The development and expansion of urban theory has drawn upon the experiences of a handful of “global” or “world” cities in the developed north. Conversely, cities of the south have been interpreted and theorised through the lens of development theory. Seldom, if ever, are these two different conceptual realms seen as mutually constitutive – theorised within the same discursive realm, adding a more complete understanding of how cities function and change.

A similar observation can be made about how our understanding of cities in the developing south have evolved. Large cities in more “influential” developing countries are nearly always the empirical base from which our understanding of cities in the south takes place. The collection of essays in this book is set against the backdrop of calls for a more inclusive theorisation and understanding of cities, that transcend the dichotomous urban narrative which characterises current academic and policy engagements with cities. Drawing on the experiences of a secondary city in South Africa - Bloemfontein - this collection of essays argues that the realities of unremarked upon, ordinary cities both challenge and reinforce a number of debates in urban theory and development theory.
Spatialities of urban change

Selected themes from Bloemfontein at the beginning of the 21st century

Lochner Marais
&
Gustav Visser (eds)
Content

List of contributors .......................................................................................................... i
 Preface ............................................................................................................................. iii
 CHAPTER 1: The spatial development of Bloemfontein: past and future conflicts ....................... 1
 CHAPTER 2: Changing inequality in post-apartheid Bloemfontein: urban management achievements and challenges ................................................................. 15
 CHAPTER 3: Revitalising the Bloemfontein CBD: prospects, obstacles and lost opportunities .................................................................................................................. 35
 CHAPTER 4: Inner-city residential change in Bloemfontein after apartheid: a perspective on those who did not flee desegregation ............................................... 53
 CHAPTER 5: The evolution of Bloemfontein’s Westdene: the changing anatomy of a neighbourhood ............................................................................................................. 75
 CHAPTER 6: An evaluation of post-apartheid housing delivery in Mangaung: a view from local government .......................................................................................... 97
 CHAPTER 7: Urban tourism in Bloemfontein: current dynamics, immediate challenges and future prospects .......... 115
 CHAPTER 8: Volksblad Arts Festival: reflections on the product, people and impacts ....................... 135
 CHAPTER 9: Transforming Christian churches into community-based resource centres, with reference to Bloemfontein ................................................................. 155
 CHAPTER 10: Bloemfontein and its future development: towards a research agenda .............................................................. 183
List of Contributors

Gijsbert Hoogendoorn is Junior Lecturer in the Department of Geography, University of the Free State

Mark Ingle is a research associate at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Skip Kringe is a research associate at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Molefi Lenka is a researcher at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Lochner Marais is Professor at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Malefetsane Mokoena is a postgraduate student at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Deidre Van Rooyen is a researcher at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Anita Venter is a researcher at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State

Gustav Visser is Associate Professor in the Department of Geography, University of the Free State
In her seminal text, *Ordinary Cities*, Jennifer Robinson (2006) argues that with the urbanisation of the world’s population proceeding apace and the equally rapid urbanisation of poverty, urban theory has an urgent challenge to meet if it is to remain relevant to the majority of cities and their populations, most of which are outside the West. She proposes a different way of looking at cities, the key contention being that cities are best understood as ordinary. The argument is that the categorisation and labelling of cities as Western, Third World, developed, developing, world or global should be re-imagined and theorised as a world of ordinary cities, which are all dynamic and diverse, if conflicted, arenas of social and economic life. Those interested in cities will be well aware that this categorisation leads to researchers ascribing prominence to very specific cities and to certain features of cities. The complexities of those cities prominent in global capital accumulation and control, for example, reign supreme and they are the subject of the case studies from which urban theory is extrapolated. The vast majority of cities, which Robinson (2002) elsewhere describes as “cities off the map”, are seldom included in that particular realm of understanding cities. Those “other cities” are viewed through the lens of development theory and they might only one day – once they have developed – be drawn upon as potentially enriching “urban theory”.

Urban theorists have over time divided cities into two broad categories: those that are modern and thus the focus of contemporary urban theory; and those that are developing and consequently theorised within development studies. To be fair, the evolving spatialities of some developing world cities, such as Cairo, Johannesburg or Mexico City might at times be deployed in urban theory, but then nearly always as indicative of processes generated and unleashed by the “important” global urban leaders such as London or New York. However, urban theory is seldom generated by the changing fortunes of those cities. Notwithstanding, and albeit within the realm of developmental theory, some of the hierarchal features of these theoretical engagements with the city are equally present within urban scholars’ approach to understanding cities in the amorphous theoretical terrain of urbanism in “the global South”. These cities mostly assume a similarly hegemonic role, but then within the realm of thinking about cities in the South. The changing spatialities of Bangkok, Jakarta, São Paulo or Johannesburg are treated, from that theoretical vantage point, as vastly more significant to understanding cities in the South. The realities of what urban means in thousands of other cities are simply ignored. As London, Los Angeles and New York are central to urban theory, and Johannesburg or Buenos Aires not, the very same changing realities of Johannesburg and Buenos Aires within developmentalist understandings of the city are of key importance, whilst the realities of Mombassa and Nairobi, for example, are not.

The contours of these debates hold direct relevance to the way we have come to understand South African cities. Indeed, much of our understanding of “the city” is either (or in combination) overshadowed by the realities of a range of “global cities”, or alternatively, our comprehension of South African urban areas is framed by the realities of its three main metropolitan areas – Cape Town, Durban and Johannesburg. These cities have been the primary investigatory sites of a very significant body of research, with all
manner of urban phenomena ably relayed through their rapidly changing spatialities. As has been argued elsewhere (Visser, 2003), this is not altogether surprising. Being the key metropolitan regions of southern Africa, and indeed the African continent, and in view of the ease with which discussion of them interlinks with perennial developmentalist debates concerning the uneven distribution of natural and human resources, this is both predictable and necessary. However, as our understanding of “the urban” from a theoretical perspective has been reduced to the realities of only a handful of cities in the “developed world”, a similar claim might be made in the context of South Africa. A consequence of this dominance has been that our understanding of South Africa’s urban realities has become skewed towards the realities of very particular metropolitan regions, while the diverse issues prevailing in other urban areas are overlooked.

The core of Robinson’s critique of theoretical understandings of cities comprises a very significant postcolonial onslaught on the parochialism of these contemporary practices in urban theorisation. The intellectual project that she proposes is highly complex, yet her contentions also have some very practical implications. The first practical implication of this project would be an engagement with cities less often, or very seldom, remarked upon in contemporary urban research. The intellectual project of knowing what happens in “cities off the map” is seen as being as intrinsically important as knowing what happens at the parochial core of Western urban theory. The second project in which the future growth of more inclusive, postcolonial urban theorisation is located is a re-visitation of those comparative urban studies so central to our understanding of cities half a century ago (Robinson, 2006). In short, there is value in interpreting urban change in other “off the map” places and a further imperative to compare and contrast those new perspectives with a whole range of cities. In that way future theorisation of “the city” will not only be more inclusive, but decidedly more rigorous.

It is against this postcolonial backdrop that the collection of essays assembled in this book aims to make a contribution to understanding the realities of urban centres that feature less frequently in the academic press. The research reported in this collection echoes and highlights many of the themes found in both the urban theory derived from the realities of many “world cities”, and in the challenges remarked upon in the development theory found in much of the work focused on South Africa’s main metropolitan regions. However, the exploration of these issues on a different scale and in a different locational context also features different perspectives on South Africa’s changing urban society, its problems and its challenges.

The themes investigated in this collection are admittedly limited. Indeed, they reflect the interests of a handful of researchers based at the University of the Free State and are in large part the result of consultancy research on behalf of both the Mangaung Municipality in which Bloemfontein is located, and of the Free State provincial government. Nevertheless, we see this as a starting point for an evolving project in which the realities of urban South Africa beyond the main metropolitan heartlands are investigated.
Preface

The imprint of the inequalities and uneven development of both the colonial and the apartheid eras has a long history and has had a profound impact upon the South African urban form. Chapter 1 provides an overview of the Mangaung urban morphology and argues that the evidence from the Bloemfontein example suggests that fundamental changes to the settlement landscape are highly unlikely – especially with regard to informal settlements and to the places where poor people reside. This reality requires far more creative ways of planning. In addition, it is argued that there are many inherent contradictions in government planning frameworks, which are not conducive to the establishment of a coherent approach to the spatial restructuring of Bloemfontein and the Bloemfontein-Botshabelo-Thaba Nchu region (BBT region) (Figure 1). Chapter 2 elaborates on some of these concerns, examining the changing patterns of inequality in Bloemfontein mainly by making use of census data. These changing patterns of inequality in Bloemfontein are mirrored against international and national trends in respect of inequality. The results show increasing inequality for the three areas under consideration between 1991 and 1996, but decreasing inequality between 1996 and 2001, and between 1991 and 2001. Two main reasons for the decrease in inequality since 1991 are advanced. The chapter first suggests that both increased mobility and increased access for domestic workers is probably a significant reason. However, more importantly, the second reason is probably related to the fact that increased service delivery ensured that the comparative infrastructure situation was significantly better in Mangaung in 2001 than in 1991. Considering this decrease in inequality, it is suggested in this chapter that two longer-term questions should be asked in this respect. The one relates to the financial sustainability of the provision of infrastructure with infrastructure standards which are unaffordable for a large percentage of the population. In addition, the need to maintain these standards will place increasing pressure on municipalities to ensure efficient technical maintenance of the engineering plants that support water and sanitation provision. Secondly, it probably overemphasises development as something to be delivered by the state.

These concerns are relevant to all parts of the city; however, specific districts confront very specific challenges, not least of which is the Central Business District (CBD). Internationally, the past three decades have witnessed the development of an extensive literature on CBD decline, focusing on why such decay sets in and on which strategies and policies might be deployed to stimulate the revitalisation of these areas. In the South African context a small but significant body of literature has developed which chronicles both CBD decline and the subsequent revitalisation strategies deployed to reverse such decline. Similar to the international experience, the focal point has been South Africa’s main metropolitan regions, whilst secondary cities have mainly remained beyond the focus of investigation. Chapter 3 aims to provide an outline of the prospects and obstacles that face CBD revitalisation in a secondary city such as Bloemfontein. It is argued that, whilst generic revitalisation programmes in cities such as Cape Town and Johannesburg have seemingly stemmed further CBD decline, other strategies might be required in secondary cities such as Bloemfontein.
Figure 1 Bloemfontein’s main suburbs and townships
Racial desegregation has, very literally, changed the face of the South African inner city. However, as highlighted in Chapter 4, despite the voluminous body of work available on these changing residential environments, none of the relevant conceptual or more empirical studies have focused specifically on how the white cohorts of the population have experienced residential desegregation. Indeed, one might go as far as to suggest that re-segregation has occurred in some parts of South African cities. In many cities whites-only areas have been replaced by desegregated residential areas. However, current trends in Bloemfontein suggest that, although a considerable increase in the levels of desegregation has been registered over the past decade, there is still no indication that the majority of whites are likely to flee the CBD, as their counterparts have done in, for instance, Johannesburg or Pretoria. Taking these factors into consideration, as well as the dearth of research regarding white inner-city geographies in South Africa, the aim of Chapter 4 is to examine the white cohorts remaining in the CBD. In essence, this chapter is presented as a work in progress rather than as a final product. Its aim is to initiate debate regarding the remaining white populations in inner-city areas.

Whilst there has been research on inner-city change, whether related to the economic base or the racial composition of its residents, a similar claim cannot be made for suburban residential neighbourhoods. Chapter 5 develops from the standpoint that neighbourhoods have not been the object of much research interest until comparatively recently. Internationally the paucity of research is now being addressed through a steady flow of new contributions. In South Africa, however, neighbourhoods remain largely ignored in the academic press. The aim of this chapter is to make a contribution towards gaining greater insight into the development of South African neighbourhoods. Drawing on a detailed analysis of the Bloemfontein neighbourhood of Westdene, it shows that post-apartheid neighbourhoods are diverse and fragmented urban spaces fulfilling very many different functions. In the process, our conceptual understanding of the concept of neighbourhood has to be adjusted from one representing a relatively homogenous residential urban space to one that incorporates a diverse range of urban functions.

Chapter 6 shifts the focus of the investigation away from Bloemfontein’s former white neighbourhoods and their middle-class comforts to those places where there is a severe lack of housing, and in respect of which the use of concepts such as *neighbourhood* somehow seems inappropriate. This chapter examines post-apartheid housing delivery in the Mangaung Local Municipality – previously known as the Bloemfontein-Botshabelo-Thaba Nchu region. The chapter assesses housing delivery against the background of existing literature on housing delivery, as evaluated from a city perspective, as well as against the notion of cooperative governance. It is suggested that various guidelines from policy and practice at the provincial level impact negatively on housing delivery at the local level. Furthermore, it is argued that despite some innovative attempts to address aspects of informal settlement upgrading, integrated housing development and participation have not received adequate attention. The chapter also questions the lack of appropriate guidelines in respect of housing delivery in some of South Africa’s hidden urbanities.
The changing nature of both the global and the local economy has prompted countless city managers to reform and refocus their economic base. A common strategy has been the development and expansion of urban tourism and the leisure economy. Similarly, South African cities have turned towards the tourism economy to provide new economic opportunities in the face of flagging post-industrial urban economies. Notwithstanding the emergence of urban tourism as a key economic driver in many South African cities and towns, there is a paucity of research focused specifically on urban tourism. The small body of research focused on South Africa’s urban places as tourist destinations is mainly concerned with urban tourism in the country’s metropolitan areas. Secondary cities, such as Bloemfontein, have to date received only scant research attention. In the context of such research neglect, Chapter 7 focuses on the urban tourism system of Bloemfontein. Drawing both on survey material and secondary data sources, the chapter provides an outline of the Bloemfontein tourism economy. Particular attention is devoted to different tourism types and their spatial distribution. After that there is an overview of obstacles to various tourism developments as experienced by product providers and potential support mechanisms are detailed. Finally, a tourism development strategy is set out.

Chapter 8 expands the urban tourism focus and provides greater insight into a component of many urban tourism development strategies — that of presenting festivals. This chapter aims to make a contribution to the sparse South African research literature focused on arts festivals, the persons who attend these events, and the types of impacts associated with them. The chapter analyses the development of the Volksblad Kunstefees staged annually in Bloemfontein. The investigation provides insights into the identity of the festival-goers, as well as to the way in which they engage with the festival both socially and economically.

Chapter 9 demonstrates how a church-based community development process, in which congregations in Bloemfontein (and elsewhere) play a pivotal role, can be transformed into community-based resource centres. It is argued that the church is not only the most representative institution in South Africa, but also geographically the most widely distributed body, penetrating every area of urban and rural community life, and thus ideally positioned to act as a community-based resource centre. A transformational-servant-community-outreach model was designed, based on international and national experience of faith-based involvement in community development. This model correlates favourably with the principles of alternative development and accommodates the approaches of Korten’s third- and fourth-generation, asset-based community development, and development as transformation. The challenge for local congregations is to apply the elements of this model to their local context by becoming community-based resource centres operational every day of the year from which spiritual and human resources can potentially be released into the neighbouring communities. Church action towards community development may contribute significantly to the establishment of a culture of local developmental governance.

Finally, Chapter 10 draws the reported research together and then looks to the future development of Bloemfontein. In addition, the outline of a research agenda focused on this city is provided.
REFERENCES


The spatial development of Bloemfontein: past and future conflicts

1. INTRODUCTION

Apartheid planning has left the South African landscape with highly segregated urban areas. Donaldson and Marais (2002: 1) argue that “South Africa’s urban areas entered the 1990s with a legacy of segregationist planning and racially imbalanced land occupancy relationships”. However, as South African society was being transformed in terms of a democratic dispensation, it was hoped that a more socially just, spatially integrated society would be created, along with compact cities. More than 13 years after the democratic transition, the results are far from conclusive. At the same time, there is an ever-increasing body of academic literature in which the processes and obstacles with regard to “spatial normalisation” in South Africa are continually being assessed (see, for example, Donaldson, 1999; Marais and Donaldson, 2002; Harrison et al., 2003). The majority of these studies suggest that changing the geography of the apartheid city is no easy task, and that in some cases this transformation may never happen. The reasons for this state of affairs are probably manifold. Could the situation be the result of poor policies and/or the neo-liberal nature of policy (see Bond, 2003) – or have other factors played a role during policy implementation? More importantly, should we change our approach towards the spatial restructuring issue?

Against this background the chapter aims to assess the post-apartheid spatial trends and policies in Bloemfontein and to identify new spatial conflicts. Two arguments are put forward in the chapter. First, the evidence from the Bloemfontein example suggests that fundamental changes to the settlement landscape are highly unlikely – especially with regard to informal settlements, where poor people reside. This reality requires far more creative ways of planning. Secondly, I suggest that there are many inherent contradictions in government planning frameworks, which are not conducive to the establishment of a coherent approach to the spatial restructuring of Bloemfontein and the Bloemfontein-Botshabelo-Thaba Nchu region (BBT region).

With a view to exploring the spatial trends and policies in the BBT region (see Figure 1 in Preface), this chapter is structured as follows. Firstly, the apartheid city is conceptualised, after which Bloemfontein is placed within the context of that conceptualisation. After that an overview of post-apartheid urban policy is provided, along with a broad overview of the existing research on spatial transformation in South Africa. Following the review of the literature, the focus shifts to an analysis of the socio-economic and spatial changes in Bloemfontein (with specific reference to Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu). Finally, the new spatial conflicts are assessed in more detail.
2. UNDERSTANDING THE APARTHEID CITY AND APARTHEID BLOEMFONTEIN

The macro-spatial aim of apartheid was to keep black people in rural areas by preventing them from urbanising. Various mechanisms were used to this end, of which influx control was probably the most significant. This was also the case in Bloemfontein and the BBT region. Therefore a broad understanding of the characteristics of the apartheid city, as well as the application of these characteristics in Bloemfontein, is required. Krige (1988: 35) identifies the following general characteristics of the apartheid city:

- The city has a sectoral structure in the form of a wheel. Each population group has a specific sector which is (preferably) linked to the Central Business District (CBD). Land expansion can take place in the prescribed sector only.
- The white residential space is located in higher-lying and better residential areas, while the dominant wind direction tends to follow a course that moves away from the white areas to the residential areas for other population groups.
- The segregation between coloured and Indian populations is not prominent.
- The black residential area is ethnically divided. If a homeland area is available within 70 km of the area, the specific ethnic population can be forced to settle in the homeland area.
- Rivers, roads, railways, open spaces and the industrial sector are used as buffer strips between different population groups.
- The CBD and industrial parks provide direct access to different population groups.
- Each population group has its own civic centre.

Krige (1988, 1991) argues that Bloemfontein represents a highly typical case of the apartheid city. In motivating this conclusion, he points out that Bloemfontein has the following characteristics of such a city. In the first place, the city has been divided into residential zones (in terms of sectors) for the various population groups. To a large degree this division mirrors the division that is typical of the apartheid city model. In this way zones for whites (which included the CBD), blacks (Mangaung) and coloureds (Heidedal) were created. As the Free State was not accessible to the Indian population (because of legislation), no zone was available for Indians. Each of these zones also provided fairly easy access to the industrial parks and the CBD. The residential status of black people in their zones was mostly temporary, as only rental housing was provided (Krige, 1991). Other characteristics include the fact that buffer strips between Mangaung and white Bloemfontein were enforced, as well as the fact that ethnic segregation between different population groups in the black areas was present. In addition, each area had its own municipal offices (Krige, 1991).

The temporary residential status of urban black people was enforced in Bloemfontein when all land expansion to Mangaung was frozen in 1968. Further black urbanisation had to be channelled to Thaba Nchu and, as from 1979, to Botshabelo. Krige (1991: 109) is of the opinion that the establishment of Botshabelo in 1979 “dominated the changing spatial patterns of the region”. To a large extent Botshabelo and, to a lesser degree, Thaba Nchu became extensions of the Mangaung township – more than 50 km away from Bloemfontein.
This means that it is impossible to analyse changing spatial trends in Bloemfontein without considering the BBT region. Krige (1991) also argues that, from the outset, Botshabelo had to develop as a fully-fledged and self-sufficient city. However, this necessitated huge subsidies. Firstly, large-scale industrial subsidies were made available to industrialists when Botshabelo was established as an industrial development point (Cobbet, 1987; Krige, 1991). In addition, an industrial area, called Bloemdustria, was developed halfway between Bloemfontein and Botshabelo. However, this area has never grown beyond the establishment of the first eight industries. Industrial development points with large-scale subsidies for industrialists were also developed in Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu (Cobbett, 1987). Despite these initiatives to improve economic growth, a large portion of the Botshabelo population was employed either in Bloemfontein or in the Free State Goldfields. A subsidised bus system was introduced to transport daily commuters between Botshabelo/Thaba Nchu and Bloemfontein. By November 1988 approximately 14 500 commuters were being transported on a daily basis between Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu. The development of the city of Botshabelo also required enormous subsidies for the purposes of infrastructure and housing (Marais, 1997).

There can be little doubt that spatial planning in the BBT region (with specific reference to Bloemfontein) was aimed at enforcing the apartheid ideology. Krige (1991: 113) comments as follows in this regard: “The fragmented nature of the spatial development of the BBT region is the result of apartheid planning during which dividing walls were erected between the First World and the Third World communities”. Obviously, apartheid ideology can rightfully be criticised for not honouring basic human rights and planning principles. In addition, other inherent flaws in relation to the spatial development of the BBT region can be pointed out. For example, the spatial planning framework did not adhere to basic economic principles. Economic development was decentralised from the core in Bloemfontein to Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu, without the necessary economic scale to justify this decentralisation.

3. SOUTH AFRICAN POLICIES AND STRATEGIES TO MANAGE THE SPATIAL IMBALANCES OF APARTHEID

A wide range of urban and regional policies were introduced after the democratic transition in 1994. At the core of these policies was the intention to restructure the patterns created by apartheid planning, while aspects such as compacting and integrating the city comprised part of the conventional wisdom that characterised the policy approaches (Todes, 2006). The essential elements of these policy approaches are highlighted below.

The first concept that underlies a wide range of policies is that of integration and integrated planning. Pieterse (2003) rightfully argues that this concept has been used in a variety of contexts, but without a proper definition. However, integration should be viewed as the antithesis of the spatial separation and the separation in urban planning that prevailed under apartheid. The Reconstruction and Development Programme, the Urban Development Framework, the Housing Policy, the Development Facilitation Act and various other pieces of legislation all uphold the objective of a larger degree of integration (Donaldson and Marais,
The Urban Development Framework outlines this aim in the following words: “Government is committed [to ensure] that its policies and programmes support the development of urban settlements that will by 2020 be spatially and socially integrated, free of racial and gender discrimination and segregation, enabling people to make residential and employment choices to pursue their ideals” (Department of Housing, 1997: 7). Furthermore, one of the six fundamental principles of the Reconstruction and Development Programme is that of an integrated and sustainable programme, while another principle relates to the eradication of a separated society categorised in terms of a “First World” and a “Third World” component. The Development Facilitation Act expresses a similar objective in the following words: “To contribute to the correction of historically distorted spatial patterns of settlements…” (Department of Land Affairs, 1995: 12). What seems evident from these pieces of legislation is that, whereas the planning philosophy under apartheid entailed the separation of racial groups, the new concept of integration is aimed at bringing areas closer together. This probably entails providing freedom of residential choice, as well as integrating different parts of the city by means of transport routes and other mechanisms.

One aspect that provides a strong motivation for moving the different groups of people closer together is the distance between the place of work and the place of residence. The notion of a compact city is directly and indirectly linked to the need for integrated settlement policies. In terms of the requirements of both the housing and land legislation, new land developments should be conducted in areas closer to the place of employment. Furthermore, such developments should not reinforce apartheid planning by increasing the distance between places of employment and residence. One way of ensuring closer proximity between places of employment and places of residence is to ensure that urban sprawl is counteracted. The discouragement of urban sprawl and the need for higher densities are also explicitly mentioned in the Development Facilitation Act and the Urban Development Framework. Urban infilling is identified as one way of achieving this objective. Curbing urban sprawl also holds major advantages in respect of the cost of urban management, in terms of both service provision and maintenance. The latest objective pursued by the National Department of Housing is to integrate lower- and higher-income households by forcing developers to provide housing for low- and high-income households in the same development.

Another prominent component of post-apartheid spatial planning relates to the addressing of the imbalances within urban areas. In this context specific mention is made of improved housing and infrastructure. The upgrading of former black townships also seems to be prominent, and such townships are being targeted as areas in which investments should be made. Two other aspects that receive attention in official documents are the importance of Local Economic Development (LED) and environmentally friendly approaches to development (Department of Housing, 1997). These aspects are extremely prominent in the Urban Development Framework and the Development Facilitation Act.

There can be little doubt that post-apartheid urban and spatial policies have essentially been aimed at addressing the spatial segregation and imbalances of apartheid. However, the reality of the situation suggests that some of the principles of these policies have been
contradictory in nature, and that most of them have been difficult to implement. Todes (2006: 51) summarises this reality in the following words: “But the lack of a strong constituency for urban spatial policy has also meant that policy has remained relatively marginal and ineffective, and it remains to be seen whether the current resurgence will be sustained”.

4. URBAN SPATIAL CHANGE: A LITERATURE OVERVIEW

The section above provided an overview of relevant policies. The emphasis now shifts to a review of relevant literature, both in terms of policy and the outcomes of policy during the last ten years. Dewar (1998:G6) is of the opinion that the outcomes of policies after apartheid have “been marked by disappointment and in many cases by disillusionment” and that “while the intentions have changed for the better, in practice it has been business as usual”. Donaldson and Marais (2002: 198) conclude that “The decade of reconstructive and restructuring policy formulation and transition has thus come to an end without much meaningful progress...”. In addition, Todes (2003: 111) argues that “there is a growing consensus that current development patterns are tending to reinforce older apartheid patterns, or new forms of spatial divide are emerging”.

As indicated by the above quotes, it is argued in most of the relevant research that very little progress has been made with regard to urban integration and processes aimed at moving people closer to their areas of employment. Tomlinson (2003) argues that urban disintegration has taken place in many South African cities, as many squatter settlements have been developing on the outskirts of townships – even further away from jobs and services. The South African housing policy was the key driver, through its targeted subsidy for the poor, in the endeavour to ensure a higher degree of urban integration. However, there is very little evidence that this objective has been realised in practice. Todes (2003) argues that there is a contradiction between the principle of urban integration, on the one hand, and a housing policy that is orientated towards the production of individually-owned detached houses, but which does not provide funds to cover the costs of better-located land, on the other. In addition, the CSIR (1999: 98) argues that there is a specific tension between additional investments to achieve goals such as integration and the principle of equity. Equity, in terms of the CSIR’s argument, relates to the principle that everybody should have access to an equal subsidy. Additional resources could potentially ensure a higher degree of integration (especially in the larger urban areas). According to the CSIR (1999), the problem thus does not lie in the policy per se, but rather in the fact that the “one-size-fits-all” approach to subsidisation will not ensure spatial integration, as land economics differ too much between settlements.

Integrated development also requires a concomitant integration of the services of various government departments. The lack of a proper system to ensure development which provides the full range of services (and not only one-dimensional housing developments) is mentioned by various authors (CSIR, 1999; Pieterse, 2003). Intergovernmental relations and budget aligning have not always functioned well. Generally, provincial governments have not
managed to align their services to various regions in an effective manner (Atkinson, 2002). In fact, Marais and Wessels (2005) argue that certain housing policy guidelines provided by the provincial government in the Free State have impacted negatively on housing provision in some of the larger urban areas of the province.

Some voices have also been raised concerning the idea of a compact city (see Todes, 2003; 2006; Cross, 2006). The compact city debate in South Africa relates to the notion that South African cities formerly had low densities, and that apartheid planning further reinforced these lower densities through segregation. Todes (2003) argues that higher densities are not always required by lower-income earners, while the formal nature of the South African housing policy has not been conducive to obtaining higher densities. She suggests that “[s]tronger movement towards urban compaction awaits housing and urban policies that accommodate informality” (Todes, 2003: 119). Cross (2006) advances the same argument. The CSIR also mentions that there is a certain degree of conflict between the drive towards compaction of cities through high-density forms of housing, and support for people living in existing low-density sprawling settlements. In essence, the formal housing policy is unlikely to contribute towards bringing the concept of the compact city to fruition. What seems to be required is a transport system (subsidised if necessary) which reduces the cost of travelling from peripheral locations (Cross, 2006).

There are also a number of broader points of criticism in the relevant literature. Firstly, policies (such as the Urban Development Framework) seldom take urbanisation and inter-urban migration into account. As the CDE (1996) rightfully argues, very little is known about these processes (see also Atkinson and Marais, 2006). Furthermore, what particular understanding of these processes is taken into consideration when policies are developed? Secondly, despite the reality in respect of the existence of many hidden urbanities (similar to Botshabelo), policy seldom considers the implications of such places. For example, does township upgrading imply the upgrading of these areas as well? Or are further developments in Botshabelo an indication of urban sprawl? This issue is extremely relevant in the case of Bloemfontein and Botshabelo – the latter historically received large investments at the expense of Mangaung, the former black township of Bloemfontein (Marais, 1997).

From the above discussion, it seems as if post-apartheid policy has seldom managed to achieve what was intended. In the remainder of the chapter I shall argue that inherent inconsistencies, as well as crucial problematic aspects such as hidden urbanities and the difficulties involved in implementing these policies in the BBT region have contributed extensively towards this situation.

5. POST-APARTHEID SPATIAL CHANGE

In addition to the above discussion of the history and application of apartheid planning in Bloemfontein, the intended policies of the post-apartheid national government, as well as the review of the literature, two issues still remain to be addressed. Firstly, what spatial changes are taking place in the region? Secondly, how has the post-apartheid local government in the
region reacted to the national policy proposals and the socio-economic and spatial trends taking place in the region? These aspects will comprise the focus of this section. Each of the three urban areas will be dealt with separately.

The following key aspects need to be reflected upon in terms of changing patterns in Bloemfontein (see Krige, 1998). In the first place, the former Mangaung township has been integrated effectively into Bloemfontein by means of various transport routes. Under apartheid Mangaung was only accessible by means of one connection. Today, various access routes exist and transport planning has incorporated Mangaung effectively into the larger urban fabric of Bloemfontein. Secondly, Krige (1998) also notes a certain amount of buffer-strip infilling and large-scale investment in the Mangaung township (township upgrading) (see also the chapter by Mokoena and Marais in this volume). However, urban sprawl resulting from informal land invasions, the deterioration of the inner city and serious problems in terms of housing delivery have been identified as well (cf. Marais and Krige, 1999; Marais and Krige, 2000). Residential desegregation seems to be limited; but inner-city desegregation is taking place much more rapidly (see Jurgens et al., 2003), ensuring an increase in proximity to the workplace, at least for those who can afford it (see also the chapter by Hoogendoorn and Marais in this volume).

Bloemfontein has also experienced high population growth rates. Estimates in respect of the relevant period for the Mangaung township alone indicate 4% (Marais and Krige, 1999). This growth, combined with a movement away from backyard housing units to informal housing units in informal settlements in the early 1990s (see Botes et al., 1990), has resulted in the establishment of large-scale informal settlements since the demise of apartheid. It is estimated that nearly 50% of the existing planned stands in Mangaung have developed as informal settlements. These growth rates are in stark contrast to the negative population growth rates in Botshabelo (Krige, 1996). The migration of former Botshabelo residents to the Mangaung township is one of the main reasons for this. Although some business development has taken place in the Mangaung township, Krige (1998) notes that, despite large-scale public investment in Mangaung (township upgrading), private sector investment has tended to move westwards (in the opposite direction from Mangaung). Thus, despite the original easy access to the CBD under apartheid rule, the westward shift of the CBD has resulted in lower-income workers being situated further away from their places of work.

The most prominent characteristic of Botshabelo is the fact that no post-apartheid population growth has occurred there (see Krige, 1996; Tomlinson and Krige, 1997). In fact, the 2001 population was estimated at 175 000, which is lower than the 1991 estimate of 177 000 (Statistics South Africa, 2004). This is in stark contrast to the fact that Botshabelo was one of the fastest-growing urban areas in South Africa between 1979 and 1991, when its population grew from 0 to 177 000 (Krige, 1996, 1998). Other important aspects relating to Botshabelo include the movement of a large number of people to residential quarters in Bloemfontein, with a consequent decline in the number of people using the subsidised bus service (Tomlinson and Krige, 1997). This move is permanent in some cases, while in others, people reside in Bloemfontein only during the week. Tomlinson and Krige (1997) noted larger
percentages of commuters on Fridays and Mondays. Despite certain technical constraints, housing delivery in terms of the new housing subsidy continued in Botshabelo (Marais, 2001). In some cases new land was developed to ensure such housing developments. In a study on the need for rental housing in Bloemfontein, it was found that more than 50% of daily commuters from Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu were interested in renting housing units in Bloemfontein (Marais, 2003a). The question can rightfully be asked concerning the degree to which planning is making provision for such a need. The original industrial development park in Botshabelo is currently nearly fully occupied. However, there are very few signs of industrial activity, as between 30% and 50% of the stands are being utilised as warehouses (Nel et al., 2004).

Although the population in Thaba Nchu has grown slowly since the demise of apartheid (in contrast to Botshabelo, where no population growth has occurred at all), a number of other trends should be pointed out in this regard. The industrial development point initiated under apartheid is more than 50% empty. A number of shopping centres have had to be closed down. Two prominent contributing factors probably account for this situation. Firstly, a large number of government officials were relocated to Bloemfontein after 1994. Secondly, Thaba Nchu lost some of its commercial advantage after 1994, as Value-Added Tax had to be added to the price of all products – a requirement which did not exist in Thaba Nchu under the previous homeland government. A fairly extensive programme was also designed to formalise and individualise land tenure arrangements (Marais, 1998). Traditionally, land belonged to the state and was managed by the traditional leaders (Erasmus and Krige, 1998). However, the process of land formalisation was not conducted without conflict with the traditional leaders.

A few comments need to be made with regard to Bloemdustria and the original plan to develop a major industrial area. It seems as if very few of the original industries are currently in operation. Furthermore, a large portion of the proclaimed industrial land was sold off to a developer for the development of middle- and higher-income housing. Although some progress has been made in developing houses, the question can well be asked as to whether these housing units do not contribute to further urban sprawl.

6. **NEW SPATIAL TENSIONS SINCE 1994**

The progress made in managing the spatial tensions during the post-1994 period has been varied in nature. In practice, a number of spatial tensions remain, while new ones have been created. In the light of the background provided above, a number of these new tensions will be highlighted in this section.

The first source of spatial tension that remains prominent is the distance between the place of residence and the place of employment. This tension is present at three levels. First, the national government continues to subsidise long-distance bus transport between Botshabelo/Thaba Nchu and Bloemfontein. In this way the apartheid spatial pattern is retained by the continuation of commuting over long distances. Second, and in addition to
Chapter 1

the subsidisation of transport, housing subsidies are provided in Botshabelo. Therefore, there
is also a continuation of the provision of houses on the periphery in Botshabelo – away from
the economic opportunities. Third, extensive growth of informal settlements is occurring on
the eastern periphery of Bloemfontein, reinforcing the city’s apartheid spatial patterns. At the
same time limited progress has been made in respect of the plans for the racial integration of
the city. For example, no progress has been made in increasing the number of housing units
in the CBD, whilst plans for more inclusive housing have remained mere plans (Marais,
Hoogendoorn and Ingle – in this volume – suggest that domestic workers residing at their
place of employment have actually played a larger role in desegregating the city). In addition,
no consideration has been given to an appropriate (and possibly subsidised) transport system
which could assist people living on the periphery to access their places of work more cheaply
– a solution which would be in stark contrast to the continued subsidisation of transport
between Botshabelo and Bloemfontein.

The second conflict that has come to the fore relates to the development of upmarket
housing estates towards the west of Bloemfontein. These upmarket developments have
resulted in further urban sprawl, and are in stark contrast to the prevailing situation towards
the east of the city. One argument put forward by the developers is that the people residing
in these estates, as well as the developers, will bear the relevant costs. At the same time
these developments have two consequences. First, they place extraordinary pressure on the
existing public infrastructure, such as sanitation, water provision and roads. Secondly, they
also increase travelling distances and costs for poorly-paid workers employed in this part of
the city. The redevelopment of Bloemdistria (towards the east) as middle-income housing
areas is also having the same impact – except that this redevelopment fits into the “grand
scheme” for the N8 corridor. The important point in this regard is that these two
developments have the same impact on the overall urban area – but in one case the
development also fits in with a “grand plan” in terms of the N8 corridor.

A third conflict lies in the development of the N8 corridor towards the east of Bloemfontein
on the route to Botshabelo. This corridor is supposed to bring Bloemfontein and Botshabelo
closer together. However, a number of inherent conflicts can be pointed out. First, the
development of the corridor is, in a certain sense, inconsistent with the idea of revitalising
the Bloemfontein CBD. A number of pilot projects – which would, in actual fact, be better
located in the CBD – are envisaged for the corridor. As indicated in the previous section,
business expansion has taken place westwards, away from the current CBD. The planning of
the N8 corridor is aimed at turning this trend around. Once again, there seems to be conflict
between capital, planning intention and the need for urban compactness.

The new SDF makes provision for urban boundaries across which development should not
take place. Although this approach would be supported by the compact city model, the jury
is probably still out with regard to the success of this approach. From initial discussions
concerning this boundary, it seems as if private capital might prove to be more powerful than
the ability to keep within the boundaries. Laying down boundaries also requires that higher
densities should naturally come to the fore. Yet many of the existing infrastructures have not
been designed to handle higher levels of density. The result is that, in some suburbs, the existing infrastructure cannot handle the increase in densities (sub-divisions/larger percentages of town houses).

7. CONCLUDING COMMENTS

This chapter has provided a brief description of apartheid planning and its application in Bloemfontein and the BBT region. Post-apartheid policy and its application, as well as the inherent conflicts between policy and practice, were also assessed in detail. Various policy contradictions exist, while a number of omissions have been identified, of which the most prominent is the issue of hidden urbanities. The Bloemfontein case study suggests that, as has been the case in many other large urban areas in South Africa, only a very limited degree of spatial transformation of the city morphology has occurred. Although it should be acknowledged that the economic structure plays a role in this regard, the chapter has also indicated that inherent conflicts in policy and application are contributing further to fragmented planning.

The lack of spatial reconstruction in Bloemfontein can also be attributed to the considerably smaller scale of the city, with limited open space available for reconstructing the city. The spatial integration in terms of the BBT region is a far more complex issue and, in reality, only limited attention has been devoted to it. In fact, the Bloemfontein case study suggests, to a large degree, that the further reinforcement of spatial separation and urban sprawl is unwittingly being brought about through the housing project in Bloemduista, as well as the fact that the hidden urbanities of Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu are being treated as former black townships. Despite some minor alterations to the racially segregated city structure that was created under apartheid, not much has changed. There are probably a number of reasons for the fact that post-apartheid spatial planning does not seem very different from the planning that occurred under apartheid. Various opportunities existed at a local level to address the problems of urban sprawl and segregation, but limited attention was paid to these opportunities. I cannot help agreeing with Charlton (2001) and Dewar (2000), who argue that the principles of the Development Facilitation Act have not been taken seriously in practice. It also seems as if the comment by Todes (2003: 111) that the principles of the Development Facilitation Act have not “been at the forefront of spatial decision making in provincial and local government” is extremely valid in the light of the situation in the BBT region, ten years after the demise of apartheid planning. Another reason for the above reality is the fact that the spatial guidelines provided in various policy frameworks and in legislation are vague (for example, they provide no indication of how to deal with the hidden urbanities of apartheid) and cannot always be implemented at a local level.
REFERENCES


1. INTRODUCTION

The study of inequality between rich and poor, between racial groups, and in urban areas of the world is no new phenomenon (Smith, 1973; Malan, 1979; Smith, 1981; Smith, 1986). At the same time inequality levels in South Africa have been recorded as being notoriously high. The Gini coefficient, which measures inequality, has rated inequality in South Africa under apartheid and afterwards as one of the highest in the world (UNDP, 2005: 270-273). To a large degree this has been ascribed to apartheid planning having resulted in, amongst other things, pronounced spatial inequalities at the city level because cities were planned along racial lines (Smith, 1982; Robinson, 1993; De Wit, 1994, 2002). Generally, and considered from an ethical point of view, the result of this segregated planning was fairly good urban areas for white people and less attractive areas for black people. However, with the demise of apartheid and the implementation of a variety of new policies and programmes since the democratic elections in 1994, the challenge has been to attempt to redress this reality. The issue of redress was also prominent in academic writing in the early 1990s (Smith, 1992; Smith, 1995). However, evidence since then suggests that inequality levels are increasing in South Africa, and that addressing these is by no means uncomplicated (May, 2000). Individuals on the left of the political spectrum are also quick to remind us that these inequalities have increased despite one of the longest periods of economic growth in South African economic history (Bond 2002). Notwithstanding the attention that has been given to conceptual studies of inequality in the South African context (May, 2000; Parnell, 2006), there has been a dearth of detailed studies of spatial inequality in South African cities (see De Wit, 2002 as an exception).

Because inequality in Bloemfontein has been so marked, and also because Bloemfontein has historically represented one of the best examples of an apartheid city, it provides the ideal context within which to study racial segregation and its bearing on inequality (see Krieger, 1988, 1991, 1998). De Wit (1994) performed extensive measurements of inequality in Bloemfontein via recourse to census and other forms of data. Labuschagne (2001) complemented De Wit’s study by assessing changing trends between 1991 and 1996. She concluded that there had been some increase in inequality during this timeframe. Although an indication of shifts in inequality between 1991 and 1996 is useful, a more complete assessment, complementing the time series using 2001 census data, yields a better indication of changing trends. By 2001 a number of factors had started to play a more determinate role in the changing patterns of inequality. Not the least of these was the medium-term effects of the changed legislative environment, which made it possible for people of different racial backgrounds to settle wherever they wanted to,
along with the implementation of urban policies that emphasised the reconstruction of the former black townships with equality and equity being central themes (see South Africa, 1997 for the Urban Development Framework). Against this background the paper aims to assess changing patterns of spatial inequality between the three historical group areas in Bloemfontein, namely Mangaung (for black people), Heidedal (for coloureds) and white Bloemfontein. It should be mentioned that segregation in Bloemfontein was pretty much complete by 1991 (Jürgens, Marais, Barker and Lombaard, 2003). But it is the spatial changes rather than the inequality between race groups that are considered in respect of the three historical group areas. Essentially we argue, by means of the case study, that an urban management approach which considers only equity issues has two inherent dangers attached to it. Firstly, it might lead to a neglect of aspects of cost recovery and financial viability in the long term. Our argument here is not for cost recovery as a criterion which trumps all others, but rather for an approach where aspects of cost recovery are at least considered in association with efforts to decrease levels of inequality. Secondly, there is the danger that an exclusive emphasis on equality may come to define development in terms of access to tangible infrastructure alone, to the neglect of sufficient attention to the quality and long-term maintenance of whatever infrastructure is actually provided.

Bearing in mind the above background, we structure the chapter in the following way. It starts with a methodological overview followed by a literature review of inequality and some of the academic debates to which the phenomenon of inequality has given rise. This lays the groundwork for our argument concerning inequality. We maintain that the international literature tends to limit itself to treatments of inequality and social justice from an idealised ethical perspective, to the comparative neglect of more empirically-grounded, practical considerations. The urban management implications of redressing equality, for example, are seldom overtly articulated. This international literature review is followed by reflections on inequality in the South African historical context. Specific reference is made to South African urban areas in order to contextualise inequality in Bloemfontein under apartheid. Then the investigation provides an overview of inequality in respect of the historical development of Bloemfontein. Emphasis is placed on changing inequality over three periods, namely 1991, 1996 and 2001. Finally a number of comments are made in respect of the urban management implications of an emphasis on equality.

2. METHODOLOGY

As the study measures inequality, a brief description of the methodology followed in this regard is required. First, inequality was measured by using indicators in four distinct categories: income, housing, education and infrastructure. These indicators were selected so as to be able to compare the 2001 results with those of 1991 as provided by De Wit (1994). Obviously the census data available make it possible to consider a range of other indicators, but the comparative nature of the study required these to be limited to those used by De Wit (1994). In some cases data for specific
indicators employed by De Wit were not available and these indicators were accordingly omitted. Furthermore, the indicators were applied to the three historical group areas as defined by the Group Areas Act under apartheid, namely Mangaung, Heidedal and white Bloemfontein. Income levels were adjusted for inflation for the ten years under consideration. Table 1 provides a detailed overview of the various indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>An overview of indicators employed in measuring inequality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Income</strong></td>
<td>% of people earning less than R5000 (1991 values) in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of people earning more than R50 000 in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Housing</strong></td>
<td>% of houses with three or fewer rooms in each of the three area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of houses with six or more rooms in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Grade 12 pass rate in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of population with a Grade 12 Certificate in each of the areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of the population with a post-Grade 12 Certificate in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infrastructure</strong></td>
<td>% of housing units with access to electricity in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of housing units with access to waterborne sanitation in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of housing units with water in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% of housing units with water on the stand in each of the three areas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To quantify inequality levels between the three areas, standard scores (Z scores) were utilised (see footnote for formula\(^1\)). These Z scores indicate the deviation of each of the three areas from the average of all the scores (which is 0 in all cases). The change in the Z scores between 1991, 1996 and 2001 can then be determined. The closer the scores get to 0, the larger the degree of equality represented. The opposite is true when the Z scores results represent a move further away from 0. These Z scores were calculated for each of the indicators, which resulted in a

\[
Z = \frac{x - \bar{x}}{\sigma}
\]

\(\bar{x}\) = average of raw numbers
\(x\) = specific raw number
\(\sigma\) = standard deviation
sectoral score (e.g. housing). All sectoral scores were again added to provide a profile of the total changes in respect of inequality.

3. INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVES ON INEQUALITY

Much of the discourse pertaining to urban service delivery in developing countries is couched in terms of ‘social justice’ and ‘inequality’. Both of these elusive, abstract concepts are vulnerable to multiple interpretations and may consequently generate more heat and misunderstanding than they produce light.

Perhaps the only point on which the literature on social equality is unanimous is that the world is shot through with inequalities along a seemingly endless number of axes and at various levels (between states, between areas in cities and between population groups). Who or what is responsible for this state of affairs, whether anything can or should be done about it, and if so, how and by whom – these are issues that, given their ethical and practical complexities, will engage scholars into perpetuity (see, for instance, Bauer, 2000; Giddens and Diamond, 2005; May, 2006; Miller, 1976, 2006; Seekings and Nattrass, 2006; van der Walt, 2005; Voorhoeve, 2006). At their core, however, these debates could be regarded as an attempt to derive an essentialist definition of ‘social justice’.

Firstly, however, it is necessary briefly to quantify and describe the kinds of inequalities social theorists tend to focus on. Fulcher (2004: 98), for instance, reports that “The gap between the richest and poorest countries has hugely increased. In 1820 the five richest countries in the world were three times as rich as the five poorest. By 1950 they were 35 times as rich; by 1970, 44 times; and by 1992, 72 times. The world has become steadily more divided by international differences in wealth”.

Although one might call Fulcher’s claim into question from several points of view (surely given the explosive increase in the number of countries during the 1820 to 1992 period, the findings are what one might reasonably expect?), he does articulate what seems to be the commonly held consensus – that the gulf between the ‘haves’ and the ‘have nots’ is growing ever wider. An important factor in this tendency has been the onset of globalisation and the so-called ‘digital divide’ (Bauman, 1998: 88).

The bleak depiction of inter-city inequality can be complemented by an equally sobering one of intra-city disparities. “Inequalities between rich and poor countries… are mirrored within countries” and by extension within these countries’ cities (UNDP, 2005: 55). It is salutary to learn that “extensive poverty existed even in the country [Canada] that ranked first in the 2001 Human Development Index (HDI), for most of the 1990s”, Montreal apparently having had a “poverty rate [of] 41.2 per cent” (UNHSR, 2003: 36).

The Gini coefficient is a tool which was developed which “measures the extent to which the distribution of income (or consumption) among individuals or households within a country deviates from a perfectly equal distribution” (UNDP, 2005: 356). According to a recent Human Development Report (HDR), the six ‘most unequal’ countries in the world are...
exclusively to be found in sub-Saharan Africa (UNDP, 2005: 270-273). A value of zero represents perfect equality and a value of one perfect inequality (see Table 2).

Table 2  A profile of the six most unequal states in the world

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Gini index</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td>70.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesotho</td>
<td>63.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>63.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td>62.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central African Republic</td>
<td>61.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaziland</td>
<td>60.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

South Africa’s Gini index value is given as 57.8 according to a survey based on consumption conducted in 2000. These findings should be qualified by the fact that Sierra Leone was last surveyed in 1989, and none of the other countries in the above table more recently than 1995, since when a great deal might have changed. It should be noted that all these countries fall into the medium to low Human Development bracket. For the record, the six ‘most equal’ countries are reflected in Table 3.

Table 3  A profile of the six most equal states in the world

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Gini index</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>24.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>24.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>25.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Again it should be noted that these are all ‘high’ Human Development countries surveyed between 1993 and 2000. It should, however, be of little comfort to learn that countries like Rwanda, Burundi and Ethiopia all have ‘good’ Gini values of below 33.4. A further caveat must be that fully 30 per cent of the 177 countries listed in the 2005 HDR have never been surveyed.

Zygmunt Bauman (Beilharz, 2001: 182) maintains that “Throughout the modern era, politics of inequality and hence of redistribution was by far the most dominant type of political conflict”.

19
It was, ironically enough, the inevitable material inequalities generated by capitalism’s “promise of equality” that gave socialism its raison d’etre (Beilharz, 2001: 260).

The World Bank (2005: 18) acknowledges the ancient origins of the equality debate when it says these “lie at the foundation of Western political philosophy”. One may discern the spirit of Aristotle’s careful analysis of ‘equity and the equitable’ and the different kinds of justice (‘just action as fairness in distribution’; ‘just action as rectification’ and so forth) in the World Bank’s (2005: xi) formulation of ‘equity’:

“Equity is defined in terms of two basic principles. The first is equal opportunity, a person’s life achievements should be determined primarily by his or her talents and efforts, rather than by predetermined circumstances such as race, gender, social and family background, or country of birth. The second principle is the avoidance of deprivation in outcomes, particularly in health, education and consumption levels.”

It should immediately be noted that the World Bank is not advocating equality of outcomes (across the board), but mere “avoidance of deprivation” in outcomes. This emphasis is far from unproblematic, as Smith (2000: 3) makes clear in his discussion of chance, luck and ‘good fortune’. What the World Bank argues for is a trade-off which inclines to privilege opportunity over outcomes, all the while realising that outcomes themselves have a role in “shaping opportunities” (2005: 3). In a context of imperfect knowledge and limited resources, this is a demanding juggling act for any city administration to bring off successfully.

Following Bauman, it was “the capitalist cultural revolution [that] disposed of the… pre-modern belief system that human inequality is beyond challenge and dispute; and that it is pre-ordained, and therefore cannot be changed by men” (Beilharz, 2001: 34). And so ironically enough it is precisely that cultural phenomenon which is supposed to have created so much of the world’s current inequality that generates the idea that inequality is susceptible of remedy and that it is not an unassailable aspect of the human condition.

According to Bauman (Beilharz, 2001: 182), the postmodern age has seen a shift away from material redistribution (wealth, income) towards the securing of human rights – “a code name for the agent’s autonomy, for that freedom of choice that constitutes the agency in the postmodern habitat”. As Fulcher (2004: 55) puts it:

Much of the redistributive egalitarianism that sought to use the state to transfer resources from the rich to the poor has been displaced by a more individualist provision of greater opportunities for the poor to realize their potential. Significantly, inequality is now discussed in terms not of differences in wealth or income but of access. As Anthony Giddens has put it, “the new politics defines equality as inclusion and inequality as exclusion”.

Implicit in this revised understanding is that the poor should be in a position to recognise an opportunity for what it is but, assuming this to be the case, how does the issue of exclusion
Chapter 2

resonate with the South African urban order? The fundamental problem with the social justice and inequality discourse is well expressed by Cooper (1980: 24):

The justice or otherwise of a distribution has to do with how the distribution came about. Before an income differential can be condemned as unjust, we must know something about how it arose… It follows that to complain, as the egalitarian does, against some differential is never, in itself, to make a complaint about injustice; for to urge that some people ought to have X because others do is not, per se, to say anything about how the possession, or lack of possession, of X came about.

Cooper’s reservations raise the question of ‘agency’, which is especially important given South Africa’s history. But it is Giddens’s ‘exclusion’, in the South African context, to which this discussion will now turn.

4. SOUTH AFRICAN PERSPECTIVES AND APARTHEID DISTORTIONS

While the international literature on inequalities and social justice often grapples with conceptual ethical abstractions, the South African literature tends to focus more on the empirical examination of concrete realities (see, for example, Bond, 2002; Pamell, 2005; Visser, 2001, 2002). This is perhaps not surprising for as Jürgens et al., (2003: 35), “The apartheid doctrine was not merely a normative, rather abstract factor in defining the social coexistence of citizens of different colours, but served simultaneously as a concrete element of spatial planning… which one-sidedly favoured the white population in its choice of residential areas and workplaces”.

The apartheid city has been contextualised well in the relevant South African literature on the topic (see Davies, 1981; Smith, 1982). Four characteristics of the apartheid city are commonly cited and are essential to our paper.

- Residential racial segregation was institutionalised between various population groups by means of residential zones for the various population groups. In reality this meant pushing the poor (mainly blacks and coloureds) to the periphery of most cities.
- Specific efforts were made to create buffers between the residential spaces of the various racial groups to ensure spatial segregation.
- Governance issues were decentralised to the various residential spaces, but with the white residential space benefiting from the redistribution of the tax base from the CBD and industry. Yet it should be mentioned that in theory the other residential spaces had to develop their own commercial spaces.
- The link with hidden urbanities in commuting distance from the core urban areas has also played a crucial role in keeping black people peripheral.

Furthermore, apartheid zoning and planning laws made it very difficult for Black Local Authorities (BLAs) to attract sufficient businesses (e.g. retail outlets) to boost their retail tax
bases, with the result that they forfeited the comparative advantage that their inhabitants’ spending clout should have given them over the white Local Authorities (who could accommodate the outlets where black people typically shopped). The loss of this kind of positive multiplier in black areas led to a vicious downward spiral of classic ‘under-development’.

The infrastructural and spatial legacy of apartheid planning is still very much with South Africa – both visibly and invisibly. It lives on in current planning, in as much as this is reactive to the past and thereby still informed by what one might call the ‘ghost’ of the apartheid planners (DBSA, 2005; Krige, 1998; Makgetla, 2007; Marais and Krige, 1999; SACN, 2004: 163). Regional development theories are generally predicated on the notion of free economic agents who can decide what to do for a living, and more to the point, where to work and where to live (given the normal circumstantial constraints). This freedom was denied the overwhelming majority of ‘non-white’ peoples under apartheid (Le Roux, 2006).

The effect of this contrived distortion was to render mainstream theories of regional or urban development otiose in South Africa’s case. At best, the institutionalised prohibition of black urbanisation, compared with the more customary process of decentralisation by incentive, meant that the normal processes of urban development found expression only in a somewhat warped and ironic, or indeed perverted, sense.

The data concerning current levels of poverty in South Africa are so at variance with one another that it may be hazardous to draw any conclusions other than those couched in general terms (Louw, 2006: 84; Melzer, 2006). For instance, the South African Institute of Race Relations (2005: 1) reports that “poverty in South Africa has increased since 1996, and inequality is becoming more pronounced”, whereas the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation says that “it seems likely that poverty has declined significantly since the turn of the century [i.e. 2000]… [although] the country’s persistently high level of inequality may have gained momentum” (Louw, 2006: 84). Increases in inequality, however, appear to be intra- and not inter-racial – most especially among “the African group” (Leibbrandt, Poswell, Naidoo, Welch and Woolard, 2006: 20-1). The 2004 General Household Survey (GHS) calculated that there were 7.5 million households earning less than R1500 per month while, the 2005 All Media and Products Survey (AMPS) put this figure at 4.7 million households – the GHS number diverges to the extent of 2.8 million households or 60 percent on the AMPS calculation (Melzer, 2006: 11). This discrepancy could be attributable to the fact that the GHS and AMPS surveys use slightly different understandings of ‘household’ – both of which definitions are, in any event, deemed in certain quarters to be “inadequate in many respects” (Melzer, 2006: 5). The situation is further complicated by the impact that HIV/AIDS may be having on household formation and on what constitutes a household. Does a 12-year-old orphan overseeing his younger brothers and sisters in an abandoned motor vehicle constitute an ‘informal household’? How is the ever growing cohort of AIDS orphans without homes allocated to household units?

That the vision of social justice for all South Africans may be no more than a pipe dream, however, is a spectre raised by Smith (2005), who doubts that a ‘Pareto optimal’ course of
redistribution for South Africa (in which no one is left worse off than before) would prove environmentally sustainable, or indeed economically attainable, in a context of “individualistic materialism and neoliberal capitalism” (Smith, 2005: 61, 62). Instead Smith rather gloomily concludes that “piecemeal programmes and projects generating benefits for the worst-off” might prove to be the best that South Africa can hope for given that there is unlikely to be much enthusiasm for the “much more modest material conception of the good life” he advocates for South Africans.

5. CHANGING INEQUALITY IN BLOEMFONTEIN

5.1 Historical overview of Bloemfontein as apartheid city
The apartheid and spatial history of Bloemfontein has been well documented by Krige (1988, 1991, 1998). Considering the characteristics of the apartheid city in general, the following two prominent similarities should be mentioned in respect of Bloemfontein.

First, the levels of racial segregation were fairly high and these levels remained high until the repeal of the Group Areas Act in the early 1990s. Three distinct urban racial spaces were created, namely Mangaung Township, Heidedal and white Bloemfontein. In Mangaung Township a concerted effort was made to ensure ethnic divisions between Sothos, Tswanas and Xhosas (Krige, 1991). Furthermore, the fact that three different tax bases were applied to the three separate areas meant that white Bloemfontein benefited from the commercial and industrial taxes. However, labour and purchasing power came from all three areas. The consequence was that the poorer areas (black and coloured) had no tax base to finance their spaces.

Second, the fact that apartheid planning in Bloemfontein is directly linked to displaced urbanisation and economic decentralisation also requires some attention. In 1969 expansion of the Mangaung Township boundaries was prohibited. Urban expansion was to take place in Thaba Nchu. The result was that all new migration was channelled to Thaba Nchu and, after 1979, when Botshabelo was established, to Botshabelo. This meant that no land expansion took place between 1969 and the mid-1980s, when the first land was made available for middle-income housing in Mangaung (Krige, 1991). It was only in 1992 that stands were made available to poor urban dwellers in Bloemfontein for the first time since 1969 (Marais and Krige, 1997, 1999).

5.2 Post-apartheid changes
Five post-apartheid trends, which are essential to an understanding of the inequality trends to be discussed in the next section, are worth mentioning. First, increasing levels of desegregation should be mentioned. This desegregation was initially slow (see Kotze and Donaldson, 1996), but has increased steadily over the last decade, with the highest concentration being in the CBD (Jurgens et al., 2003; see also the paper on white flight in the CBD in this volume). The increase of domestic workers (mainly black) and the role of this in desegregating white Bloemfontein should also be mentioned, as many started to reside on
the stands of their employers. A further form of desegregation also seems to have taken place between Mangaung Township and Heidedal in that some higher-income households from the Mangaung Township have settled in Heidedal.

Reference should next be made to the fact that the post-apartheid period also represents a period in which the demographic channelling towards Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu has been reversed through a natural process (see Botes et al., 1991; Krige, 1998; Marais and Krige, 1998). This is evident in a decline and stagnation in the population growth of Botshabelo (Krige, 1996), as well as a considerable growth of informal settlements in and around Bloemfontein – specifically in the Mangaung Township.

The third and fourth trends are interrelated. The third trend relates to extensive programmes to consider the upgrading of especially Mangaung Township. These programmes, funded by means of various intergovernmental grants, resulted in a large public sector expenditure programme in Mangaung Township, and to a lesser degree in Heidedal (see, for example, Marais and Krige, 1999, as well as Mokoena and Marais in this volume). However, this degree of public sector expenditure was not necessarily followed by private sector expenditure. The fourth trend therefore represents a larger shift in private sector money in Bloemfontein: away from the poor east towards the richer west (Krige, 1998). Krige (1998) has indicated that in the period 1994-1998 no private sector developments larger than R1 million occurred either in Heidedal or Mangaung Township. Although there has been some development in these two areas since 1998, the overall investment in Heidedal and Mangaung Township remains limited.

Finally, the most significant post-apartheid change has been the incorporation of Bloemfontein, Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu into one municipal area, the Mangaung Local Municipality. The fact that these three areas have historically been one functional economic area, though politically divided, was acknowledged with this step. Though our case study focuses exclusively on Bloemfontein, the larger picture should be borne in mind.

5.3 Measuring inequality in Bloemfontein

An overview of the methodology was provided in Section 2. In this section the shifts in inequality are considered in respect of four specific aspects: income, housing, education and infrastructure.

5.3.1 Income

As already mentioned, two indicators were employed to determine income inequality. The number of people earning less than R5000 per annum (in 1991 values), and the number of people earning more than R50,000 (in 1991 values). These figures were adjusted by means of the annual inflation for the respective periods. Figure 1 provides the results.
Figure 1 shows the following notable trends between 1991 and 2001. There was a considerable decline in the inequality levels in white Bloemfontein. This decline was followed by Heidedal, which, though at the negative end of the scale, was moving towards the positive side. These trends reflected the fact that the inequality between white Bloemfontein and Mangaung, and between white Bloemfontein and Heidedal, has decreased considerably. However, there has been an increase in inequality between Heidedal and Mangaung. Even so, the total for Mangaung of 0.95, although lower than the 0.98 measured in 1996, is still higher than the 0.91 measured in 1991. The above trends can be attributed to a number of causes. First, the fact that Mangaung has not decreased considerably is probably evidence of the large numbers of poor people who moved into the area after 1991, when the policy of orderly urbanisation was abandoned. Marais and Krige (1999) found extensive population growth rates in Mangaung – mostly among low-income dwellers. A substantial proportion of these came from Botshabelo. The main point in respect of this situation is that the dismantling of apartheid resulted in reversed migration patterns materialising in Bloemfontein, with low-income dwellers flocking to the city. The second point that should be made is that Heidedal, through a few up-market developments, became a popular place for middle-income people from Mangaung to stay, with especially those who could not afford to desegregate to white Bloemfontein moving into Heidedal. Thirdly, the decline in the total for white Bloemfontein should be ascribed to two aspects related to desegregation. Desegregation in the inner city could have played a role. However, more importantly, the fact that a large number of domestic workers were residing on the premises of those for whom they were working (something prohibited under apartheid) has probably been the most prominent contributing factor. Fourthly, the decline in inequality in respect of income between the three areas could potentially also be attributed to affirmative action policies by the government since 1994. There is national evidence that proportionally more white people have become poorer over the last decade (see Schucherman and Visser, 2005; see also
paper by Hoogendoorn and Marais in this volume). However, it should also be acknowledged that affirmative action policies have probably made a large number of people leave Mangaung Township and settle in white Bloemfontein.

Finally, the representation of these figure by means of Z scores does not reflect the real figures of the increase in the number of people with incomes below R5000 per annum (1991 values). The real numbers increased from nearly 32 000 in 1991 to more than 46 000 in 2001 – this despite the decrease in the gap between white Bloemfontein and Mangaung.

5.3.2 Housing

In considering housing, we employed two indicators. The number of households residing in houses with three or fewer rooms, and secondly the number of houses with six rooms or more were considered. Figure 2 provides an overview in this respect. However, a couple of observations should be made in respect of housing programmes. In delivery terms more than 1.8 million housing units have been delivered since 1994. In world terms this is an extraordinary achievement. However, critical comments in respect of these programmes have also emerged over the last five years. Although neither space nor our stated aim allows us to examine low-income housing programmes, one of the main consequences of the programme has nevertheless been a decline in household size (see Napier, 2005). In order to access houses, extended families were forced to become nuclear families. At the same time research on housing delivery in the Free State and in Bloemfontein has revealed that larger urban areas have not received subsidies proportionally to their share of the population and to the population growth in the area (see Marais and Krige, 1999, 2000; Marais, 2003; see also paper by Mokoena and Marais in this volume).

![Figure 2](image_url)  
**Figure 2** Changing housing inequality in Bloemfontein: 1991, 1996 and 2001

The above figures reveal a number of trends. First, the total for white Bloemfontein has decreased considerably from 1996 to 2001. Secondly, once again Heidedal has improved,
moving from under the line (negative) to above the line (positive) between 1991 and 2001. Thirdly, in Mangaung there was first an increase in the negative total between 1991 and 2001, while between 1996 and 2001 the total decreased. Furthermore, it seems as if the gap between Bloemfontein and Mangaung increased between 1991 and 1996, but that it started to decrease after 1996. The gap between Heidedal and Mangaung also increased considerably between 1991 and 1996, yet remained the same for the period 1996 and 2001.

The reasons for the above trends should be seen in association with the reasons already provided in respect of changes in inequality with respect to income. The massive inflow of low-income people who settled in informal settlements as a result of the apartheid exclusivity of Bloemfontein is once again a prominent contributing factor. The declining household size resulting from the search for housing units also contributed in this regard. The fact that a number of domestic workers now reside with their employees on the same stand has also resulted in a decrease in inequality between white Bloemfontein and the other areas. The decrease in the gap between white Bloemfontein and Mangaung emanates from the fact that there was a considerable decrease in white Bloemfontein rather than a major improvement in Mangaung. As already alluded to in the introduction, the fact that Bloemfontein did probably not receive adequate subsidies in the Free State probably contributed to this fact. At the same time one should also remember that the housing units constructed under the Housing Subsidy Programme have been fairly small. Increasing inflation has also resulted in a decrease in the number of rooms per house (Marais, 2003). The consequence is that, despite actually having formal housing units, the number of rooms as required by the indicators has probably decreased as a result of the Housing Subsidy Programme. Furthermore, despite a decrease in the gap between white Bloemfontein and Mangaung, the number of people residing in houses with fewer than three rooms in Mangaung has increased from 10 000 in 1991 to over 48 000 in 2001.

5.3.3 Education

Apartheid policies also led to various educational inequalities. Overall, white schools were better resourced, and access to tertiary education was fairly difficult for black people for a long time. With the demise of apartheid more opportunities in respect of education became available to black people, while a huge undertaking was also embarked upon to promote access to educational facilities. Although the quality of education remains suspect, it seems that improved access is high on the agenda. Three indicators were used, namely the Grade 12 pass rate, the percentage of people with a Grade 12 qualification and the percentage of people with a post-Grade 12 qualification. Figure 3 reflects on the changing patterns of inequality in respect of education in Bloemfontein.

Despite a small increase in inequality between white Bloemfontein and Mangaung between 1991 and 1996, there seems to be a considerable decrease in respect of education between 1996 and 2001. This decrease is significant when one considers the gap between white Bloemfontein and Heidedal, and the gap between white Bloemfontein and Mangaung. This decrease is essentially the result of generally better access to education – both at the
secondary and tertiary level – as well as the huge improvements in the overall pass rates in the Free State and in Bloemfontein. Essentially the gap between the pass rates in Bloemfontein and Mangaung decreased considerably. Obviously the data give no indication of the quality of the product being delivered. Comparative educational outcomes between South Africa and the rest of Africa suggest that, despite fairly significant higher levels of access to education in South Africa, the quality of the products being delivered by the system is considerably lower in South Africa than in other parts of Africa (du Plooy 2005: 61; Volksblad 19 December 2006).

![Figure 3](image_url) Changing educational inequality in Bloemfontein: 1991, 1996 and 2001

5.3.4 Infrastructure

As in the case of housing, government programmes focused on addressing infrastructural inequalities in the Mangaung Township. The Mangaung Township provides evidence of large-scale infrastructural improvements, such as road construction, water provision projects, electrification projects and projects focusing on the provision of water-borne sanitation. In terms of infrastructure, four indicators were employed. Consideration was given to the percentage of households with access to electricity, housing units with waterborne sanitation, housing units with water in the house and housing units with water on the stand. The results are reflected in Figure 4.

Considering infrastructure, there seems to be a decline in the gap between Mangaung and white Bloemfontein, as well as between Mangaung and Heidedal. This decrease in the gaps can be related mainly to a fairly effective programme to provide infrastructure. It seems there have been major achievements specifically in the context of electricity provision. The electrification programme is also cited in the Mangaung State of the Environment Report as one of the main reasons for a decline in pollution levels in Bloemfontein. At the same time
the expansion of infrastructure provision in respect of electricity, as well as a fairly high rate of economic growth, has also placed increasing pressure on the provision of electricity.

Figure 4  Changing infrastructural inequality in Bloemfontein: 1991, 1996 and 2001

5.4.3 Assessing overall inequality: reasons and urban management implications
In this section we would like to consider the overall picture across the various sectors. The summary is provided in Figure 5 below.

Figure 5  Inequality patterns across sectors in Bloemfontein: 1991, 1996 and 2001

The above table suggests that some progress has been made in respect of addressing aspects of inequality. A number of points need to be highlighted. It seems as if one aspect of the changing inequality can be related to the fact that a fairly significant number of domestic
workers are currently residing on the erven of their employers. This is probably the most significant reason for the decreases in respect of white Bloemfontein. The segregated space of apartheid has made place for a larger percentage of poor people residing in the former white suburbs – resulting in more “poverty” in these areas. This phenomenon can be evaluated from at least two points of views. On the one hand, it has certain advantages for both employers and employees: employers are less dependent on unreliable transport systems, while employees save on transport costs. On the other hand, this is controlled access for the poor to more wealthy suburbs. In most cases it is only the females who do obtain access in this way. Thus, the fact that the post-apartheid environment has provided increased mobility to people has essentially also resulted in the reduction of the inequality patterns. Yet to a large extent this is a fairly artificial situation and it has not really resulted in greater wealth for the poor – with the possible exception of the introduction of minimum wages in this sector of the economy.

What should also be mentioned is the issue of infrastructure and housing access. Although progress has been made in respect of infrastructure and housing, it seems as if a number of policy issues have resulted in the progress in housing not being as substantial as in the case of basic infrastructure (see paper by Mokoena and Marais in this volume). Access to basic infrastructure has thus improved. However, this access to basic infrastructure should also be seen in conjunction with the associated stress on urban management. Although a cross-subsidisation policy and equity intergovernmental grants are available to local governments, the pressure to ensure cost recovery and, ultimately, viable local government is mounting. In the case of Mangaung the water access of some households is being regulated by technical means to ensure that not too much water is used. Despite the availability of mechanisms to cross-subsidise 6 kl of water to the poor, the utilisation of significantly more than this subsidy increases the pressure on the financial viability of municipalities. The environmental impact in terms of the available water should also not be underestimated.

The third comment relates to education and infrastructure. The problem with measuring inequality is that it usually measures some tangible results, for example, access to water and access to free basic education. Although this is probably a legitimate approach, a number of concerns should also be mentioned in this regard. First, it says nothing about the quality of education or the quality of the water that people use. For example, passing Grade 12 does not necessarily mean that a person has the skills to participate meaningfully in the economy of a country.

6. CONCLUSION

This chapter has examined the changing patterns of inequality in Bloemfontein mainly by making use of census data and Z scores. Overall, a picture unfolded of increasing inequality for the three areas under consideration between 1991 and 1996, but of decreasing inequality between 1996 and 2001, and between 1991 and 2001. This decrease in inequality found between the three traditional areas in Bloemfontein was also significantly different from the findings of other studies, which simplistically suggested increased inequalities in South
African society. Two main reasons have been advanced for the decrease in inequality since 1991. The investigation first suggests that both increased mobility and increased access for domestic workers are significant reasons. However, more important, is the fact that increased service delivery ensured that the comparative infrastructure situation was significantly better in Mangaung in 2001 than in 1991. The gap between Mangaung and white Bloemfontein decreased significantly.

However, two longer-term questions should be asked in this respect. The one relates to the financial sustainability of the provision of infrastructure with infrastructure standards which are unaffordable to a large percentage of the population. This unaffordability coupled with the inadequacy of cross-subsidisation mechanisms has already resulted in mechanisms which attempt to curb water consumption in poorer areas. In addition, this will place increasing pressure on municipalities to ensure efficient technical maintenance of engineering plants which support water and sanitation provision. The tendency could easily be to support access but not to consider long-term maintenance – an aspect that has already crippled a number of municipalities in the Free State.

REFERENCES

SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE


Chapter 2


VOLKSBLAD. 19 December 2006. Swak skole ‘is S.A. tragedie’.


Revitalising the Bloemfontein CBD: prospects, obstacles and lost opportunities

1. INTRODUCTION

There is a rich tradition in urban scholarship of attempts to understand urban change. Although considerable theoretical innovations in understanding the city can be highlighted, much of our current comprehension of cities can still be traced to the Chicago School and its various urban “models”, which gave prominence to the idea that cities have Central Business Districts (CBDs) around which multiple permutations of other land uses are arranged. In a post-paradigmatic intellectual era urban researchers have certainly moved on to more rigorous and diverse theoretical engagements with the concept of the city, yet the importance ascribed to the idea of “a/the CBD” has remained. Traditionally, CBDs are interpreted as multi-functional areas, incorporating commercial, retail, cultural and residential components (Waugh, 1995; Carter, 1995). As in the past, the city still provides employment opportunities for a large part of the urban population, and it connects the suburban populations through various modalities (Paddison, 1999).

Despite this state of affairs, changes in the economic structure and a different approach to urban planning have also made CBDs less prominent in the economies of cities in recent years (Hui and Tse, 2004). Whilst the future of the city continues to be theorised, most urban scholars would support the idea that CBDs are changing. In many cases, up-market retailers and companies decentralise from the CBD to other areas in the city. At the same time informalisation has also “invaded” CBDs. This in turn affects the rental quality and the behaviour of formal businesses (Cohen, 1999). Despite increased decentralisation and informalisation, CBDs cannot be ignored as they still form an important component of the economic foundations of most cities (Engelbrecht, 2004), while they also have large amounts of sunk capital.

Internationally, a vast array of research focusing on policies and strategies seeking inner-city regeneration and renewal (see Atkinson, 1999; Smith, 1999; Lawless and Gore, 1999; Cameron, 2003) has emerged since the 1980s. In the South African context academic (Dewar, 2004; Rogerson, 1996) and non-academic (Thale, 2004; Erasmus, 2004) research has appeared on inner-city upgrading, focusing in particular on Cape Town and Johannesburg (Oelofse, 2004). The majority of these investigations, however, have focused on South Africa’s large metropolitan complexes, while there is hardly any literature on the specific dilemmas of inner-city upgrading in non-metropolitan cities. In the South African context national legislation to address the redevelopment of urban centres specifically was slow to emerge and certainly not with the refinement of distinctions between primary and secondary cities (see Engelbrecht 2004). In addition, subsequent legislation has been introduced with the problems and issues of metropolitan
South Africa in mind. It is our contention that, against this background, a number of important questions should be considered in terms of CBD revival in secondary cities such as Bloemfontein.

These issues relate firstly to the question of whether inner-city regeneration in secondary cities might differ from inner-city regeneration in large metropolitan areas. Secondly, can the same assumptions be used to facilitate inner-city upgrading in both large and secondary cities, or are there specific aspects to be considered in the case of secondary cities? Finally, we aim to consider to what extent policies in respect of inner-cities reflect a bias in favour of key metropolitan complexes with potentially little or no value for secondary cities.

Considering the conflict regarding the importance of the CBD within urban areas, general inner-city decline, and the fact that there is virtually no research on inner-city issues in secondary cities in South Africa, the aim of this chapter is to assess the prospects and obstacles related to inner-city regeneration in Bloemfontein. Essentially we aim to argue that policy guidelines for the upgrading of inner cities have been developed within the context of the larger cities in South Africa and that not all of the preconditions on which such policies are based are present in the Bloemfontein (a typical secondary city) CBD. At the same time we contend that some lessons are to be learned. Secondly, we are of the opinion that a number of lost opportunities will also make inner-city regeneration difficult. These contentions are addressed in three sections. First, drawing from international and national experiences, as well as from policy directives, an overview of the policies and strategies used for inner-city regeneration is presented. The investigatory focus then turns to a brief historical sketch of the Bloemfontein CBD. International and national literature is taken into consideration, as well as the background of the Bloemfontein CBD, the chapter attempts to assess the prospects, obstacles and motivation for CBD regeneration in Bloemfontein.

Methodologically the chapter draws on a number of primary and secondary studies conducted for the Mangaung Local Municipality, as well as on other primary research. The following points should be noted. In the first place the investigation draws on a longitudinal study conducted on changes in the residential character of the CBD in Bloemfontein. This study was conducted in 2001 and 2004. The survey for the above study involved approximately 250 household interviews. Secondly, it reflects on in-depth interviews with prominent land owners in the CBD. Thirdly, more than 800 interviews were conducted with retail customers. Half of these interviews were conducted in the CBD and the other half outside of the CBD. Finally, the chapter also makes use of information from about 200 questionnaires conducted with business owners in the CBD. We have intentionally decided not to share all the detailed information but to present it as part of, or evidence for, arguments forwarded in this chapter.
2. INTERNATIONAL AND NATIONAL LESSONS WITH REGARD TO INNER CITY UPGRADEING

Inner-city decay has drawn sustained academic and policy interest for most of the second half of the twentieth century (Gotham, 2001). It was, however, from the early 1970s that several Marxist social scientists such as Castells, Harvey and Lefebvre began to revise Marxists ideas to explain the demise of the CBD as part of broader investigations into uneven metropolitan development, urban industrial decline and other urban trends. These urban theorists argued that investment in land and real estate is an important means by which to accumulate wealth and a crucial activity that pushes the growth of cities in specific ways.

Processes as diverse as inner-city disinvestment and decay, suburbanisation, deindustrialisation, urban renewal and gentrification are part and parcel of the continuous reshaping of the built environment to create a more efficient arena for profit making. Indeed, Harvey (1989) has argued that capitalism’s “creative destruction” underpinned all manner of urban problems ranging from the loss of heritage and the destruction of communities to urban crime. Although opinion differs immensely on what the key causative processes for inner-city decay are, it is generally accepted that such decline can be related to a range of re-articulations in capital accumulation; its expressions have come to be generally, and perhaps more mundanely, described in a range of “discrete” urban processes.

The literature generally relates inner-city decline to, among other reasons, the development of decentralised shopping centres (Pacione, 2001; Dewar, 2004; Wasserman, 2000). According to Hall (1996), the migration of the population to areas outside of the city centre has led to a decrease in the total population of the inner city. At the same time the establishment of new secondary commercial nodes has caused shifts in consumer patterns as well as an increase in day- and night-time contrasts (Engelbrecht, 2004). As changing patterns of consumption were noted, up-market chain stores downscaled their activities within inner-city areas, with an ever-increasing number of low-grade, small-scale and homogenised retailers taking their places of business to alternative areas. One’s view on these changes in respect of consumer patterns and decentralisation can also not be disconnected from an increasing knowledge-based as well as an e-commerce-related economy. Some scholars even question the appropriateness of CBD upgrading, considering the impact of the information, communication and technological revolutions (CDE, 2005).

Inner-city revitalisation is a varied concept that includes actions and processes such as commercial development, upgrading, gentrification and renewal (Donaldson et al., 2003). Moreover, Pickett (1975) defines city renewal as an integrated series of actions which together maintain the economic and social capital of the city. It is more than slum clearance, but rather the support of industrial and commercial districts with the re-allocation of land use and the rehabilitation and conservation of property. Intrinsically the idea of urban regeneration entails investigating viable uses for previously developed land that has become abandoned and derelict (Urbed, 2005). Against this background, this following section reflects on the main lessons in respect of inner-city upgrading. These lessons are drawn from both the

37
international and South African literature as well as current policy directions in South Africa. In general, these lessons reflect on both institutional requirements and specific actions to be taken.

2.1 Private-public partnerships have played a crucial role in inner-city upgrading

In response to urban decline many local authorities, locally and abroad, acknowledge that urban renewal cannot be achieved through government intervention alone. Accordingly, they forged public-private partnerships with developers in a bid to encourage private investment and to direct it towards demarcated areas (Engelbrecht, 2004). In view of the political and economic trends at the end of the 20th century, the most commonly used strategy for recruiting public support and garnering the capital required for regeneration projects has been to create partnerships. Funding and management skills for regeneration projects could come from three sectors of the economy: the public sector, the private sector, and the ‘third sector’ or ‘non-profit’ organisation sector (Cameron, 1999). Examples of these partnerships are Business Improvement Districts (BIDs) and City Improvement Districts (CIDs).

2.2 The role of business/city improvement districts

At an operational level the public-private partnerships have resulted in Business Improvement Districts (BIDs) or City Improvement Districts (CIDs). A BID is a publicly sanctioned, yet privately directed organisation that supplements public services to improve shared, geographically-defined public spaces. Many urban renewal projects are linked to the establishment of BIDs (Davies, 1997; Hogg, Medway and Warnaby, 2003). These business formations enter into institutional arrangements with local government for the delivery of municipal services over and above the municipal norm (Loyd et al., 2003). For example, where the municipality might provide a waste removal service on a weekly basis, these public-private intuitions will ensure a daily service for certain forms of waste. BIDs are considered particularly successful in the South African context as they constitute a credible institutional vehicle to support and represent business interests. They are also most effective where they are driven by the private sector and supported by the public sector (Levy, 2001). They create institutional mechanisms for funding and managing a wide range of business-supporting activities. It should be noted that, in most cases, BIDs are not fully representative of all business interests, but tend to be structured around formal business groupings perpetuating the exclusion of small and informal business interests (Briffault, 1999).

A City Improvement District (CID) could be defined as the joint agreement by property owners in a geographically-defined area to contribute financially towards the maintenance of the area (Thale, 2004). Therefore, if 51% of property owners within a designated area could support the concept, a Section 21 company can be formed and the municipality can add a surcharge to the applicable rates bill to finance the company (Erasmus, 2004). The Cape Town CBD, for example, was recognised as being of critical importance to metropolitan success when the Cape Town Partnership, a public-private sector institution, was formed to
address the decay and attract new investment (Njikelana, 1996; Reilly, 2003). The Cape Town Partnership consists of the City of Cape Town, the Cape Metropolitan Council, the South African Property Owners’ Association (SAPOA), the Cape Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the South African Black Technical and Allied Careers Organisation (SABTACO), Business Against Crime, the Cape Town Heritage Trust, the Cape Town Tourism Bureau and city improvement associations (Dewar, 2004). The overall goal of the partnership is to establish and market Cape Town as a city that is globally competitive by using the CBD as an example and guaranteeing world-class performance standards. Similarly, in partnership with Gauteng Agency Blue IQ, the Johannesburg City Council is attempting to transform the inner city into a safe and attractive place to work, live and visit (Davie, 2005). Both BIDs and CIDs have become credible institutional arrangements to address inner-city deterioration and have been dependent on private sector involvement.

2.3 The development of flagship projects
Flagship projects highlight the strategic location or unique facilities of a city. Sometimes they attempt to alter city structure through the creation of secondary urban centres. Flagship projects are aimed at local property developers/private investors and attempt to encourage organic growth within urban areas by shifting perceptions about particular localities (Engelbrecht, 2004). They represent competitive attitudes of a drive towards bringing business back from the decentralised areas of the city, rather than to balance development between the city and its outlying areas (Njikelana, 1996). This takes on a number of forms such as convention centres (for example, Cape Town and Durban), festival market places, major office complexes, new retail developments (Waterfront in Cape Town), and leisure and sporting facilities. These projects attempt to promote new urban images and boost civic pride (Loftman et al., in Engelbrecht, 2004). In turn, this is supposed to enhance business confidence and facilitate increases in land values and development activities to adjacent areas. Often projects are not sufficient to ensure locational differentiation or the diversification of local economies. It should be noted that, in the South African context, these flagship projects have often been linked to international tourism markets (convention centres in Cape Town, Durban and Johannesburg, and the Waterfront in Cape Town).

2.4 Addressing property decline and derelict buildings
Hartshorn (1971) argues that the inner city is prone to a downgraded socio-economic character and an abundance of substandard housing. This is the result of the realities of invasion and succession, and different forms of decentralisation such as business, entertainment and residential decentralisation. Where inner-city decay is prevalent, commercial buildings often become neglected because of a lack of regular maintenance on the buildings (Morris, 1999). Gotham (2001) argues that, because of perceptions relating to the lack of recognition by real estate officials and downtown business elites – something which many inner-city areas experience – the dislocating and segregating effects of urban renewal and public housing on the CBD and their role in shaping demographic and population patterns are also often ignored. This is exacerbated by absenteeism of landlords and
landlords stopping the payment of rates and taxes as well as service charges (Engelbrecht, 2004; Morris, 1999). This causes a general deterioration of buildings (Dewar, 2004). High rentals, low affordability levels and the use of commercial buildings for residential purposes instead of business opportunities combine to create overcrowded and degraded residential environments in the inner city (Engelbrecht, 2004; Morris, 1999).

According to Bremner (2000), the first step in urban renewal strategies is often to invest in the physical regeneration of buildings and infrastructure. The rehabilitation of buildings is applied in areas where the first signs of decay are observed, although the buildings can be restored by implementing the rehabilitation rules. Nieuwoudt (1993) highlights two types of rehabilitation within the city centre, namely the rehabilitation of buildings and structures of cultural or historical interest, and the rehabilitation of buildings that can be reutilised. In contrast, buildings and areas which do not exhibit signs of any decay and are in a good condition should also be preserved. These buildings are preserved by effectively enforcing building and zoning regulations (Byfogle and Krueger, 1975).

2.5 Financial incentives to revitalise inner cities

Governments may endeavour to support area-based strategies by crowding in resources from national programmes to enhance the impact of public expenditure. Fiscal measures, such as tax incentives, are common (Engelbrecht, 2004). These may take the form of capital allowances, demand-side occupation subsidies, and relief schemes for capital gains tax. Within the South African context the Minister of Finance, Trevor Manuel, announced in 2003 the introduction of a tax incentive which would encourage investment in certain specified urban development zones. In addition to these tax incentives, national grants are available within housing policy. The Social Housing policy makes provision for a “restructuring zone grant” and most CBDs could be registered as such zones. The institutional housing subsidy also makes inner city upgrading more likely. The core objectives of these incentives are to respond to the problem of dereliction and dilapidation in large cities, and to promote urban renewal and development through private sector investment in the construction and improvement of buildings.

The tax incentive, falling under section “13quat” of the Income Tax Act (Act No. 58 of 1962), comes in the form of an accelerated depreciation allowance for the construction of new buildings and improvements in specified urban development zones. The urban development allowance applies only to buildings or improvements within an urban development zone selected by certain municipalities. In terms of the budget proposals for 2003, 16 municipalities were identified to benefit from the incentive. In terms of the legislation each municipality has the task of selecting one or two urban renewal zones based on certain qualifying criteria (National Treasury, 2004).

2.6 Increasing the residential component of inner cities

Internationally many different themes have been explored focusing on inner-city residential areas (see, for example, Reimann, 1997; Burnett, 2003; Helling and Sawicki, 2003).
Hartshorn (1971) discusses the decline and expansion versus improvement and contraction in respect of housing quality as instances which are commonly experienced in residential change. At the same time aspects such as mixed land use (residential and commercial) have become a response to the modernised planning principle which tried to separate these two land uses.

Considering the residential character of the CBD, Pacione (2001) suggests that the inner city is an area with only limited residential land uses. Kuo et al. (1998) argue that many common and shared spaces in the inner city are often barren no-man’s lands. Alternatively, a fairly new phenomenon has developed internationally where the construction of inner-city apartments has seen a ready response by local authorities towards rejuvenating downtown areas. This is based on the idea that the inner-city apartment is a geographical reaction to the marked physical separation of residence, paid work and live entertainment, which characterises the suburb, rather than a switch of preference for a wholly new residential form (Morrison and McMurray, 1999). Furthermore, Foth and Sanders (2005) are of the opinion that, as cities become more compact, critical attention should be turned to the influence of inner-city apartments and their role on the elemental components of urban renewal initiatives and design. As already noted, the South African housing policy through social housing programmes provides for inner-city upgrading and an increase in the residential component of inner-cities (Department of Housing, 2005a). The extraordinary emphasis in many South African urban policies (Department of Housing, 1997, 2005a 2005b) on higher densities also suggests that an increase in the residential component of CBDs could play a role in increasing densities.

2.7 Addressing crime and grime

Foster (1990) argues that crime is an ever-present and pervasive characteristic of many inner-city areas. One of the most worrying aspects of crime is not the overall level of crime or the relationships between the factors that cause it, but rather the deterrence of economic opportunity. This deterrence of economic opportunity in CBDs is often created by the effects of decentralised commercial developments and urban sprawl (Glaeser et al., 1996).

High crime rates near or in the CBD, whether real or perceived, could increase concerns about personal safety and thereby induce the migration of affluent residents to the suburbs, with a concomitant relocation of employment opportunities and businesses (Burnham et al., 1990). It is Oc and Tiesdell’s (1997) contention that, despite the social, economic and political changes in city centres, these centres remain important. According to Lea (1972: 45), the slum is the general form of city-centre decay and perilous surroundings. Slum housing and overcrowding of many of the buildings are portrayed as home to a criminally-minded and welfare-dependent ‘underclass’ (Mooney, 1999; Dewar, 2004). Because of this, grime inevitably and causally leads to crime; this process also could happen in the other way round.
2.8 Regulating decentralised developments

There is some evidence from the literature that a small number of municipalities have placed an embargo on decentralised commercial developments in an attempt to ensure a vibrant CBD. In this respect one might consider the embargo that the Greater London Council has placed on the development of regional shopping centres on the outskirts of London.

3. THE BLOEMFONTEIN CBD: AN HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE AND CURRENT EMPHASIS

In order to investigate the prospects for, and obstacles to, inner-city regeneration for the Bloemfontein CBD, a broad historical overview and the current emphasis on CBD regeneration is required. Krige described Bloemfontein as the quintessential apartheid urban centre (1991, 1998). This statement relates inter alia to the manner in which the various population groups were segregated, with the CBD forming the central point of convergence for commercial purposes (see Krige, 1991). Under apartheid the Bloemfontein CBD was a “whites only” group area. Unlike the case in other cities, inner-city segregation remained intact as late as the early 1990s, when more than 90% of the residents were still white (Jürgens, Bähr and Marais, 2003). In addition to the emphasis on Group Areas in Bloemfontein, the black population had been channelled away from Bloemfontein altogether to “apartheid dumping grounds” such as Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu between 1968 and 1990 (see Krige, 1991).

This resulted in the city of Bloemfontein being extended 60 km to the east in order to keep Bloemfontein a “white”-based city, but with the Bloemfontein CBD the only prominent CBD for this region. Moreover, in correlation with the rest of South Africa (see Dewar, 2004), the Bloemfontein City Council had taken various decisions in favour of decentralised developments since the early 1980s. Krige (1998) noted that, since 1994, nearly all private development has taken place towards the west of the CBD. These decentralised developments played a fundamental role in ensuring that, initially, white customers and, later, middle-class customers in general withdrew from the CBD as an area for commercial purposes. Furthermore, the withdrawal of the middle- and higher-income groups from the CBD meant that the CBD went through a phase of adjustment to a new clientele. Overall buildings were not properly maintained and public spaces as well as services did not regularly receive adequate attention. The low levels of public investment in services — which went hand in hand with the development of decentralised commercial areas — further led to the deterioration of the CBD.

The above overview creates a clear picture: the lack of control within the Bloemfontein CBD by different parties cannot be understood without relating it to the approval of decentralised commercial complexes since the 1980s. It can also not be disconnected from modernist planning paradigms which had, historically, separated residential and commercial spaces. Lastly, it cannot be seen without reference to an economy that has become more and more dependent on information and communication technology, which literally require different
Chapter 3

built environments. In addition, the services economy, similarly, is physically accommodated in different building units. As the growing service and technology base sought different types of office accommodation, many of the entertainment amenities of the old Bloemfontein — such as the Hotel Grand and movie theatres such as the Plaza, Ritz, Monte Carlo and Capital — disappeared (Coetzee, 2006), with their functions being relocated in shopping malls and neighbourhoods such as Westdene (see Hoogendoorn and Visser, 2007).

This is not to say that all decentralised nodes, whether retail or entertainment focused, were successful. The woeful performance of Noordstad Mall (now renamed Northridge Mall) — two decades ago seen as the starting point of a retail and entertainment migration a considerable distance from the more centrally located neighbourhoods closer to the CBD — highlights the limitations of a secondary city. The consumer market in a slow-growing urban economy of limited size. Even the most successful decentralised residential cluster of development on the western fringe of the city — Langenhoven Park — took more than two decades of extensive residential expansion before the area’s economy was deemed large enough to warrant and support the development of a reasonably sized shopping complex. Even so, the entertainment focus of the city has not seen any significant development there.

The importance of CBD upgrading is reflected in the Integrated Development Plan (IDP) of the Mangaung Local Municipality. The development objective which should guide the upgrading of the CBD states that “By 2006 Manguang CBDs are in demand by offices and retail, their GGP is growing at a rate of 4.5% per annum, at least 100 new business have been established, vacant office space has been reduced by 50% and more persons are permanently residing within the CBDs, which are vibrant, both during the night and the day” (Mangaung, 2006). A problematic aspect concerning what is ultimately a planning vision statement is that the IDP appears oblivious of the fact that Mangaung’s urban economy has not displayed any significant growth over the past decade. Plainly business formation is not taking place at the “hoped for” rate. Should one aim to develop the CBD in that manner, it could lead to the cannibalising of the business sector elsewhere in the city. Indeed, the failure of Noordstad Mall is closely tied to the development of the Mimosa Mall and the Loch Logan Waterfront located in Brandwag and Westdene respectively.

Nevertheless, whilst it is noteworthy that reference is made to more than one CBD, therefore also including the CBDs in Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu, this paper focuses only on the CBD in Bloemfontein as it is economically far more prominent than any of the other two. In respect of IDP programmes required in this regard, the following are mentioned specifically: an increase in visitors, the fact that the CBD should be clean and safe, effectively linking the historic CBD with the surrounding areas, effectively linking the CBD with the transport systems, and increasing the residential densities and the establishment of BIDs. In the light of the literature review, these programmes seem to be aligned with what is suggested in the literature. Although CBDs and the revitalisation of CBDs are important, one may ask whether there is not an overemphasis on CBD upgrading compared to the lack of emphasis on information and communication technologies. Against this background the chapter evaluates the prospects, obstacles and lost opportunities in respect of urban renewal in Bloemfontein.
4. PROSPECTS, OBSTACLES AND LOST OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE RENEWAL OF THE BLOEMFONTEIN CBD

The sections above provided an overview of the national and international lessons in respect of inner-city upgrading as well as a historic overview of the Bloemfontein CBD. The emphasis now shifts to discussing the prospects, obstacles and lost opportunities of CBD revitalisation in Bloemfontein. Essentially our aim is to analyse to what extent the lessons from the international and national perspective are relevant to the CBD of Bloemfontein.

4.1 Getting the fundamentals right: addressing crime and grime

The first major obstacles in the revitalisation of the CBD are in respect of the basic provision of services such as waste removal, water and crime prevention. Overall the negative experience of the provision of basic services as perceived by businesses, landowners and customers is the single most important aspect that has a negative influence on the business environment in the Bloemfontein CBD. The high levels of dissatisfaction are reflected in Figure 1.

![Figure 1](The levels of dissatisfaction of businesses with service delivery in the CBD, 2005)

In addition to these statistics, more than 50% of the formal businesses indicated crime and safety as the chief disadvantage for locating in the CBD. The low level of service provision was also an issue raised by landowners during a workshop. In fact, landowners were of the opinion that the single most important obstacle to the economic development of the CBD is the fact that basic services are not delivered adequately. The dissatisfaction with the poor levels of services in the CBD is also reflected in customers’ responses (both in the CBD and in the decentralised shopping centres), irrespective of race. Plainly these are issues to all residents of Bloemfontein and cannot be racialised empirically. The dissatisfaction is reflected
in the following responses: 57% of customers responding to the question regarding their most negative experience of the CBD mentioned crime, feeling unsafe and dirt (grime); 54% of the customers responding mentioned that making the CBD safer and cleaner would bring more people to the CBD; just over 50% of the CBD residents interviewed claimed that crime, violence and dirt are negative aspects of the CBD. Furthermore, it should be noted that the perception of a lack of safety is not necessarily supported by the actual incidence of crime amongst the residents in the CBD. Crime statistics indicate that the CBD is not the worst affected in Bloemfontein. Ironically some of the areas to which many CBD businesses and more specifically consumers have decentralised, or started-up, such as Westdene, experience higher levels of crime at certain points in time. Although crime exists, the challenge from a planning point of view is to change the perception in respect of the prevalence of crime in the CBD. Considering the evidence above, there can be little doubt that the suggestions from the literature are confirmed by business owners and the consumer base: “getting the basics right” and addressing crime and grime are appropriate starting points and extremely relevant to the revitalisation of Bloemfontein’s CBD.

4.2 Locating vital economic generators in the CBD

As already indicated in the historic overview, Bloemfontein’s CBD has lost its historical entertainment character. When customers were asked what was negative or what could be done to improve the CBD, a small but significant percentage (7%) mentioned aspects related to its entertainment character. It was also noteworthy to see that entertainment was one of the main reasons for visiting the decentralised shopping centres, but it was virtually absent from responses on the CBD. As already noted in the literature, the economic diversification of CBDs has usually gone hand in hand with flagship projects to diversify the economy of the CBD – entertainment being one aspect (Clark, 2004). Considering this approach, two lost opportunities in Bloemfontein are that the newly-constructed Windmill Casino is not located in the CBD, but on to the western fringe; Secondly, it also seems unlikely that the planned Bloemfontein Convention Centre will be developed in the CBD. What seems evident from these lost opportunities is that a concerted effort is required to lobby and make land available in the CBD for one or two flagship projects. The ability of Bloemfontein to lobby for the location of such initiatives to the CBD is also hampered by the fact that the Bloemfontein economy is less directly related to the international tourism market and concentrates mainly on the local and regional market. The question thus arises whether the ability of flagship projects to promote economic diversification in a secondary city such as Bloemfontein is as viable and appropriate as in other cities with larger global economic linkages.

Although an opportunity that still exists is the expansion of the National Museum, as well as the upgrading of the historic President Brand Street as a tourism precinct (see Visser elsewhere in this collection). This effort will require extensive intergovernmental cooperation between the Mangaung Local Municipality and the Department of Arts, Culture and Sport. These institutions should jointly raise funds and plan for the extension and improvement of the Museum. Consideration may be given to the use of Hertzog Square as part of the National Museum’s activities. This will automatically link the National Museum to President
SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE

Brand Street. The development of President Brand Street as a pedestrian and tourism-friendly environment could play an important role in this regard. However, such an initiative is at the same time also dependent on managing the existing tourism market in Bloemfontein, as well as ensuring further growth.

4.3 The potential of increasing the residential component of the CBD

The Bloemfontein CBD has historically had a fairly small residential component. Furthermore, the residential component of the CBD has mainly been located on the fringes of the CBD. The potential for increasing the residential component of the CBD seems promising and two mechanisms could probably further assist in this regard. Firstly, the use of the funding mechanisms for Social Housing could be used. In this regard the institutional subsidy, as well as allocating the CBD a restructuring grant, could be appropriate approaches. The second mechanism relates to the land tax policies of the Mangaung Local Council. Specific discounts in land tax are available for land owners who want to change the use of their commercial properties to also include a residential component. At the same stage attention should also be devoted to ensuring that an increase in the residential component does not lead to the deterioration of buildings and the public environment. However, in terms of residential property development the main obstacle is that on the whole buildings are not large enough for viable office to residential conversions.

4.4 Making use of BIDs or CID

Although the literature suggests that making use of BIDs and CID as institutional arrangements for CBD upgrading could be viable, a number of concerns should be expressed in respect of the Bloemfontein case study. The fact that more than 50% of the buildings in the CBD belong to one owner makes this approach less viable, as these BIDs and CID will be highly dependent on one company. These institutions could also be dominated by one land owner for his/her own interests. This probably also makes other land owners less willing to cooperate in such an institution. The use of these institutional arrangements is also closely related to government tax incentives. The availability of tax incentives by the national government to foster CBD upgrading favours national and international corporations to some degree. The ability of big businesses such as Old Mutual to carry expenses and manage cash flows on inner-city upgrading in some areas against the operations and profits elsewhere and in other divisions of the business (not only in property management) makes it easier for such enterprises to use the tax incentives. In Bloemfontein, where the enterprises owning property in the CBD are mainly in property management, while the majority of these enterprises own the largest part of these properties, the use of tax incentives seems less promising. In fact, during a survey of land owners, less than 50% indicated that they were aware of such possibilities. At the same time, as is the case in other cities, CID and BID are potentially unfriendly to the informal sector. Overall, although we agree that CID and BID do have a place and one of these options should at least be considered, it should also be acknowledged that the implementation of these mechanisms in a much smaller, less globally linked economy might be more difficult.
4.5 Regulating decentralised development

It was suggested during the research that Council should consider deciding to regulate decentralised development. In this way the CBD would be protected from increasing decentralised commercial activity. It is important to note that it was the landowners in the CBD who felt that an embargo on decentralised development is not necessary. In their opinion they have managed to adjust towards a new clientele and their occupation rates have increased considerably over the last five years. They were all of the opinion that regulation in this regard to address some of the dilemmas in the CBD is inappropriate.

5. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

A claim of this investigation is that, despite a range of post-paradigmatic views of the city, considerable importance is still ascribed to a city’s CBD. In many ways the CBD retains a spatial ordering function and appears to be a seemingly indispensable feature of a city, which is essential to our understanding of the city. This investigation reveals that in the context of Bloemfontein this is not the case. The CBD has developed a new function and has adapted to new realities and users. The CBD is part of the lives of a section of the city’s population, but has all but disappeared from the lived geographies of large portions of Bloemfontein’s population. Following Pirie’s (2007) contention in the Cape Town context, we would argue that, structurally and spatially, the Bloemfontein CBD is not the “centre” of the city. Not only is a considerable proportion of business conducted elsewhere, but the commercial component of the CBD is no longer primarily about commodity trade.

A contention of this investigation is that these issues relate firstly to the question of whether inner-city regeneration in secondary cities might differ from inner-city regeneration in large metropolitan areas. Our argument is that this is indeed the case. Three reasons from our discussion above support this contention. Firstly, compared to Cape Town or Johannesburg, limited international linkage of the Bloemfontein CBD to global capital makes CBD upgrading less important from an image and an economic point of view. Secondly, in the much smaller context of Bloemfontein, the use of tax incentives in respect of upgrading buildings appears to be misplaced for this particular location. Businesses have either adapted to new CBD markets, or new businesses, typically SMMEs, have developed within the context of the new CBD realities.

Related to this is the fact that the ownership base of CBD building stock is narrow and in the hands of a few business entities, with their main business activities in commercial properties. Unlike big business that can write off property investments and manage their cash flows in respect of property investment against other business activities, these smaller enterprises focusing mainly on property management do not necessarily have the business back-up to make use of the available incentives. Furthermore, given that their building stock is let and the occupants have adapted to new CBD realities, there is little incentive for these property owners to participate in the renewal/revival programmes. On the contrary, currently these property owners are effectively blocking significant renewal. In addition, as one of the
key property owners in the CBD is developing the largest regional mall in the central regions of South Africa just outside the CBD frame, there is little financial logic for the owner to invest on a large scale in the CBD. The issue of “cannibalising” their own property portfolios is a real threat, particularly in the context of our next point.

Secondly, it is our contention that the location and possibility of economic diversification projects in the CBD are limited. There are a number of reasons for such limitations. Firstly, it has to be acknowledged that, relative to the large metropolitan areas, the local economy of Bloemfontein is stagnant (although significant growth has been recorded lately). Also, in contrast to large metropolitan areas, Bloemfontein has very limited links to the national economy. Perhaps more importantly, links into the external economy or the national economy that is typically deployed to diversify CBD economies, such as the “creative industries” (in a broad sense), are particularly limited. In this respect some of these issues can be linked to institutional limitations in terms of both the provincial and local governments. Unlike, Johannesburg, for example, where there is close cooperation between provincial and local government departments and their planning units, this is not the case in Bloemfontein. There appears to be a lack of understanding of the critically important role that provincial governments play in the local economy and the CBD, in particular. In both cases there is a strong political imperative to spread development programmes across the Free State or Mangaung space-economy. Yet, there is a need to provide a clear and strong point of redevelopment to make possible the revival of the CBD.

Revitalising the CBD in terms of getting people not to hold negative perceptions of it is principally located in easily remedied issues such as better waste removal, public toilet facilities and cleaning services, as well as crime prevention. In the case of Bloemfontein, revitalising the CBD to attract more customers will be dependent on local municipal actions (perhaps in association with the private sector) to ensure an adequate environment rather than using the available national programmes to address the situation.

REFERENCES


Chapter 3


SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE


NJIKELANA, S. 1996. Let’s live in our cities and enjoy them. Plans for renewal. SACP Health Sector: Johannesburg. Available online:
REIMANN, B. 1997. The transition from people’s property to private property: Consequences of the restitution principle for urban development and urban renewal in East-Berlin’s inner-city residential areas. Applied Geography, 17(4), 301-314.
SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE


Inner-city residential change in Bloemfontein after apartheid: a perspective on those who did not flee desegregation

1. INTRODUCTION

In the apartheid era central business districts (CBDs) were situated in the white group areas. Yet CBDs were the first areas to desegregate after the demise of apartheid (Parnell et al., 1996). In fact, by the early 1970s there were already signs of desegregation in certain parts of the Johannesburg CBD (Morris, 1999a; Fick et al., 1988). For various reasons desegregation has completely changed the face of the South African inner city. For many black South Africans access to the inner city meant substantial savings in terms of transport costs (Marais, 1997). In other cases access to the CBD went hand in hand with increases in residential densities and a deterioration of the living environment (Mabin and Smit, 1997; Crankshaw and White, 1995). A fair amount of research has been conducted on inner cities, such as those of Johannesburg (Beavon, 2004; Morris, 1994; Rogerson, 1996; Morton, 1998; Bremner, 2000), Pretoria (Donaldson et al., 2001; 2003), Cape Town (Dewar, 2004; Wilkinson, 2000) and Durban (Khosa and Naidoo, 1998; Maharaj and Mpungose, 1994). Despite the voluminous body of work available on the changing residential environments, however, none of the relevant conceptual or more empirical studies focused specifically on how the white cohorts of the population have experienced residential desegregation. In many cities residential desegregation has displaced white people. By 2001 the Bloemfontein inner city had not experienced the same levels of desegregation as other inner-city areas in South Africa (Jürgens et al., 2003). However, as a result of increasing desegregation, the percentage of white households in the CBD had decreased to 23% by 2004. To some extent Bloemfontein has lagged behind in terms of desegregation (Jürgens et al., 2003; Kotze and Donaldson, 1998). Current trends in Bloemfontein suggest a considerable increase in the levels of desegregation, but there is still no indication that the majority of whites are likely to flee the CBD, as occurred in Johannesburg. At the same time Visser (2003: 230) has drawn attention to the limited amount of research on displaced white people and on white people remaining behind in CBDs. Visser (2003: 230) attributes this to the academic “blindness to white poverties” in post-apartheid South Africa, amongst other causes. In fact, Schuermans and Visser (2005: 259) argue that “research programmes designed to focus on white lives have dwindled,” and that attention needs to be focused on promoting an understanding of “white poverties” in terms of the fact that not “all whites are wealthy, included and empowered”. In practical terms Visser (2003: 231) asks the following important questions in respect of desegregation: “The question is where have these white people gone? For example, what has happened to white households that formerly lived in Hillbrow, Berea and Yeoville in Johannesburg?” Although we do not intend to attempt to answer these questions conclusively (since they pose extensive
methodological challenges), we do agree that they are valid questions. In large part they remain unanswered questions to which socio-economic research has not attended in much detail. (Some rare exceptions in this regard include Du Plessis (2004) and Guillaume and Teppo (2002).) At the same time a number of other questions should also be asked, specifically in respect of whites’ experiences in those CBDs that are in the process of desegregating. Firstly, the question arises as to why some white people have remained behind in the CBD. Are their demographic attributes in any way different from those of black households? Or do their experiences of a desegregated CBD differ from those of the black households?

Taking these questions into consideration, along with the “blindness to white poverties” in South African research, the aim of the chapter is to examine the white cohorts remaining in the CBD. This will be achieved by providing an overall picture of all the residents in the CBD and, where relevant, making some comparisons. In view of the above aim, the investigation unfolds as follows: firstly, an overview is provided in respect of the methodology employed. This is followed by a literature survey, in which the focus falls on invasion and succession theory, the processes of inner-city decline, evidence relating to desegregation in South Africa’s CBDs, and a reflection on conceptual questions in respect of those white people who are displaced and those who stay behind. In addition an overview of the history of residential changes in the Bloemfontein CBD is presented. This background information is then used as a basis for examining the demographic attributes and experiences of the white population remaining in the CBD. The chapter concludes with a reflection on what can be learned from the phenomenon of “whiteness” in the Bloemfontein CBD.

In essence this investigation is presented as a work in progress and not as a final product. Rather, its aim is to initiate debate regarding the remaining “whiteness” in inner-city areas. In the future more in-depth and thus, hopefully, also more conclusive research will be undertaken in this (possibly seminal) research niche.

2. METHODOLOGY

Methodologically this paper is based on two longitudinal surveys that were conducted in the Bloemfontein CBD in 2001 and 2004. These surveys were aimed at tracing inner-city change. Within this context “inner-city change” is used as an umbrella term to refer to different elements of change, for example, social, spatial and residential changes. These surveys provided basic socio-economic information concerning the existing residents and their perceptions on residing in the Bloemfontein CBD. An important contribution of these surveys lies in the premise that they make it possible to accurately compare the data in order to determine the changes that occurred over three years, as the same methodology was followed for both surveys. In the process 250 household heads, representing approximately 15% percent of the households in the CBD, were interviewed during each of the interview periods. In the 2001 survey 52% of the household heads were white, compared with 23% in 2004.
The following basic procedures were followed. In the first place the CBD boundaries, as defined by the Mangaung Local Council in 2004, were adhered to. A baseline survey aimed at gathering information on the number of buildings and residential units was conducted. Then a random sampling of all residential buildings was carried out. This was followed by a proportional division per building. Fieldworkers at the building level were requested to divide the number of households to be interviewed in terms of the number of levels and the number of questionnaires. For example, if four questionnaires had to be completed in a specific building which had four levels, one questionnaire had to be completed per level. At the building level the fieldworker would start with the lowest number at one level and with the highest number at the next. If nobody was available there, the next number would be taken. Interviews were conducted mainly after 17:00 to ensure that economically active people were incorporated in the survey.\(^1\)

As far as the application of the data is concerned, two approaches will be followed in respect of the analysis. Firstly, a comparison of the data for the white households for 2001 and 2004 will be made. Secondly, comparisons will be made between the attributes of the white and black households – specifically in respect of 2004. Both these comparisons hold value for the study. The first will reveal change over time, while the second will indicate whether there are significant differences between the different groups in respect of the evaluation of the living environment. The information gleaned on the basis of these two comparisons will be used in the analysis.

3. RESIDENTIAL SUCCESSION AND INVASION AND INNER-CITY CHANGE: THE MISSING LINK IN UNDERSTANDING THESE PROCESSES IN SOUTH AFRICA

Middle-class relocation from inner-city areas as a result of replacement by lower-status ethnic minorities is a common phenomenon world-wide (Donaldson \textit{et al.}, 2003). The main difference in the South African context has been that the replacement has been effectuated by a previously disadvantaged majority. On a theoretical level this replacement of one group by another has been contextualised in terms of invasion and succession theory. The initial model of invasion and succession was developed by sociologists of the Chicago school (Park \textit{et al.}, 1974). They defined invasion and succession as a phenomenon in terms of which a lower-status group “invades” the neighbourhood of a higher-status group. The latter group may regard this invasion as a threat to their social status and “flee”, allowing a lower-class group to “succeed” them (Freeman and Rohe, 2000). Classical invasion and succession theory suggests that three phases can be discerned in this process (Deskins, 1981). The first phase involves a limited settlement of the minority group in the area originally occupied by “whites”. The second phase sees the evolvement of specific clusters of the minority group. The third phase entails a rapid increase in the number of people from the minority group/s.

\(^1\) Obviously it is necessary to recognise the shortcomings of the quantitative methodology described above. However, we expect to deal with these questions in a more qualitative and in-depth manner in future.
Succession takes place when “the replacement of one identifiable population subgroup by another [occurs] within the boundaries of a given neighbourhood.” In many cases invasion and succession can be defined as a process of one race taking over an area from another race; and Meyer (1993) argues that there can be little doubt that racism plays a distinct role in this regard, irrespective of socio-economic considerations. At the same time Jürgens et al. (2003) also note that evidence in the literature suggests that the initial “invaders” are “upwardly mobile” and may even be of a higher socio-economic class than the original residents. However, they are then followed by people who have a lower income status. The American evidence suggests that certain threshold levels are reached. This results in whites migrating from the area (Schelling, 1971).

Subsequently this process of invasion and succession has snowballing effects, such as residential decline and deterioration. Dreier (1996: 107) rightfully argues that the behaviour of estate agents, banks, land-owners and others plays a significant role in determining whether the area will deteriorate or maintain an adequate public and private environment. The effect of decline and deterioration often leads to a lack of investment, which in turn may create negative effects such as a lack of services and escalating crime rates, especially in the inner city (Burnham et al., 2004; Zenou, 2003).

Downs (1981) identifies five stages of neighbourhood change, which can be summarised as follows:

- **Stage one (stability and viability)** reflects healthy neighbourhoods that may be new and thriving or old and stable. Property values rise, with no evidence of decline;
- **The second stage (minor decline)** more commonly applies to older neighbourhoods displaying evidence of minor decline. Essentially, the neighbourhood is inhabited by younger residents at higher densities than it originally had. Property values have increased slightly, but in general prices are stable. There is also some decline in respect of public services and the social status of the area;
- **During the third stage (clear decline)** the area is dominated by rented housing with deteriorating tenant-landlord relations. There is evidence of minor structural deficiencies and some structures have been converted to accommodate higher densities. Investment confidence is weak and empty houses become common;
- **The next stage (advanced deterioration)** reflects a high degree of dilapidated housing, and residential properties are mainly occupied by lower-income groups. Landlords find it difficult to profit from their properties and a general pessimism prevails;
- **The final stage (unhealthiness and non-viability)** is characterised by large-scale abandonment and the neighbourhood reflects a very low socio-economic status.

In the South African context the out-migration of white businesses, white bureaucrats and white residents from central inner-city areas has been a reality since the 1990s. Furthermore, the deracialisation and desegregation of urban space is an important factor, rendering these areas more accessible to those lower- and middle-income groups that were previously marginalised to informal areas and townships on the city outskirts (Donaldson et al., 2003).
Chapter 4

Inner-city demographic change and inner-city deterioration have received ample attention in the South African context (Cranshaw and White, 1995; Fick et al., 1988; Hart, 1996; Maharaj and Mpungose, 1994; Morris, 1999a, 1999b; Ownhouse and Nel, 1993). The most in-depth research that has focused on South Africa’s inner-city residential areas is that of Morris (1999a, 1999b) on Hillbrow, a densely populated, high-rise neighbourhood within the inner city of Johannesburg. Hillbrow was one of the first inner-city neighbourhoods in Johannesburg and South Africa to already experience a high level of desegregation during the apartheid era.

Morris (1999b) argues that the pattern of residential desegregation in Hillbrow is reminiscent of the tendency in US cities. The shift in the racial demography of the neighbourhood was followed by the deterioration of many of Hillbrow’s apartment blocks. He furthermore suggests that a number of interrelated processes and actors were involved in the process of physical decline in the case of Hillbrow. It could be argued that this has also been the case in other inner-city areas of South Africa. The processes and actors include: the influence of landlords and their relationship with the tenants and tenants’ organisations which can act as intermediaries; the policies of local and national government, for example, those relating to decentralisation and rejuvenation strategies; the impact that property administrators have on property prices, as well as, possibly, their influence in determining who may, and who may not, rent in a specific area; the general maintenance work carried out by caretakers; and the “redlining” of the neighbourhood by the financial institutions as a result of factors such as lack of investment, or the labelling of so-called “no-go” areas.

Visser (2003) points out that, although research in this regard has been carried out in the Anglo-American context, for example, empirical and conceptual research on desegregation from the point of view of those who are displaced, or who “need” to remain behind in CBDs, is virtually non-existent in South Africa. Schuermans and Visser (2005) also argue that the desegregation of the inner city has marginalised some poor whites who formerly lived, or who still live, in the inner city, because alternative “white”-based secondary and tertiary economic activities have moved to suburban areas. In addition, Visser (2003) asks the question: to what degree does the property-value decline that takes place (in terms of the stages identified by Downs above) impact on whites for whom properties have been their main form of investment? Visser (2003: 232) goes on to argue that “as a result, thousands of white households hold/held on to what is/was effectively negative equity”. Alternatively, they are “trapped” by these properties, as they cannot afford to buy properties elsewhere (Visser, 2002: 232). Against the background of the above theoretical exposition of invasion and succession, processes of inner-city decline and the relevant questions concerning the “white blindness” of researchers in respect of invasion, succession and inner-city decline, this chapter will first provide a historical overview of residential change in Bloemfontein, followed by an analysis of the white cohort remaining in the CBD.
4. INNER-CITY RESIDENTIAL CHANGE IN BLOEMFONTEIN

The emphasis now shifts to residential change in Bloemfontein. First, a brief historical background will be outlined in respect of the central business district of Bloemfontein. This will be followed by an analysis of desegregation, with the focus on the implications for, and experiences of, white people in this regard.

4.1 Historical background of the central business district (CBD) of Bloemfontein

In order to understand the nature of residential units in the Bloemfontein inner city, a broad historical overview is required (see also paper on CBD revitalisation by Hoogendoorn et al. in this volume). Krige (1998; 1991) has described Bloemfontein as an ideal apartheid city. This description relates, inter alia, to the manner in which the various population groups were formerly segregated, with the CBD as the central point of convergence for commercial purposes. Under apartheid the residential component of the Bloemfontein CBD was a “whites only” area, as pointed out in the relevant literature. In contrast to other cities, inner-city segregation still prevailed in Bloemfontein by 1991, since more than 90% of the residents were still white. In addition to the different group areas in Bloemfontein, blacks had been channelled away from Bloemfontein to Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu between 1968 and 1990 (see Krige, 1991). This meant that the city of Bloemfontein was extended 60 km to the east, in order to keep Bloemfontein racially segregated.

As has happened in the rest of South Africa (see Dewar, 2004), the Bloemfontein City Council has taken various decisions in favour of decentralised shopping centres since the early 1980s. Krige (1998) notes that, since 1994, nearly all private development has taken place towards the west of the CBD. These decentralised developments have played a fundamental role in ensuring that, initially, white customers and, later, middle-class customers in general, withdrew from the CBD as an area for shopping. Furthermore, as a result of the withdrawal of the middle- and higher-income groups from the CBD, the CBD also underwent a phase of adjustment to a new clientele. This implies that, for the past ten to fifteen years, very little private sector finance has gone into the CBD. Overall buildings have not always been maintained and public spaces and services have not regularly received adequate attention. However, as we shall later demonstrate, the availability level of basic internal services remains very good. The low levels of public investment in services – which went hand in hand with the development of decentralised commercial areas – led to the further deterioration of the CBD.

4.2 The level of desegregation

The Bloemfontein CBD is the residential area of the former “white” Bloemfontein with the highest levels of desegregation. The share of the black population in the Bloemfontein CBD increased from 4% in 1991, to 29.9% in 1996, 52.7% in 2001 (Jürgens et al.)

---

2 For the purposes of the analysis, African, coloured and Indian/Asian people are considered as black.
It could be argued that this change in the population composition of the CBD reflects a normalisation process of the South African demography. At the same time it also appears, at first sight, to represent an example of invasion and succession, as discussed in the theoretical section of this chapter. However, our preliminary conclusions on the basis of the available evidence suggest that full succession is unlikely. (Figure 1 graphically displays the levels of desegregation, from a spatial perspective, across the Bloemfontein CBD between 1996 and 2004.)

Figure 1   Levels of desegregation in the Bloemfontein CBD (1996-2004)

4.3 Who did not flee desegregation?
In the light of the above historical background, as well as the existing desegregation levels, the focus will now turn to those who have not fled the Bloemfontein CBD. First of all, before more specific arguments are put forward, a broad comparison of the socio-economic profiles of the white people in the CBD is provided in Table 1 below. However, only a few comments will be made initially in respect of this table, as a more detailed discussion will follow later.
Table 1  A socio-economic comparison of the white population in the Bloemfontein CBD, 2001 and 2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socio-economic attributes</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of years in CBD</td>
<td>11.31</td>
<td>8.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of years at current address</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two most important reasons for locating in the CBD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of people residing in accommodation</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>1.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of residents who found it very difficult /</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
<td>52.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficult to get accommodation in CBD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average age of residents</td>
<td>32.9</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of females</td>
<td>53.8%</td>
<td>50.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of residents without Grade 12</td>
<td>24.8%</td>
<td>31.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average number of rooms in flat (excluding bathroom and</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kitchen)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly income (2001 values)</td>
<td>R3 747</td>
<td>R4 495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly rental</td>
<td>R 873</td>
<td>R1 187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of income spent on rental</td>
<td>23.2%</td>
<td>21.1% (i.t.o the 2004 value of R5 626)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of respondents who rate the quality of life as</td>
<td>51.1%</td>
<td>49.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>very good / good</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most liked aspect of the Bloemfontein CBD</td>
<td>Proximity to work</td>
<td>Proximity to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most disliked aspect of the Bloemfontein CBD</td>
<td>Crime / violence</td>
<td>Crime / violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of respondents who have been robbed</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
<td>29.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of respondents who have been victims of burglaries</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>20.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of respondents who rate the environment as clean</td>
<td>15.6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of respondents with black neighbours</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although we shall return to these figures during the course of the analysis, a number of key aspects should be noted. The data seem to suggest two simultaneous trends, namely white flight (accompanied by some form of decline in the living environment), as well as the remaining of some white residents in parts of the CBD. Preliminary evidence of white flight is reflected in the fact that the number of years during which the white respondents have been
residing in the CBD has declined, along with the number of years spent at the current address. Other evidence for this argument is found in the fact that the average age of white residents in the CBD has declined, along with the educational level of white residents. Evidence to suggest that certain parts of the CBD remain places of residence for white people (including a significant proportion of higher-income whites) can be discerned in the fact that the average household size declined between 2001 and 2004, as well as the fact that there is very little difference between the two periods under consideration in respect of the ranking of the quality of the area.

4.3.1 Spatial patterns
Desegregation and the so-called “white flight” followed specific patterns within the CBD. The highest levels of desegregation occurred in the southern and south-western sections of the CBD (see Figure 1). However, desegregation and increasing white flight also occurred in the northern parts of the CBD during the period between 2001 and 2004. At the same time, on the basis of Figure 1, it would appear that some definite clustering is taking place in terms of racial groups residing in the CBD. Further evidence in this regard can be found in the survey results, which indicate that 27% of whites had black neighbours, and only 20% of blacks had white neighbours, in 2004. In contrast, 18.5% of whites had black neighbours in 2001 and 14.1% of black residents had white neighbours in the same year. Thus, despite some indications of white clustering, there are discrepancies in the evidence. Moreover, the changes in the results between 2001 and 2004 suggest that increasing overall desegregation has occurred, and not only the clustering of whites.

4.3.2 Demographic attributes
In this section the demographic attributes of the white section of the population, and the way in which these attributes changed between 2001 and 2004, are analysed in more detail. Where applicable, these attributes are compared with the attributes and responses of the black population. It has already been noted on the basis of Table 1 that the average age of white residents decreased between 2001 and 2004. Figure 2 provides an overview of the population pyramid for the white population of the CBD in 2001 and 2004.

A number of points should be noted in respect of the above overview of the age cohorts. It seems that, proportionally, the highest degree of flight has occurred amongst people above the age of 60, while the CBD also lacks a significant proportion of people under the age of 20. This reflects a typical pattern of invasion and succession, considering the large numbers of (mostly black) young people occupying the CBD. Unfortunately, it was not possible to determine the nature of the alternative arrangements made by these older people. Questions could be posed, such as, have some of them settled in with their middle-income children? Have some moved to old-age homes, or settled in other suburbs? The increase in the 20-39-year cohort suggests that there should have been a corresponding increase in the percentage of people under the age of 19. However, the decrease with respect to the white cohorts in the percentage of persons aged 19 years or younger could probably be attributed to the decline in the birth rates of white people in particular. In comparison to the black
population, the major difference lies in the fact that only 3.9% of the black population in the CBD are 40 years of age or older, compared with one third in the case of the white population.

![Age structure of the white population of the Bloemfontein CBD, 2001 & 2004](image)

A second observation is that, similar to the growth of the 20-39 age cohort of the white residents, an increase has also taken place in the percentage of black people in this age cohort. In fact, 67.8% of the black population fell within this age category in 2004, compared with 65% in 2001. This change in the percentage of people in the 20-39-year age group in the case of both the black and the white groups suggests that there has been an increase in the number of students occupying residential units in the CBD. Further evidence of this increase in the number of younger people is the fact that the average number of years during which whites have been living at their current addresses has declined considerably since 2001 – from nearly five years to just over one year.

Thirdly, there seems to have been some change in respect of the gender composition of the white population in the CBD. In respect of the total population surveyed, the percentage of females dropped from 53.8% in 2001 to 50.1% in 2004. No similar change occurred with regard to black women – in the case of the latter, the percentage remained static, at 57% of the total population. Could it be that white women are increasingly finding the CBD to be an inappropriate place of residence – possibly owing to a fear of crime, as some of the literature suggests? (see Allen, 2002) Or is this just a normal consequence of the fact that older people (usually comprising a larger percentage of females) have been finding alternative forms of accommodation?

The fourth aspect relates to the educational level of white and black residents. It was pointed out earlier that there has been an increase in the percentage of white residents without a
Grade 12 qualification. More significantly, the new “invaders” are far better qualified than the white residents. Only 13.9% of the black residents do not have a Grade 12 qualification, compared to 31.9% of their white counterparts. In effect, this reality suggests that whites are being replaced by black people with considerably higher qualifications. The close proximity of the Central University of Technology, together with the convenient location of the University of the Free State, not far to the west, has resulted in a large number of black students replacing the white students. This is corroborated by the available profile of black residents. Secondly, the more highly-qualified whites are being replaced by whites with lower qualifications.

4.3.3 Income and employment

The main trends can be identified from the income and employment profiles of the white people residing in the CBD between 2001 and 2004. Changes in income patterns are reflected in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income categories</th>
<th>Whites - 2001: % (real # in brackets)</th>
<th>Whites - 2004: % (real # in brackets)</th>
<th>Blacks - 2004: % (real # in brackets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R0 - 1 000</td>
<td>10.3 (12)</td>
<td>10.4 (7)</td>
<td>9.9 (14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R1 001 - 2 000</td>
<td>17.1 (20)</td>
<td>16.4 (11)</td>
<td>27.0 (40)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2 001 - 3 000</td>
<td>25.6 (30)</td>
<td>14.9 (10)</td>
<td>25.5 (36)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R3 001 - 4 000</td>
<td>17.1 (20)</td>
<td>13.4 (9)</td>
<td>5.7 (8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R4 001 - 5 000</td>
<td>12.8 (15)</td>
<td>10.4 (7)</td>
<td>10.4 (16)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R5 001 - 6 000</td>
<td>6.0 (7)</td>
<td>1.5 (1)</td>
<td>6.4 (9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6 001 - 7 000</td>
<td>3.4 (4)</td>
<td>10.4 (7)</td>
<td>6.4 (9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7 001 - 8 000</td>
<td>1.7 (2)</td>
<td>4.5 (3)</td>
<td>1.4 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8 001 +</td>
<td>6.0 (7)</td>
<td>17.9 (12)</td>
<td>7.1 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100 (117)</td>
<td>100.0 (67)</td>
<td>100.0 (141)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Income categories were adjusted for inflation (Consumer Price Index), which amounted to 9.3% in 2002, 6.8% in 2003 and 4.3% in 2004. The income categories represent 2001 values.

The first conclusion regarding the income categories above is that the percentage of households with an income of below R2 000 per month remained approximately the same between 2001 and 2004 (27.4% in 2001 and 26.8% in 2004). Secondly, the percentage of households with an income of above R7 000 increased considerably, from 6.7% in 2001 to 22.4% in 2004. This increase in the percentage of white residents earning more than R7 000 was accompanied by a decrease in the number of households with incomes of between
R2 000 and R7 000 per month. Thirdly, confirming the trend that was identified earlier in the age-category analysis, there seems to have been an outflow of pensioners, as well as an increase in the percentage of people employed. In 2001 white pensioners accounted for approximately 15% of the white population. By 2004 this percentage had dropped to 9.2%. Although this factor is not reflected in the above data, the only indication of the CBD having become too expensive for whites is found in the responses of 6% of the white respondents, who suggested that some of their neighbours had left the CBD for this reason.

In a comparison of the incomes of white people in the CBD to those of their black counterparts, the following aspects come to the fore. The average incomes for black households are approximately 10% lower than the corresponding averages for white households (in 2004). However, the percentages of black respondents whose incomes fall within the lowest income categories (below R3 000) are significantly higher than in the case of the white cohorts. What the data seem to suggest is that, at the income level, the “invaders” have slightly lower incomes. However, considering the arguments put forward earlier on, the fact that a large percentage of these residents are actually students probably plays a role in this regard.

The above trends possibly point to three preliminary conclusions in respect of the economic attributes of white people in the CBD. In the first place the CBD seems to have a small but significant percentage of residents (estimated at 20%-30%) who would find it financially impossible to relocate from the CBD, as other white residents have already done, or are planning to do in the future. The concept of social entrapment seems to be applicable to these respondents. Their incomes are typically lower than R2 000 per month (in 2001 values). Secondly, there is also a cohort of middle-income owners who, owing to the nature of the CBD as a residential transit area for people in their early careers, are making use of the CBD as a place of residence, because they are not able to find alternative accommodation. However, as their careers develop, they will probably find alternative accommodation or buy their own homes. The findings also seem to suggest that, for a number of young, white newcomers in the employment arena, some parts of the CBD offer viable housing options. This should also be understood against the background of the rapid increase in housing prices, which has probably made ownership extremely difficult for young persons who are beginning their working careers. Thirdly, the growth in the percentage of white higher-income earners probably suggests a clustering of whites in some of the areas in the CBD.

Also significant, and in contrast to traditional invasion and succession theory, is the fact that the initial “invaders” are lower-income earners, while their educational status seems to be higher than that of the white cohort. It seems as if the underlying factors contributing to invasion and succession might be somewhat different in the case of the Bloemfontein CBD.

4.3.4 Key experiences of those residing in the CBD

This section of the investigation will focus on the question of whether the experiences of white people in the CBD are essentially different from those of black people, and whether any changes occurred in the experiences of the white cohort in the CBD between 2001 and
2004. Essentially the question that we are asking is: how do white people experience their “whiteness” in a multi-racial environment?

**Reasons for residing in the CBD**

The following paragraphs will provide a broad reflection on the responses to three questions put to interviewees, namely, why they reside in the CBD; how difficult they initially found it to access accommodation in the CBD; and whether they intend to continue residing in the CBD or not (see Figure 3).

The most important reason cited by white people for residing in the CBD is proximity to work, to learning institutions and/or to friends. Approximately 52% of the white respondents cited this as a reason for remaining in the CBD. This percentage largely correlates with the responses given in 2001. It is noteworthy that 67% of black respondents also cited this as a reason for residing in the CBD. However, in the case of white respondents, 25% of the responses also indicated that the respondents were residing in the CBD because they had their own homes there, and that residing in the CBD was not too expensive.

![Figure 3](https://example.com/figure3.png)

**Figure 3** Respondents’ responses to the degree of difficulty experienced in accessing housing in the CBD, 2001 and 2004

Accessing accommodation in the CBD has become increasingly difficult for white people in comparison with blacks. In 2001 76% of white respondents reported that it was easy to access accommodation in the CBD. By 2004 this percentage had decreased to 48%. However, the percentage for black respondents, which remained stable, was significantly lower: approximately 33% of black respondents indicated that they had found it easy to find accommodation in the CBD.

The question of future residential mobility was also addressed: respondents were asked whether they were considering remaining in the CBD permanently, or whether they wished to move out of the CBD. In this regard, in 2004 37.8% of the respondents insisted that they would reside in the CBD permanently. In the same year, a further 5.8% expressed uncertainty...
in this regard. This response does not differ very much from the response of the black respondents: in 2004, 37.7% of the latter respondents indicated that they would reside in the CBD permanently. At the same time the percentage of white respondents who indicated that they would reside in the CBD permanently had dropped since 2001, when 49.6% of the respondents indicated that they would reside in the CBD permanently. It should also be noted that the percentage for black respondents also dropped – from 43.9% in 2001 to 37.7% in 2004. In answering the question as to why they wished to move away from the CBD, nearly 30% of the white respondents indicated that they wanted a home of their own, while nearly 20% indicated that they wanted to live in a quieter area. Once again, there are not many differences between the reasons given by the different races for wishing to leave. Crime, as a reason for moving out of the CBD, was indicated by approximately 10% of the respondents. However, the number of white respondents who desired a home of their own was considerably higher than the number of black respondents in this regard. This reality probably suggests that, for many white people, residing in the CBD is merely a stage of residential transit. This conclusion is further corroborated by the fact that nearly 50% of respondents who had acquaintances who had left the CBD reported that their neighbours’ main reason for leaving was that they wanted a home of their own.

In considering the reasons cited by respondents for choosing to reside permanently in the CBD, three specific responses should be highlighted. In the first place, in 2004 39% of respondents indicated that they were very happy in the CBD. Furthermore, in the same year 25% stated that proximity to their work, business and/or school was a crucial factor in their decision. A further 21.4% indicated that they were the owners of their current place of residence and that ownership was fairly cheap (2004 survey). It should also be noted that the percentage of respondents who cited “own place/cheap” as a reason for permanently residing in the CBD in future increased from 8% in 2001 to 21% in 2004.

Subsequently a few comments should be made in respect of the above statistical patterns relating to white people residing in the CBD. Firstly, the above responses, as well as the overview of the age structure of the white people still living in the CBD, suggest that the CBD will increasingly become an area catering for a younger generation and for newcomers to the employment arena. It also seems as if this holds true irrespective of race. However, in the case of white people, a larger percentage also consider their current and future location in the CBD in terms of affordability, or in terms of existing investment (ownership) in the area. Although the study did not attempt to investigate the nature of these investments, or the affordability levels, this factor could potentially mean that a number of white residents, unlike the majority of their white neighbours, will be unable to flee the CBD. In order to investigate this issue in more detail, the discussion will now turn to the experience of white people in terms of their quality of life, specifically in the CBD.
Quality of life

The survey results suggest that the experience of white people in respect of the CBD is becoming increasingly negative. Residents were asked how they ranked the quality of life in the CBD. Figure 4 represents the results for white and black people in 2001 and 2004.

From the results it seems that there is a limited difference between white and black people in respect of their rating of the CBD. The only significant difference between white and black residents in 2004 can be found in the “very good” column. However, considering the overall results, this finding is probably not as significant as the finding that the percentage in the “good” column has increased. The 2004 percentage for white people who experienced the CBD as “bad” is slightly higher than that for black people. More significant was the decline in the number of white respondents who experienced the CBD as “very good” between 2001 and 2004. There was also a slight increase in the number of white respondents who experienced the CBD as “bad” or “very bad” (from 10.1% in 2001 to 14.9% in 2004). However, this does not seem to suggest any meaningful differences in the case of white respondents.

It is noteworthy that there was no significant difference in white residents’ perceptions about their living environment in cases where they had black neighbours. The results for 2004 suggest that 15% of the white residents with black neighbours rated their living conditions as bad or very bad. The corresponding figure for those white residents who had white neighbours was 14.8%. Furthermore, although the samples in this regard are very small, there was also no significant difference between the reactions of white people in the more desegregated blocks of the CBD, and the reactions of those in the non-segregated blocks.
We have postulated that it is mainly the older people who have left the CBD. Therefore, we have cross-tabulated the ratings of persons older than 40, and the ratings of those below the age of 40, in respect of the quality of life in Bloemfontein’s CBD. Those in the age group of 40 years and younger seem to be slightly more positive. For example, only 12% of the latter respondents reported that their experience of the CBD was bad or very bad, compared to 22% of the respondents older than 40. However, it should be noted that 78% of the respondents above the age of 40 still rated the CBD as either very good, good or average.

As there is thus no significant evidence that the basic experiences of white people and those of other racial groups in respect of the CBD are different, the focus now shifts to a more in-depth analysis of aspects that respondents do not like about the CBD (see Table 3). The table provides a comparison of the dislikes of whites in 2001 and 2004, as well as those of blacks in 2004.

Table 3  An overview of aspects disliked in respect of the Bloemfontein CBD, 2001 and 2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What respondents dislike about the CBD</th>
<th>White (%) – 2001 (real numbers in brackets)</th>
<th>White (%) – 2004 (real numbers in brackets)</th>
<th>Black (%) – 2004 (real numbers in brackets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Crime, violence</td>
<td>29.5 (36)</td>
<td>38.4 (28)</td>
<td>46.2 (78)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noise</td>
<td>18.8 (23)</td>
<td>20.5 (15)</td>
<td>7.1 (12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filth, rubbish</td>
<td>16.4 (20)</td>
<td>12.3 (9)</td>
<td>5.9 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking / traffic problems</td>
<td>3.3 (4)</td>
<td>9.6 (7)</td>
<td>3.6 (6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfriendly people</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>5.5 (4)</td>
<td>1.8 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beggars, street children</td>
<td>0.8 (1)</td>
<td>4.1 (3)</td>
<td>2.4 (4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racism</td>
<td>8.1 (10)</td>
<td>4.1 (3)</td>
<td>5.3 (9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment/living conditions</td>
<td>0.8 (1)</td>
<td>1.4 (1)</td>
<td>4.7 (8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nothing</td>
<td>4.9 (6)</td>
<td>1.4 (1)</td>
<td>10.1 (17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everything</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>0.6 (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expensive</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>1.2 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigrants/foreigners</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>1.2 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing facilities/misuse of facilities/shops close too early</td>
<td>2.5 (3)</td>
<td>0.0 (0)</td>
<td>4.1 (7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>14.9 (18)</td>
<td>2.7 (2)</td>
<td>5.9 (10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td><strong>100.0 (122)</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0 (73)</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0 (169)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The other column for whites in 2001 has an extraordinarily large percentage of respondents. This is owing to the fact that the researchers used the 2004 categorisation.

The table suggests that, once again, there are no significant differences between blacks and whites regarding the aspects of the CBD that they dislike. If the fact that 10% of the black CBD residents stated that there was nothing about the CBD that they disliked is not taken into consideration, the first three aspects that people dislike about the CBD are similar in the case of whites and blacks. What is noteworthy, however, is the increase in the number of responses indicating crime as a serious problem. In 2001 29.5% of the white residents indicated crime as a serious problem. The corresponding percentage for 2004 is 38.4%. Despite this increase in the perception that crime or violence is a problem, the survey also indicated that a smaller percentage of white people had been victims of crime. It thus seems evident that fear of crime is a significant issue in the CBD, but that this fear does not only pertain to whites, since similar fears were expressed by black respondents. Significantly, the overall quality of services in buildings is still very good, with access to water and electricity not posing any problems. This suggests that building owners still consider basic maintenance to be important.

A further interesting observation is that in the 2001 survey 7.5% of the respondents claimed not to like black people, while the figure for 2004 was only 2.7%. Does this trend suggest that white and black people who can afford to reside in the CBD are starting to develop similar constructs of their environment? In our view, this is probably not the case and this aspect could be investigated in more detail in the future. Although the samples are extremely small, the question arises as to whether the white respondents who expressed hard-core racist attitudes in 2001 have subsequently left the CBD.

Some of the answers may possibly be found in a deeper assessment of what respondents viewed as positive in the CBD. Two more sets of responses from white people are worth discussing in more detail. Firstly, in 2004 a high percentage (49.2%) cited the factor of centrality and proximity to work, relatives or learning institutions, as well as that of convenience. This response probably suggests that purely economic motives – especially in the case of those who were newcomers in the economy – played a far more important role than racial prejudice in deciding where to locate. The second aspect, also supporting this argument, relates to the fact that 21.7% of the respondents hinted that their reasons for residing in the CBD pertained to affordability. Simply stated, these respondents have few alternatives. It is noteworthy that the responses of black respondents broadly reflect the same sentiments. On the basis of these responses, can it thus be concluded that purely economic factors will result in the Bloemfontein CBD never being fully taken over by black people, as is the case elsewhere in South Africa? Could it be that the Bloemfontein CBD will continue to play a specific role in this regard, irrespective of race? Is it possible that a new, integrated society, based on class rather than on race, could develop in the CBD? Do these findings suggest that further desegregation will occur more slowly, and that the Bloemfontein CBD will continue to have a white component of between 15 and 30%? Although we do not
claim to have any specific answers in this regard, there are indications that the rate of
desegregation will at least not be as significant as it was between 1996 and 2004.

5. WHAT CAN BE LEARNED FROM THE FINDINGS IN RESPECT OF WHITENESS
AND RESIDING IN THE CBD?

There can be little doubt that the scrapping of the legislation that governed group areas in
South Africa played a crucial role in normalising (in racial terms) the residential environment
in the Bloemfontein CBD. At the same time, in keeping with the international theory of
invasion and succession, residential desegregation has led to a decline in the white
population. However, there seems to be evidence that the CBD continues to fulfil three
functions for white people. Firstly, it seems to play a specific role in creating residential space
for newcomers to the employment arena. These newcomers, just like their black
counterparts, require affordable accommodation as close as possible to their place of work.
In the case of black residents, it seems as if the CBD plays a similar role, though subordinate
to that of providing residential space to students. Secondly, on the basis of the survey
results, there seems to be increasing evidence that the CBD also caters for a percentage of
poor whites, either in terms of affordable accommodation, or in terms of properties in the
CBD that are owned by lower-income whites. Thirdly, the CBD also seems to be a place of
residence for a small but significant percentage of higher-income earners, who, it seems,
have clustered in specific blocks.

Furthermore, our limited evidence suggests that, in contrast to classical invasion and
succession theory, whites who leave are to some degree being replaced by whites. There is
evidence that these white newcomers have a lower level of education. The available
evidence further suggests that whites who were still in the CBD in 2004 did not necessarily
experience the CBD significantly differently from the way in which their black counterparts
experienced it. The research results also indicate that the percentage of whites in the CBD
with a blatantly racist attitude has dropped significantly. What are the reasons for these two
patterns? Is it possible that those whites who had blatantly racist attitudes have already left?
Does this, in turn, imply that the remainder are becoming part of a racially integrated society?
Or have the remaining whites merely “clustered” in specific flats in order to avoid mixing with
the other racial groups? Or have they realised that they have limited choice in the matter?
Have they simply become more discreet about expressing their attitudes?

Finally, it also seems as if the future of the CBD will be highly dependent on the ability of the
public sector to maintain an adequate public sector environment by providing appropriate
cleaning services, as well as visible crime prevention – irrespective of race. Although a more
detailed study is required in respect of landlords and their perceptions and behaviour, an
appropriate public sector environment will be crucial to the future of the CBD.
6. CONCLUSION

The conclusions reached in the above section are less conclusive than we had hoped they would be when we initiated the study. The basic evidence contains discrepancies — and for that reason possibly provides a truthful reflection of the diversive reality of being white in the CBD. The chapter examined residential changes in CBDs against the background of invasion and succession theory as well as, to some degree, certain elements of Downs’ theory of neighbourhood change in respect of invasion and succession. The evidence regarding residential change in Bloemfontein appears to suggest that large-scale invasion by black people has occurred, while inner-city deterioration in terms of the public environment and crime has been noted — and not only by whites. Considering the three dimensions of “whiteness” in the CBD, as identified in the above section, we contend that further desegregation in the CBD will occur more slowly, and that full invasion is highly unlikely; and also that the CBD will continue to play a specific role in the residential mobility of young job-seekers, although it will not be possible for some persons to move out. The possibility that a new inner-city multicultural environment is developing, or that whites are in the process of redefining themselves in respect of a multiracial South Africa, still seems highly remote; and it is also probably too early to suggest such a possibility at this stage. At the same time, however, the spatial location of these white people (especially those in the lower-income brackets) places them in a better position to benefit from government initiatives\(^3\) to upgrade inner cities — a factor which Scheurmans and Visser (2005) found to be a major obstacle in respect of poor whites in other parts of the city. As this research has probably left many questions unanswered, a continuation of the study, coupled with a more qualitative assessment of especially the poorer cohort in the CBD would be worth pursuing in the future.

REFERENCES


\(^3\) Specific mention should be made of the envisaged restructuring of zones in terms of the Social Housing Policy and the tax incentives to property owners in the CBD.
SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE


Chapter 4

The evolution of Bloemfontein’s Westdene: the changing anatomy of a neighbourhood

1. INTRODUCTION

Neighbourhoods and suburbs\(^1\) have long been interpreted by urban theorists as being boring, bland and bourgeois research foci (Mabin, 2005: 2). Historically, the complexities of inner-city areas and, more recently, the challenges and impacts of their alter ego(s) – the ‘edge’ city(ies) – have preoccupied the minds of urban scholars. Nevertheless, as is evident from the recent upsurge in neighbourhood studies, neighbourhoods and suburbs as urban spaces and places of investigation are starting to emerge as key research sites for those interested in urban form and process (see, for example, Webster, 2003; Herbert, 1993; Buck, 2001; Bauder, 2002; Bridge, 2006; Lupi and Musterd, 2006; Vaiou and Lykogianni, 2006; Kennett and Forrest, 2006). Despite mounting research attention, scholars of urban geography, sociology and planning studies still struggle to define “neighbourhood” or “suburb” (Lupi and Musterd, 2006; Martin, 2003; Galster, 2001; Kearns and Parkinson, 2001; Webster 2003). In large part this definitional conundrum is the outcome not only of long-term research neglect, but also of the vast array of urban processes and the staggering range of spatial expressions exhibited by them, thus making them problematic research foci.

In the South African urban research context neighbourhood and/or suburban studies have been overshadowed by an array of other concerns. As Mabin (2005: 3) notes in a seminal contribution focused on suburban development in South Africa:

Suburbs have been a silent presence in the widely disseminated ‘models’ of the apartheid city. Attention to the pattern of the cities has demonstrated little comprehension of processes producing or further changing the suburbs. As with geographical exploration in the nineteenth century, academics living in the suburbs have perceived other parts of the city as ‘terra incognita’ and set out to explore them, whilst ignoring the anthropology of their own territory … [Moreover]… South Africa lacks a tradition of investigating the practices of the private developers whose activities generated the suburbs. In other words, how the suburbs happened is assumed rather than understood.

Over the recent past the complexities of the post-apartheid inner city and its polar opposite in the form of emerging edge cities have received considerable research

\(^1\) In this investigation the concept neighbourhood conflates with that of the suburb. Whilst there appears to be some consensus that suburban areas are spatially somewhat removed from a vaguely defined inner-city area, it appears to also be agreed that the concept neighbourhood can be deployed appropriately in both the inner-city and the suburban context.
attention (see Beavon (2004) for an overview). Moreover, in the South African context, and not least in the academic writings of the past two decades, there has been an outpouring of research investigating the neighbourhood histories of sites of forced removal such as District Six and Sophiatown, in addition to the current dynamics of “the township”. Generally, as Mabin (2005: 3) observes, little attention has been devoted to the genesis and subsequent development of South Africa’s white suburbs – and we would add, neighbourhoods – in local academic literature. Indeed, only a small body of research has explored former white neighbourhoods specifically (exceptions being Donaldson and Williams, 2004; Ballard, 2004; Kotze and Van der Merwe, 2000; Maharaj and Mpungose, 1994). Moreover, although these investigations are presented as focusing on neighbourhoods, these areas are consistently deployed as spatial units of analysis to explore more specific urban processes such as gentrification, desegregation, crime and gated communities (Visser, 2002; Horn and Ngcobo, 2003; Dirsuweit 2002; Hook and Vrdoljak 2002). On the whole these investigations do not contribute to our conceptual understanding of the term neighbourhood, its place in the development history of the city, or its bearing on how we might understand the evolution of South African cities. Similarly, interest in local suburbs has received little research attention (Mabin, 2005: 1).

Following Mabin (2005: 3), we argue that by focusing on neighbourhoods (or suburbs), the possibility exists of opening up new debates on the evolving nature of the South African neighbourhood. Such a focus might provide greater insight into the complex spatialities of these formerly homogenous white residential units. As Mabin (2005) aptly proposes, the study of suburban neighbourhoods could add to our understanding of those new forms of segregation, fragmentation and accumulation that investigators such as Harrison et al. (2004) highlight as key characteristics of the emerging post-apartheid city. Moreover, in investigating such processes, research concerning current South African urban transformation might more readily contribute to debates concerning “the urban” in spatial units other than either the inner city or the township, which have come to dominate local urban studies scholarship. These contentions are explored in the context of a historical neighbourhood – Westdene – in the secondary city of Bloemfontein.

By providing some insight into the development of Westdene, and profiling aspects of its current spatiality, this investigation aims to make a modest contribution towards understanding new forms of “the urban” emerging in a formerly white group area neighbourhood. We argue that Westdene is the outcome of various urban processes, most of which are closely related to processes of decentralisation so typical of South African cities. It is also our contention that Westdene provides some insight into the development of a neighbourhood (or suburb, depending on one’s perspective), which highlights the complexities surrounding our understanding of what one finds in a neighbourhood. The investigation will show that Westdene is a complex space that fulfils a range of different functions far removed from the initial rationale behind its establishment. These new functions complicate simplistic claims of what the role and function of suburbs or neighbourhoods in cities are. Generally speaking, it is our contention that many of South Africa’s former neighbourhoods, as small subcomponents of the city, are becoming multilayered nodes
fulfilling various economic, social and residential functions. This, we argue, points towards the urbanisation of the suburban and/or the neighbourhood seen elsewhere.

2. BRIEF NOTES ON DEFINING THE NEIGHBOURHOOD

Martin (2003) notes that scholars in geography and urban studies have struggled with defining the concept *neighbourhood*. Galster (2001) suggests that, although the term *neighbourhood* is hard to define exactly, we intuitively know one when we see it. From this perspective Webster (2003) suggests that neighbourhoods are a kind of urban order, a type of space in a larger city whole.

Lancaster (1966, cited in Galster, 2001) originally formulated the notion that the neighbourhood consists of complex commodities – it is a multidimensional bundle comprised of many abstract goods. Webster (2003) similarly supports the premise that the neighbourhood contains shared attributes. Galster (2001) applied these ideas to spatially-based attributes, connected to the complex commodity of the neighbourhood as a systemic structure. These neighbourhood commodities include the structural characteristics of residential and non-residential buildings, infrastructural characteristics, class status characteristics of the resident population, tax/public characteristics, environmental characteristics, proximity characteristics, political characteristics, socially interactive characteristics, as well as sentimental characteristics.

Others recognise these structural attributes, but place the emphasis on other features generally more closely associated with interpretations of the spatiality of particular places. Forrest and Kearns (2001), for example, describe the neighbourhood in terms of social cohesion and social capital as two juxtaposing attributes. On the one hand, an area of importance is the one where the “neighbourhood’s neighbouring” remains an important dimension of contemporary urban life by differentiating social groups, life-course stages and cultural differences. On the other hand, the internal cohesion develops at the expense of external relations (i.e. “our” neighbourhood versus “their” neighbourhood). This, in turn, creates a lack of local cohesion in the context of wider social fragmentation, connecting to negative social reputation, labelling, ill-health and the development of perverse social norms and behaviours as a response to social exclusion. Kearns and Parkinson (2001) illustrate the multilayered neighbourhood on the following scale:

- The home has a predominant function reliant on psychosocial benefits – the mechanism is familiarity and community;
- The locality also has a predominant function, which in turn relies on residential activities and social status, and position – this hinges on the mechanism of planning, service provision and the housing market;
- The urban district or region also has a predominant function in its landscape and within its social and economic opportunities mechanisms here are employment connections, leisure interest and social networks.
The theme of current thinking about neighbourhoods is that they are a nexus of contracts that assigns rights over private and shared resources and over their various attributes (Webster, 2003). The organisations governing those contracts, and even the contracts themselves, evolve over time in response to changes in the value of resources and changes in the costs of exchanging and combining property rights.

The task of the investigation that follows is to highlight these shifting, evolving forms, functions and meanings of Westdene as a neighbourhood.

3. AN ABRIDGED HISTORY OF WESTDENE (1901-1994)

During the South African War (1899-1902) the town council of Bloemfontein decided to develop additional residential areas as the demand for residential property then significantly outstripped existing supply. This need for residential property was fuelled by the large-scale migration of farming families from surrounding rural districts, where vast numbers of farmers were displaced as a result of the war in the region. Consequently, in October 1901 the town council decided to develop what was then known as the “Western Extension”, later known as Westdene (Figure 1). In the context of large-scale impoverishment linked to the circumstances underlying rural displacement, the lots of land were initially developed with lower-income white residents in mind (Schoeman, 1980). The types of properties in Westdene were developed as an alternative to the agricultural plots then being established on the fringes of Bloemfontein from 1903. Later, in a bid to alleviate the housing shortages in the wake of rural in-migration, the first three decades of the twentieth century saw properties in Westdene being offered at nominal prices, whilst buyers were partially subsidised by the town council in the erection of dwellings (Roodt, 1994). These (initially) residential structures were basic and retained their lower-income status for a considerable time. One long-term resident recalls:

Well, my grandfather built this house we are sitting in now, in 1923. He built this because this property, actually no. 28, was his first which he built across the street. The plans for that house were drawn up in 1904. That house had only four rooms, there were no bathrooms and there was still a stable for the cow in the backyard. They used to have the night cart that used to visit in the lane between the houses. Then in 1923 my grandfather built this house, when they started building bathrooms into the homes.

Westdene experienced sustained residential development during the 1930s and was virtually completely built-up by the time Bloemfontein gained city status in 1945 (Senekal, 1977; Schoeman, 1980). With all the available residential lots occupied, the 1950-1970 period witnessed minimal physical development. Elsewhere in Bloemfontein – as in post-war urban societies elsewhere in South Africa and, indeed, internationally – experienced a suburban

---

2 This in-migration was initially linked to the war, and later the Great Depression, as well as subsequent waves of agricultural mechanisation.
boom (Senekal, 1977). During the 1970-1990 period the more established suburbs of Bloemfontein, particularly those adjacent to the CBD, such as Arboretum, Westdene and Willows, experienced redevelopment, and the southern edge of Westdene was rapidly rebuilt with high-rise flats. This period also saw the emergence of the townhouse boom that has come to dominate contemporary residential development in Bloemfontein. Echoing similar trends in other South African cities, the mid-1970s marked the beginning of significant business migration from the central business district to residential areas adjacent to the CBD, such as Westdene. A night-club owner, one of those who initially migrated from the CBD, recalls:

The CBD at that time was where Hoffman Square is now, and gradually gravitating outwards ... Westdene was a very obvious candidate to absorb the decentralisation from the central business district. A lot of, I would say, houses or homes were used as business premises. You had designers coming in selling clothing in the little houses and the trendy, the trendiness started taking place in Westdene.

A significant development resulting in the westward migration of business expansion away from the CBD was the development of the Loch Logan Park and of the Westdene Arcade in 1986. These developments resulted in an influx of population into the southern parts of Westdene, as well as in the establishment of new businesses.


The current academic record on the evolution of Westdene does not cover the (re)development of this neighbourhood after the demise of apartheid in 1994. Our aim is to address this gap in the historical chronicle, in the first instance because we believe that doing so has intrinsic value. Simultaneously, however, we also aim to provide insight into the complex spatiality of this neighbourhood and the implications of this for understanding South African neighbourhoods. Attention is also drawn to a range of processes that have unfolded over the past 15 years since last the development of Westdene was recorded.

The investigation unfolds in the following manner: first, the impacts of both business and entertainment-function decentralisation from the CBD to Westdene are outlined; next, the migration of crime from the CBD is noted; it is then shown that, whilst this former solely residential neighbourhood has developed into the commercial hub of Bloemfontein, Westdene nevertheless continues to fulfil a residential function. In this respect it is noted that the neighbourhood has experienced racial desegregation and that parts of the neighbourhood have undergone forms of residential gentrification.

In drawing attention to these developments it is our intention to demonstrate that Westdene has undergone compaction and very significant changes in land uses removed from the purely residential function of the first 90 years of its existence. Although such change might imply elevated levels of economic, social and racial integration, it is our contention that
Westdene has nevertheless become a highly fragmented space – indicative, we believe, of the general urbanisation of South African neighbourhoods.

4.1 The influence of business decentralisation on Westdene

Although the creation of Westdene as spatial unit was the product of decision making at the dawn of the 20th century, the current neighbourhood is the product of a range of different subsequent urban processes fulfilling a range of different roles. It is possible to trace the genesis of Westdene’s current meaning(s) and functions to specific urban process of business decentralisation from the Bloemfontein CBD. Goodall (1987) interprets decentralisation as the movement of people, jobs and activities from the centre or core of a major metropolitan (or central-city) area to suburban and outlying locations. Westdene’s development history certainly forms part of such processes.

Relative to most of South Africa’s main urban areas, large-scale business decentralisation came relatively late to Bloemfontein. Unlike cities such as Cape Town, Durban or Johannesburg, where processes of decentralisation were in evidence as early as the 1960s, the major drive towards decentralised business nodes in Bloemfontein coincided with the demise of apartheid in 1994. The scraping of a range of restrictive race-based laws and by-laws had far-reaching impacts on Bloemfontein’s central business district. Foremost among these were the large-scale desegregation of the CBD and a significant and sudden decentralisation of businesses, office and retail outlets to formerly white neighbourhoods such as Westdene. Whilst the spatial delimitation of the CBD remained visible, there were comprehensive changes in the nature of those residential areas in relatively close proximity to it.

Westdene is typical of one of those zones that have absorbed business decentralisation from the CBD. In 1998 *Die Volksblad* (1998) reported that the Bloemfontein Chamber of Commerce and Industry predicted that the property prices of the central business district (CBD) would continue to stagnate or decline as a result of desegregation and the decentralisation of higher-order economic activities to the suburban areas, which resulted in the shifting of the tax base to other areas such as Westdene. It was furthermore reported that the reasons for (white) people preferring to conduct business in Westdene was in large part the neglected state of the CBD and the view that the environment of Westdene was more relaxed, felt safer and was more organised, as well as the fact that there was no charge for parking. It was observed that, at that time, the white constituencies of Bloemfontein preferred to do business in the suburban settings of Bloemfontein. Echoing Ballard’s (2004) findings in Durban, this relocation was in the main the result of a hostile response on the part of many white people to the arrival of (black) informal settlements and (black) informal businesses that were (and still are) in various ways perceived as a threat to the formal business sector and to white sensibilities regarding the way that cities function and “should” look – not only functionally but racially. In contrast, Lehare and Marais (1996) note that most black people are not as hostile as are white people towards informal settlements and businesses, and
consequently to the changing nature of the CBD. In this context Westdene (re)developed as a result of a general hostility towards the black constituencies, which was underpinned by South Africa’s urban segregationist history, as well as by perceived fear of victimisation in the CBD. In the wake of such opinions, a range of new developments consolidated the westward movement of business activity towards the wealthier, formerly white residential group areas. These substantial developments included the Loch Logan Waterfront and Mimosa Mall. Currently three quarters of Westdene, mainly concentrated in the southern part, is being extensively developed as a business and commercial area. This has resulted in an alternative business district in Bloemfontein, with Westdene forming the key focus of that area. In contrast to its overwhelmingly residential role only two decades ago, close to 1000 businesses now operate from Westdene.

Table 1 provides a basic profile of the business ventures located within Westdene. It is evident that the core business focus is retail/sales (26%) and, secondly, the services sector (21%).

Table 1  Selected features of business owners in Westdene

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Core business focus:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail (sales)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accounting/audit/finance</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real estate/development/architecture</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal services</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical-related focus</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food-related focus</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender of business owners:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Racial category of business owners:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Home language of business owners:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sesotho</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Westdene has a vast array of different businesses ranging from clothing retailers, book shops, art and framing shops to antique dealers. There are also many businesses which focus
on services, such as security companies, beauty salons, graphic design studios, internet providers and information/communication technology providers. Significant other business sectors include accounting, audit and financial services (14%), real estate, development and architectural firms (12%), legal services (12%), and medical-related businesses (12%). The combined total of these professional institutions is 50%. Although these types of business do not fall under the same classifications, they nevertheless do present similarities in that they provide services. Surprisingly, the gender of the business owners is relatively balanced (male, 59% and female, 41%). This can be accounted for by the fact that many of the businesses are smaller-scale enterprises within economic sectors where, generally, there are higher levels of women participants in the labour market.

As much of the reason for business decentralisation was fuelled by “white flight” from the CBD, it is not surprising to find that the business owners are overwhelmingly white (89%). Internal to the white business profile, a significant minority are Greek and Portuguese entrepreneurs. The remainder of the business owners are black, (8%), coloured (2%), and Asian (1%). The home languages of the business owners correlate directly with the racial profile of Westdene’s business owners. As they are mostly white, most of the owners’ home languages are either Afrikaans (73%) or English (21%). The remainder are Sesotho (2%) and four percent either Greek or Portuguese.

Table 2 explores the employee profile of the businesses of Westdene. Owing to historical inequalities, apartheid-induced differences in education and socio-economic position, as well as the high skills demand of many of the enterprises that developed in Westdene, most of the employees are white (80%), with a small number being either black (15%) or coloured (5%).

The largely white business owner and employee profiles are reflected in the location where these employees reside. Consequently, the former white group area settlement pattern is echoed in the fact that there is a very significant under-representation of blacks in the employee profile. Surprisingly, where there is generally a significant spatial mismatch in the South African context between where people work and reside, a very significant number of employees live in Westdene (22%). Reflecting South African realities elsewhere, however, the majority reside in Bloemfontein’s western, and still predominantly white, neighbourhoods of Universitas and Langenhoven Park. As there are plenty of professionally-orientated businesses in Westdene, many of the employees earn substantial salaries and it is only to be expected that one will find workers living in residential locations in the higher-income neighbourhoods of Bloemfontein North (19%) such as Heuwelsig, Hillsboro and Helicon Heights. Services-related employment reflects a generally higher presence of women, with the employee gender division being mostly female (59%) as opposed to only 41% males.
Table 2  Race and residential location of Westdene employees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average race division of employees</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location of employee residence</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Westdene</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein West</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein North</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein South</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangaung</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein Central</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heidedal</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 investigates the historical and economic profiles of the businesses in Westdene.

The relationships between business owners and the properties from which they operate demonstrates differences from those typical of CBD properties, where there is a general tendency towards concentrated ownership in the hands of relatively few institutional property owners. In the case of Westdene there is a high proportion of businesses of which the proprietors own the properties from which they operate.

One of the most important findings of the research is that most of the businesses (64%) have always operated in Westdene and that only 9% have moved from the CBD to Westdene. Moreover, 27% of the current businesses moved from other decentralised business nodes in Bloemfontein to Westdene. The time at which the businesses were established is spread out quite evenly between the pre-1990 and post-2000 period. Decentralisation of existing businesses from the CBD was not the driving force behind Westdene’s new function. Indeed, 78% of the businesses were established after 1996. It would appear that only the businesses which established themselves in Westdene prior to 1990 (8%), or between 1990 and 1995 (14%) were active in driving the decentralisation process. Interestingly, these businesses are the large retail banks and insurance houses. In essence these businesses appear to represent the development of a new economy towards a range of services functions, including financial, information technology, publishing and creative design services, for whom locating in the CBD would have been less appropriate or totally inappropriate. In this case Westdene served as the starting point of a new economic base with different demands for the physical structures from which they operate.
The estimated initial market values of business premises are distributed fairly evenly: 26% are under R100 000, 21% between 100 001-R300 000, 21% between R300 001-R500 000, 21% between R500 001-R1 million. On the whole, however, these values were significantly lower than those in the CBD, and the premises therefore probably more attainable to smaller service providers. The only real variability is in the range above R1 million, which represents 11% of the property market and tends to be developed or held by larger property development concerns letting premises, for example, to national companies’ regional head offices. Currently the estimated selling price is much higher than the initial purchasing price, with 40% seeking between R500 001-R1 million, and 53% wanting over R1 million for their properties. Interviews with property agents in the neighbourhood confirm that such prices are easily reached.

Business decentralisation was the initial process leading to land use changes in Westdene. Because of desegregation in the CBD and an escalation of crime in that area, people sought other areas in which to work. The decentralisation process reached its peak in 1994 and led

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Previous location of business</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Always in Westdene</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein West</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein Central</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein North</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein South</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year business was established</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1990</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990-1995</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996-1999</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000 +</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated initial market property value of business premises</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;R100 000</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R100 001-R300 000</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R300 001-R500 000</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R500 001-R1 million</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;R1 million</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated selling price</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;R100 000</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R100 001-R300 000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R300 001-R500 000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R500 001-R1 million</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;R1 million</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
to significant changes in the southernmost part of Westdene. Thus most of the processes which developed in Westdene after the initial period of decentralisation have been additive to this primary process. Because of the effects of business decentralisation, entertainment amenities also developed in Westdene.

4.2 Entertainment in Westdene

A key feature of Westdene relates to its important function as the key (white) entertainment node of Bloemfontein. With the development of businesses in Westdene, people in the entertainment industry noticed the potential for developing entertainment amenities in this once exclusively residential setting. Clark (2004b) advanced the idea that human capital increasingly drives development, and that quality amenities are the main factor which brings human capital to the city. Similarly, at the neighbourhood level, combining the service sector and the entertainment industry as an alternative business district connected to the aesthetic value of Art Deco and Edwardian-style buildings has made Westdene a very popular area in which to live, work and be entertained.

Specific streets such as Second Avenue developed more extensively than other streets in Westdene. The intersection of Second Avenue and Kellner Street is seen as Westdene’s main entertainment nexus/focus. The attractions are mainly bars, nightclubs, restaurants, art dealers, interior decorators and more traditional residential neighbourhood businesses such as greengrocers, pharmacies, butchers and liquor stores. Westdene also hosts cultural facilities with cabaret performances at Fishpaste Restaurant, as well as live acts at venues such as The Mystic Boer and Cool Runnings. Owing to this blend of services, Westdene is seen by many as a bohemian neighbourhood and continues to be the site of new entertainment amenity developments. This is not surprising as Glaeser et al. (2004) stress the importance of density as an agent for facilitating the influx of new urban amenities to such nodes.

4.3 Crime in Westdene

Crime and the fear of crime have deeply negative impacts on personal and societal well-being (Sah, 1991). Furthermore, Santiago et al. (2003) suggest that one of the main non-economic negative influences on neighbourhood property prices and social character is crime. Violence also impacts on neighbourhood business activity, as fear of violence will cause consumers, employees and entrepreneurs to alter their routine activities in areas that experience a surge in violent activity (Greenbaum and Tita, 2004). One of the ironies concerning Westdene was that the perception of safety was a key driving force behind the decentralisation of business to the area. Yet the most influential, publicised and talked about urban process in Westdene is crime. Indeed, in 2001 De Klerk (2001) reported that Westdene had the highest reported crime rate in Bloemfontein in that year. In the same year the South African Police Force (SAPD) also saw it as a major problem for the area (De Klerk, 2001).
In 2004 crime in Westdene escalated to dire proportions as a string of murders, physical assaults, rape and overall unruliness occurred. For example, Smith (2004) reported the case of a musician who suffered eleven stabs wounds and subsequently drove to himself to hospital. Kruger (2004) also reports that a student was violently assaulted after escorting a friend back home in Westdene. The area’s vulnerability to crime relates to the fact that accessibility for business also unfortunately makes it easier to escape from the crime scene. Moreover, according to Da Silva and Jardim (2004), the reasons for crime in Westdene are also a consequence of its proximity to Mimosa Mall, the Loch Logan Waterfront and educational institutions such as the University of the Free State and three school hostels in that these places are easy targets for crime-orientated individuals or groups (Da Silva and Jardim, 2004). In response to the exacerbated crime situation in Westdene, the Gemeenskappolisieforum (GPF)/Community Policing Forum was established by the residents of Westdene and by some key business and restaurant owners.

Since the crime wave of 2004, crime in general has decreased significantly. Yet Westdene’s crime rate nevertheless remains high in comparison with other neighbourhoods in Bloemfontein. Over the three-month period from 18 June to 21 September 2005 Westdene had 146 reported cases (Table 4). By comparison, Heuwelsig, which is only two kilometres away, had only 19 cases. Willows, similarly proximate to the CBD, had 58 cases. The establishment of the GPF has resulted in a major expansion of visible forms of surveillance: measures such as security guards, car watchers, radios, whistles and dogs are now prominent features of Westdene; they have in the process also made residents more crime attentive.

Table 4  The incidence of reported crime: 18 June – 21 September 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Westdene</th>
<th>Heuwelsig</th>
<th>Willows</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theft</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theft out of cars</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business burglaries</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical attacks</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car theft</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vandalism</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential burglaries</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armed robberies</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rape</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fraud</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crimen injuria</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hijackings</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>146</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fear of crime has resulted in both businesses and residents upgrading security and fortifying themselves and their properties, thereby making Westdene’s character increasingly cold and
suspicious (see, for example, Liebermann and Coulson (2004) and Lemanski (2001) for further discussion on fear of crime and prevention). As a resident remarks:

I think more in attitude than just in terms of walls and fences. You notice that, but you don’t feel that people are very outreaching. Again I’m just thinking of our street here. I don’t even know what our neighbours look like really. But I don’t know whether that is because of our own fortifications. We have to walk past our own security when we go outside and past our wooden gate. I don’t know if that’s the case.

In addition, patrons of the entertainment amenities are also starting to look towards alternatives beyond Westdene, such as Preller Square, where they can entertain themselves with less fear of being confronted with some kind of crime-related occurrence. It must be said, however, that the crime situation has been alleviated over the past two years as residents, business owners and people moving in and out of Westdene have become more conscious of crime. While complacency is always a danger, excessive vigilance is tantamount to living in a surveillance society.

4.4 The current residential base of Westdene

Donaldson (2004) argues that, because of the proximity of historical suburbs to the CBD, they are more often than not vulnerable to urban development trends, such as having to make way for CBD expansion or for home offices and businesses. Whilst Westdene is both the economic and entertainment hub of “white” Bloemfontein, it has nevertheless retained its former function as place of residence. However, Westdene’s residential component has diminished drastically, the residential population having fallen from 4 004 inhabitants in 1996 to 2993 in 2001.

Figure 2 shows that the residential components of Westdene are uneven and that people are housed in different types of housing units ranging from flats and townhouses to single residential units. Most of the residential function of Westdene is still evident north of Brill Street, but it declines to the south of this street. Further south, particularly below President Reitz Street, the residential component becomes progressively smaller. Table 5 provides some insight into the general socio-economic features of Westdene. It emerges that the residential population is divided into a large student population, on the one hand, and a generally middle-class segment, on the other. Moreover, it is evident that racial segregation remains high, even though desegregation is starting to take place. An additional observation is that the rate of desegregation is very uneven, with those areas in the south of Westdene recording far higher levels of desegregation than those in the north of the neighbourhood.

The census statistics, however, provide an aggregate view of the residential component of the area. There is considerable deviation from this general profile, particularly north of Brill
SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE

Street. Indeed, based on survey material,³ this part of Westdene appears to have undergone a form of gentrification. Table 6 indicates the personal details of the respondents, gender profile, the age of the household members, home language and marital status, while also focusing on profession and education attainment.

Table 5  General demographic profile of Westdene 1996 and 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>1996 (%)</th>
<th>2001 (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;6</td>
<td>5.96</td>
<td>5.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-12</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>5.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-18</td>
<td>8.70</td>
<td>11.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-30</td>
<td>40.33</td>
<td>34.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>10.61</td>
<td>13.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>8.29</td>
<td>9.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>7.94</td>
<td>8.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61+</td>
<td>12.08</td>
<td>11.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>6.19</td>
<td>13.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coloured</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>4.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian or Asian</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>1.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>92.20</td>
<td>80.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual income</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No income</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R1-R1000</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>12.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R1001-R2500</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2501-R6000</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6001-R8000</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8001-R11000</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R11001-R16000</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R16001-R30000</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above R30000</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The residential cohorts of Westdene are mostly active as business professionals (37%). The gender profile of the respondents is 54% male and 46% female. Almost two thirds (65%) of the residents are married, and there is a very low divorce rate of 6%. The home language is mostly Afrikaans (71%), with a smaller percentage being English (24%), the other 5% being mostly Greek or Portuguese. The education level of the respondents is exceptionally high, 9%

³ The data for this section were obtained from a questionnaire survey. A questionnaire was personally delivered to every residential unit in the northern area of Westdene above Brill Street. Of the 200 questionnaires distributed, 56 were returned, which represents a 28% response rate.
of the respondents having completed doctorates, while most have completed a degree course. The age of the household members is once again highest in the 19-30 and 31-40 age brackets, with both lying at 19%, while the percentages of the younger-than-6 and the 6-12 cohorts are 13% and 12% respectively. On the whole, the 19-40 group and the 6-12 group are indicative of young families, 19-40 being the most common time for people to start families.

Table 6  Demographic profile of residents in the gentrified part of Westdene

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Home language</th>
<th>Marital status</th>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>Highest qualification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>&lt;6</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Grade 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>6-12</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>Primary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>13-18</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>Academic/ teaching</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>6-12</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>19-30</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>Academic/ teaching</td>
<td>Bachelor’s Degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>13-18</td>
<td>Living together</td>
<td>Medical</td>
<td>Honours Degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>&gt;61</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Widower</td>
<td>Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>19-30</td>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>Technical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Widow(er)</td>
<td>Doctorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>Separated</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>Separated</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>&gt;61</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 reflects the economic profile of the residential respondents, namely their annual income per person, the year of purchase of their properties, market value of their properties when first bought, and lastly, the desired sales prices of their properties.

The annual incomes of the respondents are high, with 32% earning between R100 001-R200 000 and 10% earning between R300 001-R400 000 annually. Probably one of the most striking of all the figures in this table is the year of property purchase. Most of the respondents (42%) bought their properties after 2000. It could be argued that the correlation between the preponderance of the age cohort 19-40, the income bracket of R100 000-R200 000 per annum, properties being bought after 2000 and a significant level of education, suggests the existence of a strong gentrification profile in Westdene. These figures are
positive in terms of the property ownership cycles of Westdene because long-term investment is possible.

Table 7  Economic profile of residential respondents and value of property

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annual income per person:</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;R100 000</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R100 001-R200 000</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R200 001-R300 000</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R300 001-R400 000</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;R400 001</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of purchase:</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1970</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971-1980</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981-1990</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991-1995</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996-1999</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;2000</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Market value when bought:</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;R100 000</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R100 001-R200 000</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R200 001-R300 000</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R300 001-R400 000</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;R400 000</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Desired sales prices:</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;R500 000</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R500 001-R600 000</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R600 001-R700 000</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R700 001-R800 000</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R800 001-R900 000</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R900 001-R1000 000</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;R1000000</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The market value of Westdene’s residential properties splits into two clusters: most of the respondents (36%) bought their properties for under R100 000, and 22% bought for over R400 000. It could be argued that the people who acquired their properties for under R100 000 bought before 2000 and the other group bought after that date. This confirms the possibility of gentrification in Westdene. The desired selling prices demanded by the respondents are high, as 24% want between R700 001-R800 000, and 22% want between R600 001-R700 000. Again interviews with estate agents reveal that these prices are easily attained in the property market. These details add to the perception that property prices in Westdene have changed over the past ten to fifteen years because Westdene has become
business orientated and that young professionals have invested in the area – because Westdene is so close to the CBD, the Loch Logan Waterfront, Mimosal Mall and a range of excellent schools – thereby driving higher property prices.

Gentrification in Westdene has been a very selective process. Certain streets, such as Brebner Road, have been partially gentrified. For example, the eastern part of the street has been completely gentrified. Here young doctors in their thirties, who have young children, have renovated and upgraded their houses. Yet farther west the street is still occupied by older people who have lower incomes and who have not done much recently towards upgrading their surroundings. This differentiated process unfolds on different levels throughout Westdene. It could be argued that gentrification is still a developing process in Westdene and that it has certainly not gentrified as a whole.

4.5 The question of community in Westdene

Lupi and Musterd (2006) comment that the lack of community and insularity in neighbourhoods are often emphasised in academic debates. In contrast, many urban commentators are of the opinion that diversity in land use and socio-economic class can address these “neighbourhood shortcomings”. The survey material for businesses clearly pointed to the fact that their interaction with the residents of Westdene itself was negligible. For example, proxy questions for sense of community such as the friendliness of other business owners and permanent residents located in the neighbourhood were highlighted by only five percent of the respondents. In addition, contact with local residents consistently scored low positive responses as the businesses’ main clientele resided outside of the neighbourhood.

The more in-depth survey focusing on the residential component of Westdene reflected a similarly uninterested view.

Table 8 Relationship between neighbours

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship with neighbours</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Greet only</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visit occasionally</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visit regularly</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not know neighbours</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 outlines the respondents’ relationships with their neighbours in the core residential part of the neighbourhood. Views in this respect vary, but these are markedly disengaged, with 50% of the respondents only greeting their neighbours and 4% not knowing their neighbours at all. Further south in the neighbourhood these scores are significantly lower. As one resident remarked:

I’ve experienced Brebner Road 63, I don’t know anybody else. I know what the neighbours look like. I don’t find it a very friendly street; I know everybody is
very busy. But I wouldn’t say it’s very friendly and I wouldn’t say that I could recognise people who live here. I don’t experience any form of community here, like a local shop with community notices. The friendships that we are developing are through kind of other routes through other people, it’s not through…not through, sharing a space called Westdene.

Westdene challenges the residential values communities perceive as normal pertaining to issues such as neighbourliness, safety of children playing in the streets or the traditional suburban settings. Community dynamics are here evolved in a setting where residential and commercial borders are blurred.

Whilst many urban theorists are keen to support such blurring, it is not the case in Bloemfontein nor, we suspect, elsewhere (see Grant, 2005). Although Westdene as a neighbourhood provides ample opportunity for most of its workforce in terms of services and entertainment needs, the overwhelming majority live elsewhere in the city and do not want to live in the area where they work. They prefer land-use homogeneity as it gives them a sense of order. Indeed, the fragmented nature of land use in the neighbourhood has become abhorrent to many and they automatically settle as far away as possible from the area.

Similarly, the long-term residents – who have lived their lives in Westdene – are critical of the fact that residential homogeneity was eroded, this despite the fact that a whole host of services and functions that they require are very literally now located just around the corner. For them, diversity has fragmented their neighbourhood. The supposed cohesion that heterogeneity supposedly facilitates is nowhere in evidence.

4.6 Towards the post-apartheid neighbourhood

Current debates suggest that neighbourhoods have become highly complex nodes within the fabric of the city. Whereas these areas were in the past often interpreted and experienced as spatial units in which residential familiarity and community were commonly found, these meanings and functions have changed. The neighbourhoods have shed their homogeneous, monofunctional features and have become sites of multi-layered functions (and meaning) which are not necessarily related to one another. Neighbourhoods as spaces of residential consumption have evolved to include various functions that include cultural, economic and social production and consumption.

As seen in this investigation, Westdene’s spatiality has changed dramatically from that of two decades ago. Its singular purpose as residential space, that of aiding the production and reproduction of mainly middle-class whites, has become far more diverse and complex. In reviewing some aspects of this neighbourhood’s recent development, one recalls with considerable irony that some of the reasons for (white) people preferring to conduct business and spend leisure time in Westdene were linked to the idea that Westdene was perceived as more relaxed, felt safer and was more organised than the CBD. Moreover, it was a segregated white urban space largely devoid of other race groups. The very act of seeking
out “the neighbourhood” as a space in which to withdraw from the CBD actually resulted in this neighbourhood eventually becoming more like the CBD.

Westdene as a former white neighbourhood has been shaped by a range of different, yet well-known urban processes. Its current form is the outcome of the decentralisation of services-based business activities, which has led to the development of an entertainment base that has collectively drawn in crime. This has in turn resulted in heightened levels of surveillance and fortification. Its continued “success” is in many ways linked to desegregation in the CBD and, indeed, other formerly white neighbourhoods such as Willows.

Despite the fact that commercial land uses have developed significantly in Westdene, the neighbourhood still retains a residential function for a relatively diverse socio-economic residential base. In many ways Westdene represents the kind of neighbourhood of which many urban planners and commentators have been supportive. As such, Westdene as a neighbourhood demonstrates a markedly diverse spatiality. Although at some levels this area is merely a former white neighbourhood, it is certainly not as homogenous as urban commentators on South African cities often imply. Yet the demonstrated diversity in the neighbourhood’s land use and racial composition has had limited impact in terms of “integrating” either Westdene’s people or its functions.

The larger issue is that Westdene is merely one example of South African cities’ neighbourhoods and suburbs which are increasingly becoming functionally (and racially) diverse spatial units. Westdene is not an exception: it is typical. This holds a number of implications for how we might plan and more generally think of the development of South African cities. In the South African urban research context the investigatory gaze has for long been characterised by the pitting of one cluster of neighbourhoods or suburbs (generally white) against the former (black) townships, and more recently the inner-city areas. Research on both apartheid and post-apartheid urban forms have tended to focus on the supposed homogeneity of privileged white suburbs or neighbourhoods as opposed to the deprivation of townships, highlighting the class and racially fragmented nature of the South African urban form. Little, if any, consideration has been given to the diversity of the ostensibly bland and supposedly homogeneous white suburbs or neighbourhoods. As this investigation has shown, this perception is far off the mark. Neighbourhoods are changing in land use as a result of both decentralisation and of desegregation of business, leisure and residential characteristics. Though no urbanised area functions in isolation and historically, for example, has always had strong linkages to a city’s CBD, it is also clear that the various linkages between neighbourhoods need to be investigated as well. Ultimately, the changing nature of the neighbourhood might very well mean that we not only have to rethink the meaning of the concept of neighbourhood, but also of the CBD.
REFERENCES


BRIDGE, G. 2006. Perspectives on cultural capital and the neighbourhood, Urban Studies, 43(4), 719-730.


ROODT, A. 1994. Planning and the transformation of social space in the neighbourhood Westdene: A Case study in Bloemfontein, Unpublished Masters dissertation in Town and Regional Planning Faculty of Natural Sciences, University of the Free State, Bloemfontein.


An evaluation of post-apartheid housing delivery in Mangaung: 
a view from local government

1. INTRODUCTION

An increasing number of academic articles are focusing on post-apartheid housing policy and practice in South Africa. An assessment of post-apartheid housing research by Marais (2006) has shown that the main topics addressed in housing research in South African academic journals since 1994 are: general policy assessment (20.3%), informal settlements (18.7%), social issues related to housing delivery (8%) and financial or economic issues related to housing policy (5%). Aspects of housing research that have not received adequate attention include the evaluation of housing policy from a city and municipal perspective, and the way in which national and local policies influence local delivery. Although there has certainly been no lack of local case studies in housing research – nearly 38% of all housing research is conducted by means of local case studies – the experiences of cities and towns (or municipalities) in respect of housing policy have not been documented adequately (Marais, 2006). Some of the exceptions in this regard include studies on Bloemfontein during the first five years of post-apartheid housing delivery (Marais and Krige, 1999), as well as on Durban (Charlton, 2003), Welkom (Marais and Wessels, 2005) and Cape Town (Graham, 2006). In addition to the lack of evidence concerning the experiences of municipalities or cities, a large percentage of the research in this regard has focused largely on the impact (or, in practice, the lack of impact) of housing subsidies on the urban (apartheid) morphology (see, for example, Harrison et al., 2003). Aspects that are not considered in most of this research include the role played by intergovernmental relations, as well as the concept of cooperative governance in housing delivery at the local level. The evaluation of housing policy initiated by the National Department of Housing has devoted virtually no attention to aspects of cooperative governance in respect of housing. In fact, reflections on cooperative governance and its implications for local governments within the housing environment are virtually non-existent, with the exception of some incidental comments made in this regard (see, for example, Marais, 2003; Marais and Wessels, 2005). This is true, despite some academic contributions on cooperative governance in general (Reddy, 2001; PAIR Institute of South Africa, 2002; Malan, 2005). The only direct response in respect of housing and cooperative governance is that of McLean (2003), who is of the opinion that housing and housing delivery in fact comprise an excellent example of how intergovernmental relations should work.

Against the background of this serious lack of appropriate research and thinking on housing and cooperative governance, this chapter aims to evaluate post-apartheid
housing policy and practice in the Mangaung Local Municipality (mainly Bloemfontein, Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu) by assessing how provincial and national policies influence housing practice at the local level. Secondary to this aim, an overview of housing policy and practice at the local level will also be provided. Considering the lack of research at the city or municipal level, such basic evidence is pivotal. The chapter starts off with a brief overview of literature relevant to local cities or municipalities. The emphasis then falls on an analysis of the notion of cooperative government. The literature overview and analysis of the concept of cooperative governance will be followed by an assessment of delivery, and of how the role played by provincial and national government has impacted on post-apartheid housing delivery in the Mangaung Local Municipality, as well as how the Mangaung Local Municipality has reacted in this regard.

2. EXISTING HOUSING RESEARCH AND THE CITY IN SOUTH AFRICA: A LITERATURE REVIEW

This section presents an attempt to provide a broad overview of existing research on low-income housing research, which has implications at a city level. Although the primary aim is to assess the research by the National Department of Housing, other relevant research will also be considered. Seven aspects relevant to this paper are worth mentioning.

Firstly, South African housing policy has frequently been criticised for fostering urban sprawl by locating housing delivery on the peripheries of urban areas, thereby reinforcing the spatial tendencies of apartheid and locating the poor on the periphery (Huchzermeyer, 2003; Harrison et al., 2003). Watson, as cited in Turok (2001: 2369), is of the opinion that “[S]prawling development on the urban periphery may also impose excessive operating costs on public authority services in the years to come”. Furthermore, Tomlinson (1999) notes that “evidence… suggests that residents of shack settlements on the urban peripheries, while now enjoying access to housing subsidies, have remained marginalised and impoverished. The lack of economic opportunities means that huge numbers of families are in the same economic situation as before, albeit with a housing option” (Tomlinson, 1999: 292). Watson and McCarthy (1998: 52) observe that “the location of many ownership schemes, usually on cheaper land on the city edge, has meant that many poor households have had to choose between ownership in a peripheral settlement, far from work, or rental in a better located area”. At the same time, it should also be noted that some researchers have started to question the inherent notion of higher densities, and suggest that informality on the periphery is part and parcel of the South African housing landscape (Cross, 2006; Todes, 2006). The importance of appropriate public transport systems in addressing this reality is therefore emphasised (Cross, 2006).

The second conceptual issue frequently brought to the fore in the literature is the fact that the subsidy scheme is not suitable to be used for informal settlement upgrading (Huchzermeyer, 2002); that informal settlement upgrading is limited (CSIR, 1999; Marais, 2003); and that the practice of informal settlement upgrading has serious shortcomings (Huchzermeyer, 2002). The most common shortcoming is the fact that, owing to the nature
of the subsidy mechanism, the informal settlement upgrading projects are not area-based, which results in an over-emphasis on the house; and that, compared to other countries, the involvement of social movements in upgrading has been limited (Huchzermeyer, 2002).

Thirdly, linked to the issue of the lack of informal upgrading, the inappropriate nature of ownership in respect of the poor is problematic. In this regard Khan (2003: 24) argues that “[A] key challenge for SA housing policy is the development of appropriate tenure arrangements/instruments for informal settlement upgrade, especially because informal land and housing delivery systems will for many decades remain the only alternative for the homeless poor”. The same sentiments are also expressed by Phillippe and Houssay-Holzschuch (2002) and Morange (2002). Charlton (2003) and Charlton and Kihato (2006) argue that the emphasis on ownership is one-dimensional and does not allow for innovation.

Fourthly, aspects relating to norms and standards have always been an issue in housing policy. Although the initial White Paper on Housing contained no specific guidelines in respect of norms and standards, some provinces had their own. Later on during the policy development process, some guidelines were set. Although it can hardly be denied that there is evidence of developers and contractors providing products that are inferior and of poor quality, it should be noted that stricter norms and standards have also had negative consequences (Public Service Commission, 2003). Basically, there are two opposing views in the relevant literature in respect of norms and standards. Charlton (2003) is of the opinion that the norms and standards result in low levels of services being implemented, and that this in turn negates the idea of well-located development. Some municipalities, such as the eThekwini Municipality, provide an additional R10 000 per site to improve levels of infrastructure. In contrast, there seems to be a prevailing opinion that too much emphasis has been placed on norms and standards, in the sense that this often creates certain unexpected policy outcomes. The most prominent evidence in this regard can be observed in the fact that houses constructed in the Free State have been the largest (as required by a provincial emphasis on housing size), but have also had the lowest levels of infrastructure (Marais and Krige, 2000; Marais, 2003). The Public Service Commission (2003) has also warned that problems of equity may result from an emphasis on housing size.

Fifthly, in terms of levels of satisfaction, it seems that there is a prevailing satisfaction with the delivery of certain basic services such as water and sanitation, and that this represents an overall improvement in peoples’ lives (Public Service Commission, 2003: 95, 97; Zack and Charlton, 2003: 27). The importance of access to these services in raising the quality of life should not be underestimated. The linkage of such services with better management of health must also be understood. In relation to HIV/AIDS, for example, access to clean water and sanitation makes a significant difference to both patient and care-giver.

Sixthly, although very little empirical evidence exists in respect of the financial drain of low-income housing on municipalities, a number of researchers have highlighted this problem at a conceptual level, while it has also been mentioned in the document entitled Breaking New Ground (National Department of Housing, 2005). The location of many low-income housing developments, their scale and the poverty of their inhabitants imply a considerable
maintenance and management problem. Tomlinson (1999: 291) noted that “while interviews with local government housing implementers revealed a willingness, if not an eagerness, to provide low-cost housing, the councils were hesitating, as they began considering its likely impact on their financial health”. It has also been pointed out that some councils have supported housing delivery by means of an amount additional to the subsidy. However, in most municipalities, this was not possible, since the municipalities did not have funds available.

Finally, despite a large number of academic papers on hidden urbanities, housing policy has been silent in respect of the role of housing in these areas. The only academic contributions in this regard are those of Marais (2001, 2005). State response has come in the form of the National Spatial Development Perspective (Presidency, 2003) which outlines where government expenditure should take place. In essence, the document suggests that in areas that lack economic potential, the focus of government expenditure should be on people and not places. Yet places with potential should, in fact, receive funding for infrastructure investment (investment in places). Housing delivery has not yet been categorised in terms of the NSDP, and there is uncertainty as to whether, according to the NSDP, it is regarded as economic infrastructure or basic infrastructure.

The overview of the foregoing seven crucial aspects in relation to housing delivery provides the framework for the emphasis on intergovernmental relations and cooperative governance and the implications of these for the Mangaung Local Municipality.

3. COOPERATIVE GOVERNANCE

In South Africa government is constituted as national, provincial and local, with provision being made for cooperative governance between these spheres. Although a number of papers have appeared in this regard (Reddy, 2001; Malan, 2005), only one has reflected on the concept of cooperative governance in relation to housing (McLean, 2003). Malan (2005: 226) acknowledges that proper cooperative governance is required to make projects work effectively. One of the problems in the cooperative governance context is that housing is not a local government function. Chapter Three of the Constitution (Republic of South Africa, 1996) sets out principles of cooperative government. Despite the fact that housing has not been a local function, the Constitution furthermore provides in Section 41 (1) that “All spheres of government and all organs of state within each sphere must exercise their powers and perform their functions in a manner that does not encroach on the geographical, functional or institutional integrity of government in another sphere” (Republic of South Africa, 1996: 41(1)). Moreover, all spheres of government should cooperate with one another in mutual trust and good faith by - (i) fostering friendly relations; (ii) assisting and supporting one another; (iii) informing one another of, and consulting one another on, matters of common interest; (iv) coordinating their actions and legislation with one another; (v) adhering to agreed-on procedures; and (vi) avoiding legal proceedings against one another. According to McLean (2003), this represents a radical shift from the central government structure of
the apartheid era—which provided for different tiers of government—to spheres of government, which are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated.

Table 1  Roles of the three spheres of government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ROLE OF GOVERNMENT</th>
<th>National Government</th>
<th>Provincial Government</th>
<th>Local Government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National government’s responsibility is to establish and facilitate a sustainable national housing development process. For this purpose, it must determine national housing policy. It is responsible for:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Defining and applying the minimum norms and standards for housing</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Engaging in national facilitation programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allocating funds to provinces</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Allocating funds to provinces</td>
<td>☐ Engaging in national facilitation programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring national and provincial performance against the housing delivery goals</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Monitoring national and provincial performance against the housing delivery goals</td>
<td>☐ Monitoring national and provincial performance against the housing delivery goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervising national statutory institutions and accounting to Parliament for the progress made</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Supervising national statutory institutions and accounting to Parliament for the progress made</td>
<td>☐ Supervising national statutory institutions and accounting to Parliament for the progress made</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial government’s main responsibility is to create an enabling environment, by promoting and facilitating the provision of adequate housing in the province. In addition thereto, provincial government must:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Determining provincial policy in respect of housing development</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Determining provincial policy in respect of housing development</td>
<td>☐ Determining provincial policy in respect of housing development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting the adoption of legislation to ensure effective housing delivery</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Promoting the adoption of legislation to ensure effective housing delivery</td>
<td>☐ Promoting the adoption of legislation to ensure effective housing delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking all reasonable and necessary steps to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Taking all reasonable and necessary steps to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities</td>
<td>☐ Taking all reasonable and necessary steps to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-ordinating housing development in the province</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Co-ordinating housing development in the province</td>
<td>☐ Co-ordinating housing development in the province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Every municipality must, as part of integrated development planning, take reasonable and necessary steps within the housing legislation to ensure that:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People have access to adequate housing</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ People have access to adequate housing</td>
<td>☐ People have access to adequate housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unhealthy and unsafe living conditions are prevented</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Unhealthy and unsafe living conditions are prevented</td>
<td>☐ Unhealthy and unsafe living conditions are prevented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services such as water, sanitation, electricity, roads, storm-water drainage and transport are provided</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Services such as water, sanitation, electricity, roads, storm-water drainage and transport are provided</td>
<td>☐ Services such as water, sanitation, electricity, roads, storm-water drainage and transport are provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing delivery goals are determined for areas under its jurisdiction</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Housing delivery goals are determined for areas under its jurisdiction</td>
<td>☐ Housing delivery goals are determined for areas under its jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land for housing development is identified and designated</td>
<td>☐ Setting up national subsidy systems</td>
<td>☐ Land for housing development is identified and designated</td>
<td>☐ Land for housing development is identified and designated</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Republic of South Africa, 1997

In terms of Part A of Schedule 4 of the Constitution (Republic of South Africa, 1996), housing is a concurrent competence of national and provincial government. This means that both the national and provincial governments are competent to enact legislation to regulate housing (McLean, 2003). However, local delivery requires specific roles for local governments. McLean (2003) also argues that the principle of subsidiarity in the delivery of housing, in so far as it relates to the fact that the sphere closest to the people (local government) that is capable of delivering housing should do so, is another clear trend bearing testimony to the fact that cooperative government is required. The argument here is that these two developments of private to public, and of provincial to local, have resulted in greater emphasis on the role of local government in housing delivery; and also in a corresponding need to clarify the remaining role of provincial government, where the local government has
become more active in housing delivery. Table 1 outlines the roles of the three levels of government in terms of the Housing Act of 1997.

National government’s responsibility is to determine national housing policy, and to establish and facilitate a sustainable national housing development process. The provincial government’s main responsibility is to create an enabling environment by promoting and facilitating the provision of adequate housing in the province. The municipalities must, as part of integrated development planning, take reasonable and necessary steps within the housing legislation to ensure that the right of access to adequate housing is realised.

Fundamentally, we should like to challenge the optimistic view expressed by McLean (2003) as to how well cooperative governance works in the housing field by arguing that evidence from the Free State – in this case the Mangaung Local Municipality – suggests that, despite the theoretical advantages of cooperative governance, serious structural problems exist in reality. Research on housing policy in the Free State has reflected on the consequences of the norms and standards in the Free State being higher than the national norms and standards – a factor which has had serious negative consequences for larger urban areas (Marais and Krige, 1999; Marais, 2003; Marais and Wessels, 2005). However, these negative implications have been conceptualised at the provincial level. The question is how municipalities – and in this case, specifically the Mangaung Local Municipality – experience processes of housing delivery.

4. HOUSING DELIVERY IN MANGAUNG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY: A BRIEF STATISTICAL OVERVIEW

4.1 A geographical and historical overview of housing provision

The municipality consists of three main urban areas, namely Bloemfontein, Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu, as well as the agricultural areas in between. Krige (1991) has claimed that the Bloemfontein-Botshabelo-Thaba Nchu region (which today forms the Mangaung Local Municipality) is one of the best examples of apartheid planning. Under apartheid the region consisted of a former homeland area (Thaba Nchu) and an R293 town in Botshabelo (Krige, 1991). Some literature also refers to Botshabelo and, to some extent, urban Thaba Nchu as hidden urbanities (CDE, 1998), the reason being that black urbanisation under apartheid was channelled away from Bloemfontein to Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu. In 1968 land expansion for black people in the Mangaung Township in Bloemfontein was frozen and black urbanisation was channelled to Thaba Nchu. After the establishment of Botshabelo in 1979, it became the focus of channelled urbanisation. Channelled urbanisation also meant that housing and infrastructure services were allocated to these homeland areas or hidden urbanities at the expense of the core urban area, Bloemfontein (Marais, 1997, 2001, 2005).

\[1\] A distinction should be made between the Mangaung Local Municipality, which includes the magisterial districts of Bloemfontein, Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu, and the Mangaung Township, which refers to the former black township in Bloemfontein.
The first expansion of Mangaung Township occurred in 1986 when private urban stands for middle-income dwellers became available in Mangaung Township (Krige, 1991). However, it was only when funds for sites and services became available from the Independent Development Trust in 1992 that stands for low-income earners were made available for the first time since 1968 (Marais and Krige, 1997). In addition to the reality of the hidden urbanities, Bloemfontein has also been labelled as one of the better examples of apartheid planning (Krige, 1991, 1998). Inter alia, this entailed a sector layout structure accommodating African people, with the coloured populations in sectors towards the east. It was thus within this reality of hidden urbanities, and also of racial fragmentation in Bloemfontein, that a post-apartheid housing policy had to operate.

4.2 Delivery statistics

Since the initial observation of Marais and Krige (1999) that post-apartheid housing delivery was slow, low-income housing delivery has increased steadily in the Mangaung Local Municipality. Table 2 provides an overview of the housing delivery in the Municipality. Of the houses delivered in the Free State, 21.7% were constructed in the Mangaung Local Municipality.

Table 2  Houses completed in the Mangaung Local Municipality: 1994-2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Houses</td>
<td>14 168</td>
<td>3 097</td>
<td>3 500</td>
<td>3 850</td>
<td>1 700</td>
<td>26 315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of total in the Free State</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Mangaung Local Municipality, 2004a

If one considers this percentage in the light of the fact that Mangaung Local Municipality accommodates approximately 25% of the Free State population, it is apparent that the degree of delivery has been somewhat less significant in this area. Furthermore, the Free State Growth and Development Strategy argues that nearly 30% of the housing problem is located in the Mangaung Local Municipality (Free State Provincial Government, 2006). This further suggests that delivery in the Mangaung Local Municipality has not been up to par, either in respect of the share of the population or in respect of the share of the housing backlog in the Free State.

5. KEY ASPECTS OF HOUSING DELIVERY

This section will indicate the lessons learned from post-apartheid housing delivery in the Mangaung Local Municipality. The first two aspects to be discussed relate directly to the fact that cooperative governance and intergovernmental relations have placed extraordinary pressure on Mangaung Local Municipality. The third and fourth aspects are related to the issues of well-located land and informal settlement upgrading, while the fifth aspect is
concerned with the spatial allocation of subsidies within Mangaung Local Municipality, with special emphasis on the hidden urbanities in Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu.

5.1 Cooperative governance and intergovernmental relations in the delivery of housing in the Mangaung Local Municipality

In this section we argue that, despite the noble intentions of cooperative governance, the reality is far more complex. We will also argue that the inherent levels (despite the emphasis on spheres) have intended and unintended consequences, of which local government is forced to bear the brunt. Five examples will be provided in this regard.

Firstly, the Provincial Department of Local Government and Housing in the Free State allocates housing subsidies to Mangaung Local Municipality on an _ad hoc_ basis instead of on a multi-year basis as required by both the provincial housing strategy and the Mangaung Local Municipality’s housing sector plan. This _ad hoc_ allocation has serious implications for the Mangaung Local Municipality. It makes longer-term planning virtually impossible. In practice councillors and officials cannot provide people in informal settlements, or those in need of housing assistance, with any significant medium-term indication of what their real plans are. Essentially, the problem is that _ad hoc_ allocations make long-term planning impossible and this impacts negatively on the accountability of councillors.

Secondly, linked to this _ad hoc_ approach to subsidy allocation, the municipality has no mechanism to negotiate the number of subsidies being allocated to Mangaung Local Municipality. There is no systematic overall approach to the allocation of subsidies. The result is that the Municipality has no idea as to what action should be taken in order to improve the allocations. The Mangaung Local Municipality also has very little control over the appointment of developers, as such decisions are taken at the provincial level. Again, local accountability comes under pressure.

Thirdly – and as a further consequence of the _ad hoc_ allocation of subsidies – the lack of coordinated multi-year planning for housing development between the two spheres has been problematic. On the one hand, Mangaung Local Municipality is expected to implement capital projects identified in the IDP in a particular fiscal year. Yet, on the other hand, the Municipality receives no medium-term housing allocation to assist with the actual implementation of the capital projects, as projected in the IDP. Owing to the lack of longer-term allocations, as well as the prescription in respect of 40 m² housing units (which will be discussed later), the tendency has been to shift projects around to areas where serviced sites have been available. This tendency has had the result of defeating the object of integrated development planning, and has demoralised people (community members) who had prioritised the implementation of certain projects in their wards during the community ward planning process.

In addition to these three aspects related to the _ad hoc_ allocation of subsidies, two other aspects related to intergovernmental relations and cooperative governance require some reflection. Firstly, land in Botshabelo belonged to the Provincial Department of Public Works;
and for this reason, this Department had to sign deed-of-sale documents before houses could be constructed. The reality is that this created a situation that was difficult for the Mangaung Local Municipality to control, because the signing of sale documents and the implementation of projects fell within the jurisdiction of different spheres of government. Delays and administrative problems between the Department of Public Works and the Mangaung Local Municipality occurred constantly and had serious implications at the local level.

Secondly, in 1998, the Thaba Nchu TLC embarked on a process of registering almost 14 000 sites under communal administration against the names of individuals. The Department of Land Affairs (DLA) led this process. This exercise, and especially the way in which the Department of Land Affairs collected information, resulted in a number of registration errors at the Deeds Office. These ownership discrepancies hampered the implementation of housing projects.

All the cited reasons, from the ad hoc planning process to the inappropriate administrative procedures, point to issues of cooperative government which have resulted in fewer houses being built in the Mangaung Local Municipality over the last ten years.

5.2 The impact of the 40 m² housing

In the Mangaung Local Municipality almost all the RDP houses provided in terms of the government’s housing subsidy scheme conform to the provincial policy of a minimum size of 40 m². However, this requirement has had a number of implications for Mangaung Local Municipality.

Marais (2003) indicated that it is only possible to construct 40 m² housing units where planned stands are available and where land prices are extremely low. The lack of planned stands initially made it very difficult for Mangaung Local Municipality to comply with the initial 40 m² housing criterion (Marais and Krige, 1999). However, the Municipality gradually started to make in-roads in this process. Three mechanisms were employed, both to finance new stands and to provide the appropriate infrastructure on these stands. Initially, funds from the Electricity Commission facilitated the availability of planned stands through electricity provision. Secondly, the Municipality started to use its Erf Stabilisation Fund to make stands available. Thirdly, some funds were also available from intergovernmental processes. It is especially in respect of the Erf Stabilisation Fund that a number of concerns should be raised. Any erf stabilisation fund should work according to the principle that, once the erven have been sold, the money should be paid back into the fund to ensure replicability. Owing to the 40 m² requirement, this was not possible, as the full amount received from the housing subsidy had to be used to comply with the prescribed housing size. The possibility of recovering this cost from the beneficiaries was also limited. This approach therefore offers no long-term solution. What happens if no more funds are available? The emphasis placed by the provincial government on 40 m² housing units has also contributed to the lack of adequate services at some of the housing units (for example, some units are without adequate sanitation), as the whole subsidy was used to comply with prescriptions in respect of size.
5.3 Evaluating the issue of insufficient well-located land for housing development in the Mangaung Local Municipality

The literature overview has emphasised that the lack of well-located land for housing the poor is a problem throughout the country. Access to well-located land closer to the city remains a fundamental challenge with regard to the objective of sustainable human settlement development in the municipality. Because of this situation, Mangaung Local Municipality has implemented “infill” projects to promote integration and to ensure that poor people are not spatially removed from basic social and economic amenities. This section provides an overview of the approach followed.

Most “Open Urban” spaces in existing areas in the Mangaung Township have been rezoned into “Residential” spaces. Such rezoning has resulted from two factors. Firstly, these areas are well located in relation to social and economic amenities. Secondly, informal invasions occurred on these open spaces (see Table 3 below). These open spaces included the previous buffer strips that were provided for under apartheid planning. This approach was informed by two motivational factors: firstly, it played a significant role in containing urban sprawl and enhancing urban efficiency and, secondly, it promoted integration in that it was focused on the development of developable buffer strips. The following areas were rezoned from other land uses into “Residential” areas after 1994 as infill projects (see Table 3 and Figure 1).

Between 1994 and 2004 a total of 26 315 houses were constructed throughout the Municipality. Of these, almost 21 000 (about 78%) were constructed in Mangaung Township. An estimated 7 336 of these 21 000 houses were constructed within existing areas in Mangaung Township as infill projects, representing almost 35% of the total number of houses constructed in the township (see Table 3). This means, therefore, that 65% of the houses were constructed in formalised areas, which are located farther away from the city. The Municipality has, to some extent, circumvented the scarcity of well-located land closer to the city by embarking on infill projects within the existing Mangaung Township so as to contain urban sprawl and to promote integration. However, it should be acknowledged that most of the houses still played a role in promoting further sprawling towards the east, in that large-scale informal settlements developed in that direction. The lack of better-located land is probably the main reason for this circumstance. We tend to agree with Cross (2006) that there is a need for a renewed emphasis on the development of transport routes and systems that integrate the poor effectively into the mainstream economy, as the reality of South African urban areas probably entails peripheral locations for the poor. However, at the same time, evidence from Mangaung suggests that effective integration and infill help to contain urban sprawl.
Figure 1: Urban open spaces rezoned from other land uses into “Residential Areas” in Mangaung Township since 1994
Table 3  Urban open spaces rezoned from other land uses into “Residential” areas in Mangaung Local Municipality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Former urban open spaces in Mangaung Township</th>
<th>No. of erven created</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Township</th>
<th>Previous zoning/function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tambo Square I and II</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Business and Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thabo Mbeki I and II</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Mokaba</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Botshabelo</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shuping I and II</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solomon Mahlangu</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isithwalandwe</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codesa I</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Botshabelo</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codesa II and III</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Botshabelo</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joe Slovo</td>
<td>697</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Phahameng-East</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kagisho Square</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Phahameng-East</td>
<td>Farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathrada I and II</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Phahameng-East</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China Square</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Kagisanong-Buffer</td>
<td>Farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sejake/Lekota</td>
<td>526</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Kagisanong-Buffer</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loziho I and II</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Kagisanong</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JB Mafora III</td>
<td>1053</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Kagisanong-Buffer</td>
<td>Farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia North</td>
<td>1517</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Kagisanong</td>
<td>Farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albert Luthuli</td>
<td>568</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Kagisanong</td>
<td>Public open space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension V</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Kagisanong</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noordkamp III</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1999-2003</td>
<td>Kagisanong-Buffer</td>
<td>Farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Square Extension</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Kagisanong-East</td>
<td>Farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kgoteloepale</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Phahameng-East</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thipe Square</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Kagisanong</td>
<td>Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lusaka Square</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>1987-2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maphikela</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Batho</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dark City</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Phahameng</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silver City</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Phahameng</td>
<td>Community facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lapologa Square</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Kagisanong</td>
<td>Park</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOTAL (Infill projects)</th>
<th>7 336</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL (Mangaung Township)</td>
<td>21 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL (MANGAUNG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY)</td>
<td>26 315</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Mangaung Local Municipality, 2004b

5.4 Informal settlements approach in the Mangaung Local Municipality

The management of informal settlements in Mangaung Township displayed some innovation; yet some of the dilemmas identified in the existing literature remain (see Huchzermeyer, 2002). In the first place, the process of developing and formalising land was separated from the housing development process – an important first step in informal settlement upgrading (Huchzermeyer and Karam, 2006). This was possible because the erf stabilisation funds and certain intergovernmental grants were available. In the process Mangaung Local Municipality was able to create 32 263 erven in the newly formalised areas over the past ten years. Secondly, a firm decision was taken that inhabitable land would not be formalised.

Thirdly, the Municipality has embraced the view that informal settlements are likely to continue to provide shelter for many poor people who are waiting for houses within formal developments. For this reason managing existing informal settlements by bringing informality within the orbit of formal planning and tenure is critical. In this sense, through established ward structures such as those comprised of the Ward Councillors and Ward Committee Members, the Municipality manages the process of issuing individual sites before the process of township establishment. The process that is adhered to is as follows. The ward structures assist housing officials in the identification of families on “residential sites” and in the drawing up of a list of these families, which includes all the particulars of the occupants (surname and initials, identity numbers, dependants and special cases), for the purpose of proper settlement once the Township Register is opened. This information is then captured on the housing database by the Department of Housing of the Mangaung Local Municipality. Each site is again visited once the Surveyor-General’s plan has been finalised to collate or re-confirm data on the list with the person on site. Following this confirmation, the person on site is then given a “call form” or is invited to come to the nearest housing office for the signing of a site permit (occupation agreement). This information is then incorporated into the municipal housing database. In this way the occupant is given occupational rights, as well as the right to purchase the erf/site from the Council when the Township Register and services are in place and the land price has been determined. Any dispute arising from site allocation at any stage is dealt with in terms of a legitimate dispute resolution process within the Council’s administration, established in terms of the Housing Act of 1997. In this way the municipality has created an interim system for the provision of secure land to the beneficiary, without linking it directly to ownership, but providing security of tenure as quickly as possible. This system, in a very pragmatic way, provides the new urban resident with some security in the urban setting – albeit with the aim of providing full ownership later. It also demonstrates
that some innovation and local application are possible within the current tenure framework. Initially, it also provided a way of circumventing the fact that people owning land would not be able to access a housing subsidy. Full transfer of ownership only occurred once the housing subsidy had been allocated and the house constructed. Furthermore, prior conferring of “occupation rights” through informal land management processes provides a sound basis for the entitlement system and minimises corruption related to site allocations. Moreover, tenure security outside of housing delivery provides housing more quickly, because registration at the Deeds Office is excluded, and there are no site ownership disputes at the time of project implementation.

Although this has been a fairly successful approach to ensuring security of tenure for new urban dwellers, it has also been neither integrated nor holistic in nature, compared with international lessons in this regard (see Huchzermeyer and Karam, 2006). The level of participation, integrated settlement development and local control over decision-making has been limited. Although an attempt has been made to address aspects of integration and participation by means of the “new” Breaking New Ground Policy, it seems unlikely that this will make any significant difference if, in the eyes of provincial and national government institutions, the desired outcome still comprises a predetermined type of house.

5.5 Spatial allocation of subsidies in Mangaung Local Municipality

An aspect on which housing policy has been fairly silent is the question as to where (regionally speaking) housing subsidies should be allocated. As already noted, some reference to this issue has been made in the literature by Cranshaw and Parnell (1996), while Marais (2001, 2003, 2005) has also touched on this topic. The Housing Sector Plan stipulates that Bloemfontein should receive 60% of the subsidies, Botshabelo 20% and Thaba Nchu 20% (Mangaung Local Municipality, 2003).

Table 4 Housing subsidy allocations between the three urban settlements in Mangaung Local Municipality, 1994-2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bloemfontein</td>
<td>10 568</td>
<td>2 598</td>
<td>2 500</td>
<td>2 400</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>20 366</td>
<td>77.39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botshabelo</td>
<td>2 200</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>3 618</td>
<td>13.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thaba Nchu</td>
<td>1 400</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>2 331</td>
<td>8.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>14 168</td>
<td>3 097</td>
<td>3 500</td>
<td>3 850</td>
<td>1 700</td>
<td>26 315</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Mangaung Local Municipality, 2004c

Several conflicts have arisen from this percentage allocation in the Housing Sector Plan of the Mangaung Local Municipality. Councillors – especially those for Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu – argue that most development is targeted at Bloemfontein. These councillors point out that the current allocation ratio encourages the relocation and resettlement of people in...
Bloemfontein; and they have since insisted that at least 25% should be allocated to the two regions and 50% to Bloemfontein. Table 4 provides information on the spatial allocation of subsidies in the three towns over the past ten years.

The table demonstrates that most subsidies were allocated in Bloemfontein. Thaba Nchu and Botshabelo received only 8.85% and 13.7% of subsidies respectively. A number of aspects should be noted in this regard. Firstly, very few guidelines exist nationally, despite the existence of the NSDP. Many regard the NSDP as an indicative tool, while the question of whether housing is economic infrastructure or basic infrastructure is not answered. Secondly, there seems (understandably) to be political pressure from politicians in Thaba Nchu and Botshabelo for housing delivery in these regions. Thirdly, housing delivery in these two areas cannot be viewed separately from the continuation of the transport (bus) subsidy between the two areas and Bloemfontein (see Marais and Krige, 1999). To a large extent it seems as if the emphasis on housing subsidies, along with the transport subsidy, maintains the apartheid-planned spatial heritage of the Mangaung Local Municipal Area; it should perhaps also be acknowledged that, from a human point of view, this is probably an appropriate approach under the circumstances. Whether it actually makes long-term financial and economic sense is obviously a legitimate question, which, however, seems to be avoided. Finally, it seems as if purely administrative difficulties (which could be a blessing in disguise) have limited proportional delivery in Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu.

6. CONCLUDING COMMENTS

This chapter has evaluated housing delivery and policy in the Mangaung Local Municipality, which includes the urban areas of Bloemfontein, Thaba Nchu and Botshabelo. The investigation fills three gaps in existing housing policy research in South Africa. Firstly, it provides a housing-delivery perspective from a municipal point of view. In terms of this perspective the chapter points to some concerns in respect of the principle of cooperative governance, and also argues that policy and allocation procedures at the provincial level are impacting negatively on housing delivery in the Mangaung Local Municipality. The ad hoc fashion in which subsidies are delivered, the administrative problems in an array of government departments and the emphasis on 40 m² housing units have all placed the Municipality under pressure in terms of long-term planning, local accountability and financial viability. Thus, despite the good intentions of other spheres of government, local governments bear the brunt, at a local level, of the consequences of these good intentions. Secondly, the case study of Mangaung Local Municipality suggests that, despite serious attempts at integration, security of tenure and effective informal settlement upgrading, a number of problems persist. For example – as the relevant literature suggests – urban sprawl continues (with limited indications of effective transport planning), while integrated settlement development and effective participation in informal settlement upgrading are also still limited. Thirdly, it seems as if political pressure and a human rights approach, coupled with implementation problems, still play a predominant role in housing-delivery problems in South Africa’s hidden urbanities. An appropriate policy response is urgently required.
Against this background, the accreditation of the Municipality according to the Housing Act might provide an opportunity for a more appropriate and locally-driven approach to housing. Further research should at least investigate how the Municipality has addressed some of the conflict areas discussed in this paper.

REFERENCES


MANGAUNG LOCAL MUNICIPALITY (MLM). 2003. Housing Sector Plan, Compiled by Mvusuluso Multi-Dimension Services for the Free State Department of Local Government and Housing, Bloemfontein.
PAIR INSTITUTE OF SOUTH AFRICA, THE. 2002. Intergovernmental relations and co-operative governance in South Africa. Best practices case study series, report funded by DFID, Pretoria.


Urban tourism in Bloemfontein: current dynamics, immediate challenges and future prospects

1. INTRODUCTION

The city and its artefacts have been a source of attraction to tourists since ancient times. However, several commentators note that the urban dimension has been given insufficient attention within tourism scholarship (Law, 1992, 1993; Hall and Page, 1999; Page and Hall, 2003; Suh and Gartner, 2004). It is noted that over the past two decades the historical paucity of research reflection on tourism in cities and the phenomenon of urban tourism have been addressed by way of a range of issues relating to tourists in cities, hereby attracting a growing number of investigations (Rogerson and Visser, 2005: 63). Current international literature has seen extensive urban tourism research being focused on North American and Western European cities (cf. Law, 1993; Van der Berg et al., 1995; Law, 1996; Page and Hall, 2003; Wober, 2002). Much of this work highlights the fact that increased interest in urban tourism is underpinned by escalating demand by tourists for urban historic sights and heritage cities, as well as by concerted efforts by policy makers to focus on the role of tourism in revitalising urban areas and their economies (Rogerson and Visser, 2005; Van der Merwe and Patel, 2005). Recently the investigatory gaze has been expanded to include research focusing on urban tourism in Australia, New Zealand, Hong Kong, Singapore, as well as China and Taiwan (Chang, 1999, 2000; McKercher et al., 2004, 2005). On the whole, however, urban tourism in the developing world context, not least urban Africa, remains scant.

Until comparatively recently urban tourism has largely been invisible to the South African academic research community (Rogerson and Visser, 2005). The lack of research into urban tourism is somewhat perplexing, however, for unlike the situation in many developing countries, the contours of its development can be traced through an extensive urban geography. Indeed, the development of many neighbourhoods in cities such as Cape Town, Durban or Port Elizabeth, as well as a host of smaller coastal and, increasingly, interior rural towns is inextricably linked to urban tourism growth (Donaldson, 2007; Pirie, 2007; Rogerson and Visser, 2007; Scott and Preston-Whyte, 2007; Visser, 2007). Whilst urban tourism has not received much research attention in South Africa, authors such as Grant and Bultet-Adam (1992) have, nevertheless, demonstrated that cities such as Durban and East London have actively promoted themselves as tourist destinations at least since the 1930s.

The limited current body of research on urban tourism in South Africa, along with substantive new material, has recently been compiled into a comprehensive collection of essays – Urban tourism in the developing world: the South African experience (Rogerson
and Visser, 2007). A clear theme running throughout this collection relates to the deployment of tourism as an economic driver for the expansion and restructuring of urban economies. One of the sub-themes explores the use of tourism activities as a tool for local economic development (Nel and Binns, 2003; Nel et al., 2003) generally, and inner-city urban regeneration specifically (Rogerson and Kaplan, 2006). In this respect a range of strategies have been suggested ranging from business tourism (Rogerson, 2002; 2005, 2005b, 2007a), festival tourism (Visser, 2005), township tourism (Nemasetoni and Rogerson, 2005), conference and exhibition tourism (Rogerson, 2007b), sport tourism (Bob and Moodley, 2001a, 2001b, 2001c, 2001d, 2001e, 2001f; Kotze, 2006) to gay tourism (Visser, 2003a).

A central characteristic of this work and, in fact, the bulk of the small existing corpus of local research focused on urban tourism relates to the size of the urban centres under investigation. Overwhelmingly, the main research focus has been the large metropolitan complexes, particularly of Johannesburg, but also Cape Town and Durban. This is hardly surprising, since much of the growth in the South African tourism system – particularly that relating to the business, conference and similar market segments – has been concentrated in the established urban, amenity-rich areas such as the Western Cape, particularly the greater Cape Town metropolitan area, Gauteng – specifically Johannesburg – and KwaZulu-Natal, where the focus is on Durban (Visser and Kotze, 2006). On the other hand, there has been increased interest in urban tourism in the high natural and cultural amenity-rich small towns of KwaZulu-Natal and especially in the Western Cape (see Donaldson (2007) for a review).

As might be expected, there has been a surge in research focusing on the actual and projected impacts that tourism can have on these destination areas both as regions and as urban places (see Rogerson and Visser (2007) for a review). What does cause concern, however, is that urban tourism development in South Africa retains the historically uneven distribution of both tourism product providers and, consequently, of tourists (see Visser 2003b). This is an outcome that national tourism policy instruments, not the least of which being the Tourism White Paper, have aimed firstly to address and, secondly, to avoid. Indeed, national government has expressed, as a key policy objective, the more even development of tourism products and tourist flows. Moreover, investigations into those regions with smaller tourism systems, or tourism systems that are small relative to other urban functions, have received little research attention and interest. In this respect smaller cities that are not metropolitan complexes, but nevertheless still cities, have received considerably less research attention. Indeed, the relevance of urban tourism development for secondary cities such as Bloemfontein, East London, Kimberley and Pietermaritzburg, for example, has not been considered in any depth.

It is in the context of the historically marginal position of the Free State province in the South African tourism system generally (Visser and Kotze, 2006), and specifically of Bloemfontein as a secondary city, that the paper aims to make a contribution. Despite official recognition of the potential significance of the tourism system to urban economic development, there have recently been no comprehensive studies into the structure and dynamics, or into the potential and opportunities, for urban tourism development in Bloemfontein. In view of such
limitations and particularly the lack of integrated yet relatively detailed research covering its tourism sector as a whole, strategic planning for tourism development in Bloemfontein is difficult to undertake. It is the intention of this investigation to remedy this omission.

Against this backdrop the task of this investigation is to provide an outline of the Bloemfontein tourism system so as to aid in the development of an urban tourism development strategy that might provide opportunities to tap into the positive development impacts associated with urban tourism expansion. These aims are developed in the following manner: firstly, an outline is provided of the data sources consulted and the methodology deployed in this investigation; secondly, a broad background of the tourism products of the Free State is provided, after which the current characteristics of the Bloemfontein tourism economy are subjected to scrutiny. The fourth section provides an overview of the obstacles to tourism development experienced by tourism product providers, whilst the fifth section details the types of support tourism product providers in Bloemfontein seek from both local and provincial authorities. In the light of this analysis, the sixth section profiles a development strategy for urban tourism development in Bloemfontein, additionally sketching the contours of possible future research directions.

2. DATA SOURCES AND METHODOLOGY

It has been argued that compared with other economic sectors, such as agriculture, manufacturing or mining, for each of which there is a considerable body of official data at the national level, the tourism sector is distinguished by the poor state of official data collection (Visser and Kotze, 2004). It is therefore not surprising that at both the provincial and local government level there is minimal official information upon which to provide a macro-analysis (let alone a micro-analysis) of the tourism economy of Bloemfontein (Visser and Kotze, 2004). Given this context, the first major task of this investigation was to compile a comprehensive listing of tourism product providers. This information was collected from the Free State Directory, the Yellow Pages and Phone Book, the Africa Dream Project, the information offices of Mangaung and Motheo (the relevant local authorities) and South African Tourism’s web-site. Combining all these sources of data presented the most comprehensive dataset for the Bloemfontein tourism system and resulted in the identification of 236 tourism products in October 2006.

These data are augmented by more in-depth survey material from 2004. That investigation focused on the main characteristics of the various tourism sectors in the Free State, and it drew upon interview material collected from tourism product providers. That survey methodology involved contacting all (888) of the tourism product providers in the Free State province (according to the most comprehensive listing for 2004). A total of 141 product providers participated in the survey, which entailed telephone interviews with all tourism product providers and institutions lasting between 15-45 minutes. The semi-structured questionnaire survey covered between 25-30 individual items (depending on the tourism

---

1 For an in-depth analysis of this investigation, see Visser (2005) and Visser and Kotze (2006).
sector, some question were not applicable to all tourism product providers). For the purposes of this paper, only the responses (52) of those product providers based in Bloemfontein are included in this investigation.

3. BACKGROUND NOTES ON THE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE OVERALL FREE STATE TOURISM PRODUCT

South Africa’s tourism economy has expanded very significantly over the past two decades. The demise of apartheid has seen international tourist arrivals increase from 50 000 in 1985 to more than 7.2 million in 2005 (South Africa Tourism, 2006). The distribution of international tourists is highly uneven, with overseas international visitors focusing their tour itineraries on the Western Cape and regional international tourists converging on Gauteng (Rogerson and Visser, 2007). The only significant international tourist market to visit the Free State in any significant numbers is tourists from Lesotho, currently numbering some 432 000 visitors annually. These tourists visit mainly for business and visiting friends and relatives (VFR) purposes. On the whole, however, the Free State is barely visible on the current international tourist travel radar (Visser and Kotze, 2006).

In terms of domestic tourist flows, the Free State is equally marginalised, accounting for only 6.9% (3.45 million trips) of all domestic tourism trips (49.1 million) (Visser and Kotze, 2006). A closer look at the data reveals that, of that percentage, only 32.9% were visitors from beyond the Free State, suggesting that domestic interprovincial travel was not a key element in the provincial tourism economy. Moreover, two thirds of these domestic tourism trips are for VFR (visiting friends and relatives) purposes. The tourism system in the Free State is profiled as making an intermediate contribution to the provincial economy of approximately ten percent and as supporting an estimated 60 000 employment opportunities (Urban-econ, 2004). The most recent data suggest that the total tourism expenditure in the Free State is in the region of R3.2 billion (WTO 2004). Given the magnitude of the tourism economy in the South African economy as a whole, the Free State provincial government, through its Free State Development Plan (2005), indicated its intention to address this dismal performance, and the desire to capture a greater share of the tourism system and the benefits associated with it, particularly in terms of employment creation and capital investment.

Production levels in the trade and catering sector, which also includes the tourism economy, have shown some fluctuation over the past decades, but have generally been downward. The Free State tourism sector depends largely on the spending power of the aggregate regional economy (owing to the fact that most of its tourists are intraprovincial), and has, as a result, not demonstrated much growth over the recent past. The provincial government recognises that the Free State is currently not accessing the tourism system in any particular force and, in fact, is losing ground on the national tourism front, whilst in general dramatic strides are being made in the tourism system elsewhere in South Africa (Visser and Kotze, 2004). Consequently, in terms of the development of the regional tourism system, the provincial government has set the goal of increasing its share in national tourism by two percent, and in the Free State GGP by five percent over the next few years. The key
objectives, in line with national tourism development policy, are to increase employment and to spread tourism-related opportunities more evenly across the Free State province. Similarly, the Mangaung Municipality, within which Bloemfontein is located, has included tourism development as a key driver of the local economy and as a vehicle to address the highly uneven distribution of employment opportunities in the city.

4. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE OVERALL BLOEMFONTEIN TOURISM ECONOMY

The tourism product of the Free State is unevenly distributed. Bloemfontein has the largest and the strongest cluster of tourism enterprises in the province (26%). The second and third most important tourism nodes are the Bethlehem-Clarens area (19%) and Parys (5%). As such, then, at least half of the Free State tourism product is focused on urban areas. The Bloemfontein tourism economy is currently estimated to attract R800 million in tourist spending annually and to maintain approximately 15 600 employment opportunities. Figure 1 provides an outline of the composition of the Bloemfontein tourism products. It is clear that the Bloemfontein tourism economy is narrow in focus and small in the number of enterprises directly involved in tourism product provision. In total an expansive view of tourism products suggests that some 439 businesses are associated with tourism (Figure 2 and Box 1). The product providers range from those that are directly and exclusively dedicated to the tourism system, such as the tourist accommodation sector, vehicle hire, conference venues, tour operators and travel agents, to those that are more involved in recreation—for example, museums and theatres—to those, such as restaurants, that only partially fulfil a tourism function. It is clear that the tourism economy of Bloemfontein is dominated by the tourist accommodation sector. In addition, this sector is comprised mainly of guest-house and bed-and-breakfast establishments.

Box 1 Typology of facilities included as tourism facilities and/or attractors in the investigation

| Exclusive or near-exclusive tourism resources/attractors/facilities | Tourism accommodation |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with considerable tourism use | Vehicle hire |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Tour operators |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Travel agents |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Conference venues |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Major arts and sports events |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Museums and theatres |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Art galleries |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Casinos |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Botanical gardens |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Restaurants |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Bars |
| Resources/attractors/facilities with partial tourism use | Well-known streetscapes |
An important feature of the Bloemfontein tourism economy is that, in the main, tourist accommodation sectors are dominated by small and medium-sized enterprises. The survey material indicated that the Bloemfontein guest-house sector\(^2\) emerged as tourist and accommodation segment in the mid-1980s. It has subsequently come to dominate the tourist accommodation sector both in capacity (6,500 bed spaces) and in the number of enterprises (211). Typically, these establishments cater for 16 guests visiting for business purposes for two days and who mainly reside permanently in Gauteng (50%). Both Rogerson (2005b) and Visser and Kotze (2005) demonstrated that this sector is predominantly white-owned and was established mainly over the past ten years. Establishment costs are in excess of R1 million. The staff profiles of these enterprises reflect a highly racialised division of labour more generally typical of the South African tourism system. Management positions are typically occupied by white men or women, with the lesser-skilled positions being filled by black women.

In contrast, the Bloemfontein hotel segment, although well established, has become a minor player (10 hotels) in tourist-accommodation provision. The upsurge in guest house development has resulted in few new hotels being built over the past 15 years. The hotel sector is nearly exclusively owned and managed by national hotel chains, such as Southern Sun and Protea Hotels. Staff complements are medium sized, generally numbering 40 full-time employees. More than 75% of employees are female. Staff profiles are skewed in terms of gender, with women in the lower positions and men in managerial posts. There is, however, greater balance in terms of the racial profile of the managerial staff. Typically, these establishments cater for 40-100 guests, who are visiting for business purposes for two days and who mainly reside permanently in Gauteng (70%) (Visser and Kotze, 2004).

The second largest tourism product category relates to the restaurant and bar sector. Of the 439 tourism product providers, 16.9% were restaurants and bars. It is important to remember that these establishments are complementary services and their core business is not directly linked to tourists. However, Visser and Kotze (2004) found that for restaurants located in the Waterfront, Westdene and Mimosa Mall areas, tourists, particularly in the form of weekend visitors, in fact formed critically important components of their patron profile. This is particularly the case as much of the tourist accommodation sector, i.e. guest houses, does not provide dinner or lunch services.

In addition, the survey yielded a vast array of conferencing venues. In most cases, the conference facilities form part of accommodation units such as guest houses, lodges and hotels. The largest conferencing venues are, however, not dedicated conferencing venues and include lecture hall and theatre facilities at the Central University of Technology and the University of the Free State, as well as the Civic and Sand du Plessis theatre complexes. As highlighted in Table 1, conferences in Bloemfontein have low levels of economic leakages out of the local economy and involve a vast array of different enterprise types benefiting the city.

---

\(^2\) This includes bed-and-breakfast establishments.
Figure 1  Spatial distribution of the Free State tourism product

Figure 2  The Bloemfontein tourism product
Table 1  An example of local economic benefits and linkages of a Bloemfontein conference (Source: Author Survey)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expense item</th>
<th>Cost (R)</th>
<th>Economic leakage level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direction banner and signs</td>
<td>5 037</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation and breakfast</td>
<td>62 939</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banquet entertainment</td>
<td>6 117</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photos</td>
<td>1 131</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honoraria speakers</td>
<td>66 850</td>
<td>Very high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venue hire and catering</td>
<td>259 768</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal function and entertainment</td>
<td>56 000</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouses programme</td>
<td>1 765</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design and printing costs</td>
<td>95 842</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening ceremony</td>
<td>10 000</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audiovisual expenses</td>
<td>59 232</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postage</td>
<td>4 130</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proofreading</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional fees: organiser</td>
<td>75 960</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prizes</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travelling costs</td>
<td>186 361</td>
<td>Very high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stationery</td>
<td>1 803</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone/fax/ e-mail</td>
<td>8 301</td>
<td>Very high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refunds</td>
<td>23 623</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIP excursion</td>
<td>22 352</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPD accreditation</td>
<td>1 700</td>
<td>Very high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshop expenses</td>
<td>7 324</td>
<td>Very low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total expenses</strong></td>
<td><strong>968 715</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Perhaps one of the most unlikely of tourism products in Bloemfontein relates to the ten key medical facilities in the city. Of the ten hospitals, five are state owned and five are privately held. The centrality of Bloemfontein, its larger size relative to all the urban centres of both the Free State and the Northern Cape, as well as the presence of the University of the Free State Medical School, has resulted in the development of a very significant number of large medical facilities relative to its size. Moreover, the province as a whole is poorly serviced.
with high-level hospitals. As a result, patient referral is very common and covers the whole Free State and parts of the Eastern and Northern Cape provinces.

Other tourism products are the 18 major annual events that take place in Bloemfontein. These events in the main relate to arts festivals and major sport tournaments that take place during the year. These events have considerable economic impact. In terms of arts festivals there is currently little research that has focused on the key arts festivals staged in Bloemfontein annually. Recent investigations by Strydom et al. (2006) and Visser (2005) outline the important economic impact one of these festivals – the Volksblad Kunstefees – has on Bloemfontein. Although this festival is considerably smaller than festivals such as KKNK in Oudtshoorn or the National Arts Festival in Grahamstown, it nevertheless does have a number of positive local economic impacts. The festival is widely supported by the local population, with only 30% of the attendees coming from outside Bloemfontein. Approximately 27 000 visitors attend the festival. On average, they attend for three days. During the festival period a range of different tourism products are used, ranging from tourist accommodation and food outlets and restaurants, to considerable amounts spent on shopping. The 2005 festival was calculated to have had a total economic impact of R18 million on the local economy of Bloemfontein.

In terms of sport events, research by the Centre for Development Support focused on the economic impact of soccer and rugby internationals in Bloemfontein. It was shown that the impact of rugby internationals was larger than for soccer equivalents. It was shown that a single rugby international drew more than 27 000 spectators from outside Bloemfontein. In fact, as many as 25% of these spectators came from other provinces. These visitors were generally men in their mid-30s who, on average, stayed two nights in Bloemfontein's various guest houses. These tourists' total expenditure, ranging from accommodation and restaurant meals to various forms of entertainment other than attending the sports event, came to nearly R49 million for a single international match.

One of the smallest yet most significant components of the Bloemfontein tourism economy relates to its cultural-historical tourism products. These include 21 museums of various sizes. The most important of these are the National Museum and the Anglo-Boer War Museum. Moreover, the city has some high-profile streetscapes that have considerable cultural-historical tourism value. However, the interview material revealed that in most cases these tourism products are mainly supported by educational institutions and local recreation seekers. Tourists are only a small percentage of the visitor base.

Figures 3a and 3b provide an overview of the spatial distribution of tourism product providers in Bloemfontein. It is clear that the distribution of tourism products is highly uneven. Unlike cities in Europe and North America, or Cape Town and Durban in the South African context, where tourism functions and services would typically be concentrated in the CBDs, this is not the case in Bloemfontein. In addition, it is evident that most tourism products are located in the former white residential neighbourhoods. The popularity of Westdene as a tourist accommodation location is directly linked to the fact that this area also represents the densest concentration of high-order businesses in Bloemfontein. It is also evident that
Westdene is the main location for bars and restaurants. The other main cluster, particularly in terms of tourist accommodation, is Universitas, which is a neighbourhood adjacent to the University of the Free State and the Universitas Hospital complex and which also includes the Netcare Hospital. In addition, conference facilities obtainable from guest houses and lodges in Universitas are utilised to host business- and medical-related conferences. Further markets for the accommodation sector are those of parents visiting students and attending graduation days, as well as academic guests of the two local universities.

A further point is that there is a spatial mismatch between the location of cultural-historical and sport tourism product providers and tourist accommodation. A large part of the cultural-historical fabric of Bloemfontein, and particularly its museum offerings, are located in the CBD, whilst there are very few and limited complementary services, such as bars, restaurants and tourist accommodation. On the other hand, Willows is the key location of Bloemfontein’s sport precinct, and includes soccer and rugby fields, cricket and hockey pitches, as well as tennis courts and an athletics oval.

5. OBSTACLES TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF TOURISM IN BLOEMFONTEIN

The preceding analysis highlighted issues concerning the Bloemfontein tourism product without reference to the views of tourism product providers themselves. The following sections provide a summary of the obstacles that certain tourism product provider segments are currently experiencing. The types of support these tourism product providers desire from both local and provincial government are also outlined.

A goal of this investigation was to record the various types of support that the various tourism product providers would like to receive from different spheres of government. By virtue of the different roles played by different levels of government with regard to different enterprises, it is to be expected that the various product providers will also require different types of support from provincial or local government. The interview material revealed a range of obstacles in terms of tourism product providers’ views on the future development of both their personal product offering and the Bloemfontein, and indeed Free State, tourism system more generally. Whilst the different sectors indicated decidedly different obstacles, it was clear that the marketing of the Free State generally, and of Bloemfontein in particular, is seen as totally inadequate by all product providers (Table 2). Moreover, echoing the concerns of Vrahimis and Visser (2006), the tourism product providers indicated that both the provincial and the local authorities play a key role in threatening the development of the Bloemfontein and the Free State tourism system on a variety of fronts, particularly owing to inaction in the delivery of key infrastructure and maintenance responsibilities.
Figure 3a Spatial distribution of the Bloemfontein tourism product in formerly white group areas
6. TYPES OF SUPPORT DESIRED BY TOURISM PRODUCT PROVIDERS

The survey set out to record the different types of support that the various tourism product providers seek from different spheres of government. It has to be pointed out that, by virtue of the different roles that different levels of government play with regard to different
enterprises, it is to be expected that they require different types of support from provincial or local government. Moreover, the provincial government does not necessarily have any jurisdiction or control over certain types of functions. Where support types were not the responsibility of the provincial or local government, they were nevertheless included, as the provincial or local government might either assist, or lobby, for such support. Tables 3 and 4 provide some examples of the types of support tourism product providers seek from the provincial government. It is clear that some of these demands are relatively simple. Generally, the marketing both of Bloemfontein and of the Free State province as a tourist destination is the most important issue.

7. **TOWARDS A TOURISM DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY**

States, provinces and local authorities pursue tourism because it can generate new money for their jurisdictions. Although people may travel to satisfy inner needs such as escape, rest, recreation, status or learning, destinations pursue tourism for the potential economic benefits derived (McKercher and Du Cros, 2002). The tourism industry enables tourists to consume experiences, but does not necessarily provide the experiences themselves. Indeed, only the merest fraction of the cost of a tour is spent at what can be called attractions; the rest is spent on transport, accommodation, food, drink, sightseeing and commissions to the travel trade. Yet it is these attractions that draw tourists to a region in the first place, enabling the rest of the benefits to accrue.

**Table 3** Example of the types of support required from Mangaung Municipality (Source: Author Survey)

| Accommodation sector | Marketing of the province and Bloemfontein as a tourist destination; Simplification of the rules controlling tourism accommodation development; Reduction of rates and taxes pertaining to guest houses; Clear road signage; and Cleanliness of the city. |
| Museums | Marketing of Bloemfontein museums in and outside of the Free State; Cleanliness of the areas around the museums; Better control and coordination of development around museums, with special reference to the areas in central Bloemfontein; and Clear and coordinated signage in Bloemfontein. |
| Tourism office | Improved communication between local government officials, administrative departments and tourism product providers; Funding for improved marketing of Bloemfontein; and Adequate cleansing services for the areas around the tourism office. |
The Free State does not constitute an important tourist destination region for either domestic or international tourists. The typical tourist in the Free State comes from within the province itself. Bloemfontein is the key focus of the Free State tourism system and, in the main, functions as a VFR destination. The secondary markets relate to business tourists who are mainly visitors from Gauteng, and visitors utilising medical facilities. It has been demonstrated that the tourism product base of the Bloemfontein tourism system has a very narrow focus and that the distribution of these products is highly concentrated in the formerly white group areas. On the whole the tourism product base is not focused on leisure tourists. That is not to say that Bloemfontein does not have a range of interesting cultural and historical attractions. The issue is that these tourism products do not constitute enough of a reason for travelling to this city for holiday purposes beyond that of visiting friends and relatives. There is, however, some scope for this city to develop a larger tourist attraction base, which could in time aid in supporting the diversification of the current tourism product base to include leisure tourists.

Table 4  Example of the types of support required from the Free State provincial government (Source: Author Survey)

| Conference market                      | Develop secure parking facilities close to the main conferencing venues; |
|                                      | Bring pressure to bear on Mangaung Municipality to clean and maintain areas around the main conferencing venues; |
|                                      | There remains a need for greater competition in the airline services to Bloemfontein. The airfares from all centres are extremely high; and |
|                                      | Bring pressure to bear on Mangaung Municipality to improve road signage and venue signage in Bloemfontein significantly. |

| Festival market                       | The provincial government must provide better marketing support for the two main cultural festivals in Bloemfontein. |

| Guest houses                          | Marketing support for Bloemfontein as a tourism destination is required. |

| Hotels                                 | Marketing of the Free State, and particularly of Bloemfontein, is seen as the primary way in which the provincial government can assist the hotel sector; and |
|                                       | Marketing of the province and Bloemfontein has to focus on addressing the negative view residents of other provinces have of the Free State and of Bloemfontein. |

| Museums                                | There is a need for marketing the main museums of Bloemfontein; |
|                                       | There is a need for more appropriately qualified staff; and |
|                                       | There is a need for capital investment in museums to properly maintain collections, as well as develop their displays further and there by enhance their tourism appeal. |
7.2 Develop the two main Bloemfontein cultural festivals into nationally significant events

Bloemfontein plays host to two important cultural festivals: Macufe and the Volksblad Kunstefees. Although both these festivals are relatively new, they have grown quickly in stature and, importantly, in public support. Currently these festivals, whilst contributing enormously to the cultural life of the city, do not generate significant income from beyond the city or, in fact, the region. The point must be that these festivals should be used to entice visitors from other provinces to travel to the Free State in significant numbers. Most productions currently staged are part of nation-wide performance circuits. Generally productions are premiered elsewhere, for example, often at the two main National Arts Festivals in Grahamstown and Oudtshoorn, and later brought to Macufe or the Volksblad Kunstefees. The organisers of these events should aim for productions that are premiered in Bloemfontein and will not be seen at the other festivals soon, or only take place at these festivals as “one-off” productions. This will, however, require very considerable resources, in that performers usually introduce new work to their “home audiences”, which would mean that most productions are premiered either in Cape Town or Johannesburg/Pretoria. Nevertheless, some performers can be enticed to do so, in which case arts patrons are “forced” to come to the province to view these productions.

Macufe has particular potential as it showcases performing artists from across the African continent. As such, this festival can be developed to fill a unique niche in the broader South African festivals landscape. The uniqueness of the festival, given appropriate marketing, can also facilitate attendance from beyond the Free State province and indeed provide a platform for enticing international visitors to Bloemfontein. An added benefit of attracting these tourists is that they are likely to visit the local museums, as well as at least part of the Free State. Larger attendance from outside the region can in turn facilitate better knowledge of Bloemfontein and might open opportunities for visits en route to, for example, coastal destinations.

7.3 Lobby for the hosting of large-scale sporting events

It was indicated that large-scale sporting events, particularly rugby, have a number of significant economic impacts. The Mangaung Municipality can play an active role in lobbying support for Bloemfontein hosting more high-level sporting tournaments. In this respect active local government support for hosting rugby and soccer internationals would be helpful in generating visitor flows to the city. Such support can be provided by providing financial assistance to the relevant sport federations towards preparing tenders and towards presentation and seed finance. However, there are numerous other sporting codes that, though they may be less visible or not as popular, still nevertheless do provide opportunities. Bloemfontein has a number of high-quality sports facilities for athletics, badminton, hockey, netball, karate and swimming. Collaborating with the various sporting codes’ administrations and facilitating the hosting of national and provincial level tournaments can generate a significant and temporally even flow of visitors to Bloemfontein throughout the year.
7.4 Develop a conference and meetings focus in Bloemfontein

Bloemfontein has much potential for exploiting its central location for regional and national conferences. Given the already significant number of well-established conferencing venues in Cape Town, Durban and Johannesburg keenly pursuing international conferences, meeting and exhibitions, it could be strategically prudent for Bloemfontein rather to focus on national conferences. In the first instance Bloemfontein has, in terms of cheaper forms of land transport, a locational advantage in being located in close proximity to most large urban areas in South Africa. In this respect one might say that its “equidistant” status in relation to other urban centres can be positively exploited. Moreover, the recent introduction of two low-cost airlines (1Time and Mango) to Bloemfontein has resulted in the city being easily accessible from most of South Africa’s main metropolitan areas. The city is now for the first time centrally located in terms of both land and air modes of transportation. Perhaps more importantly, Bloemfontein’s cost base for hosting national conferences is significantly lower than is the case with the large metropolitan complexes. Both conferencing venues and accommodation are far cheaper in Bloemfontein than in Cape Town, Durban or Johannesburg.

7.5 The conference market can stimulate leisure tourism opportunities

The fact that Bloemfontein’s population growth has been (and is projected to remain) relatively slow, and that the economy has been less buoyant than in many of the other urban areas in South Africa, mean that significant expansion of leisure tourism opportunities linked to resident recreation and leisure choices is limited. Conferences provide a “captive audience” and these visitors are likely to spend evenings or part of their days participating in some sort of leisure activity. A strategy would be to initially maximise the utilisation of the existing leisure- and tourism-related resources base. For example, these tourists can participate in short local tours of the city, if these are included in a conference package. These tours provide a platform for introducing the natural, cultural and historical attributes of Bloemfontein. Typically, this includes a game drive to any of the game farms or ranches located nearby. This short game drive can then be integrated with tours of the many museums in Bloemfontein and concluded with a visit to the theatre, or a sporting event and dinner at one of the many restaurants in the city. In this way the leisure base of the city can firstly be strengthened and, in time, enlarged.

7.6 Lesotho visitors are important to both the Free State and to Bloemfontein

Lesotho nationals constitute the largest single international visitor cohort to the Free State. It is a well-known fact that these visitors travel to South Africa, and in this case Bloemfontein, to purchase goods and for VFR purposes. Currently Johannesburg is the key shopping destination for these tourists. The Free State, and Bloemfontein as its commercial hub, could do much to stimulate the movement of these visitors by packaging a shopping trip that includes safe, reliable and cost-effective travel. Moreover, it should provide good, yet inexpensive and centrally located accommodation. Should Bloemfontein demonstrate to visitors from Lesotho that their customer support is taken seriously and is appreciated, they
will definitely visit more frequently. The combination of these shopping visits with healthcare and entertainment can significantly impact upon their decision to travel to Bloemfontein rather than Johannesburg.

### 7.7 Improve Bloemfontein marketing

As highlighted earlier, one of the greatest obstacles to tourism development in Bloemfontein relates to the very weak marketing strategies of the city outside the Free State. The marketing of the city was also one of the key forms of assistance that tourism product providers were seeking from both the local and the provincial government. Moreover, whilst marketing Bloemfontein is undoubtedly necessary, tourist demand-side analysis is required. It is of critical importance to know and understand what visitors think of Bloemfontein and what they find lacking. In knowing these views, entrepreneurs can develop new and more tailor-made tourism products.

### 7.8 Further avenues of investigation

Research into the urban African tourism system has been sparse, although within South African tourism scholarship the beginnings of a potential urban tourism discourse can be discerned, even though it is still at an early stage. This emerging body of research has largely focused on the large metropolitan complexes. Some work has been done on tourism development in small towns. The secondary cities of South Africa, however, have not received the same research attention. It was the aim of the paper to make a contribution towards addressing these limitations. The investigation profiled the Bloemfontein tourism product. It is clear that tourism development in this city is limited, that it is largely white owned, and that it is concentrated in former white group areas. There is currently virtually no tourism economy in any of the former township areas. Moreover, the current tourist cohorts visiting Bloemfontein are unlikely to provide much scope for developing these areas into feasible tourist destinations. Also, attention was focused on the obstacles tourism providers currently experience and the types of assistance they require from both local and provincial authorities. Against the backdrop of the empirical findings, the paper outlined a possible tourism development strategy for Bloemfontein. Some practical pointers as to how the tourism product of Bloemfontein might be expanded to enable the use of urban tourism as a developmental vehicle for the city were profiled.

The opportunities presented above are practical interventions that can impact positively upon the Bloemfontein tourism economy. Yet a number of issues that emerged require dedicated research attention. Of all the significant aspects that this research impressed upon the investigator, the most striking must surely be the severe paucity of available information on the Bloemfontein tourism system. Detailed empirical investigation into Bloemfontein’s tourism system is almost non-existent. Furthermore, not a single aspect of the Bloemfontein tourism system has critical and reflective secondary literature. The following provides some pointers to general lines of academic enquiry, and should significantly assist in providing useful, industry-relevant research for application in Bloemfontein and, indeed, in other secondary cities in South Africa.
One route of investigation would be to start with a systematic research programme in terms of which the tourism product providers are investigated on an in-depth basis. Here the aim would be to come to a detailed understanding of the inner workings of a particular sector or type of tourism product provider.

Research questions that could productively address this type of research would relate to questions concerning, for example, the guest-house and bed-and-breakfast sectors. Here more detail concerning the challenges these establishments are facing in the Bloemfontein tourism system and in the light of current tourist flows could be investigated. In this type of research it could also be potentially fruitful to come to deeper and more detailed insights into tourist types, such as the business and conference tourist sector in Bloemfontein.

Secondly, the racially and spatially untransformed nature of the Bloemfontein tourism system requires urgent attention. As seen in this investigation the Bloemfontein tourism product is almost exclusively white-owned and overwhelmingly based within the former white groups’ areas of the city. This type of research would focus on ascertaining the key impediments to entry to the tourism system of the current and potential black tourism entrepreneurs. Practical solutions to remedying this situation are critically important, should tourism in Bloemfontein aim to be more inclusive and empowering.

A third theme of research relates to the spatial distribution of tourism resources. Although not a strategy generally taken, ascertaining this might in fact be useful to come to an understanding of those areas that are highly unlikely to successfully deploy tourism expansion as an economic development strategy. In a resource-poor urban environment such as Bloemfontein, knowing both where and what not to invest in tourism expansion is as useful as knowing where one might fruitfully make such investments.

Fourthly, and already shown to be at issue in this investigation, is a detailed investigation into understanding the roles of local and provincial government regarding tourism promotion and development. These investigations should focus on how tourism is understood in public governance structures and on the means of addressing the shortcomings.

Finally, further research relevant to all the above themes of investigation would relate to clearly focused market research. In contrast to investigating the supply side of the tourism system, such research would aim to investigate actual and potential tourists’ understandings (the demand size) of leisure, business, etc. and how Bloemfontein can be positioned in relation to these segment-related desires.

REFERENCES


MARAIS, L. 2005. The economic impact of the soccer and rugby international in Bloemfontein, University of the Free State, Centre for Development Support, Bloemfontein.


SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE


Volksblad Arts Festival:
reflections on the product, people and impacts

1. INTRODUCTION

The staging of festivals has become a mechanism by which growing numbers of cities, towns and villages have come to market themselves to potential tourists with a view to generating new income (McKercher and Du Cros, 2002). Historically festivals were not initiated to act as income-generating events. However, as Law (2000) observes, the overwhelming majority of festivals currently staged (particularly those in the developed north) have income generation as one of the rationales for their presentation. In addition, other observers have suggested that festival tourism has become a key feature of many towns’ and cities’ tourism development strategies and now forms an integral part of their (re)development and/or economic development planning (Law, 1996; Rogerson, 2002; Van den Berg et al., 1995; Visser, 2005, 2006). Similarly, festivals and their links to urban tourism development are also starting to emerge as an important aspect of urban development thinking in South Africa (Turco et al., 2003). Notwithstanding festivals’ increased prominence, Visser (2005, 2006) has indicated that there appears to be very little by way of published research that might assist in understanding their occurrence, both in space and over time, or the purpose for which these festivals have been introduced, or what their impact on host communities might be. Indeed, echoing an international trend, South African festival tourism has not received much research attention (O’Sullivan and Jackson, 2002).

The small amount of research literature focused on South African festival tourism is in the main concerned with the three large-scale national arts festivals hosted in Grahamstown, Oudtshoorn and Potchefstroom (cf. Van Zyl, 2005). Little research attention has been given to smaller, but nevertheless still significant, arts festivals such as those hosted in secondary cities such as Bloemfontein. Indeed, the current body of academic research has largely failed to investigate arts festivals in South African cities generally (as opposed to towns), this arguably being because of arts festivals’ relatively smaller impact on larger urban economies. Moreover, as Strydom et al. (2006: 3) observe, rural areas like the Free State (and Bloemfontein) have few resources to utilise for development purposes. Indeed, Strydom (1993) indicated in the early 1990s that the Free State province was in need of a fast-growing industry like tourism to enhance economic growth, as it was too dependent on the declining mining and agricultural sectors. This situation did not change over the ensuing years and the same need was recently expressed by Visser and Kotze (2006). However, because the Free State, and Bloemfontein in particular, cannot be regarded as traditional tourist end destinations, alternative ways of tourism development, such as events or festival tourism need to be considered as a generator of tourism and economic growth for the region. Against this backdrop, the chapter provides new
empirical data focusing on how the Volksblad Kunstefees developed, who the festival-goers are, why they attend this particular festival and how they spend their money.

These objectives are addressed in four sections. The first section provides a brief overview of the international literature focused on festival tourism in urban areas. Here it is argued that, despite the magnitude of festival tourism, it remains a neglected area of investigation, and as a consequence our understanding of its various impacts on the urban form is limited. The second section provides an abridged overview of investigations into festival tourism in the South African context. It is suggested that the available body of research in this regard is extremely limited and also highly uneven in terms of the number and types of festivals focused upon. The third section provides a brief outline of the methodology followed in this investigation. Thereafter, the fourth section focuses on one of the Free State’s key arts festivals - the Volksblad Kunstefees. The final section provides a discussion of the main findings of the investigation.

2. FESTIVAL TOURISM AT THE GLOBAL LEVEL: A BRIEF OVERVIEW

The dramatic increase in the number of festivals staged annually has not been reflected in the research literature on the subject (Getz and Frisby, 1988: 22; O’Sullivan and Jackson, 2002: 326). Nevertheless, in this relatively small body of work festival tourism – which refers to a phenomenon in terms of which people from outside a festival locale visit during “a festival period” (O’Sullivan and Jackson, 2002: 325) – has emerged as an identifiable research focus. Ritchie (1984: 2) observes that festival tourism is linked to “events of limited duration developed primarily to enhance the awareness, appeal and profitability of a tourist destination”. Festival tourism encompasses a range of activities (Shaw and Williams, 2002: 26) and includes special events tourism and festivals of any size or organisational persuasion; a consequence of this is that festival tourism is a complex topic of study (O’Sullivan and Jackson, 2002: 326). The current literature agrees that festival tourism – like all types of tourism – is pursued by organisations and institutions in all manner of localities, because of the opportunities it provides for community development and environmental enhancement, in addition to the more obvious benefits of income generation (Shaw and Williams, 2002: 265). More specifically, festivals are understood to contribute towards place marketing; to extend tourist seasons (or create them); to generate revenue for different levels of government; and generally to have a positive impact on the local economy by generating incomes, supporting existing businesses and encouraging new small, medium and micro-enterprise development (cf. Thomas, 2004). Urban tourism researchers have been particularly interested in the large-scale events and festivals viewed through the lens of place marketing as a strategy within a broader entrepreneurial city framework which has become a near-obligatory planning aspect for the post-industrial urban economies of the North. Although it is generally assumed that festival tourism generates income, its true economic, social and cultural impacts on localities are complex and, surprisingly, not well understood (Shaw and Williams, 2002: 267).
Notwithstanding a general dearth of festival tourism research, some general indications of how festivals impact upon host locations can be identified. It has been found that the economic and social impacts of festivals are unevenly distributed through urban communities and can sometimes amount to very limited positive input (Mitchell and Wall, 1986). The literature suggests that smaller festivals generally produce the greatest economic benefits. However, as festivals became more established, the economic impact became relatively less significant (Snowball and Antrobus, 2001). Notwithstanding this, investigations have found that because of economic leakages out of local economies, festivals in smaller urban centres are more pronounced than in larger towns and small cities (Snowball and Antrobus, 2001).

The impacts of festival tourism, however, are not always so self-evident. The influx of tourists can result in a change in community infrastructure investment to serve the needs of festival visitors. Moreover, as festivals grow and begin to establish stronger links outside the locality, local entrepreneurs may become resentful and the economic benefits of the festival may become less significant (O’Sullivan and Jackson, 2002: 326-327). Issues surrounding who the beneficiaries of festival tourism are have also been investigated. Current investigations point out that generally the economic benefits are most significant for product providers and facility owners, and not for the ordinary citizen. Indeed, a number of studies suggest that the general population of urban centres hosting festivals seldom derives any sustainable employment opportunities from festival tourism (Janniskee and Drews, 1998). Other criticism relates to the development of tourist enclaves diverting the attention of visitors away from other parts of a city or town (Judd, 1999). Further issues of concern include the spatial concentration of festival-related economic opportunities in particular parts of cities. For example, festivals often occur far away from the residential neighbourhoods of those who need employment opportunities most (Judd, 1999). Moreover, questions have been asked about the quality of festival tourism-related employment (Shaw and Williams, 2002: 270).

O’Sullivan and Jackson (2002: 327) contend that the benefits of festival tourism in the urban context are not confined to the economic impact alone. Social impacts often also come into play. In their view festival tourism can contribute to increased organisational activity in a locality, bringing about improved leadership; positive impacts on local accountability; stimulation of better public-private co-operation; and the investment of profits back into the community. In addition, it has been argued that, particularly for smaller urban centres, the development of a festival is not solely about income generation; it also entails the celebration of community and the cultivation of place awareness, which will hopefully generate future tourist flows (Janniskee and Drews, 1998; Falassi, 1987).

Finally, beyond these social impacts, although still underpinned by a certain economic rationale, festival tourism can also lead to environmental improvements in festival locations (Janniskee, 1996). Indeed, the link between tourism in general and environmental preservation and conservation has long been recognised (Mathieson and Wall, 1982). Similarly, the role of festivals in relation to the urban environment has been acknowledged (O’Sullivan and Jackson, 2002: 328). Janniskee (1996: 395), for example, points out that in the run-up to festival time, residents and business owners become involved in activities to
make the locality more presentable. Furthermore, it is argued that as a festival becomes more established, there is increased motivation and available funding for community improvement projects such as redeveloping down-town areas, preserving and restoring historic buildings, renovating old theatres, constructing parks and community centres, planting trees, paving streets and installing holiday decorations (Gahr, 2004; Janniskee, 1996: 395).

3. FESTIVAL TOURISM IN SOUTH AFRICA: A CONCISE OVERVIEW

The contours of these international festival and festival tourism debates are as yet only vaguely observable in South African festival and festival tourism scholarship. Figures 1 to 3 provides a visual summary of multi-day (events staged over two or more days) festivals in South Africa (see Visser (2005) for an in-depth discussion of the spatio-temporal dimensions and the different types of festivals staged in South Africa). It is clear that these festivals are unevenly distributed both in time and over space. Moreover, it is clear that arts festivals in fact account for only a fraction of all festivals. Despite the vast number (211) of festivals, the different festival types, as well as times during which festivals are staged in South Africa, little has been known until recently about these events (Visser, 2005). It has been suggested that the research focused on festival tourism in South Africa deals with two specific festivals genres which are generally located in two very different types of spatial settings. In the first instance there are investigations that deal with festivals in the large metropolitan areas (cf. Du Plessis, 2002; Macufe, 2004; Martin, 2000; Pollack, 2004; Van Oerle, 2004). This type of research tends to be generated by consultancy firms or local authorities. The focus of the research is mainly on existing festivals and their impacts within the jurisdictional area of a particular local authority, or alternatively on the impact of festivals that are supported and developed by local authorities. These investigations are largely geared towards monitoring the actual economic impacts of particular festivals, not least those focused on the performing arts (Department of Economic Development and Tourism, 2003). The second strand of South African festival tourism research which tends to be the product of academic research relates to festivals that are not linked to local government development interventions; neither are they conceived as vehicles for local economic development, nor as a place-marketing strategy, nor with a view to their inclusion in urban tourism development strategies, but rather for language and cultural promotion – again the key focus placed on the performing arts.

Several further observations may be made about South African festival scholarship.

Firstly, following the international experience the bulk of these investigations focus on festivals in smaller urban areas (cf. Snowball and Antrobus, 2001, 2002; Tassiopoulos and Haydam, 2003; Wittepski, 2002), because their impact tends to be more significant than in larger urban centres (Snowball and Antrobus, 2001, 2002). In the South African context many festivals developed historically for reasons other than place marketing, or the need for an urban tourism development strategy; they include some of the largest of the local annual
festivals, as well as being the key focus of the limited available academic and consultancy research.

Secondly, the research attention devoted to festivals in South Africa is very specific in terms of the size of the urban settlements in which festivals take place. On the whole the investigatory focus has been on smaller urban settlements such as Grahamstown (National Arts Festival), Potchefstroom (Aardklop) and Oudtshoorn (KKNK) (Snowball, 2001; Snowball and Antrobus, 2001, 2002; Snowball and Willis, 2006; Van Zyl, 2005).

Thirdly, in nearly all cases the research question is concerned with the economic impact of these festivals and the profiling of festival visitors (Nuntsu, Haydam and Tassiopoulous, 2003; Snowball and Willis, 2006; Van Zyl, 2005).

Fourthly, the accurate measurement of the value of the arts to society is becoming increasingly important in a context where the arts must compete with housing, health, education and the like for public funds and corporate sponsorships (Snowball and Willis, 2006). Hence, motivation for the public funding of arts events such as the National Arts Festival in Grahamstown, for example, has become critical (Snowball and Antrobus, 2001).

Finally, investigations into the spatial and temporal distribution, as well as South Africa’s festival types, have been undertaken (Visser, 2005, 2006).

The present study follows on from these studies in terms of the focus on economic impacts and ascertaining who the visitor types at the festivals are. The secondary city context of Bloemfontein, as opposed to large towns, provides a new spatial context in which South African festival and festival tourism is analysed.

4. BRIEF METHODOLOGICAL NOTES

The investigation draws upon survey data collected at the 2005 Volksblad Kunstfees. The questionnaires were administered by the interviewer and the “recall method” was used, which included respondents outlining their spending patterns during the festival. The target population consisted of visitors to the Volksblad Kunstfees during the five days of the festival. A destination-based survey was undertaken, with interviews held during the event. Different sites were chosen to limit response bias towards a certain group of festival-goers. Questionnaires consisting of both open and closed-ended questions were administered. The questionnaire included questions on age, occupation, reasons for visiting the festival, the types of productions they attended and the general spending patterns.

The respondents were chosen randomly and the survey was conducted over the duration of the festival in order to ensure that the sample was representative of festival-goers. The total number of festival visitors is difficult to estimate. Drawing on motor vehicle exit polls, the organisers have estimated festival visitor numbers to be in the region of 40 000 (Briers, 2005). Against this backdrop, it was decided that at least 400, or a one percent sample, would be drawn randomly. Five hundred questionnaires were administered, of which a total of 415 were usable. The survey material was augmented with in-depth interviews with
information-rich informants. These participants included the Chief Festival Organiser at the time, Mrs Doks Briers, the Free State Provincial Government representative of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (Mr Angus Peterson), as well as telephone interviews with a number of local government officials.
Figure 2  Temporal distribution of festivals in South Africa
5. **THE VOLKSBAD KUNSTEFIES**

Bloemfontein, like other South African cities, hosts a number of annual events (see Figure 3). One of the five main events is a large-scale, multi-day performing arts festival – the Volksblad Kunstefees. The Volksblad Kunstefees was established in 2001 in the city of Bloemfontein, which is home to approximately 480,000 inhabitants (of which 350,000 are black and mainly SeSotho speaking, 90,000 are white and mainly Afrikaans speaking, 30,000 are Coloured and mainly Afrikaans speaking, and 5,000 Asian and English speaking). Mayfield and Crompton (1995) argue that there are eight generic reasons for staging festivals, including recreation/socialisation, culture/education, tourism, internal revenue generation, natural resources, agriculture, external revenue generation and community pride/spirit. Similarly to the large arts festivals in the country (Aardklop, Grahamstown and KKNK), the

---

1 The other festivals are the Mangaung Cultural Festival (MACUFE), the Vuka Jazz Festival, Rose Festival, Bloem Show and the Bloemfontein Food and Wine Festival.
key motivation for establishing the Volksblad festival (as is the case of the other major arts festivals) was related to culture/education – in this case with a view to promoting Afrikaans performing arts among audiences in central South Africa, most notably the Free State province (Briers, 2005). In the main the festival represents a response to the demise of the former (apartheid government-funded) regional performing arts councils during the first half of the 1990s, which led to a substantial decrease in the number of Afrikaans-based productions being staged in places such as Bloemfontein. The festival thus provides an opportunity to view a large number of contemporary Afrikaans-language productions which would usually not be staged in the Free State generally, and in Bloemfontein in particular. In the main this festival is what Dawson (1991) refers to as a “mono-ethnic festival”, with its key meaning system comprising a “cultural text” of lived ethnicity (which is mainly the different white, Afrikaans identities). As is the case at a large proportion of festivals elsewhere (Getz, 1993), the festival-producing organisation is a non-profit concern and is heavily reliant upon sponsorship (cf. Cicora, 1991; Decker, 1991).

Table 1 Key indicators of the Volksblad Arts Festival (2001-2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of tickets</th>
<th>Growth (%)</th>
<th>Number of productions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>6007</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>14 914</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>22 607</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>24 354</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>27 671</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Type of production (2005) | Number of performances
--------------------------|--------------------------
Dance                     | 2                        
Drama                     | 48                       
Children’s Theatre        | 14                       
Music (Classical)         | 11                       
Music (Popular)           | 56                       
Music Theatre             | 6                        
Poetry                    | 3                        
Talks                     | 13                       

Source: Briers (2005)

The festival developed from very modest beginnings, hosting 30 productions over a three-day period and selling only 6007 tickets in 2001 (Table 1). During the early stages of its establishment, visitor numbers could not be estimated. Following renewed support from the
University of the Free State, which provides the main performance venues for the festival (free of charge), and the Free State Performing Arts Council (which provides the Sand du Plessis theatre complex facilities gratis), in addition to sponsorship from private sector companies such as the Media24 group (the publisher of most Afrikaans-language newspapers and lifestyle magazines), the festival started to gain momentum as from 2003. In that year the festival hosted no fewer than 53 productions and over 22 000 tickets were sold. Although the mix of production types varies from year to year, there is a marked emphasis on music productions that appeal to students as well as young adult audiences (see Table 1). On the other end of the genre spectrum a range of classical music productions have been introduced over the past two years to appeal to more sophisticated and mature audiences (Briers, 2005).

Currently the festival is presented over a five-day period, staging 60 productions. Ticket sales have escalated beyond the 27 000 mark and for the first time visitor estimates have been established at around 40 000 festival-goers (Briers, 2005). When compared with festivals such as the Grahamstown festival (supporting 494 productions and attracting 131 900 visitors), the KKNK (140 000 visitors) or Aardklop (180 000 visitors), this festival is relatively small (Nieman, 2003). Notwithstanding the relatively modest visitor numbers, the festival organiser nevertheless reports that the festival is, in terms of ticket sales, the fourth largest of the key arts festival in South Africa, following after the KKNK, the Grahamstown National Arts Festival and Aardklop (Briers, 2005). In addition, the event is growing in stature among performing artists. Two important factors have contributed to this increased support. Firstly, unlike the main arts festivals (those in Grahamstown, Potchefstroom and Oudtshoorn), the Volksblad festival is the only festival that stages all its productions in venues specifically designed for music and drama performances. This obviously greatly assists performers in presenting their productions professionally. Secondly, performers enter into contracts with the festival organisers that significantly reduce their exposure to financial risk (see Box 1). These factors combined bode well for the potential quality, and hence status, of performing artists at the Volksblad Kunstefees in future.

The general demographic profile for festival visitors to the Volksblad Kunstefees is in large part similar to that found at the large-scale festivals such as Aardklop and KKNK (cf. Saayman and Saayman, 2007), although different to those supporting the English-oriented Grahamstown Festival (cf. Snowball, 2001). Festival goers at the Volksblad Kunstefees are gender-balanced (females 46%; males 54%). As the festival is an Afrikaans language and culture festival, it is not surprising that 85 percent of the survey participants’ home language is Afrikaans and that these festival-goers are predominantly white (76%). Similar to the other

---

2 The smaller number of festival-goers can be explained in a number of ways. Firstly, the festival was established more recently. Secondly, it has less sponsorship, which is a reflection of both the fact that the resident Afrikaans population of Bloemfontein is not large compared to other Afrikaans festival locations, and Bloemfontein is not located either close to key holiday destinations favoured by Afrikaans speakers, such as is the case with KKNK, or a large concentration of Afrikaans speakers, as the case of Aardklop.
main art festivals in South Africa, festival-goers are young (49% of the survey participants are under the age of 26 years). A contributing factor in this respect is that the festival is hosted on the university campus during the weekend immediately prior to the commencement of the University of the Free State’s second semester, when students have already started to return to the campus. The age profile correlates with the fact that nearly half the festival goers are students (43%). This in turn explains the relatively low average monthly income of less than R1 000. On the other hand, the second most important festival visitor cohort surveyed relates to a range of professions (36%), for example, teachers, accountants, medical practitioners and lawyers. On the whole the visitor profile in terms of age, employment types, and race strongly correlates with that of the other Afrikaans arts festivals in South Africa (Table 2) (cf. Van Zyl, 2005).

**Box 1** The remuneration structure of the Volksblad Kunstefees

The income stream of the artists performing at the Festival is structured in three different ways.

a. The selection panel chooses artists or productions that they would like to have at the Festival. These productions are either critically acclaimed, or the artists in the production are known attractions. In this case the Festival committee invites the artists and pays a sum to the artists agreed in advance.

b. The selection committee goes through the application listings for productions/artists and selects artists who, although they were not initially considered by the committee, are either critically acclaimed, or who are known attractions in specific productions. In such cases the Festival committee invites the artists and pays them a sum that has been previously agreed on.

c. The selection committee goes through the application listings for productions/artists and selects candidates. In this case the production is wholly dependent upon earnings arising from ticket-sales. 70% of the proceeds from the door sales go to the artists and 30% to the Festival funds.

The festival-goers are well acquainted with arts festivals generally (81%) and the Volksblad festival in particular. No fewer than 63 per cent of the survey group had attended this particular festival previously. In terms of first-time visitation differences among the four different race communities were recorded. In the case of white respondents only 30 per cent were first-time visitors. Among the coloured (43.9%) and black (46.8%) survey participants first-time visitation was higher, and particularly so for the small number of Asian festival-goers. There is a very high incidence of repeat visitation (63% for all race groups, 70% for whites, who comprise the main focus of this particular festival). A response that augurs well for the future of the festival is that overall 83.7 per cent of the survey group indicated that they would like to attend the festival in the following year. It is anticipated that black and

---

3 The relatively high level of black survey participants (whose home language in this case would mainly be SeSotho) is linked to the fact that the festival is held immediately prior to the start of the new academic term, as well as the fact that the student profile of the university is more than 50% black. Consequently, it is not surprising that a relatively high proportion of survey participants is black.
coloured participation in the festival will increase in future, transforming the festival from what was a almost exclusively white Afrikaans festival to one that is racial and linguistically more diverse.

Table 2 Demographic characteristics of Volksblad Arts Festival festival-goers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Female 46%</th>
<th>Male 54%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>&lt;19 19%</td>
<td>19-25 30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>Asian 5%</td>
<td>Black 9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Income</td>
<td>&lt;R1 000 25%</td>
<td>R1 001-R3 000 22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td>Student 43%</td>
<td>Professions 33%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The main reason for such change relates to a deliberate effort on the part of the festival organisers to stage more productions that would have a “cross-over” audience and multi-racial appeal. Currently, this effort at multi-racial allure is reported by the festival organisers to be the result of introducing a larger jazz component, in addition to including a leading international performing artist component, particularly with regard to the popular music productions to the festival programme. In this regard two key themes emerged to explain the desire for greater racial and linguistic inclusively. Although a festival of this nature ostensibly celebrates culture/language, this is only possible through the maintenance and increase in visitor numbers, linked to sponsorship. Within the South African context increasing numbers of corporate sponsors insist on greater diversity in the racial composition of the festival-goers and, indeed, performers. However, broadening the language base of the festival with a view to more diverse racial visitor participation might require a re-thinking of the key purpose of the festival in the future, as the promotion of Afrikaans performing arts could potentially then become diluted (which might in turn lead to negative responses from the Afrikaans community).

Art festivals are often staged as a place-marketing tool. However, this was not the reason for founding this festival. Considering that the vast majority of the festival-goers are local residents, or well acquainted with the city, it is not surprising that the staging of the festival had little impact on how the respondents experienced the host city of Bloemfontein. Nevertheless, of the 40 percent of the respondents who did indicate that the festival had had an impact on their experience of the city, half (49%) indicated that the festival made the city
“feel more alive, with more to do”, or that the festival made them see a different side to Bloemfontein and enhanced the feeling of the city as a place of very friendly people (20%).

Whilst the organisers of arts festivals might have a range of economic or non-economic reasons for staging such events, a different range of issues is at play for those individuals attending arts festivals. Crompton and McKay (1997) identified a number of motivation domains for festival attendance. In the case of the Volksblad festival, “known group socialization” was of central importance (40%). Visiting family/friends and consolidating these bonds (11%) also played a role in the motivation for attending the festival. These findings resonate with Formica and Murmann’s (1998) conclusion that family groups attend festivals to consolidate family togetherness, while friendship groups emphasise socialisation and group togetherness. This “socialisation” function, as opposed to, for example, cultural exploration, is reflected both in the group composition of the festival visitors and in the number of performances that the survey group attended. Indeed, in terms of the former attendance motivator, most of the survey group attended the festival with friends (40%), family (27%), or their partners (20%). Closer examination of the data reveals that those festival-goers in the lowest income categories where more likely to attend the festival with friends (40.1%; 26.4% attend with family) and the highest cohort attend mostly with family (70.3%). This trend is explained by the correlation between age, income and life-cycle stage.

Whilst attending an arts festival implicitly suggests attending a number of productions or exhibitions, it was established that over the five-day period most festival visitors (78%) attended fewer than four productions. In view of this finding, it is not surprising that the festival-goers spent on average no more than R127 on tickets. The average ticket price is R60, although prices range from as little as R10 to as much as R140. Given that the largest cohort of the sample spent R127 on tickets and generally did not attend more than two performances, this aggregate seems plausible. The conference organiser reported that the total income from ticket sales was R1 660 260 (Briers, 2005). Closer scrutiny of the data reveals a number of relationships between number of tickets sold, income-level cohort, gender and race. There was a direct relationship between income levels and money spent on tickets. For example, those in the lowest income category (<R1000) – and mainly representing students – spent R40 on average on concert tickets. On the other hand, those earning more than R12 000 a month spent on average R200 on tickets. Differences also emerged in terms of gender. Both genders are by and large attracted to the popular music productions (68%), although men (75%) more so than women (62%). Gendered differences were also observed in terms of drama; female festival-goers (26%) attending these production more readily. In terms of the number of performances attended during the festival period, small differences emerged with the black and coloured survey participants attending slightly fewer productions than Asian and White festival-goers. These differences are directly linked to differences in the income levels between these race cohorts.

Unlike festival-goers attending the other key Afrikaans language festivals, particularly KKNK where considerable inter-provincial travel occurs (see Van Zyl, 2005), the overwhelming majority of the festival-goers are from the Free State (73%); in fact, as many as 64 percent
are from Bloemfontein itself. Consequently, this festival does not induce “festival tourists” in any large numbers. It was established that of the 36 percent of the festival-goers who travelled to Bloemfontein to attend the festival, the majority (44%) stayed for the length of the festival, most (56%) being accommodated by family or friends. The remainder of these festival tourists supported formal tourist accommodation establishments such as guest houses (14%), hotels (14%) and bed-and-breakfast establishments (8%). Not surprisingly, then, tourist accommodation service providers indicated that the festival only had a marginal impact on occupancy levels. On average these festival “tourists” spent R275 per night on accommodation during the festival period (averaging just above R500 during their visit to the festival), and R140 to get to Bloemfontein from their permanent place of residence. Internal to the cohort that used tourist accommodation, major differences do occur in terms of whether or not a festival tourist was from elsewhere in South Africa or abroad. The handful of international festival tourists who participated in the survey, for example, spent over R1500 on accommodation during their stay at the festival. Overwhelmingly, the festival-goers are well acquainted with Bloemfontein, with only six percent of the survey group comprising first-time visitors to the city. It has to be stated, though, that it was evident that many of the festival tourists combined festival attendance with a range of other activities. Business arrangements, shopping, visiting friends and relatives, or returning a child to either one of the many boarding schools in Bloemfontein or the two universities was often part of their visit to the festival. It would appear that the festival enhances (rather than motivates) a trip they probably would have undertaken irrespective of the staging of the festival. The main difference is that they now spend more time in Bloemfontein, as the festival provides additional activities in which to engage.

Although the economic impact of the festival visitors from outside Bloemfontein is limited in terms of accommodation, their spending on a range of items is nevertheless higher than for resident Bloemfontein festival-goers. The following are a few examples. Whilst locals spend just over R100 on tickets, those from rest of the province spend on average R160, whilst those from other provinces spent R180 and visitors from outside of South Africa nearly R200. Key differences are also observed in terms of festival tourists and expenditure on food and drinks at the festival location. Bloemfontein-based festival-goers spent approximately R95, whilst those from elsewhere in the province spent just over R130 on such items. Similarly differences emerged between amounts spent on shopping: R120-R130 for Bloemfontein-based festival-goers, and R300 or more for visitors from other provinces or abroad. The same is the case for expenditure on restaurant meals (R70 for Bloemfontein-based festival-goers, R250 for visitors from outside the Free State, and R350 for those from other countries). Again those festival-goers from outside the province, and particularly those from outside South Africa, spend significantly more. On the whole, these findings support those made by Saayman and Saayman (2007) in the context of the KKNK that positive relationships are

---

4 It might be prudent to note that analysis of the overall dataset did not reveal major differences between the festival tourists and local festival visitors on a range of fronts. However, with a larger data base this claim might require modification.
found between region of origin (e.g. outside the host location or region) and money spent at the festival.

Interest in (arts) festivals, beyond their intrinsic value as vehicles for cultural engagement, relates to the economic activity that they induce. There are a number of income streams to a festival such as the Volksblad Kunstefees, including direct ticket sales (which has already been discussed), sponsorship (much of which is in kind service delivery); stall owners selling arts-and-crafts items; food and beverage providers; and entertainers. As there is a host of different service providers who facilitate the staging of the festival, it is not possible to speculate on the total income generated from the festival. In addition, neither the organisers nor the service providers were willing to divulge their financial contributions or incomes. In the main this “secrecy” has to do with the fact that all costs are open to negotiation, depending on the type of relationship between performers, organisers and support service providers. Services are often provided on a “barter” basis. The only income stream that can be relatively accurately estimated is the income derived from ticket sales. This income is set at R1 660 260 (Briers, 2005).

Whilst the modest income is certainly welcomed by the performing artists, it has to be kept in mind that these funds in fact represent a loss to Bloemfontein and the Free State. With very few exceptions, the performers are not based in the region, but mostly in Gauteng, and to a lesser extent in the Western Cape Province. As the festival (along with the festival trusts) is mainly supported by visitors from Bloemfontein and the Free State Province, this means that there is an outflow of capital from the region. A further income stream may be connected to the various stalls that provide products ranging from arts and crafts (n=285), to food and beverages (n=65). Although the turnover of these enterprises is unknown, we do know that 85 percent of them are based in the Free State (Tables 3 and 4). In this case leakages out of the province are fewer, as only 15 percent of the stall owners come from outside the province. Collectively, when the incomes of stall owners, ticket-sales, tourist accommodation, etc., are considered, the total “income” of the festival is estimated at R18 million (Strydom et al., 2005). In the main the impact of the festival relates to the circulation of capital, not the inflow of “new money” into Bloemfontein, or the Free State province as a whole. Generally, the main economic impact of the festival would appear to be the diversification of the local economic base and the way local residents see and experience Bloemfontein as a place to live in.

Table 3  Place of origin of arts and crafts stall exhibitors at the Volksblad Arts Festival (2001-2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place of Origin</th>
<th>Bloemfontein and the Free State</th>
<th>Gauteng</th>
<th>Rest of South Africa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total number of arts and crafts exhibitors = 285
Source: Rall (2005)
6. CONCLUSIONS

Despite limited research attention, a small research literature focused on South African festival tourism is starting to emerge. These investigations are in the main concerned with the key, large-scale national arts festivals such as those hosted in Grahamstown, Oudtshoorn and Potchefstroom. Perhaps as a function of the fledgling nature of festival and festival tourism research in South Africa, smaller but nevertheless still significant arts festivals such as those hosted in secondary cities like Bloemfontein remain unexplored. The objective of this chapter was to provide the first academic reflections on the development of the Volksblad Kunstefees. In particular, it provided an insight into who the particular festival supporters are; why they attend the particular festival, and what their spending patterns were.

The Volksblad Kunstefees, like its main equivalents elsewhere in South Africa, was not developed with place-marketing, or income generation for the local authority, in mind. It was shown that the festival has developed significantly since its inception six years ago and is reported now to be the fourth largest of the key annual multi-day arts festivals held in South Africa. In many respects the festival is no different from others held in the country. It draws a young group of festival-goers, with relatively small individual budgets. It was shown that the festival does not stimulate any significant tourist flows to Bloemfontein as the festival-goers are primarily Bloemfontein residents. Nevertheless, echoing findings from elsewhere, those festival patrons – both local or attending from outside Bloemfontein – spent significant amounts on food and beverages at the main festival location, in addition of supporting bars, restaurants and other facilities. In this respect, then, there is a positive impact on existing small and medium businesses, although it is unclear whether or not the festival enables small enterprise development. In terms of the all festival-goers, whether local residents or festival tourists, the economic impact of the festival is significant, relatively speaking, generating R18 million in economic activity. Beyond the economic impact of the festival, non-economic impacts are also associated with the festival. In the main the festival provided an opportunity for local residents to socialise, and to maintain and further development family and friendship ties. The festival also aided the re-imaging of Bloemfontein, and/or re-enforced the idea that the city held a number of opportunities and “had more to do”, which is not always remembered by either its visitors or residents.
7. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks are due to Chris Rogerson for initiating interest in festival tourism, Gijsbert Hoogendoorn for extensive commentary on an earlier version of the paper, and to Wendy Job of the Cartographic Unit at the University of the Witwatersrand for the preparation of the maps.

REFERENCES

GAHR, H.S. 2004. Attitudes of residents and tourists towards the use of urban historic sites for festival events, Event Management, 8, 231-242.
LAW, C.M. 2000. Regenerating the city centre through leisure and tourism, Built Environment, 26, 117-129.


STRYDOM, A.J. 1993. ’n Strategiese plan vir die effektiewe benutting van die toerismepotensiaal van die Oranje-Vrystaat, Inistituut vir Sosiale en Ekonomiese Navorsing, Universiteit van die Vrystaat.


Transforming Christian churches into community-based resource centres, with reference to Bloemfontein

1. INTRODUCTION

The cities and towns in South Africa have reflected a paradox over the last 15 years. On the one hand, tremendous progress has been made towards improving the general living environment of the black people in the ‘townships’ by means of housing, infrastructural and commercial development, and access to improved education, health, recreational and public facilities. However, on the other hand, cities and towns are experiencing increased stress as a result of poverty, unemployment, HIV/Aids, moral decay, crime, violence, lawlessness, street people and illegal immigrants, mainly from other African countries. Local municipalities are battling to cope with these challenges and it seems that the battle in the urban areas for a fair and just political dispensation in the late 1970s and 1980s has been replaced by daily socio-economic and class struggles.

Post-1994 local government legislation has paved the way for developmental local government and developmental governance, which has a strong bearing on involving civil society in empowering and transforming communities towards achieving an improved quality of life. As we are still a young democracy, the participation of civil society at local government level is in an embryonic stage and needs to be developed to its full potential. It has been stated that the Christian church is the most representative institution or non-governmental organisation (NGO) in civil society in South Africa, as 79% of all citizens in this country indicated their affiliation to the Christian faith during the 2001 national population census (Hendriks, 2004). The church, like other religious bodies such as synagogues, mosques and temples, has a definite role to play in establishing a culture of corporate citizenship.

It was recently found that an urban renaissance is sweeping through American cities thanks to the collaborative community improvement initiatives by development-oriented, faith-based organisations (FBO) involved in a variety of programmes, e.g. skills training, adult literacy, job placement, entrepreneurial business ventures, housing, health and HIV/Aids care, women and girls at risk, youth development, crèches and day care, and spiritual needs. Current debates in the United States (USA) and the United Kingdom (UK) suggest that FBOs, as idea and value institutions, are better positioned than the state to address urban poverty and to facilitate a grassroots process of hope, reconciliation and civil order (Vidal, 2001; Winkler, 2006). According to Owen (2004: 139), “Multiplicity of faith traditions potentially can speak to almost every type of individual in need, whereas

---

1 FBOs refer to any religious body which can be institutions (e.g. congregations), denominational organisations and networks, and independent para-church/synagogue/mosque/temple service agencies.
the services of government agencies and many secular non-profits cannot”. Thomas (2006: 93) agrees, as she states “the lives of many urban residents are too complicated to be helped by a bureaucratic, one-dimensional approach”. It has also been suggested that greater recognition and value should be given to the contributions of FBOs in providing social services and promoting community and economic development through which communities are being strengthened. FBOs have the ability and motivation to offer the moral, spiritual and emotional support and to uphold value systems that these residents need, as people are being addressed as whole individuals in a multi-purpose approach (Thomas, 2006). Mumford (1940: 216) suggested some 60 years ago, that the segregation of the spiritual life from the practical life is a curse and there needs to be a re-integration in all spheres of society. Winkler (2006) has found that in Hillbrow (an inner-city suburb of Johannesburg), of all places, besides the chaos and decay, there is a highly organised social infrastructure in which residents engage in a variety of networks: a significant number of residents turn to the FBOs in Hillbrow for assistance, hope, self-empowerment, survival networks and a sense of belonging.

Christian FBOs can be divided into several sectors, for example, local congregations (church), denominational organisations and networks, and independent international/national/local service or para-church organisations. This chapter will focus on only one sector, the local congregation, as the aim of the investigation is to propose that Christian churches in Bloemfontein should be transformed into community-based resource centres. The chapter will be structured in six parts. Firstly, I will share my own experience of church dynamics in Bloemfontein. Next, a discussion regarding the church and the development debate will be provided. This will be followed by a conceptualisation of alternative development. Fourthly, brief reference will be made to how the South African government and the Christian church have responded to the challenges of alternative development since 1994. Next, a conceptual framework will be provided for transforming local churches into community-based resource centres and, lastly, this transformation process will be applied to the church environment in Bloemfontein.

2. PERSONAL EXPERIENCE OF CHURCH DYNAMICS IN BLOEMFONTEIN

The researcher has been involved with church-based development enterprises in Bloemfontein since 1990. During the past 15 years there has been a quest for a faith-based development approach rooted in Africa within the church environment. After this period a number of observations may be made as part of setting the scene for this investigation.

Apartheid is dead, but its legacy is a reality and still alive within the church. Although the giant machinery of apartheid has been dismantled, new giants have emerged (or expanded) since 1994 e.g. poverty, unemployment, HIV/AIDS, crime, violence, family disintegration, moral decay, corruption, nepotism, land reform and increasing levels of inequality (but no longer along racial lines). One of the greatest sins of apartheid was the creation and

---

2 At local level ‘congregation’ and ‘church’ will be used interchangeably.
maintenance of a spirit of dependence (the ‘Pretoria-will-decide-and-provide-what-is-the-best-for-you’ syndrome) at the cost of promoting self-reliance.

As result of the fast-changing South Africa a new breed of church leadership needs to be cultivated and their non-theological capacities need to be increased, especially in leadership, management and entrepreneurial skills to cope with the changing socio-political and development challenges. In general terms, church leadership is neither equipped to participate in an open, fast-changing democratic dispensation, nor is it able to contribute towards increased civil society energy. There is still a long way to go from a theology of resistance to a theology of reconstruction and sustainable community development.

Inequality levels measured in terms of access to resources and institutional capacity between traditional black and white churches have increased. Little has changed within the ‘township churches’. In fact, the daily struggles have increased as a consequence of more desperate situations in terms of poverty, unemployment, domestic violence and family conflict, and diseases. There is a mushrooming of churches without sound leadership training capabilities (such leaders are referred to as self-appointed pastors). Church governance practice is generally poor and in many cases non-existent, because of a lack of institutional capacity. Some of the black elite have left the ‘township churches’ for more up-market churches in urban areas. There is also little evidence that the physical infrastructure of local congregations is being utilised for community purposes throughout the week.

There is also an intense power struggle between churches to access development aid from local and provincial government departments, as well as local, national and international donors. And lastly, the church is becoming more irrelevant as a vehicle stimulating sustainable community-based development and as a prophetic voice in society.

In a study commissioned by the IIDE (2005), of which the researcher was part, the research identified the following additional developmental challenges after interviewing 34 FBOs in the Mangaung Local Municipality (Bloemfontein, Botshabelo and Thaba Nchu) area.

- There is little understanding within the church of a faith-based developmental and community empowering approach, rooted in Africa, infused with a vibrant entrepreneurial spirit to transform consumers into producers. Of the 34 cases, only a few understand and practice a partly developmental approach. The majority are engaged in charity and relief activities (Korten’s first-generation strategy: see Section 4) while stock lasts, thus promoting the existing culture of dependence. Little progress is visible of paradigm shifts from social grants to self-reliance; from food parcels to food gardens; from hand-outs to creating jobs; and from projects to a developmental process.
- Mentorship and relationships are keys to sustainable community-based development.
- The church lacks institutional capacity and good governance.
- Spiritual and practical matters are being separated, including the Sunday (worship) church and the Monday to Saturday (practical ministries) church. A narrow-minded spiritual approach is being followed: get people saved and their socio-economic problems will be solved; we will pray about the matter while thousands of community
members are starving and exposed to health risks and the false panacea of quick fixes which claim to resolve all the socio-economic struggles.

- Women are valuable community transformation servants and are not being utilised optimally within church systems, especially in governance-related matters.

From these introductory remarks it is clear that there is an enormous challenge to the church in Bloemfontein to respond more effectively to the daily struggles of tens of thousands of people, as well as to explore a variety of innovative opportunities to become increasingly more engaged with faith-based community development and act as agents of change within civil society.

3. THE CHURCH AND DEVELOPMENT DEBATE

The church and development debate has been explored for the last few decades since the 1960s. At the end of the Second World War, the term ‘development’ became prominent in the secular debate which was largely driven by modernisation and economic growth theories (see Section 4). The church was influenced by these debates and, since the Geneva Conference on ‘Church and Society’ in 1966, the church has been challenged to review its involvement in poverty alleviation and in the plight of the poor; as well as its response to human needs, social justice, human rights, peace, ethics, community development, social transformation, sexism, racism, refugees, caring for the environment, the growing international debt crisis and globalisation issues (Bowers, 2005; De Gruchy, 2001a; Swart, 2006; Wilhelm, 2003). In many circles the Christian churches were perceived as an imperialistic institution upholding the values of the Western capitalist and political world emanating from a Eurocentric worldview, which is obviously not truly biblical, as their disciples would like to claim. The concept of development was perceived by some in the liberation theology school as a “new name for imperialism” (De Gruchy, 2001a: 1), because “development does not have a good track record” (De Gruchy, 2001b: 74) in poor countries.

There seems to be an increasing recognition that the Gospel is not only about evangelism, discipleship and church planting, but should also accommodate a more holistic and comprehensive approach, including social responsibility. “A holistic approach to mission affirms that ministering to the poor, sick, hungry, and oppressed and preaching the message of eternal salvation is Good News. The biblical concepts of evangelism and development are not separate” (Wilhelm, 2003: 238) and that the dualistic worldview which sees evangelism as addressing the spiritual needs and development coping with the physical needs should be corrected.

Various concepts and approaches have emerged within the development-orientated FBO environment based on the secular theories of alternative development, viz. people-centred, Max-Neef’s satisfying human needs (for both approaches cf. Wilhelm (2003), Korten’s four generations of strategic action in development (cf. Swart (2006) and the next section), asset-based community development (cf. De Gruchy (2003) and the next section) and development as transformation (cf. Bowers (2005) and the next section). It will be
appropriate to provide a discussion on alternative development and how the South African government and the Christian churches have responded to this approach.

4. **ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT**

Thorbecke (2005) has provided a useful account of the evolution of the doctrine of development from 1950 to 2005. He is of the opinion that the economic and social development of the poor countries was clearly not a policy objective of the colonial rulers before the Second World War (2005). He has designed an analytic framework to illustrate how the concept of development and its objectives, theories, techniques, policies, strategies and data systems have progressed in each of the six decades, starting from the 1950s. Several points become clear from this overview.

**Development objectives** have progressed from a purely ‘economic-goal-top-down-trickle-down’ approach with GDP growth as the sole yardstick to measure development. They entail expanding objectives to include the increase and diversification of employment opportunities, poverty alleviation, meeting basic needs, structural adjustments, improving standards of living of especially the poor, income distribution, reducing income inequalities, good governance and institutional building, equity, sustainable livelihoods, people-centred development, human development, participatory development, enlarging people’s choices, preserving resources for future generations, ensuring human rights and political freedom, achieving gender equality, reducing vulnerability, and achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDG). Since the dawn of the new millennium human development has replaced poverty reduction as the ultimate goal of development (Thorbecke, 2005; UNDP, 2005).

**Strategies and approaches** have shifted from focusing on ‘go-for-growth’, modernisation, industrialisation-first, technological advancement and scientific ‘hardware’, capital accumulation, top-down, blueprint, centralised, designing and controlling development projects from outside. The emphasis has now shifted to strategies and approaches like alternative development, human development, pro-poor growth strategies, integrated and holistic development, and endogenous development from within. Socially, focuses are on participation, involving civil society, bottom-up approaches, empowering communities, self-reliance, expansion of human capabilities, investing in human capital, and social learning. Economically, major attention is given to growth-inequality-poverty nexus, the redistribution with growth, reducing dependence from outside and appropriate technology.

**Architects** of development theories, models and approaches have moved from an exclusively economist domain mainly from the Western world towards a multidisciplinary terrain where especially social scientists have contributed towards a more balanced, comprehensive and broad-based development vision with a human face. Valuable alternative approaches, mainly from poor countries, have contributed to the growth of a rich understanding of the complexities of the development process and debate.

**And data systems** as a tool to measure human development have improved significantly in the last two decades, with especially the assistance of specialised agencies in the
developing countries. The Human Development Report, which has been produced annually since 1990, is one of the most valuable human development progress reports on a global scale (UNDP, 2005). Since 2000 the MDG Progress Chart has been adding substantial value to the monitoring process (United Nations, 2005).

From this overview of the evolution of the concept and its development, it is clear that alternative development has emerged as a response to the conventional theories of development and was originally perceived as revolutionary, anti-colonial and anti-
Some of the criticism neglects the search for practical development solutions which should be both context- and time-specific.

The development scope and vision have been broadened to include important non-economic dimensions of development in order to ensure a more balanced, equitable and comprehensive broad-based perspective on development (Botes, 1999; Brohman, 1996; Carmen, 1996; Davids, 2005; Mansuri and Rao, 2004; Martinussen, 1997; Max-Neef, 1991; Preston, 1997; Reid, 1995; Theron, 2005; Ul Haq, 1999). It should be noted that alternative development should not be seen as another panacea for development (as many previous approaches were perceived to be), as a wide range of criticism has been directed against this approach (Brohman, 1996; Chinsinga, 2003; Cooke and Kothari, 2001; Mansuri and Rao, 2004; Nunstad, 2001; Sanyal, 1994). Within an evolutionary perspective, this approach is not necessarily replacing the contents of previous theories and might be labelled (or is already being classified) as another development paradigm towards the ultimate goal of development.

For alternative approaches to development, a number of principles need to be adhered to and are summarised in Figure 1. Some of the principles overlap in terms of content and should be seen as interlocking with one another.

Brief reference will be made to Korten’s four generations of strategic action in development, asset-based community development, and development as transformation, as these three approaches are relevant to the application of transforming local congregations into community-based resource centres. Korten has identified four stages or generations of strategic orientation, starting with relief and welfare as generation one, characterised by immediate action by welfare service providers, such as providing food, health care and shelter in times of war or natural disaster to individuals and families. Although relief programmes are essential in times of disaster, and it is part of human reality that there will always be individuals within any community whose circumstances demand some form of welfare assistance, the first-generation strategy is not considered a development strategy as it does not empower the poor to meet their own needs on a sustained basis. The second-generation strategies have progressed to becoming community development strategies based on a project-centred lifespan. Empowerment is a major component, as the energy from the developmental NGO shifts to developing the capacities of the local people to meet their own needs. The outside NGO is seen more as a mobiliser than an actual doer, as the community potential that normally lies dormant is activated. The third generation is sustainable systems development. These strategies look beyond the local community and encourage changes in policies and institutions at local, national and even international level, which may constrain local community development. The fourth-generation strategies are geared towards a social or people’s movement approach to development, based on the vision of people-centred development. Value- and idea-centred processes, directed to the wellbeing of people and the environment, are at its core, as people are the actual subjects of change. Voluntarism is a special feature of this generation as committed volunteers are driven by ideas and a shared vision of an improved world and not by budgets or
organisational structures. They operate on social energy which activates independent action by numerous individuals and institutions across boundaries, reinforcing synergy and establishing dynamic networks that offer mutual inspiration, political support and the exchange of experience and technology (Swart, 2006).

Asset-based community development (ABCD) is presented as an alternative to needs-based approaches to development and is based on three interrelated characteristics, i.e. it is asset-based (what community resources are available), internally focused (problem-solving capacities of local residents, associations and institutions) and relationship driven (between local actors). A key in development is to avoid poor and needy people with lots of problems from becoming reliant on non-poor service providers with lots of solutions. This leads inevitably to a culture of dependence on outside agencies and is disempowering for those already on the margins of society. The needs-driven, problem-focused approach concentrates on the giants in the community (mentioned in Section 2) and proposes services from outside agencies as solutions. The result is that poor people become consumers of welfare rather than producers of their own solutions. According to De Gruchy (2003a: 31), this is one of the reasons why development often fails: “the more outsiders try to deal with the symptoms, the worse the problem gets. We should face the deeper issue – the community’s inability to solve its problems”. He is of the opinion that you cannot build a community on what people do not have. Instead, successful community development embarks on a process of policies and activities based on the capacities, skills and assets of people. This capacity-focused, asset-based approach starts with what the community has, rather than what it lacks.

Kretzmann and McKnight’s (1993) work on ‘building communities from the inside out’ proposes that the needs-driven, problem-focused, deficiency approach in community development should be replaced by a capacity-focused development. Communities are never built from the top down or from the outside, although valuable assistance can be provided from the outside. The hard truth is that development must start from within the communities. It is increasingly recognised that even the poorest communities have individuals, associations and institutions representing resources upon which they can start building. These resources represent expertise, skills, capacities, assets, strengths, knowledge, talents, giftedness, abilities, relationships, connections and networks, and need to be located and connected in ways that will multiply their effectiveness, leading to new avenues of local development. The appeal of ABCD lies in its premise that communities can drive the development process themselves by identifying and mobilising existing assets and therefore improve their own local socio-economic environment.

According to Mathie and Cunningham (2002), ABCD is based on five elements:

- Appreciative inquiry which identifies and analyses the community’s past successes;
- The recognition of social capital and its importance as an asset which reflects on the power of associations and informal linkages within the community and with external institutions;
- Participatory approaches to development which are based on the principles of empowerment and ownership of the development process;
Directed towards sustainable economic development that is community-driven making best use of its own resource base;

Efforts to strengthen civil society by engaging people as citizens (rather than clients) in development and to contribute towards making local governance more effective and responsive.

Although a blueprint for implementing ABCD has been rejected, the following steps have been identified (Mathie and Cunningham, 2002):

- Collecting stories of successful local community initiatives;
- Organising a core group taking responsibility for the process;
- Mapping the assets of local individuals, associations and institutions;
- Building relationships among local assets for mutual beneficial problem-solving within the community;
- Mobilising community assets for economic development and information sharing purposes;
- Building a community vision and plan;
- Leveraging activities, investments and resources from outside the community to support asset-based locally defined development.

Faith-based community development may be characterised as social capital development as relationships are being strengthened within the community and expanded to include external actors. When FBOs join with other actors in civil society with similar agendas, the multiplier effect increases significantly (Kemper and Adkins, 2005). Among the major assets in any community are religion and the local congregations which have many resources which can contribute towards building up communities, e.g. leadership, volunteers, expertise, facilities, equipment, networks and the ability to mobilise finances.

In both the secular and theological debates there has been a move towards a definition of development as transformation in the quest to be more holistic, as well as to escape the negative associations of the concept of development. The emphasis has shifted from projects and programmes to human beings as part of development which transforms all spheres of life, including “human relationships, communities, and living conditions. It is a process of change in the conditions of the lifestyle of people and the qualitative change in the nature and character of human societies” (Groenewald, 2000: 18). Development is now more predominantly defined in terms of transformation of the existing economic, social and political structures as well as interpersonal, societal and international relationships. Transformation is often used interchangeably with the term development, although it is seen as more encompassing and holistic in scope, and implies change at all levels: political, social, economic and spiritual. This change occurs in both individuals and within society as a whole. A transformation of the heart has entered the debate, referring to a change in attitudes towards others, tenderness, and compassion (IIDE, 2006).
Within the church environment transformation is being formulated according to the Wheaton Declaration in 1983 as “the change from a condition of human existence contrary to God’s purposes to one in which people are able to enjoy fullness of life in harmony with God. This transformation can only take place through the obedience of individuals and communities to the Gospel of Jesus Christ, whose power changes the lives of men and women… and making them new creatures in Christ” (cited in Bowers, 2005: 11). From a spiritual angle the core aspects of this approach are holism integrating the spiritual and socio-economic aspects, identifying the Holy Spirit as the Transformer which enlightens and empower, the notion of the Kingdom of God as both present and future, living in shalom (which refers to harmony, peace, justice, wholeness, prosperity and general well-being), the importance of the local church as an agent of change, and establishing Kingdom values and ethics in society (Bowers, 2005).

The main differences of a faith-based as opposed to a secular approach towards development are: a kingdom vision, establishing kingdom values and ethics, the inspiration of the Holy Spirit as a transformation agent, holistic spirituality integrating the spiritual with practical ministries, shalom, changed people and relationships, reconciliation, local congregation-based, servanthood and discipleship.

5. ALTERNATIVE DEVELOPMENT AND A DEMOCRATIC SOUTH AFRICA

Brief reference will be made to how the South African government and the Christian church have applied the principles of alternative development since 1994.

5.1 Response by the government

The principles of alternative development are embedded in the spirit of ubuntu and the Freedom Charter, which have provided firm direction on how the first democratically elected government should transform this country from a rigidly controlled apartheid state to a vibrant, people-centred, democratic African state. The South African public policy landscape has been transformed dramatically since 1994 as government policies were altered to focus more on the formerly excluded majority, the poor and the underdeveloped communities. A transformation of values, processes, approaches and structures was initiated. The impact of this paradigm shift towards redress, re-orientation, reconstruction and redesign towards implementing the principles of democracy, non-racialism and non-sexism was far-reaching, reshaping every aspect of South African society and it will continue doing so in future. Since 1994 more than 900 pieces of legislation, mainly from public participatory policy formulation processes, were promulgated. A significant achievement is the developmental and empowering dimension, especially with respect to the poor. These developmental laws have captured the spirit of our Constitution and the Bill of Rights, as the right to development forms a cornerstone of our democratic dispensation. Shared values are embedded in the Constitution and, inter alia, protect human rights and dignity, and promote justice, fairness, equity, equality, freedom of association, non-discrimination, non-sexism, participation, self-realisation, transparency reduce outside dependence and accountability. This legal
framework was created to promote a conducive environment for people-centred development based on the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) as a policy framework. The key programmes of the RDP were: meeting basic needs, developing our human resources, building the economy, democratising the state and society, and implementing the RDP, which fits the principles of alternative development. Some of the policies at local government level which are based on the principles of alternative development include the Integrated Development Planning (IDP), Local Economic Development (LED), and the White Paper on Local Government.

A remarkable policy framework based, *inter alia*, on the principles of alternative development has been established. However, the implementation of these principles and the increased involvement of civil society in addressing the socio-economic, political and environmental challenges of this country still have a long way to go.

5.2 Response by the Christian church

The South African Council of Churches (SACC), as an ally of the ANC during the struggle towards democracy, shares the sentiments of *ubuntu* and the Freedom Charter. The Church in general terms is called to make life better for all God’s people (a similar phrase stipulated in the RDP) and cannot ignore the developmental debate. Since 1994 the Church has lost its prophetic voice in the nation for various reasons and is struggling to switch from a theology of resistance to a theology of reconstruction, development, nation building, assistance and responsibility. The concept of theology (or church) and development is, in many circles, still a foreign concept; as De Gruchy (2001: 4) rightly observes “we are still in the early days of doing ‘Theology and Development’ in Southern Africa”. However, there are some beacons of hope, e.g. the work of Beukes (2002), Botman and Meiring (2002), Bruwer (2001), Combrinck (2002), Conradie (2002), De Gruchy (2001a and b, 2003a and b, 2005), De Villiers *et al.* (1996), Du Toit (2002), Hendriks (2004), Holder-Rich (2001), Koegelenberg (2001), Kritzinger (2002), Philpott (2001), SACC (2000), Van der Walt (2006), Van Niekerk (2002) and Vika (2001), to mention a few. These contributions challenge the Church to increase its engagement with the daily struggles of millions of South Africans in terms of poverty, HIV/AIDS, land reform, sustainable livelihoods, education, earth keeping, human rights, polarisation, powerlessness, globalisation, partnerships with the state, NEPAD and meeting the targets of the MDG. Valuable perspectives are also provided in terms of approaches and the revisitation of theological education in the context of reconstruction and development.

The second South African Christian Leadership Assembly (SACLA) in 2003 identified seven giants in our society, i.e. poverty and unemployment, HIV/AIDS, violence, crime, racism, sexism and the family in crisis (inadequate land reform and inequality are noticeably absent). It was envisaged that in every sphere of society at national, regional and local levels strategists would design strategies to tackle these massive difficulties from a biblical perspective, thus implying that the church would draft its own RDP policy framework. Little action is evident in this regard, as a national strategic operational centre (or engine room) for Christian churches in partnership does not exist (which is probably the case nowhere else).
Biblical contents to address development in general and the needy, in particular, are clear (see Isaiah 61; Luke 4: 16-19): care for the poor and afflicted, heal the broken-hearted and oppressed, provide physical, psychological and spiritual freedom, peace, social justice and equity, discipleship, and fulfil God’s purpose for your life (equipping, empowering and self-reliance), practise compassion, responsible stewardship and earth keeping, nurture interdependence and being part of a team, and volunteerism. These elements correlate favourably with the principles of alternative development (see Figure 1).

However, according to Miller (1999), the difference lies in the various contrasting worldviews – to mention just three: a biblical, secular humanistic and animistic worldview. According to Grant (in the foreword to Miller, 1999: 9), the most effective tool for combating poverty and hunger is a biblical worldview which implies God as the source, the means and the end. His servants have to do justice, love mercy and walk humbly with their God (Micah 6: 8), fulfilling His ultimate plan. Miller (1999: 21) is of the opinion that “not more money, greater manpower, or better mailing lists. Not more programmes, greater efficiency, or better systems. Not more governmental involvement, greater grassroots participation, or better public exposure. Not more denominational unity, greater international cooperation, or better distribution channels” will solve the struggles of the world’s needy people. He further states that development is more than working hard; it is about thinking and about what we think. The end result is to be “perfect and complete”, lacking nothing mentally, physically, spiritually or relationally (1999: 271).

6. TRANSFORMING LOCAL CONGREGATIONS INTO COMMUNITY-BASED RESOURCE CENTRES: A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Firstly, mention should be made of various delivery channels for faith-based community development programmes, which are as follows:

- International Christian NGOs (para-church) such as World Vision, World Relief, Tearfund, Oxfam, the Salvation Army, Habitat for Humanity International, and Jesus Alive Ministries;
- Church cooperation partnerships such as the SACC, which receives money mainly from overseas partners;
- Church denominations with (or without) international denominational links such as the Roman Catholic, Anglican, Methodist, Baptist, Dutch Reformed, and Lutheran. Each of these church institutions has its own macro social service or community development department sustaining programmes at national, provincial and local levels;
- Local congregations which operate community services from their premises or have satellite projects in the community;
- Local congregations in partnership, where a number of local congregations participate in sharing resources;
- Local Christian NGOs (para-church) independent of church denominational or congregational links.
Each of these delivery channels has its own set of dynamics, strengths and weaknesses when compared with the principles of alternative development. According to Hendriks (2004: 45-46) and Koegelenberg (2001: 103), reference are made to the institutional-denominational model and formal welfare structure (or office) model (which may include the first three channels mentioned above, depending on in-house practices). Characteristics of this model are: hierarchical structures with top-down and paternalistic practices, international and national offices far removed from communities, prescriptive procedures, technical and hard-issue bias, demands a high degree of institutional loyalty, power to control, leads to clericalism where the gifts of the laity are forced into passivity, church law is more important than the Scriptures, an outdated delivery model in today’s world, as everything is more or less ‘cut and dried’, and expensive overheads to sustain the system.

The advantages of this model are: accessibility and connection to a wide scope of international and national sources (e.g. the R220 million from USAID to the Anglican Church of Southern Africa in 2004), economy of scale principles, involvement with large projects, pooling of resources, the power of networking, should be more cost effective per capita, good governance and accountability practices, and access to government departments (which may hold the danger of becoming part of party-political agendas). Although this model contributes to the bulk of the social relief energy to the needy, it does not comply with the majority of the principles of alternative development.

The focus of this investigation, however, is to transform Sunday church service centres (local congregations: number 4 of the delivery channels above) into community-based resource centres operational seven days a week for 52 weeks per year. De Beer (2003: 14) has emphasised this channel profoundly: “We have to turn our buildings into 24 hour community centres that will touch every need of the city”. This community outreach model (also including numbers 5 and 6 of the above delivery channels) is described by Hendriks (2004: 51-55) as the transformation model and is also called the servant model. Koegelenberg (2001: 103) refers to this model as a more informal (but still well organised) local community development service. The following are some of the characteristics of this model: take the Christian witness ‘out there’ into the world; the Church should be with the people where it really hurts; the Church should get out of her comfort zones of theology, pulpits and buildings to represent Christ by serving the community; the beneficiaries are not exclusively members of the Church as the Church is there to serve the entire community; a bottom-up model engaging with the struggles of the world; mobilising local resources in the form of time, talent and treasure; practitioners are not driven by institutional loyalty but by caring for the needy and powerless, hearing their stories, restoring their dignity and providing hope in hopeless situations; a shift from ‘the truth lies in the right dogma’ to ‘truth is to be found in doing what is right’; and it is holistic, as all socio-economic, political and ecological issues are addressed. It is also suggested that this model might contribute towards restoring the credibility of the Christian Gospel in a secular world. There are obvious disadvantages to this model: the dominance of a social gospel, political-ideological struggle issues become the main focus points, the end often justifying the means, dubious methods often being
employed, and the personal lives of those driving the transformation agenda sometimes being viewed with suspicion.

An American assessment of faith-based community development was undertaken by Kemper and Adkins (2005) and some useful experiences, applicable to the South African local situation will be shared (cf. also Vidal (2001); see Table 1).

Table 1  American experience of faith-based community development

- President Bush has called on FBOs as indispensable in meeting the needs of poor Americans and has ensured that Federal Government’s policies will be established to equip, empower and expand the work of FBOs in this regard. An Office of Faith-Based Activities has been created.
- The sheer size of the religious sector in America suggests its potential as a major role player in community development programmes.
- FBOs as stewards of significant resources which can be translated as ‘loving one’s neighbour’ extends far beyond the $15-$20 billion and millions of volunteer hours (for the year 2001) which they collectively contribute each year to community improvement.
- Differentiation should be made between individual or family needs (food, clothing, shelter, jobs, etc.) and community needs (unjust practices, poor medical and educational services, moral decay, gambling, slum lords, etc.).
- Congregations must decide who their community is: is it membership or the geographical neighbourhood including all members of such a neighbourhood?
- The Social Gospel Movement emerged as a response to the urban poverty problem.
- Focusing on asset-based community development where people are helped to improve their own living conditions by applying local resources, skills, knowledge, abilities, relationships and networks.
- The parish is the centre for the development of people.
- Due to the spatial transformation of the American city, the landscape of congregations has changed dramatically, e.g. dysfunctional inner city churches with few resources and expanding affluent suburban churches.
- Successful ecumenical efforts have emerged as churches have started to cooperate and pool their resources.
- Forming partnerships entities in society, e.g. with public schools, security services, housing corporations, local government and trade unions.
- Embarking on a process of community-organising strategies which are based on a bottom-up, people-first approach; tools were presented to instil self-pride and take control of their own lives and communities.
- A paradigm shift from community-organising strategies to local-level community development corporations to pursue the economy of scale principles.
- ‘Liberal’ congregations are more willing than ‘conservative’ congregations to engage in social services to meet the needs of people.
- Poor congregations are also more willing than rich congregations to be involved with community-based development.
- Charismatic leadership is critical to mobilise a local congregation for community work.
- Christian community development is about meeting three universally felt needs, i.e. the need to belong, the need to be significant and important, and the need for a reasonable amount of
security.

- Any community development process has to be relationship driven and internally focused with a high level of ownership.
- It is not about having more, but being more in terms of the quality and relationships of life.
- Perhaps one of the most important ingredients for community development is the presence of a ‘soul’ and ‘soulful practices’. It is about real people with real names and addresses. It has been assessed that, despite the best efforts, sometimes nothing has been accomplished.
- Prerequisites for successful development-oriented FBOs are: stable leadership, a clear organisational strategy, strong management and governance, professional staff with capacity to deliver, secure resources (grants, loans, contracts, fees, technical assistance), networking inside and outside the community, partnerships, and a long-term vision.

Sources: Kemper and Adkins, 2005; Vidal, 2001

Regarding the South African situation, a number of studies have suggested similar criteria regarding faith-based community development. Research in this regard was done by Bruwer (2001), Du Toit (2002), the IIDE (2005), Van der Walt (2006) and Van Niekerk (2002), and is summarised in Table 2. The work of the Christian Community Development Association (CCDA) in America has been added in the last column.

Table 2  Criteria for faith-based community development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Christian protocol to the community</td>
<td>A Christ-centred holistic developmental approach</td>
<td>Adequate problem definition to understand problem and context</td>
<td>Kingdom vision: understanding the bigger picture</td>
<td>Mutuality: cooperation between donors and beneficiaries</td>
<td>Relocate: living amongst them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the context and respect for the needy</td>
<td>Indigenous development: from within</td>
<td>Do not rush in with answers and solutions</td>
<td>Passion</td>
<td>Empowering</td>
<td>Reconciliation: people to God and people to people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for education</td>
<td>Towards self-reliance</td>
<td>Building trust and solid relationships</td>
<td>Transformational leadership</td>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Just redistribution of resources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is a process: no instant solutions
Empowering First look and listen (in order to understand), then think (in order to know the pitfalls and opportunities), then act (in order to really help)
A Christ-centred holistic developmental and community empowering approach rooted in Africa infused with a vibrant entrepreneurial spirit, transforming people from consumers to producers
Indigenous development: from within
Listening to community: felt need concept and asset-based community development

Compassion
Servant hood
Servant hood
Mentorship and discipling
Specialised but holistic
Indigenous leadership development

Spiritual guidance
Satisfying fundamental human needs
Focus is the family or household as this is the centre of African culture
Good governance
Compassionate and just
Church-based community development

Towards self-reliance
Mobilising local resources
Advocacy and creating awareness
Spirit of volunteerism and servant hood
Professional, transparent and accountable
Holistic approach

Leadership
Sustainability
It is a process
Ownership
Empowerment

Servant hood
Relational and strengthening family life
Networking
Live among them; learn from them; love them; start with what they know; build on what they have; when the task is done the

Professionalism
Interdependence: privilege of sharing
Advocacy
Learning curve

Interdependence: privilege of sharing
Passion
Learning curve

Learning through experience
Discipleship and mentoring
Important role of women and young people

Van der Walt (2006)
Christian Community Development

Van Niekerk (2002)
Bruwer (2001)
Du Toit (2002)
IIDE (2005)
From this discussion, the following conclusions may be drawn, which will be relevant for application to the Bloemfontein church environment.

- There are significant similarities between the criteria applied by the various studies.
- These criteria compare favourably with the principles of alternative development (compare with Figure 1).
- It seems that the Christian church is possibly one of the optimal agents in sustainable community development because of its calling, as well as its geographical position in society, as congregations are located in every neighbourhood, zone, ward, district and rural village.
- The congregations which will be more likely to engage with community-based development are: having charismatic leadership sharing the vision, more progressive, predominately black, larger in number and having access to resources, and located in or close to poor neighbourhoods.
- Figure 2 illustrates the phases of influence of local congregations in the community: from inward-looking with very little impact, to outward focusing, increasing their impact on the community (shown by increased arrows).
- Figure 3 is a compilation of elements needed for a faith-based development approach and is called the transformational-servant-community-outreach model. This model is based on spirituality, holism, sustainability and flexibility. Any development-oriented FBO needs to be evaluated according to these elements. The challenge for local congregations is to be transformed into community-based resource centres, where these elements should be released into the community and/or incorporated into their respective approaches. This model forms the basis for the application of transforming local congregations into community-based resource centres in Bloemfontein. This will be discussed next.
Currently, Bloemfontein’s population size exceeds 500,000 and there are more than 300 formal and informal local congregations scattered across the city, penetrating every geographical area, including the informal settlements which are the main frontier of expansion. As a consequence of 150 years of racial policies and more than a decade of residential spatial transformation based on socio-economic criteria, the city is divided into a high-density poor eastern sector, with approximately 350,000 residents serviced by some 220 congregations, and a low-density middle- and high-income western area with some 150,000 inhabitants and 80 congregations.

**Figure 2** Phases of local congregations influencing the community
Based on the researcher’s own experience since 1990, a number of general comments may be made with regard to the current situation of local congregational involvement (or rather lack of involvement) with church-based community development in Bloemfontein. The majority of congregations are either not aware of what church-based community development is, or they are not involved (or even interested) in such a process, according to the transformational-servant-community-outreach model (Figure 2). This might be because church leaders are not equipped with a vision of what church-based community development entails or the capacity for the implementation of such an initiative. A large number of church leaders have also separated spiritual matters and practical socio-economic ministries.

The primary focus of most churches is on membership and the expansion of membership, with little evidence visible of genuine community churches serving the community beyond church membership boundaries. Only a few church premises are being utilised seven days a week for community purposes and an extensive amount of church-owned infrastructure is under-utilised for most of the week. A wide variety of social relief programmes are being managed according to the institutional model: top-down and mechanical. However, a number of ‘soul’-driven community projects are beacons of hope (see IIDE, 2005). Unfortunately there
is tension between congregational/denominational community outreach programmes and initiatives by independent para-church groups (IIDE, 2005).

There are huge inequalities in terms of access to resources and institutional capacity between poor and rich churches, which are geographically separated as a result of historical racial policies. Patterns of twinning between a materially resourceful and/or institutionally advanced church, and a sister church in the poor area is common practice within the circles of the mainline churches. The distance factor between rich and poor churches contributes to the mentality of ‘we-will-pray-and-give-resources’ without becoming physically involved with the challenges of the needy. It is expected that poorer churches are more willing to embark on a process of church-based community development. It is also true that there are substantial local resources within Bloemfontein society to make a visible difference in addressing the needs of the poor.

Currently, the combined church in Bloemfontein has not formulated a vision and action plan of how the church as a whole should engage with church-based community development in the city. Several attempts have been made in this regard since 2000 but with little impact, although awareness was created about crossing the divides of denominationalism towards achieving a Kingdom vision. Although the focus of the chapter is on local congregations, combined church action in terms of advocacy, public engagement and caring for the environment is required to achieve certain shared objectives. Reference will be made to this aspect.

On the basis of the preceding sections, the following can be suggested (not in any specific order), in terms of embarking on a church-based community development process for congregations in Bloemfontein (and elsewhere), through which local congregations may be transformed into community-based resource centres.

Perhaps the most obvious, but also the most difficult step, is to receive a revelation of God’s heart concerning those experiencing brokenness, hopelessness, poverty, affliction and oppression. An unselfish, sacrificial, compassionate life style is required. Availability and willingness are essential by loving and caring especially for those in need, regardless of one’s class or status.

A proper understanding of the Church and development debate will be required by church leaders and development practitioners. They need to be informed about the theories of alternative development, of Korten’s four-generation development strategies and the ultimate aim of achieving generations three and four (most church community development initiatives get stuck at generations one and two), as well as about the value of the asset-based community development approach by utilising one’s own assets, resources, skills, knowledge, abilities, relationships and networks. Churches also need to implement development as transformation as all aspects of individuals and communities need to be transformed into God’s purposes. The ultimate aim is to live among them, learn from them, love them, start with what they know, and build on what they have. When the task is done, the people will remark: We have done it ourselves!
Sharing the vision and understanding the comprehensiveness of the transformational-servant-community-outreach model (Figure 2) are essential. This vision needs to be taught by church leadership and development practitioners. The latter need to take the lead in the congregational context. Different dynamics might be operational in rich and poor congregations regarding interpreting the elements of the model. It should be clear from the outset that no quick fixes are applicable and that hard work, lots of godly wisdom and an entrepreneurial mindset will be a prerequisite for implementing the elements of the model successfully.

It is important to take note of experiences elsewhere, which have suggested what the prerequisites for successful development-oriented local congregations are: stable leadership, a clear organisational strategy, strong management and governance, professional staff and volunteers with a capacity to deliver, secure resources, networking inside and outside the community, partnerships, a long-term vision, and relying on the Holy Spirit for guidance in all aspects.

The development process of each congregation should be guided by a strategic framework to ensure focus, progress and accountability (see Figure 4). Each congregational task team should be asking the questions illustrated in Figure 4 on an ongoing basis. There is no blueprint for church-based community development and each congregation should trust the Lord for a unique operational plan. The community outreach programme should not be seen in isolation from other congregational programmes, and connections with other initiatives should be identified to ensure synergy. This plan and the progress being made should be communicated effectively to the members of the congregation, keeping the vision and commitment alive.

Figure 4  Strategic framework for process (Source: Adopted from Dennison, 1999: 206)

Because of the spatial segregation of the city (like most South African urban areas) into a poor eastern, low-income area with adjacent suburbs, and a middle- to high-income western segment, it is important to establish relational partnerships between rich and poor congregations, as illustrated in Figure 5. The poor and low-income suburbs are on the left-hand side, with larger arrows illustrating the movement from poorly resourced churches towards the adjacent poor communities. On the right-hand side are the middle- and high-income suburbs with more resourceful churches (with smaller arrows moving towards the neighbouring communities signifying that the need is much less there). The significance is the bridge connecting the rich and poor churches, over which a wide range of resources should flow to assist the poorer churches with a more effective outreach impact in their respective poor communities, but at the same time not promoting a culture of dependence.
According to the literature consulted, the poor congregations should embark on an asset-based community development process to determine what resources, skills and talents they have among themselves. They should also determine the community development agenda and procedures, ensuring that it is rooted in Africa, family focused and will lead towards capacity building, empowerment and self-reliance. The involvement of women and young people should be encouraged to broaden the levels of participation and ownership.

The role of the rich congregations is, firstly, to develop a sensitive approach: look, listen, think and only then act. An adequate problem definition will also be required. It was revealed in the IIDE study (2005) that the general profile of predominantly white and more resourceful churches is: an attitude of ‘we know what is good for the poor’, taking the initiative and running fast, losing community members along the way, impatience, not listening, unable to adapt to a slow process, jumping to conclusions, and wanting to see results. Members of the more resourceful congregations should provide physical, financial and human resources, volunteers, institutional capacity and mentorship to strengthen the poor churches in their fight in the trenches. They should support the poor churches to do more of what they can do, and do it better. The challenge, however, is to avoid a culture of dependence and every effort should be made to ensure that the majority of the elements of the transformational model are being implemented.

Ongoing training of church leadership in terms of leadership qualities, management skills and an entrepreneurial mindset should be provided, accompanied by a mentoring programme.
Training should also be provided to staff and volunteers. The establishment of a network will enable participating churches to share their experiences of the process on an ongoing basis to incorporate the principle of ‘learn as you go’ and to promote a Kingdom vision. The development of a research unit executing the monitoring and evaluation of the process, and providing guidance and learning experiences as the process gains momentum in a city context will be useful.

The congregations which will be more likely to take the lead (or are already engaged) are those where there are charismatic leaders sharing in the vision, committed development practitioners driving the process, a track record of caring and practising missionary work locally, more progressive and encouraging non-racial congregations, larger numbers who have access to resources, an understanding the dynamics of community needs, and which are located in or close to poor neighbourhoods.

Combined church action in a city context will be required for challenging local, provincial and national government policies and practices with regard to the massive problems in our society (an aspect of Korten’s third generation). A local forum for church leaders needs to be established, where relevant issues may be discussed and consensus may be reached and conveyed to appropriate institutions. Church leaders are called upon to be prophetic voices in civil society, proclaiming social justice, peace and reconciliation. The voice of the church should be heard where there is a lack of a developmental approach, the wasting of scarce resources earmarked for community development, unsustainable developmental practices, inappropriate allocation of developmental funding, corruption and environmental degradation. Access to public development funding should be explored, thus maintaining autonomy. Churches should also explore avenues of collaboration and strengthen their community initiatives, for instance, in the inner city. Combined church action may contribute significantly to the establishment of a culture of local developmental governance.

8. CONCLUDING COMMENTS

The focus of this chapter was to provide a church-based community development process through which congregations in Bloemfontein (and elsewhere) could be transformed into community-based resource centres. The church is not only the most representative institution in our country, but geographically it is also the most widely distributed body, penetrating every area of urban and rural community life, and thus it is ideally positioned to act as a community-based resource centre. Although a huge amount of energy for social relief programmes is being channelled through macro-denominational and para-church networks, the pattern of delivery is according to the institutional-denominational model, typifying practices not conducive towards a faith-based community development approach.

A transformational-servant-community-outreach model was designed, based on international and national experience of faith-based involvement with community-based development. It correlates favourably with the principles of alternative development and accommodates the approaches of Korten’s third- and fourth-generation strategies, asset-based community
development, and development as transformation. The challenge for local congregations is to apply the elements of this model to their local context by becoming community-based resource centres, operational every day of the year, from where spiritual and human resources may be released into the neighbouring communities.

However, practice has shown that the churches in Bloemfontein (and probably elsewhere in South Africa) are not implementing this model for various reasons, as this model suggests an unselfish, sacrificial, 'Mother Theresa'-type of lifestyle, where people are prepared to get their hands dirty by working, lovingly and caringly, especially with the poor and the afflicted. The two-world composition of the South African city (rich, first world and poor, third world) provides a unique opportunity for the Church to fulfil the necessary bridge function, linking the rich and resourceful churches with the poor congregations in order to embark on a joint journey of relational partnerships through which the church is to become a witness of hope, peace and reconciliation in civil society.

It is obvious that to change the mindset of church leadership, development practitioners and volunteers from both the poor and rich churches towards adopting a transformational-servant-community-outreach model will need an extra injection of grace and commitment. In conclusion, it is suggested that God’s solution to the problems in our city lies within the boundaries of our beloved city. He has provided His Church with the necessary blueprint and is waiting desperately for His Church to take action and to be a witness to the nations of the world.

REFERENCES


SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE


Bloemfontein and its future development: towards a research agenda

The collection of essays assembled in this book has aimed to make a contribution towards understanding some of the current dynamics of a type of city that seldom features in studies that appear in the academic press. Bloemfontein was approached as an ordinary South African city – its lived realities perhaps relatively mundane compared with global or world cities and its importance to debates surrounding our understanding of the city as a concept of but little consequence to scholars elsewhere. In addition, whilst “international” urban debates ceaselessly chase the constantly moving pot of theoretical gold at the end of the most recent discursive rainbow, our task was less ambitious but, we would argue, of equal worth. In particular, the investigation has provided baseline data on a range of themes that have not been collected or commented upon in the Bloemfontein context. In this chapter the key objective is to provide an overview of some of the key findings this collection of essays has brought to light. In reviewing our findings, we also aim to provide some indication of a range of themes that, in our view, require further research attention.

1. KEY FINDINGS AND SOME AVENUES FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

The spatial history of Bloemfontein and the BBT region – today known as the Mangaung Municipality – is the one theme of research that has been documented well. Yet the spatial conflicts associated with the period after 1990 are neither always well understood nor adequately contextualised – this was the focus of Chapter One. It is against this background that Chapter One confirms the general consensus in South Africa that not much has changed in respect of the urban morphology. The apartheid patterns have persisted and, if anything, the spatial densities have decreased even further. However, the argument in Chapter One is taken beyond the usual political-economic explanation and suggests that some of the decisions of the new policy makers have contributed to an increase in spatial segregation (the development of Mandela View), while the extensive continuation of the bus subsidy between Bloemfontein and Botshabelo has kept the apartheid urban distortion of the region intact. It is noteworthy that the reality of the transport subsidy and the renewed emphasis in setting the urban boundary to increase urban densities are never part of the same argument. Yet what seems to be a new argument in the debate is that the main discourse about the restructuring of urban spatialities has been mainly superficial and that other mechanisms such as shorter-distance public transport systems have not been considered. This seems to be highly relevant to Bloemfontein, where not much land is available for urban restructuring and
where basic access routes to the former Mangaung Township have already played a significant role in the spatial integration.

Furthermore, it seems that extensive research on these hidden urbanities, such as Botshabelo, and their consequences for urban policy and urban management remain low on the agenda of researchers, policy makers and urban managers. Considering the amount of research attention that was devoted to the topic in the 1980s, it seems that the problem has now dropped from the radar screen of researchers. At the same time the number of empirical studies focusing on the impact of low densities, spatial form and hidden urbanities remains small. In this respect the question does arise as to whether we really know enough about the impact of these realities on the lives of people. In addition, we need to ask whether we know and understand the implications for urban management.

The study of inequality between rich and poor, between racial groups, and in urban areas of the world is not a new phenomenon. In the South African context inequality linked to race and spatial location has received considerable attention, not least because past segregationist and apartheid policy and planning frameworks. Chapter Two examined the changing patterns of inequality in Bloemfontein. The picture that emerged was one of increasing inequality between 1991 and 1996, but of decreasing inequality between 1996 and 2001 and between 1991 and 2001. This finding of a decrease in inequality between three typical apartheid group areas differed significantly from that of other studies in South Africa. These suggest increased inequalities in South African society, but inevitably in terms of rather one-dimensional financial capital terms. It was suggested that this inequality would need to have its dynamics unpacked more extensively. Mainly two reasons have been advanced for the decrease in inequality since 1991. It was suggested that both increased urban mobility (the ability to locate where you choose) and increased access for domestic workers to housing on the premises of their employers are probably significant contributing reasons. However, it is probably more important and further also related to the fact that increased service delivery ensured that the levels of infrastructure situation were significantly better in Mangaung township 2001 than in 1991. The gap between formerly black Mangaung and white Bloemfontein decreed significantly. However, it was suggested that two longer-term questions should be posed in this respect. The one relates to the financial sustainability of the provision of infrastructure in accordance with infrastructure standards that are unaffordable to a large percentage of the population. This unaffordability, coupled with the inadequacy of cross-subsidisation mechanisms, has already resulted in mechanisms attempting to curb water consumption in poorer areas. In addition, this will place increasing pressure on municipalities to ensure efficient technical maintenance of the engineering plants that are to support water and sanitation provision in the future. The tendency could easily be to support access to various services in the name of curbing inequality, but not to consider long-term maintenance – an aspect that has already crippled a number of municipalities in the Free State and also elsewhere in South Africa.

Indeed, it is our contention that well-intentioned infrastructure development aimed at reducing inequality can potentially ultimately undermine the whole urban system – but
certainly that of individual cities and towns. This might suggest that the manner in which
inequality is approached – both discursively and practically – requires reformulation in South
Africa. Measures of inequality should also be framed so as to include the absolute levels of
improvement registered in, and between, places rather than simplistic measures of
difference in relative income positions. This is at once an issue that has seen considerable
debate in development studies and one that is moreover a deeply philosophical one in that it
requires a very significant engagement with a range of social justice discourses. A first
question concerning our approach to inequality in South Africa seems to remain open to
debate, and might call for a revision of the policy frameworks mainly concerned with equality.
A second question, and a key theme in politico-philosophic debates, relates to the inherent
tensions prevailing between notions of equality, freedom and sustainability. The South
African policy environment has a clear Rawlsian ascendance in which all three these ideals
are placed in careful balance, but which is neither appreciated nor understood by government
officials and/or politicians, particularly in terms of the scale of the urban society in which such
a balancing act is executed. For example, whilst resources might be available to large
global/world cities to pursue the equality of outcome clauses of, for example, a Rawlsian
understanding of social justice and the role of the state to ensure greater equality, this is not
necessarily true for an ordinary city such as Bloemfontein. Fundamental is the issue of
sustaining those services and infrastructure that have been made available to address
inequality in the city. Seen in this light, there are clearly critical philosophical questions at
stake and policy revision seems to be called for. Can countries such as South Africa have
policy frameworks that are universally applied across its urban hierarchy, not least of which
are programmes and policy positions aimed at addressing inequality? For us it would appear
that at this profoundly philosophical level there appears to be a need for greater engagement
with current policy frameworks, theories concerning “the good life” and the realities of
ordinary cities, and a teasing out of what is practical and sustainable, and not only what is
theoretically desired.

In Chapter Three it was argued that, despite a range of post-paradigmatic views of the city in
which CBDs appear to have lost some currency, considerable importance is still nevertheless
ascribed to a city’s CBD. In many ways the CBDs of many post-industrial societies retain a
spatial ordering function and are a seemingly indispensable feature of a city essential to our
understanding of the spatialities of the city. However, this investigation has revealed that in
the context of Bloemfontein this is not the case. The CBD has developed a new function and
has adapted to new realities and users. The CBD is part of the lives of a section of the city’s
population, but has all but disappeared from the lived geographies of large portions of
Bloemfontein’s population. Following Pirie’s (2007) contention in the Cape Town context, we
argue that structurally and spatially the Bloemfontein CBD is no longer the “centre” of the
city. Not only is a considerable proportion of business conducted elsewhere, but the
commercial component of the CBD is no longer primarily about commodity trade. This poses
a direct research question: in what way are the traditional CBDs of a host of non-
metropolitan cities of significance to the majority of their residents, and is their regeneration
necessary, required, or truly desirable?
A contention of this investigation is that these issues relate firstly to the question of whether inner-city regeneration in secondary cities might differ from inner-city regeneration in large metropolitan areas. Our argument is that this is indeed the case. Three reasons to support this contention were advanced. Firstly, the limited international linkage of the Bloemfontein CBD, compared with Cape Town or Johannesburg, to global capital makes CBD upgrading less important from an image and an economic point of view. The broader claim then would be that, although CBD regeneration is at present often portrayed as an inevitable outcome of cycles of capital accumulation and circulation in the built environment of the CBD, this might not always be the case. Secondly, the scale of an “ordinary city” such as Bloemfontein also appears to come into play. We argued that in the much smaller context of Bloemfontein the use of tax incentives in respect of upgrading buildings appears to be misplaced for this particular location. Businesses have either adapted to new CBD markets, or new businesses, typically SMMEs, have developed within the context of the new CBD realities.

Related to the issue of the scale of the city is the reality that the ownership base of CBD building stock is narrow and in the hands of a few local business entities, with their main business activities in commercial properties. Unlike large corporations that are able to write off property investments and manage their cash flows in respect of property investment against other business activities – and often even located elsewhere – these smaller enterprises focusing mainly on property management do not necessarily have the capital or the organisational resources to make use of the available incentives. Furthermore, given that their building stock is let and the occupants have adapted to new CBD realities, there is little incentive for these property owners to participate in the renewal/revival programmes. Quite the contrary is true: currently, these property owners effectively block significant renewal. In addition, as one of the key property owners in the CBD has now developed the largest regional mall in the central regions of South Africa just outside the CBD frame, there is little financial logic for the owner to invest on a large scale in the CBD. The issue of “cannibalising” their property portfolios is a real threat, particularly in the context of our next point.

Secondly, it was contended that the location and possibility of economic diversification projects in the CBD are limited. There are a number of reasons for such limitations. Firstly, it has to be acknowledged that, relative to the large metropolitan areas, the local economy of Bloemfontein is, in the main, stagnant (although significant growth has lately been recorded). Also, contrary to large metropolitan areas, Bloemfontein has very limited links to the national economy. Perhaps more importantly, links into the external economy, or the national economy that is typically deployed to diversify CBD economies – such as the “creative industries”, or knowledge economies quite commonly seen elsewhere – is particularly limited. In this respect some of these issues can be linked to institutional limitations in terms of both the provincial and the local governments. Unlike Johannesburg, for example, where there is close cooperation between provincial and local government departments and their planning units, this is not the case in Bloemfontein. There appears to be a lack of understanding of the critically important role provincial governments play in the local economy and specifically in the CBD, in particular. In both cases there is a strong political imperative to spread development programmes across the Free State or the Mangaung.
space-economy. Yet there is a need to provide a clear and strong point for redevelopment to make possible the revival of the CBD. This would, in our view, present fertile ground for in-depth analysis.

Revitalising the CBD in terms of getting people not to hold a negative perception of it is principally located in easily-remedied issues such as better waste removal, public toilet facilities and cleaning services, as well as crime prevention. In the case of Bloemfontein, revitalising the CBD to attract more customers will be dependent on local municipal actions (maybe in concert with the private sector) to ensure an adequate environment rather than using the available national programmes to address the situation. Again, this hints at the adequacy of the South African urban policy instruments at hand. Perhaps far greater policy flexibility and locationally specific frameworks are required. As such, it would appear that the idea of totally uniform policies for all urban areas needs to be abandoned.

Chapter Four investigated inner-city change in Bloemfontein. There can be little doubt that the scrapping of the legislation that governed group areas in South Africa played a crucial role in normalising (in racial terms) the residential environment in the Bloemfontein CBD. At the same time, in keeping with the international theory of invasion and succession, residential desegregation has led to a decline in the white population. However, there seems to be evidence that the CBD continues to fulfil three functions for white people. Firstly, it seems to play a specific role in creating residential space for newcomers to the employment arena. These newcomers, just like their black counterparts, require affordable accommodation as close as possible to their place of work. In the case of black residents, it seems as if the CBD plays a similar role, though subordinate to that of providing residential space to students. Secondly, on the basis of the survey results, there seems to be increasing evidence that the CBD also caters for a percentage of poor whites, either in terms of affordable accommodation, or in terms of properties in the CBD that are owned by lower-income whites. Thirdly, the CBD also seems to be a place of residence for a small yet significant percentage of higher-income earners, who, it seems, have clustered in specific blocks.

Furthermore, our evidence suggests that, in contrast to classical invasion and succession theory, the whites who leave are to some degree being replaced by other whites. There is evidence that these white newcomers have a lower level of education. The available evidence further suggests that whites who were still in the CBD in 2004 did not necessarily experience the CBD significantly differently from the way in which their black counterparts experienced it. The research results also indicate that the percentage of whites in the CBD with a blatantly racist attitude has dropped significantly. What are the reasons for these two patterns? Is it possible that those whites who had blatantly racist attitudes have already left? Does this in turn imply that the remainder are becoming part of a bigger “Rainbow Nation”? Or have the remaining whites merely “clustered” in specific flats, in order to avoid mixing with the other racial groups? Or have they stopped complaining, realising that they have very little choice? Have they simply become more discreet about expressing their attitudes?
Finally, it also seems as if the future of the CBD will be highly dependent on the ability of the public sector to maintain an adequate public sector environment by providing adequate cleaning services, as well as visible crime prevention – irrespective of race. Although a more detailed study is required in respect of landlords and their perceptions and behaviour, an appropriate public sector environment will be crucial to the future of the CBD. In this light a future research question would be the extent to which these observations find resonance elsewhere in South Africa, not least in smaller non-metropolitan cities.

Chapter Five argued that, in line with current debates on neighbourhoods elsewhere, these areas have become highly complex nodes within the fabric of the city. Whereas these areas were in the past often interpreted and experienced as spatial units in which residential familiarity and community were commonly found, these meanings and functions have changed. The neighbourhoods have shed their homogeneous, monofunctional features and have become sites of multilayered functions (and meaning) which are not necessarily related to one another. Neighbourhoods as spaces of residential consumption have evolved to include various functions that encompass cultural, economic and social production and consumption.

As seen in this investigation, the spatiality of Bloemfontein’s Westdene has changed dramatically from that of two decades ago. Its singular purpose as residential space, aiding the production and reproduction of mainly middle-class whites, has become far more diverse and complex. In reviewing some aspects of this neighbourhood’s recent development, it was ironic that among the key reasons for (white) people preferring to conduct business and spend leisure time in Westdene were linked to the idea that Westdene was perceived as more relaxed, felt safer and was more reminiscent of residential neighbourhoods of the time; whereas the CBD represented disorder, the residential neighbourhood represented quite the opposite. However, the very act of seeking out “the neighbourhood” as a space in which to withdraw from the CBD actually resulted in this neighbourhood eventually becoming more like the former CBD.

Westdene as a former white neighbourhood has been shaped by a range of different yet well-known urban processes. Its current form is the outcome of the decentralisation of services-based business activities, which has led to the development of an entertainment base that has collectively drawn in crime. This has in turn resulted in heightened levels of surveillance and fortification. Its continued “success” is in many ways linked to desegregation in the CBD and, indeed, other formerly white neighbourhoods.

Despite the fact that commercial land uses have developed significantly in Westdene, the neighbourhood still retains a residential function for a relatively diverse socio-economic residential base. In many ways Westdene represents the kind of neighbourhood of which many urban planners and commentators have been supportive. As such, Westdene as a neighbourhood demonstrates a markedly diverse spatiality. Although at some levels this area is merely a former white neighbourhood, it is certainly not as homogeneous as urban commentators on South African cities often imply. Yet the demonstrated diversity in the neighbourhood’s land use, socio-economic and racial composition has had limited impact in
terms of “integrating” either Westdene’s people or its functions. This, we would suggest, holds implications for the whole manner in which the “integration” debate might be understood. Again this question requires verification in other urban contexts, whether they be metropolitan centres or not.

The larger issue is that Westdene is merely one example of South African cities’ neighbourhoods and suburbs that are increasingly becoming functionally (and racially) diverse spatial units. Westdene is not an exception: it is typical. This holds a number of implications for how we might plan and more generally think of the development of South African cities.

In the South African urban research context the investigatory gaze has for long been characterised by the pitting of one cluster of neighbourhoods or suburbs (generally white), against former (black) townships and, more recently, inner-city areas. Research on both apartheid and post-apartheid urban forms has tended to focus on the supposed homogeneity of privileged white suburbs or neighbourhoods, as opposed to the deprivation of townships, highlighting the class and racially fragmented nature of the South African urban form. Little, if any, consideration has been given to the diversity of the ostensibly bland and supposedly homogeneous white suburbs or neighbourhoods. As Chapter Five has demonstrated, this perception is far off the mark. Neighbourhoods are changing in land use as a result of both decentralisation and of desegregation of business, leisure and residential characteristics. Though no urbanised area functions in isolation, and historically, for example, always had strong linkages to a city’s CBD, it is also clear that the various linkages between neighbourhoods also need to be investigated. Ultimately, the changing nature of the neighbourhood might very well mean that we not only have to rethink the meaning of the concept of neighbourhood, but also of the CBD and, more specifically, precisely where in the urban morphology it might be located.

Chapter Six evaluated housing delivery and policy in the Mangaung Local Municipality. The investigation set out to fill three gaps in existing housing-policy research in South Africa. Firstly, it provided a housing-delivery perspective from a municipal point of view. In terms of this perspective, the chapter highlighted concerns in respect of the principle of cooperative governance, and also argued that policy and allocation procedures at the provincial level are currently impacting negatively on housing delivery in the Mangaung Local Municipality. The ad hoc fashion in which subsidies are delivered, the administrative problems in an array of government departments and the emphasis on 40 m² housing units have all placed the Municipality under pressure in terms of long-term planning, local accountability and financial viability. Thus, despite the good intentions of other spheres of government, local governments bear the brunt, at the local level, of the consequences of these good intentions. Secondly, the investigation suggests that, despite serious attempts at integration, security of tenure and effective informal settlement upgrading, a number of problems persist. For example – as the relevant literature suggests – urban sprawl continues (though with limited indications of effective transport planning), while integrated settlement development and effective participation in informal settlement upgrading are also still limited. Thirdly, it seems as if political pressure and a human rights approach, coupled with implementation problems, still play a predominant role in housing-delivery problems in South Africa’s hidden urbanities.
Against this background, the accreditation of the Municipality according to the Housing Act might provide an opportunity for a more appropriate and locally-driven approach to housing. Further research should at least investigate how the Municipality has addressed some of the conflict areas discussed in Chapter Six. In this respect it is evident that an appropriate policy response is urgently required and presents fertile ground for further investigation.

This collection of essays did not include a comprehensive overview of the Bloemfontein economy. Nevertheless, at various junctures in the first six chapters reference was made to the largely public service-driven functions that underpin the city’s economy. Chapters Seven and Eight furnished explorations into possible new economic sectors that might be explored as routes by which to diversify the Bloemfontein economy and address its stagnant nature.

Chapter Seven worked from the position that research into the urban African tourism system has not been extensive in terms of its non-metropolitan areas. The objective was to make a contribution towards addressing this oversight and investigate possible ways forward. The investigation profiled the Bloemfontein tourism product. It was shown that tourism development in this city is limited, that it is largely white owned, and that it is concentrated in former white group areas. There is currently virtually no tourism economy in any of the former township areas. Moreover, the current tourist cohorts visiting Bloemfontein are unlikely to provide much scope for developing this city into a feasible tourist destination. Also, attention was focused on the obstacles tourism providers currently experience and the types of assistance they require from both the local and the provincial authorities. Against the backdrop of the empirical findings, the chapter outlined a possible tourism development strategy for Bloemfontein. Some practical pointers were profiled as to how the tourism product of Bloemfontein might be expanded to enable the utilisation of urban tourism as a developmental vehicle for the city.

Yet a number of issues emerged and will require dedicated research attention in the future, if urban tourism is to become a key economic driver for Bloemfontein. The most conspicuous obstacle to future tourism development in this city is the extreme paucity of available information on the Bloemfontein tourism system. Detailed empirical investigations into Bloemfontein’s tourism system are virtually non-existent. Furthermore, not a single aspect of the Bloemfontein tourism system has a critical and reflective secondary literature. Against this backdrop, some pointers to general lines of academic enquiry were outlined, which should significantly assist in providing useful, industry-relevant research for application in Bloemfontein and, indeed, in other secondary cities in South Africa. It was also pointed out that routes to the diversification of the tourism product would require a sense of urgency and inspired attention. One of the most significant of these related to how the racially and spatially untransformed nature of the city’s tourism product could be addressed – an issue relevant not only to Bloemfontein but to South African cities in general.

Chapter Eight took some of the issues highlighted in the previous chapter further. Current literature focused on South African festival tourism is concerned with the key, large-scale national arts festivals such as those hosted by Grahamstown, Oudtshoorn and Potchefstroom. It is significant that many of the key arts festivals are hosted by large towns,
rather than by cities, large or small. The objective of this chapter was to provide some reflection on the development of the Volksblad Kunstefees. More specifically, it provided insight into who the particular festival supporters are, why they attend the particular festival, and what their spending patterns are. The results of the investigation were less encouraging in terms of this festival’s ability to act as a catalyst for future urban tourism growth. The festival was shown to aid the re-imagining of the city and/or to reinforce the idea that Bloemfontein held a number of opportunities and “had more to do”, something which is not always remembered by either visitors or residents. Nevertheless, the economic potential of this festival — like so many hosted elsewhere — appears to be limited. The challenge for future research would thus be to uncover mechanisms that might remedy this limitation.

Chapter Nine looked into how church-based community development in Bloemfontein (and elsewhere) could transform churches into community-based resource centres. It was suggested that the church is not only the most representative institution in South Africa, but also geographically the most widely distributed body, penetrating every area of urban and rural community life, and thus ideally positioned to act as a community-based resource centre. Although a huge amount of energy directed towards social relief programmes is being channelled through macro-denominational and para-church networks, the pattern of delivery is in accordance with the principle of (para-church) the institutional-denominational model, thus typifying practices not conducive to a faith-based community development approach.

A transformational-servant-community-outreach model was designed, based on international and national experience of faith-based involvement in community-based development. It correlates favourably with the principles of alternative development and accommodates the approaches of Korten’s third- and fourth-generation asset-based community development, and development as transformation. The challenge for local congregations is to apply the elements of this model to their local context by becoming community-based resource centres, operating every day of the year, from where spiritual and human resources may be released into the neighbouring communities.

However, practice has shown that, for various reasons, the churches in Bloemfontein (and probably elsewhere in South Africa) are not implanting this model. For one, this model suggests an unselfish, sacrificial, ‘Mother Theresa’-type of lifestyle, where people are prepared to get their hands dirty by working, lovingly and caringly, with especially for the poor and the afflicted. It was argued that the two-world composition of the South African city (rich, first world, and poor, third world) provided a unique opportunity for the Church to fulfil the necessary bridging function, linking the rich and resourceful churches with the poor congregations, in order to embark on a joint journey of relational partnerships through which the Church is to become a witness of hope, peace and reconciliation in civil society.

It is obvious that, to change the mindset of church leadership, development practitioners and volunteers from both the poor and the rich churches towards a transformational-servant-community-outreach model will require an extra injection of grace and commitment. In conclusion, it is suggested that God’s solution to the problems that are threatening Bloemfontein lies within the very boundaries of this city.
Beyond the descriptive account of Bloemfontein and possible new avenues of investigation that might aid some sort of resolution to the issues, problems and potential opportunities highlighted in this collection, a set of policy and more general theoretical issues came to the fore.

Firstly, in terms of thinking about South African cities in general, disjunctures between Bloemfontein and the other, main metropolitan cities were recorded on a number of fronts. Research by the Centre for Development and Enterprise (CDE, 2005) had already concluded that policy “voices” from secondary cities were silent. In terms of the spatial inequality, the role and function of the CBD, the desirability and possibilities of CBD regeneration and renewal different from the trends seen in the large metropolitan complexes of South Africa were recorded. The expectations of urban policy frameworks, their performance elsewhere and the recorded realities of what is actually happening and desired in Bloemfontein are at odds with one another. Other changing spatialities are at variance with either urban policy frameworks or desires. This relates to the changing role of former white neighbourhoods and the diversification of its functions which appear to be in conflict with received planning wisdom concerning, for example, the compact city and the “integration” of different land uses. Similarly, housing delivery and the requirement for greater flexibility in respect of the application of the policy in Bloemfontein showed that, while some degree of urban integration was possible, spatial integration through the housing subsidy system will be extremely difficult to achieve. So too were differences recorded concerning policy desires regarding urban economic diversification for sustained or greater growth. Whilst the diversification strategies of the large metropolitan complexes have included the successful deployment of urban tourism products to diversify the local economy, it is clear that for Bloemfontein these strategies hold but limited potential. However, we should concede that, in terms of the themes presented here, it was demonstrated that the empirical realities of Bloemfontein are not always at variance with experiences registered in the large metropolitan centres of Cape Town, Durban and Johannesburg. The most obvious differences are that the scale of the urban complex is much smaller, limited land is available to assist effectively with the spatial integration, the national policies on CBD renewal are unlikely to have the same impact as in larger urban areas, and an urban tourism economy, for example, is virtually absent.

This leads to two questions about how we might generally think about South African cities, and what the experiences are of other South African cities that do not feature frequently in the academic press. What are the empirical realities of other ordinary (non-metropolitan) cities such as East London, Kimberley, Polokwane, Pietermaritzburg or Nelspruit? Are there similarities between them, are there similarities in terms of what makes their experiences different from those of South Africa’s metropolitan areas? Furthermore, we may ask why general urban policy is virtually ignoring them and whether we can assume that future efforts
to foster economic growth and development should be focused solely on the metropolitan areas.

This then leads on to the issue of how we might think about current policy frameworks that directly or indirectly affect the evolving spatialities of South African cities. Is the success of these policies to be judged according to their implementation in Pretoria, Johannesburg or Cape Town, or will the potential and actual failure of different urban policies and the contradictions inherent in them in, for example, Bloemfontein, be seen as a flaw in this particular city’s implementation of them, or perhaps the reality is that the one-size-fits-all places and spaces approach is fundamentally flawed. Thus, the question arises as to how we will develop future policy frameworks for South Africa’s rapidly urbanising society. Will the needs of the metropoles, on the one hand, and rural South Africa, on the other, determine the policy environment in which cities such as Bloemfontein are to function? Perhaps what is required is to release cities from what are essentially universalising assumptions about what ought to happen in South African cities, and then to provide real opportunities for different cities to plot and manage themselves in ways that are more appropriate to their realities. In this regard, the Centre for Development Enterprise (CDE, 2005) suggested an urban development fund for secondary cities. The criteria for the fund they suggested included ascertaining whether the fund would foster public-private partnerships and that proposals should indicate the impact of the proposal on the tax base of the respective cities. It is also significant that it was proposed that these cities should compete for the fund and that there is no automatic access to the fund. Thus the future of these cities and their ability to find creative ways to address the policy issues are transferred to leadership with the talent and skill to address the future, and it is thus not a policy environment that determines the way forward.

A few more abstract and theoretical considerations have also emerged from this investigation. Most of the material in this collection is the result of commissioned research and, as such, the collection gives us some inkling of what two levels of governments – in this case a local and a provincial government – requested from a small number of academic researchers to aid these governments in their management and planning endeavours. Although the investigation was informed by current theoretical debates in urban studies, we did not aim to theorise this ordinary city’s changing spatialities; rather, we chose a more descriptive empirical path. We wanted to capture something of the unfolding spatiality of Bloemfontein: a chronicle of a city at a particular time to be understood first and foremost on its own terms. In doing so, however, we hope this investigation will become a baseline against which future research into the changing spatialities of this city might take place. A set of themes was presented which, whilst relevant to a number of debates seen in the mainstream Anglo-American academic press on the broader field of urban studies, should be read in a specific context. In the process a template for similar investigations, particularly in the smaller cities of South Africa, has also been created. In terms of the style of presentation this collection is perhaps also somewhat different from that seen in the larger urban centres
of South Africa and the larger so-called “international debates” concerning our understanding of the city.

To many this investigation could amount to “old style” geographical synthesis so essential to the work of geographers, and urban and regional planners in the mid 20th century. This approach is underpinned by the idea that the general field of urban studies requires a more diversified set of reference points, less – rather than more – concerned with supporting or refuting the theoretical debates that have, and are, developed from the parochial concerns of mainly Anglo-American urban studies scholarship. Perhaps more importantly, our analysis is of a city, like the majority of cities in the world, that falls outside of both the empirical and theoretical accounts of what cities are and how they function. The point is that these cities do exist; they are home to billions of people across the globe and they deserve attention because, firstly, they are intrinsically worthy of scrutiny; secondly, they represent the majority of those places we call “the city”; and thirdly, because no theory of “the city” or “the urban” can justifiably stand as correct or plausible if it does not also include these ordinary cities.

By insisting on such inclusion, we are clearly also inspired by the comparative approaches of an earlier generation of scholars who drew on studies of many different cities around the world to critique the ethnocentric theories of urbanism that dominated the field. In taking this approach, we aim to make a contribution to those debates seeking to demonstrate the blatantly parochial nature of apparently universal accounts of “the city” by insisting that modes of urban life are perhaps as diverse as the different cities we as urban commentators inhabit. Ultimately, as Robinson (2006: 170) argues, such investigation “draws our attention to cities as distinctive assemblages of many different kinds of activities … cities are many things, and following the trajectories of different elements of any urban context quickly brings other cities into view in quite specific ways. Ordinary cities, then, are distinctive and have the capacity to shape their own futures, even if they exist in a world of (power-laden) connections and circulations.”

In terms of more mundane methodological concerns, the way in which this investigation developed also suggests a particular means of coming to understand ordinary cities. The methodological underpinning of such an approach implies support for inductive routes to theorisation, and one we argue is necessary if “ordinary cities” are to have some salience in theoretical accounts of the city. In addition, our contention is that, if there is any hope of urban theory becoming more relevant to ordinary cities, such an empirical base will be required. This approach undoubtedly falls within the realm of research that typically does not feature in theoretical accounts of the city. Many of the current urban debates framed by “globalisation” and “city-regions” or invisible spaces work not only from a narrow set of cities, but the understanding of the city is inherently revealed through a deductive route, the theoretical proposition of which is limited mainly to the realities of “on-the-map” cities.

Not only has this investigation been approached from the “wrong” angle, but the themes of investigation, and the scale of analysis also sit uneasily with many of the current macro-accounts (cities in the global networks) and micro-accounts (the hidden spaces of the cultural turn) of the city, certainly relative to the “on-the-map” cities. In terms of the micro
scale of analysis, the cultural turn from the late 1980s has refocused the investigatory gaze on the decidedly less visible end of the investigatory spectrum, thereby exposing the complicated spatialities of the city by means of intense, fine-grained analyses of all manner of urban phenomena encompassing a raft of different identity markers (for example, gender, race, sexuality, age, physical ability). Whilst the hidden meanings and interpretations of the city linked to these various and simultaneously interacting identities are generally highly focused, they nevertheless generally occur in the “on-the-map cities”, many of which also qualify for serious theoretical treatment in the parallel, but macro-level debates concerning global and/or world cities. Typically, these cities also represent another feature of current thinking on cities. In these accounts the city and its position in the global networks of capital, knowledge and information flows, as well as their (global cities) ability to control these various interwoven functions, has become a near obsession. New “paradigmatic cities” are conjured from mainly the Anglo-American urban experience, with a handful of urban scholars and theorists in turn enthusiastically arguing the case of their latest darling “paradigmatic city”. In this binary relationship of micro-local and macro-global – but then only in “important cities” – the questions of urban studies never appear to reach beyond, that is, towards the thousands of ordinary, “off-the-map” cities almost inevitably located somewhere in the global South.

REFERENCES


The development and expansion of urban theory has drawn upon the experiences of a handful of “global” or “world” cities in the developed north. Conversely, cities of the south have been interpreted and theorised through the lens of development theory. Seldom, if ever, are these two different conceptual realms seen as mutually constituted – theorised within the same discursive realm, adding a more complete understanding of how cities function and change.

A similar observation can be made about how our understanding of cities in the developing south have evolved. Large cities in more “influential” developing countries are nearly always the empirical base from which our understanding of cities in the south takes place. The collection of essays in this book is set against the backdrop of calls for a more inclusive theorisation and understanding of cities, that transcend the dichotomous urban narrative which characterises current academic and policy engagements with cities. Drawing on the experiences of a secondary city in South Africa – Bloemfontein – this collection of essays argues that the realities of unremarked upon, ordinary cities both challenge and reinforce a number of debates in urban theory and development theory.

SPATIALITIES OF URBAN CHANGE
SELECTED THEMES FROM BLOEMFONTEIN AT THE BEGINNING OF THE 21ST CENTURY

Lochner Marais & Gustav Visser