

Reflections on the constellation of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics in Plato's Dialogues

**By
Marise Labuschagne**



**Thesis presented in fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
MMus
in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences,
at Stellenbosch University**

Promoter: Dr Ralf Alexander Kohler

April 2019

Declaration

By submitting this thesis electronically, I declare that the entirety of the work contained therein is my own, original work, that I am the sole author thereof (save to the extent explicitly otherwise stated), that reproduction and publication thereof by Stellenbosch University will not infringe any third party rights and that I have not previously in its entirety or in part submitted it for obtaining any qualification.

M. Labuschagne

March 2019

Abstract

This research project investigates *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics as an integrated culture-shaping constellation within the democratic context of fifth-century B.C.E. Athens, Greece. *Mousikē*, in the broad sense, included music, dance and poetry, and formed an important part of Greek intellectual culture and everyday life. It was present during intimate religious ceremonies as well as grander occasions such as festivals and even battles. *Mousikē* functioned as an educational platform where aristocrats were able to master rhetoric through studying literature and the performance arts, including poetry, music and dance. Social hierarchy was of great importance in Grecian culture. The elite mastered rhetoric and *Mousikē* to express their social power over non-aristocratic citizens. As part of the democratic advances in Athens, all Athenian-born male citizens were encouraged to participate in civic duties. This presented ethical complications for the philosophers, as they believed not all men were of just character or sufficiently educated in politics to partake in political matters. For this reason, Plato envisioned an Ideal State, where philosophers would rule the *poleis* (city-states) and all citizens would be morally educated in all traditional elements of *Mousikē*. In reality, Athens found itself within an economic and political crisis in the late sixth century and required radical transformation in order to continue to exist functionally. This research project considers the possibility that the constellation of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics steadily moulded a new Grecian society that would experience exponential growth during the fifth century and into the Classical era.

Key words: *Mousikē*, Politics, Ethics, Constellation Theory, Classical Age, Athens, Democracy

Opsomming

Hierdie navorsingsprojek ondersoek die konsepte van *Mousikē*, Politiek en Etiek as 'n geïntegreerde kultuurvormende konstellasië in Athene gedurende die ontwikkeling van die Griekse demokrasie in die vyfde eeu B.C.E. *Mousikē* het 'n groot deel van Griekse kultuur verteenwoordig en was verweef met die daaglikse lewens van die burgers. *Mousikē* was teenwoordig gedurende intieme religieuse seremonies asook tydens groter feeste en vertonings. Dit het 'n opvoedkundige platform geskep waar aristokrate retoriek, digkuns, musiek en dans kon bemeester as binne die tradisies van die Griekse sosiale hiërargie. Sosiale orde was van groot belang binne die Griekse kultuur. Die beoefening van retoriek en *Mousikē* het die geleentheid geskep vir aristokrate om hulself verder te distansieer van die nie-aristokrate en sodoende sosiale mag oor hulle uit te oefen. As deel van die demokratiese ontwikkelinge in Athene is alle Atheense manlike burgers aangemoedig om aan burgerlike pligte deel te neem. Dit het etiese probleme vir die filosowe geskep, omdat hulle nie oortuig was dat alle manlike burgers oor die morele karakter of politieke insig beskik het om aan die politieke lewe deel te neem nie. Vir hierdie rede het Plato sy Ideale Staat geskep waar filosowe sou regeer en alle burgers 'n morele opvoeding sou kry. Hierdie opvoeding het *Mousikē* ingesluit. In werklikheid was Athene aan die einde van die sesde eeu in 'n ekonomiese en politieke krisis gedompel en het 'n radikale transformasie benodig om voort te bestaan. Hierdie navorsingsprojek oorweeg die moontlikheid dat die konstellasië van *Mousikē*, Politiek en Etiek gedurende die vyfde eeu stelselmatig die kultuur van Athene beïnvloed en omskep het in die historiese fenomeen wat bekend staan as die Klassieke era.

Sleutelwoorde: *Mousikē*, Politiek, Etiek, Konstellasië Teorie, Klassieke Era, Athene, Demokrasie.

Acknowledgements

I would firstly like to thank my thesis advisor, Dr Ralf Kohler of the Music Department at Stellenbosch University, for his guidance during my years of research.

Secondly, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my husband, Dewald Labuschagne, for his unfailing support and wisdom these past years. To my mother, Elise Landman, and the rest of my family and friends, I am incredibly appreciative for your continuous interest in this project, and the words of encouragement during the occasional challenging periods. The philosophical discussions at family dinners definitely kept me motivated to continue my research! I would also like to thank my grandfather, Oupa Gerhard, who always shows interest in my research and encourages me to persist with my academic studies.

Finally, to my father, mentor, supporter and role model, Frik Landman, I am forever indebted for the love of knowledge that you have instilled in me.

Thank you.

Marise Labuschagne

Table of contents

| | |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| Declaration | ii |
| Abstract | iii |
| Opsomming | iv |
| Acknowledgements | v |
| Preface | viii |
| CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH PROJECT | 1 |
| 1.1. INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.2. LITERATURE REVIEW | 9 |
| 1.2.1. <i>Mousikē</i> | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| 1.2.2. Politics | 11 |
| 1.2.3. Ethics | 13 |
| 1.3. RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS | 15 |
| 1.4. AIMS OF THE RESEARCH | 16 |
| 1.5. RATIONALE | 16 |
| 1.6. RESEARCH DESIGN | 17 |
| 1.7. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY | 17 |
| 1.7.1. Constellational method | 18 |
| 1.7.2. Historical method | 18 |
| 1.7.3. Theoretical and analytical method | 18 |
| 1.7.4. Aesthetics and criticism | 18 |
| 1.7.5. Sociomusicology | 19 |
| 1.8. ETHICS STATEMENT | 19 |
| CHAPTER 2: THE NOTION OF <i>MOUSIKĒ</i> | 20 |
| 2.1. <i>MOUSIKĒ</i> AND THE MUSES | 24 |
| 2.2. <i>MOUSIKĒ</i> AND RELIGION | 26 |
| 2.3. <i>MOUSIKĒ</i> AND EDUCATION | 27 |
| 2.4. THE VALUE OF <i>MOUSIKĒ</i> IN ANCIENT GREEK CULTURE | 30 |
| CHAPTER 3: POLITICS: <i>MOUSIKĒ</i> AND ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY WITHIN THE GOLDEN AGE | 32 |

| | | |
|--------|---|-----------|
| 3.1. | ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY: AN OVERVIEW | 32 |
| 3.2. | PERICLES AND THE GOLDEN AGE | 37 |
| 3.2.1. | Pericles' reign | 37 |
| 3.2.2. | Damon's political influence on Pericles | 40 |
| 3.3. | ATHENS' POLITICAL INFLUENCE ON PHILOSOPHY | 41 |
| 3.3.1. | Socrates' perception and practice of politics | 41 |
| 3.3.2. | Plato's political thought in his dialogues | 43 |
| 3.4. | THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MOUSIKĒ AND FIFTH CENTURY ATHENIAN POLITICS | 45 |
| | CHAPTER 4: ETHICS IN THE GOLDEN AGE | 48 |
| 4.1. | THE NOTION OF <i>ETHOS</i> | 50 |
| 4.1.1. | Terminology: ' <i>Ethos</i> ' | 50 |
| 4.1.2. | Musical modes and <i>Ethos</i> | 52 |
| 4.2. | DAMON: MUSIC THEORIST OR POLITICAL ADVISOR? | 54 |
| 4.2.1. | Damon and music | 54 |
| 4.2.2. | Damon and politics | 56 |
| | CHAPTER 5: THE CONSTELLATION OF <i>MOUSIKĒ</i>, POLITICS AND ETHICS | 58 |
| 5.1. | CONCLUSIONS AND EVALUATION OF RESEARCH | 58 |
| 5.1.1. | Contribution of this research | 59 |
| 5.1.2. | Contribution of the constellation approach | 59 |
| 5.1.3. | Contribution of the research approach | 65 |
| 5.1.4. | Conclusions on the application of research insights into current music education | 65 |
| 5.2. | RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH | 68 |
| 5.3. | FINAL THOUGHTS | 70 |
| | WORKS CITED | 71 |

Preface

I am a teacher of music. My students range from young children to senior individuals. In the course of my work I am inevitably confronted with questions such as: Why do I teach music? What kind of life do I want to live? What, for me, would constitute a good life? It is upon reading and reflecting that I came to understand that philosophers and academics have contemplated these questions for millennia. The discovery of their insights brought about a curiosity to understand the purpose of music beyond the notion of technical achievement and an afforded the opportunity to see music teaching as an integrated activity in a bigger societal picture.

My research into these ancient philosophical theories of music revealed a concern with how music, poetry and dance related to *ethos* and the development of character, and how *ethos* and character were influenced by political matters of the time. All of this revolves around a seemingly simple question: What does it mean to live a good life? This question immediately pulls one into an ethical domain. One is not only confronted to define the 'good' of this life; one is also challenged to make space for many 'goods' of others. There are also different 'goods' in one's own life i.e. emotional, spiritual, physical, etc.

Living in a modern world with fast shifting social landscapes and serious ethical challenges, insights into *eudaimonia* (within an Aristotelean context) and the 'good spirit' as the descriptor of a good life have the possibility to create a purpose for the teaching of music that exceeds the obvious technical aspects. In such a view, the music teacher participates in shaping the character of an individual and in the larger educational project of preparing good citizens. These are the platforms on which a value-based life can be lived and on which principles of moral code can be built. In brief, being a good citizen and living a good life where your desires are fulfilled is heavily dependent on your character. Music, in all its facets, has a role to play in the development of character. The purpose of this thesis is not to isolate specific factors that play a role in this development. However, my implicit assumption is that there are benefits to learning music that exceed actual technical mastery of the instrument and musical texts.

CHAPTER 1

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH PROJECT

1.1. INTRODUCTION

From a modern perspective, our concept of music does not encompass the vast and intricate role it played during Greek antiquity. To become aware of the difference between the present and the past, one needs not only to comprehend music as part of an ancient assemblage of poetry and dance, but also to take into account that it had a huge impact on the ethical and political life of the Greeks. *Mousikē* can best be translated as “the art of the muses”. Its significance in Western history becomes obvious if one delves into the teachings and writings of the main figures of the intellectual life of the time, such as that of Pythagoras, Pericles, Socrates and Plato. Damon of Oa cuts a particularly important figure in Western musical and political history – a fact which has been celebrated only recently. Plato’s writings, which will be the focus of this study, built extensively on Damon’s thought. *The Republic*, for example, not only gives insight into the philosophical and political viewpoints that were present at the Academy, but proves by mentioning Damon the importance of *Mousikē* for the well-being of society. Plato’s dialogues, *The Republic* in particular, served to create a primary context for the philosophical and ideological viewpoints of Athenian intellectuals. In all of these texts *Mousikē* is presented as a fundamental element of ancient Greek culture.

Mousikē affected all aspects of daily life. Take for example its interrelationship with ethics. The Greeks not only believed that music could affect the mood of a person, but also that it could impact character. To make the power and influence of *Mousikē* explicit, Greek philosophers advocated for a doctrine of *ethos*. These ethical ideas seem far-fetched or mystical in the absence of a broad understanding of ancient Greek music and culture. However, a short study of the nature and use of music in Greek culture reveals the roots of the doctrine of *ethos*. Music in ancient Greece was an integrated art form that permeated society and embodied cultural values. Greek philosophers recognised the power and influence of music in their society and developed the doctrine of *ethos*. Although most of the major philosophers believed in the reality of this ethical influence they disagreed about how it worked and the extent to which it affected people. Each philosopher developed his own specific theories about the effects of music and its proper forms and uses. Although Western music and culture have changed, the doctrine of *ethos* still holds significance as a piece of Western musical heritage that may function as a model for the examination of music in society.

The Greek Golden Age is generally considered one of the most intellectually influential eras in history. Although Greece's various *poleis* were separated from one another geographically, they interacted with one another in terms of commerce, ritual, culture and ideas. This was particularly true of Athens in the fifth and fourth centuries B.C.E.¹ The Golden Age saw the birth of new philosophical outlooks. Within this context, Plato found himself in a stimulating environment surrounded by other great intellectuals such as Socrates and Aristotle who influenced and shaped his thinking and moral philosophies.

Music was such an integral component of this emerging environment that its function and value became almost all-embracing in Greek cultural life and was well assimilated into the education of young Athenian males. This was also evident amongst the intellectuals of Greece, where music served as intellectual entertainment of an analytical audience interested in the theoretical aspects (scales, intervals, harmony etc.) of music composition and its performance potential. Yet, it needs to be noted that interest in music was not only formal and analytics; it was indeed also aurally conveyed, circulated amongst artists and spectators, and performed. Performers were also entitled to change the composition according to their particular interpretation.

Although some musical segments from these ancient compositions survived, the majority of research material on these compositions was generated from ancient texts and symbols (rather than notation of the compositions themselves). The extensive studies on these ancient texts brought us two important insights: into the events for which poetry and music were composed, and into the form, structure and rhythm of these compositions (Mathiesen, Conomos, Leotsakos, Chianis & Brandl, 2017). David Wulstan's (1971) discourse on the earliest surviving samples of Greek musical notation highlights the fact that there is disagreement on what can be regarded as early musical notation. According to Wulstan, discrepancies in Curt Sach's findings on early Greek notation were due to the fact that the notation could not be deciphered precisely or was not understood as notation.² This, however, stresses the fact that the Alypian notation around 250 B.C.E. emphasized the use of a consonantal alphabet rather than Greek music notation itself (Wulstan, 1971:365).

There also exists some disagreement about the compositions themselves, and around the idea of originality in particular, as it is likely that both composer and performer would further develop the artwork and that ancient music did not exist in a fixed state. The question underpinning the disagreement revolves around the ontology of the composition and the performance thereof. Which could be considered as the original artwork (Townsend, 2010:237-

¹ "Like frogs around a swamp." See *Phaedo* 109b (Plato, 1997:227).

² See Curt Sach's publication *The Rise of Music in the Ancient World* (1943) for further reading.

238)? One could argue that the composer of the poem or the music (albeit through divine inspiration from the Muses) is the architect of the artwork and so constitutes its origin. However, it was not uncommon for composers to perform their own compositions in public. In such a case, the composer-performer would then demonstrate the ideal manner to showcase the artwork.

One could also argue, as does W. Pole, that the notations or wording of the composition are mere symbols. These symbols, if they are not to remain sterile and of little aesthetic value, require interpretation from a performing artist to bring them to life in order to be perceived as an artistic and/or musical performance. In putting forward this argument, Pole suggests that the ontology of the artwork is situated within the performance itself. Consequently, it seems artificial to separate the composition from its performance at this early stage of Greek culture. Although the content of this debate may seem irrelevant, it is essential at this initial stage of this study to note an indirect reference to and possible correlation with Plato's theories of the imitative character of art (Pole, 1924:45). The concept of imitation (*mimesis*) forms part of this study and will be discussed in due course.

In the context of ancient Greek thought, the concept *Mousikē* merges composition and performance. We need to be reminded that in the ancient Greek context, music was perceived and experienced as a living concept, and was considered and performed in combination with poetry and dance. In this research project, the union of music, poetry and dance is referred to as *Mousikē*. The origin of the concept *Mousikē* is said to have been in the dominion of the Muses (Goehr, Sparshott, Bowie & Davies, 2016) and against this background the term *Mousikē* denoted the respective "arts of the Muses". To expand this concept even further, one has to take note that these arts were the primary means through which Greek cultural communication took place (Comotti, 1989:3). This is also evident when the Greek author Aristides Quintilianus dedicates a substantial section of his dissertation on music, *Peri Mousikē*, to exploring the notion of the soul of man and its interwoven relationship with the Muses by means of *Mousikē* (Mathiesen, 2017). Although Aristides Quintilianus' dissertation is not examined comprehensively in this research project, it should be noted that his academic status in the history of music aesthetics is profound. His importance for this study is that he dedicated extensive material towards man's affiliation with the Muses. His contribution conveys the magnitude of these celestial beings' authority over ancient Greek culture. The content-rich concept of *Mousikē*, in conjunction with the significance of the Muses and their mythological influence within Grecian culture, is discussed in Chapter 2, The Notion of *Mousikē*.

From the above it becomes clear that music, as a distinct discipline, formed an essential part of the discourses (a cultural activity) amongst the Greek philosophers, the most noteworthy of them being Socrates, Plato and Aristotle. In these discourses, both Socrates and Plato explored the power and influence of music and the possibility of educating the citizens of ancient Greece to become moral and just citizens by strategically including *Mousikē* in their education and focusing particularly on *Mousikē* as a vehicle or a means towards becoming a principled people. This insight and strategy originated from the critical discourses covering all aspects of Greek society (Kenny, 1997:279-281). Plato's critical findings and conclusions, considerably influenced by his teacher Socrates, emphasised the absence of a moral code, a just character, and the living of a noble life amongst the citizens of ancient Athens. These findings were considered so significant that it developed into a series of dialogues, which moulded the academic discourse and life of ancient Greece, and in turn had a vast influence on Western philosophy. These dialogues were written with a particular focus and intent: to provide guidelines for Plato's fellow citizens in order to accomplish a good and serene life. Although this was done with good intent, the guidelines provided in these dialogues occasionally took on a prescriptive tone and suggested austere behavioural restrictions as opposed to merely providing recommendations on how goodness was to be attained in one's own life and in society. A good example is the stipulations on superior and an inferior progeny, as presented in book five of Plato's *Republic*:

...but the children of inferior parents, or any child of the others that is born defective, they'll hide in a secret and unknown place, as is appropriate. It is, if indeed the guardian breed is to remain pure. (Rep., 460c)

In addition to his view on *Mousikē* as a means of becoming a principled person, Plato's *Republic* has Justice, Beauty, the Soul and the Good as recurring themes, all of which he uses to express his desire for an Ideal State.³ The basic idea was that these philosopher-rulers, chosen at a young age, needed to partake in a specific curriculum set out by older philosophers in order to develop into the potential Guardians of Athens. If Athens were ruled by ethical and educated philosopher-kings, it was thought, their leadership would be just and beauty would be appreciated in moderation. In short, Athens, from Plato's perspective, would be a *polis* that represented all aspects of a good life (Levene, 2013:35).

³ Plato's Ideal State was one where philosophers ruled and the citizens were just, living moral and balanced lives. See Mara (1983:617) regarding the importance of reaching a "certain political dimension". Plato's belief that philosopher-rulers (philosopher-kings) must be chosen and educated at an early age in order to become the young Guardians of Athens, is outlined in Book III of the *Republic*. These Guardians were the ideal students of his teachings. See Chroust (1967:38) for further reading on the matter.

In Plato's dialogues, the discussions on *Mousikē* are prominent and it is portrayed as playing an important role in the development and education of these young Athenians. In view of all of this, it stands to reason that the education of the future philosopher-kings was of great importance and served as core inspiration for the founding of Plato's Academy.⁴ This Academy was the first institution of its kind and Plato founded the Academy around 388/387 B.C.E. as a centre for philosophical, scientific and political studies. This intellectual environment was a means to educate the Guardians and aspiring statesmen of ancient Greece and would come to play a significant role in establishing the legacy of the *poleis* (Chroust, 1967:25-26). It is also important to note that the establishment of the Academy also served more immediate political ends. The conditions contributing to the establishment of this Academy were numerous. The political conditions and the ethical predicament Athens found itself in at that time, as well as Plato's critical vision for this academic establishment, is evident throughout his dialogues e.g. the *Republic*, the *Laws*, the *Statesman* and the *Seventh Epistle*. Music enters the field of moral education stage as a means towards the development of the philosopher-king. The implementation of music in the curriculum of the Guardians brought forth a multiplicity of discourses, of which the most prominent and charted dialogue is found in book three of the *Republic*. This exchange of ideas, found in numerous of Plato's dialogues, stands as testimony to the political and ethical influences on music, as well as the influences music had on the political and ethical systems.

One should not be misled into thinking that Plato's critical focus and discourses were only on the surrounding political, moral, and ethical world. As is evident in his theory of *mimesis*, he also concerned himself with the physical world. This is further expounded in his concepts of the Ideal and the Forms as representations of our surrounding world.⁵ His notion of the arts bridges the gap between idea and actual form. Anything that exists first existed as an idea. Art is therefore imitative. In fact, the arts are imitations of imitations, thus "third-order-imitations" (Magee, 2010:27).⁶ The concept of *mimesis* strongly suggests that our mortal world, and all it entails, is an imitation of an idea world; that we live a life in which we mimic the world of ideas. *Mimesis* also stands in relation to Grecian art in the Classical era in that it is affiliated to concepts such as emotion, illusion, perception and representation (Townsend, 2010:208). The importance of imitation is further explored in this project as a consequence of Plato's understanding of music as something that can be imitated. It is through such imitation that

⁴ On the history of the building where the Platonic Academy was founded, see Baltes (1993:6).

⁵ *Mimesis* as a concept associated with Plato's theory of Forms has received numerous academic explorations. T.K. Johansen's publication *Plato's Natural Philosophy: A Study of the Timaeus-Critias* presents a cosmological approach towards Plato's philosophies, with specific reference to his allegory of the craftsmen and the beds (Johansen, 2004:45).

⁶ Plato regarded our entire world as temporary, revealing imitative forms of permanent Ideal forms that are never-changing and perceived outside our understanding of space and time.

music finds its way (good or bad) into the soul of individuals and exposes their character to being shaped or moulded accordingly.⁷

Plato is steeped in the Pythagorean tradition. True to this tradition, Plato perceived his surrounding world in a rational, logical and scientific manner and classified elements in the real world accordingly. If the examined elements did not fit his logical and scientific reasoning, he excluded them from what he considered to be 'reality' (Sesonske, 1969:130-131). Townsend discusses Plato's aesthetic perceptions, stating that his perception of art is connected to its function. If the function is modified, the perception will likewise be altered. For instance, when art has nature as its subject (or function), the perception of art is changed as nature exposes its character as natural beauty, whilst art remains an imitation of this natural beauty. The aesthetic experience of art in this illustration would still require approval from its spectator, despite its imitative quality and distance from the Ideal (Townsend, 2010:9-10). Plato's perceptions of art are further extended in the *Republic* where he distinguishes between appropriate and inappropriate entities.⁸ In this text he cautioned against imitating inappropriate behaviour and thinking. Plato claimed that unfit entities should not be imitated. One should merely observe and gain knowledge and insight from the behaviour of an irresponsible individual, as opposed to imitating that individual (Shorey, 1934:68). Plato's wariness of imitation, as previously noted, is embedded in his belief that it could be harmful to one's soul and, accordingly, to society at large.

Linking the above to the education of the young philosopher-kings, Plato realised that a mimetic (imitating) culture would influence the young potential leaders of Athens and, possibly, corrupt their souls. Art itself would not necessarily have been the direct mimetic influence on the youth, but rather the adults partaking in this mimetic culture. The adults were the elders from whom the young learn, influencing them by educating them through their own experiences and wisdoms. The mimetic culture thus remained intact. It then stands to reason that the relationship between the teacher and the pupil was a serious matter in the education of these young Guardians, since they studied their various disciplines by practising and performing their skills and by reproducing what they had been taught (Sesonske, 1969:129). Initially, Plato forbade any kind of imitation, as seen in his *Republic*.⁹ Eventually, he resolved his rigid reproach by noting that it is acceptable to imitate objects or individuals who are of respectable character (White, 1979:97). Simplicity can be seen as an underlying theme in Plato's critical

⁷ In T.B.L. Webster's *Greek Theories of Art and Literature down to 400 B.C.*, the notion of *mimesis* is discussed in terms of the history and development of various theories on art and literature (e.g. paintings and poetry) within ancient Greek culture, tracing its origins back to the late sixth century B.C.E. (Webster, 1939).

⁸ See *Republic* 396a-398a (Plato, 1997:1964).

⁹ See *Republic* 397e (Plato, 1997:1967).

view of the arts, as simplicity creates harmony in the artwork and therefore also in the individual who is influenced by it. *Mimesis* could therefore be acceptable (Nettleship, 1967:109-113). Notwithstanding, Plato's aversion of various practices within the arts was certainly not illogical, as his criticism fitted into his world of Ideals. His reasoning and rational philosophies were developed in line with the concept of the Ideal Greek society he envisioned and desired (Senyshyn, 2008:180).

This environment played an important role in the thinking and discourse of the time. It is also of importance in an understanding the intricate cultural relationships and the comprehensive role of *Mousikē* in Greek society. As pointed out earlier, Athens suffered political and ethical challenges during the time that Socrates and Plato, amongst others, outlined their concept of an Ideal State, mostly for the purpose of improving their quality of life. Plato critically described the political environment around 375 B.C.E. as one of a "corrupting desire for power" (Plato, 2007:xi-xxxix).¹⁰ From his viewpoint, the yearning for power threatened the moral and ethical standards of the citizens of Greece, with specific reference to Athens.¹¹ J. Stenzel explains that Plato's aversion of the political and social conditions in Athens inspired him to found an intellectual school, the Platonic Academy (Chroust, 1967:25-27).¹² Lane further states that Athens' democracy presented challenges, because it granted the average citizen an equal share in political life that resulted in a tension between Athens' elite and the common people (Plato, 2007:xxi-xiii). Prior to the democratic regime, political contributions were reserved for aristocratic men educated in civic matters. Chroust and Lane's texts suggest that with the coming of the democratic dispensation a shift in power or rather a distribution of power took place. This power-driven culture motivated Plato to turn his pure oral teachings into teachings also accessible in written form. In studying these written representations of the oral tradition, G. Dickenson subsequently found politics to be the core subject of Plato's dialogues. Plato continuously evaluated his environment critically and searched for ways to improve it (Dickenson, 1947:55). When reading the *Republic*, it is clear that Plato's strategy was to develop the citizens of Athens into just and moral beings as he demarcated rules in and for all aspects of life in a manner he perceived as realistic. One of these aspects was the emphasis on the moral education of the young learners of Athens. The intent of *ethos* and politics is obvious in his approach. Plato, however had to find a mechanism or mechanisms to transfer his ideas into real impact or influence. In the context of the education of the young, Plato regarded *Mousikē* as an essential part of Grecian society and argued that it possessed the

¹⁰ See Melissa Lane's introductory notes to Plato's *Republic* (Plato, 2007:xi-xxxix).

¹¹ Athens is the *polis* that Plato's philosophies on ethics and morals were based on and where they were realised. Consequently, this research study focused on Athens.

¹² Also see Garvie (1937:428) regarding the political threats of "the rich" in a society.

ability to influence the people of Athens significantly. This is indeed indicative of the agency he attributed to *Mousikē* in achieving the ideals set out for the young learners and the *polis*.

Knowledge on the political conditions in Athens during the fifth century was conveyed not only through the dialogues of Plato but also the historical texts of Plutarch and Thucydides on Pericles' reign in the midst of the Persian and Peloponnesian wars.¹³ These political events found their way into the realm of *Mousikē*, inspiring music compositions and dramatic pieces (Anderson, Mathiesen & Anderson, 2017).¹⁴ In the era before Plato, Athens found itself in a political and economic crisis. The political occurrences leading up to and taking place within Greece's Classical era are of importance in this research project, as these occurrences contributed to the development of democracy, which in turn shaped and informed the phenomenon known as *Mousikē* and vice versa.

In the Golden Age, the Athenian aristocratic general, Pericles, founded a democratic empire that commanded political supremacy in all of Greece (Fornara & Samons II, 1991:xv). A consequence of Pericles' form of leadership was his employment of and association with the sophists. A sophistic movement commenced during the fifth century and enabled both aristocrats and non-aristocrats to receive specialised education in various fields. Prior to the sophistic movement, specialised education was exclusively offered to aristocrats as part of their conventional educational programme. Therefore, this sophistic movement presented a potential threat to the traditional form of social hierarchy and attracted much criticism from numerous intellectuals, as they too benefitted from the pre-democratic social order. Josiah Ober highlights Plato's and Thucydides' aversion of the sophists, as they, as intellectuals, received money for their knowledgeable services, and entertained citizens by "corrupting" their souls (Ober, 2015:234). Although Ober's critique positions Plato and Thucydides in an unforgiving light, within this political context, these sophists associated themselves with the foremost aristocratic families and were able to influence them with their modern arguments. However, Plato's aversion could be justified as he was not convinced that the sophists were men of moral and ethical character. The characters of these men would have fallen under those rubrics that Plato believed were not to be imitated.

¹³ See Benjamin D. Meritt's article *The Chronology of the Peloponnesian War* (1971) for an in-depth study of the Peloponnesian War within the context of the Athenian calendar (Meritt, 1971:97-124).

¹⁴ In this regard, the Greek dramatist Aeschylus constructed a play concerning the Persian War. Aeschylus' drama, *Persian* (472 B.C.E.), displayed Greece's victory over Persia. The music directions within this play indicate that a sombre ambiance is the aspiration, representing the despondent temperament of the defeated Persians. Music directions included the music to be performed on an aulos, which was often used for elegies, as well as the Ionian mode. All musical directions in this play strive to show the pain of the Persians through the elements of *Mousikē* (Anderson *et al.*, 2017).

One of these alleged sophists was Damon of the deme Oa. Damon, a Greek music theorist, is known for his controversial teachings on music and *ethos* (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2016). Having been ostracised around 442 B.C.E., his connection with Pericles patently attracted the unwanted attention of the democratic government. Damon's ostracism is somewhat curious, since he was not a political leader, but simply a politician's counsellor (Wallace, 2015:51,55).¹⁵ That a music theorist was banished from his *polis*, shows the extent of the relationship between music and politics, as banishment was traditionally used to evict destructive or potentially tyrannical political leaders. This relationship, however, proved to have disastrous consequences. The democratic government that prospered under the ruling of Pericles was obliterated after Pericles' death.¹⁶

With the above as backdrop, this research project is limited to the context of fifth-century Athens. *Mousikē*'s significant importance within this ancient Greek society becomes apparent when one observes its extensive involvement in all important formalities, in both religious and non-religious ceremonies and political matters (Landels, 1999:1).¹⁷ To separate *Mousikē* and its influence from Greek culture from its religious and political environment is unfeasible. It is my belief that *Mousikē*, together with Politics and Ethics, formed an influential and interconnected constellation of behaviours within the development of democracy and towards facilitating the Athenians out of their political and economic crisis. Although the constellational nature between *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics was at the core of this study, these three components first needed to be studied and understood individually within the context of democratic Athens.

1.2. LITERATURE REVIEW

In this study, I explore the importance Plato assigned to *Mousikē* in Greek society, particularly in terms of its ability to influence political and ethical contexts. This seemingly unexplored gap in the philosophy of music was the inspiration behind this research. In what way and to what extent did Plato value the concept of *Mousikē* as a means of developing future philosopher-kings (symbols of power) in a political and ethical challenged environment? In an attempt to answer this question, I start by examining *Mousikē*'s role in society, religion, education, ethics and politics. Furthermore, I will discuss the concept of *Mousikē* as part of the culture of Classical Athens, as well as observing various dialogues by Plato, focusing on the different dimensions to Plato's use of *Mousikē*. By following this approach, I anticipate that Plato's

¹⁵ Following the Persian Wars, it is said that ostracism only applied to political leaders. Damon's alleged ostracism therefore raises many queries, resulting in wide debate between historians (Wallace, 2015:53).

¹⁶ See J.M. Balcer's article *The Persian Wars against Greece: A Reassessment* for a critical and comprehensive read for further context (Balcer, 1989).

¹⁷ See Comotti (1989:6) for further reading.

concept of using *Mousikē*, as a vehicle or instrument to develop future-philosopher kings influencing ethical and political environments of ancient Greece, will become clearer.

I analyse the body of knowledge available by dividing it into three themes i.e. I. *Mousikē*, II. Politics and III. Ethics, all set in the particular era of fifth-century Athens. Each theme brings various researched texts to light, of which I choose a selected number.

1.2.1. *Mousikē*

I selected the following sources to inform the understanding of the term *Mousikē* in the context of ancient Greek culture:

- The collaborative work by P. Murray and P. Wilson: *Music and the Muses* (Murray & Wilson, 2004). Within this volume, I selected the following chapters:
 - *Introduction: Mousikē, not Music* (Murray & Wilson, 2004)
 - *The Politics of the New Music* (Csapo, 2004)
 - *Damon of Oa: A Music Theorist Ostracized?* (Wallace, 2004)
- *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom Teaching, and Politics in Perikles' Athens* (Wallace, 2015).

Music and the Muses (Murray & Wilson, 2004) concentrates on *Mousikē* as a cultural element within the context of Classical Athens. Granting that the book in its entirety possesses extensive material on *Mousikē*, it is within the text *Introduction: Mousikē, not Music* that Murray and Wilson brilliantly communicated the function and value of *Mousikē* in Classical Athens. At *Mousikē*'s core, it represents a unified and harmonious junction between dance, poetry and music.¹⁸ This unification manifested in performances ranging from public to intimate occasions. These occasions often involved the entire *polis*, thus creating a platform for alliances between regions, constructing possibilities for novel traditions and affiliations as outcomes of these occasions (Murray & Wilson, 2004:1). Additionally, *Mousikē* formed an essential part of the aspirations of the Athenian citizens towards becoming a moral and ideal people. This ideal was approximated by incorporating *Mousikē* within the educational curriculum of young Athenian males. Males below the age of 30 were required to receive instruction in music, dance and poetry. The rationale behind this is found in the objective of enforcing political codes within practical contexts, consequently shaping the character of Athens. Furthermore, the Athenians utilised *Mousikē* as a means to connect with their past – mythologies and the Muses – to

¹⁸ At this point and within the context of this research project, the term *music* represents the instrumental or vocal art of music itself, distinguishable from the term *Mousikē*, which represents the union of music, movement and poetry.

become more aware of the authority *Mousikē* and the Muses had over their mortal existence (Murray & Wilson, 2004:2).

The extensive nature and intricacies of *Mousikē* and by what means it influenced and shaped the nature of the Athenian culture, with particular reference to political and ethical values, is discussed throughout all the chapters. The text, *The Politics of New Music* (Csapo, 2004), deals with *Mousikē*'s contemporary aspects within the development of Athenian democracy. The New Music's influence on theatre and musical performance was vast. The exponential growth of performances and festivals that the theatre enjoyed was not due to aristocratic beneficence as is tradition, but to public patronage and their entertainment. Musicians were able to financially support themselves due to the larger scale and frequency of theatrical performances. Virtuosity and innovation were essential features within the musical recitals of the New Music. Innovation was also present within poetry and dance, which, for Socrates and Plato, exhibited democracy's undesirable influence on *Mousikē* within the Athenian culture (Csapo, 2004:207-211).

The following two texts by Robert W. Wallace, *Damon of Oa: A Music Theorist Ostracized?* (Wallace, 2004) and *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom Teaching, and Politics in Perikles' Athens* (Wallace, 2015), convey the fundamentally important concept of ethics within the construction of *Mousikē* in fifth century democratic Athens. Both these texts approach the theory of ethics from Damon the music theorist's perspective, whilst relating back to the political conditions and connotations to music in the fifth century. Wallace moreover explored the dubious relationship between Pericles and Damon, and the possibility of Damon's influence on Pericles' political decisions. He furthermore shed light on music, dance and poetry's respective influence in the political scope.

1.2.2. Politics

The following main texts informed my understanding of politics in the context of this study:

- *The Breakthrough of Demokratia in Mid-Fifth-Century Athens* (Raaflaub, 2007a)
- *Pericles Of Athens and the Birth of Democracy* (Kagan, 1991)
- *Thucydides and Political Thought* (Mara, 2009)
- *The Political Drama of Plato's Republic* (Roochnik, 2009)
- *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom, Teaching and Politics in Perikles' Athens* (Wallace, 2015)

The context of fifth-century Athens comprised the preliminary groundwork of political investigation in this research project. To comprehend the political influence of *Mousikē*, an investigation and understanding of the Athenian political milieu is an imperative. The examining of Raaflaub's *The Breakthrough of Demokratia in Mid-Fifth-Century Athens* (2007a) served this purpose well. This text enlightened the development of democracy and the manner in which it formed the Athenian culture. Raaflaub additionally explicated the constructive and destructive qualities of democracy, stating that this political system may well create political harmony amongst citizens due to the participation of the entire *polis*. Conversely, it may also cause damage if the people did not apply their political powers to benefit the masses. Moreover, Raaflaub discussed the subject of Athenian laws and lawgivers, with specific reference to the laws of Solon and Cleisthenes to enhance the technical aspects of the development of laws during democracy (Raaflaub, 2007b:1-5). On the matter of participation on all political matters of Athenian males, it was Donald Kagan's text *Pericles of Athens and the Birth of Democracy* that placed civic matters, together with Pericles' reforms, into the context of fifth century Athens, conveying Greece's renowned and historical achievements (Kagan, 1991:1).

The Athenian general Pericles was a central political figure during mid-century Athens. Even though additional sources dealing with Pericles occur and are available (e.g. Donald Kagan's *Pericles of Athens and the Birth of Democracy*), it is Gerald Mara's investigation of Pericles in *Thucydides and Political Thought* that significantly aided in this research project. Through the critical writings of Thucydides, Mara concentrated on the general's somewhat inadequate manner of leadership and vision for Athens (whilst delivering sufficient material on his profitable actions as well), providing a noteworthy take on the Athenian general (Mara, 2009:113). In addition to material on Pericles, political information on Plato supplemented the Athenian political context. Consequently, David Roochnik's text, *The Political Drama of Plato's Republic*, clarified the significance of Plato's political discussions in the *Republic*. Essential components are discoursed, such as prominent intellectual figures, the manifestation of sophists and the integration between *poleis*. This integration of various *poleis* and its intellectuals in Athens, created an appealing situation for foreign intellectuals to partake in all Athens had to offer. Consequently, sophists thrived in this new setting, influencing Athens' wealthiest and most influential families with their clever teachings (Roochnik, 2009:161).

Another central figure in this research project, Damon, was notorious for his political involvement within Athens. On this particular controversial character, there is not an extensive list of sources. The most notable author in this regard is Robert Wallace. Initially, Wallace constructed a chapter, *Damon of Oa: A Music Theorist Ostracized?* (Wallace, 2004), in *Music*

and the Muses (Murray & Wilson, 2004). This particular chapter progressed into an in-depth study on Damon: *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom, Teaching and Politics in Perikles' Athens* (Wallace, 2015). This specific text contributed significantly to this research project, presenting ground-breaking academic evidence on Damon's upbringing, contribution towards the *ethos* theory within a musical context, political connections to Pericles (or the renunciation thereof) and philosophical influences on Socrates and Plato (Wallace, 2015).

1.2.3. Ethics

The following core texts were analysed to underpin the understanding of the concept under review:

- *Ethos* (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a)
- *Greece* (Mathiesen *et al.*, 2017)
- *The A to Z of Aesthetics* (Townsend, 2010)
- *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom Teaching, and Politics in Perikles' Athens* (Wallace, 2015)
- Ethics (Canto-Sperber, 2000a) as presented in *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge* (Brunschwig & Lloyd, 2000)

Preliminary groundwork on the subject matter Ethics, as in the previous instance of II. Politics, is desired in order to fully comprehend the value of and interconnectedness with *Mousikē* in the context of music *ethos*. Anderson and Mathiesen's texts *Ethos* and *Greece* provide detailed approaches towards ethical theories on music by consulting materials on, or by, intellectuals such as Pythagoras, Damon, Socrates, Plato and Aristotle (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a). Following a mathematical approach towards musical structures (e.g. intervals, harmony, instruments, scales etc.), Mathiesen explored Pythagorean doctrines, which were later modified by Damon, voicing Plato's considerable influence by the Pythagorean doctrine (Mathiesen *et al.*, 2017).

Dabney Townsend's publication, *The A to Z of Aesthetics*, provides a thorough examination of the ethical characteristics of music, musical instruments and the consequences they may possibly have on the soul of man. Townsend often referred to Plato in his discussions, expressing the philosopher's aversion towards certain instruments and modes, subsequently contemplating the mathematical and expressive qualities of music and potential manipulation or impact on one's soul (Townsend, 2010:213-214; 165-166).

Robert W. Wallace's research was an invaluable asset to this research project. All three of his texts used throughout my exploration, shaped the notion of ethics and *ethos* excellently within the context of fifth century Athens. However, it is Wallace's publication, *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom Teaching, and Politics in Pericles' Athens*, that conveyed Damon's fundamental influence on the ethical theories of music and the soul. Wallace has been the first academic to produce such an extensive publication on the somewhat infamous Damon and it has proved to be an essential part of accurately comprehending the *ethos* theory within the democratic development of ancient Athens. Wallace discussed Pericles' democratic development, with focus on music's perception as a political wonder within this evolving environment, due to the Greek's belief that music is interlinked with their *polis*. Additionally, he drew attention to Plato's *Republic*, in which there are various discussions on the ethical theories of music and the advantages of incorporating *Mousikē* within an educational environment.

M. Canto-Sperber's chapter *Ethics* in Brunschwig and Lloyd's *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*, provided a holistic approach towards Grecian moral philosophy. The underpinning of ancient moral philosophy is found in the Greek's perception of 'the good' and in what manner it should be implemented in one's life (and to what extent) to affect one's character and in turn attain a virtuous life (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:115-118). In order to grasp the magnitude of ancient moral philosophy, it was necessary to additionally investigate the influential characters that preceded Socrates, Plato and Aristotle. During Socrates' time, ethical discourses were constructed on an already founded platform, principally centred on the works of Homer (eighth century B.C.E.). The Homeric culture held virtue to be dependent on self-affirmation, heroism. Sophistic teaching encouraging the ideal of self-affirmation, was disapproved by Socrates. Another prominent figure, Hesiod (sixth century B.C.E.), held an opposing view from Homer, centring his notion of morality on one's willpower. In a similar fashion to Homer, Hesiod's theories were implemented within sophistic teachings (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:96-97). In the fifth century B.C.E. Socrates entered the stage with a rationalistic approach towards human behaviour. He proclaimed that one needs to be in constant pursuit of developing one's character through the examination of one's life and endeavour to acquire consistency between one's thoughts and actions. Plato, in accord with Socrates, builds upon his instructor's ethical theory and connects it to the notion of the soul, inclusive of one's emotions and desires (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:102). Canto-Sperber contributed to my understanding of ancient ethical studies, which in turn aided in the discovery of *Mousikē*'s connection with and value in Greece's cultural character.

Jointly, these texts constructed a holistic understanding of ethical theories of music and the value of *ethos* within Greece.

1.3. RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS

My hypothesis starts by framing the situation. In the current and modern world, specialised music teaching is a widely sought after service in order to skill an individual in the mastering of an instrument. This often happens on a transactional basis and my observation is that little attention is paid to the transformational aspects of this specialised teaching platform. The latter in my current understanding refers to that which happens to the student beyond the technical mastering of the instrument. One obvious question would refer to the design of the learning. Is the learning designed merely for technical mastering or is there an element of *ethos*, character-shaping present in the design? Is it possible to reduce the music learning intervention to only a transactional condition, and if so, what is lost in the process? I chose to research the classical Golden era of Athens as home of philosophy and *Mousikē*, in an effort to throw light and help to address this concern.

The other part of the situation is the referral to the Golden era with Plato as the main focus. All understanding of a Greek classic such as Plato is based on the enlightenment of Greek culture, specifically the Classical Athenian city in which Plato thrived. Plato's perception of the culture of *Mousikē* and the practical value for a broader discourse on and application of this subject is yet to be discovered. The aim of this research project is to offer one interpretation of Plato's use of *Mousikē* within a democratic context, by focusing on selective dialogues by him. Questions that emerge in this context are, amongst others, "what is Plato's thought-process with regards to *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics, and what are the life lessons for a philosophy of music today?" Can a better understanding and a re-interpretation of the use and purpose of music promote an even richer and more meaningful approach to the teaching of music in the modern era? In order to answer this question, I first endeavoured to form a contextual understanding of *Mousikē* with a view on current value. Thereafter, it formed part of an intertextual study together with Plato's dialogues. Lastly, I endeavoured to view the complex cultural embeddedness of music through a systemic view by considering the notion of *Mousikē*, as part of a critical assemblage or constellation with politics and ethics, in an attempt to discover and portray the constellation's immense influence in the development of democracy. It was my intention to be able to conclude with "Reflections on the constellation of *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics in Plato's Dialogues" as a guide for action in the current times.

1.4. AIMS OF THE RESEARCH

The aim of this research is to, amongst others, offer different dimensions of interpretation to Plato's use of the term *Mousikē*, within the musical, political, and ethical contexts of democratic Greece. Additionally, the aim is to portray the influence of the constellation of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics on the development of fifth century democracy and vice versa, which would include the shaping of the character of people (*ethos*).

This study therefore sought to achieve the following:

- Suggest the key subjects relating to the musical culture in ancient Greece.
- Explore how the concept of *Mousikē* was understood in Classical Athens, as well as Plato's value of this understanding within the context of his philosophies.
- Assess and determine the relative matters within Plato's chosen dialogues by means of intertextuality, showing Plato's critical findings in the employment of music in the education of the chosen Athenian Guardians.
- Interpret the notion of *Mousikē* eminently, and as part of a critical constellation with Ethics and Politics, in an endeavour towards an understanding of this complex relationship within a democratic context.
- Develop an outlook as to how these findings are relative to the philosophy of music, and perhaps education, today.

1.5. RATIONALE

All societies form around a central concept, something that could be seen as the *ethos* of such a society. A particular society's *ethos* expresses its dominant features, that by which such a society is characterised. There are numerous contributors and co-producers to such an *ethos*. In this study, I focused on three interlinking co-producers of the *ethos* repertoire, namely *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics. The purpose of this study is specifically to portray Plato's assessment of the culture and value of *Mousikē* in ancient Greece. This study has explored and built on Plato's philosophies regarding music and the concept of *Mousikē* in ancient Greece, within the context of his dialogues. Partial reason for conducting this research is to shed light on a subject that has not yet received 'Thick Description' regarding a constellation interpretation, as well as finding relevant matters that may be of importance in the philosophy of music today.¹⁹ Moreover, how these relevant matters, through the platform of education, could benefit our own current power-driven society.

¹⁹ See Geertz for further reading on 'Thick Description' (Geertz, 1973:3-30).

1.6. RESEARCH DESIGN

I engaged in a musicological research discipline, exploring the historical meaning of Plato's concept of *Mousikē* by means of historical analysis between various sources, therefore revealing the conceptual nature of the research. These sources included literature regarding the culture of *Mousikē* in ancient Greece, containing material representing the interconnectivity between the music, philosophy, ethics, religion and politics. The established literature was critiqued within an analytical framework, by comparing relative dialogues by Plato.

1.7. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

It is evident thus far that Plato's value of *Mousikē* appeared to be rather complex, as it was interwoven in various environments including social, religious, celestial, political, ethical, and physical. These environments facilitated the shaping of Plato's thoughts on *Mousikē* and are therefore consulted (hermeneutically) throughout all research. However, not all environments are of equal importance. In Graeme Gilloch's publication on Walter Benjamin's critical constellations theories, he stated that certain works, objects or subjects might be best understood when viewed "in terms of (two) textual constellations".²⁰ Although Gilloch was referring to Benjamin's work itself, it seemed to be of great value to implement Gilloch and Benjamin's strategies into my current research. Accordingly, I consulted comparative dialogues by Plato regarding Ethics, Politics and *Mousikē*, creating a constellation amongst these three elements. *Mousikē* was consequently explored within Plato's political and ethical environments through intertextuality.

To ensure a conceptual and feasible research project, I used the following methods of research:

- i. Constellational method
- ii. Historical method
- iii. Theoretical and analytical method
- iv. Aesthetics and criticism
- v. Socio-musicology

The research methods listed above have been artificially separated into the various relevant parameters for the sake of methodology in the humanities. This separation is inadequate when studying Plato's work, as one has to discover all the dimensions of his theories, in order to obtain a true understanding of Plato's writings, as well as the man himself. This abstract distinction is therefore merely a portrayal of the various integrated methods and perspectives

²⁰ See Graeme Gilloch's *Walter Benjamin: Critical Constellations* (Gilloch, 2002:20).

that were used. However, it is integrated as an object and was researched and produced as such.

1.7.1. Constellational method

Constellation research involves components that are related to each other in a construction of mutual influence. Components exercise strong correlation between each other, and include relationships between people, ideas, problems and documents. By means of a holistic analytical approach, as opposed to an isolation approach, this phenomenon of complex components can be understood (Mulsow & Stamm, 2005).²¹ Identifying a possible constellation, one's attention might be drawn to a couple of people, at any time in history, who have communicated with each other within an intimate audience. Alternatively, it could also be a couple of people who have shared their thoughts from a communal problematical area. Characteristically, a structure will be apparent, resulting in a series of creative solutions for conventional problems. Inevitably, constellations occur chronologically, where one will confront new solutions for traditional problems, new attitudes towards conventional ideas as well as innovative intellectual experiences in the process of reception (Gilloch, 2002).²²

1.7.2. Historical method

By following a theoretical-philosophical approach, I have aimed to portray specific matters within the cultural domain of ancient Greece, within in an aesthetical context. These matters include the concept of *Mousikē* and Plato's evaluation of this in the Athenian *polis*, as well as the political and ethical relations between the different subjects.

1.7.3. Theoretical and analytical method

Various dialogues by Plato are used to seek findings regarding Plato's evaluation of music in the education of the Athenian citizens as well as his concept of *Mousikē*. I analyse his dialogues and compare them with each other, as well as certain dialogues of his contemporaries, including Aristotle's *The Athenian Constitution*. These dialogues included the *Republic*, the *Laws* and the *Statesman*. By doing this, I aimed to attain a critical constellation outlook of Plato's view regarding *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics.

1.7.4. Aesthetics and criticism

By means of this method of research, I aim to establish the role of music in Greek society. What are the influences of music in politics, ethics, education, philosophy, and religion? Are

²¹ The primary source of my constellational methodology is the publication *Konstellationsforschung*, edited by M. Mulsow and M. Stamm (Mulsow & Stamm, 2005).

²² See Walter Benjamin: *Critical Constellations* for further reading on the notion of constellations (Gilloch, 2002).

these disciplines interconnected and do they partake in the disciplines that represent *Mousikē*? By following a critical and aesthetic approach, I intend to demonstrate the influence of *Mousikē* within the political and ethical contexts of democratic Greece and how it was valued in philosophical discourses and the notion of the Ideal, as set out by Plato and his contemporaries.

1.7.5. Sociomusicology

The social phenomenon of *Mousikē* is revealed within the context of ancient Greek society. I explore the political and ethical influences that music and *Mousikē* had on the power-driven Greek society. The purpose of this was to establish the social role and significance of music, and in addition obtain new findings in an effort to further develop a holistic approach towards the value of the constellation of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics.

1.8. ETHICS STATEMENT

The research conducted for this study is of a historical nature, entailing the analysis of existing literature and documents within the public domain. This specific research is therefore of minimal risk within the guidelines of Stellenbosch University's Research Ethics Committee.

CHAPTER 2 : THE NOTION OF *MOUSIKĒ*

When examining the ancient world, it is apparent that its culture is both related and unrelated to our own. Even from the perspective of our modern world, we are able to connect with their philosophical notions of ethics, politics, the arts and religion. We have been granted access to foundational resources and valuable contemplations and discourses through the literary works of ancient philosophers such as Plato and Aristotle, works which have almost come to know as our own. Our familiarity with their world proves to be constructive, as we are able to acquire valuable insight into their rich culture (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:95). Considering the predominance of musical performance, politics and ethics in Greece's history, it appears reasonable to further investigate the ethical and political characteristics of *Mousikē*. Numerous studies have been written by scholars who have explored the principal position music took on during the Golden Age.²³ M.L. West, for example, writes that ancient Grecian culture was perpetually bursting with music and musical occasions (West, 1992:1). In this chapter, I will explore the Greek expression *Mousikē*, with specific reference to the philosophies of music, ethics and politics in Athens itself, focusing on the relationship between these particular components.

Grecian culture was steeped in music and it formed a part of festivals, religious ceremonies or and educational courses. This is evident in Greece's history of art and literature, even when scanning only the surface of its rich history. Music also served as a vehicle for expression in combination with other art forms relating to the culture of *Mousikē*. Anderson suggests that, by using various musical instruments, art forms such as dance and poetry became innovative platforms for presenting new performance possibilities (Anderson, 1966:1). As early as the sixth century B.C.E., musicians and composers endeavoured to produce instrumental music with more complex structures and modal possibilities. As a result, intricate musical compositions appeared within art mediums beyond purely instrumental music. These multifaceted compositions and performances were incongruent with tradition, due to experimentation with new and more complicated modes.

As previously noted, Damon and Plato interpreted emotional responses towards various musical modes as elements of the human soul, encoded to favour certain melodies and rhythms above others. The changeable characteristic of modes was thought to be the reason

²³ See Kenny (1997:279-281) on the Greek Golden Age or Classical period as being the founding of Western Civilization.

why the elements of one's soul reacted in certain ways to certain modes, consequently corrupting the character or *ethos* of an individual or even a *polis* (Stanford, 1981:133-134).²⁴ The modes were directly related to the instruments used, as certain instruments were more restricted than others with in terms of their modal capabilities. Eric Csapo confirms this when he sheds light on the ethics behind ancient instruments in his essay *The Politics of the New Music*, discussing the volume and tone colour potential of the piped instruments, as well as comparing the versatility of various ancient instruments. In this regard, it is fitting to refer to Plato's *Philebus*, in which he expresses his aversion towards the aulos. He referred to the playing of this instrument as skilful improvisation of musical material, as opposed to fixed mathematical principles: "a lot of imprecision mixed up in it and very little reliability" (*Phil.*, 56a). Plato's outlook included a disregard for any form of *mimesis*, especially if the instrument that conducted the *mimesis* was one without set boundaries. Therefore, it would be logical for Plato to choose a poem or any form of *logos* as the preferred medium, as it would prohibit the musical artist from straying towards speculation. Without these restrictions, the art of *mimesis* presented numerous dangers for the philosopher-educators (Csapo, 2004:218-219).

The most common instruments included the kithara, the lyre and the aulos.²⁵ The latter was frequently used in musical compositions and was the principal instrument within the wind instruments family. A considerable amount of extant literary sources provide detailed remarks on the timbre, pitch and tuning of the aulos. In time, modernisations on the structure of these instruments followed and more holes or strings were added, thus creating possibilities for expanding the pitch and modal range (Mathiesen *et al.*, 2017). The increasing admiration for fluctuations between notes and modes without boundaries refers back to Plato's mistrust of the aulos. This "most many stringed" of instruments, was considered to be the dominant mimetic instrument (Csapo, 2004:218-219).²⁶ Other instruments such as the salpinx and keras also fulfilled essential roles and were used during combat due to their ability to create colossal volumes of sound over vast distances. Military instruments included a curved salpinx-type instrument, a bukanē. The lyre, a more familiar Greek instrument, was incorporated into the educational curriculum of Athens. Becoming skilled in playing the lyre was considered an essential part of one's education, as it enabled all sophisticated Athenian men to take part in social and religious events. Likewise, it gave these educated men a social advantage in terms

²⁴ See also Nettleship (1967:120).

²⁵ See J.G Landels' study *Music in Ancient Greece and Rome* for further reading on relevant Grecian instruments, placing them in order of importance, dividing them into four categories: woodwind, stringed, brass and percussion (Landels, 1999:1-24).

²⁶ See *Republic* 399d (Plato, 1997:1970).

of theatrical or competitive occurrences. In this sense the lyre functioned as a link between the citizens, uniting Athens' musical culture in its entirety (Mathiesen *et al.*, 2017).

Scholars who have made an enormous contribution to the field of research on *Mousikē* include P. Murray and P. Wilson. As previously stated, their book *Music and the Muses* (Murray & Wilson, 2004) created a sound platform for this research project. Building on this platform, there is a considerable amount to be explored regarding the political and ethical connotations to *Mousikē* and how they, as both individual elements and a constellation, influenced the academic culture, philosophical thought and social structure of the Classical era. In an attempt to carry out this exploration, I commence with what the concept of *Mousikē* denoted during the Golden Age.

Mousikē not only served as a means of communication and expression, but also facilitated the acquisition of systematic and analytical thought, paving the way for a different thought process. This intellectual and analytical approach produced new insights into the theory of music. The analytical thought processes of music theory subsequently demanded diligent research and written sources on the origins and development of music. In this technical division of musical development, Pythagoras and Damon were the main focus. Pythagoras initiated and developed the theoretical analysis of music and observed ratios between intervals in music, consequently establishing the fact that music symbolizes mathematical values. Damon revised Pythagoras' mathematical findings and constructed it into an ethical philosophy (Goehr *et al.*, 2016).

Damon was born in 500 B.C.E. and grew up in an era that saw exponential growth in Athens' political and intellectual development. During these early stages of democratic growth, advanced research in the fields of politics, music and rhetoric, amongst other things, established the occurrence and demand for sophists. Before Damon, Greece was exposed to theories and innovation of music through Lasos, of Argolid Hermione. Apart from initiating the dithyrambic contests, composing the first written book on the subject of music, and presenting novel alterations in musical rhythms, notes and instruments, he supposedly created the term *Mousikē* and possibly organised musical notes into *harmoniai* (Wallace, 2015:3-4). Although Damon originated the concept of applying ethical assessments to rhythms, other intellectuals also studied the field of music and ethics (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a). Anderson concurs with Wallace that Damon was not the sole pre-Socratic intellectual who contemplated ethical theories of music. In his footnotes, he remarks on Philolaus' writings on Pythagoras, which reveals coherent ethical theories on music.²⁷ Furthermore, Anderson refers to Pindar's

²⁷ Philolaus, originally from Croton, Southern Italy, was a Pythagorean philosopher. He relocated to Thebes after demolition came to the people of Croton in 450 B.C.E. At Thebes, he taught Pythagoras'

comments on the Dorian mode, and lastly to Democritus' writings on the influence music has on children's education (Anderson, 1955:89).²⁸

Damon approached the possible ethical effects of music by categorising the various modes as either male or female.²⁹ He was of the opinion that dancing and singing were natural reactions when one's soul was impressed (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2016). In book three of the *Republic*, Plato often referred to Damon, with specific reference to the ethical dangers of music. His philosophical view of music was not based on numerical associations, but interconnected with *ethos* and the soul of man (Goehr *et al.*, 2016).

Regarding the origin of music theory, Murray and Wilson state that "musical theory was born with *Mousikē* itself..." (Murray & Wilson, 2004:1). I would agree with this statement, if Murray and Wilson's use of *Mousikē* referred to *Mousikē Tekhnē*, which implied a more analytical approach. When considering, according to Murray and Wilson, that *Mousikē Tekhnē* was the first of the 'Tekhnē' nouns, its relevance in the technical and theoretical field in ancient Greece is of substantial importance. *Tekhnē* translates directly as 'craft' or 'art', whereas Plato uses the word in his dialogues to refer to competence in life and, as an individual, mastery of various skills such as *Mousikē*, justice and virtue.³⁰ Richard Parry refers to Plato's *Republic* and notes that "each craft benefits us in its own peculiar way, different from the others" (Parry, 2014).³¹ This is apparent when one takes a closer look, from a political perspective, at the relationship between Damon and Pericles. Damon provided the 'craft' of political advice to Pericles, educating him in music's psychological capabilities (Stadter, 1991:124).³²

As Damon's focus was on the ethical issues of music education and on how one's soul could be corrupted by certain modes, one could conclude that his advice would have included the educational value of *Mousikē* and how to apply it within the political domain in order to realise Pericles' vision for Greece. This possibility is further discussed in Chapters 3 and 4. In order

hypotheses. His studies on *harmoniai* and intervals would later diverge from his Pythagorean beliefs, for which he received eminent academic critique (Levin, 2017).

²⁸ The details of the various modes, inclusive of the Dorian mode, are thoroughly discussed in Chapter 4 of this research project, *Ethics in the Golden Age*.

²⁹ Eric Csapo stated that Damon's admirers acknowledged this form of classification. Amongst them were Plato, Aristotle, Heraclides, Aristoxenus and Diogenes (Csapo, 2004:230).

³⁰ Richard Parry referred to Plato's *Republic* (346a) where he noted that 'knowledge is the indispensable basis for the philosophers' craft of ruling in the city'. For further reading on Plato's philosophy on *Tekhnē*, see Richard Parry's full article on *Episteme and Tekhnē* from the *Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy* (Parry, 2014).

³¹ See *Republic* 346a (Plato, 1997:1884).

³² For Anderson's views on Damon as an eminent figure of the Periclean Age, see (Anderson, 1955:88-89).

to portray its intricate nature during the Golden Age, I next discuss the relationship between *Mousikē* and the Muses, *Mousikē* and Religion and *Mousikē* and Education.

2.1. **MOUSIKĒ AND THE MUSES**

The Greeks were convinced that music and poetry possessed the ability to produce emotional responses in those who partook in those activities. The philosophers of ancient Greece, with specific reference to Plato and Socrates, repeatedly mentioned the expressive qualities of music, its ability to influence one's soul, and how shifting between modes and rhythms could be employed to control and limit music's influential nature on man and, consequently, Greek society (Stanford, 1981:133-134).³³ Relating to Plato's philosophies, the Pythagoreans considered music to be designed by the gods (or goddesses e.g. the Muses), which is apparent in their belief that musical harmonies moulded and established the cosmos (Hardie, 2004:15). Plato was of the opinion that the inspiration that leads to various art forms was the work of the gods and that this inspiration could lead to the insanity of the mortal who received creativity from these celestial beings. This was due to the idea that the gods were "...notoriously unreliable from a human standpoint". Townsend explains the reasoning behind Plato's belief of "divine madness" through godly inspiration, stating that the gods alone were capable of comprehending the Ideal reality from which creativity originated. Mortal beings stood in direct conflict with this idea, since they were merely able to perceive an imitation of the consecrated Ideal reality. They were thus incapable of tolerating direct interactions with the heavenly domain. Rituals were believed to protect mortal beings from such "divine madness" (Townsend, 2010:165-166).

The ancient Greeks experienced the presence and supremacy of the Muses through *Mousikē*. Greek mythology, specifically the myth of the Muses, played an important role in the origins of *Mousikē*.³⁴ According to mythology, *Mousikē* can be sourced back to the nine Muses, also known as the daughters of Zeus and Mnemosyne. They were associated with Apollo, god of Music and Prophecy (Grant & Hazel, 2002). Each of the nine daughters was allocated specific responsibilities in the dominion of the fine arts.³⁵ Musical festivals were an integral part of ancient Greek tradition, where competitions were held in honour of the Muses (Cartwright,

³³ See also Nettleship (1967:120).

³⁴ *Mousikē* is also referred to as the "Province of the Muses", and that their fundamental purpose was their celestial investment in the performance of "rhythmical speech" (Larham, 2012:25).

³⁵ The Muses are typically acknowledged as follows: Calliope, 'fair voice' (epic poetry), Clio 'renown' (history), Euterpe 'gladness' (flute-playing), Terpsichore 'joy in the dance' (lyric poetry or dance), Erato 'lovely' (lyric poetry or songs), Melpomene 'singing' (tragedy), Thalia 'abundance, good cheer' (comedy), Polymnia 'many songs' (mime), and Urania 'heavenly' (astronomy). Allegedly, the Muses danced with Apollo at festivals of the gods on Olympus (Grant & Hazel, 2002). See also Speake and Bergin (1987), on further reading on the Muses' association with Apollo and their roles as "inspirers of music and the divine creative power".

2012). *Mousikē*, from which the word music is roughly derived, refers to the several “arts of the Muses”. This included singing, poetry and dancing – the primary means of cultural communication (Comotti, 1989:2-3). Murray and Wilson state that the Muses were the goddesses that supervised *Mousikē* in all its various disciplines and that they had a fundamental influence on the intellectual life, religion and culture of ancient Greece. Through the Muses’ gifts of song, instrumental music, poetry and dance, human beings were enabled to connect with the gods and therefore their past. Owing to the Muses’ gift of *Mousikē*, mortals were granted a glimpse into the celestial realm of the gods (Csapo, 2004:366). Practising various religious rituals of *Mousikē* not only granted mortals access into the heavenly domain; it also protected them from madness.

An example of such celestial influence is found in Socrates’ dream, as discussed in Plato’s *Phaedo*.³⁶ Following Socrates’ death sentence, he resided in prison where he was visited by Phaedo. After Phaedo’s emotional visit to Socrates, he relayed his experience prior to him drinking the poison, conveying his initial distress at Socrates’ poetic compositions as Socrates himself was apprehensive of composing poetry. D. Roochnik (2001) sheds light on the peculiarity of Socrates’ poetic impulse and refers to Plato’s *Apology* where Socrates criticised poets for their inability to comprehend their own work.³⁷ His reasoning, in this instance, was based on the notion that the gods granted poets the inspiration required to compose and, due to their mortality, poets were thus unable to grasp the true meaning of their own poetry (Roochnik, 2001:239-240). In this regard, Socrates confessed that he had had a recurring dream, which declared: “Socrates, [...] practice and cultivate the arts” (*Phaed.*, 60e). Socrates was convinced that by practising the “art philosophy, this being the highest kind of art” he was serving his dream, and the gods. However, subsequent to his conviction, he was convinced that he may have misinterpreted his dream and, by composing poetry, set out to find contentment within his conscience (Plato, 1997:149-150).

A further celestial connection to the Muses is found within musical instruments themselves. It is alleged that the aulos and the lyre were invented and represented by certain Muses (Grant & Hazel, 2002). Euterpe was responsible for the aulos, the panharmonic instrument that was criticised by Plato in his dialogues due to its potential to be a danger to the souls and characters of the citizens of his Ideal State (Rocconi, 2010:1). In the worshiping of the gods, the aulos was used at Athenian festivals to accompany tragedies in honour of Dionysus, the god of fertility and wine (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006:11). The lyre is said to be associated with the three Muses of Delphi (Nētē, Mesē, and Hypatē), who also represented the three harmonic

³⁶ See *Phaedo* 60d-61e (Plato, 1997:149-151).

³⁷ See *Apology* 22b-c (Plato, 1997:92-93).

chords of this instrument (Grant & Hazel, 2002).³⁸ Another association is between the lyre and Apollo, the god of learning and the arts, which might help explain the fact that mastering the lyre was a vital part of Athenian education (Burkholder *et al.*, 2006:12).

According to mythology, the Muses were confirmed their superior musical talents by competing with other musicians. Perius' nine daughters were turned into birds for being intolerant, whereas Thamyres, the Thracian musician, was penalised with blindness, loss of voice, as well as loss of his musical talents (Cartwright, 2012). There are considerably more legendary tales regarding the Muses, performing on their allocated musical instruments on Mt. Olympus, but the detail of these tales are not considered in this study. What is of importance here is the integrated communication between the Muses and the mortals and the subsequent effect it had on their everyday lives.

2.2. *MOUSIKĒ* AND RELIGION

It would be challenging to separate *Mousikē* from the religious society that was ancient Greece. Their daily lives were entangled with religion, and religion was, in turn, intertwined with *Mousikē*. The separation between these three elements (society, religion and *Mousikē*) was seemingly impossible. *Mousikē* was significantly involved in all major formalities, including joyful celebrations, melancholic ceremonies, religious ceremonies, political debates and entertainment for the art enthusiasts in theatre, poetry and dance. Music also formed a part of the citizens' intimate gatherings with friends and family: either making music together or employing professional musicians as entertainment (Landels, 1999:1).³⁹

On a grander scale, Athens hosted the Panathenia festival in honour of the goddess Athena and the Great Dionysia in honour of the god Dionysus, where parades were accompanied by music and dancing. Musical genres would include *parabomia* (hymns) and *kateuches* (prayers), performed by *khoros* (choral group) and aulos players (Cartwright, 2013). In addition to performances of music and dance, Greek tragedy also formed a central part of the performance arts. Renowned fifth-century playwrights included Aeschylus, Sophocles, and Euripides. It was expected of the playwrights to compose the script and music of the play, as well as to direct the production (Kirby, 2000:3). *Mousikē* presented an unlimited variety of cultural possibilities, creating a platform for alliances between regions, new traditions and relationships amongst Greeks (Murray & Wilson, 2004:1). Athletic competitions between

³⁸ For a detailed description of the aulos, lyre and kithara, see (Burkholder, Grout & Palisca, 2006:10-13).

³⁹ Also see Comotti (1989:6) and Landels (1999:3-6) for further reading on music in the Greek society, as well as the religious festivals of the Great Dionysia and the Panathenaia. For the panhellenic games at Olympia and at Delphi, where sport and *Mousikē* were used to offer excellence to the gods, see (Paxson, 1985:67-78).

poleis, as in the instance of the performance arts, were centred around religion, thus offering merit and accomplishments to the gods (Cartwright, 2013).

2.3. **MOUSIKĒ AND EDUCATION**

As G. Comotti points out, *Mousikē* was the most effective of the arts for the purpose of education, as it possessed boundless potential for affecting one's emotions constructively. This occurred because of the synthesis of literature, music and movement through meticulous practise (Comotti, 1989:46). Given the Muses' influence on *Mousikē*, and the fact that *Mousikē* was the medium through which the Greeks were educated, it could be argued that the Muses were direct benefactors of ancient education in poetry, music and dance (Hardie, 2004:22-23). Cartwright holds that music demanded discipline and order and that this may be understood as the reason for the exceptional appreciation for mastering musical instruments and musical performances (Cartwright, 2013). Cartwright's perception of music could extend to *Mousikē* as an assembly of performance arts, since music, dance and poetry each required skilful practice. It would seem that numerous scholars support statements on music and *Mousikē*'s influential ability on the attainment of *arete* (excellence). This includes as well as the vast body of research on music and education.⁴⁰ The ancient Greek term *paideia* represented education or culture in the fourth century B.C.E., where children between the ages of five and seven received schooling away from home. In time, *paideia* came to represent the broad culture of learning and accomplishments (Curren, 1996).

Education in Classical Greece focused on reading, writing, mathematics, music, movement and literature. Literature studies were chosen to enhance or develop ethical characteristics. Students were required to memorise and perform these literary works, often providing accompaniment by means of rhythmical music and dance (Mathiesen, 2016). Mastering rhythmical melodies on the aulos was an integral part of education, in order to improve synchronisation (Cartwright, 2013). Specialised subjects were taught for a fee, individually, by skilled professionals who travelled between *poleis* (Mathiesen, 2016). The increasing appreciation for *arete* formed a fundamental part of ancient Greek culture, with *paideia* as the vehicle for achieving that exceptional standard.⁴¹ Traditionally, *paideia* included education in music as well as physical activities. This resulted in learning institutes, including gymnasiums, offering both physical and musical education to their students. Having both these elements at

⁴⁰ The Greek term *arete* translated as virtue or excellence in Plato's dialogues, through Socrates discourses. The term, when used within the context of human beings (it was also exercised as a manner of describing the excellence of a function), described distinctive acts of man and the flawlessness (or excellence) of those acts (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:106).

⁴¹ The ancient Greek term *Arete*, signifies excellence, goodness, exceptionality of any kind, specifically regarding manly virtues such as courage and expertise in battle (Hodder, 2006). Also see Curren (1996) and Dombrowski (1981) for further reading on *Arete* as a virtue and social acknowledgment.

the core of their education appealed to all who desired becoming well-educated men (Paxson, 1985:67-68).

The link between *Mousikē* and the intellectuals of ancient Greece proved essential to ancient education and formed part of academic discourses amongst celebrated philosophers in ancient Greece. In this regard, Socrates and Plato are particularly important. During this Golden Age, Socrates and Plato explored the possibility of a moral educating for the citizens of ancient Greece. Their strategy resulted in critical discourses on all aspects of Greek society.⁴² Plato's Academy, the first formal academic institution, followed a holistic approach to ensure that its pupils obtained comprehensive and purposeful learning. It offered an intense syllabus, consisting of a variety of subjects including mathematics, geography, history, grammar, medicine, and *Mousikē* (Baltes, 1993:17). In an effort to ensure appropriate education for his aspiring philosophers, all subjects were designed according to Plato's philosophical criteria. The syllabus was informed by Plato's critical observations of society, under influence of Socrates, which included the absence of a moral code and the need for a moral education for the citizens of ancient Greece. These findings subsequently developed into a series of dialogues, which profoundly influenced the academic life of ancient Greece, as well as Western philosophy. These dialogues were written with the intent of providing Plato's students and fellow citizens with guidelines on how to live a good and serene life. Plato's contemporaries, including Socrates, shared his desire to create an Ideal State where educated and just men ruled.⁴³

The desire to construct an Ideal State, however, was not limited to Plato's region. Independent of Plato's influence, other regions also strove to become a just people. The Arcadians is such an example. Being an isolated central region in the Peloponnesus in the south of Greece, they were notorious for living by simple means (Lagasse, 2015). *Mousikē* could be found at the very core of this region's *ethos*, shaping the characters of its citizens by the implementation of their ideals and principles, evolving them into a balanced society (Csapo, 2004:2).⁴⁴ Although emanating from a different region, this cultural system also related to the concept of *paideia*,

⁴² See Kenny (1997:279-281) on critical discourses regarding educational strategies.

⁴³ Plato's Ideal State was one where philosophers ruled, the citizens were just, living moral and balanced lives. Also see Mara (1983:617) regarding the importance of reaching a "certain political dimension". Plato's terminology for an educated and just man is a philosopher-ruler. Plato's belief that philosopher rulers (philosopher-kings) must be chosen and educated at an early age, in order to become the young Guardians of Athens, is eminent when reading Book III of the *Republic*. These Guardians were the ideal students of his teachings. See Chroust (1967:38).

⁴⁴ Part of the Arcadian culture was to enrol in a state-funded programme which includes musical training for males until the age of thirty. Musical demonstrations and performances was expected from these men, including demonstrations in dance and vocal expertise (Murray & Wilson, 2004:2).

a concept of high value to principal figures in ancient Greece, such as Simonides, Protagoras, Plato and Aristotle.

For Plato, music's main purpose was the education of the young. Anderson discusses the matter of the relationship between music and the soul in immense detail within the context of democracy, including Plato's apprehension of "liberated" rhythms and modes. He stated that, according to Plato, the moral code of music resided in the elements of rhythm and mode that communicate with the deepest part of the soul (Anderson, 1955:88). Due to Plato's belief that music possessed the ability to affect the soul, he was particularly cautious of its role in education. He delineated firm and occasionally austere instructions in the *Republic* and *Laws* as to how, and to what extent, music should be incorporated in education. In addition to musical education focusing on intellectual development, Plato's ideals included the study of music in combination with gymnastics, confirming that both body and mind were to be stimulated in an effort to exercise control over potentially harmful influences on one's character. Plato was of the opinion that the musical amateur should not have access to further study in music, particularly to certain rhythms and modes. Plato was equally apprehensive towards professionalism in music, except in the case of Damon. Damon's school of thought, relative to the Pythagorean school of thought, claimed that music could cultivate courage, moderation and justice, and followed a more theoretical, logical and mathematical approach to music and education. As Plato did not perceive Damon as a musical amateur, he was excluded from Plato's harsh rulings of music and professionalism (Anderson, 1955:91-92).

Aristides Quintilianus critiqued the situation between Damon and Plato, because Plato did not refer to Damon when discussing his ideal *polis* (Csapo, 2004:259). I focus on two scholars' viewpoints regarding Aristides' dissertation on music: the first by W. Anderson, and the second by C. Lord. In Anderson's view, Aristides regarded Damonian principles as relative to philosophy, portraying a fundamental cosmological basis (Anderson, 1955:98). Damon's focal point in musical compositions, according to Aristides Quintilianus' texts, lay in the value he attached to every note, which is the opposite of Plato's holistic approach. Based on my interpretation of Plato's *Republic* and *Laws*, I agree with Anderson that Plato's holistic approach did not include note selection or the assignment of individual notes to an *ethos*. Rather, he created awareness regarding the complexity of modes (modes being the "smallest unit to be thus treated") and its effect on the human soul (Anderson, 1955:100).⁴⁵ It would seem that Plato was less interested in the mechanistic aspects of music and more in its dynamic and affective impact on the human soul and development. There is also the question regarding the masculinity of rhythm and the femininity of melody. Anderson argued that both

⁴⁵ See *Republic* 399a-c (Plato, 1997:1969).

Damon and Plato agreed on this issue, although in different ways. Damon continued his *ethos* of allocating importance to every note, by associating masculine and feminine qualities to notes, modes and even musical instruments. Conversely, Plato, true to his systemic thinking, recognised masculinity and femininity in modes, and the simplicity or complexity of instruments (Anderson, 1955:100-101).

Turning to C. Lord's paper on *Damon and Music Education*, it is evident that he is not necessarily in disagreement with Anderson. Lord agrees that Aristides Quintilianus' dissertation on music suggests the proper manner in which to handle this subject. In principle, Lord states that there are definite similarities between Damon's and Plato's music *ethos*, but that both these intellectuals' ideals developed into separate and differentiating philosophies. Lord illustrates this by referring to a passage in the *Republic* where Plato reiterated the necessity of developing harmonies that represent contrasting characters, in order to encourage contrasting ideals such as courage and moderation.⁴⁶ According to Lord, this passage indicates Plato's acceptance of Damon's *ethos* while staying true to the holistic character of his own teachings (Lord, 1978:37). In accordance with Anderson's view, Lord initiates a discourse on the opposing sexes and their value in both Damon's and Plato's philosophies. I agree with both Anderson and Lord in this regard and accept that Damon's values of the sexes' representation in music occurred in immense detail including specific notes, modes and instrumentation, whereas Plato's main focus was on modes and that their qualities could possibly destroy his ideal of simplicity.

2.4. THE VALUE OF *MOUSIKĒ* IN ANCIENT GREEK CULTURE

From the above it is clear that *Mousikē*, as the domain of the Muses and as the container of music, poetry and other arts, had significant influence on Greek culture in general. Festive occasions in ancient Greece, whether formal or informal, generated opportunities for intellectuals and politicians to shed light on pressing ethical and political concerns on a regular basis. One of these events was the Symposium, where aristocratic men gathered to drink wine, recite poetry and performed or enjoyed music. Intellectual or philosophical debates and dialogues were inevitable, which made the Symposium ideal for discussing political affairs. These discussions initiated systematic and analytical thought amongst men, creating an opportunity for leaders of the Grecian community to introduce their current political values on an intellectual and analytical level. At the beginning of Chapter 2, it was mentioned that, during Pericles' reign, Damon provided him with music education. However, research suggests that Damon used music education as a disguise to inform Pericles of the political value music possesses and how it can be put to constructive use in his ruling. It is evident that the

⁴⁶ See *Republic* 399a-c (Plato, 1997:1969).

relationship between ethics, politics and *Mousikē* is strong and intricate, and requires a more detailed discussion. This chapter, then, highlights a few fundamental elements, while the following chapters supply material on ethics and politics during the Greek Golden Age.

In concluding this chapter, it is apparent that the concept of *Mousikē* acted as the emergent vessel for music and several other arts. As the playing field of the Muses, it influenced almost all aspects of life during the Golden Age and thus formed an integral part of life in ancient Greece. The spectrum of influence ranged from connecting to the past, forming part of everyday activities, and providing music for weddings and funerals, to influencing and shaping the intellect of the young aspiring leaders of Athens. It is becoming clear that in this coalition of *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics, it is *Mousikē* in all its dimensions, that created an opportunity for a just and tranquil state and therefore a good life. West describes this best, referring to one of Pindar's poems, by declaring that Pindar, like most Greeks, would make *Mousikē* with the pervasive activities of the Muses, a requirement for a good life (West, 1992:13):

*...and the Muse, in accord with their ways,
does not forsake that land: dance-choruses of girls
are everywhere, and the assertive voice
of lyres and resounding shawms are ever astir.
Some with horses and exercise, some with board-games,
some with lyres: in full blossom
their thriving fortune stands.*

CHAPTER 3

POLITICS: *MOUSIKĒ* AND ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY WITHIN THE GOLDEN AGE

During the middle of the fifth century B.C.E., Athens became the dominant Grecian *polis*, not only governing other *poleis*, but also dominating the seas of the west with an abundance of resources. Under the leadership of Pericles, Athens constructed an empire which signified democracy and political authority, establishing itself as the most renowned *polis* of the fifth century (Fornara & Samons II, 1991:xv). This chapter aims to outline *Mousikē*'s role and purpose within the Athenian political environment. A discussion of the intricacies of political matters during the development of democracy will preface the comprehension of the possible role and functions of *Mousikē* in this context. Within these parameters, Pericles and Damon are important figures to consider, due to their political influence and their mutual interest in ethical theories on music. Socrates' political notions, including his trial and verdict, followed by Plato's Ideal State and complemented by Socrates and Plato's views on *Mousikē*'s duty within political parameters, will also form part of this discourse. Apart from considering Damon's involvement, Chapter 3, therefore, does not focus on *Mousikē* per se, but rather on the value of democratic political life to understand the influence of *Mousikē* as an integral part of ancient Greece's culture.

3.1. ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY: AN OVERVIEW

Greece experienced different kinds of rule throughout the ages. The various *poleis* were governed by monarchies, oligarchies and democracies. Athens, during the late fifth century, experienced fundamental transformations within their society (philosophy, music, architectural structures, performance arts, economy etc.) due to democratic developments. Therefore, the most notable system of rule for this research project falls within the fifth century: the rise and fall of democracy in ancient Athens, and the elements that assisted this political evolution. The citizen's participation in political matters during this governmental development, was expected of all indigenous Athenian men, regardless of fortune or social status (Kagan, 1991:1). This extraordinary system came into being around the middle of the fifth century, initiating unity amongst Athenians and encouraging political involvement from across social classes. Pericles was a central figure in this political transformation.⁴⁷ Before his election as the democratic

⁴⁷ The period in which Pericles ruled Athens, 461-429 B.C.E., is referred to as the Age of Pericles.

leader of Athens in 461 B.C.E., he was selected as a strategic leader within his own democratic political faction.

Although the concept of democracy was based on the ideal of success and efficiency, it also held the capacity to cause damage to the citizens if not used cautiously and for the greater good, as all parties participating in democratic decisions were of moral character or educated in political matters (Raaflaub, 2007b:3). Prior to the revised democratic laws, as set in motion by Pericles, political schooling and the practice thereof was reserved for aristocratic men. As a result, Raaflaub's statement was reasonable, as the uneducated men of Athens were given consent through democracy to partake in important civic matters they were not necessarily equipped to master. Socrates' death sentence, a direct consequence of this democratic institution, comes to mind in this regard.⁴⁸ Socrates' teachings of morality were aimed at cultivating the citizens of Athens. *Mousikē*, as a cultural vehicle, was a means for Socrates to realise his teachings of justice, as he believed that it could harmonise the souls of the young students and ultimately the entire *polis*. Through *Mousikē*, Socrates was able to introduce novel perspectives on discipline, communication, expression, analysis etc., in time altering his students' thought-processes and "harmonising" their souls. Ironically, due to the democratic system, it was the very people he wanted to enrich who sentenced him to death, as they possessed the power to do so (Bickford, 2009:135). Whether or not these fifth-century democratic laws benefited or detracted from Athenian society, it remains axiomatic that democracy initiated and communicated political transformation, changing ancient Greece's political development and resulting in a substantial cultural shift (Farrar, 2007:181).

In order fully to comprehend Pericles' adaptation of democracy, it is necessary to revisit the historical events that led to the Classical era. Formal laws did not exist before the year 621 B.C.E., resulting in unstable political conditions. These unstable conditions involved certain moral objections by the middle and lower social classes, due to the fact that the laws were based on oral traditions and in absolute control of the aristocrats. The non-aristocrats demanded political transformation. Upon insisting on the election of lawgivers, Athens was in need of intellectuals who possessed skills that would offer a new political system that could address and resolve current issues (Meier, 1990:40-41). Lawgivers were generally appointed from various classes of Greek societies, with the middle class often being the typical selection. According to Gertrude Smith, this was customary, as the aristocrats were not in favour of

⁴⁸ For further reading on the actual effect of hemlock, which was used as Socrates' death sentence, see Christopher Gill's article *The Death of Socrates*, where he discusses Plato's perception of this event in *Phaedo* (Gill, 1973). Also see Janet Sullivan's study on Hemlock in *A Note on the Death of Socrates* (Sullivan, 2001).

formulating any regulation that could possibly eliminate their everyday extravagances (Smith, 1922:190). Draco, the Athenian legislator, was given the opportunity to construct the earliest code of a written law, in the hopes of achieving order amongst the people, ideally resulting in stable political circumstances between the ruling aristocratic families (Carawan, 1998:1). Draco's laws were considered as particularly severe, since the prevailing form of punishment was to be the death penalty. It was thus decided that Draco's written laws did not realise the political ideals set out for Athens. As a result of Athens' critical social, economic and political predicaments, Solon, an Athenian aristocrat, was appointed to revise Draco's laws in 594 B.C.E. (Parker, 2007:24).⁴⁹

Solon's modifications intended to protect the common people from the aristocrat's political judgements (consequently minimising any ranking potential for non-aristocrats) by shifting the power from the aristocratic families towards the government of the people. Solon was thus successful in codifying the laws, laying the groundwork for the new Athenian democracy (Carawan, 1998:384). In 508/7 B.C.E., Cleisthenes, a member of the notorious Alcmaeonid family, agreed to further modify Solon's laws in order to initiate equality between the elite and non-elite (Raaflaub, 2007b:1). Cleisthenes proposed various alterations to political matters, including restructuring the Athenian army and village governments. He also suggested relinquishing the oligarchy in favour of the common citizen's government (Wallace, 2007:76-77). Consequently, Athenians brought various motions forward in the assembly, challenging each other if laws were violated. Cynthia Farrar refers to Pericles' Funeral Oration in this regard and argues that Athenians were permitted to establish their own value system, provided that they continued to promote and protect this freedom in accordance with the system of democracy (Farrar, 2007:180).

As this self-governing *polis* encouraged men to partake in civic matters, exceedingly large number of citizens participated in political practices on a daily basis. Involvement in political affairs took place by means of the assembly, the law courts and the council. Each of these political parties were chosen and governed by male Athenian-born citizens over 18 years of age. Political members were chosen by lot, imparting this duty on all applicable citizens throughout the year. The assembly was responsible for granting verdicts regarding certain strategic matters. The boule consisted of 500 members that were required to serve Athens for a minimum of two years. Representatives from various districts and villages, in and around Athens, were chosen to deal with administrative systems, to be proposed to the assembly. The

⁴⁹ In Raphael Sealey's *The Athenian Republic*, he provides a thorough discussion on the actual objects on which Draco and Solon's laws were written down on, as well as how these objects were preserved (Sealey, 1987:140-145). For further reading on this subject, also take note of Gertrude Smith's *Early Greek Codes* (Smith, 1922:194).

law courts, chosen on a daily basis, created a platform for debate between the citizens and the general court for the day. These three political institutes collectively regulated all matters political, ensuring just and constructive outcomes (Raaflaub, 2007b:4-5).⁵⁰

In line with the implementation of democracy, Athenian citizens were expected to master certain cultural elements, which included universal knowledge and *Mousikē*, in their quest to become moral and principled citizens. Athenian leaders, ranging from Pericles to Alexander the Great, were not only required to master elements such as literacy and music (as was mandatory for all Athenian citizens), but also needed to possess exceptional qualities which included courage as soldiers and sportsman, as well as wisdom in their private and financial matters. In summary: they were obliged to exemplify the ideal citizen. The demanding nature of Athens during this time was regarded as cultivating new standards for individual excellence within this thriving democratic *polis* (Paxson, 1985:67).

During this time, principal figures in politics, astronomy, culture and philosophy found themselves in a progression towards intellectual greatness, breeding an inviting environment for all of Greece. These Greek intellectuals disseminated their knowledge and expertise by means of teaching, for a certain fee, and were referred to as sophists. Athens was recognised as a *polis* where democratic discussions were customary and where intellectuals from other *poleis* were received courteously (Roochnik, 2009:161). The sophists proclaimed that their field of expertise comprised all subjects relevant to political science, which included theoretical and practical studies. These sophists believed that political leadership or science, was related to theories of human nature and the nature of power. As a result of studying subjects related to political science, it was believed one could acquire a set of skills that would enhance one's political endeavours. The sophists mastered various fields related to political leadership, including ethics, music, rhetoric and mathematics (Ober, 2015:206-207). Meier ascribes this phenomenon of exponential skills development to the fact that Athens was in a state of "evolutionary openness" to various democratic advancements. He refers to the Archaic period (800-480 B.C.E.) as a political prelude to democracy (Meier, 1990:32). In *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece*, H.A. Shapiro refers to the Archaic period as Greece's "formative years", considering that this era saw the initial phase of several central Greek elements, which include poetry, philosophy and architecture (Shapiro, 2007:1). For this reason, Meier's earlier description of the Archaic period as a prelude to the Classical era, is accurate. It is important to acknowledge the developmental process of elements such as music

⁵⁰ See Finer (2007:344-350) for a detailed adaptation on the Athenian structure of government.

and philosophy within the Classical era in order to achieve a better understanding of their contexts.

When one discusses the Archaic period, the origin of the term *polis* is typically at the centre of the discussion. Jonathan Hall refers to the translated word “city-state” as being a weak, but not incorrect translation of the term. The origin of this word is not of importance in this chapter. However, the form of government that accompanied the origin of the *polis* is. This manner of rule enabled the residents to partake in civic matters concerning their *polis*, creating a sense of devotion towards the political wellbeing of their specific *polis*. This allegiance towards one’s own *polis* was quite exceptional for this time period and the sentiment only took hold in Greece towards the end of the Classical era (Hall, 2007:40).⁵¹ Meier’s emphasis on the Archaic period as a preface to democracy is further validated by Hall’s discussion on the occurrence of political societies.

S.E. Finer refers to the numerous political societies between the *poleis*, and within each *polis* as well, voicing the competitive nature of the Greeks. He presumes that it was their competitiveness that produced division between *poleis*, and even amongst politicians of the same *polis*. Within a pleasant and sociable context, such as contests in athletics, music or drama, this characteristic of the Greeks was appropriate. Within a political context, however, the Greeks were easily persuaded by their desire for power and fraud. Finer concludes that this egocentric characteristic was the cause of many erroneous political decisions (Finer, 2007:326). Hall further discusses the hierarchical system of the elitists who created separation between the people of Greece in order to gain power. Aristocratic families governed Greek *poleis*, each seeking to gain control over law codes, thus creating resistance amongst themselves in pursuit of power over the elite and non-elite. Accordingly, Solon constructed a new set of laws, aspiring to design an impartial system of governance that would benefit the masses and not only the elite (Hall, 2007:45-46).

With reference to Meier’s previous notion on democracy as producing opportunities for intellectuals to develop into principal figures of politics, music, philosophy, mathematics and poetry within Greek societies, there remained constraints within which principal figures were forced to perform and develop. If these boundaries were crossed, it was up to this newly-founded democracy to decide the fate of those principal figures. Ostracism materialised as a

⁵¹ During the Archaic period, another practice of state was in motion, namely the *ethnos*. The *ethnos* was characteristically a more lenient political institute, related to the regions of Achaia, Elis, Aitolia, Akarnania, Thessaly and Makedonia. The *polis* is seen as the more dominant form of political organisation during this time and therefore the topic of discussion in this chapter (Hall, 2007:49). For further reading on the significance of the *ethnos*, see Jonathan M. Hall’s chapter Polis, Community, and Ethnic Identity in *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece* (Shapiro, 2007).

manner of punishment conducted by the assembly. Athenian elites were exiled from society for up to ten years. Josiah Ober supposes that ostracism, being “a particularly dramatic example of an accountability procedure”, empowered the non-aristocrats of Athens to repel any manner of aristocratic intimidations, thus defending the democratic government (Ober, 2015:174). There were six occasions on which aristocrats were banished from Athens. One of these ostracisms included Pericles’ father, Xanthippos. Another was Pericles’ music instructor and advisor, Damon (Wallace, 2007:79). The use of ostracism as penance diminished after 415 B.C.E. The refinement of a *polis*’ political system was thought to be signified by their punishment practice, the most severe of which was the death penalty (Finer, 2007:357).

3.2. PERICLES AND THE GOLDEN AGE

3.2.1. *Pericles’ reign*

The Athenian general Pericles, son of the notorious Xanthippus, is widely considered to have been the principal commander of Athens during the Peloponnesian War, influencing the Athenian fleet with his renowned enthusing oratories.⁵² Pericles came from an esteemed and wealthy family, who fell under scrutiny of the demos for being powerful Athenian aristocrats (Wallace, 2007:79). Fornara and Samons give a detailed description of Plutarch’s writings on Pericles in *Athens from Cleisthenes to Pericles*, discussing Pericles’ apprehension towards politics due to his privileged upbringing and natural talent for oration. He dreaded possible ostracism if he did in fact decide to involve himself in governmental matters (Fornara & Samons II, 1991:24). In due time, Athens would thrive under the leadership of Pericles, constructing the Athenian Empire and playing a significant role in the development of Western thought. Under Pericles’ democratic leadership, Athens gained authority in Attica, overseeing all political concerns (Wallace, 2007:81).

Regarding the success of Pericles’ leadership approach, it is observed that during Pericles’ reign, Athens was in a state of transformation and therefore susceptible to the political transformations presented by him. However, the initial system of democracy, as developed by Solon in the sixth century, should be acknowledged as an initial form of democracy. Cleisthenes’s restructuring of this system materialised during a period that was ripe for change. The profound changes that occurred during Cleisthenes’s time would have been unimaginable

⁵² Pericles’ father Xanthippus, son of Ariphron, was the victor of Mycale. The Athenians constructed a statue in his honour on the Acropolis (Fornara & Samons II, 1991:23). However, Pericles’ mother’s family, the Alcmeonids, is believed to be cursed through acts of profanity, somewhat 200 years before. The Spartans used this information against Pericles as a political tactic, preceding the Peloponnesian war. For further reading on the curse of the Alcmeonids, see Fornara and Samons II (1991:1-3). For historical information regarding the Alcmeonids’ influence during the Archaic period, see Richard Neer’s article in *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece* (Neer, 2007).

and impractical at an earlier stage of Athens' development (Raaflaub, 2007b:15). Pericles' manner of governance not only moulded the *polis* of Athens into the dominant political *polis* in Attica, but also realised the countless accomplishments that Greece has been renowned for throughout history (Kagan, 1991:1).⁵³ It is thus evident that although Pericles was not the initiator of democracy, he did play a prominent part in its development. Ober validates this by arguing that these political revolutions "were the direct result of collective action" by its political predecessors (Ober, 2007:83).

Pericles grew up in an era where cultural tutoring was an integral part of aristocratic education. Tutoring included musical instruction in the lyre and aulos and in the principles of poetry through the writings of Homer. These teachings were based on both theoretical studies and practical performance. The Grecian religious festivals served as a platform for numerous Athenian males to compete in choral ensembles, showcasing their aptitude for cultural studies thus weaving politics, music and the arts into the cultural fabric.⁵⁴ Plato spoke on the subject of aristocratic cultural education in *Protagoras*, stating that the study of music and poetry enabled men to obtain qualities that were expected of all aristocratic males.⁵⁵ These qualities included self-control, gentleness and rhetoric. In this instance, the ground for ethical behaviour becomes apparent (Kagan, 1991:21). This emphasis on cultural development within a Greek *polis* illuminates the fact that, during Pericles' reign, Athens appealed to countless artists, philosophers and other intellectuals from various *poleis*. The new culture-orientated communities of Athens created a market for a new form of knowledge exchange, and this role was taken up by the Sophists who traded knowledge remuneration. Sophists were frowned upon by intellectuals who likewise imparted their wisdoms on those who pursued it, but did not charge for their services.⁵⁶ Ober refers to their teachings as *politike technē*, as their fields of expertise included elements associated with political leadership or science (Ober, 2015:206). In Plato's *Republic*, Thrasymachus the sophist comes forward as the third challenger in a list of contenders provided by Cephalus. His appearance in Book I indicates the extent of Sophists' involvement in philosophical discourses and that they were becoming prominent and notorious figures within Athenian culture (Roochnik, 2009:161). Socrates's criticism of the Sophists was

⁵³ Although Pericles's governance only emanated half a century after its creation, it is imperative to acknowledge the manner in which an erratic political leadership developed into a functional government. Formerly, the non-aristocrats were still to be submissive toward the aristocrats. Pericles ensured that his government provided political independence for all his people (Kagan, 1991:3). For further reading on the details of Pericles' reforms, see Fornara and Samons (1991:66, 73) and Raaflaub (2007:115).

⁵⁴ The infamous symposium also provided a location for aristocratic men to sing together whilst discussing political matters (Kagan, 1991:21).

⁵⁵ See *Protagoras* 326a-c (Plato, 1997:1456-1457).

⁵⁶ Barbara Cassin provides a thorough essay on Greek sophists in *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge* (Cassin, 2000).

that their talent did not lie within the domain of knowledge, but in their ability to master rhetoric (Thompson, 2009:84).

R.T. Neer remarks that the art of rhetoric emerged as early as the Archaic period as a direct result of a decline in public aristocratic self-presentation, which signified skill, elitism and nobility.⁵⁷ Before this development, it was customary for aristocrats to exhibit their personal collections of statues or other structures. This change in aristocratic self-presentation was related to the emergence of colossal public collections and treasuries during the beginning of the fifth century. With the increase of these public collections, a decrease in aristocratic displays followed. However, the demand for self-presentation did not truly decrease, but was merely replaced by a new display of expertise: rhetoric. Oratory skills indicated ambition, the ability to afford exclusive teachers and the potential to gain power in Greek society (Neer, 2007:251-252). The art of public speaking, and acquiring favour from the addressees, occasionally created disorder during political gatherings. Ober refers to an instance in 415 B.C.E., where a persuasive assembly speaker generated enormous excitement during a political gathering, resulting in an extravagant and unnecessary excursion to Sicily. The details of this excursion are not as important as the fact that the council members were unable to influence the assembly members, due to the rhetorical expertise of the speaker. Ober further states that Thucydides and Plato cautioned against skilled public speakers, since their expertise – and their moral compass, by extension – was shaped by “deceitful” Sophists (Ober, 2015:234). It is known that Pericles, however, encouraged the teaching of Sophists, since he appointed individuals such as Damon, Anaxagoras and Aspasia to educate him.⁵⁸

As fifth-century literature was written during a time of accelerated political development, it is crucial that the philosophies and views of Greece’s historical writers are also studied, as they provide invaluable material that communicates the then current sociological aspects of the *poleis* (Raaflaub, 2007b:11-13). In this respect, Plutarch and Thucydides are dominant figures. Thucydides’ *History of the Peloponnesian War* is a particularly important text.⁵⁹ This Athenian

⁵⁷ See Robert Wardy’s essay *Rhetoric* for a detailed account of rhetoric in Classical Greece (Wardy, 2000). See also Susan Bickford’s essay in *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Greek Political Thought*, in which she discussed Plato’s *Gorgias* regarding rhetorical teachings to aspirant politicians - The *Gorgias*: Pastry-makers and Politicians (Bickford, 2009:129-140).

⁵⁸⁵⁸ Thompson examined Pericles’ relationship with sophists, by analysing the writings of Plutarch, with particular reference to Pericles’ son, Xanthippus. The latter mentioned, did not approve of his father’s customary discourses with these specific intellectuals and would make it known by imitating discussions between Pericles and certain sophists. For further reading on this subject, see (Thompson, 2009:84).

⁵⁹ Ober stated that Thucydides’ *History of the Peloponnesian War* did not merely suffice as an historical account of occurrences during the war; it also provided its readers with knowledge to develop into sensible political contributors during forthcoming wars. Interestingly, Ober added to this that out of all Greek historical writers, he is of the opinion that Thucydides implemented the methodologies and reasoning of 5th century sophists to the extreme. Ironically, Socrates’ associate, Hippocrates, also found the sophistic teachings to be of value, consequently implementing elements of beliefs into his

general the events of the Peloponnesian War as they unfolded from its commencement in 429 B.C.E.. Although Thucydides openly commended Pericles' leadership, Mara shows that that he also offered constructive criticism. He spoke of Pericles' inability to manage his political vision for Athens separate from his individual foresight (Mara, 2009:113). Thompson focuses on the change of leadership style during the refinement of democratic Athens, suggesting that Pericles was the "first citizen" of Athens, increasingly accepting political authority over the government (Thompson, 2009:83). Although Athens experienced constant political change during this refinement phase of democracy, I do not think that it was the intent of democracy to have a "first citizen" exercising political authority. I refer back to my previous deliberation on rhetoric, where it appears that Pericles' expertise in this matter gained him widespread political influence and power.

Another scholar, Susan Bickford, refers to Socrates's discourses on Pericles as an attempt to verify his character. Bickford deliberates that Socrates criticised Pericles, and other political leaders, due to their inability to improve the characters of their citizens. They were, therefore, unsuccessful in their duties as a governing body (Bickford, 2009:135). Socrates' teachings were based on ethics and principles and attempted to cultivate all citizens into good, balanced and honourable people. Pericles as "first citizen", consequently possessed the skill and political status to develop Athens into a just and moral *polis*. However, in Socrates' view, he did not achieve this and thus neglected his duty as political leader. It appears as though Pericles aimed to establish an innovative Greek culture. He was of the opinion that a citizen's self-interest was inseparable from the interests of society. Therefore, if the citizen succeeded, so too would the society and the *polis*. He endeavoured to teach his philosophy through rhetoric and not by force, thereby providing a platform for citizens to freely obey his principles (Kagan, 1991:7).

3.2.2. Damon's political influence on Pericles

With his aristocratic background, intellect and talent for rhetoric, Pericles developed into an extremely powerful and autonomous leader. His affinity for Sophists and the fact that he employed them demonstrate his progressive views. As referred to earlier, Pericles showed an interest in philosophy and music, which would explain his association with Damon, Anaxagoras and Aspasia (Stadter, 1991:124).⁶⁰ Wallace, referring to Plutarch's writings, argues that Pericles and Damon knew each other since Pericles' youth and that their attachment continued

philosophies (Ober, 2015:207). Also see Martin Ostwald's chapter on Thucydides for a detailed account of this historian's writings and life in *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge* (Ostwald, 2000).

⁶⁰ Pericles received instruction on the psychological influence of music through Damon, assistance in rhetoric through the physical philosopher Anaxagoras, and skilfully developed the manner in which he constructed arguments through Aspasia (Stadter, 1991:124).

into Pericles' old age (Wallace, 2015:51,55).⁶¹ Damon regarded music education as an apparatus with which one could implement virtuous social and political components into a community with relative ease (Lord, 1978:42). Of course, outside his teachings, he did not publicly pronounce his philosophies within a political context. This makes his ostracism intriguing. In the following chapter, Damon's philosophy of music education is discussed in more detail. At this point of the argument, it is adequate to acknowledge Damon as Pericles's advisor. Damon's influences, strategies and beliefs regarding Pericles and his position as political leader have been fundamental in this project, and are reflected on further in Chapter 4, within the context of Greek ethics.

3.3. ATHENS' POLITICAL INFLUENCE ON PHILOSOPHY

The central point of intellectual debate amongst philosophers in Classical Greece concerned the examination of fundamental characteristics needed to produce an authentic statesman. The significance of political matters during this period was vast and capable of affecting the character of the citizens and consequently the *polis* itself. For this reason, philosophers felt compelled to observe and assess all matters political, in an effort to improve the soul of the *polis* and the soul of its people (Bodéüs, 2000:139). In this context, I focus on two intellectuals – Socrates and Plato – who made a significant impact on philosophical discourses regarding politics and the soul by means of critical written dialogues. As Socrates did not produce any written work, my research comprises Plato's interpretation of historic matters of which Socrates formed part. Plato formulated Socrates' methodology as one of questioning all elements related to the matter at hand. From Plato's dialogues, much can be gleaned about Socrates' character. What is apparent in Plato's deployment of the Socratic method is the value of asking questions over conclusive explanations. Thus, philosophical discourse relies on various possibilities of interpretation, rather than on specific outcomes (Bickford, 2009:128).

3.3.1. Socrates' perception and practice of politics

The tragedy of Athens from the Socratic perspective is not his own death – he does not regard death as an evil – it is the failure of the Athenians to use rightly the great and unique gift they have been given – Timothy Mahoney.⁶²

The execution of Socrates has been the subject of many a discourse. An important question is whether the charges against him were based on ethical foundations or merely on dissatisfaction with his political views. There were concerns that Socrates imparted his political

⁶¹ It is believed that Pericles and Damon were related also by marriage: Agariste, Damon's wife, was an Alcmeonid, similar to Pericles' mother. See (Wallace, 2015:133) for further detail on Damon and Pericles' family connections.

⁶² See Socrates' Loyalty to Athens and His Radical Critique of the Athenians (Mahoney, 1998:1).

beliefs to the young Athenian men. According to Martin Carcieri, Socrates denied responsibility for the actions of the youth that shadowed him. His rejection was based on the grounds that he did not declare himself a teacher and could not be held liable for the impact of his alleged teachings. However, Socrates's claims echoed those of Sophists and the manner in which he addressed and ridiculed the jury was seen as disrespectful. This blatant contempt for Athenian culture did not favour Socrates's argument (Carcieri, 2003: 137).

In a critical study, to discover the actual reasoning behind Socrates' devotion towards an apparently corrupt Athens, Timothy Mahoney refers to Plato's *Crito*. In this dialogue, Plato portrayed Socrates as a committed Athenian citizen who accepted capital punishment and refused escape (as suggested by his friend Crito), since escaping would defy the authority of the *polis* and, consequently, count as an injustice. A just soul required the performance of just acts. For this reason, Socrates accepted his death sentence (Mahoney, 1998:1-3). Plato observed that this political act by the *polis* was confirmed his critique of Athenian democracy and its incapability of wisdom (Munn, 2000:6). Despite the fact that his own *polis* found him guilty on various counts, keeping in mind that he had dedicated himself to a philosophical life and improving the citizens of Athens, he nevertheless honoured his philosophy and accepted his fate. Why did he act in this way? Mahoney, in examining Plato's *Apology*, attempts an answer by concluding that Socrates had faith in his "divine mission" to transform and improve the lives of Athenian citizens (Mahoney, 1998:8). Concerning previous discussions regarding the inseparable nature of religion and celestial influence in Greek culture, Socrates's faith in his "divine mission" was not to be taken lightly. For Socrates, the divine mission overruled human nature and strove towards moral justice. To quote Bickford: "Whatever else we can say about Socrates, it is surely the case that for him the pursuit of truth was no mere exercise." (Bickford, 2009:126).

Striving for a principled and moral life was at the core of Socrates's belief system. He believed that analysing one's own thoughts consistently with one's actions and constantly striving to obtain knowledge of how to enhance one's character were necessary to attain virtue, and in turn, lead a good life (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:102). It was these very principles that Socrates endeavoured to teach the citizens of Athens. Based on this belief, Socrates was confident that he was taking part in an authentic politics. For him, ruling in a just way trumped the gratification of the masses. Bickford, however, makes an interesting observation that Socrates would have been ill-suited for the role of political leader (apart from the fact that he showed no interest in partaking in political matters) (Bickford, 2009:135). Although, as mentioned earlier, Socrates was notoriously apathetic towards everyday civic obligations, he was selected to serve on the Athenian council for two years, together with other members of his deme Alopeke (Ober,

2015:165). This civic duty was expected of all Athenian men, despite class or moral principles.⁶³

Although Socrates had no political aspirations he launched serious critiques against the institutions of Athenian democracy. In book eight of Plato's *Republic*, Socrates's prior subtle criticisms of democracy become more transparent. Roochnik (2009) provides a thorough analysis of Socrates' political views in *The Political Drama of Plato's Republic* (2007), with specific focus on Socrates' criticisms. Socrates compared the *polis* to the soul, expressing that a just *polis* comprises just citizens. He continued to describe the Ideal *polis*, in which cultural events or interests such as poetry and music would be restricted since they could promote unruly behaviour and affect individuals who partook in political matters. One can deduce from this position the potential power and influence on the political soul of the *polis*. Furthermore, he made some suggestions on the management of education, religion, medical assistance, classism, property, family relations and eugenics (Roochnik, 2009:164-167). All these restrictions were constructed for the purpose of a "beautiful city", and all contradicted the values of the democratic *polis*. Richard Bodéüs declares that Plato, through his dialogues, emphasised the demand for "an apprenticeship in politics" in an effort to realise elements of the Good (Bodéüs, 2000:139):

He (Plato) sought in the statesmen a firm universal knowledge, nourished by the source of all intelligibility, that is, by the absolute Good, which is situated beyond being.

Raising Bickford's previous notion on the paradoxical nature of Socrates' teachings, I would agree that the paradox is apparent in the context of Roochnik's and Bodéüs' findings. In sum, Socrates's objective was to enhance and develop the soul in service of political life. Accordingly, each citizen was responsible for the justice and level of excellence of their *polis*, considering that the character of the soul was interrelated with the character of the *polis* (Canto-Sperber, 2000b:758-759).

3.3.2. Plato's political thought in his dialogues⁶⁴

Researching Plato of Athens' aristocratic upbringing, one discovers various political influences: the Peloponnesian War started three years before his birth, Solon the lawgiver was his ancestor, his stepfather was acquainted with Pericles, and two of his uncles came to be

⁶³ Peter Krentz intriguingly devised an essay on warfare and the armour used during Socrates' lifetime, presenting statistics on the affordability of metal and equipment for Athenian soldiers. He stated that a skilled worker would have been able to afford a shield and spear with a mere month's earnings and that even Socrates, who worth less than 500 drachmas, was capable of affording adequate armour for no less than two battles (Potidaia in 432-429 B.C.E. and Boiotia in 424 B.C.E.) (Krentz, 2007:71-72).

⁶⁴ See Szlezák's *Characteristics of the Platonic Dialogues* for a comprehensive understanding of the essential characteristics of Plato's dialogues (Szlezák, 1999:18-19).

delegates of the political society, the Thirty Tyrants. Given this context, it would have seemed probable that he would publicly participate in political matters. Instead, he dedicated his life to philosophical discourses in an attempt to convey elements of the good to society, determined to motivate Athenian citizens to become just and moral leaders. Moral leaders would ensure a moral society, he believed (Annas, 2000:672). Throughout his dialogues, Plato discussed political matters by investigating real or fictional political establishments, focusing on their influences on developing the characters of Athenian citizens. Consequently, Plato argued that authorities would inevitably influence the souls of citizens and therefore it was paramount that the ruling class practice a just politics to ensure to ensure the development of just citizens (Bickford, 2009:128). Plato believed that the good fortune of a *polis* was interconnected with the principal political leader. The principal figure either had to become a philosopher-king, or a philosopher had to become the principal political figure. According to Plato's conviction, a *polis* would only flourish when philosophy was integrated with political leadership (Bodéüs, 2000:140). As the *Republic* and *Laws* best illustrate the political influences on the souls of a *polis*' citizens, I limit my discussion to these two dialogues.⁶⁵

In the *Republic*, Plato's political thought shifted from critiquing the factual laws of Athens (as in *Crito* or *Apology*) to visualising an Ideal State, where just leaders rule just citizens. The focus therefore was twofold: the just individual, and the just society. J.S. McClelland reasons that justice as a virtue is distinctive from other virtues. Virtues such as wisdom, courage and self-control can be practised by individuals irrespective of whether others are practising them. Justice, on the other hand, needs to be practised by all citizens, to be favourable to society. McClelland refers to wisdom, courage and self-control as political virtues, as they are interconnected with the struggle for power amongst men. Plato, on the contrary, declared justice a political virtue which is fundamental to the realisation of a just political society (McClelland, 1996:23).

During the Classical era, book six and seven of the *Republic* provided an educational framework that was implemented into the schooling of young citizens in Plato's newly-found Academy. As in the *Republic*, the intent of the Academy was to instruct young Athenians by means of philosophy, in order to equip these young learners to participate ethically in future political matters of their *polis* (Brisson, 2000:895). Philosophical studies were intended to act as a vehicle for cultivating the souls of these young students, furthering their progression to becoming ethical citizens. McClelland addresses Plato's division of the soul into three

⁶⁵ Please note that I am by no means of the opinion that the *Republic* and *Laws* are the sole dialogues discussing political matters in accordance with the soul. Dialogues such as *Apology*, *Gorgias* and *Crito* would have provided additional valuable information. I merely limited the extensiveness of my research, within Chapter 3, to the chosen dialogues.

functions: reason, passion and appetite. Plato allocated various virtues to these three functions (McClelland, 1996:23). Annas states that the *Republic* declared all three functions as part of an individual's soul, but that domination of these three elements vary between individuals. By using reason and controlling the education of the young, Plato suggested that these three elements could be nurtured into a state of harmony (Annas, 2000:688). One way of nurturing the harmony of the soul was by means of *Mousikē*. Plato recommended specific parameters regarding the teaching of musical modes, rhythms and instruments, all to enhance and improve one's soul. In both the *Republic* and *Laws*, Plato conversed about music's ethical characteristics influencing the soul (Anderson, 1955:1). These ethical theories on music are further discussed in Chapters 4 and 5.

Contrary to Plato's Ideal *polis*, he later composed a dialogue that examined political themes in more depth and complexity, therefore resulting in conflicting conclusions with his earlier works. The *Laws* provide philosophical material that demonstrates the flaws of human nature and how one cannot practise authority and selflessness simultaneously. Where the *Republic* provided the reader with fictional and idealistic laws, Plato constructed new laws based on current Athenian laws, shaping them according to his own philosophies. It would seem that the structure of his Ideal State implied democratic conventions. The transformation in Plato's philosophical discourse throughout his lifetime, when comparing only these two dialogues, is significant, as it shows the development of philosophical discourse in Athens. Although Plato wrote his works in the form of dialogues, he refrained from partaking in the discourses, merely instigating reasoning (Annas, 2000:689-691).

3.4. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN *MOUSIKĒ* AND FIFTH-CENTURY ATHENIAN POLITICS

The value of *Mousikē* within this political context was found in its diverse functions. To highlight a few: the incorporation of *Mousikē* into the educational curriculum of young Athenian males (who were trained to become moral political leaders); the use of *Mousikē*'s possible manipulative influences on the Athenian citizens by established political leaders; the use of music and dance, as disciplines within *Mousikē*, prior to or even during combat; the performance of compositions of music, dance and song concerning prominent battles; the communication of political sentiments through music by certain political figures.⁶⁶ Political developments influenced *Mousikē* in turn: the art of performance grew more popular as

⁶⁶ On the cruel incorporation of *Mousikē* in political matters, see P. Murray and P. Wilson's Introduction: *Mousikē*, not Music regarding Heiron of Syracuse's practice (Murray & Wilson, 2004:3). Furthermore, an Athenian musician and politician, Kritias, explored various techniques and terminology that would be suitable for recitals of stringed instruments. As a musician and politician, Kritias' reactions towards his current political environment materialised by means of musical performance. Through music and poetry, he was actively involved in political matters (Wilson, 2004:294).

theatres and performance platforms were erected and maintained due to the economic growth, and the Athenian government took more interest in the principal figures connected to *Mousikē*, e.g. Damon and Socrates.

As previously stated, Plato envisions and sketches a comprehensive image of the ideal *polis*. Against this background, *Mousikē*'s principal role was to serve as a vehicle to produce just and moral political leaders and citizens, and as a result, a just society. To understand this, more information on the curriculum and educational praxis are needed. The governance of Plato's Ideal *polis* was to be ruled by educated Athenian males skilled in the ability to govern. Plato's belief in this regard may be attributed to Socrates' aversion of democratic principles that declared 'honesty' the sole criteria for occupying a position in government. This political conviction, that only skilled men who are trained in the "art of governing" should be allowed to maintain a political post, was not favoured by the democratic enthusiasts, as their belief remained that all men (regardless of status) were competent in civic duties. Plato's idealistic educational curriculum, as articulated by Victoria Wohl, was "...also a social education, producing a citizen who is simultaneously egalitarian and elite" (Wohl, 2004). It is here where multiple dialogues by Plato are relevant. He vividly depicted within them the manner in which music should be incorporated into proper education, and subsequently in society, and which musical developments were to be viewed as unethical. In short, his inclusion of music within education and society, excluded all modern ('New Music') developments (Csapo, 2004:236):

...no pipe music (Rep. 399, cf. Gorg. 501e), musical innovation (Leg. 816c), Dionysiac music and dance (Leg. 815c-d), music unaccompanied by words (Leg. 669d-70a), mode and rhythm which does not follow the verbal line (Rep. 400d, Leg. 669e), the use of more than one note per syllable (Leg. 812d), direct speech or vocal mimesis (Rep. 392c-96e), modulations in music or violent changes in the motion of dance (Leg. 814e-16c), polyphony or any sort of embellishment in melody or rhythm (Leg. 812d-e), and specifically polychordia (Rep. 399c), polyharmonia (Rep. 397c, 399c), polymetry (Rep. 397c, 399e), and 'colours' (Leg. 655a).⁶⁷

Agreeing with Plato, Andrew Barker states that "they [composers of the New Music] ignore established boundaries of genre and style, mixing every sort of music together in an incomprehensible jumble" and that they showed "a lack of respect for formal boundaries" (Barker, 2004). The New Music symbolised variety, change and development and flourished within the democratic society. Democracy directly contradicted the aristocracy, elitism and superiority. So too, the New Music was opposed to structured, controlled and disciplined music

⁶⁷ See Eric Csapo's chapter, The Politics of the New Music in *Music and the Muses*, for an in-depth description on this expression (Csapo, 2004).

and the social hierarchy which Plato was accustomed to. Prior to democracy, an educated man would be accomplished in various subjects, including music, indicating aristocracy and accomplishment. However, as democracy persisted, so did professionalism in the arts, particularly in music. As a result, the factors that represented a disciplined society, or “cultural superiority” as such, were being compromised from an aristocratic perspective (Csapo, 2004:236). Thus in Athens, music was perceived as a political marvel because they believed it was directly connected to their *polis*. It was in the *Republic* that Socrates cautioned against modern music, as it went against tradition. It was thought that innovations in the New Music could change the principles of the *polis* (Wallace, 2004:263). This statement reinforces the perception that the constellation of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics assisted with the transformation of the Athenian society. If modifications were made within the practice and performance of *Mousikē*, it would also have indicated changes within the political domain, which would have implied ethical changes within the political leaders themselves. These three elements evidently functioned as an entity, influencing and being influenced by each other.

CHAPTER 4

ETHICS IN THE GOLDEN AGE

During the course of the fifth and fourth centuries B.C.E., the principal influential figures on the notion of ethics were Socrates, Plato and Aristotle. Although each of these figures expressed their individual philosophies of ethics, they all followed a contemplative and rational approach towards the investigation of human behaviour. Their approach was in contrast with their predecessors' conventional methodology based on mythical and poetic approaches towards behavioural studies. Through their reflective and rational approaches towards the nature and welfare of individuals, Socrates, Plato and Aristotle collectively constructed the prototype for philosophical methodologies of ethics (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:94). The Greek doctrine on *ethos* was viewed as something that gives ethical powers to music, poetry and dance, and these had the power to shape and influence someone's character. A modern observer, in the absence of knowledge about the foundations of ancient Greek culture and in particular *Mousikē*, may find this mystical and even absurd. *Mousikē* and its integrated role in a complex cultural life, as demonstrated in Chapter 2 of this research project, contained the values of the society and acted as an active agent in the development of their doctrine of *ethos*. The following section contextualises this statement.

In an effort to express the integrated role of *Mousikē* as part of the Greek's progression towards their doctrine of *ethos*, we must first understand the context in which their doctrine was created. Canto-Sperber (2000a) suggested that political conditions of fifth century B.C.E. facilitated the shift in the Greeks' approach to human behaviour. Intellectuals preceding Socrates's time, as previously noted, followed a mythical and poetic approach to their ethical studies, in contrast with Socrates' rationalism. The Greeks experienced thirty years of continuous warfare, battles amongst classes and political societies, and the effects of the Athenian democracy's radicalization. These extreme political conditions weakened the traditional approaches towards morality, as they introduced immoral principles into the Athenian society (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:99).⁶⁸ After the Peloponnesian War, Athens had to find a way out of the devastating consequences of the battle that left their social harmony on an insecure foundation. They could no longer rely on spoils of successful wars to finance them. The rebuilding of their *polis* and society was their effort to reposition themselves as a people of significance. In the previous chapters, it was established that the resulting Athenian Golden

⁶⁸ In Thucydides' *History of the Peloponnesian War*, detailed explanations on this political crisis exists. Canto-Sperber (2000a) declares: "The fear of a state of growing immorality in which only the appearance of orality exists can be detected in Thucydides'"remarks in his writings (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:99).

Age provided a platform where intellectuals could take part in critical discussions, reflecting on the soul, religion, astronomy, politics and so forth. The art of *Mousikē*, as an integral and prominent element of their culture, was one of the subjects that intrigued philosophers (Murray & Wilson, 2004:4).

Athens produced one of the most notable discourses on the philosophy of music, exploring the ethics of music and its capacity to mould and modify one's soul. Discourses included, amongst others, writings by Plutarch and Thucydides, and further dialogues by Plato. These writings brought about discussions on the ethical theories of music, how its mathematical and expressive qualities came about, and which of these theories were worthwhile. Damon's theories on music and ethics, essentially influenced by the Pythagorean doctrines, were at the centre of this discourse, laying the philosophical groundwork on which prominent figures such as Socrates, Plato and Aristotle would develop their hypotheses on music and the soul (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2016). Regarding philosophical discourses on music and *ethos*, moral education in Greece itself was established through major literary works created before, or during, Socrates's time. Building on this existing foundation of moral education, Greece produced its foremost works on moral philosophy (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:96).

Socrates, Parmenides, Anaxagoras and the teachings of Pythagoras fundamentally influenced Plato's hypothesis on music and the soul. The Pythagoreans' schoolings on the "mathematicising of reality" resonated with Plato's empirical tendencies. Following the death of Socrates, Plato employed the Pythagorean doctrine as a mechanism to formulate Socrates's ethical theories in a mathematical manner. This was done in order to avoid any possible arbitrary interpretations of his work, as Socrates himself had not reached definitive concepts on his philosophical outlook (e.g. beauty, courage, justice). As a result, Plato combined Pythagorean principles together with those of Parmenides and Anaxagoras to create order within the physical world through his theory of Forms (Dillon, 2000:60-61). The reasoning behind Plato's academic effort (to avoid incorrect or arbitrary interpretations of Socrates' effort which led to the theory of Forms) was most probably based on Plato's appreciation of his educator's developments on ethical principles. This is consistent with Plato's belief that formalist led to social harmony. This formalisation is evident in his views on politics as seen in the *Republic* and also in the formation of the Academy which was to influence and shape the young minds according to a very specific curriculum towards Plato's ideal of 'philosopher-kings'. Apart from Plato's exemplification of Socrates's construction of ethics as an independent concept of contemplation, he was also perceived by Cicero as the originator of philosophical viewpoints on ethics, and the first intellectual, according to Aristotle, to pursue classifications within morality. Ethical occurrences in the literature of Sophocles, Euripides and

Thucydides, all which preceded Socrates' rational and non-traditional discussions, challenge this view. Moreover, the ethics and morality as topics of discussion in Greece were in fact already present during the eighth century B.C.E. through the works of Homer, and during the sixth century B.C.E. through the works of Hesiod (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:96-97). The objective of considering other creators and contributors of major philosophical principles is of importance, as it strongly suggests the collective nature of Greek philosophical thought and ethical contemplation.

In this chapter, I commence with a more detailed explanation of the concept of *ethos*, limited in part by an examination of Damon as a principal figure in Athens. I attempt to provide an analysis of his ethical philosophies and the influence thereof on the musical and political life of Athens.

4.1. THE NOTION OF *ETHOS*

4.1.1. Terminology: '*Ethos*'

On an individual level, *Ethos* refers to the character of a person. On an organisational or community level it refers to the culture of that particular group. The character of the individual and the culture of the group become visible through their behaviour. According to Anderson and Mathiesen (2017a), the term *ethos* is generally associated with ancient Greek music, as this expression was frequently used to define the correlation between music and education. In ancient Greece, this connection represented a medium through which ethical beliefs could be delivered. In other words, music was used to give form to the character of the individual and to the behaviour of the collective. Historically, Greek intellectuals such as Hesiod, Homer and Heraclitus used *ethos* in different ways in their writings. It is within the writings of Heraclitus that *ethos* embodied "moral character" (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a). Consequently, *ethos* has been applied as "moral character" throughout this research project. It is further important to note for this project, that the concept '*ethos*' also contains elements such as values, principles and moral codes, and the element of 'ethics'. *Ethos* represents the collective culture or moral character of an individual. The latter is important, as Classical Greek philosophers were concerned with the character of the individual to the extent that it contained the qualities upon which principles of action and moral codes could be built. In this instance, I refer to Socrates who shifted from the traditional ethical discussion founded on exemplars of good behaviour, to an analytical and rational approach based on behaviour and character. His position comes from his belief that virtue could be attained through reasoning (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:102). Ethics suggest the values, principles and moral codes assumed within *ethos*. Although it places limits on behaviour, it is the character of the person that fundamentally explains the behaviour and not the other way around. This is important to note in the context

of politics where a collective has to find ways to live a good life together. The practice of *Mousikē*, as the playing field of the Muses, and its manifestations in music, poetry and dance, played an essential role in shaping the *ethos*, character or soul of the individual and that of the collective towards the good life within the complex components of politics and culture.

Ethics then, ought to be a guide for action towards what Aristotle would have named *eudaimonia*, in simple terms, the 'good life'.⁶⁹ This needs to be emphasised because of Aristotle's significant contribution to ethics. Aristotle participated in studies at Plato's Academy and continued his philosophical endeavours there for twenty years. Although Aristotle remained at the Academy, his theories conflicted with those of Plato (Pellegrin, 2000:556). Plato supposed that philosophers would be the sole true leader, whereas Aristotle considered them as associates to politicians and lawmakers. Aristotle's academic institution, the Lyceum, intended to produce instructors on political virtue, whereas Plato's Academy intended to produce philosopher-kings (Pellegrin, 2000:574). In the modern era, the field of ethics is divided into two streams, namely normative or character ethics, and ethics of conduct. The latter branches off into two, namely consequentialism and deontology. Consequentialists consider that actions are ruled as right or wrong in accordance with the outcome of these actions. In contrast, the deontologists reason that the intent of the action justifies the ruling (Howard-Snyder, 1994:107). Aristotle's ethics represents character ethics or virtue ethics (what kind of people do we want in society?).

In the modern era, Immanuel Kant was an advocate for the ethics of conduct and more specifically, deontology (the good is defined independently from the right). Kant believed that it is essential for an individual to execute their duty based on their devotion to duty alone, and on no account on the good that might come out of executing their duty (Booth, 2008:531). I discuss Kant's ethics of conduct in more detail in Chapter 5 and juxtapose it with Aristotle's virtue ethics. Aristotle held the position that someone's character and the virtues that one's character embodies will determine ethical behaviour. The logical conclusion is that the individual's being, rather than their actions or behaviour, is important. It follows that one's morality is based on who you are, your character. Morality is, therefore, not a function of behaviour. To develop a good person, the purpose of education ought to be "to make men good by bringing reason, habit and nature into harmony" (Schoen-Nazzaro, 1978:266). It is art's role in education to fill all the shortcomings in the individual's nature. Schoen-Nazzaro makes an important point: that according to Aristotle, music "only disposes towards moral

⁶⁹ The notion of *eudaimonia* is further discussed in Chapter 5.

virtue” it does not directly inject the virtue (making the person virtuous) or knowledge. Music moves one emotionally and gives you “only familiarity with, well-ordered emotions”.

4.1.2. Musical modes and Ethos

The belief that music, as an element of *Mousikē*, included the ability to influence one’s soul and character was based on various aspects, including connotations to literary works, rhythmical patterns, musical modes and the type of instrument chosen to portray them. Throughout the ages there have been various doctrines on this subject. The element that connects these diverse doctrines to the “theory of *ethos*” is the belief that music influences the moral character of men, regardless of the platform (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a). The Greeks believed that one’s soul imitated the music around it, and that one’s soul, in turn, influenced one’s character. Accordingly, if the surrounding music (which influences the soul), did not represent ethical elements, the immoral elements could be taken up in one’s character. Thus, the sound of music were thought to reach out and penetrate the soul, educating and shaping it in the process. As stated earlier, Aristotle held a slightly different view. According to him, music only ‘disposed’ the person towards the virtue which would ultimately shape their character (Schoen-Nazzaro, 1978:269). This was one of the four functions Aristotle assigned to music. The other three were giving intellectual enjoyment, imitating emotion and giving pleasure. In comparing the ends that both Plato and Aristotle ascribed to music, Schoen-Nazzaro concludes that both of them meant the same thing, although they may have used different words. They did, however, differ in the emphasis they placed on “music’s power to please” (Schoen-Nazzaro, 1978:271-272).

The soul was not always perceived as an autonomous and immortal presence. It was only during the sixth century B.C.E. that the concept of the soul was more than something simply exiting the mortal body at the time of death. In the time of Plato, the meaning shifted simply to mean “being alive” and the meaning was extended to all living creatures. In this shift, the pleasure of eating, sexual desire, the seat of courage and other characteristics were assigned to the concept of soul and thus became closely associated with *ethos*, character. Traditionally, immortality was only assigned to the gods, a concept distant from mere mortal beings. It is believed that the concept of the immortal soul originated within religious groups, although their specific identities are unknown. Nonetheless, this notion developed into an interlaced element in the ethical reflections of Socrates and Plato, as is seen in the manner in which their philosophies treat it as autonomous (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:97). Plato was a firm believer in imitation (good and bad) and therefore demanded that music be regulated to ensure that the appropriate *ethos* could be developed. He was against complex music and the New Music as he believed it would corrupt the soul and disturb political institutions. This is consistent with his

political moralism, i.e. the design of the Ideal State, a utopian ideal, which also required regulation.

Within this research project, the doctrine of Pythagoras enters the argument, due to its influence on the musical theories of Damon and Plato. The Pythagoreans founded their musical theories on numeric and intervallic principles, proclaiming that the universe was assembled on the numeric values of *harmoniai* (Hardie, 2004:15). The philosophies of Philolaus and Damon are of significance in this respect, as both these intellectual figures followed Pythagorean principles. Philolaus, an eminent Pythagorean philosopher, proclaimed that it was only through the celestial influence of *harmoniai* that the fundamentals of the universe could be communicated to and comprehended by man (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a). Damon, on the other hand, questioned and examined human behaviour in terms of the psychological influence of music and rhythm. Although numerous ancient writers, ranging from historians and philosophers to playwrights, mentioned him in their literary works, it was Plato's *Republic* that cemented his role as a principal music theorist in Athens (Wallace, 2004:249).

In the *Republic*, the intricate aspects of rhythms are discussed with reference to Damon, the best-known music theorist. Socrates also discussed the mimetic aspect of rhythms, noting that suitable rhythmical arrangements are a direct imitation of a good life (Anderson & Mathiesen, 2017a). Plato himself was not concerned with the actual notes or structure of songs, but focused his attention on the appropriate mode choices to enhance ethical behaviour.⁷⁰ He preferred the words of the song to adhere to the same principles set out for "words not set in music" (*Rep.*, 398d), adding the requirement that the rhythm and mode should fit the words. The connection between emotional responses and modes led Plato to make semiotic associations with the modes used in various musical instruments (Senyshyn, 2008:182). These musical modes each represented specific characteristics. The modes mentioned here are the Mixolydian, Syntonolydian, Ionian, Lydian, Phrygian and Dorian.⁷¹ The Mixolydian and Syntonolydian modes were associated with mourning and sorrow. This did not encourage bravery and, consequently these modes did not receive Plato's approval. The Ionian and Lydian modes represented reckless behaviour (drinking songs) and were believed to inspire immoral conduct and therefore were also not suitable for men of just and moral character. The Phrygian and Dorian modes were considered to be representative of the moral principles that all Athenian men should aspire to achieve (Woerther, 2008:91).

⁷⁰ See *Republic* 399a-c (Plato, 1997:1969).

⁷¹ For further reading on *harmoniai* and ethical principles, see Mathiesen's article *Harmonia and Ethos in Ancient Greek Music* (Mathiesen, 1984).

4.2. DAMON: MUSIC THEORIST OR POLITICAL ADVISOR?

In addition to Plato's writings, other prominent figures who praised Damon's intellectual qualities were Isocrates, Aristotle and Plutarch. They voiced their appreciation of his intellect, although Plutarch expressed his suspicions regarding Damon's association with Pericles (Wallace, 2004:249). Consensus on Damon's profession as a music theorist or political advisor (or both) has not yet been reached. Anderson, for example, states that "[Damon's] political counselling had no essential relationship to his musical theorizing" (Anderson, 1955:94). Concerning Anderson's statement, I should re-emphasise the uncertainty around Damon's ostracism: would he have been banished merely because of his theories of music and human behaviour? As ostracisms were traditionally used to protect the democracy from tyranny, could Damon's actions have been linked to tyranny? The logical conclusion would certainly be to suspect some aspect of adverse political involvement, as Wallace makes it clear that this form of punishment originated as a means to eliminate "undesirables who nonetheless had committed no crime." (Wallace, 2004:252). Speculations aside, in the next sections I discuss Damon in both musical and political contexts, in an attempt to portray him as a political music strategist in relation to *ethos*. Damon's position as a political music strategist demonstrates the integrated nature of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics in Athenian culture.

4.2.1. *Damon and music*

In Peter Wilson's essay, *Athenian Strings* (2004), he refers to the ethical principles in music as the *ethos* theory. He vaguely discusses the ethical matter of music, stating that only strings were thought to be an appropriate instrument for citizens to study. He is also of the opinion that Damon was the instigator behind the *ethos* theory. Plato's *Republic* is clear on the matter of strings when Socrates speaks to Glaucon saying: "The lyre and the cithara are left, then, as useful in the city, while in the country, there'd be some sort of pipe for the shepherds to play" (*Rep.*, 399d). Furthermore, and more significantly, Wilson explores Damon's appearance in philosophical discussions amongst figures such as Plato and Socrates, and even as a character in comedy, playing the lyre and tutoring Pericles. His character *Kheiron*, Pericles' educator, was described as using his lyre and musical teachings to conceal his true ambition for tyranny (Wilson, 2004:292-293). The significance of this lies in Damon's apparent importance. The prominence of Damon as a public figure in philosophical writings and drama, demonstrates his influential character. Even Socrates, in wanting to understand which modes to employ, suggested to consult Damon "as to which metrical feet are suited to slavishness, insolence, madness, and the other vices and which are suited to their opposites" (*Rep.*, 400b).

Could Damon have executed his theory of *ethos* through *Mousikē* and politics? The answer remains to be established. However, the speculations about Damon's supposedly Sophistic

activities could perhaps provide the link here, since being a Sophist would have ensured that his ethical theories were being replicated due to the influence he would have had through his teachings. Plutarch and Isocrates referred to “Damon the Sophist”. Anderson states that Plutarch and Isocrates’ label is not necessarily sufficient evidence to show that Damon was a Sophist, but there are factors that support their view. For instance, if one looks at Damon’s acquaintances, Plutarch’s and Isocrates’ label is reinforced (Anderson, 1955:93).⁷² Within the context of morality, it was believed that the Sophists played a fundamental role in the modification of Athens’ values. Prior to the Sophistic movement, instruction on morality was believed to be moulded by either “heroic example” or through the wisdoms of one’s elders. The Sophistic movement thus astounded the Grecian society, embedded in traditional approaches to teaching, by demanding remuneration for their ethical teachings (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:99-100). As such, Plutarch’s and Isocrates’ Damon accusations have merit, as he threatened their conservative values.

In the third book of the *Republic*, Damon’s ethical theories on musical modes are assessed and regarded as truthful. Plato also conveys Socrates’ admiration for Damon’s musical knowledge. Wilson investigates the reasoning behind the significance placed on the instruction of strings of the young Athenian men throughout the course of Classical Greece. He concludes that Socrates’s belief that these young men would profit profoundly from learning this skill (not professionally, merely privately), was sufficient. Within the context of *Protagoras* and *Gorgias*, Wilson further examines the importance of music, with specific focus on the lyre. Within the practice of performing one’s instrument privately, the skill of playing the lyre would enhance the improvement of the soul. The young Athenian men would learn gentleness whilst they were influenced by the rhythms and harmonies of the music. Additionally, their experience of rhythm and harmony would ensure their proficiency in rhetoric and battle (Wilson, 2004:295).⁷³

Furthermore, Socrates’ aversion towards the democratic system becomes clear when examining his constrained and regulated approach towards music. As previously noted in this project, he concurred with Damon’s theory on ethics and the human psyche. Accordingly, and in his aspiration to produce a just society, Socrates selected the Dorian mode (expressing courage and self-control) to be implemented in the musical education of the young. He decreed the Lydian mode (regarded as mournful) unfit for educational purposes and discarded the aulos as an appropriate instrument (Roochnik, 2009:165). Damon’s empirical view of music corresponded with that of his predecessor, Lasos. The latter did not allocate mathematical or abstract significances to music, but rather valued its experimental properties (Wallace,

⁷² Anderson stated that one key figure, namely Agathocles, enhanced the sophistic claims towards Damon, as Agathocles was known as a sophistic music teacher (Anderson, 1955:93).

⁷³ See the *Republic* 399a-e for further reading on the discussion of appropriate modes and instruments.

2015:5). Accordingly, Wallace (2004) argues that no verification exists that would indicate Damon encouraging specific modes of music above others, confirming the correlation between him and his predecessor, Lasos. Instead, he merely examined probable political implications of various rhythms, *harmoniai* and metrics in relation to ethical and behavioural components (Wallace, 2004:267).

4.2.2. Damon and politics

Wallace reviews Plutarch's *Life of Pericles* 4 and notes Plutarch's hostility towards Damon's facade as a music theorist whilst concealing his political agenda from the Athenian society. Plutarch voiced the same opinion as in Plato's *Protagoras*, confirming Plato's acknowledgment of this statement (Wallace, 2004:249-250).⁷⁴ Additionally, Damon was believed not only to convey his political beliefs to Pericles through ethical theories, but to actively participate in political matters through his relationship with Pericles. It was suggested that Athenian citizens, who provided their services to the *polis* in the public courts, should be compensated for their participation. Aristotle acknowledged Damon in this regard, and believed him to be the instigator of this practice (Wallace, 2004:249).

As previously noted, Damon's ostracism has been a point of contention between historians.⁷⁵ Discrepancies include the date of the ostracism, the legitimacy of this event, the political figures present during Damon's hearing and, most importantly, the motive behind his banishment (Wallace, 2015:252). The reasoning behind Damon's banishment is of relevance, as Damon's theories on music and *ethos*, and possibly his sophistic activities in this respect, could in fact be the underlying cause.

In this regard, I turn to Wallace's article, *Damon of Oa: A Music Theorist Ostracized?* (2004), where he acknowledges important writings by Aristotle and Plutarch on this matter. Wallace concludes with four possible motives behind Damon's ostracism. First, according to Plutarch, Pericles' superior manner of rule was considered to be overly domineering and not in accordance with fifth-century democracy. The *demos* thus accused Damon of being *philotyrannos*, due to his Sophistic association with Pericles.⁷⁶ Second, during the fifth century, the *demos* were apprehensive towards politicians appointing substitutes for certain political proceedings or rulings. In this regard, both Aristotle and Plutarch addressed the connection

⁷⁴ See *Protagoras* 339a-e (Plato, 1997:1476-1478).

⁷⁵ Wallace argued that the actual date of Damon's ostracism would have taken place in the years 443/442 B.C.E. He acquired his conclusions from historical records noted in the Platonic dialogues. Wallace stated that although Plato's dialogues are not always accurately chronologically set, the historical information presented within them provides a sufficient time-framework (Wallace, 2004:252).

⁷⁶ See also Wallace's book *Reconstructing Damon* (2015) for further reading on the political accusations (*philotyrannos* and *megalopragmôn*) aimed at Damon (Wallace, 2015:56).

between Pericles and Damon. Aristotle made a direct allegation towards Damon in his writings (*Ath. Pol.* 27.4), revealing that Damon suggested “most of Pericles’ measures”. Furthermore, according to Wallace, Plutarch stated in *Life of Pericles* that Pericles’ deputy-system, assigning masters of rhetoric in various disciplines on his behalf, was characteristic of him. This implied that Damon was certainly not the sole political subordinate. Third, Damon was renowned amongst the Athenian democrats for his *deinotês* (cleverness). Although Athens appealed to countless philosophers and Sophists owing to its engagement with, and encouragement of intellectual matters, the *demos* nonetheless questioned occurrences where they suspected *deinotês* being used to impress conflicting beliefs. Within this context, Damon was believed to have used his rhetorical skills to deceive the Athenians. Lastly, Wallace stated that the ostracism of Thucydides’ son of Melesias has historical correspondence with Damon’s ostracism, as rivalries of Pericles would have been advised to oppose Damon due to their political association (Wallace, 2004:253-256).⁷⁷

⁷⁷ See Wallace (2015:63-64) for further reading on Thucydides’ son of Melesias’ ostracism.

CHAPTER 5

THE CONSTELLATION OF *MOUSIKĒ*, POLITICS AND ETHICS

5.1. CONCLUSIONS AND EVALUATION OF RESEARCH

The focus of this chapter of my research is on the evaluation of the systemic approach of the constellation concept and its contribution to understanding the interconnectedness of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics. I am also a music teacher and subsequently I cannot be an objective observer. I therefore acknowledge the possibility that I am carrying my own values into the research process.

The idea of a constellation conjures up certain questions: Could it have generated simplicity within the *polis* during the fifth century, allowing Athens to transform itself out of its crisis and to thrive within its democratic movement? If so, how did it initially come about and who would have been the principal characters that motivated its expansion into the *polis*? In this instance, I would like to raise the matter of Pericles' success and the improvement of the constitutional laws, as discussed in Section 3.1.2 of Chapter 3. As previously stated, Pericles ruled during Athens' transitional period from crisis to non-crisis. It is of importance to note that Pericles' rule commenced half a century after the development of democracy in response to the requirement for a change in leadership, hence his political position. Owing to Pericles, the strict social hierarchy in terms of non-aristocrats being subservient to aristocrats was demolished. His governance was one of liberation for all Athenian citizens, not solely for aristocrats as was the tradition (Kagan, 1991:3).

Constitutional laws that thrived during Pericles' reign, as previously set out by Cleisthenes and further changed by Pericles, evolved by means of a collective endeavour. Initially, Solon presented a set of laws that would better the Athenian *polis* during the sixth century B.C.E. Although it improved certain aspects, political favour still fell amid the aristocrats. Whilst the initial form of democracy was practised, there arose a time when Athens requested an additional restructuring of the laws, which is where Cleisthenes's laws emerged. His laws would not have been a realistic proposal during Solon's time, as the *polis* had not yet undergone political and social change in order to acknowledge Cleisthenes's proposition for a new democratic system. My argument within this specific context is that the development of the democratic system cannot be ascribed to one individual. Democracy as practised during the Golden era was a result of multiple persons and components that progressed over time. In a similar manner, the occurrence of the constellation did not simply appear during the fifth century. It was not the result of a single ruler's choice of conduct within the *polis*. Rather, it was

shaped, practiced and reformed over centuries within Athens' intriguing demonstration of *paideia*. Within their cultural, social, religious and political activities, a desire for knowledge, progress and *arete* was celebrated and practiced. I argue that *paideia* offered a constructive platform for *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics to form a constellation, through their interconnected qualities within the context of Grecian culture. This constellation became increasingly influential in the Athens. It therefore makes sense that the constellation did not merely evolve with democracy, but played a role in the advancement of democracy advanced.

5.1.1. Contribution of this research

The first contribution of my research is the demonstration of how the constellation theory could be applied to a historical social context. This allowed me not only to contextualise the concepts of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics, but also how these components of the constellation relate to each other. The subsequent contributions will act as testimony of the usefulness of this approach.

Another contribution of this thesis is the creation of new interpretive possibilities. The individual chapters on *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics, consistently opened up into the context of the cultural whole, which included the main intellectual actors of the day. The detail of these concepts was difficult to assess in isolation and made little sense on their own. The value lies in the interconnectedness that suggests synergy. Yet, having looked at the concepts of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics separately in Chapters 2 to 4, allowed for insights into the dynamics of the constellation that acted as a tool for synthesis.

A third contribution is the insight into the complexities of a social system and the war amongst different points of view, interrupted by external events such as war. Connected to the previous insight there is the discovery of how all these activities formed a dominant *ethos* (a moral character-shaping mechanism) by which such a particular social system can be recognised.

A last contribution of this thesis is the possibility of viewing current music education practices through the lenses offered and the lessons learnt with the purpose of applying them in the context of current music education.

5.1.2. Contribution of the constellation approach

The homology between music, the soul, and the state has most to do with the hierarchy of control:
the words of the song must rule the music, the logical part of the soul must rule the emotional,
and the educated elite must rule the masses" – (Csapo, 2004:235).

Engendering new interpretations, i.e. following a hermeneutic approach, is the main objective in applying a constellation perspective on the historic era under review is. For the purpose of this study it suffices to state that hermeneutics is a theoretical approach to discovering an understanding of texts and utterances in a particular context. The word 'homology' used by Csapo (2004) in the above quotation, is a biological term to signal different components having a related or similar structure, thereby possibly alluding to the idea of a constellation without explicitly stating it. In this case, Csapo (2004) identified 'control' as that base structure, i.e. as the logic (*logos*) driving these concepts. My use of the conceptual lenses of the constellation suggests otherwise, i.e. it is more about emergence than a given homology. Homology, in my view, suggests existing structural control bases. Emergence suggests the relationship did not exist before but comes into existence and is visible through the interaction of *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics. My use of emergence does not suggest that these concepts did not each have control as a base structure, but only that they were not of a similar nature. It is only in the confluence of these respective control ends that an overarching or meta-control towards a greater purpose, e.g. the Ideal State, emerges. I conclude that this emergence is forthcoming due to the multitude of interconnected relationships leading up to ends within ends. The following concluding paragraphs demonstrate the complex set of relationships and connections making the constellational system.

My research shows that *Mousikē* played a profound role within late fifth-century Politics and Ethics. Intellectuals in both the fields of Politics and Ethics conducted numerous discourses on the function of *Mousikē*, and especially music itself, in their political and ethical contexts. Referring back to research conducted on sixth-century B.C.E. mathematics, Pythagorean scholars already documented philosophical viewpoints on the notion of music, which included the connection between musical pitches. Moreover, they documented that those musical connections could be denoted into numerical values. Through numerical representation, a relationship was unveiled between music and mathematics, which would consequently be connected and related to astronomy and the cosmos. It was believed that music represented celestial characteristics within the mortal world (Bujčić, 2017). My conclusion is that this belief was an emergence based on the connections the observers of the time made in their context based on their insight.

From a constellation perspective the research shows that it is noteworthy how, in due time, intellectuals such as Damon, Socrates, Philolaus, Plato, Aristotle and Aristides Quintilianus built on the Pythagorean theories and aspired to convey, through their teachings and treatises, their understanding of these celestial characteristics by means of the *Ethos* theory. Regarding these ethical theories, it is in Plato's dialogues (*Alcibiades*, *Laches*, *Republic* and *Axiochus*)

that Damon's influential and respected character becomes apparent. The constellation approach required examining this significant influencer as both the 'political Damon' and the 'ethical Damon'.

Apart from Damon's notable political agendas (e.g. Pericles), as has been established in this project, it was similarly important to establish music's relationship with ethics, with reference to his theory of *ethos*. In an effort to discover this relationship, the meaning of 'ethics' in a collective as well as an individual context first needed to be recognised. Ethics is normally described in close relationship with an individual's values as well as the ruling moral code of a particular context, e.g. Damon's values and his Athenian political playground. Ethics of conduct comes to bear on contexts and situations where there is no definite 'yes' or definite 'no'. The individual and or the collective takes a decision in this grey area and are guided by the reigning moral code. Ethics, from this perspective, goes further than making a choice but it also includes the extent of taking responsibility not only for making the choice but also for the consequences of that choice. The moral philosophy of either the individual or the collective ought to guide ethical behaviour. In the Athenian context, with reference to Aristotle, Plato and Damon, ethics was about virtue, about the character of the person and not his behaviour. This is an important part of understanding the constellation.

It is unclear what Damon's specific ethical objectives were in relation to music. However, his reputation as an esteemed scholar in more than one field implies that he used his ethical studies on music to influence the persons (in various fields) he imparted his knowledge to, in order to shape their moral characters according to his individual *ethos*. Here we start to get a glimpse of the presence of the constellation: If one considers the political, ethical and musical domains that Damon familiarised himself with, one could speculate that he noticed the valuable relationship amongst these three disciplines in shaping an individual's character. Although Damon did not explicitly outline his view on *Mousikē*, it would be safe to assume that it would have been included in the application of his ethical theories, as music, movement and poetry were interlocked with one another.

Discourses on *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics were customary amongst Grecian intellectuals. However, Plato's dialogues suggest that *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics functioned as a constellation. In Chapter 3 of the *Republic*, Plato examined a variety of topics in order to include it in and to benefit his Ideal State. Dancing, poetry and music were systemically discussed and considered for their influential power on the character of men, their souls, and therefore the political welfare of the entire *polis*. Recurring themes throughout this dialogue include justice, beauty and, as established, the soul. In his Ideal State, philosophers ruled over just citizens and all that was considered as beauty was experienced and valued within controlled

parameters. As a consequence of this controlled environment, Plato envisioned that the characters and souls of these citizens would be just and moral, as they were shielded from the unfavourable influences of the unjust.

Ultimately, the verdict was clear: all components that could assist in the realisation of Plato's Ideal State had to be taught to the young through a meticulously structured curriculum. In Plato's Ideal State, these young philosophers would have attended Plato's Academy, where they would find themselves in an intellectually stimulating, albeit controlled environment. The Academy offered studies in various fields, all in service of the enhancement of the Athenian citizens and the political challenges presented in their *polis*. This institution consequently followed a holistic approach that included education in *Mousikē*, Ethics and Politics (Levene, 2013:35). Applying the conceptual lenses of the constellation on this research, Plato's incorporation of the constellation methodology within the Academy curriculum becomes visible, although he himself did not perceive or explain it as a coherent constellation.

Studying Plato's conception of art as beauty, another relationship becomes clear: that his view on *mimesis* directly influenced the manner in which one ought to practise or experience it. In Greece's social structure, the arts played a vital role in everyday life, even to the extent that the social and religious leaders saw it as their duty to protect their citizens by limiting art's influence (Townsend, 2010:59-60). In the *Republic*, the significance of innovation is evident, specifically when discussed within an educational context. It was important to them that music's ethical influence be acknowledged and correctly incorporated in the education of the young philosophers. Consequently, Plato showed a definite aversion towards innovation of any kind, as it had the potential to corrupt the soul (Bujic, 2017).

Furthermore, in the *Republic*, Socrates demonstrated the interconnectedness of the constellation claiming that musical innovation could result in changes to the statutory laws of the state, as mentioned in Chapter 3. Socrates in this regard was referring to and discussing New Music and his aversion to what it symbolised. He did not support the political development of democracy, as it contradicted Athens' traditional way of government. The traditional Athenian government represented order, structure, and social hierarchy and this was reflected in cultural activities such as *Mousikē*. Socrates specifically linked innovation in music to possible ethical changes in the soul of man. In accordance with Plato's and Socrates's philosophy, political leaders at the time were susceptible to these ethical changes. As such, music's integral role in Athenian everyday life potentially posed the danger of negatively influencing all citizens, regardless of social status or political position. When musicians were able to control their music, they were therefore also able to control the *polis*. The tapping of one form of control into the others is notable.

My reference to the term “musician” in this study should be understood as referring to both the composer and the performer, as both these figures had the possibility, as well as the ability, to employ innovation. Lydia Goehr examines this matter further by concentrating on Plato’s advances towards the relationship between the composer and the student and/or performer:

The specific mental characteristics that assign a person to a given sort find expression in corresponding patterns of thinking; these patterns achieve utterance in characteristic forms of poetical speech, and such formal speech evokes a fitting melodic and rhythmical accompaniment. To hear, and especially to perform, the resulting music will tend to re-create the originating mental characteristics, so that the student performer becomes the same sort of person as his composer-teacher. (Goehr et al., 2016)

The same line can be drawn between the young philosopher and the seasoned philosopher. If *mimesis* is approached in a rational manner, where the student imitates the actions of his teacher (assuming to be someone of good moral character), then the young student will create a harmonious life for himself (Mara, 1983:616). Conversely, if young Athenian males imitated the rulers who were not educated, just or moral, they might have created a complex and immoral life for themselves. This subsequently illustrates the urgency of the matter at hand. If musical innovation was not conducted with the utmost care, or, for that matter, if *Mousikē* were not incorporated ethically into the curriculum of all young Athenian males, Socrates anticipated a political future bereft of control, discipline or morals.⁷⁸ Thus, the value of the constellation in Plato’s philosophy is immense (irrespective of him not naming it as such), as he and Socrates wanted to protect their *polis* and the souls of the citizens by recognising and ethically employing the celestial and influential nature of *Mousikē*.

Apart from *Mousikē* emerging as a *leitmotiv* that appears to be interwoven with Politics and Ethics, as has been established throughout this research project, it is their constellational quality that requires attention. First, the perception of the constellation must be discussed, due to the fact that the components of the constellation were present during fifth-century B.C.E. and my research observation through the conceptual lenses of the constellation materialises a few thousand years later. From a modern perspective, the constellation appears almost obvious, thoroughly constructed and implemented to assist Athens out of the economic and political crisis in the late sixth century B.C.E. Yet, this conclusion is the result of the contemporary analytical framework created in this project. My observation is that the constellation is less of a construct to be discovered in the Athenian context and more of a thinking tool applied on the study of the historical context. I consider the ‘constructed’ interlinked cultural, social and political system in Athens to be the reasoning behind the

⁷⁸ See *Republic* 424b5-c6 (Plato, 1997:2008-2009).

constellation approach: *Mousikē* was experienced and practiced in religious, social and political proceedings; the political matters of the *polis* directly influenced both the aristocratic and non-aristocratic citizens and their doings; social and religious rulers became increasingly aware of the ethical theories and their manifestation within their culture, and, therefore, mindful of its implications; many influential, intellectual and political agents participated in this social system.

As has been formerly affirmed, all three components of the constellation needed individual exploration in order to obtain a thorough understanding of their respective influence in ancient Athens. However, their interconnectedness became apparent throughout the respective investigations, which strengthened my theory on their influence during the democratic development as a constellation. Their ensemble as a collective whole played a fundamental part in the development of *paideia*. *Paideia* was representative of the Grecian culture of learning, achieving and *arete* (excellence), and cultivated the aristocratic men of Athens, who in turn would partake in civic duties. It therefore makes sense that these educated men would apply their knowledge in their respective political fields. The importance of the educational curriculum is emphasised, as it could be directly reflected in the political rule of the *polis*. Again, I refer back to Socrates's account of the necessity of *Mousikē* in educational courses, as both the mind and the body would be educated. Thus, it promotes all qualities deemed suitable to generate and shape men of moral character, resulting in a moral and just society. In book nine of the *Republic*, Plato constructed an image of his Ideal State in relation to a moral and just society, and compared it to the Athenian citizen body, which he divided into three segments. According to him, the harmony between the three segments of this citizen body was dependent on the harmonious relationship between the segments of each individual's soul, which consequently shaped the moral foundation of each respective segment of the citizen body. In this instance, Plato again illustrated the importance of musical education for the citizens of his Ideal State, as it would ensure a harmonious soul, social class and Athenian society (Csapo, 2004:235). The key factor within this controlled educational system, controlled rulers and a controlled *polis*, was to strive for simplicity in every facet of an individual's mortal life. If simplicity could be found in beauty and politics, it would result in contented individuals ruled by moral leaders. Accordingly, anything that could possibly jeopardise the simplicity of components within the Grecian culture was disapproved of. In terms of art, it appears as though it was the artist's function to reveal aspects of beauty present within their surrounding world, by way of their artwork. The intention was that the individuals on the receiving end of the artist's work were susceptible to its influence and in return would acquire knowledge regarding the surrounding beauty, albeit from the perspective of the artist (Nettleship, 1967:109-113).

The complexity revealed and suggested by the constellation approach is significant.

5.1.3. Contribution of the research approach

I describe my research as heuristic, deductive and self-reflective. The constellation approach allowed discoveries of interconnectedness in a particular historic social setting. The history is known and well described. What is unknown, is the systemic collaboration of conceptual systems (*Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics) and influence of their interconnectedness in shaping human character and behaviour. One of the questions connected to this research was how to find and understand new ways to elevate private music education beyond technical achievement. Although not part of this study, I as researcher and author live in a context responsible for shaping the character of the youth as responsible members of society. The question is to what extent music education can contribute to character formation. This research suggests particular ways captured in the last part of this chapter.

The constellation theory, as described earlier in this thesis, provided the main premise with which the selected historical social context, *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics, was viewed and researched. It allowed me to test my hypothesis and make observations on the interconnectedness of the constellation components, the notion of emergence and synergy as well as the impact of this synergy on an individual and the collective. It guided me in bringing together different voices in the chosen historical context to offer a rich understanding of the value and contribution of *Mousikē*, Politics and Ethics towards dealing with societal challenges and character development.

Observing the rich learnings from this research allowed me to reflect deeply on my own educational practice of music teaching and to capture these learnings and observations as guides for action. A further outcome is the challenging of my own assumptions and possible changes in my practice, all that would require further formal or informal research.

5.1.4. Conclusions on the application of research insights into current music education

If modern society were able to appreciate the intricate nature of *Mousikē* within the Classical Grecian culture, it would be considered more valuable. Wallace refers to music's role in modern society as an underappreciated "passive thing", absent in everyday life (Wallace, 2004:260). Therefore, the title *The value of the constellation today*, should rather read *The potential value*, as I do not consider the multidimensional qualities of *Mousikē* to be received and employed in modern-day culture to the extent that it could be. Educating the young on moral philosophy and *Mousikē* could generate a philosophical culture that effortlessly incorporates *Mousikē* into various disciplines. Plato's concept of philosopher-kings certainly

has merit, although not necessarily to the extremes that he proposed.⁷⁹ I find merit in the disciplined and introspective nature of philosopher-kings. In teaching the young to be attentive towards society's collective influence on their development as individuals and encourage them to create their own value system by mastering concepts such as *Mousikē*, I believe that moral and just leaders are a possibility. These young philosopher-kings would then have the ability to integrate their value systems into their respective fields (e.g. politics), and in time, lead society on a foundation of justice and morality.

It is at this point that the philosophy of Immanuel Kant becomes important. For Kant, as an exponent of the ethics of conduct, ethics implies more than just a moral character. In J.H. Sobel's article *Kant's Moral Idealism* (1987), he defines moral idealism as "morality with the ideal set of moral rules", where these rules display universal obedience in order to achieve the principle's moral ideal. According to Sobel, Kant's perception of a moral ideal is where favour to an individual is consistent with favour to all (Sobel, 1987:277-278). F.G. Munzel discusses Immanuel Kant's conviction that a society's leaders need to be accomplished in ethics and moral philosophy (Munzel, 2003:44). While I do agree with Kant on moral leadership, I am not convinced that moral leaders can be moulded within an immoral culture. Referring back to Plato's notion of *mimesis*, it seems improbable or unlikely that just leaders will emerge from within an unjust society. As a solution, one could construct an intellectually stimulating and educational environment where philosophers and other intellectuals can teach the young. This teaching could be most advantageous to the young and society. Additionally, their function as role models within society would give the young practical examples of good leadership.

In order to discover the value of the constellation today, a series of questions (in the manner of the Socratic method) must first be asked to obtain a conclusion. Would it be beneficial to incorporate the concept of the constellation within a contemporary educational curriculum? Who will benefit? What would the necessity or value be of the constellation in the current political setting of South Africa? What is the value of the constellation today? In an attempt to answer the first question, I would like to refer to my use of the term *eudaimonia* in the Preface and in Chapter 4. The term, of Greek origin, stems from 'eu' (good/well) and 'daimon' (a spirit's/one's personal fortune), which translates as 'good fortune', 'human flourishing' or 'good life'. Aristotle used the term *eudaimonia* within the context of one who has led a virtuous life. A virtuous life would entail honourable actions (to oneself and others) and a moral character.

⁷⁹ See S. Bickford's chapter "This Way of Life, This Contest': Rethinking Socratic Citizenship" in the publication *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Greek Political Thought* for further reading on the extremist notions on the shaping of the ideal citizen's soul, as presented in the *Republic* for Plato's Ideal State (Bickford 2009:142-143). In the same publication, see also D. Roochnik's *The Political Drama of Plato's Republic* where Socrates' rigid structuring of "the beautiful city" is explored in detail (Roochnik 2009:164-176).

It was Aristotle's belief that a virtuous character will lead to a virtuous life, which in turn would lead to contentment and happiness. In Aristotelean terms, *eudaimonia* was also used to describe an individual who has mastered *arete* holistically, e.g. who lives to enhance his own life, as well as the lives of his community members, within virtuous constraints (Silverman, 2012:100-101).⁸⁰ Canto-Sperber (2000a) relates *eudaimonia* to the soul of man, arguing that pure happiness follows a prosperous soul, consequently obtaining virtue as an award. This portrayal of Greek eudemonism, conveys the harmonious relationship between virtue and happiness (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:112):

One can be both happy and virtuous, since no suffering can deprive the individual of his virtue, which is the objective source of happiness.

If a life based on *eudaimonia* could be accomplished, when would the moral components of virtue, justice, beauty and the soul be introduced? I argue that it is of fundamental importance to introduce these concepts at an early stage. Equipping these philosopher-guardians with virtuous knowledge will encourage reflection on life, a pursuit for *arete*, and a critical mindset. Therefore, my second question, "Who will benefit?" (apart from the young scholars), draws attention to all individuals influenced by these learners. Primarily it will commence with people that they are in direct contact with e.g. parents, siblings, neighbours and friends. Supposing not all persons experience the concept of the constellation as beneficial, there may be an individual who accepts the influence and partakes in his own pursuit of a good life, influencing his own social circle. It would hence be exceptionally beneficial for the young learners, their surrounding elders, and, in time, society as a whole to develop a moral philosophical outlook on life. I do not use the words 'in time' lightly. Realistically, such a specific curriculum could well be met with criticism and apprehension. Even in the case of no resistance, it would take years for these young learners to master the character-shaping curriculum, due to the fact that they have conformed to a different kind of society. Nonetheless, the time component should not be a reason to refrain from incorporating knowledge on the constellation into their philosophical curriculum, from which all of society (in due course) will clearly benefit.

My third question, "What would the necessity or value be of the constellation in the current political setting of South Africa?" requires knowledge of a few of the current political issues in our country. I will not endeavour to examine all political issues at present, but simply bring to light a select few in order to portray the necessity for such an educational system in our country's political (and economic) crisis. Within this context, I turn to Mary Robertson's article

⁸⁰ See P.A. Leven's article "New Music and its Myths: Athenaeus' reading of the Aulos Revolution" for an important interpretation of Aristotle's *Politics* (Book eight) and his inclusion of the aulos in the education of the young, as well as the influence of his philosophies on Athenaeus (Leven, 2010:35-47).

“The constraints of colour: popular music listening and the interrogation of 'race' in post-apartheid South Africa”. Robertson conducts thorough research into the internalization of cultural structures and the transformation thereof in young South Africans. She finds inclinations towards certain types of music as a result of social or cultural pressure to be a principle obstacle within different racial groups.

In her case studies, she found individuals who, despite social conduct, listened to music not traditionally associated with their specific cultural heritage. These individuals break away from what is socially expected of them and transform themselves, and possibly others, to experience and perhaps embrace other cultures (Robertson, 2011). The necessity of the constellation is evident when observing the economic and political inequality in South Africa. There exists a demand for transformation, though the fulfilment of this demand appears challenging. It is at this juncture where the value of the constellation emerges. The significance of music as an expressive vehicle to overcome social and cultural boundaries, is vast. Consequently, *Mousikē* as a transformative platform within a multi-cultural society is attainable. *Mousikē* could be a key factor in the introduction of the constellation in South African educational institutions. To answer my final question, “What, then, is the value of the constellation today?”, I judge its value to be transformative, unbounded by social restrictions. The constellation possesses the potential to alter the course of our future, as it did during Greece’s Golden era.

5.2. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

Throughout this research project, it became apparent that there are topics outside the scope of this project that require further attention. The first recommendation for further research resides in an educational domain. In this context, I refer to Plato’s *Alcibiades*. In this dialogue, Plato constructed a discussion between Socrates and Alcibiades, an ambitious Athenian male, who aspired to become a political leader. Socrates was of the opinion that Alcibiades was uneducated in the fields of virtue and politics, and hence not suitable to become a worthy leader. In an endeavour to convey this information to him, Socrates asked a series of questions. The purpose of these questions was to assist Alcibiades in the process of understanding his own inadequacies. The outcome of this dialogue is not of importance in the current instance. It is the manner in which Socrates conducted his intellectual interrogation, forcing Alcibiades to reflect introspectively and to follow a critical thought process, that motivated this recommendation. I relate this to an educational environment. If one could create an intellectually stimulating environment that follows a holistic approach during lessons, the student could benefit further than the parameters of the specific field. For instance, if a student partakes in an individual music lesson, the teacher could ask a series of questions that would

oblige the student to follow an analytical thought process and possibly introduce other components related to the lesson, e.g. mathematical or physiological components. In pursuit an holistic approach, the student's knowledge within the respective field is broadened and a more perceptive character is built.

The second recommendation likewise falls in the domain of education. It is, however, interdisciplinary: In what way can the education of *Mousikē* be of value in leadership development? This topic requires a thorough examination of the vast field of leadership development and education. The suggestion is to study possible traces of leadership development within each aspect of *Mousikē* (music, dance and poetry) and to attempt to construct a programme where both young students and mature individuals could benefit from it. The concept entails that both mind and body are stimulated (hence the incorporation of *Mousikē*) in order to implement ideal leadership skills. In this instance, attention should be paid to the particulars of the types of music, as well as dances and poetry, as a means to find suitable selections for the purpose of leadership development. At this point, I refer to Yaroslav Senyshyn's article *The Good and Its Relation to Music Education*. Here Senyshyn follows a modern approach to Plato's analysis of which musical modes or instruments are appropriate in the education of the young, although Senyshyn's analytical method is not as harsh as the approach presented in the *Republic*. Rather, he differentiates between "good music and the good *in* music" (Senyshyn, 2008:174).

The last recommendation falls within a political domain. It has been noticeable during the course of my research, that the desire for power within Greece (in both the sixth and fifth century B.C.E.) was characteristic of aristocratic Athenian men, and, after Pericles' instatement during democracy, eventually of non-aristocratic Athenians as well. Aspiring political leaders would seek the services of Sophists, who would teach them the knowledge needed to partake in public office. My recommendation is to evaluate music's (not *Mousikē*'s) role within politics at a time when Greece experienced political tension, in comparison with the political tension currently occurring in South Africa. Could music have benefitted opposite parties by unifying societies or even to obtain power over the people? Are there structures in place within current South African political parties that are benefitting from such a system?

Although there could be additional future research focusing on related aspects, the three abovementioned recommendations could build on the research conducted in the current project.

5.3. FINAL THOUGHTS

After recognising the palpable value of the constellation in the advancement of democracy, I am confronted with the following question: Is the value of *Mousikē* recognised within our modern-day South African society? More specifically, could political parties have put this to use in South Africa in the search for a national *ethos*? The answers remain unclear, as an in-depth exploration would need to be conducted in order to make an informed conclusion. Intuitively, I would suggest that it is not acknowledged as such and therefore not employed.

In the context of our country's current political and economic predicament, it could be beneficial to consider the possibility of incorporating the constellation in the current curriculum of our young learners. From a young age, they would be confronted with the importance of practising control over their minds and bodies. If learners could be taught, at an age still susceptible to philosophical influences, how to (1) operate ethically in various contexts (e.g. social and political), (2) develop a moral consciousness that would assist their critical thought process and decision making, (3) familiarise themselves with the respective disciplines of music, dance and poetry designed to master control over their own minds and bodies, and lastly how to (4) become moral and just leaders with the aspiration to create a moral and just society, then there would appear to be a light in the political darkness. By recognising that we, as individuals, have a duty to ourselves to continuously aspire to become moral citizens, we could contribute to South Africa in its entirety. If this aspiration is absent in the beliefs of our political leaders, it suggests an absence within South African society. The way forward would be to inspire young South Africans to engage in philosophical discourses from an early age and challenge the beliefs of their elders. Canto-Sperber stated (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:103):

...the study of human nature has a moral aspect inasmuch as it sheds light on the normative system present in man himself -to know what a man ought to be is to know the purpose of life.

By educating the young learners of South Africa on the principles of the constellation in order for them to identify their individual leadership skills, and by teaching them how to employ those skills to improve society, we could contribute to the realisation of their own life's purpose. Plato's moral philosophy conveyed that a philosopher is capable of evaluating the good in humanity and the world. The education of the philosopher-kings, as delineated in the *Republic*, would have provided the aspiring political leaders with qualities of "beauty, order and harmony", thus equipping them with the ability to perceive and practise the best way in which to lead society (Canto-Sperber, 2000a:115).

WORKS CITED

Primary Sources

Plato. J.M. Cooper & D. Hutchinson (eds.). 1997. *Plato: Complete Works*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc.

Secondary Sources

Anderson, W. & Mathiesen, T.J. 2017a. *Ethos*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/09055> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].

Anderson, W. & Mathiesen, T.J. 2016. *Damon*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/07129> [Accessed: 5 March 2016].

Anderson, W., Mathiesen, T.J. & Anderson, R. 2017. *Aeschylus*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/51453> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].

Anderson, W. 1966. *Ethos and Education in Greek Music*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Anderson, W. 1955. The Importance of Damonian Theory in Plato's Thought. *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association*, **86**, 88-102.

Anderson, W., Mathiesen, T.J. & Anderson, R. 2017. *Aeschylus*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/51453> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].

Annas, J. 2000. Plato. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 672-692.

Balcer, J.M. 1989. The Persian Wars against Greece: A Reassessment. *Historia: Zeitschrift für Alte Geschichte*, **38**(2), 127-143.

Baltes, M. 1993. Plato's School, the Academy. *Hermathena*, **155**, 5-26.

Barker, A. 2004. Transforming the Nightingale: Aspects of Athenian Musical Discourse in the Late Fifth Century. In: P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and the Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 185-204.

Bickford, S. 2009. *"This Way of Life, This Contest": Rethinking Socratic Citizenship*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Bodéüs, R. 2000. The Statesman as Political Actor. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 125-146.

Booth, A.R. 2008. Deontology in Ethics and Epistemology. *Metaphilosophy*, **39**(4/5), October, 530-535.

Brisson, L. 2000. Platonism. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 893-917.

Brunschwig, J. & Lloyd, G.E. (eds.). 2000. *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.

Bujić, B. 2017. *Aesthetics of Music*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/opr/t114/e90> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].

Burkholder, J.P., Grout, D.J. & Palisca, C.V. 2006. *A History of Western Music*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, Inc.

Canto-Sperber, M. 2000a. Ethics. In J. Brunschwig & G.E.R. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University, 94-121.

Canto-Sperber, M. 2000b. Socrates. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 745-762.

Carawan, E. 1998. *Rhetoric and the Law of Draco*. New York: Oxford University Press Inc.

Carcieri, M.D. 2003. A Twenty-First Century Intervention in the trial of Socrates. *The Classical Outlook*, **80**(4), Summer, 137-142.

- Cartwright, M. 2013. *Greek Music*. [Online]. Available: http://www.ancient.eu/Greek_Music/ [Accessed: 3 March 2016].
- Cartwright, M. 2012. *Muse*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.ancient.eu/muse/> [Accessed: 3 March 2016].
- Cassin, B. 2000. Sophists. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 957-976.
- Chroust, A. 1967. Plato's Academy: The First Organized School of Political Science in Antiquity. *The Review of Politics*, **29**(1), 25-40.
- Comotti, G. 1989. *Music in Greek and Roman Culture*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Csapo, E. 2004. The Politics of the New Music. In: P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and The Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press Inc, 207-248.
- Curren, R. 1996. *Philosophy of Education: An Encyclopedia*. [Online]. Available: <http://search.credoreference.com.ez.sun.ac.za/content/entry/routpe/paideia/0> [Accessed: 20 August 2015].
- Dickenson, G.L. 1947. *Plato and his Dialogues*. West Drayton Middlesex: Penguin Books.
- Dillon, J. 2000. The Question of Being. In J. Brunschwig & G.E.R. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 51-71.
- Dombrowski, D.A. 1981. Atlantis and Plato's Philosophy. *Apeiron: A Journal for Ancient Philosophy and Science*, **15**(2), 117-128.
- Farrar, C. 2007. Power to the People. In K.A. Raafaub, J. Ober & R.W. Wallace (eds.), *Origins of Democracy in Ancient Greece*. Berkeley and Los Angeles (California): University of California Press, 170-195.
- Finer, S.E. 2007. *The History of Government from the Earliest Times: Ancient Monarchies and Empires*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Fornara, C.W. & Samons II, L.J. 1991. *Athens from Cleisthenes to Pericles*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press.
- Garvie, A. 1937. Reflections on Plato's Republic. *Philosophy*, **12**(48), 424-431.

- Geertz, C. 1973. *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books.
- Gill, C. 1973. The Death of Socrates. *The Classical Quarterly*, **23**(1), May, 25-28.
- Gilloch, G. 2002. *Walter Benjamin: Critical Constellations*. Malden: Blackwell Publishers Inc.
- Goehr, L., Sparshott, F., Bowie, A. & Davies, S. 2016. *Philosophy of Music, §II: Historical Survey, Antiquity-1750*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/52965pg2> [Accessed: 5 March 2016].
- Grant, M. & Hazel, J. 2002. *Who's who in Classical Mythology*. [Online]. Available: <http://ez.sun.ac.za/login?url=http://search.credoreference.com.ez.sun.ac.za/content/entry/rou twwcm/muses/0> [Accessed: 5 August 2015].
- Hall, J.M. 2007. Polis, Community, and Ethnic Identity. In H. Shapiro (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion To Archaic Greece*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 40-60.
- Hardie, A. 2004. Muses and Mysteries. In P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and the Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 11-37.
- Hodder, A. 2006. *The Essentials of Philosophy and Ethics*. [Online]. Available: <http://ez.sun.ac.za/login?url=http://search.credoreference.com.ez.sun.ac.za/content/entry/hod derepe/arete/0> [Accessed: 20 August 2015].
- Howard-Snyder, F. 1994. The Heart of Consequentialism. *Philosophical Studies: An International Journal for Philosophy in the Analytic Tradition*, **76**(1), 107-129.
- Johansen, T.K. 2004. *Plato's Natural Philosophy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kagan, D. 1991. *Pericles of Athens and the Birth of Democracy*. New York: The Free Press.
- Kenny, A. (ed.). 1997. *The Oxford Illustrated History of Western Philosophy*. New York: Oxford University Press Inc.
- Kirby, J.T. 2000. *Secrets of the Muses Retold: Classical Influences on Italian Authors of the Twentieth Century*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Krentz, P. 2007. Warfare and Hoplites. In H. Shapiro (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 61-84.

- Lagasse, P. 2015. *The Columbia Encyclopedia*. [Online]. Available: http://search.credoreference.com.ez.sun.ac.za/content/entry/columency/arcadia_region_of_ancient_greece/0 [Accessed: 20 August 2015].
- Landels, J. 1999. *Music in Ancient Greece and Rome*. London: Routledge.
- Larham, D. 2012. *The Meaning in Mimesis: Philosophy, Aesthetics, Acting Theory*. New York: Columbia University.
- Leven, P.A. 2010. New Music and its Myths: Athenaeus' reading of the Aulos Revolution. *The Journal of Hellenic Studies*, **130**, 35-47.
- Levene, L. 2013. *I Think, Therefore I am*. United Kingdom: Michael O'Mara Books Limited.
- Levin, F.R. 2017. *Philolaus*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/21585> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].
- Lord, C. 1978. On Damon and Music Education. *Hermes*, **106**(1), 32-43.
- Magee, B. 2010. *The Story of Philosophy*. London: Dorling Kindersley Limited.
- Mahoney, T.A. 1998. Socrates' Loyalty to Athens and his Radical Critique of the Athenians. *History of Philosophy Quarterly*, **15**(1), 1-22.
- Mara, G.M. 2009. *Thucydides and Political Thought*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Mara, G.M. 1983. Politics and Action in Plato's Republic. *The Western Political Quarterly*, **36**(4), 596-618.
- Mathiesen, T.J. 2017. *Aristides Quintilianus*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/01244> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].
- Mathiesen, T.J. 2016. *Paideia*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/20709> [Accessed: 6 March 2016].
- Mathiesen, T.J. 1984. Harmonia and Ethos in Ancient Greek Music. *The Journal of Musicology*, **3**(3), 264-279.

- Mathiesen, T.J., Conomos, D., Leotsakos, G., Chianis, S. & Brandl, R.M. 2017. *Greece*. [Online]. Available: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/11694-pg1> [Accessed: 10 August 2017].
- McClelland, J. 1996. *A History of Western and Political Thought*. London: Routledge.
- Meier, C. 1990. *The Greek Discovery of Politics*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Meritt, B.D. 1971. The Chronology of the Peloponnesian War. *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, **115**(2), 97-124.
- Mulsow, M. & Stam, M. 2005. *Konstellationsforschung*. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp Verlag.
- Munn, M.H. 2000. *The School of History: Athens in the Age of Socrates*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Munzel, G.F. 2003. Kant on Moral Education, or "Enlightenment" and the Liberal Arts. *The Review of Metaphysics*, **57**(1), September, 43-73.
- Murray, P. & Wilson, P. 2004. Introduction: Mousikē, not Music. In P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and The Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press Inc., 1-8.
- Murray, P. & Wilson, P. (eds.). 2004. *Music and the Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press Inc.
- Neer, R.T. 2007. Delphi, Olympia, and the Art of Politics. In H.A. Shapiro (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece*. New York: The Cambridge University Press, 225-264.
- Nettleship, R.L. 1967. *Lectures on the Republic of Plato*. New York: St Martin's Press.
- Ober, J. 2015. *The Rise and Fall of Classical Greece*. Princeton (New Jersey): Princeton University Press.
- Ober, J. 2007. "I Besieged That Man": Democracy's Revolutionary Start. In K.A. Raaflaub, J. Ober & R.W. Wallace (eds.), *Origins of Democracy in Ancient Greece*. Berkeley and Los Angeles (California): University of California Press, 83-104.
- Ostwald, M. 2000. Thucydides. In: G.E. Lloyd & J. Brunschwig (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Classical Guide to Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 763-778.

- Parker, V. 2007. Tyrants and Lawgivers. In H. Shapiro (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Parry, R. 2014. *Episteme and Techne*. [Online]. Available: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/episteme-techne/#2> [Accessed: 4 March 2016].
- Paxson, T.D. 1985. Art and Paideia. *Journal of Aesthetic Education Special Issue: Paestum and Classical*, **19**(1), 67-78.
- Pellegrin, P. 2000. Aristotle. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Guide to Classical Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 554-575.
- Plato. 2007. *The Republic*. London: Penguin Group.
- Pole, W. 1924. *The Philosophy of Music*. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company.
- Raaflaub, K.A. 2007a. The Breakthrough of Demōkratia in Mid-Fifth-Century Athens. In K.A. Raaflaub, J. Ober & R.W. Wallace (eds.), *Origins of Democracy in Ancient Greece*. Berkeley and Los Angeles (California): University of California Press, 105-154.
- Raaflaub, K.A. 2007b. Introduction. In K.A. Raaflaub, J. Ober & R.W. Wallace (eds.), *Origins of Democracy in Ancient Greece*. Berkeley and Los Angeles (California): University of California Press, 1-21.
- Robertson, M. 2011. The constraints of colour: popular music listening and the interrogation of 'race' in post-apartheid South Africa. *Popular Music*, **30**(3), 455-470.
- Rocconi, E. 2010. *Music in Plato's Laws*. Pavia: University of Pavia.
- Roochnik, D. 2009. The Political Drama of Plato's Republic. In S. Salkever (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Greek Political Thought*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 156-177.
- Roochnik, D. 2001. The Deathbed Dream of Reason: Socrates' Dream in the Phaedo. *Arethusa*, **34**, 239-258.
- Salkever, S. (ed.). 2009. *The Cambridge Companion to Ancient Greek Political Thought*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Schoen-Nazzaro, M.B. 1978. Plato and Aristotle on the Ends of Music. *Laval théologique et philosophique*, **34**(3), 261-273.

Sealey, R. 1987. *The Athenian Republic: Democracy or the Rule of Law?* University Park (Pennsylvania): The Pennsylvania State University Press.

Senyshyn, Y. 2008. The Good and Its Relation to Music Education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, **16**(2), 174-192.

Sesonske, A. 1969. *Plato's Republic*. Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company.

Shapiro, H.A. 2007. Introduction. In H.A. Shapiro (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Archaic Greece*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1-9.

Shorey, P. 1934. *What Plato Said*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Silverman, M. 2012. Virtue Ethics, Care Ethics, and "The Good Life of Teaching". *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, **11**(2), 96-122.

Smith, G. 1922. Early Greek Codes. *Classical Philology*, **17**(3), July, 187-201.

Sobel, J.H. 1987. Kant's Moral Idealism. *Philosophical Studies: An International Journal for Philosophy in the Analytic Tradition*, **9**, 52(2), 277-287.

Speake, J. & Bergin, T. 1987. *The Encyclopedia of the Renaissance*. [Online]. Available: <http://ez.sun.ac.za/login?url=http://search.credoreference.com.ez.sun.ac.za/content/entry/hodderepe/arete/0> [Accessed: 6 August 2015].

Stadter, P.A. 1991. Pericles Among the Intellectuals. *Illinois Classical Studies*, **6**(1/2), 111-124.

Stanford, W. 1981. Sound, Sense, and Music in Greek Poetry. *Greece & Rome*, **28**(2), 127-140.

Sullivan, J. 2001. A Note on the Death of Socrates. *The Classical Quarterly*, **51**(2), 608-610.

Szlezák, T.A. 1999. *Reading Plato*. Abingdon (Oxon): Routledge.

Thompson, N. 2009. *Most Favored Status in Herodotus and Thucydides: Recasting the Athenian Tyrannicides through Solon and Pericles*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Townsend, D. 2010. *The A to Z of Aesthetics*. Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc.

Wallace, R.W. 2015. *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom Teaching, and Politics in Perikles' Athens*. 1st Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wallace, R.W. 2007. Revolutions and a New Order in Solonian Athens and Archaic Greece. In K.A. Raafaub, J. Ober & R.W. Wallace (eds.), *Origins of Democracy in Ancient Greece*. Berkeley and Los Angeles (California): University of California Press, 49-82.

Wallace, R.W. 2004. Damon of Oa: A Music Theorist Ostracized? In: P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and the Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 249-267.

Wardy, R. 2000. Rhetoric. In J. Brunschwig & G.E. Lloyd (eds.), *Greek Thought: A Classical Guide to Knowledge*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 465-485.

Webster, T.B.L. 1939. Greek Theories of Art and Literature down to 400 B.C. *The Classical Quarterly*, **33**(3/4), 166-179.

West, M. 1992. *Ancient Greek Music*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

White, N.P. 1979. *A Companion to Plato's Republic*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Wilson, P. 2004. Athenian Strings. In: P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and the Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 269-306.

Woerther, F. 2008. Music and the Education of the Soul in Plato and Aristotle: Homoeopathy and the Formation of Character. *The Classical Quarterly* (New Series), **58**(1), May, 89-103.

Wohl, V. 2004. Dirty Dancing: Xenophon's Symposium. In: P. Murray & P. Wilson (eds.), *Music and the Muses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 337-363.

Wulstan, D. 1971. The Earliest Musical Notation. *Music & Letters*, **52**(4), October, 365-382.