compliance. Members of the various stakeholder bodies can be invited to be part of a Ministerial Committee for Education to give inputs in the policy formulation process.

As far as governance is concerned, the Head of Education as the administrative head, must ensure that the audit committee meets regularly and that audit internal audits are conducted as prescribed by the PFMA. Reporting should be done on their findings so that the necessary adjustments, if needed can be made timeously.

In improving the internal control at the Head Office, members should be trained or capacitated as to how to perform these functions. Persistent gross negligence should lead to the institution of disciplinary procedures against the poor performance. This process should take place in terms of the provisions of the Labour Relations Act No 66 of 1995. At school level School Governing Bodies and principals as well as administrative staff should receive training on an on-going basis as regulations in these regards are changing.

6.2.2 Strategy and plans

In ensuring that good governance and effective control exist in the Department, it is recommended that a Quality Assurance Directorate be established in the office of the Head of Education. This directorate should be responsible for quality assurance of the processes and systems of the Department against a agreed upon quality framework or model. The PSEM is strongly recommended in this regard.
Continuous improvement can be institutionalised by means of workplace forums structures where employees can meaningfully influence decisions affecting them and the immediate business. Implementing work team sessions (between section head and staff to address workplace issues) will ensure involvement of staff in decisions and operational planning, and facilitate two-way communication in the organisation.

The following ways of measurement can be used to assist the WCED with is evaluation of performance:
- Customer satisfaction surveys: questionnaires;
- Increase in the throughput of learners;
- Reduction in the dropout rate of learners;
- Corporate culture: set targets and benchmark with models;
- Identification of staff with vision: performance evaluation;
- Staff perception of management: interviews;
- Efficiency of work teams: performance measurement;
- Effectiveness of new systems: benchmarking;
- Motivation of levels of staff: benchmarking; and
- Staff accountability: benchmarking.

6.2.3 Leadership

Although concerted efforts were made to adopt a shared vision, transformational leadership is required to gain the trust of all parties. Great commitment should be sought from employees and buy-in should receive priority.
6.2.4 Resources

In pursuance of a remedy for the lack of control over the assets of the Department, the keeping of an asset register should be enforced. Secondly, members of staff should receive continuous training in terms of compliances. Persistent failure or negligence should be dealt with in terms of disciplinary measures.

6.2.5 People

Feedback is not considered to be timely and effective, but on the other hand most employees seem to have a good idea of what their responsibilities are, and are informed by management on how to improve their performance. The on-going-spot feedback must be part of the managerial approach of the WCED.

The viewpoint suggests that the training objectives are somewhat subordinate to the operational objectives. The problem needs to be investigated further. Two approaches can be followed in addressing the problem:

- Obligatory attendance endorsed by top management;
- Re-evaluation of training programmes with respect to:
  - Relevancy to the job and bottom-line of branches;
  - Training needs of delegates;
  - Up-to-date training programmes and methodology;
  - Cost, timing, duration and frequency;
  - Training instructor competence;
  - Feedback and measuring of effectiveness;
  - Whether it will ultimately lead to higher productivity; and
- Whether it is aligned with people development and organisational strategy.

Experience from past training programmes has shown that:

- the training needs of the delegates were not in line with the business goals of the organisation;
- the contents of the training programmes were not geared to meet the requirement of the organisation;
- the training instructors were not suitably qualified or competent enough; and
- the training programmes were too long and costly, requiring delegates to be away from work for too long.

The above situations have to be rectified and the correct measures have to be undertaken to ensure that all future training programmes are conducted in a professional and efficient manner. A Strategic Human Resource Strategy should address the wide variety of people issues relevant to the business strategy.

6.2.6 Resources and results

The successful implementation of the policies and programmes of the WCED will depend; first and foremost, on making sure that employees understand the purpose and objectives at levels within the organisation. This will require a well – managed communication campaign in which employees at all levels are able to participate and have their questions answered, and their concerns taken into account.

Managing people at the WCED has traditionally been seen as the task of
individual departments, whose main task has been to ensure compliance with centrally determined regulations. These activities have sometimes been perceived as controlling and inhibiting the effective management of human resources. Continuous communication is vital, in order to sustain staff morale and motivation.

6.2.7 Programme outcomes

To improve the customer focus, excellent service programmes should be run on an ongoing basis to establish culture and to address the issue of a lack of a strategic focus amongst all employees, all key staff should have sound values and buy-in and the vision and mission should be communicated to all employees.

6.3 Conclusion

The significance of quality as a core value needs to be emphasised in the Performance Management process. The fundamental reason for introducing TQM, or any quality initiative is to increase stakeholder value – value to shareholders, customers, employees and the community. Quality management encompasses a number of essential principles and must be integrated in a holistic manner to optimise organisational performance. These principles can be summarised as follows:

- All processes focus on delivering quality products and services to meet customers’ expectations, both internally and externally; and
- Processes and sub processes are continuously improved.

When managers move from managing people to managing quality, their whole perspective changes. They realize that their function is to manage and
improve processes and not to control people. Table 3 summarises the differences between traditional and quality management.

**Table 3: Differences between traditional management and quality management**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRADITIONAL MANAGEMENT</th>
<th>QUALITY MANAGEMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Bottom-line driven</td>
<td>• Customer-driven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Measuring individuals</td>
<td>• Measuring processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Management controls workers</td>
<td>• Self-control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Quality is the responsibility of production managers and quality controllers</td>
<td>• Quality applies to all levels of staff in the organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Individuals are concerned about doing their own jobs</td>
<td>• Individuals work in teams to make the total process function in a better way</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A competitive organisational culture reinforces individualism</td>
<td>• A quality organisation culture reinforces both individual and group contributions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Maintaining the status quo</td>
<td>• Continuous improvements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• React to problems when crises occur</td>
<td>• Preventative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Maintained by the power, position and status of management</td>
<td>• Maintained by a documented quality system (ISO 9000 etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Emphasis on management- subordinate relationships</td>
<td>• Emphasis on customer-supplier and management-employee relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employees are blamed for errors</td>
<td>• Errors are part of the process and the system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Functional departments promote their own interests</td>
<td>• Inter-departmental co-operation focuses on quality products and services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employees satisfy management needs</td>
<td>• Employees satisfy customer needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Adversarial industrial relations</td>
<td>• Collaboration and constructive industrial relations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Meyer, 1998
6.3 Further Research Recommendations

As service delivery improvement through the Batho Pele principles is the flagship of the government of the Republic of South Africa, it is strongly recommended that further research be conducted in the following areas:

- The application of the PSEM in the rest of the Departments of the WCED;
- The aspect of transformational leadership and the PSEM; and
- A comparison of all the national Departments in terms of performances measured against the PSEM.
ANNEXURE A

Service Delivery Improvement Plan/ Programme of WCED for 2002/2003

Changes in the legislative and national and provincial policy framework necessitated drastic changes the way schools were governed and managed. The WCED, therefore, underwent a restructuring process, which ultimately resulted in a new organisational structure and establishment.

In order to support school-based management, the WCED established seven EMDCs. The EMDCs are responsible and accountable for all functions pertaining to support, development, enablement, empowerment and coordination at the intermediate level of the WCED. Multi-disciplinary teams based at the centres support, develop and manage the institutions.

Other initiatives designed to improve school-based management included training and advising governing bodies on their duties and advising school management teams on effective school management procedures. An uniform equitable provisioning scale for allocating public service posts was used to deploy staff to the centres.

The Khanya project is an initiative of the WCED, and was started in April 2001 to address the shortage of qualified teachers in poor schools. The project uses affordable and appropriate information and communication technology as a tool to improve learning and teaching in schools. Since its establishment the Khanya project has benefited more than 227200 learners, helped 267 schools to use technology effectively, empowered 6779 educators to use technology optimally for curriculum delivery and made the use of 8681
computers in Khanya schools possible (Personnel Newsletter, 2004).

In recognition of the importance of its human resources for its ultimate success an Employee Assistance Programme (EAP) was implemented. The purpose of this programme is to identify and assist individuals and groups to assess the nature of their difficulties and to help them overcome these with a view of improving their work performance and productivity (WCED, 2003). An employee wellness programme was launched on 12 October 2004 with the aim to support employees by means of promoting their physical and mental health, a healthy lifestyle, wellness and quality of life. The service provides expert counselling and advice on a wide range of issues relating to mental, emotional, physical, financial and legal help. This includes such issues as depression, relationships, alcoholism, drug abuse, stress, debt, gambling, family problems, bereavement and health problems such as HIV/AIDS. All counselling is strictly confidential. A telephone counselling service is available 24 hours per day. A toll free number is available for this purpose.

The WCED developed a Workplace Skills Plan (WSP) to focus on the gaps in terms of skills shortages and service delivery needs. This programme is closely monitored by the Department of Labour and serves as a means to addressed the skills shortages in the province.

The WCED further launched a campaign on services delivery and drawing all employees’ attention to their responsibilities, and the fact that they are its internal service providers. In this way the WCED sensitised all line managers and frontline employees to the needs of its customers and how they should be treated. Further to this top management, line management and frontline service staff all received focused training in service delivery.
A Client Services Centre, which can be seen as a one-stop shop for personnel and financial enquiries was established in 2002. This assist principals with the necessary administrative enquiries as it is expected of educators to teach and not to stay for long on the telephone when making enquiries to the head office regarding remuneration and appointments.

An Issue Management System, which is a database that keeps record of all correspondence flowing in the WCED was implemented. It tracks enquiries from clients to finalisation and generates reports on where bottlenecks are experienced in terms of service delivery as well as the number and type of queries that the WCED receives(WCED, 2003).
References


Cornelissen, D. 2004. Interview with Mr. Archie Lewis, Advisor to the Minister of Education in the Western Cape. Cape Town. 8 September 2004.
Cornelissen, D. 2004. Interview with Mr. Eugene Daniels, Director of the EMDC South in the Western Cape Education Department. Cape Town. 5 October 2004.

Cornelissen, D. 2004. Interview with Mr. Cameron Dugmore, Minister of Education in the Western Cape. 8 November 2004.

Cornelissen, D. 2004. Telephonic interview with Mr. Ron Swartz, Head of Education in the Western Cape Education Department. 1 December 2004.


Fitzgerald, L & Moon, P. *Performance measurement in service industries: Making it work*. CIMA, London.


